

Afghanistan

Community Livestock and Agriculture Project Supervision Report

Main report and appendices

Mission Dates: 23 September - 4 October 2018
Document Date: 06/11/2018
Project No. 1100001637
Report No. 4889-AF

Asia and the Pacific Division
Programme Management Department

Abbreviations and Acronyms

AWPB	Annual Work Plan and Budget
BVW	Basic Veterinary Workers
CDC	Community Development Council
CLAP	Community Livestock and Agriculture Project
CLAP-AF	Community Livestock and Agriculture Project-Additional Financing
COSOP	Country Strategic Opportunities Program
DAIL	Department of Agriculture, Irrigation and Livestock
DCA	Dutch Committee for Afghanistan
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations
FLRC	Farmers Learning and Resource Centres
FY	Fiscal Year
GoIRA	Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan
HHs	Households
HLP	Horticulture and Livestock Project
ICARDA	International Centre for Agricultural Research in the Dry Areas
IA	Integrated Area
IDS	Integrated Dairy Scheme
ISAF	International Security Assistance Force
KM	Knowledge Management
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MAIL	Ministry of Agriculture, Irrigation and Livestock
MIS	Management Information System
MRRD	Ministry of Rural Rehabilitation and Development
MTR	Mid-Term Review
NSP	National Solidarity Programme
O&M	Operations and Maintenance
OFWM	On-Farm Water management
PCC	Project Coordination Committee
PME	Participatory Monitoring and Evaluation
PSC	Project Steering Committee
PST	Program Support Team
PY	Project Year
OFWM	On-Farm Water management
PCC	Project Coordination Committee
PME	Participatory Monitoring and Evaluation
RIMS	Results Implementation Management System
RMLSP	Rural Microfinance and Livestock Support Programme
SNaPP2	Support to National Priority Programme 2
SP	Service Provider

A. Project Overview

Region:	Asia and the Pacific Division	Project at Risk Status:	Not at risk
Country:	Afghanistan	Environmental and Social Category:	B
Project Name:	Community Livestock and Agriculture Project	Climate Risk Classification:	3
Project Id:	1100001637	Executing Institution:	Ministry of Agriculture, Irrigation and Livestock
Project Type:	Agricultural Development	Implementing Institutions:	Ministry of Agriculture, Irrigation and Livestock
CPM:	Hubert Boirard		
Project Director:	Abdul Latif Zahed		
Project Area:	Kabul, Parwan, Logar, Balkh, Herat, Nangarhar, and Baghlan		

Approval Date	13/12/2012	Last audit receipt	28/08/2018
Signing Date	08/04/2013	Date of Last SIS Mission	04/10/2018
Entry into Force Date	08/04/2013	Number of SIS Missions	8
Available for Disbursement Date	08/04/2013	Number of extensions	1
First Disbursement Date	12/11/2013	Effectiveness lag	4 months
MTR Date	24/11/2016		
Original Completion Date	30/06/2019		
Current Completion Date	30/06/2022		
Financial Closure	not available yet		

Project total financing

IFAD Financing breakdown	Debt Sustainability Framework	\$24,999,999
	Debt Sustainability Framework	\$58,001,000
Domestic Financing breakdown	Beneficiaries additional financing	\$1,844,000
	Beneficiaries	\$3,481,000
	National Government	\$3,576,000
	National Government (add)	\$191,000
Co-financing breakdown,	Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations	\$456,000
	To be determined	\$387,000
Project total financing		\$92,935,999

Current Mission

Mission Dates:	23 September - 4 October 2018
Days in the field:	1
Mission composition:	Mr Hubert Boirard, CPM and mission leader; Mr Alok Kumar, Rural Finance and Value Chain Specialist and Co-Mission leader; Mr Ravindra Narayanswamy, Agribusiness and Livestock Specialist; Mr Ganila Paravithana, Infrastructure Specialist; Mr Wassem Shahzad, Procurement specialist; and Mr Claudio Mainella, Finance Officer, Afghanistan.
Field sites visited:	Kabul Dairy union

B. Overall Assessment

Key SIS Indicator #1	Ø	Rating	Key SIS Indicator #2	Ø	Rating
Likelihood of Achieving the Development Objective		5	Assessment of the Overall Implementation Performance		4

Effectiveness and Developmental Focus	5	Project Management	4
Effectiveness	4	Quality of Project Management	4
Targeting and Outreach	5	Knowledge Management	5
Gender equality & women's participation	5	Value for Money	5
Agricultural Productivity	5	Coherence between AWPB and Implementation	4
Nutrition	5	Performance of M&E System	5
Adaptation to Climate Change	4	Requirements of Social, Environmental and Climate Assessment Procedures (SECAP)	4

Sustainability and Scaling-up	5	Financial Management and Execution	4
Institutions and Policy Engagement	4	Acceptable Disbursement Rate	3
Partnership-building	5	Quality of Financial Management	4
Human and Social Capital and Empowerment	5	Quality and Timeliness of Audit	4
Quality of Beneficiary Participation	5	Counterparts Funds	3
Responsiveness of Service Providers	4	Compliance with Loan Covenants	4
Environment and Natural Resource Management	4	Procurement	4
Exit Strategy	5		
Potential for Scaling-up	5		

Relevance	5
------------------	----------

C. Mission Objectives and Key Conclusions

Background and Main Objective of the Mission

The Community Livestock and Agriculture Project (CLAP) is funded by IFAD grant of SDR 37.65 Million entered into force in April 2013. IFAD approved additional financing of SDR 17.7 Million in December 2017. The project completion and closing dates are 31 December 2022. The lead programme agency is the Ministry of Agriculture, Irrigation, and Livestock (MAIL). The project operational area are in Kabul, Parwan, Logar, Balkh, Herat, Nangarhar, and Baghlan.

The programme development objective is to improve the food security of about 223,000 rural poor households in the Project Area by increasing agriculture and livestock productivity and reducing gender disparities. The programme has three components (i) Community Development, including Productive Infrastructures and Institutional Strengthening; (ii) Livestock and Agriculture Development; and (iii) Project Management, Policy Support and Young Professional programme. The joint IFAD and Government of Afghanistan (GoA) supervision mission took place from 23 September to 4 October 2018. The main objectives were to: (i) assess the programme implementation progress; (ii) review progress of the 2018 AWPB and procurement plan; (iii) identify actual and potential/ emerging operational problems; (iv) propose solutions or corrective measures. The mission held consultations and working sessions with key partners, including Ministry of Finance (MoF), Ministry of Rural Rehabilitation and Development (MRRD), Dutch Council for Afghanistan (DCA), Food and Agriculture Organisation (FAO), International Centre for Agriculture Research in the Dry Areas (ICARDA), Kabul Dairy Union (KDU), Local NGOs implementing poultry subcomponent (BESO, ASIO) and MAIL officials. Due to security situation, field visit was not possible outside Kabul operational UN areas. A final wrap-up meeting was held in Kabul on 2 October, chaired by the Minister of Agriculture.

Key Mission Agreements and Conclusions

Under Component 1, Irrigation Structure, With the inclusion of the additional CLAP financing, the revised target is now 172 irrigation schemes, on which MAIL/ID and MRRD have initiated or completed 131 schemes (86%). 41 irrigation schemes are already identified, and contracts will be awarded by the end of December 2018. On the 131 schemes under works, 43% of the irrigation schemes have been completed or handed over. More than half (57%) is not completed. The total command area of the 131 irrigation schemes under works represents 37,993 ha corresponding to 73% of the overall CLAP revised target on irrigation.

Under component 2.1, Dairy Development, the performance is in line with the expectation and considerable progress is made to achieve the appraisal targets. Nevertheless, the key constraint remains in achieving the commercialization of cow milk produced by smallholder farmers under dairy sub-component. The annual outcome survey of CLAP and FAO reports confirm that the milk yield has been increased from 3.5-liters/ cow (baseline) to 10.88 liters/cow. The increase in yield is due to improved breeds through AIs, extension support, improved feed and health management. As the increase in yield, which is 310%, has not reflected proportionally on the increase in income of the household which is only 17.5% increase. The decision to support the farmers through the Kabul Dairy Union with a multipurpose Dairy Plant (including UHT product) instead of the private sector is still pending by MAIL/GoA for the last 2 years now.

Disbursement, one of the primary reasons for slow disbursement is the cumbersome process being followed before sending for withdrawal application from the CLAP to MAIL to MoF. The process involved 51 signatures of different departments from MAIL and MoF. The mission observed that some invoices of service provider had not been processed even after three months.

D. Overview and Project Progress

CLAP's disbursement rate on the IFAD initial grant (USD 58 million) stands today at 66% (56% without the initial advance of USD 5,5 million) at 9 months of the initial completion date (June 2019) and at 4 % disbursement for the USD 25 million grant as additional financing approved in December 2018. The AWPB 2018 physical target achievement by the end of August 2018 is 55%. Despite the relevance of CLAP programme and the potential capacity of the implementing partners to deliver 100% of the AWPB, the current system used in terms of financial flow is seriously slowing down the project progress.

Component 1: Community Development, including Productive Infrastructures and Institutional Strengthening

1.1 Productive Infrastructure

Irrigation Directorate: The MAIL/ID has initially designed and planned 25 schemes for which they have achieved 99.6% overall progress. At the initiation of these schemes, the subjected cumulative command area was 5415 ha. After completing these 25 irrigation schemes, it has grown up to 6552 ha with new additions of 1137 ha. This is an increase of 20% in terms of cultivation land. Based on the statistics, these 25 schemes by MAIL/ID have achieved financial progress of 96%. This is lower than 99% physical progress of work. Further, it is observed that 21 handing over notes are available for the schemes. The Mission recommended carrying out remaining payments and handing over notes in a short time since the physical work is completed for the first stage of MAIL/ID projects.

Under additional financing, 41 new irrigation schemes are planned, and to be carried out by MAIL/ID, with financing of 10 million USD. Planning and designing works have been completed for 41 irrigation schemes, out of which 14 schemes are under bid evaluation. Other 27 schemes are in the initial stage of procurement. Considering the facts that all the design work and part of the procurement are completed. The mission recommends completing the procurement of all 41 schemes by Feb 2019 and completing the work by June 2020.

MRRD: The MRRD has planned and designed 106 schemes adding 2490 Ha, which achieved overall progresses of 86%, 56% and 97% for Kabul, Logar, and Parwan province respectively by the end of September 2018. Projects in Logar province achieved the lowest work progress. The MRRD explains this delay due to the prevailing security conditions at Logar province. MRRD have completed or handed over 31 (29%) schemes, 33 (31%) schemes are over 90%, 17 (16%) schemes are in between 61%-90%, 14 (13%) schemes are in between 30%-60% and 11 (11%) schemes are less than 30% completed.

The handing over procedures is stopped due to the fact that the final payments are not made to CDC. This has been caused by the delay in releasing 1 million USD from the ministry of finance. Therefore the mission recommends to immediately release the second tranche (remaining 10%) of payment to the CDC for completed schemes to facilitate smooth hand over. The mission observes that the mandatory requirement for the community to contribute 10%, is an impediment in some cases to complete the work. Hence the mission recommends for the community contribution to be an optional requirement.

1.2 Institutional Strengthening

The irrigation associations are registered with MAIL, and are responsible for the water management and maintenance of the irrigation schemes. Irrigation Association are critical for sustainability of the irrigation schemes and have traditionally been playing the role. The mission recommends formalizing their role and responsibilities and provides support (not exceeding USD 650) to the IAs for construction of basic office with office equipment. The objective is for each IAs to have proper book keeping, membership details with land holding, quarterly report on the crop yield/income for each member. The vision should be for these IAs to grow into mature associations providing market access to the members for the agriculture produce. The project may also support the IAs to recruit a local person to help them in collecting and collation of the data. With respect to Capacity Building, CLAP project Trained 750 irrigation Association members on the role and functions of irrigation associations. These training manuals are too generic and do not reflect the afghan context and experience of Irrigation Associations. Therefore mission recommends revision of these training manuals.

1.3 Gender Mainstreaming and Capacity Building

The project has made notable strides in gender mainstreaming. The project reached out to 49% women beneficiaries who are promoted or supported by the project and specifically benefiting 8% of women-headed households. The poultry component has specifically targeted women in the households, and reached 13,332 women and organized them into VEPGs. For the first time, many women participants had economic opportunities and had a social voice through the VPPGs. The 27 female graduates were recruited to promote kitchen gardening among women beneficiaries under component 2.3. To date, 870 women beneficiaries have established kitchen gardens. In addition, totally 52 SHG established and provided with in-kind support and equipment under Kuchi development. Besides, 2,849 women farmers under dairy development received milk hygiene kits and trained accordingly.

Most of the activities under this sub-component have been streamlined with other subcomponents; nevertheless, the gender unit has prepared a strategy note to increase women participation under the project. The mission recommends revising the Gender strategy and action plan to incorporate activities on literacy & forming exclusive Women Association / Women Producers Company at national level. The entry level for these intervention could be from the initiatives of the other sub components such as poultry business associations, Also, the mission recommends PST to organize exposure visits to women run enterprises or associations such as SEWA in India before re-drafting of the strategy and action plan.

Component 2: Livestock and Agriculture Development

2.1 Dairy Development

To date, 3036 beneficiaries have been reached against the appraisal target of 5000. The key physical achievement for four parts under this subcomponent is 136% for capacity development, 79% for Institutional Development, 109% for Women development and 50% for enterprise development. The Project is in line to achieve the targets and in some instances have exceeded the initial appraisal targets; nonetheless, the challenge remains in the enterprise development related to commercialization, if not achieved certainly raises serious doubts over the sustainability of the overall dairy subcomponent.

The milk yield has been reported to increase from 3.5-liters/ cow (baseline) to 10.88 liters/cow. To immediately address the increased supply, the project has attempted to establish market linkages with 16 private sector players in dairy. However, the experience has not been promising. The 11 of 16 companies have failed to procure as agreed with Milk Chilling Centres, and other 5 companies that have also not been able to honour to procure the minimum set quantity^[1]. There are many instances where the payments to the farmers have been delayed for more than 3 months.

