

Tajikistan

Livestock and Pasture Development Project II

Mid-term Review

Main report and appendices

Mission Dates: 9-20 September 2019

Document Date 25/11/2019

Project No. 2000000977

Report No. 5199-TJ

Near East, North Africa and Europe Division
Programme Management Department

Abbreviations and Acronyms

ADB	Asian Development Bank
AKF	Aga Khan Foundation
ATAC	Agriculture Training and Advisory Centre
BCR	Benefit Cost Ratio
CACILM	Central Asian Countries' Initiative on Land Management
CAMP	Central Asia Mountain Partnership Programme
CBA	Cost Benefit Analysis
CD	Community Development
CF	Community Facilitator
CIG	Common Interest Group
CIS	Commonwealth of Independent States
CO	Community Organisation
DPO	District Project Officer
CU	Cattle Unit
EBRD	European Bank for Reconstruction and Development
EC	European Commission
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organisation of the United Nations
GOT	Government of Tajikistan
HH	household
IFAD	International Fund for Agricultural Development
IGA	Income Generating Activity
IRR	Internal Rate of Return
LPDP	Pasture and Livestock Development Project
MOA	Ministry of Agriculture
MSDSP	Mountain Societies Development Support Programme
MTR	Mid-term Review (by IFAD and GOT)
MWRLR	Ministry of Water Resources and Land Reclamation
TAAS	Tajik Academy of Agricultural Sciences
NARS	National Agricultural Research System
NGO	Non-governmental Organisation
NPV	Net Present Value
OMPP	Operational Manual for Procurement Procedures
PCR	Project Completion Report
FMM	Financial Management Manual
PIM	Project Implementation Manual
CLPMP	Community Livestock and Pasture Management Plan
PMT	Pasture Management Trust
PMU	Project Management Unit
PRSP	Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper
PSC	Project Steering Committee

PUU	Pasture Users Union
PUUB	PUU Board
SCLMG	State Committee for Land Management and Geodesy
SOE	Statement of Expenditures
SVIS	State Veterinary Inspection Services
SU	Sheep Unit
TA	Technical Assistance
TJS	Tajikistani Somoni , Currency unit of Tajikistan
TOR	Terms of Reference
TT	Technical Team
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
USD	United States Dollar
VO	Village Organisation
WA	Withdrawal Application
WB	World Bank
WIGG	Women Income Generating Groups
WFP	World Food Programme

A. Project Overview

Region:	Near East, North Africa and Europe Division	Project at Risk Status:	Not at risk
Country:	Tajikistan	Environmental and Social Category:	B
Project Name:	Livestock and Pasture Development Project II	Climate Risk Classification:	2
Project ID:	2000000977	Executing Institution:	Ministry of Agriculture
Project Type:	Livestock	Implementing Institutions:	not available yet
CPM:	Mikael Kauttu		
Project Director:	.		
Project Area:	Districts of Vose, Kulob, Dangara		

Approval Date:	12/12/2015	Last audit receipt:	03/06/2019
Signing Date:	03/02/2016	Date of Last SIS Mission:	29/09/2019
Entry into Force Date:	03/02/2016	Number of SIS Missions:	3
Available for Disbursement Date:	23/11/2016	Number of extensions:	0
First Disbursement Date:	28/11/2016	Effectiveness lag:	2 months
MTR Date:	08/09/2019		
Original Completion Date:	31/03/2021		
Current Completion Date:	31/03/2021		
Financial Closure:	not available yet		

Project total financing

IFAD Financing breakdown	Debt Sustainability Framework	\$8,700,000
	IFAD	\$8,700,000
	ASAP Trust Fund	\$5,000,000
Domestic Financing breakdown	National Government	\$446,000
	Beneficiaries	\$1,348,000
Co-financing breakdown,		
Project total financing:		\$24,194,000

Current Mission

Mission Dates:	9-20 September 2019
Days in the field:	12-14 September
Mission composition:	Mikael Kauttu, Country Director; Tommaso Alacevich, Economist /Team leader (FAO, Investment Centre Division); Anvar Mamkulov, Procurement Specialist; Rahul Antao, Sociologist, IFAD; Joldoshbek Dadybaev, Veterinarian / Livestock Specialist (consultant); Alban Bellinguez, Livestock Specialist (consultant); Alaa' Abdel Karim, Finance Officer, IFAD; Bakhtiyor Zuhurov, Environmental Specialist, IFAD; and Zainab Kenjaeva, IFAD Proxy in Tajikistan
Field sites visited:	Vose, Hamadoni, Kulob, Dangara and Farkhor in the Khatlon Region

B. Overall Assessment

Key SIS Indicator #1	Ø	Rating	Key SIS Indicator #2	Ø	Rating
Likelihood of Achieving the Development Objective		5	Assessment of the Overall Implementation Performance		5

Effectiveness and Developmental Focus	5	Project Management	5
Effectiveness	5	Quality of Project Management	5
Targeting and Outreach	5	Knowledge Management	5
Gender equality & women's participation	5	Value for Money	4
Agricultural Productivity	5	Coherence between AWPB and Implementation	4
Nutrition	N/A	Performance of M&E System	5
Adaptation to Climate Change	4	Requirements of Social, Environmental and Climate Assessment Procedures (SECAP)	4

Sustainability and Scaling-up	5	Financial Management and Execution	5
Institutions and Policy Engagement	5	Acceptable Disbursement Rate	4
Partnership-building	4	Quality of Financial Management	6
Human and Social Capital and Empowerment	5	Quality and Timeliness of Audit	6
Quality of Beneficiary Participation	4	Counterparts Funds	6
Responsiveness of Service Providers	5	Compliance with Loan Covenants	5
Environment and Natural Resource Management	4	Procurement	5
Exit Strategy	4		
Potential for Scaling-up	5		

Relevance	5
------------------	----------

C. Mission Objectives and Key Conclusions

Background and Main Objective of the Mission

The Livestock and Pasture Development Project, second phase (LPDP-II) is supported by the International Fund for Agricultural Development (IFAD) with a loan of US\$ 8.7 million and a grant of US\$ 8.7 million. ASAP has also contributed US\$ 5 million to the project for implementing climate adaptation activities (IFAD Loan No. 2000001439/DSF Grant No. 2000001438/ASAP Grant 2000001437). The project completion date is 31 March 2021. LPDP-II's goal is to contribute to the reduction of poverty by enhancing livestock productivity and climate resilience in a sustainable manner. It is expected benefit 38,000 smallholder livestock households through the implementation of three components: (i) Institutional Development; (ii) Productivity Enhancement and Improved Animal Health; and (iii) Pasture Development and Diversification for Vulnerability Reduction. The Project Management Unit (PMU) of the Ministry of Agriculture located in Dushanbe, in coordination with a regional office in Kulab and two project implementation partners is responsible for project implementation in the five districts of Dangara, Farkhor, Hamadoni, Kulob and Vose.

The Mission visited over 25 Pasture Users Unions (PUUs) in all the five project districts. During the field visits, the Mission consulted representatives from 9 Women Income Generating Groups (WIGGs), supported for honey, rosehip and dairy milk production and processing enterprises; over 25 Common Interest Groups (CIGs), benefitting of support for fodder production. The mission also visited fodder demonstration sites, infrastructure investment sites, and fodder seed producers receiving Project's support to produce high quality seeds. Detailed discussions were held with staff members at the PMU, regional staff, district project officers and the community facilitators involved in project implementation. The mission met and briefed the representatives of various institutions, including: the Ministry of Finance, Ministry of Agriculture, Ministry of Economic Development and Trade, State Committee on Investments and State Property Management, State Committee on Environmental Protection, Tajik Agrarian University, Tajik Veterinary Association, the Food Security Committee and the State Veterinarian Inspection, Pasture Meliorative Trust under the Ministry of Agriculture, State Institute of design projection "Tojikzaminsoz" (GIPROZEM) under the State Committee of Land Management and Geodesy, and the Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO) about the key findings and also organised a wrap up meeting with all PMU staff members on 20 September 2019.

Key Mission Agreements and Conclusions

LPDP-II has proven to be substantially efficient in its implementation, with solid physical progress. Such performance is also resulting from a competent and well managed PMU with consolidated experience in implementing the LPDP, which shown also substantial resilience during Suspension. The M&E system is efficient and at output level is able to produce needed information to take corrective measures when required. As the end of the implementation is approaching (18 months from the date of the MTR) it is important that the PMU starts reflecting on outcome level progress, as a way to better understand behavioural changes as well as to ensure appropriate and informed assessment at project end. The exit strategy of the organizations at village level, as well as the ones of partner institution at national level assumes a critical importance at this stage and the PMU will need to be geared towards empowering them to be self-sustainable. In terms of investment, the PMU will need to start refocusing the focus, paying higher attention to: (a) sub-projects that promote availability of fodder for livestock breeders; as well as (b) climate resilience infrastructures, yet pursuing the (c) diversification of income sources; and (d) livestock genetic improvements and animal health. All these represent the response to the need to enhance the resilience of the population in the project area. Knowledge generation from the project investment is critical also as a way to ensure guidance to future investment in the livestock domain. The project will follow up and will explore possibility to engage in the national policy dialogue by bringing experience from its investments

The exit strategy of the project relies on the capacity to strengthen the rural institutions in order for them to maintain their basic functions and aims in the medium run. More specifically concerning the rural institutions, the financial and institutional sustainability of PUUs, CIGs, and WIGGs is critically important. In order to reinforce the exit strategy, the Project will ensure that the National gender, youth and business development consultant – once recruited, will immediately start guiding Project District officers and in turn the PUUs in the basic elements described above.

In the framework of the elaboration of an exit strategy, the Project will ensure that the supported institutions (at local and national level) are equipped with tools and capacities to ensure their sustainability in the medium term, including focus on: (a) presence of an adequate regulatory framework; (b) adequate structure in place; (c) sufficient sources and inflow of financial resources; (d) stakeholders' demand; (e) convergence of interest of parties. Specific elements of the sustainability of the institutions are described later in the MTR report (Exit Strategy).

D. Overview and Project Progress

Since effectiveness (February 2016), benefitting also from the experience and lessons learned from the first Livestock and Pasture Development Project (LPDP, August 2011 – September 2018), the project has demonstrated a satisfactory performance.

Suspension: Livestock and Pasture Development Project (LPDP) Project funds were frozen (US\$596,968) in

Tajprombank where the project bank account was held due to bankruptcy in early 2016. As a result of the freeze, IFAD suspended its portfolio in the country on 5 December 2018. On 31 May 2019, the Government of Tajikistan refunded the remaining balance (US\$ 583,416.70), and IFAD lifted the suspension in a letter dated 18 June 2019.

In reality, the suspension throttled implementation for longer than a year. The looming threat of suspension caused the PMU to defer signing of significant contracts a long time before its onset out of fiduciary concerns. The period of suspension itself disrupted the procurement pipeline that is now being re-launched and accelerating up to normal pace. Also, some key personnel were lost. This happened even as the PMU maintained the key functions of the PMU, including critically important recurrent expenditures (staff, office costs, monitoring). During the suspension, the PMU performed activities related to the facilitation of PUU planning process, as well as regular project monitoring, including the annual update of outcome level indicators. After suspension, the PMU prepared a revised AWPB adjusted for implementation between June and December 2019.

Component 1: Institutional Development

Sub-component 1.1: Development of Community Organisations

Pasture Users Unions established. The project has achieved its target and has established 180 PUUs (of which one has withdrawn from the project) and an additional 15 more villages have been identified for PUU establishment thanks to project's savings. All PUU boards have maintained on average a minimum of 30% women among their members. The project has also surpassed its outreach target (38,000 HH) and currently stands at 41,045 HH, expected to further increase as due to the inclusion of additional 15 villages. Almost all established PUUs (i.e., 179) have adopted and the Community Livestock and Pasture Management Plans (CLPMPs), based on which the project has initiated investments (sub-projects). These are mostly concerning: agricultural machinery, pasture infrastructure development, livestock breeding, fodder crop improvement and income diversification (further elements under sub component 3.1).

Based on the experience of the earlier LPDP (2011-2018), the PMU also established a Pasture User Association (PUA) for each district, registered as legal entities, with the function to provide support and representation for PUU members with local authorities. The project initiated also the establishment of *District Pasture Commissions* in each project district comprising of representatives of the local authorities (Tax committees, State land committee, Jamoats, Hukumats and the Forestry agency) and the Pasture User Association that is based on the pasture law.

Sustainability of PUUs. While the institutional arrangements of the PUUs appear satisfactory, the insufficiently regular and transparent documentation on the income sources and expenditures represents a risk for the sustainability and planning capacity of the PUUs themselves (including for equipment operation and maintenance). In addition, CLPMPs, initially conceived as tools exclusively aimed at mobilizing LPDP project funds, should be seen in a wider and longer perspective and considered as a permanent community based planning and fundraising tool. The capacities of PUUs to extend CLPMPs should thus be reinforced in this last phase of implementation, and as part of the implementation of the project exit strategy, trainings should be organized to enable PUUs to develop their post LPDP CLPMPs.

Overall, the progress on the subcomponent is satisfactory (5)

Sub-component 1.2: Advancement of Policy and Legal Framework and Strengthening National Institutions

Under this sub-component, the project provided institutional support to several institutions including the Pasture Meliorative Trust (PMT), and the Tajik Agrarian University, but also supported policy dialogue and formulation, with a specific focus on the Pasture Law.

The project has significantly reinforced the technical capacities of the Pasture Meliorative Trust (PMT), through secondment of technical assistants, trainings, provision of logistical equipment and renovation of premises. It has also strengthened its institutional structure by revising the internal charter and creating a new pasture management department.

The support of the project to the revision of the Pasture Law, provided through the PMT, is a major achievement of the project. The renewal and reinforcement of this legal framework reinforces and secures the achievements at field level, especially the establishment of PUUs. The policy dialogue process deployed with the support of the project was very inclusive and involved national and local authorities, development partners, but also local communities. The main changes brought by the revised law are related to rights and duties of parties in lease arrangements, protection of pastures, payment and utilization of renting fees and definition of rights and duties of PUUs.

