

Afghanistan

Community Livestock and Agriculture Project Supervision Report

Mission Dates: 26 October to 10 December 2020
Document Date: 05/01/2021
Project No. 1100001637
Report No. 5611-AF

Asia and the Pacific Division
Programme Management Department

Abbreviations and Acronyms

AWPB	Annual Work Plan and Budget
BVW	Basic Veterinary Workers
CDC	Community Development Council
CLAP	Community Livestock and Agriculture Project
CLAP-AF	Community Livestock and Agriculture Project-Additional Financing
COSOP	Country Strategic Opportunities Program
DAIL	Department of Agriculture, Irrigation and Livestock
DCA	Dutch Committee for Afghanistan
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations
FLRC	Farmers Learning and Resource Centres
FY	Fiscal Year
GoIRA	Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan
HHs	Households
HLP	Horticulture and Livestock Project
ICARDA	International Centre for Agricultural Research in the Dry Areas
IA	Integrated Area
IDS	Integrated Dairy Scheme
ISAF	International Security Assistance Force
KM	Knowledge Management
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MAIL	Ministry of Agriculture, Irrigation and Livestock
MIS	Management Information System
MRRD	Ministry of Rural Rehabilitation and Development
MTR	Mid-Term Review
NSP	National Solidarity Programme
O&M	Operations and Maintenance
OFWM	On-Farm Water management
PCC	Project Coordination Committee
PME	Participatory Monitoring and Evaluation
PSC	Project Steering Committee
PST	Program Support Team
PY	Project Year
OFWM	On-Farm Water management
PCC	Project Coordination Committee
PME	Participatory Monitoring and Evaluation
RMLSP	Rural Microfinance and Livestock Support Programme
SNaPP2	Support to National Priority Programme 2
SP	Service Provider
VPPG	Village Poultry Producer Group

A. Project Overview

Region:	Asia and the Pacific Division	Project at Risk Status:	Not at risk
Country:	Afghanistan	Environmental and Social Category:	B
Project Name:	Community Livestock and Agriculture Project	Climate Risk Classification:	1
Project ID:	1100001637	Executing Institution:	Ministry of Agriculture, Irrigation and Livestock
Project Type:	Agricultural Development	Implementing Institutions:	Ministry of Agriculture, Irrigation and Livestock
CPM:	Candra Samekto		
Project Director:	Mustafa Hamed Zia		
Project Area:	Kabul, Parwan, Logar, Balkh, Herat, Nangarhar, and Baghlan		

Approval Date:	13/12/2012	Last audit receipt:	28/10/2020
Signing Date:	08/04/2013	Date of Last SIS Mission:	10/12/2020
Entry into Force Date:	08/04/2013	Number of SIS Missions:	13
Available for Disbursement Date:	08/04/2013	Number of extensions:	1
First Disbursement Date:	12/11/2013	Effectiveness lag:	4 months
MTR Date:	24/11/2016		
Original Completion Date:	30/06/2019		
Current Completion Date:	30/06/2022		
Financial Closure:	not available yet		

Project total financing

IFAD Financing breakdown	Debt Sustainability Framework	\$24,999,999
	Debt Sustainability Framework	\$58,001,000
	Rural Poor Stimulus Facility	\$890,000
Domestic Financing breakdown	National Government	\$3,576,000
	Beneficiaries	\$3,481,000
	Beneficiaries additional financing	\$1,844,000
	National Government (add)	\$191,000
Co-financing breakdown,	Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations	\$456,000
	To be determined	\$387,000
Project total financing:		\$93,825,999

Current Mission

Mission Dates:	26 October to 10 December 2020
Days in the field:	n/a due to Covid 19

Mission composition: Candra Samekto Mission Leader; Mr Liam Chicca, IFAD Senior Portfolio Advisor; Elizabeth Ssendiwala, Senior Technical Specialist, Rural Institutions, Sustainable Production, Markets and Institutions Division (PMI), Strategy and Knowledge Department (SKD); Ms Sashwati Mishra, IFAD Gender and Social Inclusion Analyst; Peter Ekblad, IFAD Knowledge Management Specialist; Evi Wulandari, IFAD Environment and Climate Office; Mr Arsalan Vardag, Financial Management Specialist; Mr Virinder Garg, Procurement Specialist; Zahid Shakeel, Infrastructure Specialist.; Khaista Rahman Yousafzai, Agriculture and Livestock Specialist; Ziauddin Rahimi, Civil Engineer; and Mr Qaim Shah, Agricultural Specialist (Team Leader)

Field sites visited: n/a

B. Overall Assessment

Key SIS Indicator #1	Ø	Rating	Key SIS Indicator #2	Ø	Rating
Likelihood of Achieving the Development Objective		4.23	Assessment of the Overall Implementation Performance		3.83

Effectiveness and Developmental Focus	4	Project Management	4
Effectiveness	4	Quality of Project Management	4
Targeting and Outreach	4	Knowledge Management	4
Gender equality & women's participation	4	Value for Money	4
Agricultural Productivity	5	Coherence between AWPB and Implementation	4
Nutrition	4	Performance of M&E System	4
Adaptation to Climate Change	4	Social, Environment, and Climate Standards requirements	4

Sustainability and Scaling-up	4	Financial Management and Execution	4
Institutions and Policy Engagement	5	Acceptable Disbursement Rate	2
Partnership-building	5	Quality of Financial Management	4
Human and Social Capital and Empowerment	4	Quality and Timeliness of Audit	3
Quality of Project Target Group Engagement and Feedback	4	Counterparts Funds	5
Responsiveness of Service Providers	5	Compliance with Loan Covenants	4
Environment and Natural Resource Management	4	Procurement	4
Exit Strategy	4		
Potential for Scaling-up	4		

Relevance	5
------------------	----------

C. Mission Objectives and Key Conclusions

Background and Main Objective of the Mission

The Community Livestock and Agriculture Project (CLAP) was approved by IFAD's Executive Board in December 2012 at a total cost of USD 65.5 million, with a USD 58 million IFAD Debt Sustainability Framework (DSF) grant. The Financing agreement entered into force in April 2013. This was followed by an additional financing of SDR 17.7 million (equivalent to USD 25 million) as a DSF grant in December 2017, bringing the total cost of the project to USD 93 million and IFAD Debt Sustainability Framework (DSF) grant to USD 83 million. The project completion and closing dates are 30 June and 31 December 2022, respectively.

CLAP covers selected districts of the provinces of Kabul, Parwan, Logar, Balkh, Herat, Nangarhar, and Baghlan. Development objective of the project is to improve the food security of about 223,000 rural poor households by increasing agriculture and livestock productivity and reducing gender disparities. The project has three components, namely: (i) Community Development, including Productive Infrastructures and Institutional Strengthening; (ii) Livestock and Agriculture Development; and (iii) Project Management, Policy Support and Young Professionals Programme.

The Lead Project Agency is the Ministry of Agriculture, Irrigation, and Livestock (MAIL). The Ministry of Rural Rehabilitation and Development (MRRD), FAO, ICARDA and DCA are engaged as service providers for implementation project activities.

The Supervision and Implementation Support Mission was undertaken remotely during 28 October to 30 November 2020. Main objectives of the Mission were to review implementation progress, assess COVID 19 impact on project progress and target groups and assess status of recommendation of supervision and implementation support missions and provide implementation support. The Mission interacted extensively with the project staff and service providers (FAO, ICARDA and DCA through video meeting and emails).

The remote nature of the mission did not provide opportunities to all members of the mission to observe implementation progress, outputs and outcomes. A huge handicap was the interaction with project beneficiaries. The review and assessment on the project's performance are based on information provided by PMU and service providers, discussions through video meetings and emails exchanges and feedback of local consultants.

Key Mission Agreements and Conclusions

The project implementation continued to be good except for Sub-Component 2.2 Poultry, until the country was hit by COVID 19 pandemic. The implementation progress of poultry was delayed because of the change of the current approach to a matching grant model.

COVID-19 struck Afghanistan in early 2020 at a time when the country was already beset with multiple economic, political and security crises. The pandemic has exacerbated the fragile conditions of the economy and according the World Bank, is expected to contract between 5.5% to 7.4% in 2020. A World Bank analysis suggests that due to the combined effects of political, security and the pandemic, the poverty rate may increase from a baseline of 54.5 percent in 2016-2017 to between 61 percent and 72 percent over 2020.

The COVID 19 lockdown and resulting disruption in labour, goods and services sectors caused either slowing down or complete halting of project implementation during the current AWPB period with the risk of delay in timely completion of project interventions and negative consequences for the target group. The irrigation subcomponent was the worst effected where construction work came to a complete halt due to non-availability of labour, material and transport and procurement process for engagement of contractors for new schemes suffered delays. Several extension related group events and trainings were also affected.

There is emerging evidence that the pandemic has caused a loss of income and purchasing power of small farmers in the project area as access to markets was blocked, access to production inputs was restricted and seasonal laborers and those particularly those farmers who supplement their household income through off-farm labour were seriously affected. Impact on the livestock sector in the project area was more pronounced due to reduction in demand for milk, closure of livestock markets and limited access to extension services and inputs. Collection of milk from the project area particularly Parwan, Logar and Kabul province was stopped due to complete restriction of movements on the roads and farmers sales of milk and dairy products were reduced because all hotels, restaurants, wedding halls and government entities were closed in urban areas. According to a report by FAO, on average, milk collection reduced by around 55% during March-June 2020 in comparison to the same period last year^[1].

The implementation of the AWPB 2020 is severely affected due to COVID 19 and is unlikely to achieve completion of planned activities and financial utilisation. The AWPB 2020 had an outlay of USD 14,279,222.58 (USD 4,284,658 for CLAP Original and USD 9,994,564.58 for CLAP AF). The current reported utilization is only 19% of the total AWPB allocation. However, based on the estimated pending payments and projected expenditure during Oct-Dec 2020, the financial utilisation/expenditure is expected to reach USD 7.5 million – 52% of the AWPB allocation. The procurement timelines were impacted Covid-19 only 26 percent of the planned packages from PP2020 have been contracted till 16

November 2020. Implementation progress and achievement of physical targets pickup since Aug 2020 and the project is making enhanced efforts to regain the good pre COVID 19 momentum.

The project outreach has so far covered 75% HH against the target of 223,000 households. Cumulatively, the overall physical progress is 65% and range between 63 to 85 percent for different components and subcomponents except the poultry subcomponent (33%). Disbursement rate is 61.6% (including WA under preparation) for both original (80%) and additional financing (27%) combined. The combined disbursement rate net of advances is 56.3%.

The mission strongly endorses the implementation support mission recommendation the Government of Islamic Republic of Afghanistan (GoIRA) and IFAD shall consider one year extension of the Programme completion date to allow successful and timely completion of the project and more importantly, to support the recovery and resilience of livelihood of project target group affected by the COVID 19 pandemic.

In view of the proposed project period and availability of unspent unallocated funds, the mission recommends extension of the scope and scaling up of some successful high impact activities like the community paravet managed Veterinary Field Units, livestock management training for women and climate smart conservation Agriculture. Please see details in section D. Overview and Project ProgressII. Component II - Livestock and Agriculture Development and Section G: Project Modifications.

[1] Impact of COVID-19 on Dairy Supply Chain in Kabul and Surrounding Provinces. (UTF/AFG/080/AFG).

D. Overview and Project Progress

Component 1 - Community Development, including Productive Infrastructures and Institutional Strengthening

1.1 Productive Infrastructure

The original project design provided for 1,032 small and medium scale infrastructure schemes, to be implemented by MRRD through the National Solidarity Program (water supply, drainage and sanitation, and others) and MAIL through the OFWM directorate (Irrigation/Agriculture Schemes). In 2015 due to renewed focus and priority on the water sector development for enhanced agriculture production and to achieve food self-sufficiency, IFAD, at the request of the Government, agreed to change the scope of the original 1,032 small and medium scale infrastructure schemes to rehabilitation of 106 community based irrigation schemes under MRRD/NSP and 25 irrigations schemes under MAIL/OFWM. CLAP-AF originally planned 56 irrigation schemes. However, in view of cost efficiencies and high priority of the government, the project decided to invest the savings in additional 15 irrigation schemes within the CLAP-AF allocation of USD 10.2 million. Additionally, an amount of USD 3.2 million was left unutilised by MRRD after completion of its target of 106 schemes and at the request of the government, this amount was also allocated to finance 28 additional irrigation schemes. Thus, bringing the total target for irrigation schemes to 230 under CLAP and CLAP-AF. – 25 for CLAP and 99 in CLAP-AF by MAIL Irrigation Directorate.

Description	Planned		Revision 1	Revision 2	Total	Remarks
	MAIL/ID	MRRD/NSP				
CLAP (original)	25	106			131	Rev-1: savings from CLAP-AF allocation of for USD 10.2 m Rev-2: reallocation of USD 3.2 m saving from MRRD
CLAP-AF	56		15	28	99	
Grand Total					230	

MAIL/Irrigation Directorate: Barring the impact of COVID 19 on implementation progress, the ID showed good progress in implementing the schemes despite the continually expanding targets. Of the total 124 irrigation schemes, under MAIL/Irrigation Directorate for CLAP and CLAP-AF, 47 are completed, construction work is in progress for 42 schemes and the remaining 35 are under procurement process. The implementation progress however varies significantly across/along various set of revisions/funding, but largely commensurate with the time-lag when additional schemes were added to enhance overall target.

The current mission endorses the findings of implementation support mission of Aug/Sep 2020 mission that the completion of all schemes is unlikely by June- 2021 as originally planned in view of the COVID-19 lock down that severely

affected the overall implementation progress.

MRRD: As per revised scope/target MRRD has completed all 106 irrigation schemes and currently befitting the respective communities. The Community Development Councils (CDCs) in each case, are successfully operating and maintaining the completed schemes.

Outcome and Impact: The project has already surpassed almost three times the planned target of 52,650 ha farmland area under improved irrigation system and has successfully achieved improved irrigation for more than 150,263 ha of land through rehabilitating 131 irrigation schemes (25 by MAIL and 106 by MRRD) completed under the CLAP original design. The number of households benefitted from these schemes is around 146,000, about 50% more than initially envisaged number of 101,500. The improved irrigation infrastructure is now bringing sufficient, reliable and timely supply of water to farmlands leading to better crop yields both in terms of quality and quantity. The area benefitted will be further increased to 155,454 ha once all irrigation schemes are completed.

As of October-2020, the project has formed 208 IAs representing about 4,575 farmers and trained more than 3,200 (70% of total) farmers on schemes planning and monitoring, optimal use of water and its conservation, operation and maintenance related activities.

An impact assessment survey^[1] of completed irrigation schemes^[2] in 2019 through an international consultant, concludes that overall the CLAP irrigation component resulted in increased land under irrigation, enhanced crop productivity, improved household incomes and an achieved and overall increase in diversity of diets. Results were particularly encouraging for downstream households, which previously received very little water. Disputes over water have significantly reduced due to more equitable distribution of water. Land under irrigation increased significantly from an average of 3.25 jerib^[3] to 5.22 jerib; an increase of 60.6%. Changes are even more pronounced among downstream households where the area under irrigation increased by 86.0%; from 2.96 jerib to 5.51 jerib. Other factors such as fairness, timing and adequacy of water distribution have improved according to the majority of surveyed households (97%, 93%, 93% respectively). The majority (90%) noticed an increase in overall crop productivity. The overall average yield of wheat increased by 31.3%; from an average of 2.95 Tons/ha to 3.87 Tons/ha 84.3. The increase was most pronounced among downstream households where an increase of 36% was estimated. The survey indicated improvements in income, ability to produce food and improvement of diets for the vast majority of surveyed households (96%, 92% and 89% respectively). The estimated average increase in household income is 25%. Overall consensus among focus group participants was that households earn more because of increased productivity and have more diverse diets with higher fruit and vegetable consumption because of project's multiple interventions including irrigation schemes.

[1] CLAP (August-2019): Socio-Economic Impact evaluation: (Ellen Geerlings)

[2] The impact evaluation study reviewed 25 CLAP and 4 SNAPP2 completed irrigation schemes

[3] 1 jerib = 0.2 ha

1.2 Institutional Strengthening, Gender Mainstreaming and Capacity Building

Institutions Strengthening

The CLAP-AF continues to follow an integrated community driven development approach, with communities having a central role in the identification/prioritisation of needs, implementation, monitoring and post-completion O&M.

Under productive investment sub-component, one of the selection criteria for Irrigation/Agriculture Productive Infrastructure is farmers' willingness to form an Irrigation Association (IA/CDC). Accordingly, formation of one irrigation association (IA) against each rehabilitated scheme was envisioned at design. Currently, the project reports formation of 208 Irrigation Associations for the completed and ongoing irrigation schemes and these IAs have been involved in planning and implementation and successful operation and maintenance of completed schemes.

Under the dairy subcomponent, CLAP has established 36 milk producer cooperatives at village level with 3303 members. Further, the Afghanistan Dairy Producers Association (ADPA) has been established with 9161 members. Forty women Self-help groups with 624 members have been trained and milk hygiene kits distributed to 3,271 women against appraisal target of 3000. The project has trained 849 women on specific hands on skill and value addition, product diversification and enhanced food storage techniques. The mission was pleased to note that based on recommendation of the implementation support mission of August, 2020, a maturity assessment of the dairy cooperatives/associations was carried out covering key areas of, good governance; representation; communication and planning; administration and financial management. Key finding from the assessment show that the cooperatives and their executive members have attained experience and capacity to manage their cooperatives and provide services to their membership. However, despite the traditionally heavy involvement of women in livestock management, women's share to the general membership is only 18%. Given the low representation of women in the cooperatives, CLAP should encourage the registration and participation of women in the cooperatives, including in leadership positions.

Under Improved Food, Fodder, and Vegetable Crops subcomponent, ICARDA is working with 9 Village Based Seed

Enterprises (VBSEs) 7 of which are newly established and 2 being old VBSEs. The VBSEs are supported in seed production. Seventy-two training programs have been organized for VBSE farmer members against appraisal target of 61. At least 472 VBSE members are receiving project inputs for seed production.

Under Livestock Development for Kutchi Subcomponent, the project has established 38 self-help groups for women for sustainable livelihood opportunities and 52 new VFUs and 108 existing VFUs have received technical assistance through a public Private Partnership model. The project has trained 15,463 Kutchi farmers (Male & Female) on Kutchi extension package. The project established Kutchi village level councils (*Shura*), Kutchi provincial directorates and a Kutchi Advisory Board at central level for the identification of most vulnerable Kuchis, identifying the Kutchi populate areas, consultations, feedback and knowledge sharing and conflict resolution and serve as a coordination mechanism with MAIL and its provincial staff.

Component 2 - Livestock and Agriculture Development

The component aims at reducing poverty through enhancing food security with a strong emphasis on women-headed households and the vulnerable and marginalized within the rural communities and provides for linkages of livestock and agriculture activities to the productive infrastructure and community development/institutional strengthening activities to ensure a holistic and integrated approach. The component implementation is progressing well and promising results under the component are visible.

In view of the traditional role of women in livestock management and the importance of livestock management to realise the potential of increase milk production, processing and marketing, the mission recommends to increase the target for Cattle/livestock management related trainings from the exiting 3,200 to 4,200. The activity will be financed through the unallocated amount under CLAP-AF.

One of the key constraints of livestock sector is the limited outreach of public and private production extension and animal health services. A successful, cost effective and sustainable examples based on the experience of IFAD financed RMLSP, the CLAP Livestock Development for Kutchi subcomponent and experience from region is the creating a cadre of community paravet at village level for improving the outreach of livestock services. Utilisation of animal health services by Kutchi livestock holders in CLAP, increased to 83% against the baseline of 11% resulting in 59% annual mortality rate of small ruminants.

In view of the importance of the evidence based usefulness and sustainable nature of the activity, the mission strongly recommend extending the scope of community paravet training including women, to all the provinces of the project area by training additional 100 youth and women for enhancing the outreach of livestock service for the sedentary and semi nomadic livestock holders. The intervention is particularly very important from women point of view as traditionally they have a major role in livestock management and their access to service for cultural reasons is severely limited because of lack of women extension staff in public institutions.

2.1 Dairy Development

The subcomponent is implemented by FAO. Objective of the subcomponent is to increase milk production, processing and marketing, create dairy institutions such as cooperatives, unions and a dairy federation and enable capacity and policy environment for the established dairy sector.