[1] The FAO and KDU reported many instances where the contract with the companies have not been honored in totality for an example, Dehyan Roz company procures only 350-400 liters/ day from the MCC in Qalandarkhill village in Bagram district, Parwan province against the agreed quantity of 840 liters/day.

At the policy level, the IFAD since the first project (i.e., RMLSP) has supported the Dairy cooperative movement and recognizes that institution building takes time and requires a favourable policy environment. Setting up of the national dairy development board would be one of the important steps towards dairy cooperative development and policy dialogue, hence mission recommends to expedite the process to set up the board.

2.2 Poultry Development

The two national NGOs (BESO and ASIO) selected through a competitive process, are implementing the poultry subcomponent in Kabul, Logar, and Parwan provinces. As of today, 13,332 HHs, 33% of the appraisal targets and 80% of the AWPB 2018 physical target has been achieved. The 3rd phase is under the procurement process to select the IPs for covering 5000 beneficiaries in Baghlan and Kabul provinces in 2018-2020. The mission recommends launching the phase 4 of the procurement process to identify one IP for each province for the remaining beneficiaries with an objective to reach out the appraisal target by 2019.

At the initial stages, each beneficiary gets 10 eggs per day of which 70% of the eggs are sold in the market with an average monthly initial income of Afs.1650.00, and the beneficiaries consume the remaining 30% of the eggs as part of nutrition. However, the mission observes with the discussion with the service providers and the annual output survey, that the beneficiaries almost doubled their stock, and may have resulted in doubling the average monthly income. As the SNNAP2 and CALP project areas are merged, the mission recommends exploring the possibility of linking the prospective women beneficiaries and village group leaders interested in scaling up the business to be linked to FMFB under access to finance component of SNNAP2 for debt financing to finance the expansion of the business. The project management staff of the service providers should be given two days orientation by FMFB on how to access loans facilitated by PST.

Besides, the project established 267 Village Poultry Producer Groups (VPPG) and identified one village group leader is identified to facilitate market linkages. These leaders are provided with extra capacity building and in-kind support such as 250 kg poultry feed, thermos, hanging weighing scale, calculator, egg trays/baskets, nasal masks, gloves, and white coat to act as a bridge between beneficiaries. The intention should be to turn these village group leaders to become aggregators, an intermediary actor in the value chain between the beneficiaries (supplier) and purchaser—thereby reducing the transaction costs of individual smallholder engagement, therefore the mission recommends to provide an intensive training in business management and how to scale by leveraging village poultry groups.

2.3 Improved Food, Fodder, and Vegetable Crops

To date, 52,000 beneficiaries have been reached against appraisal target 120,000. Most of these targets are achieved through the selling of wheat seed from the VBSEs to the smallholder farmers. The double counting of the HHs is avoided as the farmers are only allowed to purchase seeds from the VBSEs in 5 years. The mission recommends for ICARDA to submit the strategy to reach the beneficiaries by the end of 2019.

Under adaptive research, a total of 224 trials have been conducted for wheat, chickpeas, lentil, Mung bean, tomato, potato, onion, grass pea, alfalfa, clover. The objective is to release 6 promising lines through the Agriculture Research Institute of Afghanistan (ARIA), the trait/characters include heat, cold, drought, and disease tolerant varieties. So far, 3 wheat lines results have been submitted to ARIA, which are expected to be released by the end of 2018. The mission recommends clarifying strategy on seed multiplication by establishing the demonstration plot of 5Kgs along with 172 irrigation schemes under community infrastructure sub component of the proposed promising lines, which would be approved by ARIA.

For Establishment of and support to farmer-led Village Based Seed Enterprises (VBSEs): All the 7 planned VBSEs have been established and 2 more existing VBSEs reaching out to 125 beneficiaries out of which 11% are women, have been trained and received a package that has allowed them to produce certified seeds in 36 MT in 2016, and 98 MT in 2017. The mission recommended that the performing VBSE should be selected for production of certified seed varieties in Fodder and vegetable crops, this will bring in a wide range of certified seed products within the VBSEs as well increase

the income of the individual member since the cost of certified fodder and vegetable seeds are much higher than the wheat varieties.

For Participatory demonstrations to accelerate adoption of newly released high-yielding varieties, 1320 demos have been established against the appraisal target of 1353, and around 2368 against the appraisal target of 3300 farmers (2097 male and 271 female) have been trained. An average of 77% yield improvement of wheat varieties and 61% for Mung beans have been reported. However, the mission observes that for one demonstration plot is for 1.7 beneficiaries, hence the Mission recommends for the ICARDA to clarify or revise the strategy to increase the ratio of demonstration plots vis-a vis beneficiaries. In addition, 870 kitchen gardens have been established only for women beneficiaries.

2.4 Livestock Development among the Kutchi

As of today, 21,074 HH against the appraisal target of 50,000 HHs have been reached (Initial appraisal target was 20,000 which has been increased by 30,000 HHs under additional financing to 50,000 HHs to additional 7 provinces). 42 new Para vets have been trained or supported an additional 16 Para vets are undergoing training or identified for training. In addition, 78 existing Veterinary field units have been contracted to provide veterinary services. The new Para vets are selected from the Kuchis community, and as well the VFUs are on the mobile routes of the Kuchi communities, resulting in health management service for over 2,404,660 ruminants. Due to these interventions reduction in mortality rates has been reported to be from 15% to 6.2%, implies that almost 211,610 ruminants have been saved. As well, 9 feed banks were established, and 159.8 MT concentrate feed was distributed to 2495 HHs. Under the additional financing, 2000 MTs of feed distributed to 7333 HHs as drought response measures were carried out.

In response to the drought, the mission recommends introducing Hydroponic fodder production system. This system will help the communities to produce fodder in 8-10 days time period using locally available materials. The mission recommends training and demonstration for Kutchi communities as well as for Dairy and poultry components. Also, the mission recommends exploring the possibility of developing financial instruments such as insurance scheme as drought response measures.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Overview and Project Progress		
Advance of USD 6.5 million to be justified by October 30 at the latest	MRRD	10/2018
Submit the plan to support to Irrigation Associations for office structure, office equipment and recruitment of local staff for data management to IFAD for NO objection	PST/ Engineering Unit	11/2018
Dairy plant CLAP to handle the procurement of Dairy plant and FAO contract with the CLAP to be amended accordingly to reflect the changes. Consequently the Procurement Plan of CLAP to be updated. IFAD NO Objection required.	CLAP/FAO	11/2018
Completion of the irrigations schemes, handing over of MRRD/ MAIL ID implemented schemes: 48 schemes (above 60% works already completed as of today)	MAIL/MRRD/PST	12/2018
Completion of the irrigations schemes, handing over of MRRD/ MAIL ID implemented schemes: Completion of 41 new irrigation schemes under additional financing	MAIL/PST	12/2018
Kabul Dairy Union MAIL confirms to IFAD, its interest to support the Kabul Dairy Union with a 30,000 l/day UHT plant in the existing KDU location. In the case of non-interest, terminate the dairy development sub-component contractual arrangements and submit to IFAD a proposal to reallocate or cancel the dedicated funds.	MAIL/PST	12/2018

Disbursement CLAP should propose to IFAD, after consultation with MAIL and MOF a revised procedure allowing accelerating significantly the disbursement process	PST/ MAIL/MoF	12/2018
Revise the training manuals for Irrigation Association on water management, operation, maintenance and data collection	Irrigation Unit/ PST	12/2018
Seed Multiplication	ICARDA/ PST	12/2018
Completion of the irrigations schemes, handing over of MRRD/ MAIL ID implemented schemes: 27 schemes (below 60% works already completed as of today)	MRRD/PST	06/2019
Training and demonstration on Hydroponic Fodder System for Kutchi communities as well as for Dairy and poultry components	DCR, FAO, BESO, and ASIO	06/2019
A remote monitoring system concept note and operational plan to be submitted for monitoring quantity and quality of work for both MAIL/ID and MRRD work for IFAD NO objection	CLAP	12/2019
Develop the strategy and modus operandi for the maintenance of handed over irrigation canals through irrigation Associations.	CLAP/ MAIL/ MRRD	12/2019
Gender Strategy and Action Plan Revised the Gender strategy and action plan by incorporating activities on literacy & formation of exclusive Women Association / Women Producers Company at national level, and submit for IFAD NO objection.	Gender Unit/ MAIL	12/2019
Kabul Dairy Union The Human Resource Development Plan with KDU to be prepared and submitted for IFAD NO objection. The KDU would take lead in the recruitment of the management staff. The plan should include the Technical Assistance support, recruitment procedures, minimum qualification, and induction programme among others.	CLAP/KDU/FAO	12/2019
MoU with KDU and CLAP detailing the responsibility of each party, details of support provided by CLAP, audit, financials and other reporting requirement, key performance indicators.. IFAD NO objection required.	KDU/CLAP	12/2019
Training, demonstration, awareness and promotion of 'Compost making.' 75% of the targeted HH to have implemented & adopted by end of 2019.	FAO	12/2019
Conduct training of VPPG members to collect the quarterly data with respect to the increase in stocking, eggs consumed in the household, eggs sold, number of chickens consumed, income and expenditure.	BESO/ASIO/ PST	12/2019
Once the Dairy Plant is procured, the business plan to be updated/revised to incorporate the actuals based on the dairy plant cost, location etc. IFAD NO objection required.	KDU/CLAP/FAO	01/2020

To release the remaining USD 1 million from NSP to Citizen Charter, to disburse the second instalment for completed schemes implemented through MRRD.	MoF/ CLAP	
Formalize Irrigation Association role and responsibilities	PST	
Gender Organize exposure visit to women run enterprises in the region	PST	
Setting up of the National Dairy Development Board would be one of the important step towards dairy cooperative development and policy dialogue.	FAO/CLAP	
Launch phase 4 of the procurement process to identify the IPs for each provinces for the remaining beneficiaries	PST	
Two days orientation of all service providers on how to access loans facilitated under SNNaP2.	PST/FMFB	
Provide training to Village Group Leaders on role and business opportunity for Aggregators	PST	
ICARDA to submit the strategy to reach the targeted beneficiaries by the end of 2019.	ICARDA	
Fodder varieties Up-scale on-going field trials of Cactus and other drought-tolerant fodder varieties, which are being done under the different project and as well identify additional tree fodder and leguminous varieties for new trails and submit proposal for IFAD NO.	ICARDA	
ICARDA to clarify or revise the strategy to increase the ratio of demonstration plot vis-a vis beneficiaries	ICARDA	
Performing VBSE should be selected for production of certified seed varieties in Fodder crops and vegetable crops.	ICARDA	
Income per HH reporting format should be provided to each HH to capture the data related to expenses and sales	PST	
Stakeholder forum to be established with all the stakeholders (farmer members, researchers, extension workers, and policymakers) to help achieve the seed related policies and initiatives and ICARDA should lead this forum.	CARDA and all stakeholders	

E. Project implementation

a. Development Effectiveness

Effectiveness and Developmental Focus

Effectiveness

Rating: 4

Previous rating: 5

Justification of rating

Today, approximately 49% of the revised appraisal target has been reached against 223,000 HHs. The project has shown improved physical improvement since MTR, but the project disbursement is behind schedule with 66% on the initial financing and 4 % disbursement for the USD 25 million grant additional financing approved in December 2017. However, in terms of output, outcomes and impact, CLAP interventions, both at community level and household level, has resulted in substantial improvements in household incomes, economic and social empowerment as well as women empowerment.

Log-Frame Analysis & Main Issues of Effectiveness

CLAP outreach is to-date significant, with more than 109,549 HHs reached and representing 49% of the overall appraisal target of 223,000 households. Out of the appraisal target of 164 irrigation schemes, 131 schemes have been completed or initiated and remaining 41 schemes have already been identified. There is a significant delay in completing the irrigation schemes carried out by MRRD due to emerging security issues in Logar province. However working with community development councils significantly reduces the security concerns. The total command area of the 131 irrigation schemes under works represents 37,993 ha corresponding to 59% of the overall CLAP revised target on irrigation.

Under dairy subcomponent, 3036 dairy farmers (108 % of the original target and 61% of the revised target with additional financing) have been trained, organized and are benefitting from animal health and food-improved services. Cow milk production of these farmers has increased by 7 litres/day on an average. 20 collecting centers and 5 chilling centers are now operational. However, the increase in yield has not been reflected in the increase in income, which has been reported by 17.5%. The challenge is to commercialize the excess milk produce to achieve the semblance of parity with income and yield.

Under poultry development, against the revised target of 40,000, the project has achieved only 13,300 beneficiaries. The mission recommended reaching all the clients by the end of 2019, to ensure that the project has sufficient time to graduate these clients from backyard poultry to semi commercial kitchen gardening. Similarly under improved Food, Forage and vegetable crops, the project has recommended submitting the strategy to reach out 120,000 by 2019 (the project has reached out to only 52,501 since Dec 2017).

<i>Agreed Action</i>	<i>Responsibility</i>	<i>Agreed Date</i>
Development Effectiveness		
Detailed MIS Requirement CLAP to prepare a detailed MIS requirement and submit for IFAD NO	CLAP M&E	10/2018

Development Focus

Targeting and Outreach

Rating: 5

Previous rating: 5

Justification of rating

The project has been designed to target the vulnerable such as women, smallholder farmers and livestock keepers including the landless. The project primary target groups consist of women for most of the investment primarily under poultry and dairy development. Women in Afghanistan generally possess fewer assets, receive less education and have less employment due to traditional restrictions on their activities outside the home. The Kuchis (the nomadic herders) are considered to be one of the largest vulnerable groups (about 1.5 million) and over the years, many of them have lost their herds (drought, diseases, war, etc.). The post MTR and CLAP-A project area geographic has provided opportunity to extend the scope of the subcomponent for Kutch livestock development to cover the entire migration trail during summers and winter.

Main issues

There are no major issues with targeting. Although the project is following the identified criteria for each component, it seems that according to the selection criteria, it is problematic to find literate Kutchi population to be trained as para-vet under the livestock development among the Kutchi.

