

Senegal

Agricultural Development Project in Matam - Phase II

Project Completion Report Digest

Senegal - Agricultural Development Project in Matam - Phase II

Item	Assessment Remarks	Rating
Country & Project Name	Senegal - Agricultural Development Project in Matam - Phase II	
Loan No.:	608-SM	
Project Id.	1219	
Board Date	10 April 2003	
Effectiveness Date	01 November 2003	
Original Closing Date	30 June 2012	
Final Closing Date	30 June 2012	
Total Project Cost USD(M)	24.29	
IFAD loan US\$(M)	12.51	
Cofinanciers (if any)	BOAD: US\$7.90; Domestic total: US\$3.88	
Implementing Agency	Ministry of Agriculture and Livestock	
Principal Components	The project has been implemented through the following four components: (a) Capacity development of beneficiary organizations; (b) Development of productive potential; (c) Development of decentralized rural finance; and (d) Project coordination, monitoring and evaluation.	
Project Performance		
Relevance	This project is a follow-up project to a successful first phase. It directly responds to the wish expressed by both, the Government of Senegal (GoS) and beneficiaries, for a second phase to help them consolidate the achievements of the first phase. As such, it directly responds to the priorities of the rural poor, in particular to the need to strengthen the capabilities of rural organizations so that they can take over the responsibility for, and manage their own development. The project is fully in line with the IFAD COSOP and with Government's rural development policies and strategies. It is aligned with the country's PRSP and decentralization process, by strengthening grassroots organizations and helping them to get ready to take on the new tasks assigned to them.	6
Effectiveness	The project met all of its specific objectives. It is considered a flagship project and classified by IFAD as the best performing project in the WCA region in 2010 and 2011. In 2010, it was also awarded the Alpha price by GoS for the second-best performing project across all sectors. Overall, it has helped reduce extreme poverty by increasing household incomes, improving HH food security and child malnutrition, and by improving literacy among the populations, women in particular, whose literacy rate has now surpassed that of men. In specific terms, the project significantly contributed to strengthening the capacities of grass-roots organizations, promoting the creation of apex organizations, improving the participation of women and the youth, increasing agricultural production and productivity, improving the economic activity in the region and thus, increasing and diversifying incomes sources and improving household food security. Some remarkable results could be reached at completion. 73% of the POs had reached operational autonomy (compared to an initial target of 70%). The productive potential could be increased by opening up 2000 ha of productive land in the Walo region and by establishing 11 pastoral units over a surface of 900 000 ha in the Ferlo region. This has greatly contributed to increasing and consolidating the agricultural production performance in the project area. The project has also contributed to the diversification of agricultural production and incomes by providing support to the development of vegetable production in the Diery. A total of 3000 ha of irrigated land were developed. The project has further helped integrating 2 important economic hubs (production and consumption zones) with the construction of 120 km of rural roads and 3 bridges of 100m. Finally, the institutional rehabilitation of the POs has enabled them to re-establish themselves as regular clients of the CNCAS. Also, access to CAPEC loans has enabled women to increase their incomes and improve food security of their households. Altogether, the project has reached 290 900 beneficiaries, of which 55% are women, which corresponds to 96% of the target set.	6
Efficiency	The project can be considered highly efficient. With 38%, the ERR calculated at completion is twice as high as the appraisal estimate of 18.3%. The IFAD and BOAD loans were entirely disbursed (98.8 and 99.9%). The MTR was anticipated and took place 2 ½ years after effectiveness to address the deterioration of the exchange rate. This was done by increasing Government contribution to the project costs. Financial achievement is therefore high (117%) which reflects the additional funding provided by GoS to compensate for the exchange rate loss.	6
Project Performance		6
Partner Performance		
IFAD	IFAD has been praised for its close follow-up of this project and for providing the right technical support to BOAD supervision missions. Doubtless, this has contributed to the project's positive	5

