

Bangladesh

Haor Infrastructure and Livelihood Improvement Project - Climate Adaption and Livelihood Protection

Supervision Report

Main report and appendices

Mission Dates: 17 - 28 March 2019
Document Date: 30/04/2019
Project No. 1100001585
Report No. 5038-BD

Asia and the Pacific Division
Programme Management Department

Abbreviations and Acronyms

Abbreviations and acronyms

AWS	Automatic Weather Station
BMD	Bangladesh Meteorological Department
BRTC	Bangladesh Road Transport Authority
BTEB	Bangladesh Technical Education Board
BUET	Bangladesh University of Engineering and Technology
BUG	Beel User Group
CALIP	Climate Adaptation and Livelihood Improvement Project
DDM	Department for Disaster Management
DPP	Development Project Pro-forma
GOB	Government of Bangladesh
HILIP	Hoar Infrastructure and Livelihood Improvement Project
IDCOL	Infrastructure Development Company Limited
IFAD	International Fund for Agricultural Development
IWFM	Institute of Water and Flood Management
IWM	Institute of Water Modelling
LCS	Labour Contracting Societies
LGED	Local Government Engineering Department
LGD	Local Government Division
LIFE	Local Idea for Employment (NGO)
MTR	Mid-term review
PDO	Peace and Development Organization
PMU	Project Management Unit
SCBRMP	Sunamganj Community-Based Resources Management Project
TMSS	Thengamara Mahila Sabuj Sangha
WRF	Weather Research and Forecasting

A. Project Overview

Region:	Asia and the Pacific Division	Project at Risk Status:	Not at risk
Country:	Bangladesh	Environmental and Social Category:	B
Project Name:	Haor Infrastructure and Livelihood Improvement Project - Climate Adaption and Livelihood Protection	Climate Risk Classification:	not available yet
Project Id:	1100001585	Executing Institution:	not available yet
Project Type:	Rural Development	Implementing Institutions:	not available yet
CPM:	Omer Zafar		
Project Director:	not available yet		
Project Area:	Netrakona, Habiganj, Brahmanbaria, Kishoreganj and Sunamganj		

Approval Date	15/09/2011	Last audit receipt	31/12/2018
Signing Date	18/07/2012	Date of Last SIS Mission	29/03/2019
Entry into Force Date	18/07/2012	Number of SIS Missions	15
Available for Disbursement Date	30/11/2012	Number of extensions	0
First Disbursement Date	29/11/2012	Effectiveness lag	10 months
MTR Date	12/05/2016		
Original Completion Date	30/09/2020		
Current Completion Date	30/09/2020		
Financial Closure	not available yet		

Project total financing

IFAD Financing breakdown	Asia and the Pacific Division	\$1,043,534
	ASAP Trust Fund	\$15,047,193
	IFAD	\$55,049,205
Domestic Financing breakdown	National Government	\$32,424,113
Co-financing breakdown,	Spanish Fund	\$29,745,137
Project total financing		\$133,309,182

Current Mission

Mission Dates:	17 - 28 March 2019
Days in the field:	5 days in 2 groups
Mission composition:	Mr Dewan A H Alamgir (mission leader), Mr Abu Taher Chowdhury (infrastructure specialist); Mr David Doolan (agriculture specialist), Mr Richard Abila (IFAD senior technical specialist-fisheries); Mr. Karan Sehgal (environment and climate change specialist); Mr Didarul Islam (finance management specialist); Mr Shankar Kutty (IFAD senior procurement specialist); Mr Nabil Rahman (mission facilitator and infrastructure specialist); and Ms Enika Basu (IFAD regional analyst, M&E, targeting and gender specialist)
Field sites visited:	Baniachong, Azmiriganj, Lakhai, Sunamganj Sadar, South Sunamganj, Biswambarpur and Derai Upazilas

B. Overall Assessment

Key SIS Indicator #1	Ø	Rating	Key SIS Indicator #2	Ø	Rating
Likelihood of Achieving the Development Objective		5	Assessment of the Overall Implementation Performance		4