Gender equality & women's participation**Rating: 5****Previous rating: 4****Justification of rating**

An opportunity for women's participation is cross cutting through out the components of the project. The project reached out to women beneficiaries who are promoted or supported by the project is 49% and specifically benefiting 8% of women headed households. 2,849 women farmers under dairy development received milk hygiene kits and trained accordingly. The poultry component specifically targeted women in the households and reached 13,332 women and organized them into VEPGs. Under Village based seed enterprises 11% of the members are women. Two VBSE has female as chairman and deputy chairman. To increase the women participation under this component, the 27 female graduates were recruited to promote kitchen gardening among women beneficiaries. To date, 870 women beneficiaries have established kitchen gardens. For the first time, many women participants have economic opportunities and had a social voice through the VPPGs. Gender guideline was revised based on MAIL and IFAD gender strategy in two sections (administration and projects level). Project has made considerable improvement in women workforce in the project and service provider's organization structure. The number of women staff grew from 13% at MTR to 33% at the end of Sep 2018, which is pre requisite to ensure more female beneficiary participation.

Main issues

Some communities remains under control or very traditional and the participation of women is consequently more difficult to ensure. The mission has recommended for an update of the gender strategy with action plan to be prepared and submitted for IFAD NO Objection.

Agricultural Productivity**Rating: 5****Previous rating: 5****Justification of rating**

Project has made concentrated effort in accelerating agriculture productivity through a number of project interventions like irrigation solutions, improved food, fodder, and vegetable crops, enhanced milk production and livestock development among Kuchis. As a result of the combined effect of improved irrigation facilities and agriculture technologies 85% beneficiaries of the completed small and medium irrigation schemes reported a 10% increase of agriculture productivity for key crops, significant increase in milk production of 317% and decrease of 15% to 6.2% in animal mortality were reported under Livestock development among Kuchis subcomponents. Outreach of Improved food, fodder and Vegetable has reached over 52,501 HHs for demonstration, VBSE and kitchen gardening.

Main issues

The main issues is to roll out 6 promising lines through the Agriculture Research Institute of Afghanistan (ARIA), the trait/characters include heat, cold, drought, and disease tolerant varieties. So far, 3 wheat lines results have been submitted to ARIA. The mission recommends clarifying strategy on seed multiplication by establishing the demonstration plot of 5Kgs along with 131 irrigation schemes under community infrastructure sub component of the proposed promising lines, which would be approved by ARIA.

Nutrition**Rating: 5****Previous rating: 4****Justification of rating**

The project is contributing to improving family nutrition and income by advancing relevant livestock and agriculture technology choices and services for increased on-farm productivity and production of field crops, fodder, vegetables, dairy, eggs, and poultry meat. It is estimated that 40% of the vegetables produced under kitchen gardens activities is retained for self-consumption. Similar under the backyard poultry component 30% of the increased poultry production (mainly egg), are consumed by the beneficiaries. Under the Kuchi component, through nutrition security is not measured separately, the project has a visible impact on food security and nutrition due to the significant increase in the livestock productivity and income generation in Kuchi population.

Adaptation to Climate Change**Rating: 4****Previous rating: 4****Justification of rating**

Project design is largely oriented to address existing environmental and social conditions in the target area. The SECAP review note prepared during CLAP-AF design acknowledged this. The specific relevant climate sensitive activities of the CLAP Project include improving irrigation system and management through productive infrastructure, capacity building for construction/rehabilitation of irrigation systems efficient use of water resources, support for community-based sustainable agriculture and livestock activities including capacity building of communities and government staff for sustainable management of rangeland, introduction of drought resistant agriculture technologies, farmer-to-farmer dissemination of information and training, and building rural population managerial capacities to organise independently around various

activities and markets. The SECAP review note concluded that potential impacts are relatively minor especially because that the project design provides appropriate actions on adaptation and mitigation measures.

Main issues

CLAP-AF emphasises training of project staff at all levels in climate change adaptation issues and equipped with the necessary didactic and promotional material in this regard whereby using real field settings such as assessing technology options promoted under the four sub components of Agriculture, Horticulture, Livestock and Capacity building.

b. Sustainability and Scaling up

Institutions and Policy Engagement	Rating: 4	Previous rating: 4
---	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

Project policy support fund supports the formulation, development, follow-up or completion of draft policies, strategies and legislations required by MAIL to nurture an enabling environment. The policy support sub-component has funded the authoring of the Comprehensive Agricultural Development framework (CAD) which forms a key pillar of the NPDP (2017 - 2021). Main features of the CADF include support to local institutions, innovative approaches to rural finance and inclusive development, which fully compliments the NPD. The project is pursuing strengthening of local public and community institution institutions in the IFAD programme area to gradually change of role for SPs from execution of projects to facilitator and ultimate taking charge of the developmental processes.

Main issues

No particular issue. CLAP Project Support team will submit to IFAD a policy action plan, discussed with the FOs, to be developed in 2019.

Partnership-building	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 5
-----------------------------	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

The project has been able to develop number of successful partnerships. The project partnered with FAO, ICARDA, DCA, MRRD, MAIL/ID and local NOGs (BESO and ASIO) for the implementation of Dairy development, Food forage and vegetables, Kutchi, rehabilitation of irrigation schemes and poultry development.

Human and Social Capital and Empowerment	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 5
---	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

Smallholders are benefitting from the provision of support in the form of skill development, asset transfer and market linkages, as well as extension services to enhance productivity of the farming activities in which they engage in, which in turn is expected to have significant impact on their income level and economic empowerment. CLAP mainly focus on women beneficiaries and development of community institutions (CDC & IAs). The establishment of dairy cooperatives include female members and the backyard poultry activity targets purely women beneficiaries.

Main issues

IAs and CDCs are expected to take responsibility for the agriculture development in their catchment area; these organizations need to be supported to build capacity to lead the process, have full knowledge of their membership and area potential, and provide services to their members.

Quality of Beneficiary Participation	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 4
---	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

Strong beneficiary participation, especially of women and youth, is a salient feature of CLAP implementation. CLAP has applied participatory processes to mobilize households to participate in project activities and implementation. regular field visits are conducted by the project and SPs staff for interaction and feedback with beneficiary groups and individual HH. Development approach and processes are used for identification and participation of beneficiaries. Project interventions are planned and implemented in consultation and by the community institutions. Project and SPs staff proactively engages with communities for planning, implementation, participatory M&E. There is a need for identification of vulnerable HHs in community institutions for targeting of specific activities.

Responsiveness of Service Providers	Rating: 4	Previous rating: 5
--	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

Project's service providers include various directorate of MAIL, MRRD and service providers (FAO, ICARDA, DCA and local NGOs) for agriculture and livestock development component. Contract Agreements with SPs and NGOs govern the provision of services by these partners while MOU's with government agencies guide provision of their services. PSU/PMU has successfully forged strong, responsive and accountable partnerships with all service providers and project's excellent performance.

Main issues

The partnership with MRRD needs to be reviewed in light of the not completed work and unjustified advances after the deadline agreed during the mission.

Environment and Natural Resource Management	Rating: 4	Previous rating: 4
--	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

Climate change (CC) with frequent long dry spells or excessive floods is being experienced in project implementation areas. The project is working with ICARDA to develop drought and disease resistant varieties as well as to rehabilitate the irrigation schemes resulting in water savings has positive impact on mitigating climate change.

Main issues

Considering the on-going drought due to La Niña (70% rain and snow deficit), the mission recommends to up-scale on-going field trials of Cactus and drought tolerant fodder varieties which is being done under the different project and as well identify additional tree fodder and leguminous varieties for new trials. For the Cactus and drought tolerance fodder varieties the project should prepare an action plan to incorporate these fodder varieties for other subcomponent beneficiaries.

Exit Strategy	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 5
----------------------	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

The project hands over the completed irrigation schemes to the IAs. The IAs is expected to maintain these schemes and play an active role in the water management. Similarly, under dairy development the farmers are organised into cooperatives and linked to market through collection centres and chilling centres. As well, the village poultry groups leaders are identified and given assets for them to act as a bridge between the women egg producers and market. These initiatives are in line to ensure the sustainability of these interventions once the project is finished.

Main issues

The main issue is the capability of the IAs to manage the water management and maintenance of the irrigation schemes. The mission recommends the capacity building of these IAs in terms of training and assets. As well, the role of Village Poultry Leaders needs to be formalised in view of training them into aggregators. If the exit strategy is clearly defined for each type of CLAP activities, the project has to implement it in the 4 remaining years in order to strengthen the capacities of the institutions that will remain after CLAP.

Potential for Scaling-up	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 5
---------------------------------	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

The project is highly relevant to IFAD target group and has successfully brought many innovations with a special focus on youth and women. Geographical extension will remain a possibility as today, only 7 provinces are reached by IFAD financing.

c. Project Management

Quality of Project Management	Rating: 4	Previous rating: 5
--------------------------------------	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

The two-tier project management teams supporting all IFAD-financed projects (PST) and the PMU have generally

responded proactively and adjusted to the challenges faced by CLAP. Project management functions by PST and PMU and Steering Committee continue to be performed satisfactorily as testified by post MTR progress.

Main issues

The PMU has seven vacant positions inducing the CLAP Project Manager Position, which needs to be immediately filled to ensure smooth functioning of the project. As well, the mission recommends having a quarterly peer review meeting with all the service providers to share the best practices from each other, which can be implemented in other activities.

The Young Professional Programme is an initiative under which the fresh graduates are recruited for one year for different functions based on the demand. This provides an opportunity to the young fresh graduates to get experience as well develop their skills in the respective domain. A three days induction programme and continuous coaching/ mentoring are provided to these young professionals (YPs). To date, 61 YPs (only 8 female) have been recruited under CLAP of which 36 (59%) have found jobs or gone for higher studies. The mission recommends re-hiring of the willing unemployed served YPs to be placed in the field for them to gain minimum 2 years experience and opportunity to find employment opportunity.

Under Special Financing Facility, to date the project has not utilised the fund, the mission recommends exploring possibility of bringing in insurance and other financial instruments such as sharia loan products.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Project Management		
Recruitment Fill all seven vacant positions	PST	12/2018
Young Professional Programme Re-hiring of the willing unemployed served YPs to be placed in the field for them to gain minimum 2 years experience and opportunity to find employment opportunity.	PST	03/2019
Peer review Conduct quarterly peer review meeting with all the service providers to share best practices	PST	12/2019
Special financing Facility Develop concept paper on introducing insurance and other relevant financial products.	PST	12/2019

Knowledge Management

Rating: 5

Previous rating: 4

Justification of rating

The KM quality has improved, publication activities increased, focal persons nominated, KM objectives and guidelines distributed among staff and relevant training conducted. KM unit is contributing to creating, disseminating and documenting of best practices. reasonably well- developed M&E plan guides project's knowledge generation and sharing activities. Regular assessment of the key interventions in terms of quality and impact are conducted and a number of evaluation/impact assessment reports have been generated by SPs. The updated KM strategy includes adequate communication plan. The project is very active in submitting success stories to the gender newsletter or posting on the project web site in IFAD Asia.

Main issues

There is a need for video documentary such as Village Poultry Groups, SHGs of Kutchi, as well video documentation of the supervision mission carried out by CLAP officials. Propositions will be submitted to IFAD for NOC.

Value for Money

Rating: 5

Previous rating: 5

Justification of rating

With a total investment of US\$ 92.5 million for both CLAP and CLAP-AF (including government and beneficiary contribution), the project is helping 223,000 rural poor households (1,338,000 persons) to increase their incomes. It

comes to an average of USD 414 per household and USD 64 per head. Compared to the results achieved in terms of overall coverage, capacities built and services rendered and economic and social returns it is a very economical investment.

Main issues

The benefit cost (B:C) ratio was noted to be 1.53 as per the updated economic and financial analysis at the time of design of CLAP AF. The average increase in income at the MTR stage for the benefitted HHs was estimated at US\$245 per household varying between US\$491 in the case of Community Development, Productive Infrastructures and Institutional Strengthening and US\$183 in the case of Livestock and Agriculture development. The average incremental benefit per household for poultry was noted to be US\$108, dairy at US \$ 32, Kuchi at US\$485 per household and in the case of crops incremental benefit was noted to be US\$590 per household. These results and impact were achieved despite the fact that grim security situation prevailing in the country.

Coherence between AWPB and Implementation

Rating: 4

Previous rating: 4

Justification of rating

During FY 2017 WPB execution rates improved significantly over the previous years. Achievements of targets for most of the components were in the range of 75 to 100 percent. Notable exceptions were performance of implementation of CPIs by NSP/MRRD (15% achievement). AWPB 2018 physical target achievement by the end of August 2018 is 55%. The project is in line to achieve most of the targets with the exception of delay in establishment of dairy plan awaiting MAIL request.

AWPB Inputs and Outputs Review and Implementation Progress

The quality of AWPB has improved, however the mission noted that the appraisal targets needs to be revised in view of additional financing. Component wise physical achievement for FY 2018 AWPB is presented below:

Sub component	Progress against appraisal %	Annual progress %
Productive infrastructure development	34	68
Irrigation schemes rehabilitation	97	98
Integrated Dairy Sachems	60	39
Backyard Poultry	67	83
55Improved food, fodder and vegetable development	69	41
Kuchi development among	72	52

Performance of M&E System

Rating: 5

Previous rating: 5

Justification of rating

The PMU has set up a sound system for monitoring and evaluation, which monitors processes as well as results, and the M&E unit produces regular progress reports and annual outcome surveys that feed into management decisions. Recently the project contracted a consultant to carry out the mid-term evaluation. The team has adopted and incorporated into the system the new log frame of CLAP, revised after the increase of targets with the approval of the additional financing in December 2017.

M&E System Review

The M&E system is capturing the gender mainstreaming by reporting sex- disaggregated data since the beginning of the programme. One M&E officer positions is vacant, which would be filled by the end of November 2018. In order to strengthen its role of advisory support (already mentioned in MT), the M&E unit should have awareness on budgetary implications of activities being monitored.