Key physical targets have been achieved and for some activities have exceeded the targets. The current cumulative physical progress includes:

- 36 milk primary milk producers' cooperatives have been formed at village level with 3303 members against the target of 3000 members in Kabul, Parwan and Logar provinces and 3 provincial dairy unions established,
- 180 women have direct membership of the milk producer cooperative and one woman is chairperson of the cooperative.
- Afghanistan Dairy Producers Association (ADPA) has established with 9161 members,
- District level 17 milk chilling centres and 19 milk collection point established,
- 6,199 men and 3,991 women farmers trained for animal health and husbandry,
- 48,821 Cow inseminated,
- 3,713 fodder crop demonstration plots established.
- 311,998 cattle vaccinated for FMD,
- 63,959 cattle dewormed and 57,920 treated
- Introduced new technology for making silage, urea treatment, hay and compost. (476 Mt of silage produced)
- 40 Self-help group for women with 624 members received training,
- Milk hygiene kits distributed to 3,271 women.
- Based on COVID-19 guidelines trained farmers and distributed need kits, poster, etc.

CLAP has produced promising results under the dairy subcomponent through an increase in annual milk collection from 1261 Mt (2014) to 2933 Mt (2019); controlling 94% common infection diseases; 75% of the total beneficiaries have improved milking cows practices and 86% farmers are using improved fodder crops. Daily milk yield per cow increased from 3.5 litre at baseline to 10.9 litre and milk production per household per day increased to 14.75 litre from a baseline of 4.37

litre. Average household milk consumption per day has increased to 3.6 L/day (Baseline 1.5 litre) contributing to improved food security and nutrition status.

Dairy Plant. In view of the potential market and the dairy production capacity, the Supervision Mission of Dec 2020, agreed to the Government of Afghanistan's request to upgrade a dairy processing plant from pasteurisation to ultra-high temperature processing (UHT), with increased overall capacity, for an additional investment of USD 2.2 million.

Construction work of the dairy plant is 90% completed and the procurement process of dairy equipment is at the evaluation stage. The plant machinery was originally to arrive by Dec. 2020 which is likely to be delayed because of COVID 19 disruptions.

FAO has prepared a business development plan for a 40 MT per day (based on single shift operation) capacity UHT and multi product milk processing plant and Concentrated Feed Processing plant operations. The business plan proposes to graduate Kabul Dairy Union (KDU), established in 2007, into the Central Dairy Union (CDU). CDU formation process has been initiated and is expected to be completed by Dec. 2020.

The business development plan also highlighted the following challenges for successful operation and business sustainability. The mission recommends focus on addressing these challenges during the remaining period of the project.

- Need to expand the market network in view of increased capacity of milk processing plant.
- In order to increase milk catchment and run the processing plant optimally, milk must be collected from all project areas in 3 provinces. Additional farmers' cooperative societies should be established, and technical support extended to the additional farmers.
- Strategies must be formulated to address seasonal fluctuations in milk supply and demand. This will include provision for reconstituting powdered milk.

Policy Issue. The MTR of the project highlighted that was a high tax rate of 20% on the net profit of milk producers' cooperatives and 7% sales tax, which makes the cooperative products less competitive with other imported milk products that mostly come through informal trade from neighbouring countries. Accordingly, a new law is in the process of being formulated where all cooperatives will to be considered and registered as union to provide an enabling environment and a level playing field. The mission recommends that project through MAIL and in consultation with Afghan Dairy Product Association, FAO and KDU/CDU, pursue finalisation and promulgation of the law and provide technical support, if required.

2.2 Poultry Development

Due to change in the original backyard poultry approach to a matching grants model, the progress of the subcomponent remained negligible during 2020. Recruitment of 40 CBEW has been completed, Identification of beneficiaries for the matching grant has been completed and training activities are in progress. Cumulatively, 13,332 households (or 66% of the appraisal targets) have benefited from the poultry interventions. The project beneficiaries have been organized into 267 Village Poultry Producer Groups (VPPG) and identified village group leaders (VGL) to facilitate market linkages and link the beneficiaries with private sector suppliers and purchasers.

2.3 Improved Food, Fodder, and Vegetable Crops

The subcomponent is implemented by ICARDA. The main objective of this sub-component is developing and promoting new drought-resistant and high yielding improved varieties of food, vegetable and fodder crops. The objective is planned to be achieved through adaptive research; establishment of Village Based Seed Enterprises (VBSEs) to ensure sustainable production of certified seeds and facilitate the adoption of the newly introduced varieties by farmers, and; by strengthening the capacity of MAIL researchers and extension workers, farmers and other stakeholders.

The subcomponent has so far reached 152,449 beneficiaries against the target of 121,000. About 430 research trials of Wheat, Chickpea, Lentil, Mungbean, Tomato, Potato, Onion, Grasspea, Alfalfa and Clover have been carried out in 19 research stations across the country and 50 promising line of different crops were identified. During the current AWPB period release of 3 tomato and 4 alfalfa varieties has been recommended to MAIL/ARIA for release and proposals for 2 chickpea and 2 alfalfa varieties are ready for submission which after a series of testing will be confirmed and released for dissemination through MAIL extension services. So far 3 drought resistant wheat varieties with yield gain of 17-18 percent over improved check/benchmark variety and 4 high yielding disease resistant potato varieties have been released with yield gain of 8.22-17.7percent over improved check/benchmark variety.

All the planned 7 VBSEs including 1 women VBSE and 2 VBSE with women members have been established and 2 existing VBSEs, were supported for seed production. During 2020, 1,267 MT of certified seed was produced and cumulatively 3,675 MT of certified seed has been produced and marketed since inception of the activity. On average more than 40 percent yield improvement over local varieties is achieved with maximum in mung bean (61%) followed by wheat (55%).

As of 31 Oct 2020, a total 1491 demo plots of wheat, legumes, vegetable and forage crops were implemented, 27 field days were conducted with the farmers (3001 farmers participated out of which 352 were women), 69 participatory on-farm demonstrations on wheat were conducted and a total of 3,082 persons were trained under various capacity building

programmes. Under kitchen/nutrition gardening 1180 Kitchen and 29 school garden gardens were established with an outreach to 10,000 households.

ICARDA also introduced pilot climate resilient Conservation Agriculture initiative in dry lands as well as in areas with irrigated systems. Under the activity, 80 female and male researchers, extension workers, and 116 farmers were trained. Farmers experience shows, at least 30% saving in farm inputs and labour and 15-20% increase in yield.

2.4 Livestock Development among the Kuchi

The subcomponent is implemented by Dutch Committee for Afghanistan (DCA). The sub-component aims at enhancing the livelihoods and resilience against predictable livestock emergencies of 50,000 *Kutchis* households which are considered to be one of the largest vulnerable groups and over the years, many of them have lost their herds due to drought, diseases and war.

The subcomponent scope in addition of the 7 project provinces, also extends to the provinces of Khost, Paktia and Laghman which are part of the Kuchi migratory trail. Some key achievements as of Oct. 2020, are:

- 46,785 households (94%) have been reached against the appraisal target of 50,000 for both CLAP and CALP-AF;
- 60 youth from the community were trained as para-veterinarian professional, and supported for establishment of Veterinary Field Units;
- 49 Youth were provided basics training in veterinary service with provision of kits;
- 106 existing Veterinary Field Units rehabilitated and supported;
- 15,500 livestock owners trained through extension work;
- additional 9000 poor Kuchi household were trained and supported in value addition,
- 15 fodder banks established;
- 4 million animals were treated, 5.7 million were vaccinated and 3.5 million were dewormed.
- Additionally, 700 Kuchi women motivated, encouraged and provided with home-base job, through establishment of 38 Self-Help Groups and 245 Kuchi women provided employment opportunities through distribution of wool spinning machine.

As reported, the project interventions resulted in 41,5 % increase in the average income of livestock keeping households, 5% increase in the average number of small ruminants owned per household, 59% increase in average milk production and 59% decrease in the annual mortality rate of small ruminants.

Due to mobile lifestyle of Kuchis, access to quality veterinary service is a challenge and a main cause of poor state of the livestock. An innovative model of veterinary services was the establishment of a network of Veterinary Field Units with trained professionals after an analysis of the Kuchi trails and their summer and winter residence areas. There are two categories of VFUs and paravets in the programme: existing ones supported with capacity building and in some cases rehabilitation of their clinic (106 rehabilitated and supported) and newly established ones (60 VFU) operated by a trained Kuchi paravets who were selected from literate Kuchi youth. Each of these VFUs are expected to service about 500 Kuchi households with livestock.

At the request of the government an amount of USD 1 million was withdrawn from the subcomponent to support the national animal drought feed relief programme in 2018. According to DCA, the budget cuts have significantly affected its planned activities particularly relating to improved access to quality veterinary services, value chain and access to markets and establishment of fodder banks. In view of the effectiveness of the intervention in terms of outcomes and impact and availability of sufficient balance amount under unallocated categories, the Mission strongly recommends provision of USD 1 million for completion of all the planned activities envisaged in the PDRs and achieving the objectives.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Extension of Project Period In view of slowing down of the project implementation progress the Government of Islamic Republic of Afghanistan (GoIRA) and IFAD shall consider requesting one-year extension of the Programme completion date. Accordingly, service providers agreement shall also be extended. Please see section G: Project Modifications (Reallocation among categories) for cost estimates	PST/MAIL/MoF/IFAD	12/2020
AWPB 2021 The AWBP from 2021 onwards shall take into consideration the lost momentum during 2020 due to COVID 19, enhanced targets for some activities and the extension of the project. All physical activities shall be completed by Dec 2020 to all time for consolidation and transfer of planning and implementation responsibilities to public institutions and community groups during the last six months of the extended period	PST/PMU	12/2020
Scaling Up of successful interventions In view of the proposed project extension, subsequent extension of agreements with service providers and availability of unspent unallocated amounts: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • the scope of establishment of VFUs be extended to other project provinces by training 100 additional paravet by DCA. • Target for Cattle/livestock management training women by FAO shall be increased from existing 3,200 to 4,200. • In view of the positive outcomes of the, the scope of the pilot climate Conservation Agriculture activity by ICARDA shall be expanded Please see section G: Project Modifications (Reallocation among categories) for cost estimates	PST/PMU	03/2021
Successful operation and business sustainability of dairy plant The mission recommends focus on addressing the challenges for successful operation and business sustainability of dairy plant in the remaining period of the project.	FAO	

E. Project implementation

a. Development Effectiveness

Effectiveness and Developmental Focus

Effectiveness

Rating: 4

Previous rating: 4

Justification of rating

Moderately satisfactory. Based on the reported outputs, outcomes and impact, the project is likely to achieve its goal and objective. Key interventions delivered under the project have been relevant and effective leading to improved food security and increased households' income through increasing agriculture and livestock productivity. The project has reached 75% (166,833 households) of the target beneficiaries (223,000 hh). The project continues to show good implementation progress except during the first half of current AWPB period when COVID 19 pandemic severely disrupted implementation of most of the project activities particularly infrastructure. Some of the main overall outputs have already been achieved or exceeded. Positive outcome and impact results in terms of household income and socio-economic empowerment particularly for women and youth, have emerged as a result of combined and multiplier effects of community development and productivity enhancement interventions. The project design and investments in capacity

building of communities, water sector development and improved agriculture and livestock productivity and service delivery are highly relevant to the country current development strategies and priorities. The project disbursement rate is 61.6% (including WA under preparation) for both original (80%) and additional financing (27%) combined. The combined disbursement rate net of advances is 56.3%. The COVID-19 pandemic has negatively affected the implementation of CLAP and other on-going IFAD projects in Afghanistan with detrimental effects for the target groups.

Log-Frame Analysis & Main Issues of Effectiveness

Project goal is to contribute to reduce poverty in rural Afghanistan and set a target of 10% reduction from 2012 baseline. Based on various evaluation reports and impact surveys by PST/PMU and service providers an estimated 2% reduction in poverty has been achieved in the project area. Various assessments and studies clearly show that project interventions have helped in improved household incomes of the beneficiary households community development including capacity building and improved agriculture and livestock productivity. The reduction in poverty and improved incomes was achieved in the backdrop of sharp increase in the overall poverty rates of 55 percent in 2016-17 from 38.3 percent in 2011-2012 and rural poverty increased from 42.3% to 58.6% ^[1] due to the withdrawal of International Security Assistance Force (ISAF), impacts of deteriorating security conditions, declining aid flows, political instability, and climate change. A recent World Bank analysis suggests that due to the combined effects of political, security and COVID 19 factors, the poverty rate may increase from a baseline of 54.5 percent in 2016-2017 to between 61 percent and 72 percent in 2020 as a result of unemployment, declining incomes and increasing prices for food and other vital household goods.

The development objective of improved food security of rural households in the project area by increasing agriculture and livestock productivity is being successfully achieved. According to the project reports food insecure households decreased to 1.8 percent from 38% at baseline and households reporting higher income increased by 30% from 18% at baseline.

Outcome 1 - Enhanced capacities of local communities and local institutions for the participatory planning and operation of small and medium scale irrigation infrastructure is being achieved successfully through following an integrated community-based development approach including establishment community organisations and technical and managerial capacity building under the various components of the project where the communities have a central role in the identification/prioritisation of needs, implementation, monitoring and post-completion O&M of project investments. The project established 208 Irrigation Associations for planning, implementation and O&M of irrigation infrastructure; 36 milk producers cooperative, 3 provincial cooperatives and Central Dairy Union for milk collection planned dairy plant, marketing and provision of services; established 7 Village Based Seed Enterprises for production of certified seed and working with other groups for research trails; 267 Village Poultry Producer Groups (women) and; 76 women self-help groups for sustainable livelihood. The project trained about 38,000 persons including 13,000 women under its various components.

Outcome 2 and 3 – Objective of increased agriculture and livestock productivity is being pursued successfully through technical and managerial capacity building for upgrading of human resource; productive infrastructure/irrigation investments; introduction of appropriate livestock and agricultural practices and packages including development and promotion of new climate smart drought resistant and high yielding crop, fodder and vegetable varieties and; provision of capital inputs, advisory, strengthening of agriculture and livestock extension services. value-chain support and linkages with markets and private sector.

The project infrastructure invests improved water availability for 150,263 ha of land against the target of 52,650 ha for the completed irrigation infrastructure which achieved an increase of 31-36 percent in what yield and an estimated 25% average increase in household income.

Promising results have been achieved under the dairy subcomponent through controlling 94% common livestock infectious diseases; 75% farmers adopting improved milking cows' practices and 86% farmers using improved fodder crops. Daily milk yield per cow increased from 3.5 litre at baseline to 10.9 litre and milk production per household per day increased to 14.75 litre from a baseline of 4.37 litre. Average milk household consumption per day has increased to 3.6 L/day (Baseline 1.5 litre) contributing to improved food security and nutrition status.

The combined effect of poultry distribution to poor women, capacity building and extension services increased yearly egg production by 153% resulting in increase in net income of equivalent to USD 300 for beneficiary hh.

The introduction of new crop varieties and training and extension so far resulted in release of 3 drought resistant wheat varieties with yield gain of 17-18 percent over improved check/benchmark variety and 4 high yielding disease resistant potato varieties with yield gain of 8.22-17.7percent over improved check/benchmark variety. Additionally, 3,675 MT of certified seed has been produced and marketed since inception of the activity which is adopted by 86% of the target beneficiaries. On average more than 40%yield improvement over local varieties is achieved with maximum in mung bean (61%) followed by wheat (55%).

Under the Livestock among Kutchis subcomponent achievements include 5% increase in the average number of small ruminants owned per household, 59% increase in average milk production and 59% decrease in the annual mortality rate of small ruminants resulting in 41.5 % increase in the average income of livestock keeping households.

[1] Paying for services

[1] Afghan Living Conditions Survey, 2016-17, Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Central Statistics Organization

Development Focus

Targeting and Outreach

Rating: 4

Previous rating: 4

Justification of rating

Moderately satisfactory. The project has covered 166,833 household or 1.3 million persons (75% of the target of 223,000 HH) through its various activities. The project has disaggregated figures for target groups including women and non-women headed households. The end targets for disaggregated target groups is yet to be determined. Project activities are self-targeting including selection of women and men beneficiaries for irrigation schemes, backyard poultry, beef fattening, cashmere, dairy and cattle management, processing of products etc. The project has facilitated development of platforms for people's participation at the village level such as CDCs, SHGs, Kuchi Councils/Boards, Irrigation Associations. Kuchi village level councils (Shura), have been formed for identification of most vulnerable Kuchis, identifying the Kuchi populate areas, consultations, feedback and knowledge sharing and conflict resolution. The project needs to enhance meaningful participation of women and youth in these through leadership training, mentoring and monitoring through M&E system.

Main issues

The Project M&E system needs to capture the participation (*in operational decisions, implementation of project activities, resource allocation, administration and co-ordination efforts etc*) youth and women and them benefiting from project activities in different institutions developed by the project including Irrigation Association, Dairy Association, CDCs and Kuchi Village Councils/Boards. M&E must be carried out in a gender sensitive manner to ensure differences in project outputs, outcomes and impacts experienced by women and men are documented and any differences highlighted. In addition, the end targets of different target groups needs to be completed along with analysing by gender, age and poverty

The CBEWs are drawn from the target villages and they are working at district level as focal point for the project - they are young, educated and competent. CDCs were involved in their recruitment process and all CBEWs were verified by CDCs. They have been receiving training on different extension themes by the project and have provided key inputs to the beneficiaries on access to inputs, technology, market information, services etc. The Community based Extension worker model started by the project is a low cost-high yield approach to increase outreach to farming communities in remote areas. The sustainability of the project depends on the functioning of the extension services at district level. To ensure sustainability, CLAP needs to forge functional collaboration with MAIL/Directorate of Agricultural Extension and relevant institutions/organizations for further capacity building of CBEWs (with special focus on female CBEWs) and enable them to draw user fees from the community for provision of services^[1] or facilitate their absorption in Directorate of Agricultural Extension. Before the project completion, it is crucial to build CBEWs capacities on modern agronomic and agriculture practices, gender and social inclusion and crop handlings practices to provide proper advice and awareness to farmers.

[1] Paying for services

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Youth and Women Participation M&E system to track people's participation Project M&E system to capture youth and women participation in forums and institutions developed by the project and complete the end targets	M&E Officer	06/2021
Outreach and Inclusion of target groups Develop an exit strategy for CBEWs with the aim to enhance their expertise; to provide them gainful employment and service to the community	PMU	06/2021

Gender equality & women's participation

Rating: 4

Previous rating: 4

Justification of rating

Moderately satisfactory. Many activities are aimed at productive empowerment and practical needs of women including adequate water access for their traditional roles through irrigation schemes; inputs provided for backyard poultry; training

on dairy and cattle management/processing of products. Some activities are also aimed at strategic needs such as supporting women producer groups to be inputs supplier to beneficiaries; animal feed process centres run by women; establishing 12 women dairy associations; Solar drier machine distribution in 20 SHGs to reduce drudgery and collectivizing women into SHGs groups and WEG of all MAIL projects etc.

Main issues

An amount of USD 1,18,3000 was allocated for gender related activities which is unlikely to be utilized fully due to slowing down of implementation progress in the first half of 2020 because of COVID 19 lockdown. The 2021 AWP/B needs to develop a detailed plan for executing the gender budget with timelines and responsibilities assigned. As recommended in section D above, the project shall develop a cadre of community women para-vet professionals.

Engaging men in gender conversation, training and activities is as crucial as targeting women as it has been seen across South Asia that it is very powerful when men call on other men to make a change in terms of shared household responsibilities, shared parenting and how it positively affects the household and community. Involving local key actors in the process of changing values and gender norms in the traditional structure of Afghan communities is crucial. These actors include the religious teachers, village elderly, village malik, schoolteachers and community and youth councils that are considered decision makers or role models. Engaging them is fundamental to gender equality. 2021 AWP/B needs to reflect gender training and activities aimed towards men and youth. CLAP needs can partner with local NGO/development agencies to draw relevant resource persons for these activities.

The current percentage of female professional staff (among MAIL/DAIL and SPs) is 14%. The appraisal target of women professional among staff is at least 25% and the project need to accelerate the hiring of competent women professional. CLAP can identify active women members amongst the beneficiaries who have demonstrated capacities and have potential to deliver. These women can be mentored and coached as extension workers, paravet professionals or community mobilizers etc. The mission recommends giving preference to competent women candidates for filling any vacant positions within the PMU (particularly the soon to be advertised provincial M&E officers).