Effectiveness and Developmental Focus	5	Project Management	4
Effectiveness	4	Quality of Project Management	5
Targeting and Outreach	5	Knowledge Management	4
Gender equality & women's participation	5	Value for Money	4
Agricultural Productivity	5	Coherence between AWPB and Implementation	4
Nutrition	5	Performance of M&E System	5
Adaptation to Climate Change	5	Requirements of Social, Environmental and Climate Assessment Procedures (SECAP)	4

Sustainability and Scaling-up	5	Financial Management and Execution	4
Institutions and Policy Engagement	5	Acceptable Disbursement Rate	4
Partnership-building	5	Quality of Financial Management	4
Human and Social Capital and Empowerment	5	Quality and Timeliness of Audit	4
Quality of Beneficiary Participation	5	Counterparts Funds	5
Responsiveness of Service Providers	5	Compliance with Loan Covenants	4
Environment and Natural Resource Management	5	Procurement	4
Exit Strategy	5		
Potential for Scaling-up	5		

Relevance	5
------------------	----------

C. Mission Objectives and Key Conclusions

Background and Main Objective of the Mission

The Hoar Infrastructure and Livelihood Improvement Project (HILIP) is financed by the International Fund for Agricultural Development (IFAD) with a loan of US\$ 55 million and a grant of US\$ 1 million; a Spanish Trust Fund loan of US\$ 29.7 million. In 2014 an additional financing of US\$ 15 million from the ASAP Trust Fund was added to the project for specific activities targeted at climate adaptation and piloting of innovative adaptation initiatives, under the supplementary project Climate Adaptation and Livelihood Protection Project (CALIP). HILIP/CALIP is implemented by the Local Government Engineering Department (LGED) and has been effective since July 2012. The project areas includes five districts in the Haor region (Netrakona, Habiganj, Brahmanbaria, Kishoreganj and Sunamganj), a swampland/basin ecosystem, where 23 rivers drain. The project completion date is 30 September 2020. The project has five technical components: (i) Communications infrastructure, (ii) Community infrastructure, (iii) Community resource management, (iv) Livelihood Protection, and v) Capacity and Knowledge for Building Resilience. The last supervision mission in May 2018 and the implementation support in October 2018, confirmed that HILIP-CALIP was on track to achieve most of its targets. However, implementation delays were still observed and some particular areas related to infrastructure, vocational trainings, and fiduciary aspects required urgent improvement and acceleration of implementation.

IFAD undertook the project's 8th annual supervision mission from 17-28 March 2019. The objective of this mission was to review the progress status and plans, follow up on last mission's recommendations, agree on a strategy to complete all project activities per Government's DPP within the completion date (September 2020), and assess sustainability and exit strategy.

The official kick-off meeting was held on 18 March, at LGED, chaired by Mr Md Moslah Uddin, Additional Chief Engineer, IWRM, with participation of relevant LGED officials, implementing partners and service providers. Field visits were undertaken by two separate teams, in two of the five project districts (Hobiganj and Sunamganj), from 18-22 March and a total of 27 sites were visited in Baniachong, Azmiriganj, Lakhai, Sunamganj Sadar, South Sunamganj, Biswambarpur and Derai Upazilas. The mission's main findings and recommendations, and the agreements reached, were recorded in an Aide Memoire. It was discussed with, and endorsed by, Government at a wrap up meeting held in the Ministry of Local Government and Cooperatives on 28 March 2019, chaired by Dr Kazi Anowarul Hoque, Additional Secretary, Local Government Division. The mission's findings and recommendations were discussed and agreed at a pre-wrap meeting with the PMU and relevant officials at LGED HQ, chaired by Mr Md Moslah Uddin, Additional Chief Engineer. The mission expresses appreciation for the collaboration and hospitality extended by Government of Bangladesh.