The project has made a substantial investment in Tajik Agrarian University (TAU) to support the development of Baccalaureate and Magister degrees in Sustainable Pasture Management in the Faculty of Agronomy, and by refurbishing classrooms and laboratories. TAU has enrolled respectively 18 and 24 students in a four year degree in 2018 and 2019, and scholarships are awarded to students who perform well on state tests. TAU has identified interns to spend summers with the PMT; 5 interns were assigned to the Kulob office of the PMT in summer 2018, this activity will continue until end of Project. Under International Training/Twinning Programme, during October-November of 2019, two professor of TAU will visit to Kyrgyz State Agrarian University. The TAU has an E-learning curriculum already set up and working, although it appears that few students present in Dushanbe are aware of this. The project will support strengthening the TAU's

capacity to conduct e-learning by investing into relevant videoconference equipment.

Overall, the progress on the subcomponent is satisfactory (5)

Sub-component 2.1: Productivity enhancement

Promotion of fodder production and conservation: In 2017, the project supported dekhan farmers to develop a seed multiplication activity. The outcome of this activity will need to be assessed on the long term to verify its efficiency and sustainability. 173 CIGs have received fodder seeds in 2018, and have established an average of 9.5 ha of crops each. It should however be noted that a large share of the seeds distributed through these activities were not fodder seeds but cereals.

In order to encourage the shift towards a greater use of cultivated fodder, it is recommended for the remaining period: (i) to encourage PUUs to give more priority (20% of investments) to fodder mechanization.; (ii) to pilot technical innovations on fodder, through capacity building, distribution of a larger range of seeds, strategic partnerships with projects working on fodder innovation and implementation of “fodder innovation” sub-projects under CLPMPs.

Sheep breeding. A total of 41 CIGs have been provided with 600 Hissar rams, to improve the productivity of local flocks. 703 additional rams have been provided to 64 PUUs under CLPMPs, and 20 new CIGs will be provided with 300 rams each in 2020. This will bring the total number of rams distributed to 1,603 and will lead to a ratio of 1 ram for 34 sheep in the project area, which should lead to a complete crossbreeding of flocks within less than two years. The impact of this activity on sheep genetics will thus be very significant.

Cattle breeding. 37 dairy bulls have been distributed to progressive farmers, who are supposed to use the bull for their own needs but also for the smallholders in their community. The project will distribute 221 more bulls, this time through PUUs, which should be more satisfactory in terms of outreach and impact. A transparent and clear management and monitoring mechanisms should be setup to ensure that these bulls benefits to all PUU members. The ratio of improved bull per cattle will be of 1/50 when all bulls will be operational, which should lead to substantial change of genetic potential.

The project has supported AI services in 2018 by providing kits and semen, but the demand remains low. One way to promote AI and improve its availability would be by private vets. The project shall participate in national dialogue based on the evidence of its investments, to support policy reforms and privatization of AI services.

Promotion of private entrepreneurship: 22 business plans have been developed under this activity, all for WIGGs. Private entrepreneurs were not in demand of these services which is why the project has focused on WIGGs only. Market access does not appear as a major constraint in the area, which also justifies why the project did not dedicate more efforts to support private aggregators; since this activity does not respond to a priority need, it is suggested to drop it for the second half of the project.

Overall, the progress on the subcomponent is satisfactory (5)

Subcomponent 2.2: Improved animal health.

Up to date, the following activities have been implemented: (i) Internal assessment of the TR Veterinary Services to identify the capacity gaps as well as to develop the subcomponent's implementation programme has been conducted by a national consultant; (ii) the list of 60 participating vets has been compiled and agreed for the distribution of the veterinary packages and training; (iii) the main topics for the trainings have been identified; (iv) the composition of the 60 vet packages has been compiled, procured and distributed among them.

The activities agreed during last IFAD supervision mission have been completed except for trainings. Others planned for sub component 2.2, such as the strengthening the State Veterinary Authority, renovation and procurement of the laboratory equipment have not been implemented yet due to structural changes. Regarding to The Government resolution (Dec 2017) the function of the State Veterinary Inspection (SVI) has been transferred to the newly established Food Security Committee (FSC) under the Government. This change has created challenges in LPDP's activities. The FSC's mandate to delegate appropriate functions to the private sector provides an opportunity to clarify and implement change with respect to the roles of public and private veterinary practitioners.

Following a request from the Government, an evaluation of the Veterinary Services based on OIE PVS methodology was conducted in November 2017. A suite of “treatments” under the OIE PVS Pathway is recommended. More detailed recommendations are listed under each critical competency in Part III of the report.^[1]

The FSC committee confirmed the need for having a comprehensive RT's Veterinary Services Development Strategy based on the OIE assessment and guidelines. This tool will be instrumental both to address the gaps identified in the PVS assessment and has already mobilize resources from the Government and donors. Since FAO has already initiated the process of supporting the formulation of this strategy (including the recruitment of an international consultant), it is recommended to partner with them and possibly with other development partners to undertake this exercise. FAO is going to conduct trainings for private vets in a few weeks. It is recommended to be in touch with them to avoid any duplication or

overlapping.

The utilization of funds (US\$ 324,900) for strengthening the State Veterinary Authority is of concern. The Government has several times changed its decision to use these funds. Their last offer was to use them for the purchase of laboratory equipment for a new veterinary laboratory which one under construction in Dangara. The Government should confirm this choice and submit an official request to the project as soon as possible, to enable the procurement process to start before the end of the year.

Overall, the progress on the subcomponent is satisfactory (5)

Sub component 3.1: Community Resilience Pasture Management and Investments

179 PUUs developed their CLPMPs. CLPMPs comprise the Pasture Management Plan (PMP), and the investment plan.

In all visited PUUs, PMPs were effectively implemented and enforced, and their acceptance by communities was excellent. The impact of implementation of the PMPs is not easy to assess at this stage. The introduction of rotation must have had a significant impact on pasture condition, and the mission observations and discussions confirm this trend. The survey conducted in 36 PUUs concluded that the pasture productivity had increased by 19% for the eatable biomass, but this difference could also be attributed to the better rainfall in 2019 and this change should be confirmed on the longer term.

In order to be able to monitor the impact of PMPs on pasture, it is recommended to: (i) continue to conduct the quantitative monitoring in 36 PUUs; (ii) conduct an assessment of the feeding value of pasture at least twice (iii) conduct a remote sensing analysis of pasture of all PUUs (iv) repeat the botanical survey conducted in 2018 to assess the impact of PMPs on the floristic composition of pasture.

Investment plans. All 179 PUUs developed their investments plans in 2016 and 2017. Each plan includes an average of 3 sub-projects. 405 have been approved so far: 58% are mechanization projects; 17% demonstration plots; 16% livestock improvement; and 9% infrastructure. 206 of these projects had been implemented. Considering the actual pace of implementation, it is very likely that all sub-projects are executed by the end of the project. In the course of implementation of their CLPMPs, many PUUs have felt the need to amend their plans. The PMU has been flexible enough to accommodate changes when they were relevant, and this must be commended.

The mechanization projects represent 53% of the total available budget of investment sub-projects. Only 7% of the total cost of mechanization equipment are specifically aimed at supporting fodder production and conservation; Higher investments in food and cash crop mechanization however present benefits, including contributing to the diversification of incomes hence reducing vulnerability. It also strengthens the sustainability of PUUs by increasing their incomes through services that are in high demand. Nevertheless, in order to increase the share of fodder related mechanization, it is recommended to raise awareness of PUUs on the need for increasing fodder production, and to aim at 20% of mechanization for fodder in the future.

The initial target, which was to allocate US\$ 8.5 million to climate resilient infrastructure will not be achieved. At this stage around US\$ 0.95 million have been allocated to sub-projects in this domain. However, in order to effectively contribute to reinforce the resilience to climate change, it is recommended to maintain efforts in this domain, and to aim at reaching a total investment of US\$ 3 million.

Overall, the progress on the subcomponent is satisfactory (5)

Sub component 3.2: Income Diversification

Common interest groups and Women Income Generation Groups. A Participatory Rural Appraisal (PRA) exercise was conducted in each village after PUU establishment, to identify Common Interest Groups (CIGs) and Women's income Generation Groups (WIGGs), with a focus on the poorer households in the village. In total, 453 trainings have been carried out and the project also established 173 CIGs for fodder crop production and 41 CIGs for sheep breeding. In addition, 27 WIGGs have been established focusing on activities of rosehip production/processing, beekeeping and dairy production/processing.

While the establishment and disbursement of assets is impressive, the mission observed a few areas of weakness that have possibly arisen as a result of the suspension which emphasize the need to speed up the recruitment of the gender and business development consultant.

<i>Agreed Action</i>	<i>Responsibility</i>	<i>Agreed Date</i>
Component 1: Institutional Development Sub-comp. 1.1 : Include in Community Facilitators curricula elements on the New Pasture Law (2019).	PMU/Community Facilitators	11/2019

Component 1: Institutional Development Start the dissemination of the content of the new Pasture Law	District project officers, pasture specialist	11/2019
Component 2: Productivity Enhancement and Improved Animal Health Update PUUs animal health plan according to the epizootic situation of each village as well as its implementation should be monitored timely.	Livestock specialist, PUU's head, District Vet Authority	12/2019
Component 2: Productivity Enhancement and Improved Animal Health In case of need or upon request from FSC, hire a laboratory specialist to prepare technical specification of FSC request to facilitate the procurement process	FSC, PMU	12/2019
Component 2: Productivity Enhancement and Improved Animal Health In consultation with IFAD, contact FAO and OIE to propose coordination and possibly partnership on veterinary issues	PMU	12/2019
Component 1: Institutional Development Ensure that all PUUs keep books on motor-hours, ha serviced per service and PUU 's benefits from the use of machineries	Community facilitators	01/2020
Component 2: Productivity Enhancement and Improved Animal Health Upon request and agreement of FSC, organize a round table with one-two days training for FSC/ Veterinary Department Staff on OIE mission, goal, and benefits.	PMU International Consultant	01/2020
Component 2: Productivity Enhancement and Improved Animal Health Conduct refreshers trainings for the projects' vets	PMU, Livestock specialist	02/2020
Component 3: Pasture Development and Diversification for Vulnerability Reduction In order to refocus on fodder and climate-related investments for the remaining sub-projects in already existing PUUs (estimated balance yet to be allocated: US\$ 2.9 million), the Project will stimulate the following: o At least US\$ 1.8 million will be dedicated to climate resilient infrastructures. o At least US\$ 1.1 million will be dedicated to fodder production and/or conservation related equipment	PMU / District Project Officers / Community Facilitator	06/2020
Component 2: Productivity Enhancement and Improved Animal Health Engage in partnerships with development partners involved on technical innovation for fodder production and conservation (including GIZ, ADB, others) such as new fodder varieties, conservation techniques, to encourage them to implement some of their activities in the project areas, and disseminate findings in PUUs.	PMU, and district project officers	08/2020

Component 2: Productivity Enhancement and Improved Animal Health Ensure that the targets set for bull distribution are met, and that the bulls distributed through PUUs benefit to a large share of population		08/2020
Component 3: Pasture Development and Diversification for Vulnerability Reduction Provide business development training to the WIGGs and CIGs	National BDS consultant	08/2020
Component 1: Institutional Development Further awareness raising activities for PUUs on applicable adaptation measures according to the specific climate change effects on pastures and rain-fed crop lands	National Climate Adaption and Environment Consultant, Community facilitators	09/2020
Component 1: Institutional Development Provide technical support and training for improvement of pastures by means of reseeded native species of fodder crops, locust control, reduction of pressure on climate affected pasture lands	National Climate Adaption and Environment Consultant, Community facilitators	09/2020
Component 3: Pasture Development and Diversification for Vulnerability Reduction In order to refocus on fodder and climate-related investments for the sub-projects of the 15 additional PUUs to be established (estimated allocated budget: US\$ 2.0 million), the Project will stimulate the following: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> o At least 20% of the New Villages' machineries investment need to be specifically dedicated to fodder. o At least 50% of the New Village's investments need to be for climate resilient infrastructure. 		

E. Project implementation

a. Development Effectiveness

Effectiveness and Developmental Focus

Effectiveness

Rating: 5

Previous rating: 5

Justification of rating

Despite the interruption of investment during suspension, the project kept a sustained progress towards its development objectives. The establishment of 179 functioning PUUs (all with office equipment including GPS equipment and about half with mobile office) is an element of potential future sustainability. The implementation of CLPMPs in all PUUs – including pasture rotation, is a promising sign of PUUs capacities. The creation of 214 CIGs and 22 WIGGs for women empowerment represent a high potential for socio-economic improvement. The progress at output level (including for 15 additional villages) appears on track to ensure timely completion of project activities. Outcome level analyses on productivity and behavioural changes are recommended to guide the project in its last phase.

Log-Frame Analysis & Main Issues of Effectiveness

The formulation and implementation of pasture management plans by the PUUs, and in particular the introduction of pasture rotation, will indubitably lead to reduce the degradation and increase the productivity of the pasture, which is the core of the theory of change of the project. However, these efforts may not be sufficient to put an end to the degradation process due to overgrazing, since the global trend in livestock inventories shows a constant increase of the last decades. This trend may not affect the attainment of project outcomes in the mid-term, because improvements in pasture

productivity will be of a greater scale than the increase in livestock inventories. It could however attenuate the project impact in particular in the longer term.

Even if the project was not designed to attempt to reduce animal populations, which would also require policy and regulatory efforts, it could however contribute to slow the increase of animal populations. It could for instance initiate and pilot activities aiming at supporting farmers and PUUs that are willing to do so, to initiate a shift towards systems that are more intensive, and less dependent on pasture for feeding their animals, which implies working on increasing production and utilization of cultivated fodder, and a better crop-livestock integration. These more intensive systems would require more productive animals, and thus parallel efforts on genetic improvement.

Development Focus

Targeting and Outreach

Rating: 5

Previous rating: 5

Justification of rating

The effectiveness of targeting in the project is considered satisfactory. The project does meet its intended target group namely smallholder livestock farmers, private veterinary service providers and women headed households. The targeting strategy is being effectively implemented as per PIM. The Project has taken the following targeting approaches: (i) geographical targeting for selection of the Jamoats with the potential for livestock and pasture development; (ii) selection of villages along the poverty data profiles; (iii) household targeting according to the Project's poverty and gender criteria (wealth ranking exercise); (iv) gender targeting for specific Project activities through fixing special quotas for their inclusion.