CLAP has yet not measured the cumulative physical progress measured against AWP/B including Core Indicators of a) percentage increase of women who have control of productive assets; b) percentage increase in net income among women and c) percentage of female professional staff (among MAIL/DAIL and SPs). It is recommended to report against these three indicators under component 1.3.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Planning and tracking Gender Budget Develop accelerated plan for spending and tracking the gender budget as part of AWP/B 2021	PMU/Gender Officer	01/2021
Gender Training Gender Training/Activities for Men and Youth	PMU/Gender Officer	01/2021
Gender Indicator Reporting Report on the three gender indicators mentioned in the text	M&E Officer	03/2021
Implementation of ISM Recommendations Implement all the gender recommendations of ISM undertaken in Aug 2020	PD	03/2021

Agricultural Productivity

Rating: 5

Previous rating: 4

Justification of rating

Satisfactory. The project has made concentrated efforts in achieving the agricultural and livestock productivity through a number of interventions such as irrigation infrastructure rehabilitation, capacity building, introduction of improved food, fodder and vegetable varieties, production and of high quality certified seeds, extension of improved fodder crops, and vegetable, strengthening and provision of agriculture, animal health and livestock production extension services.

The availability of sufficient, reliable and timely supply of water due to rehabilitation of irrigation schemes resulted in 31.3% increase of wheat yield. The increase was most pronounced among downstream households where an increase of 36% was achieved. The production and availability of improved certified seed on average resulted in more than 40% yield

improvement over local varieties with maximum in mung bean (61%) followed by wheat (55%). The introduction of new crop varieties and training and extension so far resulted in release of 3 drought resistant wheat varieties with yield gain of 17-18 percent over improved check/benchmark variety and 4 high yielding disease resistant potato with yield gain of 8.22-17.7 percent over improved check/benchmark variety.

The livestock interventions achieved controlling 94% common dairy cattle infection diseases and 59% decrease in the annual mortality rate of small ruminants. Daily milk yield per cow increased from 3.5 litre at baseline to 10.9 litre and milk production per household per day increased to 14.75 litre from a baseline of 4.37 litre. Milk production of small ruminants increased by 59%.

Poultry distribution for poor women together with capacity building and improved extension services increased yearly egg production by 153%.

Main issues

In order to achieve the objective of a holistic and integrated approach through linkages of productive infrastructure, agriculture development and community development/institutional strengthening and in view of promising results, CLAP should follow the SNaPP2 integrated approach of complementing water availability/irrigation schemes with extension services and capacity building and linkages with markets and private sector through the 4P model of SNaPP2. The SNaPP2 4P model on the one hand offers an opportunity for smallholders to access resources such as improved seeds, fertilizers, improved agricultural practices as well as assured better returns and access to market and on the other hand the private sector gains sustainable access to raw materials and supplies that meet the private sector specifications regarding delivery timeline, quality and volume based on agreed contract farming agreements.

Additionally, the scope of FMFB-A's current agricultural and livestock sector loan programme under SNaPP2 shall also be extended to CLAP beneficiaries. In this regard a formal MoU shall be signed between FMFB-A and CLAP.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Synergies between CLAP and SNaPP2 Introduce the SNaPP2 integrated approach of complementing water availability/irrigation schemes with extension services and capacity building and linkages with markets and private sector through the 4P model.	PMU	01/2021

Nutrition

Rating: 4

Justification of rating

Moderately satisfactory. One of the key focus areas of the project design is improved family food and nutrition status through increased on-farm productivity and production of field crops, fodder, vegetables, dairy, eggs and poultry meat by introducing appropriate livestock and agriculture technology options. The project provides for strengthening the capacity, knowledge and skills in awareness raising and training beneficiary HH in nutrition and food security related issues.

In the absence of any data presented by the project, it is not possible to accurately assess improvements in nutrition at household level. However, ad-hoc assessments from the positive outcomes of the project relating to improved agriculture and livestock productivity and household incomes indicates clear improvements in nutrition situation of the target households. Generally increased income leads to better food and nutrition. According to Socio-Economic Impact evaluation of irrigation schemes, 89 percent beneficiary report improvement in diet as a result of improved production since completion of irrigation schemes implying improved nutrition of HHs.

It is an established fact that animal source of food is the most direct way to improve household nutrition either through own-consumption or income generation. FAO data for dairy development subcomponent provides evidence of an increase of average milk household consumption per day from 1.5 litre at baseline to 3.6 L/day and the 59% average milk increase in small ruminants suggest increased own consumptions thereby, contributing to improved food security and nutrition status. Similar results are observed from poultry development component where the yearly eggs production increased by 158%.

An important contributory factor for improved nutrition status of HH members from livestock productivity and income is that traditionally women are highly involved in livestock management and sale, particularly small ruminants and poultry, production and sale of milk and milk products and income for these activities is largely controlled by women. This in addition to increasing the level of empowerment and position of women within the family and society through her contributions towards the family economy, also enhances their decision-making power over household expenditures which usually is directed to improving maternal and childcare, as well as household nutrition and health.

Main issues

Tangible impact of improved agriculture and livestock productivity and household incomes on food and nutrition status, is also imperative on appropriate knowledge and skills of HH particularly women on food and nutrition security issues. Therefore, as provided in the project design, there is a need for focus on strengthening the capacity, knowledge and skills in awareness raising and training of beneficiary HH in nutrition and food security. Since food security and nutrition is an important element of IFAD's Strategic Objective and Corporate Mainstreaming priorities, there is need for systematic data collection and survey on nutrition aspects of the project.

Adaptation to Climate Change

Rating: 4

Previous rating: 4

Justification of rating

Moderately satisfactory. CLAP AF design prepared a "Social, Environment and Climate Assessment Procedures (SECAP)" using the IFAD guidelines. The SECAP review note concluded that potential impacts are relatively minor as the project design provides appropriate actions on adaptation and mitigation measures. The project is adopting climate related measures as per guidance provided in the SECAP. In case of irrigation schemes adoption of climate smart designs (appropriate siting, adjustable inflow/ outflow structures to cater water fluctuations etc.), adopting new technologies (zero tillage and laser land levelling); coupled with regular institutional strengthening and capacity building of the staff from ID/MAIL and MRRD, and of farmers through IAs/CDCs. Resilience of farmers against extreme weather events are built by promoting improved water management practices amongst farmers for increasing land (i.e. crop production per unit area) and water productivity (i.e. crop production per unit water) by demonstrating the promising results through establishing irrigation demonstration sites. Capacity building and trainings of community institutions on climate smart technologies is an integral part of institutional strengthening which is cross-cutting across all project components. The community institutions play a positive role in sustainable management of the water and natural resources. These institutions have also been instrumental in conflict management particularly in the areas of water distribution, usage of the common pastures and meadows and other communal places.

Agriculture and livestock activities including capacity building of communities and government staff for sustainable management of rangeland, introduction of drought resistant agriculture technologies, farmer-to-farmer dissemination of information and training, are building communities resilience to climate change. Through livestock vaccinations, fodder production and improved animal husbandry practices, and easy access to concentrate feed has helped farmers adapt to the effects of climate change. The project introduced Conservation Agriculture (CA) initiative support sustainable agricultural production through increasing the farmers' economic gains and environmental safety, while enhancing production and productivity.

Main issues

Strengthening the monitoring capacity of project staff and community groups through dedicated trainings sessions on sensitization and on adopting climate smart technologies (zero tillage, laser land levelling and high efficiency irrigation systems etc.). Further a robust mechanism needs to develop for capturing progress on adaptation and capacity building events. The positive results Conservation Agriculture offer a good potential for large scale adoption.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Capacity building climate change Strengthening the monitoring capacity of project staff and community groups through dedicated trainings sessions on sensitization and on adopting climate smart technologies	PMU/Service Providers	02/2021

b. Sustainability and Scaling up

Institutions and Policy Engagement

Rating: 5

Previous rating: 4

Justification of rating

Satisfactory. The IFAD country programme through CLAP and other on-going projects includes activities to establish and strengthen community institutions and groups as a driver for sustainable socio-economic development including community-based natural resource management, with gender mainstreaming integrated into the project designs which include some specific targets for women's participation. The project is also focusing on capacity building of partner government agencies within agriculture and rural development sectors. CLAP particularly provides to facilitate and strengthen MAIL staff at provincial and district level in the project area for improved implementation and service delivery with the aim to reduce reliance on service providers by transfer of responsibility for planning and implementation of project's activities to the provincial and district level staff of MAIL as well as community institutions

The project provides for policy support for formulation, development, follow-up or completion of draft policies, strategies

and legislations required by MAIL to nurture an enabling environment. A key achievement was the funding for technical assistance for preparation of the Comprehensive Agricultural Development Framework (CADF) which forms a key pillar of the Afghanistan National Peace and Development Framework (ANPDF) 2017-2021. Main features of the CADF includes support to local institutions, innovative approaches to rural finance and inclusive development, which fully compliments the ANPDF.

Main issues

The project has generated key lessons that could be useful for other similar projects, government policymakers and donors. A key policy issue for CLAP was the high taxation of dairy cooperatives. With the government's imposition of up to 20% tax for processed dairy products, the dairy cooperatives cannot compete with the informal import of dairy products. The project reported that a new law for changing the status of cooperatives to union to address the taxation issues is in the proceed for being formulated. The mission recommends that the project through MAIL and in consultation with Afghan Dairy Product Association, FAO and KDU/CDU, should pursue the finalisation and promulgation of the law with the relevant ministries. If required assistance could be provided through the policy support.

In its exit strategy, the DCA has identified 2 policy issues namely: i) Transboundary disease prevention control particularly for Foot and mouth disease (FMD) ii) Policy support and intervention on nutrition management and utilization of agriculture waste and by product.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
New law on taxation of dairy cooperatives Pursue early finalisation and promulgation of new law with relevant ministries. Technical assistance could be provided through the project policy support, if required.	MAIL/FAO/CLAP	03/2021
Policy Papers Prepare policy position papers including recommendations on transboundary disease prevention control particularly for Foot and mouth disease (FMD) and on nutrition management and utilization of agriculture waste and by product for dissemination through KM and pursuing with relevant government ministries.	MAIL/DCA/CLAP	03/2021

Partnership-building

Rating: 5

Previous rating: 4

Justification of rating

Satisfactory. Due to sever capacity constraints at the operational level, the project developed partnership with international organisations and NGOs like FAO, ICARDA and DCA for implementation of the project. Despite a very challenging operating environment and start up delays, the implementation partners have done reasonably well in terms of attainment of outputs and outcomes of the project. Engagement of with international organisations and NGOs as service providers also facilitated sharing of global experiences. IFAD has relied on RBA as important partners on the ground. FAO is a key implementing partner of CLAP and WFP facilitates logistic and security support for IFAD staff and consultants during their visit to the country.

Through implementing projects including CLAP, IFAD forged strategic alliances and partnerships with key ministries like MAIL and MRRD which defined IFAD role as an active and major development partner and provided opportunities for coordination and programme-based decisions for better country programme management and a platform for dialogue and coordination with the other government ministries and international and local stakeholders. Regular efforts are made to explore opportunities for con financing both with DFIs and bilateral institutions.

Main issues

Because of lack of country presence and the restrictions on travel due to security and COVID 19, active engagement of IFAD in donor forums within Afghanistan has not been possible for the last two years with all DFIs, major bilateral agencies and UN agencies.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Participation in in-country donor forum As far as possible, remote participation of IFAD in in-country donor forum/meetings be ensured till such time that mission visits are allowed.	IFAD CD	

Human and Social Capital and Empowerment**Rating: 4****Previous rating: 4****Justification of rating**

Moderately satisfactory. Following a participatory development approach, CLAP has undertaken steps to develop productive, managerial and technical capacities of women and men through project activities. It has enhanced their collective bargaining and organisational development through establishment and development of milk producer cooperatives, Afghanistan Dairy Producers Association, VBSE, Animal Feed Centres, Mirabs and Irrigation Associations, SHGs etc. Positive outcome and impact results in terms of household income and socio-economic empowerment, particularly for women and youth, have emerged as a result of combined and multiplier effects of community development and productivity enhancement interventions. Improved livelihood opportunities for women in their traditional domain of livestock where income for livestock products is largely controlled by women, has increased the level of empowerment and position of women within the family and society through her contributions towards the family economy.

Main issues

CLAP has established milk producer cooperatives and Afghanistan Dairy Producers Association (ADPA), which have a total of 9161 members. Due to training and project intervention, the technical capacity in livestock management and dairy management has improved. This is evident by increase in average livestock milk production, decrease in the annual mortality rate of animals and increase in the average income of livestock keeping households. Mentorship and skill building of women can enhance their meaningful participation in these association in terms of decision-making and leadership roles.

CLAP has undertaken steps to develop productive and technical capacities of women. It has facilitated the development of 40 SHGs with 624 members. 543 of the SHGs women have received training of managerial functions and financial management. There are 12 women led dairy associations, animal feed process centres led by 3 women, 1 VBSE and 1 dairy cooperative led by women; 100 women producer groups supported to be inputs supplier to beneficiaries. While interacting with women beneficiaries during the mission, it was observed that women are benefiting from project activities and their skills and socio-economic conditions are improving because of project interventions. The findings of the Gender Impact studies will further provide evidence on how the technical, leadership, organisational and managerial capacities of men and women have enhanced.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
self-help groups Develop plans to integrate the CLAP SHGs under Ministry of Rural Rehabilitation and Development (MRRD), Government of Afghanistan national SHG programme: Women's Economic Empowerment – Rural Development Project (WEE-RDP) for sustainability and improving women's economic empowerment	PD	06/2021

Quality of Project Target Group Engagement and Feedback**Rating: 4****Previous rating: 5****Justification of rating**

Moderately satisfactory. CLAP has facilitated the development and strengthening of CDCs, dairy unions and cooperatives, Irrigation Associations and SHGs. These community groups are the key platform for bottom-up planning, people's participation and community development activities at the village level. The CDCs are also address local conflict and act as grievance redressal bodies. The project has informed that consultative meeting to implement CLAP's activities are jointly organised by the provincial agriculture department, DDA, CDCs, dairy cooperatives and unions, Irrigation Association, SHGs etc.

Main issues

In absence of field visit within COVID-19 context, it has been difficult to assess the beneficiary participation in the real sense.

One key issue that emerged during the interaction with women beneficiaries during the ISM in August 2020 and the current supervision mission and the Irrigation impact study indicates that women have not been directly involved in the design and implementation of the irrigation schemes. The MAIL irrigation engineers have taken the traditional use of the irrigation canals by women into account during the design process. Women and men have different roles and responsibilities in agriculture and household activities, therefore their needs in terms of access to water is different. The meaningful engagement of women in the irrigation associations is necessary to allow for addressing specific needs of women in terms of access to water, decision and control over water, knowledge and training related to water use etc.

Also, pathways for women participation needs to be created in the recently established all-male dominated Kuchi village level councils (*shura*) and Kutchi board. bord.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Enhanced participation of Women and Youth Mentorship and coaching of women and youth to meaningfully participate in management of Mirabs and Irrigation Associations and Kuchi Councils and Board	PMU	06/2021

Responsiveness of Service Providers

Rating: 5

Previous rating: 4

Justification of rating

Satisfactory. Partnerships with FAO, ICARDA and DCA remain a main cornerstone in CLAP. Given the capacity constraints within the government agencies, and security concerns, these partnerships have played an important role in attainment of project outcomes and targets. Despite continually expanding targets (increased from original 56 to 99 under CLAP-AF) and more recently disruption of implementation of project due to COVID-19 pandemic, the Irrigation Directorate continued to show good progress for design, procurement of contracting services and implementation of irrigation schemes.

Main issues

FAO in Business Plan identified some challenges for successful operation and business sustainability of dairy plant (details in Section D: Overview and Project Progress under Dairy Development subcomponent. The mission recommends focus on addressing these challenges in the remaining period of the project.

Environment and Natural Resource Management

Rating: 4

Previous rating: 4

Justification of rating

Moderately satisfactory. The project does not include any activity of a size or scale that will pose any significant social and environmental or social risks. The project activities are mostly small scale, temporary and largely site specific. There has been no involuntary resettlement or economic displacements. The infrastructure schemes of the project are environment friendly interventions because of relatively smaller size and are limited to rehabilitation existing irrigation schemes. Most of the project interventions are agriculture focussed like irrigation infrastructure (inlets, canal lining, small diversion works) and on-farm watercourse lining which not only control the excessive use of water at upstream but also contribute towards reducing the water conveyance losses thereby increasing water efficiency and productivity and thus improving the overall environment.

Climate change impacts with frequent long dry spells or excessive floods is being experienced in project area. The design considerations in infrastructure schemes provide flexibility to adapt to the climate change impacts. For instance: provision of inlet structures with adjustable inflow/outflow arrangements to cater to possible changes in upstream water levels. The project is working with ICARDA to develop drought and disease resistant varieties and so far, introduced three wheat varieties which are capable of surviving at 50% of water requirements when compared with usual varieties. Similarly, the rehabilitation of irrigation schemes are resulting into water savings and has positive impact on climate change adaptation efforts.

The environmental and climate change aspects are integral part of all trainings and capacity building of stakeholders that contribute in raising the awareness of farmers on issues such as: water conservation, proper management of pesticides and herbicides, use of zero tillage and laser land levelling etc. The project conducted about 70 different capacity building sessions with more than 3,000 participants that received trainings on various agriculture aspects including environment and climate change impacts.

The project under the improved food, fodder and vegetable crops subcomponent recently piloted conservation agriculture (CA) activity. Initial results indicate that the CA technology achieved at least 30% saving in farm inputs and labour and 15-20% increase in yield; thus, contributing towards conservation of natural resources. Under the Kuchi livestock and veterinary services subcomponent, DCA initiated establishment of feed banks across the target area which not only provide animal with sufficient feed but also reduced the pressure on pastures for sustainable pasture management. Moreover, FAO supported fodder production positively impacts the environmental preservation and also reduced degradation of pasture. Fodder crops are also used for crop rotation, hence improving nitrogen fixation and replacement of chemical fertilizer application by organic manure and compost.

Main issues

The mission recommends that project should strengthen its monitoring activities on environmental and social impacts

while adequately capturing and documenting the mitigation measures adopted at site. There is also a need to conduct dedicated sessions on E&S issues among the Project/MAIL/MRRD staff to better sensitization on the issue and raise awareness on mitigation measures including SECAP requirements. The mission further recommends preparing 3-4 site specific ESMPs for relatively larger irrigation schemes on priority.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Preparation of ESMPs Complete site specific ESMPs for sample 3-4 relatively larger irrigation schemes	CLAP	02/2021

Exit Strategy **Rating: 4** **Previous rating: 4**

Justification of rating

Moderately satisfactory. There are several key elements in the project design which ensure post-project sustainability and a natural exit strategy including strengthening the planning and implementation capacities of public service delivery institutions at provincial and district level and community groups. The project following the design parameters, is working with and within the existing and permanent organisational set up of MAIL and MRRD like the extension directorates, agricultural Research Institute of Afghanistan (ARIA) and Irrigation Directorate of MAIL and National Solidarity Programme of MRRD. Therefore, the linkages established between the MAIL/MRRD and community institutions through planning and implementation of project activities, are likely to benefit the project target groups in terms of continued access to good and services in the post project period.

The participatory development process followed by the project, including establishing and strengthening community institutions and involvement of communities in every step of project cycle not only respond directly to community and households development priorities but also creates a strong sense of ownership among community and its households, which manifests in a robust sustainability and smooth exit. Another contributory factor for sustainability and successful exit strategy is that the project community development initiatives including establishment of community groups are built on the traditional collective decision making mechanisms and natural resources management, the centuries old Mirab system where a person or a group provides distribution and operation and maintenance services for irrigation. Most of the project community institutions and community technical service providers like dairy unions and cooperatives, Irrigation instructions, Village based Seed Enterprises, community paravets, are registered under relevant regulatory frameworks of ministries which provides them status of formal and legal entities. The formal and legal status of these community groups and the registration and licence to practice for community paravet, extend their scope of the service delivery beyond the project life.