Key Mission Agreements and Conclusions

The mission noted satisfactory physical and financial progress of most sub-components and related activities, notable management efficiency, good quality of physical works and training activities, revision of PIM as recommended, satisfactory implementation of previous mission's recommendations, and overall improved implementation efforts. The main findings and conclusions of the mission are as follows:

- In the last one year, the project has made good physical and financial progress under all components. The project has achieved almost 76% of its physical targets and financial disbursement stands at 83% (HILIP) and 65% (CALIP). However, in order to achieve all targets by the completion date (September 2020), infrastructure works under Components 1 and 2, and beel development works under component 3 need accelerated implementation to make up for the accumulated lag.
- The impact of the project is already evident: substantial improvement in communication was visible due to new road infrastructure in one of the poorest and most difficult geographic areas of the country. This has contributed to enhanced business and trade, access to health, education and other services, and reduced post-harvest losses. The project has created wage and self-employment through farm and non-farm livelihoods training, that has enhanced income and increased diversification of livelihoods choices.
- The mission recognises that while LCSs have successfully contributed to infrastructure work in several areas, in many others the formation and training of LCS groups for earth works is causing a serious bottleneck in implementation planning at this late stage. Considering the limitation of time, and the need to accelerate works, the mission recommends that the PMU contract private contractors to complete all remaining earth works.
- With regard to the project financing instruments (IFAD loan and Spanish Trust Fund loan), the mission noted a substantial difference in the allocation between the two financing instruments. In order to balance out the expenditure from both financing instruments, the mission recommends the PMU to initiate necessary action to amend the financing agreement to resolve this issue. The PMU needs to formally request IFAD to amend the Financing Agreement to continue utilizing IFAD loan funds at a revised proportion with GoB counterpart funds to invest all loan funds during the project period.

D. Overview and Project Progress

Physical and financial progress over the FY 2018-19 has been satisfactory. The main achievements and issues during the period can be elaborated as follows:

Component 1: Communication Infrastructure (HILIP)

The performance of Component 1 has been satisfactory due to very good physical progress of major construction works with acceptable quality standards. The main activities under the component are construction of Upazila and Union roads, bridges and culverts, boat landing ghats, development of minor road alignment, and maintenance of existing roads. The project has made very good progress in constructions of roads and bridges/culverts: 88% of upazila roads, 91% of union roads, and 80% of boat landing ghats were completed as of February 2019. The constructions are found to be of acceptable standards, with minor corrections required in design to improve longevity. All remaining road works have already been contracted out; and 8 ghats are either under design or at bid evaluation stages to be completed by June 2019.

The project has been somewhat slow in implementation of minor earth works (48% achieved) to improve road alignment, and maintenance, which was to be fully funded by GoB. The progress in maintenance is expected to be fast as 50.1 km out of 60 km of maintenance works have already been approved and bids are being currently evaluated. The project is facing difficulties in organizing required number of LCS members to do minor earth works due to shortage of labour during harvest period, which is also the main season of construction in the Haor area.

Component 2: Community Infrastructure

HILIP: Community infrastructure

The progress in community infrastructure works under HILIP has been satisfactory and of acceptable standards. Of the nine activities under HILIP, the project has made very good progress in construction of community roads (89% completed), development of village markets (91%), and market protection works (95%). The mission finds most of the constructions to be of acceptable quality. Other activities have made limited progress: construction of collection points (40% or 2 out of 5); village protection works (66%; 66 out of 100 villages); irrigation infrastructure (33%; 18 out of 55); minor earth works (18%), and road/infrastructure maintenance (23.05 km approved out of 40 km). The remaining works of the high performing items are expected to be completed in due time. The proposed 'innovative infrastructure' is yet to materialize as it is still in conceptualisation stage.

The mission finds that small rural markets, in its entirety or in part, are actually 'collection points'. Therefore, the project should choose small rural markets as 'collection centres/points', preferably at the banks of rivers/canals where farmers bring their commodities. The items for construction for these 'collection points' would be i) paved open space for buying/selling farm produces, ii) tube-well for water, iii) toilet block, and iv) in some cases, a ghat.

The construction of remaining 22 village protection walls should not be a problem if designs/estimations are done quickly by PMU, as IFAD earlier agreed to allow contractors for such works. Similarly, construction of minor irrigation projects (open channels) should not be a challenge because of the simplicity of design and construction, which can be done throughout the year, since they are on higher lands and not affected by flooding. The PMU already has nine (9) such proposals at hand and needs an additional 27 proposals.

Similarly, maintenance works should be completed easily as these will be done by contractors and will cover all roads in project Upazilas, not necessarily only HILIP-supported roads. But for all such activities to happen within FY2019-20 the PMU and LGED cannot afford any delay in design, internal approval and tendering process.