Item	Assessment Remarks	Rating
Country & Project Name	Senegal - Agricultural Development Project in Matam - Phase II	
	results. The project has further benefited from IFAD's shift towards direct supervision in 2008. On the less positive side, the PCR points out that the frequency of supervision missions was reduced from twice the year under BOAD to once the year with IFAD, and that IFAD's administrative supervision has been slow and at times cumbersome due to the amount of paper work required. This concerns in particular the fiduciary aspects. When IFAD took over the direct supervision, replenishment of the Special Account took 119 days. In 2010-12, it could be reduced to 67 which is however still longer than the average 38 days with BOAD. Nevertheless and given all other positive aspects, IFAD performance is considered satisfactory.	
Cooperating Institution	BOAD has closely supervised the project until IFAD took over the direct supervision in 2008. Supervision missions were organized twice the year and complemented by an IFAD expert. BOAD showed strong interest in the project and supervision performance was good.	5
Government	Government performance was altogether highly satisfactory, characterized by strong ownership, excellent institutional support and close follow-up of project activities. The steering committee performed its task adequately. The Ministry of Economies and Finance (<i>Ministère de l'économie et des finances</i> – MEF) provided all necessary support to the project and was efficient in processing payment requests. The same applies to the Ministry of Agriculture (MOA). The different services of the MOA have provided adequate support to the project at all times (Livestock, Water and Forest). The Department of Water and Forests played a critical role in the implementation of NRM and conservation measures (reforestation of village irrigation schemes, bush fire management, etc.) and has developed a regional bush fire management strategy in close collaboration with the project and local development partners. Also, it has provided additional resources for the management and restoration of the natural resources base in the Walo and Ferlo areas. Government counterpart funds were provided on time and significantly increased to compensate for the CFA/DTS exchange rate loss. They reached a disbursement rate of 175% at project completion. Procurement was rendered difficult with the introduction of the new public procurement code in 2008, which led to delays in the approval processes. This has negatively impacted on project investments in 2008-09. The situation has improved thereafter. Performance of the PCU was not explicitly assessed in the PCR but is considered highly satisfactory, given the high level of achievement reached by the project. Supervision mission recommendations were closely followed.	6
NGO/Other	Performance of the two regional federations of farmers' organisations (<i>organisations paysannes</i> – OPs), AKNB in the Walo and ABNF in the Ferlo region, is considered highly satisfactory. They have benefited from the project's support and in turn greatly contributed to the project's outcomes. Both have gradually become the first port of call for any new project intervention in the region. ABNF in the Ferlo region still needs additional support to consolidate.	5
Cofinancier(s)	The performance of BOAD as co-financier was not specifically assessed in the PCR, but it is considered satisfactory. Its loan was fully disbursed (99%). No weaknesses were mentioned.	5
Combined Partner Performance	Collaboration between partners was very good. After 2008, when IFAD took over direct supervision of the project, both BOAD and IFAD made an effort to coordinate the timing of their respective supervision missions to further benefit from each-others experience and advice, and to save the time of the PCU which needed to prepare only one instead of two missions. The project has also established positive partnerships with the Integrated Ecosystem Management Project of Senegal in the Ferlo region and since recently, with the USAID/YAJEENDE focused on the development of value chains to improve food security of the most vulnerable.	
Rural Poverty Impact		
Household Income and Net Assets	The project has had various direct and indirect impacts on household incomes and assets. Its impact on agricultural production and productivity through training, capacity strengthening and the development of irrigated land and pastoral units has directly contributed to increasing, stabilizing and diversifying household incomes sources. The project has also contributed to the creation of new incomes sources for women and the youth. The development of fruits and vegetable production in particular has opened up new incomes generating opportunities and has helped reduce migration to the cities. One such example is the development of banana production. It has helped young people find a new source of income and stay in rural areas while women are earning additional incomes by selling the banana at almost twice the farm gate price. The construction of water points in the pastoral units has also created new jobs, either directly (management of water points) or indirectly (young people helping women groups which have developed new activities around the water points, with heavy jobs such as transportation). Thanks to the improvement of the food security situation in the project area, remittances in the Walo region, previously used for purchasing food, are now invested into housing and other higher needs. In the Ferlo region, implementation of the pastoral units and	5