Besides, The M&E system is manual and excel based. The M&E unit is already in the process of developing the digital MIS system; however, the mission recommends developing detailed MIS system requirement before commencing the procurement.

Requirements of Social, Environmental and Climate Assessment Procedures (SECAP)

Rating: 4

Previous rating: 4

Justification of rating

A whole system approach to food and feed production that sustains the health of soil, ecosystem and people needs to be done with related to all the components by all the stakeholders/Service providers. It relies on ecological processes, biodiversity and cycles adapted to local conditions. Sustainable agriculture needs to be practised based on the identification of major risks and challenges faced by the communities, as of now there is severe drought visibly observed. Strategies need to be aimed at reducing vulnerabilities and increasing the resilience of the small and medium holders.

SECAP Review

The mission observed that the water saving technologies like zero tillage needs to be scaled up and most or maximum number of beneficiaries should have been following such methodologies as well bring in additional saving technologies too. Soil health is the key property that determines the resilience of agriculture under changing climate, which requires more attention. Livestock intervention under SECAP like trails/demos being carried out for new drought variety fodder crops is not adequately implemented. Usage of chemical fertilizers and pesticides had to be curtailed and bring in more biofertilizers and compost making for the agriculture with the help of the surplus quantity of animal waste available in the community. M&E should do the SECAP Assessment and the process is incorporated fully into the project life cycle. Specific tools like Environment and Social Audit; Pesticide management Plan; Social Impact Assessment.

d. Financial Management & Execution

Disbursement by financier

Type	Name	Current Amount	Disbursed Amount	Actual Rate
Domestic Financing breakdown	Beneficiaries additional financing	\$1,844,000		
	Beneficiaries	\$3,481,000		
	National Government	\$3,576,000		
	National Government (add)	\$191,000		
Co-financing breakdown,	Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations	\$456,000		
	To be determined	\$387,000		

Acceptable Disbursement Rate

Rating: 3

Previous rating: 4

Justification of rating

By 31 August 2018, IFAD had released an aggregate amount of SDR 25.6 million (USD 36.3 million), a disbursement of 66% for the original grant and 4% for the additional grant. To note that USD 5.5 Million are advances. Most of the unspent funds of the original financing have been committed and are expected to be disbursed by the end of the project. In accordance with the profile of the project, the disbursement rate is considered moderately unsatisfactory.

Main issues

The issue related to the mis-categorization of some expenditures of IPs is being resolved, this will allow the processing of a reallocation, to be proposed by CLAP management. It is necessary for the project to continue monitoring PST and IPs expenditures to ensure correct classification of these in the WAs.

The depreciation of the USD against the SDR and the subsequent reduction of funds available in the original grant, must be duly considered in the preparation of the future budgets.

Withdrawal applications. The project has submitted 6 WAs for the PCU and SPs since the date of the last IFAD mission. WAs are submitted regularly.

The mission reviewed all of them. Generally WAs are prepared properly, and funds claimed are eligible for IFAD financing; however the following areas for improvement have been identified:

- Hard copy of category wise SOEs should be attached with WAs of DCA and ICARDA;
- Detailed SOEs should be submitted by FAO instead of summary reports;
- Categorization of expenditures in claims from IPs needs to be properly monitored by PST before submission of WAs to IFAD. Some minor, non-material, expenses have not been classified correctly.
-

Special Account reconciliation are prepared on a monthly basis and properly recorded in the system.

After more than two years of partial recovery of initial advances on all WAs, now the level of advances to PST and IPs is deemed adequate and it has been agreed to stop the recovery on forthcoming WAs, with the exception of MRRD, for which the 100% recovery on all WAs will continue to apply.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Financial Management & Execution		
Miscalssification of expenditures Detailed calculations (WA wise) of the misclassifications in Incremental Operating Costs should be prepared and the accounting entries corrected. Upon finalization and confirmation from the Audit report the project will request IFAD to adjust its records.	Finance Team	06/2018
Review of claims presented by IPs Improve the review of claims presented by IPs before submission of WAs to IFAD to reduce the risk of misclassification of expenditures	Finance team	10/2018
Management of MRRD advance Follow up with MRRD to collect documentation to justify the outstanding advance. Submit Was to IFAD for justification of MRRD advances when agreed requirements are met.	Program Director and Finance Team	11/2018
Service providers management ICARDA to immediately submit WA from 1 July 2017 to 31 Dec 2017 (6 months) and thereafter submit quarterly WA within one month of the end of the Quarter.	Program Director and Finance Team	
Service PProviders management Category wise SOEs should be attached with WAs of DCA and ICARDA	Finance Team	

Fiduciary Aspects

Quality of Financial Management

Rating: 4

Previous rating: 4

Justification of rating

Since the beginning of the project Financial Management (FM) has improved considerably, including improved and stronger oversight over IPs, improved understanding IFAD's Financial Management policies & procedures, improved and regular reporting to IFAD, preparation of cash flow forecasts, reduction in cash expenditure and cash balances, timely submission of un-audited and audited financial statements of the project including its IPs. Accordingly the quality of FM has been rated as moderately satisfactory (4) and the FM risk is rated as medium. FM needs to be further improved in the accounting (deployment of TOMPRO and phasing out of Quickbooks and the related training) and budgeting (preparation/execution of consistent budgets for both GoA and IFAD) areas.

Main issues

Staffing: The Finance and Accounts unit is combined for two projects i.e. CLAP and SNaPP2. It consists of 1 Senior Manager Finance (SFM), 1 Finance Manager (FM) responsible for CLAP and SNaPP2 projects, with 3 Finance Officers dedicated to the projects backed up by 1 Finance Assistant and 1 Cashier. In additional three Finance Assistants are based in the provincial offices. An international financial consultant is in the process of being hired for a period of three to

six months, for further capacity building and guidance on the use of TOMPRO. Dedicated training to finance staff needs to continue to be run on a regular basis.

Accounting and Financial Reporting: The project follows a cash basis of accounting (with advances treated as expenditures reporting wise) and no accruals are taken into account. A Double Entry accounting software (QuickBooks - QB) is being used by the project but the software is designed for commercial entities and not for projects. Until now the project prepared WAs and financial reports including financial statements by extracting the accounting transactions from QB and manipulating these in MS Excel. The quality of financial reports is adequate. The project has finalized the procurement of the TOMPRO software which has been installed on all workstations. Three sessions of training of ten days each have been agreed; the first one has already been run and the other two will be run before the end of the year. The TOMPRO service provider is taking care of inputting all transactions since project's beginning in TOMPRO. CLAP finance team is just starting the use of the software to record current transactions. The move to the Finance Directorate makes it difficult to keep the QB software updated. There is an increased risk of non-recording, double recording or partial recording of transactions until the TOMPRO is not fully deployed and staff fully trained. It is necessary to keep the QB software updated until the transition to TOMPRO is finalized.

Internal controls. The project has put in place appropriate internal control procedures including proper segregation of duties, expenditure authorization processes, bank reconciliations, etc. Bank Reconciliation Statements are prepared on a monthly basis and no issues arose in this regard. Before full TOMPRO utilization, financial reports are continuing to be prepared by extracting information from the QB to Excel.

A fixed Assets registers have been maintained with distinctive numbers for identification and verification. Physical verification of fixed assets is conducted by the project periodically but not properly documented; suggestions have been given to improve the management of the fixed assets register.

Budget management and execution. In 2018 the project presented two different versions of the budget to GoA (for approx. USD 6 Million) and to IFAD (for approx. USD 11.5 Million). Total disbursements in the period do not entirely reflect the rate of execution of budget as IFAD disbursed also a new advance. While GoA considers all disbursements as expenditures, IFAD considers expenditures only the utilization of funds. The execution rate of the budget stands at more than 80% from the GoA perspective and at 28% from IFAD perspective. Details on budget execution in appendix 1. For 2019, it is recommended the preparation and submission of a unique budget for both GoA and IFAD to increase transparency and coherence of information.

Treasury and funds flow. The project has a Special Account in US Dollars, fully controlled by the Ministry of Finance (MoF) where the disbursements of IFAD flow in and from where all the payments are made. For every payment, the transaction is initiated by the FO, followed by review by the FM and the SFM and approved by the Project Director. This is followed by a review of the MAIL finance department and internal audit unit and the final approval of the MAIL Deputy Minister (Admin and Finance) for onwards forwarding to MoF for payment from the Special Account upon further review of the supporting documents. Until now the project made entry in the books of account maintained in QB software upon receipt of bank statements. Authorizations and authentication at appropriate levels were observed in respect of any kind of payment made. Payments to IPs are made through Direct Payment method, which also goes through the same process of approval i.e. MAIL and MoF. The funds flow mechanism is reliable even if sometimes slow due to the long authorization process.

Implementing Partners (IPs). Most of the project's implementation is being conducted through IPs therefore it is important to ensure that the quality of financial management and procurement of the IPs is satisfactory. The project has meetings with the IPs on a regular basis to discuss fiduciary matters. IPs provide regular reporting to PST. Overall, through time the PST management of the relation and the contracts with IPs has improved and is now satisfactory.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Financial Management & Execution		
TOMPRO deployment Procurement and implementation process of accounting software should be completed urgently.	Procurement and Finance teams	04/2018
Capacity building An international financial consultant may be engaged for a period of three to six months period, for further capacity building and guidance of finance team and implementation of accounting software.	Programme Manager	04/2018
Contribution to MAIL To determine the amount of the required contribution for the cost of consultancy services for the preparation of the financial procedural manual for the Finance Department	Programme Manager	05/2018
Capacity building Finance team may be provided additional capacity building trainings to ensure that they are able to do planning, budgeting and monitoring functions	Programme Manager and Finance Team	06/2018
Fixed assets management Fixed assets verification to be performed on a six monthly basis, properly documented, the report needs to be printed out and signed off by PST Director and Admin Manager	Admin Officer	11/2018
Record of transactions Ensure parallel and timely recording of financial transactions both in Quickbooks and TOMPRO until the new software is fully deployed, training delivered and the finance staff becomes familiar with it.	finance team	11/2018
PIM update with TOMPRO To update the accounting and reporting requirements in the PIM upon full deployment and utilization of TOMPRO	Finance team	12/2018
Budget management From 2019 onwards ensure the same budget proposal, figures and amounts are presented to both IFAD and GoA	PST Director and Finance Team	12/2018

Quality and Timeliness of Audit

Rating: 4

Previous rating: 4

Justification of rating

The audit report for 2017 has been submitted to IFAD within the stipulated deadline. PST submitted its own audited financial statements together with those of all IPs. Opinions on all financial statements were unqualified. Auditors used ISAs to perform the audit work. Auditors did not identify and major internal control issues. The quality of the audit work was acceptable but assessed as moderately satisfactory as auditors did not detect some inconsistencies in reference to WAs disbursed. The procurement for audit services for 2018 and 2019 is ongoing and should be finalized by year end.

<i>Agreed Action</i>	<i>Responsibility</i>	<i>Agreed Date</i>
Financial Management & Execution		
Audit process management Upon finalization of the procurement of audit services, set-up a meeting with auditors to agree the course of action of the 2018 audit to ensure timely submission of audit report to IFAD. Share with auditors the "Conceptual Framework on Financial Reporting and External Audit of IFAD-Funded Projects"	Finance team	12/2018

Counterparts Funds	Rating: 3	Previous rating: 4
---------------------------	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

Government contribution at appraisal was budgeted to be USD 3.6 million for the original grant and until August 2018 USD 2.07 million (58%) has been contributed by the Government which is almost in line with IFAD original grant utilization.

Main issues

Detailed exercise for revising the calculations of Government contribution was conducted as per previous recommendations. Government contribution has been made in-kind in the form of office space, electricity, internet, water, and security expenses provided to PST/PMU and in the implementation of Irrigation schemes by the MAIL & MRRD. Major Government contribution has been made by MRRD/NSP in the implementation of Irrigation/Productive Infrastructure. Detailed information on counterpart funds in appendix 1.

Beneficiaries' contributions: The program design includes this source of financing, that is captured in project accounts. Beneficiaries contributed in-kind for USD 1 Million out of USD 3.4 estimated in the beginning of the project (30%).

<i>Agreed Action</i>	<i>Responsibility</i>	<i>Agreed Date</i>
Financial Management & Execution		
Mobilize MAIL/MRRD resources for CLAP	PST Director and Technical Team	12/2018

Compliance with Loan Covenants	Rating: 4	Previous rating: 4
---------------------------------------	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

All financing covenants are respected except the one stated in Section E paragraph 2 (b) which foresees the establishment and adequate composition of the PST in MAIL. The transfer of Procurement, Finance and HR staff to the respective Directorates of the Ministry have altered the organization and the internal control function of the project. Details on compliance with financing covenants in Appendix 1.

Procurement

Procurement	Rating: 4	Previous rating: 5
--------------------	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

The review of the procurement processes found that the PST is fully compliant with National Public Procurement Laws of Afghanistan and consistent with IFAD's Procurement Guidelines. The procurement plan for the year 2018 includes work and services for a total cost of US\$10,638,040.00 in line with the Annual Work Plan and Budget (AWPB) and the PP and the contract register were maintained with actual dates. The agreed actions of the last supervision mission have been partially implemented. There has been proper documentation of processes and the documents have been properly filed.

Procurement Review

Currently, the PST/PMU support units procurement, finance and human resources have been integrated within the Government MAIL directorate. However, during the Mission, the meeting was held with the Minister for Agriculture, Irrigation and Livestock (MAIL) for the re-integration of procurement, finance and HR to Project Support Team (PST). It was agreed by the Ministry that the support unit's procurement, finance, and HR will be physically re-integrated in the PST by the first week of October 2018.

The PST is currently staffing with one Senior Procurement Specialist, one Senior Procurement Officer, one Contract

Management Officer, one Procurement Assistant, however, there are two additional positions have been approved by IFAD in 2018 procurement plan. These are: 1) Procurement Specialist; and 2) Procurement Assistant.

The project team is in process for the preparation of the Annual Work Plan and Budget (AWPB) and Procurement Plan for FY 2019, the draft would be submitted to National Procurement Authority (NPA) by the mid of December 2018 for review and approval and thereafter will submit to IFAD for review and possible No Objection.