Main issues

The PUU has nominated households to participate in the fodder development activity in accordance with the following criteria: (i) poor households; (ii) women headed households; (iii) household's dependent on livestock as a main source of income; (iv) own no more than 0.5 ha of irrigated land or no more than 1.0 hectares of rain fed land. The PIM also outlines that the WIGG projects target poorer households owning less than 0.25 hectares of irrigated land and no more than 0.5 hectares of rainfed land, but this could not be validated in the field. In this regard, the mission suggests a profiling of the women's group and their participation is conducted by the gender/business development specialist to understand the degree to which the targeting has been effective.

Gender equality & women's participation

Rating: 5

Previous rating: 5

Justification of rating

Considering the national context, the projects gender focus remains satisfactory. However, additional efforts are required to maximize benefits on women empowerment from WIGGs and other gender sensitive project tools. The mission recognises that in general the project is doing well with regard to its gender focus albeit its implementation remains quota-driven. Notwithstanding, the very high capacity of the PMU, the renewal contract of the gender specialist/BDS specialist and the strong beneficiary participation create an opportunity to do more. The projects M&E system adequately captures gender disaggregated data and all RIMS indicators are disaggregated. Targets for women's inclusion and activities have all been met and in some instances (WIGGs, beneficiary participation) surpassed.

Main issues

As documented against the Log Frame, 30% of all PUU boards comprise of women. However, based on interviews in the field, the mission was not convinced that women's participation remains strong. There is strong recognition of the sub-component 3.2 on Women's Income diversification through the WIGGs although the business sustenance and growth elements and the optimization of utilities could be further strengthened. The mission reviewed the LPDP II gender strategy and found that its objectives clearly articulate the pillars for women's empowerment but there is scope for much strengthening. It is suggested that gender specialist in tandem with the PMU review the gender strategy and draw up an activity work plan for until the end of the project. The mission also suggests the PMU explore the successful achievements of the first GALS/HHM experience in the central Asia region in Kyrgyzstan, the use of these methodologies contributed to strengthen women's empowerment and overall project effectiveness. In this regard, is suggested that a small amount of resources be set aside for exchange tour to Kyrgyzstan.

An assessment of the capacity of PMU staff to implement a gender sensitive approach in all Project interventions was planned although this has not been carried out. The planned assessment also includes focusing on project analysis and drawing specific measures to strengthen the participation of women in the Project activities and the capacity of implementing partners in this regard. The previous supervision mission also noted that gender studies have been conducted in 22 villages to assess gender empowerment and impact. The mission recommends that the to-be recruited specialist also focus on conducting these assessments.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
PMU exposure to GALS and HHMs Organize an exchange tour to Kyrgyzstan for PMU to explore the successful achievements of the first Gender Action Learning Systems (GALS) and Household management methodologies (HHM) experience in the central Asia	PMU	06/2020

Agricultural Productivity

Rating: 5

Previous rating: 5

Justification of rating

Project activities are leading to a substantial increase in agricultural productivity in the project area. However, at this stage it is not possible to assess progress towards productivity targets (+15% milk yields, +10% weight of animals sold for meat). The MTR survey (Nov. 2019) will complement the info. Introduction of Pasture Management Plans in all 179 PUUs is leading to a significant improvement in pasture productivity, and quality. The better availability and quality of pasture, combined with parallel efforts on animal health and genetics result in improved animal productivity (milk and meat production). Such increase is being measured, quantified and documented but its monitoring will require some improvements and further analyses to confirm trends and eliminate bias.

Main issues

Pasture productivity. The impact of implementation of the PMPs on the productivity and condition of pasture is not easy to assess at this stage of the project. From a theoretical point of view, the introduction of rotation must have had a significant impact already on pasture condition. The mission observations and feedback from the PUU members confirm this positive trend. The in situ quantitative survey conducted by the PMU in 36 PUUs, concluded that the pasture productivity had increased by 8% for the total biomass, and 19% for the eatable biomass. However, this incremental productivity could also be attributed to the better rainfall received in 2019 (322.4 mm from January to August) compared to 2018 (280.96 mm for the whole year). This trend should be confirmed on the longer term with at least 4 years of observations.

The significant difference in incremental productivity of total biomass and eatable biomass, indicates a qualitative improvement of pasture, which is a logic effect of introduction of rotation. A geobotanical survey was conducted by GIPOZEM in 2018 in 5 selected sites and consisted in a global assessment of spatures, as well as in a detailed floristic inventories. It will be critical to renew this exercise around the end of the project, to compare the two situations and thus assess the effect of PMPs of the pasture condition.

In order to produce more solid data, and be able to monitor the impact of improved management, it is also recommended to: (i) continue to conduct the in situ quantitative monitoring undertaken by the PMU pasture specialist in the 36 PUUs; (ii) conduct an assessment of the feeding value of pasture samples at least twice in the remaining project lifetime (using the Feed and Fodder Laboratory of the Food Security Committee if it is refurbished by the project); (iii) conduct a remote sensing analysis of pasture of all PUUs, using the Normalized Difference Vegetation Index (NDVI) or other climate variables through remote sensing analysis tools such as the FAO developed Earthmap platform.^[1]

Animal productivity. The increase in animal productivity should be both a consequence of the improved productivity and condition of pasture (more and better grass available) and a result on other activities on animal health, fodder production, and genetics (introduction of Hissar rams in sheep and dairy bulls in cattle). Monitoring of animal productivity is undertaken every year in the scope of the project outcome survey. There is no baseline and the first set of data available is for 2018. Unfortunately, 2018 data can hardly be compared to 2019 because the dates of monitoring were different, because the size of samples were not the same, and also because the accuracy of data collected in 2018 was too low (round figures for milk, without decimals)

Productivity of sheep. The outcome survey recorded the weight at various ages of the Hissar crossed offspring, but in the absence of control sample (pure local animal), the added value of the crossbreeding is difficult to assess. It would thus be critical to measure the same criteria on flocks of pure local breeds, in order to allow comparison and assessment of impact (preferably at midterm and completion).

Milk productivity. The outcome survey shows an increase of 7% (5.3 to 5.7 litres) which is not very significant and cannot lead to any conclusion for the moment. In the future, it would be critical to measure milk production at the same period of the year to eliminate any seasonal bias, if possible at peak (May-June) since dairy production is very dependent on grass availability.

^[1] Earth Map (<https://beta.earthmap.org>) is an innovative tool that facilitates and empowers users in performing historical and current climate-environmental analysis for a given area (regional, inter-regional, national, district, and sub-district) through a graphical interface that has been developed by FAO thanks to its partnership with Google. The tool ensures an objective evidence-based approach not only to support project design but to be accessible in future for monitoring and

evaluation activities, as well.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Monitoring of pasture productivity Conduct in-situ qualitative assessment of pasture (mid-term and end of project) and ex-situ quantitative monitoring (remote sensing), annually .	Pasture Specialist, with support from IFAD (on remote sensing analysis)	12/2020

Nutrition

Rating: N/A

Adaptation to Climate Change

Rating: 4

Previous rating: 4

Justification of rating

All 179 PUUs' CLMPs include pasture rotation plans with satellite maps and detailed grazing schedule. Some of the CLMPs include climate change adaptation specific sub-projects, including: 36 sub-projects for pasture ecosystem restoration; 34 sub-projects for establishment of demo plots for improving pasture lands by means of advanced technologies; and 32 sub-projects for construction of water points for livestock. The introduction of Waterboxx for drought-tolerant trees and bushes plantations is another example for adaptation to climate change. The visited PUUs showed awareness of climate change implications to agriculture and livestock, emphasized by the negative impact on rainfed crops and pastures of recent relatively drier springs and autumns with low annual precipitation.

Main issues

Capacity building on adaptation to climate change. Due to the six-month project suspension, the Project could not keep contracts of its pasture monitoring / environmental consultant and environmental consultant. The latter was able to support the Project to a certain extent in awareness raising of the PUU members about climate change affects to pastures, but the interruption left substantial parts of knowledge transfer unfulfilled, in particular about awareness raising of the project beneficiaries on the need for adaptation to climate change and applicable best practices and feasible measures for climate change adaptation. The recruitment of the National Climate Adaptation and Environmental Consultant is ongoing.

Climate data consideration. The Project is strongly aligned with, and contributes to the priorities of the Third National Communication of Tajikistan to UNFCCC, which identifies agriculture and livestock among the sectors most vulnerable to climate change. The Project is also in line with the Climate Change Adaptation Strategy 2015-2030, developed under the leadership of the Agency for hydrometeorology of Committee of Environmental Protection. However, the Agency for Hydrometeorology does not appear sufficiently involved within the project implementation and there no cooperation has been observed between this institution and the key project actors and stakeholders. Since irrigated lands are limited for poor HH in the Project area, the PUUs members are largely dependent on rain-fed arable lands and pastures. The PUU members are aware of how climate change affects their pastures, but lack sufficient awareness on applicable immediate and long-term adaptation measures, leading to frustrations on possible remedial and adaptation options. Weather projections or longer term trends of climate change could help them take measures to undertake adaptation measures, or adjust their agricultural activities to minimize their economic losses as well as reduce pressure on the pastures.

In light of the climate focus of the project, the PMU could gain knowledge and awareness of climate change related challenges and ensures engaging in partnerships with relevant national institutions and development partners operating in the domain of climate change adaptation and climate resilient infrastructures (an example include the collaborations between the ADB and the Agency for Hydrometeorology). The PMU should also ensure that relevant climate projections and weather forecast data reach out the stakeholders in the project areas. In particular, the PMU will stimulate the participation of the regional branch of Agency for Hydrometeorology of the State Committee of Environmental Protection in the district-level Pasture Regulation Commissions meetings. This will allow the PUAs in the area to receive exposure to whether data. Relevant information will be transmitted to PUUs by the Community Facilitators with support of the Project's National Climate Adaptation and Environmental Consultant, in turn supported by IFAD technical specialist backstopping (TORs provided in Appendix 4).

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Filling vacant position of national expert Ensure rapid filling of vacant position of National climate adaptation and environment consultant	PMU	11/2019
Involvement of Hydrometeorology Agency Invite the regional branch of Agency for Hydrometeorology of the State Committee of Environmental Protection to participate in district-level Pasture Regulation Commissions	National Climate Adaption and Environment Consultant	01/2020

b. Sustainability and Scaling up

Institutions and Policy Engagement	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 5
---	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

The project has successfully influenced the policy framework related to pasture management by proposing amendments which have contributed to issuing a new Pasture Law in June 2019. The work was conducted through inclusive policy dialogue involving smallholders through PUUs and local authorities. It has significantly increased the institutional capacities of institutions such as the Pasture Meliorative Trust (PMT) at national level, and PUUs at local level. The project needs to keep supporting PMT towards New Law's implementation to ensure sustainability and impact.

Main issues

Support to review of the Pasture Law The Pasture Law, which was adopted in 2013 without an appropriate consultative and informed decision process (including of pasture users), was innovative but inadequate. The support of the project to the revision of the Law, which was provided through the PMT and the experts mobilized by LPDP II seconded to this institution, is a major achievement of the project. The renewal and reinforcement of this legal framework reinforces and secures the achievements at field level, especially the establishment of PUUs.

The project has supported a very inclusive and comprehensive policy dialogue process that involved national and local authorities, development partners, but also local communities through PUUs and PUAs. A working group was established at national level, and public hearings were also held at regional level, to collect views and suggestions from the grassroots level actors. With the support of the LPDP II national expertise, amendments affecting around 70% of the articles of the original law were proposed. The New Law was approved in June 2019.

The main changes brought by the revised law include, among others: (i) definition of rights and duties of parties in lease arrangements; (ii) introduction of legal provisions related to protection of pastures; (iii) clarifications on payment and utilization of renting fees by local authorities, including for pasture protection; (iv) definition of rights and duties of PUUs and PUAs; (v) establishment of local pasture regulation commissions.

Policy support - Breeding policy. The project will make a major contribution to breeding in the project area, through introduction of bulls, rams, and support to AI. This will lead to a profound change in genetic characteristics of animals, and issues like the conservation of local breeds, or level of crossbreeding to target, will need to be addressed in a strategic manner. The project should thus participate in policy dialogue on AI and genetic improvement by: (i) analyzing M&E data, MTR survey report, and other statistics on livestock genetic improvement and artificial insemination; (ii) identifying opportunities for national policy dialogue; and (iii) participating in events of national policy dialogue, in partnership with other development partners (i.e., Asian Development Bank's upcoming project on dairy).

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Participate in policy dialogue on breeding Through documentation of lessons learnt, production of evidences, and participation in national discussion fora	Livestock specialist	12/2020

Partnership-building	Rating: 4	Previous rating: 5
-----------------------------	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

The most effective and relevant project partnership is with the Pasture Meliorative Trust (PMT), which requires continued

attention and support in developing a sustainable plan to keep ensuring provision of services to the pasture users. The positive collaboration with TAU (including the 18 + 24 students enrolled in 2018 and 2019 respectively in Sustainable Pasture Management Degree) represents an opportunity even beyond the project scope to mobilizing knowledge for policy dialogue. The collaboration with FSC/SVI is an opportunity to scale up at national level the knowledge gained by the project's investment in animal health and genetic improvements. The collaboration with Oryan as CF for the 15 additional villages is also an opportunity to consolidate the national capacities.

Main issues

Increased attention is recommended to establish partnerships in the climate and environmental domain, including by strengthening the existing ones with the State Committee of Land Management and Geodesy (used to conduct pasture geo-botanical analysis), and establishing new ones, e.g., with ADB projects in collaboration with Hydromet. The upcoming recruitment of the national climate and environment specialist and the envisaged backstopping from IFAD technical adviser (TORs in Appendix 4) represent an opportunity to this end.