Item	Assessment Remarks	Rating
Country & Project Name	Senegal - Agricultural Development Project in Matam - Phase II	
	the improved management of boreholes and water points has contributed to reducing diseases, facilitating access to water and reducing the workload. This has enabled women to start new IGAs, such as the preparation of milk products. CNCAS loans have allowed the POs to engage into irrigated agriculture and thus, to increase the incomes of the members. CNCAS loans reached 1350 billion CFA with a reimbursement rate of 97%. Also, 5 CAPECs were created and have provided 7214 loans totalling 1.3 billion CFA. These have enabled women in particular to start IGAs.	
Food Security	Project interventions have helped improve food security and the nutrition status of the populations in many ways. The production and productivity of rice and maize could be improved (Walo), new varieties of sorghum and millet were introduced, livestock production and hence, meat and milk production could be improved (Ferlo) and vegetable production was developed (Diery). Altogether, this has helped the populations to significantly improve their food security and to diversify their diet. Surpluses are marketed which allows them to fill remaining nutrition gaps. Also, access to CAPEC loans of which women are the main beneficiaries, has enabled them to engage into petty trade and small processing units. This again has allowed them to increase their incomes and considerably improve household food supply. As a result, severe child malnutrition has significantly decreased from 14% in 2004 to 2.5% in 2011. Acute malnutrition has remained unchanged, however.	5
Ag. Productivity	The productive potential could be increased by opening up 3000 ha of irrigated land and establishing 11 pastoral units. In the Walo region, this has enabled 3000 households to increase and stabilize their rice yields at 6t/ha and to start off-season maize production. The project has also facilitated the introduction of new sorghum and millet varieties as well as banana production. In the Ferlo region, the implementation of 11 pastoral units together with the provision of appropriate means and infrastructure (boreholes, water towers, fodder storage facilities, animal vaccines and vaccination facilities, health centers, fire breaks, etc.) has helped develop 900 000 ha of natural resources and rangeland. Cattle fertility increased from 53% to 80% and mortality rates could be substantially reduced. In the Diery region, vegetable production was developed. Production and productivity were increased by making use of the availability of water in the vicinity of boreholes to mitigate the negative impact of erratic rainfalls. High value vegetables are now produced by the populations, women and the youth in particular, benefiting directly 560 households. All of these activities have greatly contributed to increasing, stabilizing and diversifying agricultural production and to increasing agricultural productivity.	5
Agricultural Productivity and Food Security		5
Natural Resources and Environment	The implementation of 11 pastoral units, through the establishment of concerted management plans, has contributed to improving the sustainable management and protection of the natural resource base. It has helped: (i) reduce bush fires, slash & burn practice, and poaching; (ii) improve reforestation efforts; (iii) improve social cohesion between herders and transhumant; and (iv) implement transparent water resource management practices. More importantly, it has brought about sound organization and management practices of the pastoral units with a high level of participation of all users. As a result, rural communities, the federation of pastoral units (ABNF), technical and administrative public services and concerned projects (PRODAM, PGIES) are now actively involved in the implementation of a regional bush fire alleviation and fire break management strategy for the Matam region.	6
Human, Social Capital and Empowerment	The project's impact on education and capacity strengthening has been substantial. The project has greatly contributed to strengthening the sense of organization, initiative and the social capital of the beneficiaries, which has allowed them to significantly increase and diversify their incomes and assets. New associations were created, political pressure groups have emerged, social cohesion in rangeland areas could be improved, and the social status of both, women and the youth could be lifted. The project has had a strong impact in the area of literacy training. Literacy training was substantially expanded with the unplanned participation of the rural communities in this activity (489% achieved). Their contribution has been highly instrumental in empowering the grassroots population on a broad base, thus lessening the power of the local elite. Also, literacy training has mostly benefited women who accounted for 76% of the beneficiaries against 24% men. Women literacy could be increased from 12% to 75% rate and is now higher than the literacy rate of men (64%). It is worth mentioning that the success of the adult literacy programme has had an indirect impact on the expansion of the formal education in the Ferlo region. Beneficiary parents requested that their children be given a similar education by the public system. As a result, new teaching facilities have emerged. Members of	6