Main issues

A key aspect of the project exit strategy is a gradual and planned handover and transfer of responsibilities from service providers to national institutions and beneficiary groups/cooperatives/Unions etc. based on considerably strengthened capacities, for continuing the work of the project. Strengthening public and community institutions for gradual takeover of full implementation and O&M responsibilities to ministries and community institutions/CDCs are critical premise of the project. The project has laid a sound foundation in terms of establishing and fostering community and farmer institutions and capacity building of staff of ministries. To ensure sustainability and seamless exit, the Mission recommends to focus on the consolidation of capacity building of public service providers for sustainable service delivery and community development processes, including technical and managerial capacity building of community/farmer institutions during the remaining period of the project. Formal linkages between public and private service providers and project community institutions shall also be strengthened for continuous post project delivery of good and services through the community institutions. The project should maintain continuous contact and follow up with community institutions through some formal (regular periodic visits, if feasible), or at least informal (telephonic contact) mechanism to track their working, provide technical and managerial guidance, if needed, to ensure their sustained proactive role in the development process.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Exit Strategy, Sustainability and Consolidation Phase To capitalise on the capacity building initiatives of ministries staff and community and achieve successful handover of transfer of implementation and O&M responsibilities to ministries and community institutions/CDCs, the project shall prepare an exit strategy in consultation with service provider, for consolidation of public institutions and communities capacities during the remaining project period and transfer of responsibilities to respective ministries and community institutions.	PMU/Service providers	03/2021

Potential for Scaling-up	Rating: 4	Previous rating: 4
---------------------------------	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

Moderately satisfactory. Livestock production has always been an integrated part of smallholder farming systems in Afghanistan and plays a key role in shaping both incomes and diets of local households. Productivity and income growth in the livestock sector in addition to food and nutrition security of smallholders, have strong income multiplier and poverty reduction impacts. More importantly, benefits from livestock development in particular are important to poor rural women, primarily because traditionally women in Afghanistan tend to be more associated with livestock production. One of the key constraints of livestock sector is the poor institutional infrastructure with limited outreach for cost effective veterinary and production extension services for the majority of livestock holders. To address the challenge, a system of Veterinary Field Units (VFUs) was adopted in IFAD financed RMLSP and in CLAP for livestock development subcomponent with assistance of Dutch Committee for Afghanistan (service provider). VFUs are private-sector, service-delivery units at the community level. Professionally trained paravet selected by communities, establish their own private, fee-for-service VFU in their local community. The paravets are licensed by mail to practice veterinary services and are also sometimes engaged to perform public sector functions through a public private partnership arrangement. The VFU model has proven as an excellent sustainable model of private-sector veterinary service delivery in CLAP. As reported by project, utilisation of animal health services by Kutchi livestock holders increased to 83% against the baseline of 11% resulting in 59% annual mortality rate of small ruminants, ICARDA introduced climate resilient Conservation Agriculture initiative in dry lands as well as in areas with irrigated systems. Farmers experience shows, at least 30% saving in farm inputs and labour and 15-20% increase in yield.

Main issues

In view of the importance of enhanced outreach, evidence based usefulness and sustainable nature of the VFU, the mission strongly recommend, extending the scope of community paravet training and establishment of VFUs to all the provinces of the project area by training additional 100 youth and women for benefiting the sedentary and semi nomadic livestock holders. The intervention is particularly very important from women point of view as traditionally they have a major role in livestock management and their access to service for cultural reasons is severely limited because of lack of women extension staff in public institutions.

In view of the country being one of the most vulnerable countries in the world to climate change and high vulnerability of the agricultural sector to increased temperatures, droughts and changes in rainfall patterns and snow melt, the positive results of Conservation Agriculture pilot activity offer a good potential for large scale adoption.

c. Project Management

Quality of Project Management	Rating: 4	Previous rating: 4
--------------------------------------	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

Moderately satisfactory. To provide greater synergies within the expanding IFAD portfolio and utilization of institutional knowledge from within the existing IFAD projects, a two-tier management structure was introduced with the design of CLAP. Under the arrangements a Project Support Team with responsibilities of support to all project for cross issues of implementation coordination, financial management, gender and M&E including MIS and knowledge management, was established. Project management units including CLAP were placed under the PSU. The management system has generally responded proactively to the changing circumstances and need and adjusted to the challenges faced by CLAP, notably the change in the scope of productive infrastructure component, expanding targets for irrigation schemes from 56 to 99 under CLAP-AF and response to government priority of emergency animal feed programme during the 2018 droughts. The implementation performance of the project indicates demonstrated capacity to implement the project and achieve its objectives, Bases on the MTR recommendations staff has clear demarcation of roles and responsibilities and more effective performance assessments was introduced.

The Young Professional Programme is an initiative under which the fresh graduates are recruited for one year for different functions based on the demand. The initiative provided opportunities for young fresh graduates to get experience as well develop their skills in the respective domain. To date, 98 YPs have been recruited under CLAP of which 59% have found jobs or gone for higher studies. The mission recommends re-hiring of the willing unemployed served YPCs to be placed in the field for them to gain minimum 2 years' experience and opportunity to find employment opportunity.

Main issues

In view of the geographic overlap and the need for sharing and adopting successful experiences, there is a need to create synergies between CLAP and SNaPP2 and reflected in the PST/CLAP/SNaPP2 management structure. The project design provides for strengthening the capacity, knowledge and skills in awareness raising and training beneficiary HH in nutrition and food security related issues. The mission could not get a clear idea about implementation of this important activity.

Knowledge Management**Rating: 4****Previous rating: 4****Justification of rating**

Moderately satisfactory. SNaPP2/CLAP jointly have one KM specialist working closely with the M&E team and coordinates KM activities with field level staff and facilitates KM training. A detailed KM strategy is in place and is regularly updated with lessons learned and planned actions. There was a provision for KM activities in the AWPB both of 2019 and 2020. The KM strategy includes a communication plan which has been agreed will frequently be updated and shared with IFAD to facilitate better planning and coordination of KM products on relevant themes. The M&E plan integrates the programme's knowledge generation and sharing activities which in a cohesive way connects lessons from M&E and communications. As part of this, a guide has been produced for field staff on how to write communication products.

Main issues

The Mission noted some concerns that the M&E officer's and the KM specialist's limited access to the field may impose obstacles from capturing lessons from implementation. This capacity can be expected to be improved with the seven additional M&E officers under recruitments which are to be placed in provincial level. It will be useful to follow up how these new resources provide additional value to the KM capacity and if additional KM training is necessary.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
KM Sharing The project KM team agreed to work with NWARA for the new AIWRDP project to provide assistance by sharing lessons learned from working with KM on SNaPP2/CLAP. This feeds back to previous agreed actions that MAIL In view of the potential of learning and scaling up of successful experiences of the Programme should share these with relevant ministries.	NPD and KM specialist	

Value for Money**Rating: 4****Previous rating: 4****Justification of rating**

Moderately satisfactory. Project implementation has been efficient, and investments represent good value for money. With a total project cost of USD 92.5 million for both CLAP and CLAP-AF (including government and beneficiary contribution), the project will benefit 223,000 household (1,338,000 persons) at an all-inclusive average cost of USD 414 per household and USD 64 per head (including PST/PMU and service providers implementation and management costs). In view of the results achieved in terms of outreach and positive outcomes under difficult conflict prone work conditions and accessibility issues in some of the project provinces, this is an efficient, effective and economic investment.

Main issues

The benefit cost (B:C) ratio was noted to be 1.53 at the time of design of CLAP AF. A socio-economic impact evaluation of irrigation subcomponent for completed schemes^[1] estimated benefit cost ratio of 2.83 with IRR of 44%. The results of sensitivity analysis for three scenarios (10% increase in costs, 10% decrease in benefits; 10% increase in cost with 10% decrease in benefits) still remain promising at 2.57, 2.55 and 2.31 respectively.

Cost efficiencies were achieved in completed irrigation schemes in terms of better design, efficient bidding and implementation process (time, cost saving) resulting in substantial saving which was utilised to implement 15 additional irrigation schemes.

Based on the available data, the average additional annual income per household was estimated at USD 49^[2] for Community Development, Productive Infrastructures and Institutional Strengthening, average income earned by Kutchi households was approximately 41.60% higher compared to baseline and average yearly income of USD 316 per household for poultry was reported. Similarly design outputs and outcome targets under the components and subcomponents have either been already achieved or surpassed such as land under irrigation, number of women and men trained in agriculture and livestock related subjects, increase of agriculture/livestock productivity, vaccination and treatment of animals, certified seed production, number of farmers accessing inputs and services etc

^[1] Socio-Economic Impact evaluation, Irrigation Component, 2019, Ellen Geerlings, Research & International Development

Consultancy Services (EGRID)

^[2] Ibid

Coherence between AWPB and Implementation**Rating: 4****Previous rating: 4****Justification of rating**

Moderately satisfactory. Planned completion of AWPB 2020 activities and targets are unlikely to be achieved due to COVID 19 lockdown and resulting disruptions labour, goods and services sectors. The AWPB had an outlay of USD 14,279,222.58 (USD 4,284,658 for CLAP Original and USD 9,994,564.58 for CLAP AF). The current reported utilization is only 19% of the total AWPB allocation. However, based on the estimated pending payments and projected expenditure for Oct-Dec 2020, the financial utilisation/expenditure is expected to reach USD 7.5 million – 52% of the AWPB allocation. Implementation progress and achievement of physical targets pickup since Aug 2020 and the project is making enhanced efforts to regain the good pre COVID 19 momentum.

The overall cumulative physical progress is 65% and ranges between 63 to 85 percent for different components/subcomponents except the poultry subcomponent (33%). The poultry subcomponent was changed for the original backyard poultry approach to a matching grants model which slowed down the progress. Identification of beneficiaries for the matching grant has been completed and training activities are in progress.

AWPB Inputs and Outputs Review and Implementation Progress

Main reason the low AWPB utilization were the lockdown and impact of COVID 19. Disruptions in the labour, goods and services sectors, resulted in either slowing down or complete halting of project implementation particularly the infrastructure activities, several extension related group events and trainings. Additionally, because of the government SOPs, offices working hours were reduced and staff attendance is restricted to alternate days. The irrigation subcomponent was worst effected where construction work came to a complete halt due to non-availability of labour, material and transport and procurement process for engagement of contractors for new schemes was suffered delays.

Performance of M&E System**Rating: 4****Previous rating: 4****Justification of rating**

Moderately satisfactory. M&E unit produces regular progress reports and annual outcome surveys that feed into management decisions. Because of the project implementation arrangements, most of the data and information is collected by service providers on a regular basis, and then reviewed within the PMU. Work on the MIS system recommended by previous mission was completed in Aug 2020 and data entry is in progress. Web based M&E has been developed by the project. Additionally, the annual outcome survey is in process and is expected to be completed in Dec 2020 and some case studies on livestock development for Kutchis were conducted.

Owing to ongoing data validation constraints, development of GIS based M&E system and its merger with MIS was recommended by SV mission of 2019.

M&E System Review

The project has developed a comprehensive M&E system consisting of output, outcome and impact level monitoring and evaluation. However, its full implementation is hindered due to shortage of M&E staff particularly at provincial level and the quality and frequency of outcome and impact level data need improvement. The project needs to particularly focus on impact evaluation for poverty, food security and nutrition data and analysis. Currently the project is mostly relying on data and information provided by service providers. Recruitment of provincial M&E staff is in process. The project also needs to speed up the process of completion of GIS based M&E system.

The Mission has some difficulties in accessing relevant data on the targets and achievements of AWPB. The Mission recommends that PMU shall review format of the AWPB where the component and subcomponent target, unit cost and budget shall be clearly mentioned and data of outputs and expenditures shall be regularly updated and available.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Recruitment of provincial M&E staff The process for recruitment and capacity building provincial M&E staff shall be completed	PST/MAIL	01/2021
Completion of GIS based M&E system To overcome the shortcoming of remote monitoring due to travel restrictions GIS & remote Sensing Specialist shall be immediately engaged and the system completed	PST	03/2021

Social, Environment, and Climate Standards requirements

Rating: 4

Previous rating: 4

Justification of rating

Moderately satisfactory. CLAP AF design prepared a “Social, Environment and Climate Assessment Procedures (SECAP)”. The review note classified the Project as Category B for environmental classification and recommended for continuous monitoring of land and water management and climate change related aspects during project implementation. The SECAP however notes that the project is not expected to have any significant negative impact on either social or environmental status as the project design is largely oriented to address existing environmental and social conditions in the target area. The note also recommends for the capacity building of project staff through focussed trainings at all levels with regards to climate change adaptation issues and equipped with the necessary didactic and promotional material in this regard whereby using real field settings such as assessing and introducing technology options.

SECAP Review

Given the guidance provided through SECAP, the project is paying special attention on improving water management through rehabilitating irrigation schemes with climate smart designs (appropriate siting, adjustable inflow/ outflow structures to cater water fluctuations etc.), adopting new technologies (zero tillage and laser land levelling); coupled with regular institutional strengthening and capacity building of the staff from ID/MAIL and MRRD, and of farmers through IAs/CDCs.

Environmental aspects the project is pursued by preparing infrastructure scheme specific mitigation checklist/IEEs and submits to NEPA (National Environmental Protection Agency) for its review and NOL. During implementation of each scheme necessary mitigation measures are adopted (such as avoiding of cutting trees, providing access passage to pedestrian, proper disposal of surplus construction material, restoration of construction site etc.). The compliance is regularly monitored by field staff and periodically by the NEPA as well.

The mission however recommends that project should strengthen its monitoring activities on environmental and climate change impacts while adequately capturing and documenting the adaptive and mitigation measures supported through adequate evidence (data, pictures etc.).

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Strengthening SECAP Monitoring Project should strengthen its monitoring activities on SECAP implementation while adequately capturing and documenting the adaptive and mitigation measures supported through adequate evidence (data, pictures etc.).	CLAP E&S Focal Person / CLAP Management	

d. Financial Management & Execution

Acceptable Disbursement Rate

Rating: 2.0

Previous rating: 3

Justification of rating

Automated rating based on IFAD disbursement data

Main issues

The project is in its 7th year of implementation (completion date 31st December 2022) and its disbursement rate is 61.6%

The project is in its first year of implementation (completion date of December 2020), and its disbursement rate is 56.3% (including WA under preparation) for both original (80%) and additional financing (27%) combined. However, the combined disbursement rate net of advances is 56.3%.

Overall Financial Performance: As of Sep 2020, the Programme had disbursed SDR 34.06 million out of the available amount of SDR 55.35 million for both original (SDR 30.12 million out of SDR 37.65 million) and additional financing (SDR 4.81 million out of SDR 17.70 million) combined, giving a combined financial performance rate of 61.6%.

However, it was noted that in the original financing one Category "Incremental Operating Costs" the disbursement rate is 102% of the revised allocation, while in special financing facility, the disbursement rate is 0%. The project needs to consider if the allocation for special financing facility needs to be reallocated.

Submission and Quality of WAs: The project is still not regular in preparation and submission of withdrawal applications. For original financing the PCU had not submitted WA since July 2019 by 30 Sept 2020. For additional financing the PCU had not submitted WA since January 2020 by 30 Sept 2020. These WAs were submitted during the mission. It is strongly recommended that WAs for PCU and all IPs should be submitted at least once every three months.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Review of claims presented by IPs Improve the review of claims presented by IPs before submission of WAs to IFAD to reduce the risk of misclassification of expenditures	Finance team	
Submission of WA:WA to be submitted at least once in three months or upon utilization 30% of the initial advance whichever is earlier.	Sr. Finance Manager	

Fiduciary aspects

Quality of Financial Management

Rating: 4

Previous rating: 4

Justification of rating

The Financial management has improved over the last year, including implementation of TOMPRO, improved & regular reporting to IFAD, timely submission of un-audited and audited financial statements, conducting regular internal audits and accordingly the quality of FM has been rated as moderately satisfactory. The FM needs to be further improved including completely switching to TOMPRO, hiring of international financial consultant, following up on internal audit recommendations and preparing rolling cash flow forecasts.

Main issues

Accounting and Financial Reporting: The project follows a cash basis of accounting and is operating in parallel the old QuickBooks Software (QB) and newly implemented TOMPRO software. However, preparation of WA and financial reports are prepared on Excel based on data extracted from QB/TOMPRO. The quality of financial reports is adequate and annual financial statements for 2019 have been timely prepared. The Programme needs to completely switch to TOMPRO and discontinue using QuickBooks after satisfactory parallel run.

Staffing. The Finance team of two projects comprises of ten team members headed by a Senior Finance Manager. The mission again recommends that an international financial consultant may be engaged for a period of three to six months period for capacity building of finance team to ensure that they are able to do better planning, budgeting and monitoring functions.

Internal controls. The project has put in place appropriate internal control procedures including proper segregation of duties, expenditure authorization processes, bank reconciliations, etc.

Administrative management. Controls over consumable stores and petty cash, monitoring of fuel consumption and travel claims is satisfactory. Fixed Assets register has been maintained and physical verification of fixed assets is conducted periodically.

AWPB execution. Execution rates for 2020 (until Sep only) is quite low at 19% (USD 2.74 million as compared to USD 14.28 million budgeted). In Community Development it is 17% (USD 0.93 million out of USD 5.4 million budgeted) due to very low Civil Works / Community Infrastructure. For Livestock and Agriculture Development the execution rate is 19% (USD 1.18 million out of USD 6.36 million) due quite disbursement to FAO, Poultry Project and ICARDA. For Project Management, it is 56% (USD 0.62 million out of USD 1.11 million) which is reasonable considering that the execution rate is upto September 2020. The project also budgeted USD 1.41 million to be contributed by the Government, beneficiaries and implementing partners, however, actual numbers are usually available and recorded in the books after the year end.

Internal audit: An internal auditor was hired in 2018, audit plan for 2019 was prepared and a number of internal audits were conducted in 2019. The internal audit covered areas like office management, financial recording and reporting, internal control process, fixed assets recording and tagging, filing system, staff attendance, stock maintenance, procurement and also conducted field visits to verify various schemes. The audit reports appear to be detailed and of good quality and management comments on the observations have also been obtained. The internal audit reports have been shared with IFAD also. There is a need to follow-up on the internal audit reports to ensure that the recommendations have been complied with and the follow-up reports need to be shared with IFAD also.

Treasury and funds flow: The Programme needs to prepare proper rolling cash flow forecasts for six months period.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Preparation of six months rolling cash flow forecast.	Sr. Finance Manager	12/2020
Resolve accountability issue for the internal auditor and action on internal audit recommendations.	PMU	01/2021
New advance to DCA under the Additional Financing Provide a new advance to DCA of US 0,6 Million under the Additional Financing and recover the outstanding advance under the original financing.	PMU Finance Team	01/2021
Customization of TOMPRO and training. Contact TOMPRO provider to finalize customization and training. It is the third time this recommendation is repeated. PIM to be updated when phase-in of TOMPRO is concluded Complete switch to TOMPRO and discontinuation of QuickBooks after successful parallel run.	PMU Finance Team	01/2021
Capacity building of Financial Management Team An international financial consultant should be engaged for a period of three to six months period, for further capacity building and guidance of finance team.	Sr. Finance Manager	01/2021
Record of transactions Ensure parallel and timely recording of financial transactions both in Quickbooks and TOMPRO until the new software is fully deployed, training delivered and the finance staff becomes familiar with it.	finance team	
Internal control mechanisms Ensure the following internal control mechanisms are fully operational: - Contract monitoring forms always updated - Increased control on cash advances and limit the utilization of these - Realistic budget preparation and submission to IFAD within 60 days before year end	PMU and Programme Director	
Follow up on Internal Audit Reports Follow up on the internal audit reports to ensure that the recommendations have been complied with and the follow-up reports need to be shared with IFAD also	Internal Auditor	

Quality and Timeliness of Audit

Rating: 3

Previous rating: 3

Justification of rating

The audit report for financial year 2019 has been submitted to IFAD with 2 days delay, on 22 August 2020. The quality

and timeliness of the audit work is assessed as "Moderately Unsatisfactory".

Main issues

The auditors should respect deadlines of IFAD and submit audited financial statements to IFAD within the specified deadline. Also, as per the audit TOR and IFAD requirements, the auditors need to submit a Management Letter to IFAD. However, the management letter was not presented with the audit reports. It was submitted to IFAD on 28th October 2020 as per IFAD's request.

Counterparts Funds	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 4
---------------------------	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

Government contribution at appraisal was budgeted to be USD 3.76 million and until Sep 2010 USD 3.79 million (101%) has been contributed by the Government, which is substantially higher than IFAD grant utilization percentage.