Human and Social Capital and Empowerment

Rating: 5

Previous rating: 5

Justification of rating

The project has successfully maintained a clear strategy for reaching out to poor rural women and men. CF conducted workshops using wealth ranking exercises to determine the poverty ranking within communities, allowing community members to better understand the relative social and economic differentiation and variance in household needs. This led to positive pro-poor initiatives by PUUs, e.g., maintaining discounted quotas for poorer households in renting agricultural machinery; exemption from paying PUU membership fees. The project targets the poorest while distributing the fodder seeds from the seed funds (513 HH). Under the CLPMPs, 4640 Turkeys and 62 incubator start-up packages will be distributed by end-2019 to 464 poorest households based on the wealth ranking.

Quality of Beneficiary Participation

Rating: 4

Previous rating: 5

Justification of rating

The level of participation at grassroots level is highly satisfactory. The project's delivery mechanism is effective in translating PUUs members demands into actual investment, as shown by the implementation of the CLPMPs. However, caution is recommended in the establishment of possible CIGs and WIGs in the additional 15 villages, to ensure ownership and empowerment of the groups' members.

Main issues

While the PUU council members that have been interviewed appear mid to high range wealth ranking HH, it should be acknowledged that these individuals are crucial to handling the bureaucracy of the project and therefore ensure its success. However, the availability of HH wealth ranking data at the level of the PUU would make it easy for the PMU to monitor the average wealth ranking of HHs on PUU council, in order to identify those where PUU councils become dominated by wealthier HH members. This would help in monitoring the risk of elite capture and also identify those where poorer HH members have been elected and to learn lessons from such examples on how poorer HH can be improved.

Responsiveness of Service Providers

Rating: 5

Previous rating: 5

Justification of rating

64. General experience with services provided under the project is generally found of satisfactory good, with timely delivery and within the budget. Service providers included: two community facilitator NGOs in charge of community mobilization (Al Amar and Oryan – the latter recruited again for the 15 additional villages), veterinarians, technicians/engineers, a company recruited for the mid-term survey, and Giprozem (which conducted a geobotanical survey in 5 selected sites. Reports of international consultants, who have provided technical assistance to the project, are of good quality and generally technically sound, with appropriate recommendations and support for project implementation

Main issues

It will be critical to renew the geobotanical survey around the end of the project, to compare the two situations and thus assess the effect of PMPs of the pasture condition

Environment and Natural Resource Management

Rating: 4

Previous rating: 5

Justification of rating

The Project, through its Components 1 and 3, is contributing to more sustainable management of available natural resources (irrigated/rain-fed arable land, water and pasture) in the project area. Thus, the Project has been enhancing the environmental management and climate change adaptation capacities of Project beneficiaries, and therefore supporting the measures proposed by the Third National Communication of the Tajikistan to the UNFCCC. However, more emphasis on environmental and natural resource management sustainability is required to ensure progressing towards less but more productive livestock production system. as the focus of community investments has not in all cases optimally supported this goal. As mentioned above, a stronger focus on fodder crops is recommended.

Main issues

The Project supports a number of techniques and technologies showing the Project efforts on introduction of CC adaptation, but also rational use of natural resources. The most significant include: (a) rotational grazing, adopted by all PUUs, with benefits for pasture conditions and resilience to climate related stressors; (b) 20 fenced demo plots, showing the vegetation response to absence of livestock grazing and a wide range of native species of grass; (c) rosehip and pistachio demo planted with Groasis Waterboxes, where the dry-tolerant bush provide profitable fruits and shade/windbreaks to ease heat stress on animals; (d) increased production of irrigated fodder crops (alfalfa, fodder beet and maize), leading to reduction of pressure on pastures. Within their CLPMPs, the PUUs have priority sub-projects also for pasture ecosystem restoration and construction of climate resilient and environmentally sound infrastructure, which have been supported by the project under the ASAP grant.

Dry tolerant species of fodder crops. The project has largely supported cultivation of irrigated fodder crops in the project area such as alfalfa, maize, fodder beets and barley, which have greatly contributed in production of fodder and improved availability of high quality seeds locally for the poor. The project has introduced also the rain-fed sainfoin crop, which is drought – resistant and is a multi-year crop that can be grazed, but also harvested for seeds and fodder production. The sainfoin can be cultivated also on a part of the pastures of the PUUs and gradually multiplied over the rest of the pastures being under rotation. In addition, the Project could support the PUUs in exploring and obtaining other dry – tolerant multi-year fodder crops for hand-broadcasting and multiplication throughout the PUUs pastures.

Climate resilient and environmentally sound infrastructure. Adaptation will require more resilient infrastructure, more climate-resilient technologies, and new applicable practices to counter the increased climate risks. The sub-projects planned and executed so far include only in limited portion climate resilient infrastructures. In general, this is caused by the PUUs' preference for agricultural machineries investments – which still present positive yet indirect impacts on environment, and the high cost of the climate resilient pasture infrastructure.

For the remaining part, the project is recommended to refocus on environmental and climate-related investments to enhance the climate change resilience. Innovative technologies and practices include resilient agro-pastoral practices, rain water management and gradual restoration of pasture ecosystems (details in Appendix 4).

Exit Strategy	Rating: 4	Previous rating: 5
---------------	-----------	--------------------

Justification of rating

The support to developing capacities of the established (PUAs, PUUs or member-based groups) or supported institutions (at national / local level, such as PMT, FSC/SVI) represent an asset for the exit strategy of the project. Securing land rights through certification is also an additional asset and the new Pasture law represent an opportunity for all project's partners. Nevertheless, starting to develop an exit strategy for the project or for the institutions and stakeholders is a priority. The exit strategy will depend on the extent to which the Project will be able to ensure sustainability of the local member based institutions (PUUs, PUAs, WIGGs, CIGs) and national institutions (PMT).

Main issues

Sustainability of the Pasture Meliorative Trust The project has greatly contributed to strengthen PMT operational capacities through logistical support, capacity building, secondment of experts, policy support, and even through contribution to some of its operational costs of the PMT (e.g., pasture monitoring). The dependency of PMT on LPDP support is therefore important.

In order to envisage measures that would mitigate the impact of project closure on PMT operability, it appears critical at this stage of the project to engage in a strategic thinking on project exit strategy. The project closure will deprive the PMT from key staff and other resources, and the lack of own and alternative resources may hinder the PMT future capacities to fulfil its current mandate, as well as possible additional tasks related to the Pasture Law, if PMT was entrusted the role of implementing and enforcing the law. At the time of MTR, the decree for the operationalization of the Pasture Law had not been issued, and it is not clear whether the PMT or another institution will be given this role.

The project could address this challenge by providing further support to the PMT in carrying out an internal strategic thinking, as part of the formulation of the project exit strategy, aiming at identifying alternative sources of incomes to maintain capacity. This process could consist in the formulation of a PMT strategic plan, including a midterm budget and resource mobilization strategy. This issue could also be brought to the agenda of wider discussion fora such as the

Pasture Working Group, where other actual or potential partners of the PMT are present.

Sustainability of CLPMPs. CLPMPs have been conceived primarily as tools aimed at mobilizing LPDP/II project funds. Their short-term lifespan available until Project completion allows the PUUs to test their functioning and to strengthen their implementation capacities in due course. Nevertheless, CLPMPs should be seen in a wider and longer perspective and considered as a permanent community based planning and fundraising tool. Currently they are meant to be financed by the LPDP/II only, but they could be used in the future to leverage other resources such as those from local governments, or simply plan the utilization of PUUs own resources. The capacities of PUUs to extend CLPMPs should thus be reinforced in this last phase of implementation, and as part of the implementation of the project exit strategy, trainings should be organized to enable PUUs to develop their post LPDP/II CLPMPs, including elements that will help PUUs in accessing alternative financial sources. For the institutional sustainability, the Project will ensure that the PUUs start publishing on a regular basis the quarterly budget in publicly accessible boards. Moreover, the PUUs will be assisted in developing machineries and other assets management plans.

The machineries and product processing lines/equipment as well as the supported climate-resilient infrastructure will gradually require proper maintenance. As part of PUUs sustainability, sufficient attention needs to be paid to proper operation and maintenance mechanisms.

Potential for Scaling-up	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 5
--------------------------	-----------	--------------------

Justification of rating

Through the PMT, the PUU model is being scaled up outside the scope and target geographic area of the project. So far 22 PUUs have become active in 3 Districts, with more planned. These new PUUs are formed under the authority of the new Pasture Law, with formal Hukumat approval and financial independence. Adoption of pasture rotation models based on the experience of LPDP/II shall be encouraged also in unreached villages by PMT or other institutions. At this stage, it is critical for the project to participate in national policy dialogue and engage in discussions with other Projects or organization working on livestock development, pasture management and climate resilience to share its experiences

c. Project Management

Quality of Project Management	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 5
-------------------------------	-----------	--------------------

Justification of rating

The effectiveness of the PMU is guaranteed by a solid leadership, backed by strong financial management and procurement staff and the experienced technical team. The processes of planning, budgeting and reporting process follow the established system of implementing IFAD projects, including the preparation of Annual Work Plan and Budgets (AWPBs). The Project Steering Committee (PSC), headed by the Deputy Minister of Agriculture, has been meeting on a regular basis. Despite the suspension, the PMU maintained key functions and ensured minimal deceleration of the project delivery.

Main issues

With the suspension in December 2018, the PMU could no longer retain community facilitators and the Gender officer. Despite the reduced capacity to implement and supervise the activities and investments in the field, the PMU maintained a minimum level of follow up, ensuring a rapid restoration of the activities. At the time of MTR mission, three months after the lifting of the suspension, the PMU has produced an AWPB, approved by IFAD, and has been implementing it at rapid speed. Specifically on staffing and community mobilization, the PMU issued a tender to contract one organization acting as community facilitator for the 15 additional villages; and has started the selection process for the recruitment of a National gender, youth and business development consultant; and of a National climate adaptation and environment consultant.

Knowledge Management	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 5
----------------------	-----------	--------------------

Justification of rating

Despite the portfolio suspension, the project managed to regularly update its webpage and disseminate any updates within this period. In addition, the project also developed a media tool kit for journalist. This gained additional visibility within this period mobilizing a mass media strategy and garnering interest in the projects achievements. The PMU reported that the media reports generated interest in the project and were invited to share and exchange knowledge on the PUU modalities with districts outside the targeted area – as a result 4 more PUU were established. As a result, the IFAD projects are widely known in the relevant districts and within the administration.

Main issues

The coming recruitment of Gender and Environment experts and the backstopping from IFAD on the latter will further

improve the project's capacity to generate knowledge products. The mission highly recommends the translation of knowledge products in Tajik – or at least a basic information relating to them – for circulation.

Value for Money	Rating: 4	Previous rating: 4
------------------------	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

In general, the project has progressed timely and within budget, with only limitedly deceleration due to suspension. The project reached 108% of its target population and 179/180 targeted villages have functioning PUUs with CLPMPs. While maintaining its investment targets, the project generated savings in order to reach an additional 15 villages for PUU establishment and CLPMP. Moreover, PMT replicated PUUs in other districts with additional increase the projects' outreach. CLPMPs' investments and support to animal health and genetic improvement demonstrated to be profitable, but the utilization of the assets shows high variance, and PUUs income accordingly. Deeper understanding of the functioning and utilization of PUUs investment is needed to ensure the highest benefits/cost ratio.

Main issues

The positive results of institutional building and capacity development of PUUs, PUAs, PMT and other institutions represents an high value addition of the project, and the parallel expansion from PMT beyond the project area shows a high potential for a paradigm shift in the country. The productivity of the assets provided to PUUs is generating positive results and to a certain extent increase in agriculture productivity. A Mid Term review survey is ongoing, which will allow to assess progress and quantitative increases of pasture, milk and meat productivity as well as other outcome level results.

The investment of PUUs as well as in the 214 CIGs and 22 WIGGs the financial benefits are positive and promising, although with variance and somehow lack of clarity concerning the full potential utilization of the assets received. For instance, the mission observed a high variation in PUU revenue from mechanization services from about TJS 4,000 up to TJS 17,000, slightly below what observed during previous supervisions. Nevertheless, Results on CIGs and WIGGs interventions are positive on the short term and all interviewed women reported a positive outcome of the initiative and an increase in income. In the beekeeping groups visited in Dangara, women could produce 70 kg of honey, mostly for marketing with an average of 10 kg for own consumption.

The results of the seed multiplication through dekhani farmers was positive, thanks to the increased availability of high quality seeds on the market and about 513 farmers in target area having directly received fodder seeds as part of the mechanism. However, the planned ratio whereby dekhani farmers would devolve 1.5 times the quantity of seeds received, seems somehow inefficient both in terms of quantity and of time-lag in the distribution (one year after).

The other mechanism that has been put in place by the project to enhance availability of fodder seeds has been the establishment of Common Interest Groups (CIG) specifically focusing on fodder seeds. 173 CIGs (almost in all PUUs) gathering 3,586 PUU members have been established. These CIGs have received the seeds and fertilizers that enabled them to establish 1,134 ha of crops. According to a survey conducted in 2019 on a sample of 56 of these CIGs, this activity has benefited to 22.5 households per CIG in average, and each household has established 0.42 ha of crops in average.

It should however be noted that a large proportion of the seeds distributed both under the first operation through dekhani farmers and the second through CIGs were not fodder seeds per se, but cereals seeds (barley, wheat, maize for grain). It is true that these crops also somehow indirectly benefit to livestock too through by products and part of the grains, but in a marginal manner. Only 20% of the total area sown by the 173 "fodder CIGs" was actually planted in real fodder (alfalfa 210 ha, and 6 ha of fodder beet). The impact of this operation on fodder production must thus be nuanced.

Coherence between AWPB and Implementation	Rating: 4	Previous rating: 5
--	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

The project overall disbursement rate from IFAD financing is 53%. In 2019, disbursement rate was heavily affected by the suspension for which only US\$ 0.706 million was disbursed. During the mission, the project submitted one withdrawal application for an amount of US\$ 0.458 million. From September to December, the project is planning to disburse US\$ 3.78 million. Commitments as on 31st August 2019 are as follows; \$ 0.9 million from IFAD grant and \$1.2 million from IFAD loan.