Progress on the Procurement Plan (Works): Based on the procurement plan the PST has planned the activities of works with an estimated cost of US\$8,693,783.62. Out of which two (2) irrigation schemes at the cost of US\$230,450.00 have been completed; six (6) schemes Bid Evaluation Report (BER) prepared and sent to IFAD for No Objection, eight (8) schemes bid evaluation report at the advanced stage and the remaining activities are in the initial stages.

Completion of 25 Irrigations Schemes:

The Mission has reviewed the documentation of twenty-five (25) irrigation scheme's contracts, it was found that the PST/MAIL is retaining 10% of total contract cost from the contractors after completion of work. This retention money is kept for one year for the maintenance/quality of work as per the National Procurement Authority Guidelines. However, there is provision in the Guidelines that the Project may keep up to 15% retention amount from the contract based on the nature of work.

Services: The CLAP has planned activities "firms and individual consultancies" with an estimated cost of US\$1,944,256.51 under services category; these are:

1. hiring the services of an individual consultants against the vacant positions of PST; these are: i) National Dairy Development Consultant Short term (New); ii) Finance Officer; iii) Finance Assistant; iv) Procurement Specialist; v) Procurement Assistant; vi) Sr. M&E Officer; and vii) Guard.
2. hiring the services of service providers for: i) Poultry Development Project in Sorbi, Khak-e-Jabar, Mirbachakot and Shakardara Districts in Kabul; ii) hiring the services of service providers for the Poultry Development Project in Doshee, Khenjan, Deh salla and Pulikhomree districts in Baghlan province; iii) hiring the services of audit firm to conduct Annual Audit for CLAP Project-FYs 2018 and 2019; iv) hiring the services of audit firm to conduct Annual Audit for NSP/MRRD Project for the year 2018.

The PST has not initiated the procurement process of consultancies.

Contract Management: The Mission noted that the role of contracts management is assigned to Contract Management Officer; who is responsible for the management of all contracts related to goods, works and services for the time submission of outputs and deliverables from each contracts/assignment.

Fixed Assets Register: Maintaining an up to date fixed asset register is an important internal control element, reducing risk of misuse and loss of assets. The Mission reviewed the CLAP fixed asset register and noted that items procured are registered and marked with inventory identification code stickers.

Record Keeping: The Mission reviewed the record-keeping system and observed that there is a consolidated filing system in place. All the documents are available and are organized for all procurements carried out.

F. Agreed Actions

<i>Agreed Action</i>	<i>Responsibility</i>	<i>Agreed Date</i>
Overview and Project Progress		
Advance of USD 6.5 million to be justified by October 30 at the latest	MRRD	10/2018
Submit the plan to support to Irrigation Associations for office structure, office equipment and recruitment of local staff for data management to IFAD for NO objection	PST/ Engineering Unit	11/2018
Dairy plant CLAP to handle the procurement of Dairy plant and FAO contract with the CLAP to be amended accordingly to reflect the changes. Consequently the Procurement Plan of CLAP to be updated. IFAD NO Objection required.	CLAP/FAO	11/2018

Completion of the irrigations schemes, handing over of MRRD/ MAIL ID implemented schemes: 48 schemes (above 60% works already completed as of today)	MAIL/MRRD/PST	12/2018
Completion of the irrigations schemes, handing over of MRRD/ MAIL ID implemented schemes: Completion of 41 new irrigation schemes under additional financing	MAIL/PST	12/2018
Kabul Dairy Union MAIL confirms to IFAD, its interest to support the Kabul Dairy Union with a 30,000 l/day UHT plant in the existing KDU location. In the case of non-interest, terminate the dairy development sub-component contractual arrangements and submit to IFAD a proposal to reallocate or cancel the dedicated funds.	MAIL/PST	12/2018
Disbursement CLAP should propose to IFAD, after consultation with MAIL and MOF a revised procedure allowing accelerating significantly the disbursement process	PST/ MAIL/MoF	12/2018
Revise the training manuals for Irrigation Association on water management, operation, maintenance and data collection	Irrigation Unit/ PST	12/2018
Seed Multiplication	ICARDA/ PST	12/2018
Completion of the irrigations schemes, handing over of MRRD/ MAIL ID implemented schemes: 27 schemes (below 60% works already completed as of today)	MRRD/PST	06/2019
Training and demonstration on Hydroponic Fodder System for Kutchi communities as well as for Dairy and poultry components	DCR, FAO, BESO, and ASIO	06/2019
A remote monitoring system concept note and operational plan to be submitted for monitoring quantity and quality of work for both MAIL/ID and MRRD work for IFAD NO objection	CLAP	12/2019
Develop the strategy and modus operandi for the maintenance of handed over irrigation canals through irrigation Associations.	CLAP/ MAIL/ MRRD	12/2019
Gender Strategy and Action Plan Revised the Gender strategy and action plan by incorporating activities on literacy & formation of exclusive Women Association / Women Producers Company at national level, and submit for IFAD NO objection.	Gender Unit/ MAIL	12/2019
Kabul Dairy Union The Human Resource Development Plan with KDU to be prepared and submitted for IFAD NO objection. The KDU would take lead in the recruitment of the management staff. The plan should include the Technical Assistance support, recruitment procedures, minimum qualification, and induction programme among others.	CLAP/KDU/FAO	12/2019

MoU with KDU and CLAP detailing the responsibility of each party, details of support provided by CLAP, audit, financials and other reporting requirement, key performance indicators.. IFAD NO objection required.	KDU/CLAP	12/2019
Training, demonstration, awareness and promotion of 'Compost making.' 75% of the targeted HH to have implemented & adopted by end of 2019.	FAO	12/2019
Conduct training of VPPG members to collect the quarterly data with respect to the increase in stocking, eggs consumed in the household, eggs sold, number of chickens consumed, income and expenditure.	BESO/ASIO/ PST	12/2019
Once the Dairy Plant is procured, the business plan to be updated/revised to incorporate the actuals based on the dairy plant cost, location etc. IFAD NO objection required.	KDU/CLAP/FAO	01/2020
To release the remaining USD 1 million from NSP to Citizen Charter, to disburse the second instalment for completed schemes implemented through MRRD.	MoF/ CLAP	
Formalize Irrigation Association role and responsibilities	PST	
Gender Organize exposure visit to women run enterprises in the region	PST	
Setting up of the National Dairy Development Board would be one of the important step towards dairy cooperative development and policy dialogue.	FAO/CLAP	
Launch phase 4 of the procurement process to identify the IPs for each provinces for the remaining beneficiaries	PST	
Two days orientation of all service providers on how to access loans facilitated under SNNaP2.	PST/FMFB	
Provide training to Village Group Leaders on role and business opportunity for Aggregators	PST	
ICARDA to submit the strategy to reach the targeted beneficiaries by the end of 2019.	ICARDA	
Fodder varieties Up-scale on-going field trials of Cactus and other drought-tolerant fodder varieties, which are being done under the different project and as well identify additional tree fodder and leguminous varieties for new trials and submit proposal for IFAD NO.	ICARDA	
ICARDA to clarify or revise the strategy to increase the ratio of demonstration plot vis-a vis beneficiaries	ICARDA	
Performing VBSE should be selected for production of certified seed varieties in Fodder crops and vegetable crops.	ICARDA	

Income per HH reporting format should be provided to each HH to capture the data related to expenses and sales	PST	
Stakeholder forum to be established with all the stakeholders (farmer members, researchers, extension workers, and policymakers) to help achieve the seed related policies and initiatives and ICARDA should lead this forum.	CARDA and all stakeholders	
Development Effectiveness		
Detailed MIS Requirement CLAP to prepare a detailed MIS requirement and submit for IFAD NO	CLAP M&E	10/2018
Project Management		
Recruitment Fill all seven vacant positions	PST	12/2018
Young Professional Programme Re-hiring of the willing unemployed served YPCs to be placed in the field for them to gain minimum 2 years experience and opportunity to find employment opportunity.	PST	03/2019
Peer review Conduct quarterly peer review meeting with all the service providers to share best practices	PST	12/2019
Special financing Facility Develop concept paper on introducing insurance and other relevant financial products.	PST	12/2019
Financial Management & Execution		
TOMPRO deployment Procurement and implementation process of accounting software should be completed urgently.	Procurement and Finance teams	04/2018
Capacity building An international financial consultant may be engaged for a period of three to six months period, for further capacity building and guidance of finance team and implementation of accounting software.	Programme Manager	04/2018
Contribution to MAIL To determine the amount of the required contribution for the cost of consultancy services for the preparation of the financial procedural manual for the Finance Department	Programme Manager	05/2018
Miscalssification of expenditures Detailed calculations (WA wise) of the misclassifications in Incremental Operating Costs should be prepared and the accounting entries corrected. Upon finalization and confirmation from the Audit report the project will request IFAD to adjust its records.	Finance Team	06/2018

Capacity building Finance team may be provided additional capacity building trainings to ensure that they are able to do planning, budgeting and monitoring functions	Programme Manager and Finance Team	06/2018
Review of claims presented by IPs Improve the review of claims presented by IPs before submission of WAs to IFAD to reduce the risk of misclassification of expenditures	Finance team	10/2018
Management of MRRD advance Follow up with MRRD to collect documentation to justify the outstanding advance. Submit WAs to IFAD for justification of MRRD advances when agreed requirements are met.	Program Director and Finance Team	11/2018
Fixed assets management Fixed assets verification to be performed on a six monthly basis, properly documented, the report needs to be printed out and signed off by PST Director and Admin Manager	Admin Officer	11/2018
Record of transactions Ensure parallel and timely recording of financial transactions both in Quickbooks and TOMPRO until the new software is fully deployed, training delivered and the finance staff becomes familiar with it.	finance team	11/2018
PIM update with TOMPRO To update the accounting and reporting requirements in the PIM upon full deployment and utilization of TOMPRO	Finance team	12/2018
Budget management From 2019 onwards ensure the same budget proposal, figures and amounts are presented to both IFAD and GoA	PST Director and Finance Team	12/2018
Mobilize MAIL/MRRD resources for CLAP	PST Director and Technical Team	12/2018
Audit process management Upon finalization of the procurement of audit services, set-up a meeting with auditors to agree the course of action of the 2018 audit to ensure timely submission of audit report to IFAD. Share with auditors the "Conceptual Framework on Financial Reporting and External Audit of IFAD-Funded Projects"	Finance team	12/2018
Service providers management ICARDA to immediately submit WA from 1 July 2017 to 31 Dec 2017 (6 months) and thereafter submit quarterly WA within one month of the end of the Quarter.	Program Director and Finance Team	
Service Providers management Category wise SOEs should be attached with WAs of DCA and ICARDA	Finance Team	

Community Livestock and Agriculture Project

Logical Framework

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of verification			Assumptions
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2017)	Cumulative Result (2017)	Cumulative Result % (2017)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility	
Outreach	1.b Estimated corresponding total number of households members										
	Household members		571 809	1 338 000	354 657	571 809	42.7				
	1.a Corresponding number of households reached										
	Non-women-headed households		86 724	223 000	13 665	95 301	42.7				
	Women-headed households		8 577		2 300	8 577					
	1 Persons receiving services promoted or supported by the project										
	Males		291 622	682 380	41 306	291 622	42.7				
	Females		280 186	655 620	41 212	280 186	42.7				
	Goal To contribute to reduce poverty in rural Afghanistan	Decrease of population below the poverty line							RIMS impact survey	Baseline, mid-term, completion	
Population below poverty line		69	71	59							
Objective To improve food security of rural households in selected districts of the provinces of Kabul, Parwan, Logar, Herat, Nangarhar, Balkh and Baghlan by increasing agriculture and livestock productivity	Households reporting decreased food insecurity							outcome survey	start, mid-term, end	service providers, PMU	No major security problems in the project target areas. No major natural disasters. No major drought.
	food insecure households	38	1.8								
	Households reporting an increase in income										
	households		18	30							

Outcome 1. Enhanced capacities of local communities and local institutions for the participatory planning and operation of small and medium scale irrigation infrastructure	Households expressing satisfaction with the quality of services provided by local government agencies staff						AOS, key informant interview	Annual	service providers, PMU	No major security problems in the project target areas. No socio-cultural barriers for the participation of poorest and marginalized households in local planning processes. No resistance from traditional leaders vis à vis women participation in local planning and decision-making processes. Clear roles and responsibilities for irrigation development.	
	households		34	70							
Output 1.1 Creation and completion of small- and medium-scale irrigation infrastructure and drinking water schemes	1.1.2 Farmland under water-related infrastructure constructed/rehabilitated						outcome surveys	annual	PMU	No major security problems in the project target areas. No socio-cultural barriers for the participation of poorest and marginalized households No resistance from traditional leaders vis à vis women participation in local planning and decision-making processes. Clear roles and responsibilities between MRRD and MAIL for irrigation development.	
	Hectares of land		4 058	64 600	3 894	4 058					6.3
	Other productive infrastructure constructed/rehabilitated						records	annual	PMU		
	irrigation schemes		37	164	25	37					22.6