Main issues

The following table shows the status of Government, Beneficiary and IP Contribution as of 30 Sept 2012 (amounts in USD 000):

Table - Government, Beneficiary and IP Contribution (USD 000)

Financier	Budget	Actual	%age
Government	3,765	3,795	101%
Beneficiary	5,282	2,820	53%
Co-Financier / IP	843	826	98%
Total	9,891	7,441	75%

Over the years the Programme has developed and documented policies and procedures for recording and reporting Government, Beneficiary and Co-financier contribution.

The Government contribution comprises of staff salaries of MAIL working for the Programme and office expenses of MAIL offices provided to the Programme.

Compliance with Loan Covenants	Rating: 4	Previous rating: 4
---------------------------------------	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

Moderately satisfactory. The Project has mostly complied with the Project Grant Agreement Covenants. For details please see Appendix 3.

Main issues

Most of the Project Grant Agreement Covenants have been complied with except that the goods financed by the project have not been insured due to non availability of appropriate insurance companies.

Procurement

Procurement	Rating: 4	Previous rating: 4
--------------------	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

Moderately satisfactory. Moderate difficulties experienced in procurement and in the submission of the procurement plan. Procurement is at times not in compliance with the approved plan; Documentation and decisions are of moderate quality. Application of procurement procedures is in general transparent.

Procurement Review

Procurement Plan: Updated PP are not submitted periodically to IFAD for review and No Objection. Methods of procurement in the plan and actual procurement are consistent with the provision of the Financing Agreement, Letter to the Recipient and the National procurement Law and rules of procedure. PP is not accessible publicly but PMIS is being upgraded by NPA to include the same. Some delays have been noted for some procurement packages of consultancy, goods and works under PP 2020. The estimated procurement timelines were impacted due to initial delays by the PMU and then Covid-19 from March 2020. The mission noted that 26 percent of the planned packages from PP2020 have been contracted till 16 November 2020. Consultancy package planned for 2020 has not been contracted so far. Formulae in cells providing actual amount in Procurement Plan template seem to have been deleted inadvertently by project staff and needs correction. Internal auditor has pointed out less number of quotation and non-usage of RFQ procedure in provinces, which should be rectified for further procurement as agreed by the management.

Processes and Procedures from Prequalification to bidding: During the mission, the randomly selected procurement of 9 packages were reviewed. The processes and procedure comply with the National Public Procurement law and regulations of Afghanistan consistent with IFAD's Procurement Guidelines. There is a need to improve on framing of specifications.

Process and Procedures for Evaluation and Contract Award: Nine procurement cases including seven post review were randomly selected and they were found to comply with the Public Procurement law and rules of procurement procedures of Afghanistan and consistent with IFAD's Procurement Guidelines. BER has included no conflict declaration from evaluation committee members but the same could not be reviewed being in Dari language. Time elapsed from bid opening to contract award for NCB procurement has been found to be more than 3 months in most cases, which may be reduced by preparing an acceptable timeline for each activity. There is strong case for reducing time spent by MIS and control sections in conducting their respective actions.

Review of Contract Administration and Management: The Contracts Register (C10) and Individual Contract Information/Payment Monitoring Template (C11) are up to date, with information on all the awarded contracts for the life of the Programme. Contract register provided to the mission contains some blank cells including absence of IFAD no objection dates in most cases. The Contract Management Officer (CMO) currently acts as a reviewer of documents for payment purposes and contract amendments. Contracts are managed by technical teams in consultation with the finance teams. IFAD has included contract monitoring system on the portal and the project must keep all contract data updated. Contracts for individual consultants are managed by human resources unit, rather than the CMO.

Review of Project procurement filing system and the ease of document retrieval: Physical filing system could not be reviewed due to remote mission. However, demanded documents were promptly provided which indicates that there is a consolidated filing system for the procurement records, which is available right up to the point of contract issuance. Thereafter, the information is managed by several technical and financial teams. PMU should file all the deliverable reports, payments records copies with the endorsement of the technical team and finance team including copies of delivery orders, receipt of goods in satisfactory condition and clearance of the payment request for goods and the same for consultancy services.

e. Key SIS Indicators

Likelihood of Achieving the Development Objective	Rating: 4.23	Previous rating: 4.0
Assessment of the Overall Implementation Performance	Rating: 3.83	Previous rating: 4.0

F. Relevance

Relevance	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 4
------------------	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

Satisfactory. In view of the considerable scope in Afghanistan for the coordinated development of the agriculture and livestock sectors to increase agricultural output, food security and household incomes and to address the government priorities articulated in various national and agriculture sector strategies, IFAD identified a strategic opportunity through design of CLAP for supporting the Government of Afghanistan in addressing the challenges of poverty reduction and food insecurity in rural areas. The project, objectives, components and approach are still relevant and in line with the objectives and priorities of the current Afghanistan National Peace and Development Framework 2017-2021 (ANPDF). The overarching goal of the framework is to reduce poverty and improve the welfare of people. Increasing agricultural productivity through multi-sectoral investments in irrigation resources, water management, improved planting materials, value chains increased wheat and cereal production, and expanding the depleted livestock herd are key objectives of APDC. Additionally, IFAD realigned the productive infrastructure subcomponent to respond to the government priority for

investment in irrigation sector development for food security.

In view of the sharp increase in the overall poverty rates of 55 percent in 2016-17 and the recent World Bank analysis that due to the combined effects of political, security and COVID 19 factors, the poverty rate may increase in the range of 61 percent and 72 percent in 2020, IFAD strategic objectives and investments/projects including CLAP has become more critical for support to restoration of livelihoods and building resilience of the rural poor who are exposed to shocks.

Main issues

G. Project Modifications

Responsibility	Modification type	Description
MOF/PMU/IFAD	Completion Date	COVID 19 lockdown and Impact severely affected implementation progress of the project. As originally planned completion of some of the activities particularly productive infrastructure is unlikely in a systematic matter during the current completion period of June 2022. Mission strongly recommends that the Government of Islamic Republic of Afghanistan (GoIRA) and IFAD shall consider one-year extension of the Programme completion date to allow successful completion of the project to achieve its objectives. More importantly the extension will provide opportunities to support the recovery and resilience of livelihood of project target group affected by the COVID 19 and rising poverty levels.
MOF/PMU/IFAD	Reallocation	In view of the extension of the project period and availability balances and unspent unallocated funds, service providers agreements will be extended accordingly and scope and scaling up of some successful high impact activities is proposed. Please see details in section D. Overview and Project Progress II. Component II - Livestock and Agriculture Development for details. The proposed Reallocation table will be prepared after working out the estimated requirements and available balances.

H. Lessons Learned

Participatory Development Approaches

The participatory development process followed by the project, including establishing and strengthening community institutions and involvement of communities in every step of project cycle not only respond directly to community and households development priorities but also creates a strong sense of ownership among community and its households, which manifests in a robust sustainability and smooth exit.

Nutrition awareness and training

Impact of improved agriculture and livestock productivity and household incomes on food and nutrition status, could only be realised on appropriate knowledge and skills of HH particularly women on food and nutrition security issues. Providing women with training on nutrition and hygiene practices contributes to improving households' nutrition and disease prevention. More than 90 percent of women who participated in a hygiene and nutrition training by WFP reported that they have changed their cooking and feeding practices ([Afghanistan- Reinforcing Smallholder Farmers. WFP, 2015](#)).

PPP mode of Service Delivery

One of the key constraints of agriculture and livestock sector is the poor institutional infrastructure with limited outreach for cost effective extension and veterinary services. To address the challenge, a system of community male and female extension workers and community Veterinary Field Units (VFUs) was adopted in IFAD financed RMLSP and in CLAP for agriculture and livestock development. These community extension workers network proved to be an excellent sustainable model of private-sector service delivery and has become to be a reliable partner in public-private partnership with government public Services delivery institutions. Notably professionally trained paravet selected by communities, establish their own private, fee-for-service Veterinary Field Units in their local community. The paravets are licensed by

mail to practice veterinary services and are also sometimes engaged to perform public sector functions through a public private partnership arrangement. The women community extension workers initiative is particularly very important from women point of view as their access to service for cultural reasons is severely limited because of lack of women extension staff in public institutions.

Holistic and integrated approach

Project are likely to enhance impact if they focus on holistic and integrated approach for sub-sectors which can help farmers build their resilience and food security and adopt a value chain approach to improve the quality of inputs, provide supporting infrastructure particularly irrigation, introduction of technologies and improved and climate resilient practices, reduce post-harvest losses and establish sustainable links to markets.

I. Agreed Actions

<i>Agreed Action</i>	<i>Responsibility</i>	<i>Agreed Date</i>
Overview and Project Progress		
Extension of Project Period In view of slowing down of the project implementation progress the Government of Islamic Republic of Afghanistan (GoIRA) and IFAD shall consider requesting one-year extension of the Programme completion date. Accordingly, service providers agreement shall also be extended. Please see section G: Project Modifications (Reallocation among categories) for cost estimates	PST/MAIL/MoF/IFAD	12/2020
AWPB 2021 The AWPB from 2021 onwards shall take into consideration the lost momentum during 2020 due to COVID 19, enhanced targets for some activities and the extension of the project. All physical activities shall be completed by Dec 2020 to all time for consolidation and transfer of planning and implementation responsibilities to public institutions and community groups during the last six months of the extended period	PST/PMU	12/2020
Scaling Up of successful interventions In view of the proposed project extension, subsequent extension of agreements with service providers and availability of unspent unallocated amounts: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • the scope of establishment of VFUs be extended to other project provinces by training 100 additional paravet.by DCA. • Target for Cattle/livestock management training women by FAO shall be increased from existing 3,200 to 4,200. • In view of the positive outcomes of the, the scope of the pilot climate Conservation Agriculture activity by ICARDA shall be expanded Please see section G: Project Modifications (Reallocation among categories) for cost estimates	PST/PMU	03/2021
Successful operation and business sustainability of dairy plant The mission recommends focus on addressing the challenges for successful operation and business sustainability of dairy plant in the remaining period of the project.	FAO	
Development Effectiveness		

Planning and tracking Gender Budget Develop accelerated plan for spending and tracking the gender budget as part of AWP/B 2021	PMU/Gender Officer	01/2021
Gender Training Gender Training/Activities for Men and Youth	PMU/Gender Officer	01/2021
Synergies between CLAP and SNaPP2 Introduce the SNaPP2 integrated approach of complementing water availability/irrigation schemes with extension services and capacity building and linkages with markets and private sector through the 4P model.	PMU	01/2021
Capacity building climate change Strengthening the monitoring capacity of project staff and community groups through dedicated trainings sessions on sensitization and on adopting climate smart technologies	PMU/Service Providers	02/2021
Gender Indicator Reporting Report on the three gender indicators mentioned in the text	M&E Officer	03/2021
Implementation of ISM Recommendations Implement all the gender recommendations of ISM undertaken in Aug 2020	PD	03/2021
Youth and Women Participation M&E system to track people's participation Project M&E system to capture youth and women participation in forums and institutions developed by the project and complete the end targets	M&E Officer	06/2021
Outreach and Inclusion of target groups Develop an exit strategy for CBEWs with the aim to enhance their expertise; to provide them gainful employment and service to the community	PMU	06/2021
Sustainability and Scaling up		
Preparation of ESMPs Complete site specific ESMPs for sample 3-4 relatively larger irrigation schemes	CLAP	02/2021
New law on taxation of dairy cooperatives Pursue early finalisation and promulgation of new law with relevant ministries. Technical assistance could be provided through the project policy support, if required.	MAIL/FAO/CLAP	03/2021

Policy Papers Prepare policy position papers including recommendations on transboundary disease prevention control particularly for Foot and mouth disease (FMD) and on nutrition management and utilization of agriculture waste and by product for dissemination through KM and pursuing with relevant government ministries.	MAIL/DCA/CLAP	03/2021
Exist Strategy, Sustainability and Consolidation Phase To capitalise on the capacity building initiatives of ministries staff and community and achieve successful handover of transfer of implementation and O&M responsibilities to ministries and community institutions/CDCs, the project shall prepare an exit strategy in consultation with service provider, for consolidation of public institutions and communities capacities during the remaining project period and transfer of responsibilities to respective ministries and community institutions.	PMU/Service providers	03/2021
self-help groups Develop plans to integrate the CLAP SHGs under Ministry of Rural Rehabilitation and Development (MRRD), Government of Afghanistan national SHG programme: Women's Economic Empowerment – Rural Development Project (WEE-RDP) for sustainability and improving women's economic empowerment	PD	06/2021
Enhanced participation of Women and Youth Mentorship and coaching of women and youth to meaningfully participate in management of Mirabs and Irrigation Associations and Kuchi Councils and Board	PMU	06/2021
Participation in in-country donor forum As far as possible, remote participation of IFAD in in-country donor forum/meetings be ensured till such time that mission visits are allowed.	IFAD CD	
Project Management		
Recruitment of provincial M&E staff The process for recruitment and capacity building provincial M&E staff shall be completed	PST/MAIL	01/2021
Completion of GIS based M&E system To overcome the shortcoming of remote monitoring due to travel restrictions GIS & remote Sensing Specialist shall be immediately engaged and the system completed	PST	03/2021
KM Sharing The project KM team agreed to work with NWARA for the new AIWRDP project to provide assistance by sharing lessons learned from working with KM on SNaPP2/CLAP. This feeds back to previous agreed actions that MAIL In view of the potential of learning and scaling up of successful experiences of the Programme should share these with relevant ministries.	NPD and KM specialist	

Strengthening SECAP Monitoring Project should strengthen its monitoring activities on SECAP implementation while adequately capturing and documenting the adaptive and mitigation measures supported through adequate evidence (data, pictures etc.).	CLAP E&S Focal Peron / CLAP Management	
Financial Management & Execution		
Preparation of six months rolling cash flow forecast.	Sr. Finance Manager	12/2020
Resolve accountability issue for the internal auditor and action on internal audit recommendations.	PMU	01/2021
New advance to DCA under the Additional Financing Provide a new advance to DCA of US 0,6 Million under the Additional Financing and recover the outstanding advance under the original financing.	PMU Finance Team	01/2021
Customization of TOMPRO and training. Contact TOMPRO provider to finalize customization and training. It is the third time this recommendation is repeated. PIM to be updated when phase-in of TOMPRO is concluded Complete switch to TOMPRO and discontinuation of QuickBooks after successful parallel run.	PMU Finance Team	01/2021
Capacity building of Financial Management Team An international financial consultant should be engaged for a period of three to six months period, for further capacity building and guidance of finance team.	Sr. Finance Manager	01/2021
Record of transactions Ensure parallel and timely recording of financial transactions both in Quickbooks and TOMPRO until the new software is fully deployed, training delivered and the finance staff becomes familiar with it.	finance team	
Review of claims presented by IPs Improve the review of claims presented by IPs before submission of WAs to IFAD to reduce the risk of misclassification of expenditures	Finance team	
Internal control mechanisms Ensure the following internal control mechanisms are fully operational: - Contract monitoring forms always updated - Increased control on cash advances and limit the utilization of these - Realistic budget preparation and submission to IFAD within 60 days before year end	PMU and Programme Director	
Submission of WA:WA to be submitted at least once in three months or upon utilization 30% of the initial advance whichever is earlier.	Sr. Finance Manager	

Follow up on Internal Audit Reports	Internal Auditor	
Follow up on the internal audit reports to ensure that the recommendations have been complied with and the follow-up reports need to be shared with IFAD also		

Afghanistan

Community Livestock and Agriculture Project Supervision Report

Logical Framework

Mission Dates: 26 October to 10 December 2020
Document Date: 05/01/2021
Project No. 1100001637
Report No. 5611-AF

Asia and the Pacific Division
Programme Management Department

Community Livestock and Agriculture Project

Logical Framework

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of Verification			Assumptions
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2020)	Cumulative Result (2020)	Cumulative Result % (2020)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility	
Outreach	1 Persons receiving services promoted or supported by the project										
	Females				3 038	19 517					
	Males				30 195	204 887					
	Total number of persons receiving services				33 233	224 404					
	Female										
	1.a Corresponding number of households reached										
	Women-headed households		8 577		2 490	19 705					
	Non-women-headed households		86 724		21 997	171 615					
	Households		95 281	223 000	24 487	192 320	86.2				
	1.b Estimated corresponding total number of households members										
	Household members		571 809	1 338 000	164 409	1 414 756	105.7				
Project Goal To contribute to reduce poverty in rural Afghanistan	Decrease of population below the poverty line							RIMS impact survey	Baseline, mid-term, completion	PST	Inflation remains low; no security challenges in project area
	Population below poverty line	69	71	59							

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of Verification			Assumptions
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2020)	Cumulative Result (2020)	Cumulative Result % (2020)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility	
Development Objective To improve food security of rural households in selected districts of the provinces of Kabul, Parwan, Logar, Herat, Nangarhar, Balkh and Baghlan by increasing agriculture and livestock productivity	Households reporting decreased food insecurity							outcome survey	start, mid-term, end	service providers, PMU	No major security problems in the project target areas. No major natural disasters. No major drought.
	food insecure households	38	1.8								
	Households reporting an increase in income										
	households		18	30		77	256.7				
Outcome 1. Enhanced capacities of local communities and local institutions for the participatory planning and operation of small and medium scale irrigation infrastructure	Households expressing satisfaction with the quality of services provided by local government agencies staff							AOS, key informant interview	Annual	service providers, PMU	No major security problems in the project target areas. No socio-cultural barriers for the participation of poorest and marginalized households in local planning processes. No resistance from traditional leaders vis à vis women participation in local planning and decision-making processes. Clear roles and responsibilities for irrigation development.
	households		34	70		80	114.3				

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of Verification			Assumptions
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2020)	Cumulative Result (2020)	Cumulative Result % (2020)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility	
Output 1.1 Creation and completion of small- and medium-scale irrigation infrastructure and drinking water schemes	1.1.2 Farmland under water-related infrastructure constructed/rehabilitated							outcome surveys	annual	PMU	No major security problems in the project target areas. No socio-cultural barriers for the participation of poorest and marginalized households No resistance from traditional leaders vis à vis women participation in local planning and decision-making processes. Clear roles and responsibilities between MRRD and MAIL for irrigation development.
	Hectares of land		4 058	64 600	35 519	155 453	240.6				
	Other productive infrastructure constructed/rehabilitated							records	annual	PMU	
	irrigation schemes		37	164	11	153	93.3				
Output 1.2 Capacity of population and local institutions strengthened	CDC members trained in infrastructure operation and maintenance							CDC/group records, outcome surveys	annual	service providers	No major security problems in the project target areas. No socio-cultural barriers for the participation of poorest and marginalized households No resistance from traditional leaders vis à vis women participation in local planning and decision-making processes.
	Males		1 728	13 532	0	1 828	13.5				
	Females		440	6 766	0	420	6.2				
	3.1.1 Groups supported to sustainably manage natural resources and climate-related risks										
	Groups supported		127	164	0	138	84.1				
	members of irrigation associations trained										
	members		381	492	0	601	122.2				

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of Verification			Assumptions
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2020)	Cumulative Result (2020)	Cumulative Result % (2020)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility	
Outcome 2. Increased agriculture and livestock productivity and incomes, in particular for women-headed households and vulnerable and marginalized rural communities	1.2.4 Households reporting an increase in production							CDC records, key informant interview	annual	service providers, PMU	No major security problems in the project target areas No major natural disasters in the project target areas. Sufficient rainfalls. Irrigation infrastructure is used for growing legal crops. No major animal disease outbreak (such a bird flu disease).
	Households		85	100	96	96	96				
	Women-headed households				5 510	5 510					
	Non-women-headed households				178 158	178 158					
	Households				183 668	183 668					
Output 2.1 Establishing and strengthening diary milk production and a centralised Dairy Federation	1.1.4 Persons trained in production practices and/or technologies							surveys	annual	PMU	No animal disease outbreak
	Total number of attendances to training sessions				1 756	10 190					
	Men trained in livestock		3 060	5 000	1 515	6 199	124				
	Women trained in livestock		2 928	5 000	241	3 991	79.8				
	Total persons trained in livestock		5 988	10 000	1 756	10 190	101.9				
	fodder seeds and fertilizers distributed							surveys	annual	PMU	
	tonne		51	101	0	68.97	68.3				
	Trainings provided to farmers							CDC records	annual	PMU	