AWPB Inputs and Outputs Review and Implementation Progress

During the suspension, despite the reduced capacity to implement and supervise the activities and investments in the field, the PMU maintained a minimum level of follow up, ensuring a rapid restoration of the activities. At the time of MTR mission, three months after the lifting of the suspension, the PMU had produced an AWPB, approved by IFAD in June 2019, and has been implementing it at rapid speed. Specifically on staffing and community mobilization, the PMU issued a

tender to contract one organization acting as community facilitator for the 15 additional villages; and has started the selection process for the recruitment of a National gender, youth and business development consultant; and of a National climate adaptation and environment consultant. Considering that there is only one year and a half until completion, the planning and implementation must be monitored closely to ensure on time adjustments and to identify challenges.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Recruitment on vacant posts Ensure rapid filling of vacant positions of (i) National gender, youth and business development consultant; and (ii) National climate adaptation and environment consultant.	PMU	11/2019

Performance of M&E System **Rating: 5** **Previous rating: 5**

Justification of rating

90. The project implements a robust M&E plan that covers performance and progress related to all components periodically. The system uses a mix of direct and participatory monitoring to measure progress against its targets. Information is collected from communities through participatory monitoring and is routed via the district officers/relevant specialists and relayed to the M&E officer. The system is constructed using CSPRO and the information is regularly backed up on an external hard drive. The outcome survey information is being periodically performed and the mid-term survey is ongoing

M&E System Review

The project maintains a detailed geo-referenced output dashboard that indicates infrastructure, machinery and equipment benefitting each village. Random sampling of CIGs groups is done on annual basis (sample size 10) to gather information related to yields of fodder crop production. Although M&E indicators have been developed for WIGGs, the project should begin data collection immediately as this is currently not being done. The previous supervision mission had also suggested participatory M&E systems to monitor the performance of the income generation activities amongst WIGGs, however, due to the suspension this has yet to come into effect.

The mission noted that Farkor was part of the control group for the baseline information in LPDPI and recommends utilizing this information given that Farkor is part of LPDP II target area. This offers an opportunity for the M&E further track progress against the existing data sets. The mission also suggests sharing the M&E data analysis towards communities. This could also serve the purpose of awareness raising on achievements of the projects.

The mission welcomes the Mid-Term survey as a complementary source of information, but notices a discrepancy in timing between the MTR mission and the survey as the procurement of the company suffered from the delays caused by suspension. Under technical point of view, the mission has proposed some edits to the questionnaire (notably, on the questions to derive information on milk productivity) which are taken onboard by the contractor. In view of completion, the mission recommends paying sufficient attention to perform the final survey sufficiently in advance to allow an informed end-project results assessment.

Requirements of Social, Environmental and Climate Assessment Procedures (SECAP) **Rating: 4** **Previous rating: 4**

Justification of rating

By design, the Project is expected to result in positive social and environmental impacts through improvement in pasture rehabilitation/maintenance, grassland productivity, livestock productivity (risk category B). Environment monitoring indicators are included in the M&E system and are monitored on a regular basis to ensure that there is no negative impact from the Project activities related pasture development and diversification as well as livestock development. The awareness of the Project beneficiaries about sustainable natural resources and impacts of climate change has been raised but requires stronger efforts. The recruitment of the National consultant (dismissed during suspension) is a priority to ensure fulfilment of the SECAP review note recommendations.

SECAP Review

As per key issues defined within the SECAP review note, the Project has progressed relatively well addressing to a certain extent the key issues, namely unsustainable pasture management, climate change, governance of tenure rights and weak policy/legal framework and governmental support. The Project has also been implementing the recommendations generated in the SECAP review note, undertaking mitigation measures, endorsing multi-benefit approaches, providing incentives for good practices and enabling participatory processes. Nevertheless, the suspension of the project has relatively affected also implementation of these recommendations. Given the small scale nature of the

Component 3 interventions, no negative environmental impacts have been reported or observed in the visited sites. The engineering designs of the visited small-scale infrastructure sub-projects of the PUUs under the Component have been reviewed and approved by the concerned district – level state agencies and are in line with requirements of Tajikistan legislation. No major comment has been given for the designs of the sub-projects under the consideration. With the recruitment of a national climate adaptation and environment consultant, the backstopping from IFAD technical specialist (TORs provided in Appendix 4) and implementation of the MTR report the gaps should be filled in.

d. Financial Management & Execution

Disbursement by financier

Type	Name	Current Amount	Disbursed Amount	Actual Rate
Domestic Financing breakdown	National Government	\$446,000	\$0	0.0%
	Beneficiaries	\$1,348,000	\$0	0.0%

Acceptable Disbursement Rate

Rating: 4

Previous rating: 3

Justification of rating

At end of August 2019, the project has disbursed 53% from IFAD financing. Disbursement rate has increased in 2018 forming 33% out of total disbursement, there was a drop in disbursement since January 2019 because of the suspension (December 2018 to June 2019). January to August 2019 only 3% has been disbursed from IFAD total financing. The project is in its 3rd year of implementation. Project is planning to disburse \$3.78 million for the period from September to December 2019. If this amount was disbursed as planned, the rate for 2019 will increase from 3% to 19% and eventually this will result in increasing the overall disbursement rate to 69% as at the end of 2019. Commitments as at 31st of August 2019 are \$0.9 million from IFAD grant and \$1.2 million from IFAD loan.

Main issues

The main reason behind the low disbursement in 2019 is the suspension which was effective on 5 December 2018. The project disbursed \$1.37 million in December 2018 (after the suspension) to pay for commitments for contracts signed before the suspension. After the suspension lifting on 18 June 2019, the project submitted only 2 WAs for an amount of \$ 0.706 million. The following disbursement plan was submitted to IFAD covering up to the end of 2019.

Withdrawal Applications Plan - from September till December 2019					
	Sep	Oct	Nov	Dec	TOTAL
Loan	\$ 268 400.00		\$ 420 000.00	\$ 730 000.00	\$ 1 418 400.00
Grant	\$ 458 600.00	\$ 450 000.00	\$ 380 000.00	\$ 430 000.00	\$ 1 718 600.00
ASAP			\$ 400 000.00	\$ 250 000.00	\$ 650 000.00

Since September 2018 and December 2018, there were no transactions or spending under ASAP grant and IFAD loan respectively. As for ASAP grant, tendering under pasture improvement category will start in September and contracts are expected to be signed in October 2019. For Loan, tendering has started in June 2019 and contracts were signed end of August 2019.

In order to enhance disbursement of the projects, authorized allocation limit was discussed to check if an increase in the limit is needed. However, the Finance Manager ensured that the limit is adequate. In addition in 2019, the project SOE thresholds have been removed and disbursement process changed to be "Straight Through Processing" since LPDP II overall FM rate is low. ICP has been rolled out successfully in March 2019. The following actions are proposed in order to ensure close monitoring of the disbursement plan up to the end of 2019:

Fiduciary aspects

Quality of Financial Management	Rating: 6	Previous rating: 6
--	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

Financial management arrangements are highly satisfactory. Staff are experienced in IFAD projects, AWPBs are submitted on time, the accounting software used is very good as it includes functions that facilitate submitting WAs, financial reporting and budget monitoring. Interim financial reports are submitted on time (Semi-annually). In addition, internal control are maintained through good structure that ensures segregation of duties, an organized documentation process and availability of register for both assets and contracts.

Main issues

Currently, the project is using the financial manual for LPDP I, it is recommended to review the manual in case of any differences or updates related to LPDP II implementation.

Last mission's recommendation were taken into consideration; ICP has been rolled out and the project is using it for withdrawal applications. A list of custom duties exempted by the government has been prepared and will be disclosed in the audit report for 2019.

There is internal audit department within PMU structure. The project transactions and activities are reviewed by the Accounts Chamber and the Agency for State Financial Control and Fight with Corruption in Tajikistan. No documents or reports are available or provided to PMU on these checks. It is recommended that PMU requests a report that reveal the feedback of the review process.

Under IFAD grant, IFAD loan and ASAP grant, the project's target was to cover 180 villages under pasture management plans, however as the cost per household was \$375 and they have ended up with 37 250 households, total cost was \$13 968 750 out of planned \$ 16 179 700 (XDR 11 810 000). Hence the project decided to cover 15 more villages to use the \$2 million surplus.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
• Share with IFAD's Financial officer the "no objection" letters for 3 contracts for "Construction of water supply lines"	Finance Manager	09/2019

Quality and Timeliness of Audit	Rating: 6	Previous rating: 6
--	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

Timely submission and compliance with IFAD Reporting and audit requirements

Main issues

Early submission of draft report, quick response to IFAD feedback. Fully informative report that comply with IPSAS and IFAD reporting requirements.

Counterparts Funds	Rating: 6	Previous rating: 6
---------------------------	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

Counterparts funds for LPDP II includes: (1) beneficiary cash contribution and (2) government contribution in the form of tax and duties exemptions. Up to 31st of August 2019, 68% of budgeted amount was paid by beneficiaries and 342% was paid by the government in the form of tax exemptions. Tax exemptions reached an amount of \$1.52 million compared to \$ 0.44 million in the original budget. The reason behind this increase is mainly due to the amount of taxes exempted on equipment bought under CLPMP grants which were not estimated in the original budget. Moreover, the government provides in-kind contribution in the form of "custom duties" which will be included in the next audit report. Government and beneficiary contributions are received on time and are documented properly.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Disclosure of government in-kind contribution Government in-kind contribution "custom duties" to be disclosed in the audit report for 2019 in the notes of the financial statements	PMU/Finance Manager	06/2020

Compliance with Loan Covenants	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 5
---------------------------------------	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

The project has complied with the loan covenants. The details with regards to the status of implementation and compliance with Project Financing Agreement covenants are presented in Appendix 3.

Procurement

Procurement

Rating: 5

Previous rating: 5

Justification of rating

Project procurement follows the IFAD guidelines as reflected in Project Procurement Manual (PPM). There is an adequate procurement capacity. Recommendations of the previous supervision mission have been largely performed. The current procurement review has revealed no major violations. However, some minor issues have been noted.

Procurement Review

There is an adequate procurement capacity. The procurement unit is adequately staffed with consultants with long-term experience in WB/IFAD procurement procedures. It is recommended to continue improving the knowledge in various training courses, including ITC ILO (Turin, Italy).

The applied form of the Procurement Plan (PP) is in conformity with the requirements and reflects the process of procurement activities. It is noted that LTB thresholds are not always taken into account. The possibility of making amendments to the LTB (procurement thresholds, inclusion of additional methods LIB, ICS, CQS, LCS, SSS, DC), prior review requirements has been agreed in line with the PPM. The General Public Notification (GPN) has been published on the UNDP website.

The document filing and registration system is organized satisfactorily. The main documents are available and classified accordingly on the shelves. The database of eligible companies is available. The recommendations were provided on improving the record keeping system and active use of database.

The mission reviewed the process and documents for a sample of contracts. No major violations were observed. The mission notes that: (i) the project applies of the IFAD's prior review even in cases of post review as specified in PP; (ii) Lack additional contract amendments when changing the terms of the contract; (iii) pre-tender meetings with bidders were held without minutes; (iv) contracts were extended through new contracts rather than through amendment; (v) long period between the evaluation and contracting in hire of consultants. The measures necessary to address these issues have been discussed with the procurement staff. More details are provided in the Technical Note.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Adjust PP for 2019 in line with recommendations and submit to IFAD Adjust PP for 2019 in line with recommendations and submit to IFAD	Coordinator and Senior Consultant on Procurement	10/2019
Implementation of the recommendations provided by the mission in the ongoing procurement. Implementation of the recommendations provided by the mission in the ongoing procurement.	Procurement staff	10/2019
Capacity Building Improve the skills and knowledge of procurement staff in various training courses on procurement.	PMU Director and Procurement staff	06/2020
Keep minutes in pre-tender meetings with bidders. Keep minutes in pre-tender meetings with bidders.	Procurement staff	09/2020

e. Key SIS Indicators

Likelihood of Achieving the Development Objective	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 5
Assessment of the Overall Implementation Performance	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 5

F. Relevance

Relevance	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 5
------------------	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

Project activities are demand driven fully responding to the priorities of the pasturelands users and PUUs

Main issues

No main issue at this stage

G. Lessons Learned

Non livestock related mechanization reinforces the sustainability of PUUs

The main and initial purpose of PUUs is to manage pasture, and secondarily to improve livestock production. However, PUUs have invested massively in mechanization equipment that are either multi-purpose (such as tractors and ploughs) or even sometimes exclusively used for cash and food crops (combined harvesters). This could be considered as in contradiction with their mandate. However, this equipment, which respond to a higher demand for services than fodder equipment for instance, contributes to the financial sustainability of the PUUs by providing consistent financial resources. It therefore enables them to fulfil their primary public good mission related to pasture management, which is essential, but does not generate resources.

PMPs are well accepted and easily enforced because they respond to a priority need

The “tragedy of commons” is a typical situation in pastoral communities in Africa, Middle East, and Central Asia. The logical response to this problem is to establish community based pasture management mechanism, such as the Pasture Management Plans, to rationalise the utilization of pastoral resources, and limit their degradation. However, the adoption and enforcement of these management mechanisms often faces some challenges, even if the mechanism has been established in a participatory manner.

Under LPDPPII (but also under LPDPI), this has not really been an issue. Yet, the mechanism has often been established in a very short time (1 year) in a quite proactive way. But community members (at least those met by the mission) all recognized that they were very happy to be part of such an initiative and that they were very satisfied to see that some initiatives were taken to reverse the pasture degradation process. One assumption to explain this easy acceptance by communities could be that the change is very radical (from a totally unorganized pasture management, to a very strictly planned system); but on the other hand, it also leads to very significant, visible and rapid improvements.

When changes are more progressive and lead to more marginal and less palpable benefits, they may be less easily accepted. This is however an assumption that would require to be confirmed by a sociological study.

PUUs financial sustainability heavily depend on their income generating assets not on membership fees

Thanks to direct and indirect support of the Project, institutional set up of the PUUs/PUAs is under legislative and state control, and liquidation of a state – registered institution in Tajikistan is now a big problem, which is very good for the PUUs/PUAs. However, the pasture law and the relevant local state agencies do not interfere with material and financial matters of the PUUs/PUAs, accept for complained cases. This is also very good, particularly, for the PUUs, which are well equipped by the Project with income generating brand new machineries and equipment. Since the PUUs' collected membership fees comprise very small part their budget, their financial sustainability heavily depend on income from their common assets. With inevitable depreciation, the maintenance costs of these assets gradually increase, while their technical service fees for the PUU members should remain low. Respectively, in order to secure a long-term continued income and thus ensure financial sustainability of the PUUs, a sound operation and maintenance mechanisms should be introduced for each machinery and equipment, taking advantage of high demand for their multi-function services.