Output 1.2 Capacity of population and local institutions strengthened	CDC members trained in infrastructure operation and maintenance						CDC/group records, outcome surveys	annual	service providers	No major security problems in the project target areas. No socio-cultural barriers for the participation of poorest and marginalized households No resistance from traditional leaders vis à vis women participation in local planning and decision-making processes.	
	Females		440	6 766	220	420					6.2
	Males		1 728	13 532	1 228	1 728	12.8				
	Establishment of irrigation associations and capacity building										
	Irrigation associations established		127	164	47	127					77.4
	members trained		381	492	141	381					77.4
Outcome 2. Increased agriculture and livestock productivity and incomes, in particular for women-headed households and vulnerable and marginalized rural communities	1.2.4 Households reporting an increase in production						CDC records, key informant interview	annual	service providers, PMU	No major security problems in the project target areas No major natural disasters in the project target areas. Sufficient rainfalls. Irrigation infrastructure is used for growing legal crops. No major animal disease outbreak (such a bird flu disease).	
	Households		85	100							
Output 2.1 Establishing and strengthening diary milk production and a centralised Dairy Federation	New livestock production groups/cooperatives established/strengthened						CDC records	annual	service providers, PMU	No animal disease outbreak	
	groups		33	90							
	Members of livestock groups/cooperatives						CDC records	annual	service providers, PMU		
	Males		3 036	5 000							
	Females		60								
	1.1.4 Persons trained in production practices and/or technologies						surveys	annual	PMU		
	Men trained in livestock		3 060	5 000	1 050	3 060					61.2
	Women trained in livestock		2 928	5 000	680	2 928					58.6

	fodder seeds and fertilizers distributed						surveys	annual	PMU		
	tonne		51	101	14.46	50.1					49.6
	Trainings provided to farmers						CDC records	annual	PMU		
	days per farmer		5 988								
Output 2.2 Poultry development to improve food and nutritional security through enhanced poultry production and productivity	1.1.8 Households provided with targeted support to improve their nutrition						outcome survey	annual	service providers, PMU	no major animal disease outbreak	
	Households		13 332	40 000							
	Households receiving animals from restocking/redistribution										
	households		13 332	40 000	6 666	13 332					33.3
	1.1.4 Persons trained in production practices and/or technologies						surveys	annual	PMU		
	Women trained in livestock		13 332	40 000	6 666	13 332					33.3
Outcome 3. Introducing, developing and promoting new drought-resistant and high yielding improved varieties of production	1.2.2 Households reporting adoption of new/improved inputs, technologies or practices						outcome survey	annual	service providers, PMU	Research activities and trials are successful; relevance of new varieties to farmers' needs; availability of necessary resources and equipment	
	Households		40 007	120 000							
	Village Based Seed Enterprises (VBSE) producing 1000-2000 MT of certified seeds						surevys	annual	PMU		
	tons of production of certified seeds		400	2 000							
Output 3.1 Demonstration and dissemination of high yielding crop varieties organised through participatory approaches	1.1.4 Persons trained in production practices and/or technologies						CDC records, training reports, SPC reports	annual	service providers, PMU	Research activities and trials are successful; relevance of new varieties to farmers' needs; availability of necessary resources and equipment	
	Men trained in crop		2 745		2 745	2 745					
	Women trained in crop		624		624	624					
	Total persons trained in crop		3 369	7 237	3 369	3 369					46.6
	VBSE members trained in seed production										
	Females		66		0	66					

	Males		350		22	350					
Output 3.2 Promoting livestock development among Kuchis to enhance livelihoods and resilience against predictable livestock emergencies	Kuchi households using the Veterinary Field Units							outcome surveys	annual	service providers, PMU	Kuchi pastoralists agree to pay for veterinary services
	Kuchi households		10 584	50 000	3 000	10 584	21.2				
	1.1.3 Rural producers accessing production inputs and/or technological packages										
	Females			2 250							
	Males			2 250							
	Households receiving animals form restocking/redistribution							surveys	annual	PMU	
	households			5 000							

Afghanistan

Community Livestock and Agriculture Project

Supervision Report

Appendix 1: Financial: actual financial performance; by financier by component and disbursements by category

Mission Dates: 23 September - 4 October 2018

Document Date: 06/11/2018

Project No. 1100001637

Report No. 4889-AF

Asia and the Pacific Division
Programme Management Department

Financial: Actual financial performance by financier; by component and disbursements by category

Table 1A:		Financial performance by financier				
Financier		Appraisal (USD '000)		Disbursements (USD '000)		Per cent disbursed
		IFAD Orig Grant	IFAD Add Grant	IFAD Orig Grant	IFAD Add Grant	IFAD Orig Grant
IFAD financing		58 002	25 000	35 322	-	61%
Co-financier		456	387	450	-	98%
Government		3 574	191	2 046	-	57%
Beneficiaries		3 481	1 801	1 045	-	30%
Total		65 513	27 379	38 865	-	59%

Table 1B: Financial performance by financier by component (USD '000)

Component	IFAD add grant			IFAD orig grant			Beneficiaries			Government			Co-financier			Total		
	Appr	Actual	%	Appr	Actual	%	Appr	Actual	%	Appr	Actual	%	Appr	Actual	%	Appr	Actual	%
Community Development	10 240	-	-	21 377	15 325	72%	2 303	560	24%	1 693	1 692	100%	-	-	-	25 373	17 578	69%
Livestock and Agriculture Development	10 260	-	-	25 246	15 762	62%	1 178	484	41%	1 581	177	11%	456	450	99%	28 461	16 875	59%
Project Management	4 499	-	-	11 379	4 235	37%	-	-	-	300	176	59%	-	-	-	11 679	4 411	38%
Total	25 000	-	-	58 002	35 322	61%	3 481	1 045	30%	3 574	2 046	57%	456	450	99%	65 513	38 865	59%

Table 1C: IFAD original grant disbursements (SDR, as at 31 August 2018)

Category	Category Description	Original Allocation	Disbursement	Balance	Percentage
	Authorized Allocation - Special Account		726 048	(726 048)	
	Advances		2 813 032	(2 813 032)	
122426	Civil Works, Community and Infrastructure	12 750 000	9 081 498	3 668 502	71%
122427	Vehicles, Motorcycles, Equipment and Materials	2 640 000	1 312 486	1 327 514	50%
122428	Technical Assistance, Training and Studies	7 600 000	3 252 930	4 347 070	43%
122429	Salaries and Allowances	6 620 000	5 519 297	1 100 703	83%
122430	Incremental Operating Cost	1 430 000	1 930 739	(500 739)	135%
122431	Policy Support Fund	320 000	345 238	(25 238)	108%
122432	Special Financing Facility	2 270 000	-	2 270 000	0%
122433	Unallocated	4 020 000	-	4 020 000	0%
	Total	37 650 000	24 981 269	12 668 731	66%

Table 1D: IFAD additional grant disbursements (SDR, as at 31 August 2018)

Category	Category Description	Original Allocation	Disbursement	Balance	Percentage
	Advances		716 766	(716 766)	
200003	WORKS (CIVIL WORKS AND COMMUNITY INFRASTRUCTURE)	6 300 000	-	6 300 000	0%
200004	PROJECT COMPONENT A (POLICY SUPPORT FUND)	400 000	-	400 000	0%
200016	OPERATING COSTS (INCREMENTAL OPERATING COSTS)	1 400 000	-	1 400 000	0%
200018	SALARIES AND ALLOWANCES	2 800 000	-	2 800 000	0%
200019	TRAINING (TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE, TRAINING AND STUDIES)	4 700 000	-	4 700 000	0%
290001	UNALLOCATED	2 100 000	-	2 100 000	0%
	Total	17 700 000	716 766	16 983 234	4%

Table 2: Budget execution by component – 2018 as at 31 August 2018

	Community Development	Livestock & Agriculture Development	Project Management	TOTAL
2017				
Budget	12 797 528	8 369 733	1 411 459	22 578 720
Actual	4 740 490	4 806 700	1132582	10 679 772
% execution	37%	57%	80%	47%
2018				
Budget	3 548 371	6 057 099	1 645 446	11 250 916
Actual	268 336	2 427 173	453 981	3 149 490
% execution	8%	40%	28%	28%

Table 3: Government contribution to the project

Year	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	Total
Office Space	12 760	19 140	19 140	19 140	26 518	18 292	114 990
Electricity	2 000	3 000	3 000	3 000	13 065	7 112	31 177
Water	760	1 140	1 140	1 140	10 200	885	15 265
Security	2 760	4 140	4 140	4 140	8 208	4 854	28 242
Internet	3 840	5 760	5 760	2 400	-	-	17 760
Irrigation Schemes (MAIL)	-	-	-	200 472	216 798	-	417 270
Irrigation/Productive Infrastructure (MRRD)	-	-	-	1 275 627	-	-	1 275 627
Poultry Development	-			15 255	11 487	-	26 742
Food, Forage, Vegetable	-	-	-	0	151 061	-	151 061
Total	22 120	33 180	33 180	1 521 174	437 337	31 141	2 078 132

Compliance with legal covenants: Status of implementation

Section	Covenant	Target/Action Due Date	Compliance Status/Date	Remarks
Grant Agreement Section B – Para 3, Section E Para 2(d)	The recipient shall open and maintain a Designated Grant Account denominated in USD in a bank acceptable to the Fund for purpose of receiving Grant Financing for the project. The Designated Grant Account shall be operated by the Ministry of Finance .	On Grant effectiveness	Complied	
Grant Agreement Section B – Para 4	The Recipient shall provide in-kind contribution financing for the project in the amount of USD 3.57 million.	Throughout the project	Ongoing	As per Project, the Government has contributed USD 2.07 million (58%) until Aug 2018.
Grant Agreement Section B – Para 4	The beneficiaries shall contribute to the Project up to the amount of USD 3.48 million in the form of cash, in kind and/or through labour.	Throughout the project	Ongoing	As per project, the beneficiaries have contributed USD 1.04 million (30%) until Aug 2018.
Grant Agreement Section E – Para 2 Sub Clause (a) and Section 7.11 of the General Conditions.	The National Project Director shall have been appointed	Condition precedent to withdrawal	Complied	
Grant Agreement Section E Para 2 Sub Clause (b)	The Programme Support Team (PST) must have been established	Condition precedent to withdrawal	Initially Complied but now not complied	The Ministry of Agriculture (MAIL) has decided to centralise Finance, Procurement, HR and IT functions in the Ministry. Accordingly, Finance personnel of the PST have been transferred to the Finance Directorate and report to the respective Directors and not to the Programme Director. Discussion ongoing to re-establish original arrangements.
Grant Agreement Section E Para 2 Sub Clause (c)	The Project Steering Committee shall have been established	Condition precedent to withdrawal	Complied	
Grant Agreement	The PIM shall have been adopted by the Lead Project Agency, substantially	Condition precedent to	Complied	

Section E – Para 2 Sub Clause (d)	in the form approved by the Fund	withdrawal		
Grant Agreement	A MOU shall have been executed between the LPA and the MRRD	Condition precedent to withdrawal for MRRD	Complied	
Section E – Para 3 Sub Clause (a)				
Grant Agreement	Contracts for Services shall have been executed between the LPA and the Service Providers and IFAD has endorsed respective AWPB as approved by PSC.	Condition precedent to withdrawal for SPs	Complied	
Section E – Para 3 Sub Clause (b)				
Grant Agreement	IFAD approval of proposal of expenditure under Policy Support Fund and Special Financing Facility	Condition precedent to withdrawal for Category VI and VII.	Partially Complied	Expenditure under Policy Support Fund is bring incurred while no expenditure under Special Financing Facility is bring incurred.
Section E – Para 3 Sub Clause (c)				
Grant Agreement Schedule3 – Para 7	The agreement/contract of services of each Service Provider (SP) shall specify that the SPs will make available to the recipient through the PST the statement of sources and uses of funds in respect of each fiscal year within two months of the end of each fiscal year.	Throughout the programme period	Not fully Complied	Not all agreements/MOUs with SPs specify provision of statement within two months of the end of the fiscal year.
Grant Agreement Schedule3 – Para 8	The agreement/contract of services of each Service Provider (SP) shall specify that the SPs will appoint an external independent auditor to audit their financial statements relating to the project and should be submitted to the recipient through the PST, within five months after the end of each fiscal year.	Throughout the programme period	Complied	
General Conditions – Section 4.02 (b)	No withdrawal shall be made until the first AWP&B has been approved by the Fund.	From first year of programme	Complied	
General Conditions – Section 7.01 (b) (ii)	The LPA shall submit the draft AWP&B to the Fund no later than sixty days before the beginning of the relevant project year	21 October 2017	Complied	2018: Complied
General Conditions – Section 7.08 (b) (ii)	The Recipient shall insure goods which are financed by the Financing against hazards in accordance with sound commercial practice.	Throughout the programme period	Not Complied	No reliable insurance companies in Afghanistan
General Conditions – Section 8.03 (a)	The LPA should submit progress reports to the Fund containing at least the minimum information spelt therein.	Throughout the programme period	Complied	
General Conditions – Section 11.01	The proceeds of the financing shall not be used for the payment of taxes	Throughout the programme period	Complied	Taxes on Salaries of project team is financed through IFAD Grant. This is allowed under General Conditions
Letter to Recipient- Paragraph 6				

LTR - Para 20	IFAD prior review of procurement for goods and works above USD 50,000 and consulting services above USD 30,000	Throughout the programme period	Complied	
LTR - Para 25	The first auditor should have been appointed within 120 days from the date of entry into force	First Year	Not Complied	
LTR - Para 25	For each fiscal year, the auditors should be appointed within 120 days of the beginning of the fiscal year.	21 Mar 2016 (2016)	Not Complied	Auditors are usually appointed after the completion of the year end.
		21 Mar 2017 (2017)		
	As per the new IFAD's Handbook for Financial Reporting and Auditing of IFAD Financed Projects, the auditors should be appointed 30 days before the start of the financial year.	30 Nov 2017 (2018)		
General Conditions –Section 9.03 (b)	The recipient shall within six months of the end of fiscal year furnish to the Fund, the audited financial along with the audit report.	21 June 2017	Complied	.