CALIP: Community infrastructure

Community infrastructure under CALIP has also made good progress. The project has completed 69% of village protection works and 72% of village internal services. All villages for remaining of these two types of works have already been selected. The mission found the quality of construction of internal services such as road, tube well, and toilets to be of good standard and such services appear to be in great demand. The project should be able finish the remaining 55 villages by engaging contractors.

Similarly, 120 (out of 175) village protection system (VPS) have either been completed or are in progress. The remaining 55 should be completed by using blocks and with or without vetiver by contractors. The quality of construction of VPS was found acceptable but improvement in workmanship and supervision needed. The road slope protection using CC block and vetiver was found of acceptable quality. The growth of vetiver in VPS and road slopes was found to be of mixed result: in some parts the grass grew well as expected, and in other parts they were fully damaged.

Village protection infrastructure: Out of the 175 planned villages, 120 have been protected through the combined CC block-vetiver model. The design of the project included various village protection model to experiment with to identify low-cost, as well as effective models for haor areas. For deep haor areas it is understood that concrete blocks and walls are

suitable against strong wave action. The other options, especially i) only vetiver, and ii) treated bamboo, geo-jute and vetiver were meant to observe efficacy of these very low-cost options. The project has constructed 14 village protection system using only vetiver but omitted chemically treated bamboo, vetiver-geo-jute option. A team of experts from BUET is now studying the effectiveness of various VPS. But the mission notes that the project has not tested the above two vegetative options sufficiently as per design. At this stage the mission recommends that the project completes the remaining VPS with CC blocks with or without vetiver.

The project has made moderate progress in the other four pilot activities: i) model village development, ii) pilot testing of beel bank protection, iii) pilot testing of killa bank protection, and iv) pilot testing of Upazila/union road slope protection (not necessarily HILIP supported roads as they are mostly submergible roads. Although the mission realises the difficulties to implement infrastructure schemes during the flooding season, overall, the achievements fall below the expectations of the original design. The mission recommends that the PMU promptly contract out all these small works.

Model villages. The PMU reported some progress such as completion of earth filling, and processing of applications from potential poor households in case of first model village in Mithamoin Upazila of Kishorganj district. But a lot of works remain to be completed: village protection against wave action; construction of internal services; and development and handover of 'plots' to each arriving poor family. The second village is planned for Sunamganj district in either Dharmapasha or Jamalganj Upazila. However, the allocation of khas land seems to be uncertain as the process takes quite some time. Unless the land issue is settled with weeks the development of second village may most likely remain incomplete.

Component 3: Community Resources Management

Progress in this component has been moderately satisfactory, in view of the delays in beel development and canal re-excavation. Physical implementation progress during the current AWPB was better compared to the previous year, however, the component's overall performance remains significantly below targets.

Beel and canal re-excavation. The project targeted to secure and develop a total of 500 beels, each with a well-established BUG and BMC. However, there have been challenges in securing beel leases, and it is clear that the original target may not be achieved, and a total of 434 beels will be completed. The Ministry of Land (MoL) has so far transferred to the project a total of 383 beels (76.6%), of which 329 have been handed over to BUGs, while 54 are yet to be fully identified and developed before hand over. A total of 88 beels have been excavated out of 215 targeted (40.9%). Cumulatively 49 Km of canal have been excavated out of the targeted 100 km (49%). A total of 318 LCS groups (7950 members) have been trained out of 435 groups targeted (73%), of which 40 groups (1,000 members) were trained in the current AWPB. Cumulatively 213,000 swamp trees have been planted out of 300,000 targeted (71%). Monitoring studies conducted by WorldFish since 2014 present a very positive outlook on the status and trends of fish production and biodiversity in the beels and show that the project's interventions in the beels has generated tangible benefits. Total fish production in the project's beels increased from 543 Kg/ha in 2012/13 to 733 Kg/ha in 2017/2018. In terms of biodiversity the number of fish and prawn species increased from 105 to 126 during the same period. Comparatively non-project beels recorded declining productivity and biodiversity in that time frame.