H. Agreed Actions

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Overview and Project Progress		
Component 1: Institutional Development Sub-comp. 1.1 : Include in Community Facilitators curricula elements on the New Pasture Law (2019).	PMU/Community Facilitators	11/2019
Component 1: Institutional Development Start the dissemination of the content of the new Pasture Law	District project officers, pasture specialist	11/2019
Component 2: Productivity Enhancement and Improved Animal Health Update PUUs animal health plan according to the epizootic situation of each village as well as its implementation should be monitored timely.	Livestock specialist, PUU's head, District Vet Authority	12/2019
Component 2: Productivity Enhancement and Improved Animal Health In case of need or upon request from FSC, hire a laboratory specialist to prepare technical specification of FSC request to facilitate the procurement process	FSC, PMU	12/2019
Component 2: Productivity Enhancement and Improved Animal Health In consultation with IFAD, contact FAO and OIE to propose coordination and possibly partnership on veterinary issues	PMU	12/2019
Component 1: Institutional Development Ensure that all PUUs keep books on motor-hours, ha serviced per service and PUU 's benefits from the use of machineries	Community facilitators	01/2020
Component 2: Productivity Enhancement and Improved Animal Health Upon request and agreement of FSC, organize a round table with one-two days training for FSC/ Veterinary Department Staff on OIE mission, goal, and benefits.	PMU International Consultant	01/2020
Component 2: Productivity Enhancement and Improved Animal Health Conduct refreshers trainings for the projects' vets	PMU, Livestock specialist	02/2020

Component 3: Pasture Development and Diversification for Vulnerability Reduction In order to refocus on fodder and climate-related investments for the remaining sub-projects in already existing PUUs (estimated balance yet to be allocated: US\$ 2.9 million), the Project will stimulate the following: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> o At least US\$ 1.8 million will be dedicated to climate resilient infrastructures. o At least US\$ 1.1 million will be dedicated to fodder production and/or conservation related equipment 	PMU / District Project Officers / Community Facilitator	06/2020
Component 2: Productivity Enhancement and Improved Animal Health Engage in partnerships with development partners involved on technical innovation for fodder production and conservation (including GIZ, ADB, others) such as new fodder varieties, conservation techniques, to encourage them to implement some of their activities in the project areas, and disseminate findings in PUUs.	PMU, and district project officers	08/2020
Component 2: Productivity Enhancement and Improved Animal Health Ensure that the targets set for bull distribution are met, and that the bulls distributed through PUUs benefit to a large share of population		08/2020
Component 3: Pasture Development and Diversification for Vulnerability Reduction Provide business development training to the WIGGs and CIGs	National BDS consultant	08/2020
Component 1: Institutional Development Further awareness raising activities for PUUs on applicable adaptation measures according to the specific climate change effects on pastures and rain-fed crop lands	National Climate Adaption and Environment Consultant, Community facilitators	09/2020
Component 1: Institutional Development Provide technical support and training for improvement of pastures by means of reseeded native species of fodder crops, locust control, reduction of pressure on climate affected pasture lands	National Climate Adaption and Environment Consultant, Community facilitators	09/2020
Component 3: Pasture Development and Diversification for Vulnerability Reduction In order to refocus on fodder and climate-related investments for the sub-projects of the 15 additional PUUs to be established (estimated allocated budget: US\$ 2.0 million), the Project will stimulate the following: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> o At least 20% of the New Villages' machineries investment need to be specifically dedicated to fodder. o At least 50% of the New Village's investments need to be for climate resilient infrastructure. 		
Development Effectiveness		

Filling vacant position of national expert Ensure rapid filling of vacant position of National climate adaptation and environment consultant	PMU	11/2019
Involvement of Hydrometeorology Agency Invite the regional branch of Agency for Hydrometeorology of the State Committee of Environmental Protection to participate in district-level Pasture Regulation Commissions	National Climate Adaption and Environment Consultant	01/2020
PMU exposure to GALs and HHMs Organize an exchange tour to Kyrgyzstan for PMU to explore the successful achievements of the first Gender Action Learning Systems (GALS) and Household management methodologies (HHM) experience in the central Asia	PMU	06/2020
Monitoring of pasture productivity Conduct in-situ qualitative assessment of pasture (mid-term and end of project) and ex-situ quantitative monitoring (remote sensing), annually	Pasture Specialist, with support from IFAD (on remote sensing analysis)	12/2020
Sustainability and Scaling up		
Participate in policy dialogue on breeding Through documentation of lessons learnt, production of evidences, and participation in national discussion fora	Livestock specialist	12/2020
Project Management		
Recruitment on vacant posts Ensure rapid filling of vacant positions of (i) National gender, youth and business development consultant; and (ii) National climate adaptation and environment consultant.	PMU	11/2019
Financial Management & Execution		
• Share with IFAD's Financial officer the "no objection" letters for 3 contracts for "Construction of water supply lines"	Finance Manager	09/2019
Adjust PP for 2019 in line with recommendations and submit to IFAD Adjust PP for 2019 in line with recommendations and submit to IFAD	Coordinator and Senior Consultant on Procurement	10/2019
Implementation of the recommendations provided by the mission in the ongoing procurement. Implementation of the recommendations provided by the mission in the ongoing procurement.	Procurement staff	10/2019
Capacity Building Improve the skills and knowledge of procurement staff in various training courses on procurement.	PMU Director and Procurement staff	06/2020

Disclosure of government in-kind contribution Government in-kind contribution "custom duties" to be disclosed in the audit report for 2019 in the notes of the financial statements	PMU/Finance Manager	06/2020
Keep minutes in pre-tender meetings with bidders. Keep minutes in pre-tender meetings with bidders.	Procurement staff	09/2020

Livestock and Pasture Development Project II

Logical Framework

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of Verification			Assumptions
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2019)	Cumulative Result (2019)	Cumulative Result % (2019)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility	
Outreach	1.b Estimated corresponding total number of households members										
	Household members			239 400							
	1.a Corresponding number of households reached										
	Households			38 000							
	1 Persons receiving services promoted or supported by the project										
	Females			117 306							
	Males			122 094							
	Total number of persons receiving services			239 400							
	Poor smallholder household members supported in coping with the effects of climate change										
	Females			95 000							
	Males			95 000							
	Total household members			190 000							

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of Verification			Assumptions
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2019)	Cumulative Result (2019)	Cumulative Result % (2019)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility	
Project Goal Contribute to the reduction of poverty in Khatlonr region (50% of people in Khatlon are estimated as being below the poverty line)	reduction in the prevalence of chronic malnutrition (stunting)										A sound use of climate change vulnerability assessment informs and drives adaptation work; risk mitigation management plans are implemented by targeted communities; elite capture of a disproportionate amount of the gains from increased production and local level conversion of animal, milk and meat surpluses sold on the market and the processors (R). A political stability and conducive macro economic framework; Commitment and cooperation among all concerned institutional partners; influence of overall economic development concealing project achievements (R);
	Weight for age (girls)	40		3							
	Weight for age (boys)	40		3							
	Height for age (girls)	40		3							
	Height for age (boys)	40		3							
	variation/increase in household assets income for 18 000 household in the project area										
	increase in household assets income			15							

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of Verification			Assumptions
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2019)	Cumulative Result (2019)	Cumulative Result % (2019)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility	
Development Objective Increase the nutritional status, incomes and resilience of poor households by enhancing livestock productivity in a sustainable manner	Average HH income increase from livestock for 80% of population										A sound use of climate change vulnerability assessment informs and drives adaptation work; Risk mitigation management plans are implemented by targeted communities; Elite capture of a disproportionate amount of the gains from increased production and local level conversion of animal, milk and meat surpluses sold on the market and the processors (R). A sound use of climate change vulnerability assessment informs and drives adaptation work; Risk mitigation management plans are implemented by targeted communities; Elite capture of a disproportionate amount of the gains from increased production and local level conversion of animal, milk and meat surpluses sold on the market and
	Income increase in TJS	2 932		3 372							
	Number of targeted HH reporting increased income from livestock										
	Targeted households			3 250							
	Number poor smallholder households whose climate resilience has been increased										

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of Verification			Assumption(s) On the market and the absorption.
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2019)	Cumulative Result (2019)	Cumulative Result % (2019)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility	
	Households			38 000							

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of Verification			Assumptions
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2019)	Cumulative Result (2019)	Cumulative Result % (2019)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility	
Outcome Outcome 1: Targeted public sector and community organisations (disaggregated by type, i.e. PUUs, Vos, MoA, Pasture Department, TAU, Jomoats) are more effective and efficient at pro-poor pasture management	% of PPUs declaring satisfactory levels of governance										Favourable government policies and cross-sectoral cooperation between state, region and district authorities; Interest and motivation among community members, Lack of capacity in government agencies and communities to effectively participate in project activities and transmit information and know how.
	PPUs			75							
Output Output 1.1 PUU are enabled to develop and implement climate risk-mitigation community pasture plans incorporating needs and priorities of poor and women 180 of land use rights agreements obtained by PUUs that reduce disputes regarding access to pastures by 50%;	3.1.1 Groups supported to sustainably manage natural resources and climate-related risks								Quarterly		
	Groups supported			180							
	Total size of groups			1 260							
	Males										
	Females										
	Women in leadership position										
	% of the PPUs Board with at least 30% women representation										
	PPUs Boards			22.5							

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of Verification			Assumptions		
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2019)	Cumulative Result (2019)	Cumulative Result % (2019)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility			
	CIGS supported (crops)												
	Total size of CIGs supported			3 000									
	Women in leadership position												
	Number of CIGs supported			150									
	CIGs supported (sheepbreeding)												
	Total size of CIGs supported			3 250									
	Number of CIGs supported			50									
	Women in leadership position												
	Number of land use rights agreements obtained by PUUs												
	Land titles - Agreements			180	2	139	77.2						
	Land titles - Certificates			80	6	52	65						
	Output Output 1.2 PUUs acquired planning and technical skills to implement sustainable pasture management and livestock production;	Number of people benefitting of training or study tours, (women 30%).											
		Number of people			5 400	36	10 050	186.1					
Women				30	13.88	30.71	102.4						

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of Verification			Assumptions
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2019)	Cumulative Result (2019)	Cumulative Result % (2019)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility	
	Number of trainings										
	Number of trainings held			326		453	139				
Output Output 1.3 Increase in pasture fees collected by the end of the project	% variation in pasture fees amount										
	Variation (increase)			20							
Output Output 1.4 Public institutions involved in pasture management are strengthened (PUUs, VOs, MoA, Pasture Department, TAU, Jamoats)	Number of public institutions assisted/receiving training										
	Public Institutions			1							
Output Output 1.5 Improved Pasture Law and related legislation proposed/passed;	Improved Pasture Law and related legislation passed										
	Pasture Law approved			1	1	1	100				
Output Output 1.6 Sustainable Pasture Management curriculum is taught in Tajik Agrarian University.	Number of curriculum taught in Tajik Agrarian University										
	Sustainable Pasture mgt curriculum taught			1							
Outcome Outcome 2: Healthier livestock with lower levels of mortality and increased supplementary feed available to community livestock	Number of livestock households reporting reduction in animal mortality							"Baseline, mid-term, completion surveys, project M&E records, progress reports "			
	Livestock Households										

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of Verification			Assumptions
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2019)	Cumulative Result (2019)	Cumulative Result % (2019)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility	
	15% increase in average milk yields							"Baseline, mid-term, completion surveys, project M&E records, progress reports "			
	Milk Ltrs	3.2									
	10% increase in average weight of cattle, sheep goats										
	Cattle	0.09		0.1							
	10% increase in average weight of cattel, sheep, goats sold in local markets										
	Sheep	0.05		0.05							
	10% increase in average weight of cattle, sheep, goats sold in local markets										
	Goats	0.05		0.05							
Output Output 2.1 Capacity for sustainable and efficient livestock production built.	number of beneficiary HH trained in improved livestock husbandry practices							CF/TA Reports Progress Reports Veterinarians logbooks Annual Reports Case studies			Communities willing to participate in the project activities; Govt support is favourable
	Households			5 000							

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of Verification			Assumptions
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2019)	Cumulative Result (2019)	Cumulative Result % (2019)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility	
	1.1.3 Rural producers accessing production inputs and/or technological packages							CF/TA Reports Progress Reports Veterinarians logbooks Annual Reports Case studies CF/TA Reports Progress Reports Veterinarians logbooks Annual Reports Case studies			
	Females			900							
	Males			2 100							
	Total rural producers			3 000							
	1.2.2 Households reporting adoption of new/improved inputs, technologies or practices							CF/TA Reports Progress Reports Veterinarians logbooks Annual Reports Case studies			
	Households			3 000							
	Number of business plans prepared and which received financing										
	Business Plans			20							

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of Verification		Responsibility	Assumptions
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2019)	Cumulative Result (2019)	Cumulative Result % (2019)	Source	Frequency		
Output Output 2.2 Private vets provide animal health and production services on a sustainable basis	Number of veterinarians trained and equipped							CF/TA Reports Progress Reports Veterinarians logbooks Annual Reports Case studies			Communities willing to participate in the project activities; Govt support is favourable.
	Males			60	60	60	100				
	Females			0							
Outcome Outcome 3: Household resilience increase through sustainable use of pastures and income diversification	% income increase of beneficiaries households from alternative income activities (ASAP)							"Baseline, mid-term, completion surveys, Project M&E records, progress reports "			
	Income increase			20							
	ha of accessible pasture managed in a more climate resilient manner							"Baseline, mid-term, completion surveys, Project M&E records, progress reports "			
	Hectares of land			95 000	24 907	32 267	34				
Output Output 3.1: Resilient and sustainable investments prioritized in CLPMPs completed and functioning.	number of PPUs implementing CLMP plans							"Baseline, mid-term, completion surveys, Project M&E records, progress reports "			Communities willing to participate in the project activities; Govt support is favourable
	Number of plans implemented			180							
	Number of plans developed			180							
	Number of subprojects approved/financed of PPUs (by priorities, first, second and set)										