Afghanistan

Community Livestock and Agriculture Project

Supervision Report

Appendix 2: Physical progress measured against AWP&B

Mission Dates: 23 September - 4 October 2018
Document Date: 06/11/2018
Project No. 1100001637
Report No. 4889-AF

Asia and the Pacific Division
Programme Management Department

Appendix 4: Physical progress measured against AWP&B, including RIMS indicators

Objective Hierarchy	Indicator	Period: Jan-Aug 2018			Cumulative Actual	Appraisal Target	%
		Plan	Actual	%			
Goal: To contribute to reduce poverty in rural Afghanistan Development objective: To improve food security of 169,500 rural households in selected districts in the provinces of Kabul, Parwan, and Logar by increasing agriculture and livestock productivity.	% decrease in population below the poverty line (Target: 10% decrease from 2012 baseline)				71%	10% 59%	-2%
	% increase of agriculture/livestock productivity (measured as quantity of milk/cow, n. of eggs/chick, yield/ha) among households targeted by the project Targets:				36.75	30%	122.5
					230eggs/Chick/year	230	100%
	100% increase in milk/cow				9.1	8	260
	100% increase in annual milk production/hh				4015	1835	438
	1.16 m eggs produced by beneficiary hh in Yr 6	open	3.4. M		22.1	1.16 m	1629%

	Yield/ha (kg) of certified seeds (1 st and 2 nd planting): wheat (3.4, 2.55); lentil (0.5, 0.38); chickpea (1.0; 0.73); mungbean (0.9, 0.7); potato (19.1, 14.34); tomato (38.3, 28.69); onion (31.9, 23.91); beans (0.7, 0.48)				36.75%	15-45%	150%
	No. of households with increased agriculture productivity (Target: 157000)		1534		52501	157000	42.4%
	No. of households with increased livestock productivity (Target: 157000)		3976		157000	28670	18%
Outcome 1 (Community Development) Capacity of local communities and local institutions enhanced, cultivable land increased, agriculture production/productivity increased, health condition improved and water-borne diseases decreased.	% increase in agriculture productivity (yield/ha) (Target: +10%)				10	10%	100%
	- No of households benefiting from productive infrastructures (Target: 101500).				144456	101500	142%
	% increase in agriculture productivity (yield/ha)(Target: 10% increase from baseline)				10%	10%	100%
Output 1.2 (Community Development and Institutional Strengthening) Capacity of beneficiary communities/community organizations and local government agencies strengthened.	% of beneficiaries expressing satisfaction on the quality of services provided by local government agencies staff (measured through questionnaires)				80%	80	80%

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> (Target: at least 80%) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> % of organization members expressing satisfaction on the quality of management of community organizations (measured through questionnaires) (Target: at least 80%) ^b				0	80%	
Output 1.3 (Gender Mainstreaming) Role/Involvement of women in productive activities and productive potential increased.	% increase of women who have control of productive assets				0		
	% increase in net income among women ^c				0		
	% of female professional staff (among MAIL/DAIL and SPs) (Target: at least 25%).				48%	25%	192%
Outcome 2 (Livestock and Agriculture Development) Increased agriculture and livestock productivity	Increase in average hh income from dairy	10%	10%	100%	35%	200	17.5%
	(Target: +200%) (Expected n. of beneficiary hh: 3,000)*	1000	10001	100%	3036	3000	101%
	Increase in net income of poultry keeping hh (Target: +400%) (Expected n. of beneficiary hh:20,000)	\$ 250/annum	\$ 301	120%	\$250	50	500%
	(Target: at least 100%) (Expected n. of beneficiary hh: 81,055)	3000	1534	51%	52501	81,055	64%
	Increase in net income of livestock keepers (Target: +25%) (Expected n. of beneficiary hh: 20,000)	3000	1,754	58%	12838	20,000	64%
Output 2.1 (Dairy Development) Milk production and productivity	Increase in average number of cattle per family (Target: from 1.254 to 1.75)	0.2	0.2	100%	1.66	1.75	95%

increased; dairy milk processing and marketing improved	Increase in milk consumption at hh level (Target: 1.5 l/day)	1	0.5	50%	3.4	1.5	226%
	Increase in average hh income from dairy (Target: +200%)	10	10	100%	35	200	17.5%
	Nb of demonstration plots	1000	910	91%	2991	3000	99%
	Seeds distributed (Kg)	6000	2089	34%	9215	15000	61%
	Number of cattle vaccinated	7500	26339	100%	81441	12000	100%
	Number of cattle de-wormed	6000	8231	100%	38961	12000	100%
	Treatment of individual cattle	1000	6737	100%	33861	2500	100%
	Number of dairy cows regularly monitored for fertility.	2500	1383	55%	5815	6000	96%
	Nb of inseminated cows	5000	5877	100%	25252	23000	100%
Output 2.2 (Poultry Development) Traditional fowl systems strengthened; small-scale commercially viable poultry systems developed	Increase in egg production for traditional birds (Target: 12 per annum)	150	230	153%	230	153%	
	Decrease in mortality rate (Target: from 3% to 1.5%)	3 -1.5%	3 – 1.5%	50%	3-1.5%	3-1.5%	
	Increase in net income of poultry keeping hh (Target: +400%)	\$ 18	\$ 301		\$ 301	1672%	
	No of beneficiaries selected & trained (female only)	6666	6666	100%	13332	20000	66%
	No of beneficiaries receiving pullets	6666	6666	100%	13332	20000	66%
	No of pullets distributed	99990	99990	100%	199980	300000	66%

Output 2.3 (Improved Food, Fodder, and Vegetable Crops) New drought resistant and high yielding improved varieties of wheat, food and forage legumes, and vegetables developed and adopted.	Number of farmers adopting new seeds and related best practices (Target: +81,000)	3000	1534	51%	52501	81055	42.4
	% increase of food, fodder, and vegetable production (Target: +30-60% over existing rates)	30	63	210%	36.75	30	122.5%
	Increase in net income of adopters (target: at least +100%).	0	0	0	118	178	66%
	Number of participatory evaluations Trials conducted	33	55	100%	379	222	100%
	No. of participatory demonstrations with improved crop cultivars and with good agricultural practices laid out.	329	345	95%	1320	1353	97%
	No. of farmers visited the demonstration fields during field days.	700	485	69%	2368	3300	71%
	No. of Field days conducted	5	5	100%	21	33	63%
	No. of FFS organized	0	0	0%	6	6	100%
	Number of VBSEs that developed linkages with market agencies (bags, testing)	0	0	0%	15	9	100%
	No. of VBSEs registered	0	0	0%	7	7	100%
	Excremental trials/ nurseries obtained from international centers (wheat, chickpea, lentil, Grasspea, Fababean)	16	16	100%	87	45	193 %
Output 2.4 (Livestock Development among the Kutchi) Livelihoods among Kutchi enhanced	% reduction in prevailing mortality rates for shoats and cattle (Target: +10%)	2%	2%	100	6%	10%	60%
	Increase in daily milk production (Target: +0.05 l)	0.2 inc/Liter/sheep	0.1	50%	0.4	0.5	80%

	Increase in net income of livestock keepers (Target: +25%)	12%	12%	100%	24%	25%	96
	Vaccination	500,000	414,827	82%	2058215	3,000,000	68%
	Treatment	200,000	156149	78%	681374	800,000	85 %
	De worming	210,000	259031	100%	1253449	1000,000	100 %
	Farmers trained in extension by sessions	1500	6747	100%	15783	6000	100%
	VFU monthly Support Package (Report Writing, Rent etc) \$40 pm	60	38	63%	38	60	63%
	Need assessment Survey	1	0	0%	3	3	100%
	Refurbishments of selected VFUs	15	5	33%	39	50	78%
	Train VFU staff and field extension workers on extension package	33	13	39%	126	150	84%
	Number of Para-vet trained	2	0	0%	14	30	46%
	Number of feeder bank established	4	0	0%	10	15	66%

Afghanistan

Community Livestock and Agriculture Project

Supervision Report

Appendix 3: Compliance with legal covenants: status of implementation

Mission Dates: 23 September - 4 October 2018
Document Date: 06/11/2018
Project No. 1100001637
Report No. 4889-AF

Asia and the Pacific Division
Programme Management Department

Compliance with legal covenants: Status of implementation

Section	Covenant	Target/Action Due Date	Compliance Status/Date	Remarks
Grant Agreement Section B – Para 3, Section E Para 2(d)	The recipient shall open and maintain a Designated Grant Account denominated in USD in a bank acceptable to the Fund for purpose of receiving Grant Financing for the project. The Designated Grant Account shall be operated by the Ministry of Finance .	On Grant effectiveness	Complied	
Grant Agreement Section B – Para 4	The Recipient shall provide in-kind contribution financing for the project in the amount of USD 3.57 million.	Throughout the project	Ongoing	As per Project, the Government has contributed USD 2.07 million (58%) until Aug 2018.
Grant Agreement Section B – Para 4	The beneficiaries shall contribute to the Project up to the amount of USD 3.48 million in the form of cash, in kind and/or through labour.	Throughout the project	Ongoing	As per project, the beneficiaries have contributed USD 1.04 million (30%) until Aug 2018.
Grant Agreement Section E – Para 2 Sub Clause (a) and Section 7.11 of the General Conditions.	The National Project Director shall have been appointed	Condition precedent to withdrawal	Complied	
Grant Agreement Section E Para 2 Sub Clause (b)	The Programme Support Team (PST) must have been established	Condition precedent to withdrawal	Initially Complied but now not complied	The Ministry of Agriculture (MAIL) has decided to centralise Finance, Procurement, HR and IT functions in the Ministry. Accordingly, Finance personnel of the PST have been transferred to the Finance Directorate and report to the respective Directors and not to the Programme Director. Discussion ongoing to re-establish original arrangements.
Grant Agreement Section E Para 2 Sub Clause (c)	The Project Steering Committee shall have been established	Condition precedent to withdrawal	Complied	
Grant Agreement Section E – Para 2 Sub Clause (d)	The PIM shall have been adopted by the Lead Project Agency, substantially in the form approved by the Fund	Condition precedent to withdrawal	Complied	
Grant Agreement Section E – Para 3 Sub Clause (a)	A MOU shall have been executed between the LPA and the MRRD	Condition precedent to withdrawal for MRRD	Complied	
Grant Agreement Section E – Para 3 Sub Clause (b)	Contracts for Services shall have been executed between the LPA and the Service Providers and IFAD has endorsed respective AWPB as approved by PSC.	Condition precedent to withdrawal for SPs	Complied	
Grant Agreement	IFAD approval of proposal of expenditure under Policy Support Fund	Condition precedent	Partially	Expenditure under Policy Support Fund

Section E – Para 3 Sub Clause (c)	and Special Financing Facility	to withdrawal for Category VI and VII.	Complied	is bring incurred while no expenditure under Special Financing Facility is bring incurred.
Grant Agreement Schedule3 – Para 7	The agreement/contract of services of each Service Provider (SP) shall specify that the SPs will make available to the recipient through the PST the statement of sources and uses of funds in respect of each fiscal year within two months of the end of each fiscal year.	Throughout the programme period	Not fully Complied	Not all agreements/MOUs with SPs specify provision of statement within two months of the end of the fiscal year.
Grant Agreement Schedule3 – Para 8	The agreement/contract of services of each Service Provider (SP) shall specify that the SPs will appoint an external independent auditor to audit their financial statements relating to the project and should be submitted to the recipient through the PST, within five months after the end of each fiscal year.	Throughout the programme period	Complied	
General Conditions – Section 4.02 (b)	No withdrawal shall be made until the first AWP&B has been approved by the Fund.	From first year of programme	Complied	
General Conditions – Section 7.01 (b) (ii)	The LPA shall submit the draft AWP&B to the Fund no later than sixty days before the beginning of the relevant project year	21 October 2017	Complied	2018: Complied
General Conditions – Section 7.08 (b) (ii)	The Recipient shall insure goods which are financed by the Financing against hazards in accordance with sound commercial practice.	Throughout the programme period	Not Complied	No reliable insurance companies in Afghanistan
General Conditions – Section 8.03 (a)	The LPA should submit progress reports to the Fund containing at least the minimum information spelt therein.	Throughout the programme period	Complied	
General Conditions – Section 11.01 Letter to Recipient- Paragraph 6	The proceeds of the financing shall not be used for the payment of taxes	Throughout the programme period	Complied	Taxes on Salaries of project team is financed through IFAD Grant. This is allowed under General Conditions
LTR - Para 20	IFAD prior review of procurement for goods and works above USD 50,000 and consulting services above USD 30,000	Throughout the programme period	Complied	
LTR - Para 25	The first auditor should have been appointed within 120 days from the date of entry into force	First Year	Not Complied	
LTR - Para 25	For each fiscal year, the auditors should be appointed within 120 days of the beginning of the fiscal year. As per the new IFAD's Handbook for Financial Reporting and Auditing of IFAD Financed Projects, the auditors should be appointed 30 days before the start of the financial year.	21 Mar 2016 (2016) 21 Mar 2017 (2017) 30 Nov 2017 (2018)	Not Complied	Auditors are usually appointed after the completion of the year end.
General Conditions –Section 9.03 (b)	The recipient shall within six months of the end of fiscal year furnish to the Fund, the audited financial along with the audit report.	21 June 2017	Complied	.

Afghanistan

Community Livestock and Agriculture Project

Supervision Report

Appendix 5: Mission preparation and planning, TORs, schedules, people met

Mission Dates: 23 September - 4 October 2018
Document Date: 06/11/2018
Project No. 1100001637
Report No. 4889-AF

Asia and the Pacific Division
Programme Management Department

Annex V Terms of Reference for Consultants and other persons hired by IFAD to participate in missions under a non-staff contract

COUNTRY OF ASSIGNMENT/LOCATION: Kabul, Afghanistan

MISSION NAME: Supervision Mission for Community Livestock and Agriculture Programme (CLAP)

MISSION START AND END DATES: 23 September - 4 October 2018 (in country)

REPORT TO: Hubert Boirard, Country Programme Manager, APR

MISSION COMPOSITION:

1. Hubert Boirard, Country Director Afghanistan, Mission Leader
2. Alok Kumar, Rural Finance and Value Chain Specialist, Co-Mission Leader – component 3
3. Ganila Paravithana, Infrastructure Specialist – component 1
4. Ravindra Narayanaswamy, Agribusiness and Livestock Specialist – component 2
5. Waseem Shahzad, Procurement Specialist
6. Claudio Mainella, FMD Officer

BACKGROUND:

The CLAP was approved by the Executive Board in December 2012 for a financing of USD 58 million, and became effective in April 2013. The main objective of CLAP is to improve food security in selected districts of Kabul, Parwan, and Logar Provinces by increasing agriculture and livestock productivity. This will be achieved by enhancing productive assets, skills, services, technologies, and income opportunities of the target groups by introducing livestock and agriculture technology options, strengthening local capacity, and improving linkages with markets. Due to good performance an additional financing of USD 25 million has been approved by the EB in December 2017. In 2017, in order to create more synergy between the two programmes, the target area of both have been merged, covering now the provinces of Kabul, Parwan, Logar, Balkh, Herat, Nangarhar and Baghlan. The programme completion and closing dates are 30 June 2022 and 31 December 2022 respectively. The lead programme agency is the Ministry of Agriculture, Irrigation and Livestock.