The senior PMU officials expressed confidence that with the application of excavators and dredgers the project will complete all re-excavation works. But it has to be done in March-April of 2019 and in dry season of 2020. Therefore, it is extremely important that all contracting works be completed by 30 June 2019. The success of beel and *killa* protection works under Component 2 (CALIP) very much depends on the completion of re-excavation works. In fact these two activities (re-excavation and protection) should be combined for contracting purpose.

The transfer of the remaining beels from the MoL to the project, short duration of current leases and uncertainty surrounding BUG ownership of leases beyond the project, have been under discussion for some years without any resolution. The project should put more effort and initiate a tripartite consultation mechanism involving the three key institutions – Local Government Division (LGD), Ministry of Lands (MoL) and Ministry of Fisheries and Livestock (MoFL). BUGs need to be registered as fishing co-operatives by first identified as fishers and issued with ID by the Department of Fisheries. The project should facilitate BUGs in each step. Other challenges include heavy siltation of some of the beels, effectively reducing their sizes and potential productivity.

Component 4: Livelihoods Protection (HILIP and CALIP)

The component's progress has been satisfactory in both HILIP and CALIP parts, in view of good progress and impact of training, demonstration and prospect of completion of all activities. This component has contributed to increase in sustainable incomes combined with rural livelihood diversification to reduce poverty in the Haor areas where the people rely too heavily on paddy and open water fisheries. The project focuses mainly on promoting increased production of beneficiaries in selected sub-sectors (HILIP): crops, horticulture, poultry, livestock, and pond fisheries. The CALIP has included additional subsectors such as village forestry, pond fisheries, jute, and wood/bamboo products. Besides, CALIP is financing various off-farm vocational trainings.

On-field demonstrations. The project has made significant progress in the last year and the target of forming 3,700 common interest groups (CIGs) has been achieved. The trainings of the CIGs have benefitted 84,100 people and created

960 small scale businesses. Overall, under HILIP, 77% of the livelihoods training have been completed. The training courses lagging most behind are field days and artificial insemination programme, for which the project has an implementation plan for the last year.

The demonstrations on horticulture crops were well done and generated significant interest not only among CIG members but also adjacent farmers. The increased returns from high value vegetable production is appreciated by farmers who, because of the project investment in road and irrigation infrastructure, can now consider engaging in production of these perishable products. Further efforts on demonstrating and training farmers in alternative crops is warranted in the final year to accelerate adoption and expansion of high value production.

Livestock initiatives, sheep rearing for landless farmers was appropriate for the needs of landless and marginal farmers supported by para veterinarian training. Groups reported a steady increase in sheep numbers from the initial stocking that allows them generate income from sales. An increase in availability of feed and fodder production, combined with training on on-farm production of balanced feed rations, would be desirable.

Vocational training: The engagement of Vocational Training Service providers has helped accelerate delivery of these courses with most on track to meet expectations. The training events reviewed by the mission demonstrate the highly practical and hands-on nature of the training which is essential to meet the competency based assessment for certification under the Bangladesh Technical Education Board (BTEB). The service provider and trainees report high (80%) post graduate employment with the balance undertaking self-employment. In addition to technical skills, business skill development for the trainee would be useful, particularly to equip those going into self-employment. As an exit strategy, LGED should increasingly facilitate linkages with MFIs/banks given that many beneficiaries plan to be self-employed and thus require working capital. The introduction of training certificates has had positive outcomes in terms of job placement opportunities and this is a positive feature promoted by LGED.

Pond Aquaculture. The project is supporting pond aquaculture activities based on two models: Mola Polyculture (with carp fishes and tilapia) and Monoculture mainly of tilapia. This activity is very well organized with effective learning pathways, and the farmers met by the mission displayed sufficient knowledge of aquaculture good practices they had learned through the project. The activity is generating significant income and nutritional benefits to households. There is high demand for Mola locally and it fetches relatively higher market prices (around 500 BDT per Kg) while still providing households' protein needs for 3 to 4 days in a week.

Cumulatively 221 batches (sub-groups of CIGs, each of 5 members) have been trained out of a target of 252 batches (87.8%), ensuring a fair gender balance. In the current AWPB 20 batches were trained out of 25 target (80%). In total the project organized farm visits for 73 batches and hatchery visits for 78 batches, out of a target of 126 batches in each case, representing 57.9% and 61.9% achievement respectively. Pond aquaculture has picked up well and the Mission did not identify major technical constraints. However, a few members were trained but lack land to construct a fish pond. The project should explore with such beneficiaries if they can team up and lease ponds.