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of Verification			Assumptions
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2019)	Cumulative Result (2019)	Cumulative Result % (2019)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility	
	Number of sub-projects			180							
	Number of approved CLPMP in the Project areas (includingLPDPI's PUUs) effectively integrating climate risk mitigation and adaptation measures (ASAP)										
	# of approved CLPMP			180							
	Number of HH with access to infrastructure that is climate resilient & environ sound										
	Households			18 000							
	Land under climate-resilient practices										
	Land area			7 560	15.8	1 829.5	24.2				
Output Output 3.2 Alternative income generating activities supported to enhance risk coping mechanisms	2.1.3 Rural producers' organizations supported										Communities willing to participate in the project activities; Govt support is favourable
	Rural POs supported			22							
	Total size of POs			220							
	Males			0							
	Females			0							
	Women in leadership position			22							
	Number of grants disbursed to new enterprises established										
	Number of grants			22							

Tajikistan

Livestock and Pasture Development Project II

Mid-term Review

Appendix 1: Financial: actual financial performance; by financier by component and disbursements by category

Mission Dates: 9-20 September 2019
Document Date 25/11/2019
Project No. 2000000977
Report No. 5199-TJ

Near East, North Africa and Europe Division
Programme Management Department

Appendix 1: Financial: Actual financial performance by financier; by component and disbursements by category

Table 1a: Financial performance by financier (USD '000) as at 31 August 2019

Financier	Appraisal	Disbursement	Balance	Per cent disbursed
IFAD Loan	8 700	5 139	3 561	59%
IFAD Grant	8 700	3 089	5 611	36%
ASAP Grant	5 035	2 587	2 448	51%
Government	447	1 528	-1 081	342%
Beneficiaries	1 348	910	438	68%
Total	24 230	13 254	10 976	55%

Republic of Tajikistan
Livestock and Pasture Development Project II

Table 1b: Financial performance by financier by component (USD '000) as at 31 August 2019

		IFAD Loan			IFAD Grant			ASAP Grant			Government			Beneficiaries			Total		
	Component	Appraisal	Actual	%	Appraisal	Actual	%	Appraisal	Actual	%	Appraisal	Actual	%	Appraisal	Actual	%	Appraisal	Actual	%
1	Institutional Development	0	0		1 313	904	69%	153	128	83%	126	36	29%	269	0	0%	1 861	1 067	57%
2	Productivity Enhancement	0	0		1 871	923	49%	0	0		190	4	2%	184	99	54%	2 245	1 025	46%
3	Pasture Development	8 700	5 139	59%	4 002	780	19%	4 882	2 460	50%	23	1 481	6440%	895	812	91%	18 502	10 672	58%
4	Project Management	0	0		1 514	482	32%	0	0		108	7	6%	0	0		1 622	489	30%
	Total	8 700	5 139	59%	8 700	3 089	36%	5 035	2 587	51%	447	1 528	342%	1 348	910	68%	24 230	13 254	55%

Republic of Tajikistan
Livestock and Pasture Development Project II

Table 1c: IFAD Grant (XDR '000, as at 31 August 2019)

Category	Category description	Original Allocation	Disbursement	Balance	Per cent disbursed
I	Equipment & Materials	1 425	970	455	68%
II	Consultancies	1 000	534	466	53%
III	Training	100	18	82	18%
IV	Grants and Subsidies	2 510	211	2 299	8%
	Grants and Subsidies 2	315	103	212	33%
V	Operating costs	600	135	465	23%
VI	Unallocated	250	0	250	0
	Authorized Allocation		524	-524	
	Total	6 200	2 495	3 705	40%

Table 1d: IFAD Loan (XDR '000, as at 31 August 2019)

Category	Category description	Original Allocation	Disbursement	Balance	Per cent disbursed
IV	Grants and Subsidies	6 200	3 659	2 541	59%
	Authorized Allocation		231	-231	
	Total	6 200	3 890	2 310	63%

Table 1e: ASAP Grant (XDR '000, as at 31 August 2019)

Category	Category description	Original Allocation	Disbursement	Balance	Per cent disbursed
II	Consultancies	150	91	59	61%
IV	Grants and Subsidies	3 100	1 431	1 669	46%
	Grants and Subsidies 2	350	288	62	82%
	Authorized Allocation		350	-350	
	Total	3 600	2 160	1 441	60%

Tajikistan

Livestock and Pasture Development Project II

Mid-term Review

Appendix 2: Physical progress measured against AWP&B

Mission Dates: 9-20 September 2019

Document Date 25/11/2019

Project No. 2000000977

Report No. 5199-TJ

Near East, North Africa and Europe Division
Programme Management Department

Appendix 2: Physical progress measured against AWP&B

No	Components / Sub components / Activities	Total Allocation (all sources) US\$ '000	Est. Cost (USD '000) for financial year 2019*	Activities	2019						Details/steps	Notes
					July	Aug	Sep	Oct	Nov	Dec		
1	Component 1: Institutional Development											
1a	Sub-component 1.1: Development of Community Organizations	977.01	89.50									
1a.1	District workshop	2.06	-	To launch the project districts (<u>Dangara, Vose, Farkhor, Hamadoni, and Kulob</u>) with participation of the Local government authority. During the workshop, the PMU will presents information about the objectives of the Project, its approach and main activities and present information on: (i) Project procedures and modalities; (ii) types of investments eligible for funding; (iii) allocation of funds; and (iv) a form for Memorandum of Understanding (MoU), Community Partnership Agreement (CPA), banking arrangements and financial controls.							The first district workshop will take place In project districts, the date of first meeting will be defined	completed
1a.2	Local study tour for members of PUU,CIGs,VDC	10.93	5.00	The local study tours is expected to organize in the area where have already been established PUU by LPDP- I and other projects and donors. The exact district(s) and PUU for trip would be specified.							PMU with supporting of CF will prepare budget and organize all necessary logistic	-
1a.3	International study tour	15.92	10.00	International study tour for members of PUU, head of CIG, PUU and project Jamoat representatives, PMU and MOA specialists/representatives.							PMU will prepare the list of participants, negotiation with receiving party, and cost estimation.	-
1a.4	Community Development International TA	-										
1a.5	NTA - Contracting Community Facilitators	487.04	40.00	Recruiting an NGO to assist Project field community mobilization and implement field Project activities.							Obtain no objection from IFAD on the SSS for National Community Facilitators who participated in realization in LPDP Phase 1.	
1a.6	Nat.Consultant/District Project Officer	23.00	4.50	Recruiting National Consultant/District Project Officer to assist Project field community mobilization and implement field Project activities.							PMU prepares ToR, provide SSS, IFAD approval, contract negotiation, contract signing	
1a.7	Start-up Equipment	169.55	30.00	Provision of minor office equipment for additional established PUUs							PMU specialists/consultants will prepare specification of necessary equipment, IFAD approval, contracting.	179 PUU provided

No	Components / Sub components / Activities	Total Allocation (all sources) US\$ '000	Est. Cost (USD '000) for financial year 2019*	Activities	2019						Details/steps	Notes
					July	Aug	Sep	Oct	Nov	Dec		
1a.8	Pasture Land Certificates (by PUUs and facilitated by PMU)	268.51	-	Preparation of a format for data collection. Collection of data on pasture type and users. Collection of all the documents and submission to the local governments. Negotiating and obtaining land certificates.							PMU specialists/consultants will prepare the required formats and explain the PUUs on the required documents, as well as assist PUUs in negotiating with local governments.	Financed by PUUs
	Jamoat and Village selection			Data collection of targeted Jamoats and villages of all project districts							PMU M&E, DPOs specialists and other relevant specialists collect information on villages in accordance with PIM requirements.	Completed
1a.9	Memorandum of Understanding			Preparation and signing of Memoranda of Understanding (MOU)							PMU specialists will prepare and sign the MoU with PUUs, jamoats and district hukumats.	Completed
1a.10	First village meeting			Conducting first general village meetings							A general village meeting will be scheduled in each village of the selected Jamoats, which will be attended by Jamoat/Hukumat Administration representatives and PMU and CF members.	Completed
1b	Sub-component 1.2: Advancement of Policy and Legal Framework and Strengthening National Institutions	827.37	90.99									
1b.1	Institutional Assessment and Programme Development	4.20		Recruiting an International Consultant to undertake a participatory institutional assessment of key stakeholders, to identify the institutional and capacity gaps which need to be addressed to strengthen their capacity as well as to develop a Programme of work for the future Pasture Department							PMU prepare ToRs, Invitation/Advertisement, provide tender, IFAD approval, contract negotiation, contract signing	Contract completed
1b.2	Public Awareness	6.27	3.00	Publishing on awareness and dissemination publications on pasture management legal and institutional issues							PMU will prepare necessary information and publish among the project stakeholders and others	
1b.3	International study tours/conferences	32.32	4.82	Conduct International study tours for representatives from PMU and other related agencies							PMU will prepare the list of participants, negotiation with receiving party, and calculate a cost estimation.	
1b.4	Office renovation	20.00		Renovation of the future Pasture Department's office							Pasture Department office need in renovation. PMU will make cost estimate.	Completed

No	Components / Sub components / Activities	Total Allocation (all sources) US\$ '000	Est. Cost (USD '000) for financial year 2019*	Activities	2019						Details/steps	Notes
					July	Aug	Sep	Oct	Nov	Dec		
1b.5	Vehicles	71.00		Procurement of vehicles for the future Pasture Department							In accordance with the Procurement Plan	Completed
1b.6	Office equipment	32.00		Procurement of office equipment, furniture and minor equipment for the future Pasture Department							In accordance with the Procurement Plan	Completed
1b.7	Pasture Management Consultant	18.63		Recruiting a National Pasture Monitoring Consultant (NPMC) to assist the PMU staff, future Pasture Department, MoA, CF, Districts Governments, Jamoat Councils, and PUU Councils in Pasture monitoring and assessment issues, to design monitoring format and datasheets							PMU prepare/revise ToRs, Invitation/Advertisement, provide tender, IFAD approval, contract negotiation, contract signing	
1b.8	Interns	23.61	7.00	Selection of postgraduates to gain practical knowledge and assist the future Pasture Department							PMU prepares the terms and conditions for recruiting interns. Invite the interns from TAU and TAAS institutions.	
1b.9	Pasture assessment and monitoring	19.17	11.17	Recruiting independent consultants to provide comprehensive assessment and monitoring of pastures in project area. This includes: soil tests, plant assessments, productivity and quality of production							PMU prepares ToR, Invitation/Advertisement, provide tender, IFAD approval, contract negotiation, contract signing	Geobotanical analyze and soil test of pasture completed. Short term Local consultant for pasture assessment hired
1b.9.1	Pasture Monitoring Consultant for Pasture Trest (Department)	37.80	5.40	Recruiting a National Pasture Monitoring Consultant to provide monitoring and evaluation of pasture Union Users, Pasture Association, pasture land use, and other tasks according the ToRs							PMU prepares ToR, provide SSS, IFAD approval, contract negotiation, contract signing	
1b.9.2	Mapping and GIS consultant for Pasture Trest (Department)	24.00	4.50	Recruiting a national Consultant for Pasture Department of MoA, to provide inventarization of pasture land, collect geoinformation data, prepare map of pasture on type, yield, using for PUU, project and non project districts at Republic level							PMU prepares ToR, provide SSS, IFAD approval, contract negotiation, contract signing	
1b.9.3	PUU Institutional Development Consultant	24.00	4.50	PMU recruit National Institutional Development Consultant to provide assesment on strengthened of PUUs, Pasture Department, mobilization of establishment of PUU in Non project districts, and other tasks according ToR							PMU prepares ToR, provide SSS, IFAD approval, contract negotiation, contract signing	
1b.10	National Legal TA	50.19	5.40	Recruiting a National Legal Consultant to review policy and legal issues, assist on entitlement and management of pasture users institutions and local communities . e.g. for PUU, CLPDP Jamoat/Hukumat Administration, PMU, CF, CIGs, etc. according the ToRs							PMU prepares ToRs, Invitation/Advertisement, provide tender, IFAD approval, contract negotiation, contract signing	
1b.11	Agronomist Consultant	25.40	5.40	Recruiting a National Agronomist Consultant to provide agricultural advise to pasture user, CIG, farmers, households on cropping, cultivation, treatment, processing of agriculture and fodder crop.								