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of Verification			Assumptions
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2020)	Cumulative Result (2020)	Cumulative Result % (2020)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility	
	days per farmer		5 988		0	4 719					
	2.1.3 Rural producers' organizations supported										
	Rural POs supported		33	90	0	36	40				
	Males		3 036	5 000	0	4 302	86				
	Females		60		0	60					
Output 2.2 Poultry development to improve food and nutritional security through enhanced poultry production and productivity	1.1.8 Households provided with targeted support to improve their nutrition							outcome survey	annual	service providers, PMU	no major animal disease outbreak
	Total persons participating			40 000	0	0	0				
	Households		13 332	40 000	0	0	0				
	Household members benefitted			240 000	0	0	0				
	Women-headed households				0	0					
	Non-women-headed households				0	0					
	1.1.4 Persons trained in production practices and/or technologies							surveys	annual	PMU	
	Total number of attendances to training sessions				0	13 332					
	Men trained in livestock			0	0	0	NaN				

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of Verification			Assumptions
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2020)	Cumulative Result (2020)	Cumulative Result % (2020)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility	
	Women trained in livestock		13 332	40 000	0	13 332	33.3				
	Total persons trained in livestock		13 332	40 000	0	13 332	33.3				
	1.1.3 Rural producers accessing production inputs and/or technological packages										
	Females		13 332	40 000	0	13 332	33.3				
	Males				0	0					
	Total rural producers				0	13 332					
Outcome 3. Introducing, developing and promoting new drought-resistant and high yielding improved varieties of production	1.2.2 Households reporting adoption of new/improved inputs, technologies or practices							outcome survey	annual	service providers, PMU	Research activities and trials are successful; relevance of new varieties to farmers' needs; availability of necessary resources and equipment
	Households		40 007	120 000	31 125	135 600	113				
	Village Based Seed Enterprises (VBSE) producing 1000-2000 MT of certified seeds							surevys	annual	PMU	
	tons of production of certified seeds		400	2 000	876	3 645	182.3				
Output 3.1 Demonstration and dissemination of high yielding crop varieties organised through participatory approaches	1.1.4 Persons trained in production practices and/or technologies							CDC records, training reports, SPC reports	annual	service providers, PMU	Research activities and trials are successful; relevance of new varieties to farmers' needs; availability of necessary resources and equipment
	Total number of attendances to training sessions				0	4 496					
	Men trained in crop		2 745		0	3 098					
	Women trained in crop		624		0	1 398					

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of Verification			Assumptions
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2020)	Cumulative Result (2020)	Cumulative Result % (2020)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility	
	Total persons trained in crop		3 369	7 237	0	4 496	62.1				
	VBSE members trained in seed production										
	Males		350		0	924					
	Females		66		0	521					
Output 3.2 Promoting livestock development among Kuchis to enhance livelihoods and resilience against predictable livestock emergencies	Kutchi households benefitting from Kutchi component							outcome surveys	annual	service providers, PMU	Kuchi pastoralists agree to pay for veterinary services
	Kuchi households		10 584	50 000	4 511	45 785	91.6				
	1.1.3 Rural producers accessing production inputs and/or technological packages										
	Females			2 250	307	5 300	235.6				
	Males			2 250	1 028	17 216	765.2				
	Total rural producers			4 500	1 335	22 516	500.4				

Afghanistan

Community Livestock and Agriculture Project Supervision Report

Appendix 1: Financial: actual financial performance; by financier by component and disbursements by category

Mission Dates: 26 October to 10 December 2020
Document Date: 05/01/2021
Project No. 1100001637
Report No. 5611-AF

Asia and the Pacific Division
Programme Management Department

Appendix 1: Financial: actual financial performance by financier; by component and disbursements by category

Table 1A: Financial performance by financier (USD '000) on 30 Sep 2020

Financier	Appraisal	Disbursements	Per cent disbursed
IFAD Grant	58,002	42,299	73
IFAD Additional Grant	25,000	5,090	20
Government	3,765	3,795	101
Beneficiaries	5,282	2,820	53
Co-financier	843	826	98
TOTAL	92,893	54,830	59

Table 1B: Financial performance by financier by component (USD '000) till 30 Sep 2020

	IFAD Grant			IFAD Additional Grant			Government			Beneficiaries			Co-financier			Total		
Component	Appraisal	Actual	%	Appraisal	Actual	%	Appraisal	Actual	%	Appraisal	Actual	%	Appraisal	Actual	%	Appraisal	Actual	%
Community Development	21,377	16,759	78	10,240	2,700	26	1,693	2,249	133	3,171	1,802	57	-	-	-	36,481	23,510	64
Livestock & Agricultural Development	25,246	20,210	80	10,260	2,143	21	1,591	1,290	81	2,112	1,018	48	843	826	98	40,052	25,487	64
Project Management	11,379	5,330	47	4,500	247	5	481	256	53	-	-	-	-	-	-	16,360	5,833	36
Total	58,002	42,299	73	25,000	5,090	20	3,765	3,795	101	5,282	2,820	53	843	826	98	92,893	54,830	59

Table 1C-1: IFAD Grant disbursements (SDR, as at 30 Sep 2020)

No	Category description	Original Allocation	Revised Allocation	Disbursement	WA to be prepared	Balance	Per cent disbursed
I	Civil works, Community Infrastructure	12,750,000	15,289,000	11,127,172	55,540	4,106,289	73%
II	Vehicles, Motorcycles, Equipment & Materials	2,640,000	5,009,000	2,056,428	31,267	2,921,305	41%
III	Technical Assistance, Training and Studies	7,600,000	6,203,000	4,920,075	336,511	946,413	79%
IV	Salaries and Allowances	6,620,000	8,237,000	7,675,635	518,684	42,681	93%
V	Incremental Operating Costs	1,430,000	1,644,000	1,676,837	32,751	(65,587)	102%
VI	Policy Support Fund	320,000	368,000	361,478	7,021	(499)	98%
VII	Special Financing Facility	2,270,000	900,000	-	-	900,000	0%
	Unallocated	4,020,000	-	-	-	-	#DIV/0!
	Initial Advance	-	-	1,446,936	-	(1,446,936)	#DIV/0!
	Advance - FAO	-	-	522,537	-	(522,537)	-
	Advance - ICARDA	-	-	332,695	-	(332,695)	-
	Total	37,650,000	37,650,000	30,119,792	981,774	6,548,434	80%

Table 1C-2: IFAD Additional Grant disbursements (SDR, as at 30 Sep 2020)

No	Category description	Original Allocation	Disbursement	WA to be prepared	Balance	Per cent disbursed
I	Civil works, Community Infrastructure	6,300,000	1,296,189	430,347	4,573,464	21%
II	Vehicles, Motorcycles, Equipment & Materials	-	-	-	-	
III	Technical Assistance, Training and Studies	4,700,000	1,644,541	69,545	2,985,913	35%
IV	Salaries and Allowances	2,800,000	284,833	88,321	2,426,846	10%
V	Incremental Operating Costs	1,400,000	129,627	16,936	1,253,437	9%
VI	Policy Support Fund	400,000	-	133,116	266,884	0%
VII	Special Financing Facility	-	-	-	-	
	Unallocated	2,100,000	-	-	2,100,000	0%
	Initial Advance	-	1,451,024	-	(1,451,024)	
	Total	17,700,000	4,806,214	738,266	12,155,520	27%

Afghanistan

Community Livestock and Agriculture Project Supervision Report

Appendix 2: Physical progress measured against AWP&B

Mission Dates: 26 October to 10 December 2020
Document Date: 05/01/2021
Project No. 1100001637
Report No. 5611-AF

Asia and the Pacific Division
Programme Management Department

Appendix 2: Physical progress measured against AWP&B

Objective Hierarchy	Indicator		Period: 01-Jan-2020 to 30-Sep-2020			Cumulative Actual	Appraisal Target	%
			AWP&B	Actual	%			
Goal: To contribute to reduce poverty in rural Afghanistan Development objective: To improve food security of 169,500 rural households in selected districts in the provinces of Kabul, Parwan, and Logar by increasing agriculture and livestock productivity.	% decrease in population below the poverty line (Target: 10% decrease from 2012 baseline)					71%	10% 59%	-2%
	% decrease in child malnutrition (under 5 yrs old, chronic, acute-underweight)(Target: 5% decrease from 2012 baseline) ^a					0	5%	
	% increase of agriculture/livestock productivity (measured as quantity of milk/cow, n. of eggs/chick, yield/ha) among households targeted by the project ■ Targets:		30	63	210	36.75	30%	122.5
			230 Eggs/chick/Y ear	230/eggs	100%	230eggs/Chick/year	230	100%
		- 100% increase in milk/cow	0	0		9	8	260
		- 100% increase in annual milk production/hh	0	0		4015	1835	438
		- 1.16 m eggs produced by beneficiary hh in Yr 6		10.8 M		18.9	1.16 m	1629%

	- Yield/ha (kg) of certified seeds (1 st and 2 nd planting): wheat (3.4, 2.55); lentil (0.5, 0.38); chickpea (1.0; 0.73); mungbean (0.9, 0.7); potato (19.1, 14.34); tomato (38.3, 28.69); onion (31.9, 23.91); beans (0.7, 0.48)			Wheat (72 %) Lentil (57 %) Chickpea (229 %) Mungbean (23 %) Tomaton (90 %) Onion (56 %)		36.75%	15-45%	
	- No. of households with increased agriculture productivity (Target: 169,500)			0		103754	121000	85.7%
	No. of households with increased livestock productivity (Target: 169,500)	0	0	0%	3036	3000	101%	
Outcome 1 (Community Development) Capacity of local communities and local institutions enhanced, cultivable land increased, agriculture production/productivity increased, health condition improved and water-borne diseases decreased.	- % increase in agriculture productivity (yield/ha) (Target: +10%)					10	10%	100%
	- No of households benefiting from productive infrastructures (Target: 115,000).					22023	115,000	19%
Output 1.1 (Productive Infrastructures) Crop yield increased, income opportunities increased, health conditions improved (thanks to the construction of small-	- % reduction in water-borne diseases(Target: 8% reduction from baseline)					0	8%	
	- % increase in No. of hh having access to drinking water and sanitation facilities(Target: 1.3% increase from baseline).					0	1.3%	

scale productive infrastructures).	- % increase in agriculture productivity (yield/ha)(Target: 10% increase from baseline)					10%	10%	100%
Output 1.2 (Community Development and Institutional Strengthening) Capacity of beneficiary communities/community organizations and local government agencies strengthened.	- % of beneficiaries expressing satisfaction on the quality of services provided by local government agencies staff (measured through questionnaires)					80%	0	80%
	▪ (Target: at least 80%) - % of organization members expressing satisfaction on the quality of management of community organizations (measured through questionnaires) (Target: at least 80%) ^b					0	80%	
Output 1.3 (Gender Mainstreaming) Role/Involvement of women in productive activities and productive potential increased.	- % increase of women who have control of productive assets					0		
	- % increase in net income among women ^c					0		
	- % of female professional staff (among MAIL/DAIL and SPs) (Target: at least 25%).					14%	25%	
Outcome 2 (Livestock and Agriculture Development)	- Increase in average hh income from dairy		10%	10%	100%	35%	200	17.5%

Increased agriculture and livestock productivity	▪ (Target: +200%) (Expected n. of beneficiary hh: 3,000)*		1000	10001	100%	3036	3000	101%
	- Increase in net income of poultry keeping hh		\$ 250/annum	\$ 301	120%	\$250	25,000	
	▪ (Target: +400%) (Expected n. of beneficiary hh:25,000)							
	- Increase in net income of adopters		Not planed					
	▪ (Target: at least 100%) (Expected n. of beneficiary hh: 81,055)					0	81,055	
	- Increase in net income of livestock keepers							
	▪ (Target: +25%) (Expected n. of beneficiary hh: 20,000)					0	20,000	
Output 2.1 (Dairy Development) Milk production and productivity increased; dairy milk processing and marketing improved	- Increase in average number of cattle per family (Target: from 1.254 to 1.75)		0.2	0.2	100%	1.66	1.75	95%
	- Increase in milk consumption at hh level (Target: 1.5 l/day)		1	0.5	50%	3.4	1.5	226%
	- Increase in average hh income from dairy (Target: +200%)		10	10	100%	35	200	17.5%
	- Nb of demonstration plots		100	186	186%	3714	3000	123.8%
	- Seeds distributed (Kg)		150	279	186%	13470.75	15000	89.8%

	- Number of cattle vaccinated		7500	12253	163%	178954	24000	745%
	- Number of cattle de-wormed		6000	8325	139%	72284	24000	301%
	- Treatment of individual cattle		8000	8454	106%	65744	24000	274%
	- Number of dairy cows regularly monitored for fertility.		2000	2668	133.4	14878	8000	186%
	- Nb of inseminated cows		5000	8847	177%	57668	45000	128%
	- Nb dairy kite distributed to women		250	592	267%	3863	3000	129%
	- Nb of Farmer trained for preventive animal health			1880	100%	11579	6000	193%
Output 2.2 (Poultry Development) Traditional fowl systems strengthened; small-scale commercially viable poultry systems developed	- Increase in egg production for traditional birds (Target: 12 per annum)		0	0	0%	230	153%	
	- Decrease in mortality rate (Target: from 3% to 1.5%)		3 -1.5%	3 – 1.5%	50%	3-1.5%	3-1.5%	
	- Increase in net income of poultry keeping hh (Target: +400%)		\$ 18	\$ 301		\$ 301	1672%	
	- No of beneficiaries selected (female only)		1400	13076	0%	13332		%
	- No of beneficiaries trained (female only)		1400	0	0%	13332		%
	- No of beneficiaries receiving pullets		1400	0	0%	13332		%
	- No of pullets distributed		0	0	0%	199980		

Output 2.3 (Improved Food, Fodder, and Vegetable Crops) New drought resistant and high yielding improved varieties of wheat, food and forage legumes, and vegetables developed and adopted.	- Number of farmers adopting new seeds and related best practices (Target: +81,000)					103754	121000	86%
	- % increase of food, fodder, and vegetable production (Target: +30-60% over existing rates)					36.75	30	122.5%
	- Increase in net income of adopters (target: at least +100%).						178	
	- Number of participatory evaluations Trials conducted	40	159	397.50 %	646		222	290.99%
	- No. of participatory demonstrations with improved crop cultivars and with good agricultural practices laid out.	63	69	109.52 %	1491		1353	110.20%
	- No.of farmers visited the demonstration fields during field days.	280	0	0%	3001		3300	91%
	- No. of Field days conducted	3	0	0%	26		33	78%
	- No. of FFS organized	0	0	0%	6		6	100%
	- Number of VBSEs that developed linkages with market agencies (bags, testing)	0	0	0%	9		9	100%
	- No. of VBSEs registered	0	0	0%	7		7	100%
	- No. of Kitchen Gardens established	0	0	0%	1180		853	100%

	- General support to VBSE-LS		9	9	100%	9	9	100%
	- Certified seed of wheat, chickpea, lentil, forage & vegetable crops (district to supported for 6 years) (foundation seed provided to VBSEs)		9	16	177.78	12	58	480.83
Output 2.4 (Livestock Development among the Kutchi) Livelihoods among Kutchi enhanced	- % reduction in prevailing mortality rates for shoats and cattle (Target: +10%)		2%	2%	100	6%	10%	60%
	- Increase in daily milk production (Target: +0.05 l)		0.2 inc/Liter/sheep	0.1	50%	0.4	0.5	80%
	- Increase in net income of livestock keepers (Target: +25%)		12%	12%	100%	24%	25%	96
	- Vaccination		700,000	1,599,155	228%	7,345,910	4,800,000	153%
	- Treatment		200,000	786,479	393%	2,281,697	1,690,000	135%
	- De worming		300,000	924,194	308%	4,388,815	2,280,000	192%
	- Farmers trained in extension by sessions		5,000	30,970	619%	46,433	23,500	197%
	- VFU monthly Support Package (Report Writing, Rent etc) \$40 pm		139	160	115%	160	174	92%
	- Need assessment Survey		0	0	0%	3	3	100%
	- Refurbishments of selected VFUs		20	20	100%	126	113	111%

	- Train VFU staff and field extension workers on extension package		20	71	355%	278	219	127%
	- Number of Para-vet trained		8	8	100%	60	60	100%
	- Number of feeder bank established		0	0	0%	15	15	100%

Afghanistan

Community Livestock and Agriculture Project Supervision Report

Appendix 3: Compliance with legal covenants: status of implementation

Mission Dates: 26 October to 10 December 2020
Document Date: 05/01/2021
Project No. 1100001637
Report No. 5611-AF

Asia and the Pacific Division
Programme Management Department

Appendix 3: Compliance with legal covenants: status of implementation

Section	Covenant	Target/Action Due Date	Compliance Status/Date	Remarks
Grant Agreement Section B – Para 3, Section E Para 2(d)	The recipient shall open and maintain two Designated Accounts denominated in USD in a bank acceptable to the Fund for purpose of receiving Grant and Additional Grant Financing for the project. The Designated Grant Account shall be operated by the Ministry of Finance.	On Grant effectiveness	Complied	Two designation accounts have been opened in the Da Afghanistan Bank (DAB)
Grant Agreement Section B – Para 4	The Recipient shall provide in-kind contribution financing for the project in the amount of USD 3.765 million.	Throughout the project	Ongoing	As per Project, the Government has contributed USD 3.795 million (101%) until Sep 2020.
Grant Agreement Section B – Para 4	The beneficiaries shall contribute to the Project up to the amount of USD 5.32 million in the form of cash, in kind and/or through labour.	Throughout the project	Ongoing	As per project, the beneficiaries have contributed USD 2.820 million (53%) until Sep 2020.
Grant Agreement Section B – Para 4	The implementing partners shall contribute an amount of USD 0.38 / 0.826 milliommn to the Project.	Throughout the project	Ongoing	As per project, the beneficiaries have contributed USD 0.826 million (98%) until Sep 2020.
Section 7.11 of the General Conditions.	The National Project Director shall have been appointed	Condition precedent to withdrawal	Complied	
Grant Agreement Section E Para 2 Sub Clause (b)	The Programme Support Team (PST) must have been established	Condition precedent to withdrawal	Complied	
Grant Agreement Section E Para 2 Sub Clause (c)	The Project Steering Committee shall have been established	Condition precedent to withdrawal	Complied	
Grant Agreement Section E – Para 2 Sub Clause (d)	The PIM shall have been adopted by the Lead Project Agency, substantially in the form approved by the Fund	Condition precedent to withdrawal	Complied	
Grant Agreement Section E – Para 3 Sub Clause (a)	Contracts for Services shall have been executed between the LPA and the Service Providers and IFAD has endorsed respective AWPB as approved by PSC.	Condition precedent to withdrawal for SPs	Complied	
Grant Agreement Section E – Para 3 Sub Clause (b)	IFAD approval of proposal of expenditure under Policy Support Fund and Special Financing Facility	Condition precedent to withdrawal for Category VI and VII.	Partially Complied	Expenditure under Policy Support Fund is being incurred while no expenditure under Special Financing Facility is bring incurred.
Grant Agreement Schedule 3 – Para 7	The agreement/contract of services of each Service Provider (SP) shall specify that the SPs will make available to the recipient through the PST the statement of sources and uses of funds in respect of each fiscal year within two months of the end of each fiscal year.	Throughout the programme period	Not fully Complied	Not all agreements/MOUs with SPs specify provision of statement within two months of the end of the fiscal year.