Item	Assessment Remarks	Rating
Country & Project Name	Senegal - Agricultural Development Project in Matam - Phase II	
	POs have benefited from management and technical training. Altogether, the capacities of 110 498 members were strengthened of which, 65% were women. The majority (73%) of the OPs are now operationally autonomous. Their management is efficient and transparent. Also, their members have acquired important skills, which are instrumental in helping them increase their farm and off-farm incomes. Finally, higher incomes of the POs have enabled some groups to contribute to the improvement of community infrastructure such as health centers.	
Inst. & Policies	The project has substantially contributed to the institutional strengthening by providing support to the two OP apex organizations in the Walo and Ferlo regions. AKNB in the Walo region offers important services to its members (information, sensitization, capacity strengthening, technical support, etc.) while ABNF in the Ferlo region is supporting the self-promotion of its members through the sustainable management of the natural resource base. Both have gradually become the first port of call for any new project intervention in the region. While AKNB is considered mature and autonomous, ABNF still requires further support to enable it to better deal with cross-cutting issues and include pastoralists into the decision and policy making processes. It needs to be pointed out, however, that the Ferlo Apex organization has emerged from the positive performance of the Walo apex organization and even though not yet fully consolidated, this move can be considered as a major achievement of the project. The project has played an important role in strengthening the managerial and technical capacities of OPs and in re-establishing a climate of trust and confidence with the CNCAS. Efforts initiated during the first phase, which have been pursued during the second phase, have allowed the 111 POs to re-establish themselves as regular clients of the CNCAS. They have settled all debts contracted during the first phase and have benefited from 375 new loans worth CFA 1,365 billion, from CNCAS own resources. The project has also facilitated the creation of 5 CAPEC in the Walo region. They have successfully expanded their membership during the implementation period from 1157 to 2643, of which 47% are women. At completion, 7214 loans worth 1.3 billion CFA had been given out. Almost 70% of these loans are used for petty trade and complement the CNCAS loans mainly used to finance irrigated agriculture. The generally low savings level represents, however, an obstacle to the further expansion of the CAPEC, for which the demand is still not met. - The project has also contributed to strengthening the capacities of 454 rural councils (of which 83 women) in the area of decentralization and local development.	6
Markets	The opening up of the Dandé Mayo production zone and the Diery consumption zone through the construction of 120 km of roads, two 100m bridges, one dam bridge and other rural works has allowed year-long access of about 30 villages to input and output markets. These villages, which were isolated by floodwaters for six months or more, have now been integrated into the local economy. New trading points and small agro-industries have emerged, transportation and transaction costs could be reduced, and access to means, services and information could be improved.	5
Project Impact	The project has achieved a considerable impact in four main areas: (i) development of 2000 ha of agricultural land in the Walo; (ii) vegetable production over 3000 ha in the Diery; (iii) 11 pastoral units in the Ferlo; and (iv) empowerment and professionalization of the OPs.	5
Overarching Factors		
Innovation	The project has brought about several important innovations. In the Walo: (i) introduction of a hybrid irrigation system, which combines traditional small scale canal irrigation with the siphon techniques increasing thereby the longevity of the structure and reducing pumping costs of the system; (ii) institutional rehabilitation of OPs (IEGs) as a process of organizational and financial restructuring financial through sensitization, training and support; (iii) intensive rice cultivation (Système de riziculture intensif - SRI); and (iv) participatory M&E. In the Diery: (i) stakeholder exchange within the CCCC for consistency setting with the local development plans; (ii) implementation of a gender observatory at regional and sub-regional level; (iii) implementation of information and communication community centers; and (iv) drip irrigation. In the Ferlo region: (i) implementation of pastoral units.	6
Replicability and Scaling-up	At least two key innovations will be replicated, adapted, consolidated or scaled-up under the new PADAER project: (i) intensive rice cultivation and (ii) the pastoral unit approach. It has also been observed that non-beneficiaries of the project replicate activities introduced by the project such as the dairy units. The most significant replication that has occurred during project implementation is the creation by the beneficiaries themselves of the Ferlo Apex organization, based on the success of the Walo Apex organization.	5
Innovation, Replicability and Scaling-up		6
Sustainability and	The project was designed to ensure sustainability of its achievements. This was mainly done by	5