No	Components / Sub components / Activities	Total Allocation (all sources) US\$ '000	Est. Cost (USD '000) for financial year 2019*	Activities	2019						Details/steps	Notes
					July	Aug	Sep	Oct	Nov	Dec		
1b.12	Engineer Consultant 1	52.00	15.60	Recruting a National Engineer Consultant responsible for ensuring of effective planning, management and implementation of community's infrastructural sub-projects								
1b.12	Engineer Consultant 2		7.80	Recruting a National Engineer Consultant responsible for ensuring of effective planning, management and implementation of community's infrastructural sub-projects								
1b.13	TAU-Institutional Assessment and Programme Development	-										
1b.14	TAU - Pasture Management Curriculum Development TA	-										
1b.15	TAU - International Training/Twinning Programme	42.44		TAU's twinning programme with the selected university							TAU prepares necessary documents and define the appropriate Institute, PMU gets IFAD approval, contract negotiation, contract signing	
1b.16	TAU - Pasture Management Curriculum	20.00	3.60	TAU prepare curriculum, program, sullabus, books, liflets and other materials for students of new specialization 'Pasture management' in TAU							TAU prepares necessary materials, PMU gets IFAD approval for publication	
1b.17	TAU- Technical support for Pasture Management specilization at Agromony faculty	24.00		TAU get nessesary approval of Gov Agencies, prepare documents, provide calculation for starting and opening of new specialization for Agronomy faculty							TAU prepare nessesary documents, PMU get IFAD approval, sign agreement with TAU	
1b.18	Access to E-learning	9.69	9.00	PMU will procure necessary office equipment for linkage with Institution websites to access regular E-learning studies for TAU's specialists and relevant stakeholders							PMU/TAU in consultation with IFAD/consultants will find relevant e-cources	
1b.19	Upgrading Teaching Labs	153.65	-	Modernization of Teaching laboratories in the TAU's Faculties							PMU/TAU prepare specification of Labs equipments, furniture, Invitation/Advertisment, provide tender, IFAD approval, contract negotiation, contract signing	Completed
1b.20	Office renovation	11.00		Renovation of the TAU laboratories							Pasture Department office need in renovation. PMU will make cost estimate.	Completed
1b.21	Scholarships	56.00	3.80	Scholarship programme to create opportunities for TAU's qualified students							PMU/TAU develops the terms of scholarship grants, prepare MoU and PMU sign with TAU and scholarships, adertise/invite, provide compitition and select scholarships	
1b.22	Practical studies	40.00		Practical studies for TAU's students								

[illegible]

No	Components / Sub components / Activities	Total Allocation (all sources) US\$ '000	Est. Cost (USD '000) for financial year 2019*	Activities	2019						Details/steps	Notes
					July	Aug	Sep	Oct	Nov	Dec		
3a.1	Lead Nat Consultant/Economist	32.80		Recruiting a National Economist Consultant (NEC) to undertake a project coordinator role							PMU prepare/revise ToRs, Invitation/Advertisement, provide tender, IFAD approval, contract negotiation, contract signing.	
3a.2	Community Dev Consultant/LC Assistant	59.90	12.00	Recruiting a National Community Development Consultant to assist in Development and Establishment of Community organization like PUU, CIG, Women groups and assist the Project Coordinator							PMU prepare/revise ToRs, Invitation/Advertisement, provide tender, IFAD approval, contract negotiation, contract signing.	
3a.3	Pasture Management Nat Consultant	53.90	6.00	Recruiting a National Pasture Management Consultant (PMC) to assist with preparation and implementation of Community Livestock and Pasture Management Plans (CLPMP), provide technical advice related to implementation of project demonstrations, trials and training and strengthening of veterinary services							PMU requests SSS to continue the ongoing recruitment under LPDPI, IFAD approval, contract negotiation, contract signing.	
3a.4	Livestock Nat Consultant	53.90	6.00	Recruiting a National Livestock Consultant (LC) to assist with preparation and implementation of Community Livestock and Pasture Management Plans technical advice related to implementation of project demonstrations, trials and training and strengthening of veterinary services.							PMU prepares ToRs, Invitation/Advertisement, provide tender, IFAD approval, contract negotiation, contract signing.	
3a.5	GIS/mapping Consultant	54.50	6.00	Recruiting a National Geographic Information Systems (GIS)/Mapping Consultant to assist with preparation and implementation of PDPs, technical advice.							PMU requests SSS to continue the ongoing recruitment under LPDPI, IFAD approval, contract negotiation, contract signing.	
3a.6	Climate Adaptation and Environmental Consultant	52.45	6.30	Recruiting a National Climate Adaptation and Environmental Consultant (CAC) to assist in identification of climate change and adaptation in livestock and pasture management and development							PMU requests IC, IFAD approval, contract negotiation, contract signing.	
3a.7	PMU Director Assistant	44.45	5.40	Recruiting a PMU Director Assistant to assist PMU Director on effective PMU workflow management and to achieve the Projects' goals							PMU requests SSS to continue the ongoing recruitment under LPDP II, IFAD approval, contract negotiation, contract signing.	
3a.8	GPS equipment and other usable for PUUs	93.98		Procure and provide GPS equipment and other usables for monitoring pasture rotation as well as some minor office equipment for PUUs							PMU prepares specification, submit invitations, provide tender, provide contract negotiation, contract signing	Completed

No	Components / Sub components / Activities	Total Allocation (all sources) US\$ '000	Est. Cost (USD '000) for financial year 2019*	Activities	2019						Details/steps	Notes
					July	Aug	Sep	Oct	Nov	Dec		
3a.9	Pasture Management Plans Investments	17,423.00	4,000.00	PUUs with assistance from CF prepare CLPMPs and related investment sub-projects to improve livestock productivity, access to summer pasture, to increase fodder crop productivity, rural and pasture infrastructures rehabilitation, provide machinery and equipment including CA machineries, for landscape restoration (reforestation, watershed management etc). Minimum of 5% of the community grant will be allocated to protective and natural resource rehabilitation measures of degraded land, which could include fencing, demarcation, weed/shrub eradication, supplementary seeding of community pastures; for demonstration purpose and to learn about CA and about the natural re-vegetation potential; Introducing more environmentally sound natural resource management practices.							According the subproject proposals of PUUs.	Started in 2017
3a.10	Project coordinator	45.00	16.50								PMU prepares ToR, provide SSS, IFAD approval, contract negotiation, contract signing	
3a.11	Assistant Project Coordinator	22.05	4.50								PMU prepares ToR, provide SSS, IFAD approval, contract negotiation, contract signing	
3a.12	CASP Consultants	17.40	17.40								PMU prepares ToR, provide SSS, IFAD approval, contract negotiation, contract signing	
	Sub-component 3.2 - Income Diversification	500.00	80.00									
3b.1	Business Development Facilitation			Recruiting national consultant to to facilitate and assist business development							PMU prepares/revises ToRs, IFAD approval, provide SSS, provide contract negotiation, sign contract.	
3b.2	Diversification Grants	500.00	80.00	Provision of income diversification grants for adaptation to climate change							In line with the PIM	
	SUB-TOTAL Component 3	18,453.33	4,160.10									
4	Component 4: Project Management											
4a	Sub-component 4 (a): Project Management Unit	1,511.10	272.78									
4a.1	Offices Renovation	30.45	15.15	Renovation a new PMU main office in Dushanbe and new offices (if needed)							PMU prepares a plan of repair, cost estimation. Recruit a construction firm.	

No	Components / Sub components / Activities	Total Allocation (all sources) US\$ '000	Est. Cost (USD '000) for financial year 2019*	Activities	2019						Details/steps	Notes
					July	Aug	Sep	Oct	Nov	Dec		
4a.2	Equipment and Goods	31.97	31.97	Procurement of office equipment, furniture and minor equipment							In accordance with the Procurement Plan	
4a.3	Vehicles	45.68		Procurement of vehicles for PMU and field office							In accordance with the Procurement Plan	Completed
4a.4	Deputy Director- Finance Manager	50.4	14.40	Contracting PMU deputy Director - Finance Manager							PMU requests SSS to continue the ongoing recruitment under LPDPI, IFAD approval, contract negotiation, contract signing.	
4a.5	Chief National Procurement Consultant	46.20	13.20	Contracting PMU Chief National Procurement Consultant							PMU requests SSS to continue the ongoing recruitment under LPDPI, IFAD approval, contract negotiation, contract signing.	
4a.6	Disbursement Consultant	97.00	18.00	Recruiting a National Disbursement Consultant							PMU request SSS to recruit the consultant engaged under KLSP, IFAD approval, contract negotiation, contract signing	
4a.7	Assistant Procurement Consultant	97.00	7.20	Recruiting an Assistant Procurement Consultant								
4a.8	M&E Consultant	97.00	15.60	Recruiting a Monitoring and Evaluation Consultant								
4a.9	Advancing Accounting System	10.00		Recruiting a company/firm to upgrade the existing 1C Accounting program for PMU Accounting system and train the PMU chief accountant and Assistant accountant.							PMU prepares ToRs, get IFAD approval, advertise, negotiate, and contract.	Completed
4a.10	Short-term TA	27.00	5.00	On demand							PMU prepares and confirms TORs, advertise for recruitment of consultant and procure services	
4a.11	Translation services	38.00	8.40	On demand							PMU prepares and confirms TORs, advertise for recruitment of consultant and procure services	
4a.12	Audit	81.00	12.99	Hiring a qualified Auditing company to provide Independent financial audit of the project								
4a.13	National Internal Auditor		-	Recruiting a National Internal Auditor							PMU prepare ToRs, get IFAD approval, SSS justification, contract negotiation, contract signing	
4a.14	Contracting PMU staff	208.40	63.84	Contract 2 District Project officers, 3 Drivers and Support staff (Cleaner/Messenger, Security)							PMU hires staff according labor rule and appropriate procedures	
4a.15	Allowances and Social Fund	114.00	22.03								-	
4a.16	Office Running Costs	537.00	45.00	Provision of stationary, office and vehicles operation and maintenance, and insurance							In accordance with the Procurement Plan and Financial Management procedures	
4a.17	Project planning and budgeting			Preparation and submission of draft AWPBs for second half of 2016 and 2017							PMU prepares AWPBs and endorse with MoA and send to IFAD for approval	

No	Components / Sub components / Activities	Total Allocation (all sources) US\$ '000	Est. Cost (USD '000) for financial year 2019*	Activities	2019						Details/steps	Notes
					July	Aug	Sep	Oct	Nov	Dec		
4a.18	Project planning and budgeting			Preparation and submission of project detailed AWPBs for 2019							PMU prepares AWPBs and endorse with MoA and send to IFAD for approval	
4a.19	Procurement plan			Preparation and submission draft Procurement Plan for a first 18 months and 2018							PMU prepares PP send for IFAD approval	
4a.20	Reporting			Preparation and submission of periodic reports							PMU prepares and submits semi-annual and annual reports to Government agencies and IFAD	
4b	Sub-component 4(b): Monitoring and Evaluation	110.26	43.90									
4b.1	Stakeholder Review and Planning Workshops	2.00	0.50	Provide annual workshop on project implementation, activities, successes or issues							PMU prepares all necessity and organize workshop at the end of each calendar year	
4b.2	NTA - Baseline survey	5.38		Recruitment a solid company to provide project baseline survey							PMU drafts TORs and Questionnaire, confirms TORs and Questionnaire with IFAD assistance and using IFAD methodology	Survey conducted by IFAD
4b.3	NTA - Advancing of Electronic Platform	5.08		Sign contract with a company on using Electronic Platform System for PMU M&E System and DPOs, and as well for CF staff							PMU find EPS and gets IFAD approval, and contracting a company/firm	completed
4b.4	ITA - Mid-term review	32.30	32.30	Recruitment a solid company to provide project Mid- term review							PMU drafts TORs and Questionnaire, confirms TORs and Questionnaire with IFAD assistance and using IFAD methodology	
4b.5	ITA - Project Completion Report	34.27	-									
4b.6	NTA - Interim Ad-Hoc evaluation studies	15.38	-									
4b.7	Publication and Printing	14.73	11.10	Preparation and publication project materials on project activities and progress, booklet and brochures on introducing CA, environmental issues related to climate change adaptation for sustainable pasture management, including pasture monitoring and fodder production and etc.								
4b.8	Dissemination workshops	1.12	-									
	SUB-TOTAL Component 4	1,621.36	316.68									
	TOTAL	24,173.48	5,371.26									

*Excluding Duties & Taxes
Taxes

5,371.26
396.00

No	Components / Sub components / Activities	Total Allocation (all sources) US\$ '000	Est. Cost (USD '000) for financial year 2019*	Activities	2019						Details/steps	Notes
					July	Aug	Sep	Oct	Nov	Dec		
Total			5,767.26									

Tajikistan

Livestock and Pasture Development Project II

Mid-term Review

Appendix 3: Compliance with legal covenants: status of implementation

Mission Dates: 9-20 September 2019
Document Date 25/11/2019
Project No. 2000000977
Report No. 5199-TJ

Near East, North Africa and Europe Division
Programme Management Department

Appendix 3: Compliance with legal covenants: status of implementation

Section	Covenant	Target/Action Due Date	Compliance Status/Date	Remarks
Section B.6	Opening of the Designated Account	Opening prior to Effectiveness	Complied with	Designated Account at Eskhata Bank
Section B.7	Opening of 3 Project Accounts	One for each financing source	Complied with	Three project bank accounts and one for beneficiaries contribution at Eskhata Bank
Section E.2.a Section 7.11	The PMU has been set up and the Project Director and all other key project personnel appointed	Continuous	Complied with	
Section E.2.b	Acceptable software shall have been configured for the use by the project.	Continuous	Complied with	Done by the software company on March 2017
Section E.2.c	Project Implementation Manual (PIM) shall have been duly approved	Continuous	Complied with	Revised PIM approved by IFAD on September 2017
Section E.3	External and internal ToR shall have been submitted to IFAD for approval		Complied with	TORs approved by IFAD in 2017
Section 4.08 Section 7.06	Eligible Expenditures	IFAD financing proceeds to be used exclusively to finance Eligible Expenditures	Complied with	
Section 7.01	Annual Work Plans and Budgets and Procurement Plans to be submitted to Fund	No later than 60 days before beginning of each Fiscal Year	Complied with	Submission delayed in 2019 due to portfolio suspension, but complied with after lifting of suspension.
Section B.7.02	Availability of Grant Proceeds and Counterpart Funds	Continuous	Complied with	
Section 7.05	Procurement of goods, civil works and services in accordance with Schedule 4	Continuous	Complied with	
Section 7.08	PMU shall insure all goods and buildings used in the project and goods imported for the project	Continuous	Complied with	Vehicles are insured.

Section	Covenant	Target/Action Due Date	Compliance Status/Date	Remarks
Section 8.02	Monitoring, establishment of information management system	Continuous	Complied with	
Section 8.03	Progress Reports to be submitted to IFAD on a six-monthly basis	No later than six weeks after the end of each six-month period	Complied with	
Section 8.03	A Mid-Term Review to be carried out jointly by Borrower and IFAD	No later than midpoint of the project	Partially Complied with	A Mid-Term Review was carried out in Sept 2019 from IFAD side. From PMU side, MTR started in August 2019, with results expected by November 2019). Delay in the latter were due to IFAD portfolio suspension.
Section 9.02	Submission of Financial Statements	Within 4 months after the end of each fiscal year	Complied with	.
Section 9.03	Audit Reports on project accounts of each year to be submitted to Fund	Within 6 months after the end of each fiscal year	Complied with	IFAD gave its NO, on 10 May 2017, that the audit of FY 16 could be waived for this year and combined with FY17
Section B.6	Opening of the Designated Account	Opening prior to Effectiveness	Complied with	Designated Account at Eskhata Bank
Section B.7	Opening of 3 Project Accounts	One for each financing source	Complied with	Three project bank accounts and one for beneficiaries contribution at Eskhata Bank