The overall goal of the project is to reduce the rural poverty in Afghanistan; specifically the project objective is to enhance food security of approximately 169,500 rural households in the project area. This is being achieved through three components:

Community Development, including Productive Infrastructures and Institutional Strengthening:

This component aims at strengthening the capacity of local communities by supporting the construction of small-scale infrastructure aimed at enhancing agricultural productivity, as well as the capacity of community organisations and local government agencies to address issues of ownership and sustainability. The component includes three sub-components: (1.1) Productive Infrastructure, (1.2) Institutional Strengthening, and (1.3) Gender Mainstreaming and Capacity Building.

Livestock and Agriculture Development: This component aims at reducing poverty by enhancing food security. Strong emphasis will be placed on women-headed households and the most vulnerable and marginalised individuals within the rural communities by introducing appropriate livestock and agricultural practices and packages, and, to a limited extent, supporting value-chain development and linkages to markets. This component includes four sub-components: (2.1) Dairy Development, (2.2) Poultry Development, (2.3) Improved Food, Fodder, and Vegetable Crops, and (2.4) Livestock Development among the Kutchi.

Project Management, Policy Support, and Young Professionals Programme: This component aims at enhancing Project coordination and providing technical support to the Project Support Team (PST). The Project shall also finance a Young Professionals Programme as well as the Policy Support Fund and a Special Financing Facility.

Initially, the project faced slow implementation during 2014 due to general election and establishment of the National Unity Government, which delayed the commencement of conducting survey and design of irrigation schemes. In addition, during 2015 the Government streamlined the roles and responsibilities of ministries including MAIL, Ministry of Rural Rehabilitation and Development (MRRD) and the Ministry of Water and Energy which all shared irrigation as part of their work programmes. The overlap of roles in irrigation among three ministries has been clarified towards the end of 2015, and the planned activity by MRRD has been implemented smoothly since early 2016. CLAP performed well after the MTR, resulting in additional financing of USD 25 Million. Nevertheless, In 2018 the pace of implementation has been reduced and some key issues will need to be

addressed during this supervision mission, in particular (i) the institutional arrangements and the necessity to be in line with the signed CLAP financing agreement and (ii) the proposed conditions by the November 2016 CLAP MTR (2 years ago) of the establishment of UHT plant based in Kabul that MAIL need to confirm of not.

MISSION OBJECTIVES AND OUTPUTS:

The main objectives of this CLAP direct supervision mission will be to: (i) assess the progress made in the implementation of the project; (ii) review progress against the 2017 and 2018 AWPBs and procurement plans; (iii) identify actual and potential/emerging operational problems; and (iv) propose solutions, corrective measures or improvements to be done for an acceleration of the programme and achievement of all its objectives by the CLAP completion dates.

In preparation of the supervision mission, the Programme Support Team (PST) will submit one week prior the mission, an overall and a 2017-2018 progress report that will reflect the CLAP overall status as of 31 August 2018. This progress report will include physical and financial progress, analysis per component and per partners, performance and M&E data (outreach, targeting, BP progress), human resources status and institutional arrangements as well as an pre- analysis of the current CLAP problems and a set of solutions to be discussed with the mission. Based on the last CLAP Mid Term Review and implementation support mission, the list of the recommendations and level of implementation will be provided to the supervision mission.

The PST will also prepare the documentation required for the review of fiduciary review as per requirement of IFAD financial Management Department as well as for the procurement review. Finally, the PST will prepare a draft field itinerary for the mission to have an overview of the CLAP achievements. This field visit will be subject to security clearance UNDSS.

INDIVIDUAL RESPONSIBILITIES, EXPECTED OUTPUTS AND REQUIRED COMPLETION DATES:

Mission Leader: Hubert Boirard¹, Country Director

The mission leader will assume the overall coordination of the supervision mission, review the aide memoire, supervision report and management letter, prior to their finalization.

Co-Mission Leader: Alok Kumar, Rural Finance and Value Chain Specialist, Co-Mission Leader, responsible component 3

As co mission leader, you will be responsible for coordinating the mission members (and their inputs into the written deliverables), reviewing overall project implementation progress and assessing the general coherence and complementary linkages across components and activities. More specifically, you will assume responsibility of the component 3 in addition to the for oversight of the component 1 and 2. You will provide guidance to other members of the team, in particular to all aspects related to institutional and business analysis as well as rural finance. In particular, you will :

- I. Based on appraisal targets, the 2017/2018 AWPBs and the last MTR and implementation supervision mission, review the implementation progress related to the structure, human resources, organization, cost and efficiency of the Project Support Team (PST) to deliver its key functions and responsibilities (i.e. overall project planning, financial management, M&E, knowledge management, coordination with other government programs and projects, etc.).
- II. Review the Young Professionals Program (YPP), analysed the number of new graduates recruited and what type of experience they have acquired as well as what they have done after this experience compared to the others who did not benefitted from the YPP. You will also make a matrix comparison and lessons learnt vis a vis of the RMLSP YPP.
- III. Assess both, the Policy Support Fund and the Special Financing Facility, the level of implementation, disbursement, the relevance, efficiency as well as the effectiveness and make ad hoc recommendations.
- IV. Assist the other supervision team member, specifically on sub component 1.2, 1.3 and 2.1
- V. Coordinate with the mission members and FAO/UNDSS to conduct the field visits, subject to security clearance, to assess implementation progress of CLAP;
- VI. Consolidate all mission member inputs and provide written inputs related to your component/activities for the aide-mémoire and supervision report, including: (i) overall assessment; (ii) outputs and outcomes; (iii) implementation progress; (iv) sustainability issues; and (v) updated recommendation table with clear assignments, responsibilities and due date.
- VII. Undertake any other relevant tasks as requested by the CPM or Team Leader.

¹ Mr. Hubert Boirard will join the mission on 30th September 2018 .

Outputs:

- Draft the Aide Memoire for presentation at the wrap-up meeting (CLAP) – by 30th Sep 2018
- Draft SMR report – by 3rd Oct 2018

Infrastructure Specialist: Ganila Parnavithana, responsible for the component 1

- I. Based on CLAP project design targets, the 2017/2018 AWPBs and in line with the last MTR and implementation support missions' recommendations, you will review the qualitative and quantitative level of implementation of the component 1 with a focus on sustainability, natural resource management and areas for scaling-up, as well as the implementation arrangement with respect to the MoU with MRDD; you will also identify actual and potential/emerging operational problems, and propose solutions for corrective measures or improvements to be made;
- II. Prior to the mission, you will contact the PST and request them to prepare all the documents or information necessary for you to be able to assess the component 1.
- III. You will review in particular :
 - the level of implementation of the Productive Infrastructures sub component (US\$ 23.1 m), the technical aspects, costs, institutional arrangement (construction and supervision) and progress. You will identify the issues and make recommendations for CLAP original and additional financing to be delivered by the completion date. In the context of the climate change and the 2018 drought, you will also have a particular attention to the other Infrastructure Schemes and specifically on the rain water harvesting
 - the level of implementation of the Institutional Strengthening sub component (US\$ 1.1 m) (with the co- mission leader), and in particular on the aspect related to the water management and O&M set up (including the financial exit strategy of maintenance) You will identify the issues and make recommendations for CLAP original and additional financing to be delivered by the completion date.
 - the level of implementation of the Gender Mainstreaming and Capacity Building sub component (US\$ 1.2 m) (with the co- mission leader). You will identify the issues and make recommendations for CLAP original and additional financing to be delivered by the completion date.
- IV. You will provide written inputs related to your component/activities for the aide-mémoire and supervision report, including: (i) overall assessment; (ii) outputs and outcomes; (iii) implementation progress; (iv) sustainability issues; and (v) updated recommendation table with clear assignments, responsibilities and due date.
- V. Undertake any other relevant tasks as requested by the Mission Leader.

Outputs:

- Draft the Aide Memoire for presentation at the wrap-up meeting (CLAP) – by 30th Sep 2018
- Draft SMR report – by 3rd Oct 2018

Agribusiness and Livestock Specialist: Ravindra Narayanaswamy

- I. Based on CLAP project design targets, the 2017/2018 AWPBs and in line with the last MTR and implementation support missions' recommendations, you will review the qualitative and quantitative level of implementation of the component 2, including the contractual aspects (MoU with MAIL, FAO, ICARDA and DCA,..); you will also identify actual and potential/emerging operational problems, and propose solutions for corrective measures or improvements to be made;
- II. You will assess the four sub-components: (2.1) Dairy Development (US\$ 10.5 m), (2.2) Poultry Development (US\$ 5 m), (2.3.) Improved Food, Fodder, and Vegetable Crops (US\$ 8 m), and (2.4) Livestock Development among the Kutchi (US\$ 5 m) and analyse (i) the level of achievement of each sub component (general CLAP achievement and achievement related to the last AWPB 2017-2018), the relevance and efficiency of the different approaches, the exit strategy and sustainability of each sub component as well as the outreach (number of beneficiaries direct and indirect) and conformity of the beneficiaries with the expected initial target group beneficiaries. You will finally assess the level of disbursement for each subcomponent and, based on that, made the necessary recommendations for CLAP and its additional financing to be able to reach their final target by CLAP completion dates.
- III. You will also analyse and assess if the current livestock and agricultural practices and packages implemented by CLAP through its partners (i) aims at improve the target group food security and how and (ii) increase their income and how and (ii) facilitate value-chain development and linkages to market and how.
- IV. In collaboration with the team and in particular with the irrigation specialist, you will assess the linkages between the component 1 and 2 and its synergies. You will make the necessary recommendations to

ensure a fair CLAP holistic and integrated approach.

- V. You will also have a particular assessment on the zero-till planters, bed Conservation Agriculture and zero till based planting machines as a first step towards Conservation Agriculture introduced by CLAP.
- VI. You will finally, based on the 2018 severe drought, the Afghan climate change trend and the 2018 apparent impact of La Niña (rain and snow deficit of 70 %) made the ad hoc analysis for CLAP component 2 and the recommendation on inclusion of climate adaptive practices;
- VII. Before the mission and based on the analysis of the documentation and exchange with the mission, you will contact the CLAP PST and request them to prepare all the necessary information or document you will need to achieve your objectives.
- VIII. Provide written inputs related to your component/activities for the aide-mémoire and supervision report, including: (i) overall assessment; (ii) outputs and outcomes; (iii) implementation progress; (iv) sustainability issues; and (v) updated recommendation table with clear assignments, responsibilities and due date;
- IX. Undertake any other relevant tasks as requested by the Mission Leader.

Outputs:

- Draft the Aide Memoire for presentation at the wrap-up meeting (CLAP) – by 30th Sep 2018
- Draft SMR report – by 3rd Oct 2018

Mr Waseem Arshad: Procurement Specialist

You will be responsible for undertaking the procurement review and for that: access to all procurement transactions and documentations of the period 2017 - 2018; provide a brief description of the review of the procurement actions according to the following aspects - structure of the Procurement Unit, Procurement Plan, Procurement Initiation, Terms of Reference/Specifications, Solicitation documents, Procurement Processes/methods, Contract Drafting, Contract Awards, Record Keeping, Contract Management, and any procurement on hold including unresolved issues with contractors; describe in detail if there are any issues of non-compliance in any of the procurements completed or in progress.

Specifically, you will also be tasked with the following:

- I. Summarize main progresses, issues and constraints in the current procurement process of the project;
- II. Review bidding documents (goods, works, and services) and bid evaluation reports prepared by the projects to ensure quality control;
- III. Undertake spot checks of procurement related documentation of projects;
- IV. Review quality and progress in implementation of the procurement plan; provide guidance for updating the procurement plans (in conjunction with the AWPB) as required;
- V. Assess the procurement capacity of the Implementing Agencies and Projects as may be necessary;
- VI. Undertake performance checking of projects on procurement, contract management, disbursement, and safeguards and preparing score cards;
- VII. Identify means for streamlining and improving existing procurement processes to ensure consistency and measures to minimize malpractices during bid submission;
- VIII. Assess the efficiency of the IFAD financed procurement specialist and make recommendations.
- IX. Provide written inputs related to your component/activities for the aide-mémoire and supervision report, including: (i) overall assessment; (ii) outputs and outcomes; (iii) implementation progress; (iv) sustainability issues; and (v) updated recommendation table with clear assignments, responsibilities and due date.

Mr Claudio Mainella, FMD Officer

Will be responsible for review of all Financial Management matters.

DOCUMENTATION

The following documentation will be made available to consultants prior to the assignment:

1. PDR and Additional Financing Report of CLAP
2. Aide Memoire and Main Report of CLAP MTR and supervision mission March 2018,
3. Follow-up mission reports December 2015, February 2016 and September 2016
4. 2017/2011 AWPB for CLAP
5. Templates: SMR, Aide Memoire

MISSION SCHEDULE: The mission will take place in Kabul, Afghanistan. The field visits will be confirmed after consultation with UNDSS.

23 Sep	Arrival in Kabul; team meetings, security briefing and field visit arrangements
24-28 Sep	Consultation with MAIL, MRRD, FAO, ICARDA, DCA and other partners to review CLAP progress
29-30 Sep	Field visits (tbd, according to UNDSS)
30 Sep-1 Oct	Report writing (AM, draft MTR)
3 Oct	Wrap-up meeting
4 Oct	Depart to home bases

IMPORTANT NOTE:

IFAD will accept only reports that have been properly formatted by using the template, which will be provided separately. The team leader is responsible for preparing the main report and annexes in the required format, and ensuring that the working papers submitted by the individual team members are consolidated in one single document and in the correct format. He will compile the full report, including his own contributions and those of all the mission members into one consistent final and complete Report and submit it to IFAD on or before the agreed deadline.