Item	Assessment Remarks	Rating
Country & Project Name	Senegal - Agricultural Development Project in Matam - Phase II	
Ownership	working with existing structures and strengthening their organizational, financial and technical capacities to become an essential tool for local development. The fact that the two apex organizations strengthened under the project have become the first point of call for any other intervention in the Matam region suggest that prospects for sustainability are very strong. Also, it has been pointed repeatedly that the participatory processes used by the project have created a strong ownership of its operations by the beneficiaries who have learned to analyze their situation and develop solutions. The project has established several partnerships with existing structures, which will contribute to the sustainability of its operations. These are mainly the different rural communities and USAID supported projects. Some aspects will also be integrated and further consolidated by the new IFAD-financed PADAER. The two apex organizations supported by the project have reached a good level of autonomy. AKNB in the Walo region is considered autonomous and mature. With some further support, it can become a local services provider. ABNF in the Ferlo region has not yet reached full maturity and needs further strengthening. Prospects to maintain rice production at the level of 6t/ha are good. This will largely contribute to maintaining the level of food security in the region. In the Ferlo region, more needs to be done to further develop the pastoral units, which do not yet meet the actual needs of the populations living in this area. The maintenance of the various road infrastructure works is not yet given. The public envelope is insufficient so that alternative arrangements involving the local communities need to be found. The relationship between OPs and the CNCAS have been consolidated during the second phase of the project are lending activities are likely to continue along the same line. The CAPEC still need further capacity strengthening and institutional/financial consolidation.	
Targeting	Targeting is unfortunately not explicitly analysed in the PCR, but it appears that the project has successfully developed its own targeting strategy given the positive results it has reached with respect to capacity strengthening, empowerment and increased incomes of women and the youth, considered the most vulnerable.	5
Gender	Women have benefited from project interventions in many ways. First of all, gender considerations were deliberately mainstreamed into project components and operations. The project has further facilitated the creation of a Regional Gender Observatory, which is complemented by small observatories at local level. This enables all development actors to regularly assess the situation and exchange about gender issues. Women have greatly benefited from the project's literacy training. More than half of the resources were allocated to women which has allowed women literacy rate to increase from 12% to 75% and to surpass the literacy rate of men which has climbed from 30% to 64% (RIMS). Women were also the main beneficiaries of the rural finance component. Access to CAPEC loans has enabled them to increase their incomes, through the development of micro-enterprises, and improve the food security situation of the households. Marginalized populations, including women have traditionally limited access to land in the region of Matam. Land rights are given to household heads who are usually the men. Therefore, only divorced or widowed women can be granted access to land; young men and women who belong to their parents' household have no access to land. To correct the situation, the project has successfully introduced irrigated vegetable garden plots in the Walo region which are managed essentially by women groups, but also by the youth. They are highly appreciated and valued by the entire community.	6
Overall Performance		6
Estimated number of beneficiaries		
PCR Quality		
Scope	The outline was largely respected but most annexes are missing (only Logframe included)	6
Quality	The PCR is well written, very analytical. It provides a lot of information, including qualitative assessments. It also provides a fair amount of figures, but they are seldom compared to the situation at the beginning of the project, making it difficult to assess how significant the impact has been.	6
Lessons	This section is virtually missing and cannot be assessed. The PCR provides a section entitled "recommendations" which is rather a summary of the main conclusions.	
Candour	The PCR is very objective.	6