Component 5: Capacity and Knowledge for Building Resilience

This component is progressing satisfactorily as the planned studies are under progress.

Livelihood Studies: Out of the five planned studies, three have been contracted out and are on track to deliver final reports[1]. The procurement process is underway for the fourth study on the 'examination of dynamics of reforestation and strengthening of ecological resilience'. With regards to the study on 'monitoring and performance of village protection', the mission notes that sufficient time is not available for a credible assessment of use of vetiver for road and slope protection.

Flash Flood Early Warning System: Two models have been successfully developed, and the IWM model was used by BWDB for successful flash flood forecasting. IWFM is on track to deliver the recommended agreed actions during the implementation support mission dated October 2018. An internal validation workshop at LGED was conducted on the 24th January 2019 and will be tested for this flash flood season (April-May). A Technical Validation Workshop is planned for the 10th April in BUET.

[1] Study 1 (CEGIS): Climate change forecasting and participatory scenario development and assessment of the agriculture & fisheries sector and exposure to climate risk. Final report will be submitted by May 2019.

Study 2 (CRDS): Analysis of the environment impacts of large scale expansion of pond fisheries and climate change affects. Final report will be submitted by June 2019.

Study 3 (Department of Civil Engineering, BUET): Monitoring the performance of village protection, model village, Upazila road slope protection. Final report will be submitted by October 2019.

E. Project implementation

a. Development Effectiveness

Effectiveness and Developmental Focus		
Effectiveness	Rating: 4	Previous rating: 4
Justification of rating		
<p>The project has made significant improvement in overall effectiveness since the MTR and since the last supervision mission, having surpassed its outreach target by 11%. However, with only one year left for implementation, the cumulative physical progress is only at 76%. There are still some lags in implementation. The project management has drawn up a comprehensive action plan to achieve the remaining targets and it is well possible that the project will reach over 90% of its targets at completion.</p>		
Log-Frame Analysis & Main Issues of Effectiveness		
<p>The total outreach at supervision was 342,578 households. Under the HILIP 152,141 households have reached (against target of 115,000), under CALIP 190,437 households were reached (against the targeted 191,950). The total physical progress is at 76%. With one financial year left for project implementation, there are considerable implementation lags in mainly three components: Comp 1 (bridges and culverts at upazila level); Comp 2 (village protection, slope protection and irrigation works); Comp 3 (beels); and Comp 4 (farmer field days, vocational trainings).</p> <p>Given the complex interventions and geographically extreme climatic conditions, it was noted that the project made slow progress in the aforementioned activities, partly due to previously pending budget reallocation, the procedure of revising DPP, and partly due to lag in timely planning. The target revision and reallocation process was completed in October 2018 and will now allow the project to solve administrative/procedural issues and proceed pending works.</p> <p>With regard to the logframe outcome and output targets:</p>		
<p>Outcome 1: Enhanced access to markets, livelihood opportunities and social services:Per data collected at MTR, the project has facilitated an increase of traffic volume on upazila roads by 72%, against a target of 100%, and increased volume of goods markets to 57%, against the targeted 50%. For the associated outputs, the project has completed 229 kms of roads (target: 255 kms); 2315 m of bridges and culverts (target: 2820 m); and 32 boat landing ghats (target: 40).</p>		
<p>Outcome 2: Enhanced village mobility, increased farm production and protection against extreme weather events: Per MTR data, traffic volume on village roads have increased by 63% (target: 100%); and 87% village markets are operational (target 100%). However, the project is yet to collect data on decrease in percentage of houses destroyed by wave action. Associated output targets are mostly 80% achieved, except for number of villages protected (120 against targeted 175); no. of beel banks protected (6 against targeted 50); HHs supported with increased water availability (3350 against targeted 5550).</p>		
<p>Outcome 3: Enhanced access to sustainable water bodies:The project has major lags for this outcome. So far it has improved 61 of the targeted 215 beels to improve; only 41 kms of beel canals excavated of the targeted 100 kms; and only 182,000 swamp trees planted so far, while the target is 300,000. Data on impact of project's interventions on fishing HHs incomes are yet to be determined.</p>		
<p>Outcome 4: Enhanced production, diversification and marketing of crop and livestock produce:Here the project has promising outcomes. At MTR, the project reported 57% of beneficiaries adopting new technologies promoted by the project; and 19,000 HHs that participated in training reporting improved production (against a targeted 20,000). However, associated outputs with regard to vocational trainings is significantly lagging behind, namely, against a target of 450 batches trained, only 180 batches have been trained so far.</p>		
<p>Finally, Outcome 5: Enhanced capacity and knowledge to contend with climate change impacts:The project has completed 120 village protection systems against the targeted 175. Furthermore, due to the delay in the activities, the impact of these climate smart village protection systems will probably not be known before the end of the project. With regard to the policy studies, delays in the procurement of service providers for the thematic studies have limited the use of the results in policy dialogue and enhancing the capacity to contend with climate change impacts. However, the studies are expected to be completed before the end of the year and there will still be time for some policy impact.</p>		
Development Focus		
Targeting and Outreach	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 5