Grant Agreement Schedule 3 – Para 8	The agreement/contract of services of each Service Provider (SP) shall specify that the SPs will appoint an external independent auditor to audit their financial statements relating to the project and should be submitted to the recipient through the PST, within five months after the end of each fiscal year.	Throughout the programme period	Complied	
General Conditions – Section 4.02 (b)	No withdrawal shall be made until the first AWP&B has been approved by the Fund.	From first year of programme	Complied	
General Conditions – Section 7.01 (b) (ii)	The LPA shall submit the draft AWP&B to the Fund no later than sixty days before the beginning of the relevant project year	21 October	Complied	
General Conditions – Section 7.08 (b) (ii)	The Recipient shall insure goods, which are financed by the Financing against hazards in accordance with sound commercial practice.	Throughout the programme period	Not Complied	No insurance companies in Afghanistan
General Conditions – Section 8.03 (a)	The LPA should submit progress reports to the Fund containing at least the minimum information spelt therein.	Throughout the programme period	Complied	
General Conditions – Section 11.01 Letter to Recipient- Paragraph 6	The proceeds of the financing shall not be used for the payment of taxes	Throughout the programme period	Complied	
LTR - Para 20	IFAD prior review of procurement for goods and works above USD 50,000 and consulting services above USD 30,000	Throughout the programme period	Complied	
LTR - Para 25	The first auditor should have been appointed within 120 days from the date of entry into force	First Year	Not Complied	
LTR - Para 25	For each fiscal year, the auditors should be appointed within 120 days of the beginning of the fiscal year. As per the new IFAD's Handbook for Financial Reporting and Auditing of IFAD Financed Projects, the auditors should be appointed 30 days before the start of the financial year.	21 Mar 2016 (2016) 21 Mar 2017 (2017) 30 Nov 2017 (2018) 30 Nov 2018 (2019)	Complied	A contract signed with audit firm in 2018, which is also covering FY2019. TOR is reviewed/ amended each year as recommended by IFAD. TOR for FY2019 has been amended in January 2020.
General Conditions –Section 9.03 (b)	The recipient shall within six months of the end of fiscal year furnish to the Fund, the audited financial along with the audit report.	21 June 2020	Complied	Delayed due to COVID only.

Afghanistan

Community Livestock and Agriculture Project Supervision Report

Appendix 5: Mission preparation and planning, TORs, schedules, people met

Mission Dates: 26 October to 10 December 2020
Document Date: 05/01/2021
Project No. 1100001637
Report No. 5611-AF

Asia and the Pacific Division
Programme Management Department

Annex V Terms of Reference for Consultants and other persons hired by IFAD to participate in missions under a non-staff contract

MISSION DETAILS	
Country of Assignment/Location:	Afghanistan and remote (Italy, China, India and Pakistan)
Mission Name:	Community Livestock and Agriculture Programme (CLAP) supervision Support to National Priority Programme 2 Supervision
Mission Start Date:	28 October 2020 tbc
Mission End Date:	7 December 2020 tbc
Division/Department:	APR
Reports to (name and title):	Candra Samekto, Country Programme Manager

MISSION COMPOSITION (Team members' full name and specialization)	
Name:	Specialization:
Candra Samekto	IFAD Country Programme Manager (Country Director and Mission Leader)
Qaim Shah	Agriculture and Rural Development Specialist (Team Leader CLAP)
Karim Merchant	Rural Livelihoods Specialist (Team Leader SNAPP 2)
Liam Chicca	IFAD, APR Lead Portfolio Advisor
Elizabeth Ssendiwala	IFAD Senior Technical Specialist, Rural Institutions (PTL CLAP)
Michael Hamp	IFAD Senior Technical Specialist, Rural Finance (PTL SNAPP2)
Sashwati Mishra	IFAD Gender and Social Inclusion Analyst
Sengul James	IFAD Finance Officer (for SNAPP2)
Arsalan Vardag	Financial Management Specialist (for CLAP)
Virinder Garg	Procurement Specialist
Khaista Rahman Yousafzai	Agriculture and Livestock Specialist (local – field travel)
Zahid Shakeel Qureshi	Rural Infrastructure Specialist
Ziauddin Rahimi	Civil Engineer (local – field travel)
Peter Ekblad	Knowledge Management

MISSION SCHEDULE: to be confirmed	
28 October	Kick off meeting tbc
2 – 13 November	field visit to 3 provinces (Kabul, Parwan and Nangarhar) <i>field mission cancelled</i>
15 November onwards	Meeting and discussion with PMU and Implementing Partners, Team meetings and Report writing
25 November	Submission individual inputs to Team Leaders CLAP and SNAPP2 for aide memoire
1 December	Submission of individual inputs for reports
7 December	Wrap-Up meeting

BACKGROUND

Currently the International Fund for Agricultural Development (IFAD) finances 3 (three) projects in the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, namely the Community Livestock and Agriculture Project (CLAP), Support to National Priority Programme 2 (SNAPP 2), and Arghandab Integrated Water Resources Development Project (AIWRDP). The 2 projects, CLAP and SNAPP2, cover the selected 7 provinces of Kabul, Parwan, Logar, Balkh, Herat, Nangarhar, and Baghlan. Meanwhile the AIWRDP is located in Kandahar.

CLAP

Community Livestock and Agriculture Programme (CLAP) was originally a SDR 37.65 million (equivalent to approximately USD 58 million) initiative financed through an IFAD DSF grant. CLAP was approved by IFAD Board in December 2012 and came into force on 08 April 2013. CLAP was originally due to be completed on 30 June 2019.

To support consolidation and sustainability of the results and impacts achieved and scaling up of successful experiences through increased outreach and geographical expansion, an additional financing of SDR 17.7 million (equivalent to USD 25 million), was made available as a DSF grant in December 2017. The Programme revised completion and closing dates are 30 June and 31 December 2022, respectively.

CLAP covers the seven selected provinces of Kabul, Parwan, Logar, Balkh, Herat, Nangarhar, and Baghlan, and its development objective is to improve the food security of about 223,000 rural poor households by increasing agriculture and livestock productivity and reducing gender disparities. The programme has three components, namely: (i) Community Development, including Productive Infrastructures and Institutional Strengthening; (ii) Livestock and Agriculture Development; and (iii) Project Management, Policy Support and Young Professionals Programme.

Last implementation support mission was carried out remotely in August 2020.

SNAPP2

Support to National Priority Programme 2 (SNAPP 2) is financed by an IFAD (DSF) Grant in the amount of SDR 34.45 million (equivalent to USD 48.4 million) to be implemented over a period of six (6) years, effective on the date of entry into force of the Financing Agreement between the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan (Recipient) and IFAD in April 2016. The Programme's completion and closing dates are, respectively, 31 December 2021 and 30 June 2022. The goal of the Programme is to contribute to improving the food security and economic status of poor rural households in the Programme Area. The Programme's development objectives are to promote institutional development and capacity building of community organisations, public extension services and relevant private sector entities, as well as to increase incomes of small farmers and herders, fostered by improvements in productivity and output, productive infrastructure and market linkages. SNAPP2 is structured around two main components, namely (i) Institutional Development, and (ii) Strategic Investments.

The last Supervision Mission was held in July 2020 as a follow up to the Mid-Term Review (MTR) of 5 to 14 May 2019 and implementation support missions conducted on 14-15 September and 16-18 December 2019 in Dubai, UAE where the mission met the Project team to discuss on the pending issues and agreed on the follow up action plan.

MISSION OBJECTIVES AND OUTPUTS

The current security concerns as well as imposed lockdown situation due to Covid-19 pandemic in Afghanistan, including in Kabul, makes it challenging for IFAD to field international mission members to the country. Instead, two National Consultants will be locally recruited to complement the mission through site visits in tandem with meetings being held online through Skype or Zoom facilities.

The objectives of these Supervision Missions are to:

- Review Programme implementation progress and performance to date in related project sub-components and provinces, in view of financial and physical progress achieved and yet to be achieved, including verify the submitted progress report and logical framework update;
- Verify achievements since the last missions for both projects and update its performance ratings;
- Assess impact of COVID 19 on project progress/AWPB and recommend mitigation actions.
- Get updates on the follow up according to the agreed action plans, as well as actions taken in addressing the recommendations and issues raised by the previous missions;
- Review the outcomes from the follow up actions, and provide further recommendations when necessary and applicable;
- Together with the PMUs/Project Team, follow up any emerging issues and existing difficulties with project implementation, and discuss and suggest alternative solutions to address them;
- Identify and discuss on success cases or lessons learnt from the project implementation, and explore the opportunities to produce knowledge and communication products;

Especially for **SNAPP2**:

- Get the updates on the discussion and preparation for:
 - End line survey to be conducted in 2021 that will contribute to the Project Completion Report;
 - Follow up on the Project Exit Strategy to ensure sustainability of project benefits to the beneficiaries after its completion;
- Together with the Programme to formulate and agree on strategic direction on strengthening the Programme's performance which are rated as 3 or lower.
- Explore preparatory requirements for possible No-Cost Extension

And especially for **CLAP**:

The Mission will particularly focus on the status of the dairy plant, implementation of infrastructure components of the project and status of Geographic Information System (GIS)-based M&E system, gender and social inclusion aspects

INDIVIDUAL RESPONSIBILITIES, EXPECTED OUTPUTS AND REQUIRED COMPLETION DATES	
Full Name	Candra Samekto
GENERAL DESCRIPTION OF TASK(S) AND OBJECTIVE(S) TO BE ACHIEVED	
Expected Activities: The Country Director/CPM will play the role of mission leader and will provide overall guidance to the mission. He will lead the discussions with the Government of Islamic Republic of Afghanistan. He will also contribute to the overall mission aide memoire and mission report.	

INDIVIDUAL RESPONSIBILITIES, EXPECTED OUTPUTS AND REQUIRED COMPLETION DATES	
Full Name	Liam Chicca
GENERAL DESCRIPTION OF TASK(S) AND OBJECTIVE(S) TO BE ACHIEVED	
Expected Activities: The APR Lead Portfolio Advisor will: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Provide an overall guidance on the mission in line with IFAD policy and guidelines; • Provide strategic advice on any particular issues identified during the mission; • Contribute to the overall mission aide memoire and mission report. 	

INDIVIDUAL RESPONSIBILITIES, EXPECTED OUTPUTS AND REQUIRED COMPLETION DATES	
Full Name	Elizabeth Ssendiwalwa PTL for CLAP
GENERAL DESCRIPTION OF TASK(S) AND OBJECTIVE(S) TO BE ACHIEVED	
Expected Activities:	

As the Project Technical Lead, the Senior Regional Technical Specialist on Institutions will:

- Review and oversees technical aspects of the project – particularly related to Rural Institutions;
- Provide strategic advice and overall technical guidance and advices to project and the mission;
- Contribute to the overall mission aide memoire and mission report.

INDIVIDUAL RESPONSIBILITIES, EXPECTED OUTPUTS AND REQUIRED COMPLETION DATES

Full Name	Sashwati Mishra , PDT for both
------------------	---------------------------------------

GENERAL DESCRIPTION OF TASK(S) AND OBJECTIVE(S) TO BE ACHIEVED

Expected Activities:

the Regional Gender Coordinator will:

- Assess the social inclusion and gender aspects of the project implementation;
- Provide technical guidance and advices in addressing social and gender issues;
- Provide strategic advice on strengthening the aspects of gender and social inclusion in project implementation;
- Assess and suggest any adjustments where necessary to soothe implementation and attainment of project objectives in the areas of Gender and Social Inclusion;
- Contribute to the overall mission aide memoire and reports.

INDIVIDUAL RESPONSIBILITIES, EXPECTED OUTPUTS AND REQUIRED COMPLETION DATES

Full Name	Michael Hamp PTL SNAPP2
------------------	--------------------------------

GENERAL DESCRIPTION OF TASK(S) AND OBJECTIVE(S) TO BE ACHIEVED

Expected Activities:

The PTL Senior Technical Specialist Rural Finance will:

- Assess progress in TUP component, level of involvement of MISFA;
- Based on appraisal targets, the 2020 AWPB and the last SM and implementation supervision mission, review implementation progress related to sub component rural financial services (2.3), Farmer Organizations (1.3); you will as well identify actual and potential/emerging operational problems, and propose solutions for corrective measures or improvements to be made;
- Based on appraisal targets, the 2020 AWPB and the last mission, review implementation progress related to component access to finance; you will as well identify actual and potential/emerging operational problems, and propose solutions for corrective measures or improvements to be made;
- Assess the effectiveness and efficiency of the revolving line of credit with FMFB, including a review of the appropriateness of the financial products and services;
- Assess the progress made with respect to the Sharia Compliant Loans RFP and identification of partners, including review of the sharia financial products;
- Undertake any other relevant tasks as requested by the CPM or Team Leader.

INDIVIDUAL RESPONSIBILITIES, EXPECTED OUTPUTS AND REQUIRED COMPLETION DATES

Full Name	Sengul James , IFAD Finance Officer, for SNAPP2 and CLAP
------------------	---

GENERAL DESCRIPTION OF TASK(S) AND OBJECTIVE(S) TO BE ACHIEVED

Expected Activities:

the Finance Officer will:

- Review the results of the latest external Audit Report to ascertain whether any issues raised by the auditor identify potential fiduciary risks - where relevant follow up on issues arising by contacting the external auditors. Consult main findings, requests for clarification and action plan proposed by FMD with the latest audit review exercise.
- Review FM recommendations and findings from the latest supervision mission (if applicable) and the list of agreed actions.
- Determine the amount of the Withdrawal Applications (WAs) submitted to IFAD since the last supervision mission, obtain a scanned copy of these WAs and proceed to identify the sample of expenditures under SOE to be checked and perform SOE sampling.
- Review the operation of the project designated account (DA), and project accounts to ensure that the DA reconciliation is correctly prepared. Validate the closing balances from copies of the bank statement and clarify the status of the reconciliation items (if any). Note down any pending payments and withdrawal applications still not paid by IFAD including replenishments, reimbursements and direct payments.

- Perform a remote Financial Management Performance Assessment, using the most recent FMAQ template, to review the strengths and weaknesses of the project's financial management systems. Validate the answers by asking for electronic evidence as appropriate.
- Based on the financial reports prepared by the project, review the overall financial performance by expenditure category and component to assess the project's overall financial performance against appraisal and against the approved AWPB. Review the cumulative status of funds by category of expenditure, approved AWPB and the project commitments in order to estimate the adequacy of funds and the need for category reallocations.
- Review the audit arrangements of the past and future project audits and its timelines. Organize a tele/skype/Zoom conference with the private audit company to discuss issues raised in latest Audit Report and IFADs audit review. Discuss the TOR for the upcoming audit.
- Provide implementation support as necessary.

INDIVIDUAL RESPONSIBILITIES, EXPECTED OUTPUTS AND REQUIRED COMPLETION DATES

Full Name of Consultant:	Qaim Shah for CLAP and Karim Merchant for SNAPP2
Expected Start Date of Assignment:	26 October
Expected End Date of Assignment:	31 December
Total number of working days <i>(max. 240 in a 12-month period):</i>	(mission coordination, remote meetings, and report consolidation)

GENERAL DESCRIPTION OF TASK(S) AND OBJECTIVE(S) TO BE ACHIEVED

Expected Activities:

- 1) Overall coordination of the mission to ensure full scope review by mission to project implementation and performance in related project sub-components and provinces;
- 2) Analyse the project outputs and outcomes achieved so far against the anticipated project results (and log-frame);
- 3) Review the integrity and synergy of the project activities as they spread in the different components;
- 4) Assess implementation efficiency and effectiveness: institutional coordination, capacity and performance of the implementing and technical agencies and service providers;
- 5) Will have overall responsibility for managing/ consolidating the missions work and for delivering its final outputs;
- 6) Assess and suggest any adjustments where necessary to soothe implementation and attainment of project objectives;
- 7) Capture success cases or lessons learnt to inform project management and wide audience;
- 8) Ensure the mission deliverables including aide memoire and mission reports covering the appropriate ratings based on the data and evidence submitted by PMU;
- 9) Synthesise missions' findings and recommendation and coordination with the government and other stakeholders;
- 10) Ensure effective and consistent liaison with the counterparts and among the team members; and
- 11) Conduct any other task as requested by and agreed with the CPM.

KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATORS

Expected Outputs (please include any travel if applicable):	Required Completion Date:
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Aide Memoire 	1 December
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Finalised Supervision Mission report following the latest template, accompanied with required annexes to be uploaded onto ORMS; and 	14 December
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Address issue raised by the mission report peer review process. 	31 December

INDIVIDUAL RESPONSIBILITIES, EXPECTED OUTPUTS AND REQUIRED COMPLETION DATES

Full Name of Consultant:	Khaista Rahman Yousafzai, Agriculture and Livestock expert		
Expected Start Date of Assignment:	22 October		
Expected End Date of Assignment:	7 December		
Total number of working days (max. 240 in a 12-month period):			
GENERAL DESCRIPTION OF TASK(S) AND OBJECTIVE(S) TO BE ACHIEVED			
Expected Activities:			
<p>Based upon site visits to two provinces and stakeholder meetings in Kabul:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none">1) Visit to sites where agriculture and livestock activities are implemented under Component 2 and capacity building activities related to agriculture and livestock under Component 1 and to validate progress and achievements, and provide support to facilitate programme implementation;2) Detailed review on the progress of on-going projects against agreed action plan based on the latest supervision and implementation support missions’ recommendations and identify challenges, if any, and propose workable solutions;3) Collect evidence of the project progress such as geotagged pictures and record beneficiaries statements when applicable;4) Validate and asses outcomes and impacts of the project include conducting consultation and interview with the beneficiaries to get feedback;5) Validate agriculture productivity gains attributed to project interventions (irrigations, extension services, dry area agriculture, livestock etc.).6) Any additional task assigned by the team leader and/or CPM.			
KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATORS			
Expected Outputs (please include any travel if applicable):			Required Completion Date:
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Contributions to AM and Final Report• Technical support to relevant Project components			25 November and 2 December

INDIVIDUAL RESPONSIBILITIES, EXPECTED OUTPUTS AND REQUIRED COMPLETION DATES	
Full Name of Consultant:	Zahid Shakeel Qureshi, Rural Infrastructure Specialist
Expected Start Date of Assignment:	26 October
Expected End Date of Assignment:	7 December
Total number of working days (max. 240 in a 12-month period):	
GENERAL DESCRIPTION OF TASK(S) AND OBJECTIVE(S) TO BE ACHIEVED	
Expected Activities:	
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Prepare itinerary and validation activities for National Consultant Engineer and oversee information gathering;• Detailed review on the progress of on-going projects against agreed action plan based on the latest supervision and implementation support missions’ recommendations and identify challenges, if any, and propose workable solutions;• Asses cost efficiencies for infrastructure interventions;• Review the scale, costs, arrangement (construction and supervision) and progress of the infrastructure components and identify issues if any;• Review the institutional aspects of infrastructures management to ensure sustainability of their functions after the project completion;• Provide advice on fulfilling the AWPB;• Undertake any other relevant tasks as requested by the Team Leader and/or CPM.	
KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATORS	
Expected Outputs (please include any travel if applicable):	Required Completion Date:
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Assist in drafting relevant sections of the Aide Memoire and Mission Report	4 December

INDIVIDUAL RESPONSIBILITIES, EXPECTED OUTPUTS AND REQUIRED COMPLETION DATES	
Full Name of Consultant:	Ziauddin Rahimi , Engineer
Expected Start Date of Assignment:	22 October
Expected End Date of Assignment:	7 December
Total number of working days (max. 240 in a 12-month period):	
GENERAL DESCRIPTION OF TASK(S) AND OBJECTIVE(S) TO BE ACHIEVED	
Expected Activities:	
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Visit to sites where infrastructure activities are implemented to validate progress outcomes, impact etc., and provide support to facilitate programme implementation; 2) Provide validation data and undertake other activities and tasks requested by Infrastructure Specialist; 3) Collect evidence of the project progress such as geotagged pictures and record beneficiaries statements when applicable; 4) Validate and assess outcomes and impacts of the project include conducting consultation and interview with the beneficiaries to get feedback; 	
KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATORS	
Expected Outputs (please include any travel if applicable):	Required Completion Date:
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Travel to 3 provinces and undertake multiple site visits • Primary data verification data and on-the-ground analysis and triangulated reports • Initial analysis on progress and bottlenecks 	22 Nov 29 Nov 29 Nov

INDIVIDUAL RESPONSIBILITIES, EXPECTED OUTPUTS AND REQUIRED COMPLETION DATES	
Full Name of Consultant:	Virinder Garg , Procurement Specialist
Expected Start Date of Assignment:	26 October
Expected End Date of Assignment:	2 December
Total number of working days (max. 240 in a 12-month period):	
GENERAL DESCRIPTION OF TASK(S) AND OBJECTIVE(S) TO BE ACHIEVED	
Expected Activities:	
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Review the current Procurement Plan in order to assess it has been fully updated and upgraded, ascertain its completeness, its concurrence with the AWPB, and its consistency with the country systems and/or IFAD Procurement Guidelines and Handbook; 2) Review the project's foreseen major procurement decisions and assist the PMU to prepare the procurement packages in advance; 3) Check the contracts register for matching the running bills against actual claims made in communication with IFAD Financial Officer 4) Review and make recommendations on asset management and project inventories provided under CLAP/CLAP-AF. 5) Provide support, advice and recommendations on the following: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. The thresholds, ceilings and preferences to be applied in the implementation of procurement under the project; b. The contract types and contractual arrangements for goods, works and consulting services required to implement the projects; c. The proposed methods of procurement; d. The related IFAD review procedures and provide suggestions to improve the overall quality of the procurement processes; 6) Carry out sampling checks on past procurement activities when applicable and assess the extent these adhere to Government and/or IFAD Procurement Guidelines and Handbook; in particular, verify that the goods, services and works procured correspond with the approved AWPB and Procurement Plan, in terms of quality and quantities; 7) Review the procurement, contracting and implementation processes and timeliness and appropriateness of procurement actions; 8) Assess contract administration and management procedures; 	

- 9) Assess the procurement capacity of all entities to be reviewed in terms of manpower, levels of training of procurement staff, work environments and independence of procurement staff to carry out their statutory assignments;
- 10) Determine whether adequate systems are in place for procurement planning, implementation and monitoring, and whether documentation are maintained as per required standards and can be relied upon;
- 11) Verify to the extent possible, whether goods, works and consulting services contracted were supplied/completed according to the required specifications and technical standards;
- 12) Review issues identified in the previous procurement review and aide-mémoire and procurement related issues identified in project audit reports;
- 13) Identify deficiencies and make recommendations for improvements and control mechanisms in the procurement procedures and processes;
- 14) Conduct a review of any significant changes in the borrower/recipient's procurement system and practices, and ensure project procurement procedures and systems are updated accordingly;
- 15) Review/update the Procurement Risk Assessment, using the IFAD Procurement Risk Matrix (Module I of the IFAD Procurement Manual);
- 16) Assess further procurement staff training needs and ensure relevant training is planned and provided to project management and procurement staff in a timely manner;
- 17) Conduct any other task as requested by and agreed with the Procurement Specialist and/or mission team leader.

KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATORS

Expected Outputs (please include any travel if applicable):	Required Completion Date:
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Provide supervision aide memoire/report to be discussed with Government at the wrap up meeting Finalized the report following the latest template, accompanied with required annexes to be uploaded onto ORMS 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 3 Dec 14 Dec

INDIVIDUAL RESPONSIBILITIES, EXPECTED OUTPUTS AND REQUIRED COMPLETION DATES

Full Name of Consultant:	Arsalan Vardag, FM Specialist for CLAP
Expected Start Date of Assignment:	26 October
Expected End Date of Assignment:	2 December
Total number of working days (max. 240 in a 12-month period):	

GENERAL DESCRIPTION OF TASK(S) AND OBJECTIVE(S) TO BE ACHIEVED

Expected Activities:

a) Perform a desk review:

1. Review the results of the latest external Audit Report (including specifically the Management Letter) to ascertain whether any issues raised by the auditor identify potential fiduciary risks - where relevant follow up on issues arising by contacting the external auditors. Consult main findings, requests for clarification and action plan proposed by FMD with the latest audit review exercise.
2. Review the most recent quarterly/semi-annual Interim Financial Reports (IFRs). Confirm whether IFRs have been submitted within the prescribed time limit and whether the content is aligned to requirements.
3. Review FM recommendations and findings from the latest supervision mission (if applicable) and the list of agreed actions.
4. Determine the amount of the Withdrawal Applications (WAs) submitted to IFAD since the last supervision mission using the Historic Transaction Report (HTR). Obtain a scanned copy of these WAs and proceed to identify the sample of expenditures under SOE to be checked.
 - 1) Review the operation of the project designated account (DA), and project accounts to ensure that the DA reconciliation is correctly prepared. Validate the closing balances from copies of the bank statement and clarify the status of the reconciliation items (if any). Note down any pending payments and withdrawal applications still not paid by IFAD including replenishments, reimbursements and direct payments.

b) Re-assess the Project Financial Management Arrangements (via teleconference / skype / zoom / email):

1. Perform a remote Financial Management Performance Assessment, using the most recent FMAQ template, to review the strengths and weaknesses of the project's financial management systems. Validate the answers by asking for electronic evidence as appropriate (organogram, staff TORs, Invoices, Financial reports, Screen shots from the accounting software, scanned documents, etc....)
2. Together with the project Financial Controller or equivalent, review actions taken to address recommendations and validate the status of actions by asking for electronic evidence as applicable, of:
 - i. Previous years' Supervision review,
 - ii. Recommendations raised by external auditors on previous years management letters,
 - iii. Recommendations raised by FMD during the audit review exercise; and;
 - iv. Follow-up on internal audit recommendations;.
3. Perform a virtual walkthrough of the project's internal controls relating to financial management and financial administration of project funds. As part of this exercise pick one or two large expenditure items from each expenditure category, claimed from IFAD since the past supervision and trace the item through the whole audit trail:
 - i. Approved AWPB and procurement plan,
 - ii. IFAD non objection (if applicable),
 - iii. Contract/invoice,
 - iv. Duly authorized purchase order,
 - v. Accounting software ID number (transaction inserted in the accounting software),
 - vi. Verification (physical and documentary) evidence as applicable that works have been completed,/goods delivered/ services rendered in accordance with the contract,
 - vii. Verification of payment (bank statement/cash book), and
 - viii. Project assets duly reflected in the fixed asset register. The collected information should be validated by reviewing scanned documents (contracts, invoices etc.) screen shots from the accounting software, pictures, videos, beneficiary interview etc. as appropriate and feasible.
4. Confirm the functionality of the accounting system and the financial reporting system by requesting the project to submit financial reports, extracted directly from the accounting system and compare these with the trial balance, bank statements and IFAD records for the same time period to determine that the accuracy and compliance with IFAD requirements. In addition, explore what reports can be generated automatically from the system and which reports need to be prepared/modified in excel and the type of budget controls system has.

Review Withdrawal Applications and Statements of Expenditures submitted to IFAD after the previous supervision mission to:

- i. Verify adequacy, completeness and validity of claims by selecting on a sample basis expenditure items from each category of expenditures and requesting for scanned supporting documentation for these items, SOE review check list and a general list of required supporting documentation). Note down any ineligible expenditures.
 - ii. Ensure that the claimed expenditures are net of tax and that the financing percentages have been applied in accordance with Schedule 2 of the Financing agreement. Record any ineligible expenditures.
 - iii. Confirm whether WAs prepared regularly, in an efficient manner and in line with the LTB.
 - iv. Discuss findings with the project finance staff and request further clarification / supporting documentation as deemed relevant.
5. Based on the financial reports prepared by the project, review the overall financial performance by expenditure category and component to assess the project's overall financial performance against appraisal and against the approved AWPB. Review the cumulative status of funds by category of expenditure, approved AWPB and the project commitments (contracts signed not paid) in order to estimate the adequacy of funds and the need for category reallocations. Discuss the status of preparation of the annual financial statements (if relevant for the period).
 6. Review the project's fixed asset register so as to verify the following: i) the fixed asset register contains the necessary information and in an acceptable format; ii) assets were part of the approved procurement plan (spot check); iii) assets have been tagged with a serial number (serial number and location included in the fixed asset register); and iv) all assets were subject to an annual inventory exercise (ask for electronic copy of the report). Ensure a proper handover plan of the project assets has been formally agreed on and documented by the Project, the lead project agency and the Borrower (if the project is in a completion phase). Review how vehicle fuel use is being controlled by reference to a withdrawal application submitted in the period.
 7. Review the audit arrangements of the past and future project audits and its timelines. If relevant, organize a tele/skype/Zoom conference with the private audit company to discuss issues raised in latest Audit Report and IFADs audit review. Discuss the TOR for the upcoming audit (if relevant for the period).
 8. Provide implementation support as necessary.
 9. Undertake ad-hoc tasks as assigned through email by Finance Officer.

Reporting/outputs

- Prepare the Financial management risk assessment including an updated Summary of project fiduciary risk (Financial Management Performance Assessment at Supervision and Summary of Project Fiduciary Risk Assessment at Supervision) as per IFAD's guidelines.
- In line with the Supervision Guidelines and FMD guidelines, provide inputs to the Aide-Memoire and supervision mission report as follows:
 - i. Input to Main body of the Aide-Memoire and the Supervision report including the following under section iv. "Financial Management and Execution": i) Disbursement Rate, ii) Quality of financial management, iii) Quality and timeliness of audit including follow up on the finding of the audit review exercise performed by FMD) and iv) Counterpart funds. Assign ratings and record the agreed actions, responsibilities and dates under each section.
 - ii. Appendix 1: Financial: Actual financial performance by Financier; Disbursements by Category and by component: Tables 1A, 1B and 1C.
 - iii. SOE – review log showing the expenditures items reviewed during the SOE review and observations requiring follow-up, and clearly document any ineligible expenditures identified and their values.

10.

KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATORS

Expected Outputs (please include any travel if applicable):	Required Completion Date:
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Provide supervision aide memoire/report to be discussed with Government at the wrap up meeting • Finalized the report following the latest template, accompanied with required annexes to be uploaded onto ORMS 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 3 Dec • 14 Dec

INDIVIDUAL RESPONSIBILITIES, EXPECTED OUTPUTS AND REQUIRED COMPLETION DATES

Full Name	Peter Ekblad, China Hub KM Officer
GENERAL DESCRIPTION OF TASK(S) AND OBJECTIVE(S) TO BE ACHIEVED	

Expected Activities:
<p>The KM specialist will:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Assess the project's progress in managing knowledge and lessons learned, the knowledge management strategy of the project and assess capacity of the project and its implementing partners; • Identify promising, innovations and knowledge generated by the project - provide recommendations for improvement in this area; • Carry out a comprehensive progress review of the knowledge management and how project undertaken generation of knowledge and translate it to meaningful policy and strategic input for stakeholders including government; • Assess effectiveness of the coordination between implementing partners, project and other stakeholders with regards to sharing lesson learnt; • Review the quality of the M&E, identify gaps and suggest remedial measures; • Propose how to capture achievements of cross cutting issues and the project strategies for mainstreaming gender, nutrition, climate change and youth; ➤ Assess relevance and effectiveness of Project's community participation approaches including targeting criteria for the communities and individual households and its effectiveness; • Any additional task assigned by the mission leader and Team leader
DOCUMENTATION
<p>The following documentation will be made available to consultants prior to the assignment:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Aide Memoire and Main Reports of previous supervision and implementation missions • Annual Work Plan and Budget • Other relevant project documents

IMPORTANT NOTE:

IFAD will accept only reports that have been properly filled in by using the template, which will be provided separately. The team leader is responsible for preparing the main report and annexes in the required format, and ensuring that the working papers submitted by the individual team members are consolidated in one single document and in the correct format. S/He will compile the full report, including her/his own contributions and those of all the mission members into one consistent final and complete report and submit it to IFAD on or before the agreed deadline.

MISSION SCHEDULE (Kabul Time)

28 Oct 2020 12:30-13:30 Kick-Off meeting for CLAP and SNaPP2 Supervision Missions, Wednesday

05 Nov 2020 11:30-13:00 CLAP Mission Meeting with PMU – Agriculture, Livestock and Irrigation staff including MRRD

07 Nov 2020 12:30-14:00 SNaPP2 Mission Meeting with PMU – Agriculture and Livestock staff

10 Nov 2020 12:30-13:30 CLAP Mission Meeting with FAO,

10 Nov 2020, 13:30-14:30 Meeting with DCA

11 Nov 2020, 12:30-14:30 ICARDA meeting

12 Nov 2020, 12:30 to 14:30 M&E and KM Meeting

16 Nov 12:30-13.30 PMU Irrigation staff including MRRD

16 Nov 12:00-13:00 FMFB

17 Nov, 13:30-14:30 Kabul time SNaPP2 and CLAP: Gender

18 Nov , 12:30-13:30 Kabul time SNaPP2 and CLAP: Environment and Climate

People Met and contact details				
Sr. No	Meeting date and time	Name	Title	Email
1	Kick-Off meeting for CLAP and SNaPP2 Supervision Missions Wednesday 28 Oct 2020 12:30-13:30 Kabul time	Mustafa Hamed Zia	National Program Director	mustafa.hamedzia@mail.gov.af
		Noor Akbar Srak	Program Manager/SNaPP2	noor.srak@mail.gov.af
		Asadullah Battar	Program Manager/CLAP	asad.battar@mail.gov.af
		Saleem Mirani	Sr.Finance Manager	saleem.mirani@mail.gov.af
		Javed Khandan	Finance Manager	jkhanda@mail.gov.af
		Ayaz Momand	Procurement Manager	ayaz.momand@mail.gov.af
		Ayub Ayubi	M&E Unit Head	drayub.ayubi@gmail.com
		Mirwais Khogiani	Extension Coordinator	mirwais.khogiani@mail.gov.af
		Mir Mohammad Shafee	Irrigation Coordinator	sayed.shafee@mail.gov.af
		Mujtaba Nezamyar	KM and policy specialist	mujtaba.nezamyar@mail.gov.af
		Jafar Emal	Livestock Coordinator/SNaPP2	jafar.emal@mail.gov.af
		Dr.Asghar Anwary	Livestock Specialist /CLAP	asghar.anwary@mail.gov.af
		Shafi Azizi	Provincial Coordinator /Kabul	Shafiullah Azizi' < shafi.azizi@mail.gov.af >
		Rahmat Gul Serat	Provincial Coordinator /Nangarhar	rahmat.serat@mail.gov.af
		Habib Omerkhail	Provincial Coordinator SNaPP2/Balkh	habibullah.omerkhail@mail.gov.af
		M.Asef Nikzad	Provincial Coordinator SNaPP2/Herat	asef.nikzad@mail.gov.af
		Noor Ahmad	Provincial Coordinator/Logar	noormeerkhel12345@gmail.com
		Zabiullah	Provincial Coordinator/Parwan	zabihullah.mujahed@mail.gov.af
2	Meeting with PMU - Agriculture, Livestock & Irrigation Staff including MRRD Thursday 05 Nov 2020, 12:30 - 13:30 Kabul time	Mustafa Hamed Zia	NPD	mustafa.hamedzia@mail.gov.af
		Asadullah Battar	Program Manager/CLAP	asad.battar@mail.gov.af
		Mir Mohammad Shafee	Irrigation Coordinator/CLAP, SNaPP2	sayed.shafee@mail.gov.af
		Dr.Asghar Anwary	Livestock Specialist/CLAP	asghar.anwary@mail.gov.af
		Ayub Ayubi	M&E Unit Head	drayub.ayubi@gmail.com
		Rahmatullah Sherzad	Agriculture Specialist	rahmatullah.sherzad@mail.gov.af
3	Meeting with PMU - Agriculture & Livestock Staff including ICARDA Staff Saturday 07 Nov 2020, 12:30 - 13:30 Kabul time	Asadullah Battar	Program Manager/CLAP	asad.battar@mail.gov.af
		Rahmatullah Sherzad	Livestock Specialist/CLAP	rahmatullah.sherzad@mail.gov.af
		M.Sharif Sharifi	Project Manager/ICARDA	sharifi.icarda2015@gmail.com >;
		Hamid Salari	National Technical Advisor	hsalari.icarda@gmail.com
4	FAO Meeting Tuesday 10 Nov 2020, 12:30 - 13:30 Kabul time	Mustafa Hamed Zia	NPD	mustafa.hamedzia@mail.gov.af
		Dr. Som Khanal	Technical Advisor/FAO	Som.Khanal@fao.org
		Dr. Lutfullah	National Professional Officer/FAO	Lutfullah.Rlung@fao.org

		Najib " Zia"	Knowledge management officer /FAO	Zia.Najeeb@fao.org
		Asadullah Battar	Program Manager/CLAP	asad.battar@mail.gov.af
		Dr.Asghar Anwary	Livestock Specialist/CLAP	asghar.anwary@mail.gov.af
5	DCA Meeting Tuesday 11 Nov 2020, 13:30 - 14:30 Kabul time	Mustafa Hamed Zia	NPD	mustafa.hamedzia@mail.gov.af
		Asadullah Battar	Program Manager/CLAP	asad.battar@mail.gov.af
		Dr. Raymond	Project Manager /DCA	briscoe_raymond@yahoo.co.uk
		Dr.Faridoon Qaumi,	Sr.Project Manager CLAP/Kuchi	f_qaumi@yahoo.co.uk
		Fazlullah	Field Coordinator/DCA	faz.saifi@gmail.com
		Mahboobullhaq	KM/ M&E officer/DCA	ansarzai786@gmail.com
6	M&E and KM Meeting Monday 16 Nov 2020, 12:30 - 14:30	Mustafa Hamed Zia	NPD	mustafa.hamedzia@mail.gov.af
		Asadullah Battar	Program Manager/CLAP	asad.battar@mail.gov.af
		Noor Akbar Srak	Program Manager/SNaPP2	noor.srak@mail.gov.af
		Dr. Ayub Ayubi	M&E Unit Head - CLAP/SNaPP2	drayub.ayubi@gmail.com
		G. Mujtaba Nezamyar	KM Specialist - CLAP/SNaPP2	mujtaba.nezamyar@mail.gov.af
		Angela Raufi	Gender Specialist - CLAP/SNaPP2	Angela A < angela.raoufi08@gmail.com >
		Shafi Azizi	Provincial Coordinator /Kabul	Shafiullah Azizi' < shafi.azizi@mail.gov.af >
		Hameed Momand	M&E Officer - CLAP/SNaPP2	hameed.momand@mail.gov.af
		Reshad Ibrahim	MIS Officer	reshad.ibrahimi@mail.gov.af
		Baber Khan	M&E Specialist	baberkhanahmadzai44@gmail.com
7	PMU Irrigation Staff Meeting Including MRRD Monday 16 Nov 2020, 12:00 - 12:30	Mustafa Hamed Zia	NPD	mustafa.hamedzia@mail.gov.af
		Asadullah Battar	Program Manager/CLAP	asad.battar@mail.gov.af
		Mir Mohamad Shafee	Irrigation Coordinator - CLAP/SNaPP2	sayed.shafee@mail.gov.af
		Rohullah Mukhlis	Senior Water Management Specialist	rohullah.mukhlis@mail.gov.af
		Ahmad Shakib	Community Mobilization Officer	shekeb.sherzai@mail.gov.af
		Fareed-u-din Noori	Project Manager/RP/MRRD	fareed.noori@mrrd.gov.af
8	FMFB Meeting Monday 16 Nov 2020, 12:00 - 12:30	Noor Akbar Srak	Program Manager/SNaPP2	noor.srak@mail.gov.af
		Rahmim Dad	Deputy Chief Credit Officer/FMFB	rahimdad.dehpoor@fmfb.com.af
		Habib Rahman	Chief Credit Officer	habib.rahman@fmfb.com.af
9	Gender Meeting Wednesday 11 Nov 2020, 13:30 - 14:30	Mustafa Hamed Zia	NPD	mustafa.hamedzia@mail.gov.af
		Asadullah Battar	Program Manager/CLAP	asad.battar@mail.gov.af
		Angela Raufi	Gender Specialist - CLAP/SNaPP2	Angela A < angela.raoufi08@gmail.com >
		Noor Akbar Srak	Program Manager/SNaPP2	noor.srak@mail.gov.af
		Sharefa Rahimi	Master Trainer	Sharifa.Rahimi@fao.org
		Makai Ahmadzai	Trainer	784456561
		Noorya	Cop- Member	775524045
		Gulali	Group leader of SHG	776061424

		Nasira	Group leader of SHG	765893716
		Marya	Member of Association	765893716
		Aziza	Group leader and member of Association	79372020
		Noorya	Member of women Association	779904604
10	Environment & Climate Change Meeting Wednesday 18 Nov 2020, 12:30 Kabul Time	Mustafa Hamed Zia	NPD	mustafa.hamedzia@mail.gov.af
		Asadullah Battar	Program Manager/CLAP	asad.battar@mail.gov.af
		Noor Akbar Srak	Program Manager/SNaPP2	noor.srak@mail.gov.af
		Dr. Ayub Ayubi	M&E Unit Head - CLAP/SNaPP2	drayub.ayubi@gmail.com
		Mir Mohamad Shafee	Irrigation Coordinator - CLAP/SNaPP2	sayed.shafee@mail.gov.af
		Rohullah Mukhlis	Senior Water Management Specialist	rohullah.mukhlis@mail.gov.af
		Ahmad Shakib	Community Mobilization Officer	shekeb.sherzai@mail.gov.af