Justification of rating

The project has developed and implemented a systematic poverty targeting strategy that is aligned to the project's pro-poor approach. Targeting is based on the outcomes of village level participatory rural assessments (PRA) and household surveys. The PRA defines the economic classification of households, based on which the poorest households are targeted for delivery of project services. The efficiency of the poverty targeting approach has been verified through field observations. The project has improved its outreach significantly since last mission. Currently it has overachieved its target by 11%. While under the HILIP activities a total of 152,141 households have reached (against target of 115,000), under CALIP the project has reached 190,437 households (against the targeted 191,950).

Main issues

Youth targeting. The project has made a concerted effort to make project activities attractive to young people. Young people (both women and men) seem make up the majority participants of the vocational trainings. Field visits demonstrated that technical trainings on wiring, plumbing, welding and driving were almost entirely attended by under 25 year old men. The project has specifically targeted young people who are not employed or received any training, to certify them as skilled labour and provide 80% of them with employment opportunities.

LCS. An issue remains with targeting of beneficiaries for LCS groups and construction activities. This is mostly due to the shortage of labour in the Haor area, especially during the harvesting period. This has led to few beneficiaries willing to participate in this activity and preferring to work as agriculture labour during harvesting season (which overlaps with construction season). Taking into account that only one year is left for project completion, the mission recommends discontinuation of minor earthworks being carried out by LCSs.

Gender equality & women's participation

Rating: 5

Previous rating: 5

Justification of rating

The focus on gender equality and encouraging women's participation in project activities have remained consistently high and the mission finds it to be of satisfactory quality.

Main issues

High participation of poor and destitute women was recorded. Women account for 46% of the project's direct beneficiaries (158,341 women). The project has provided targeted livelihoods support to women through on-farm trainings (crops, horticulture), livestock training, off-farm vocational training and also creating employment opportunities and supporting business development for women. The project has been transformational in as much as having women participate in 268 batches of 7 day residential trainings on product manufacturing (tailoring, wood, bamboo and jute products). Field observations indicated at approximately 30% of benefiting women starting self-employment activities following these trainings. The project is also committed in the remaining project period to having women in non-traditional livelihoods training, such as driving. Women are also engaged in decision making bodies of Beel Management Committees, Market Management Committee and Infrastructure Management committee. The project has also hired 67 women as community development facilitators, 42% of the total recruit. This is an impressive achievement considering the project area's social context.

Issues. The project has been without a Gender Advisor since July 2018 and it has been indicated that a new advisor will come on-board in April 2019. It is suggested that the new Gender Advisor focus on supporting the existing women's group in small business development activities, that are based on local market demands and feasibility of acquiring materials and selling possibilities in the local market.

Agricultural Productivity

Rating: 5

Previous rating: 4

Justification of rating

The project has made very good contribution in diversifying sources income by promoting fruits and vegetables, poultry and livestock, various pond fisheries culture, small fish production (mola fish) as newer sources of income for the households in an area overly dependent on rice production and open water fisheries as main livelihood options. The livelihoods diversification approach has increased income and reduced poverty.

Main issues

The project has successfully promoted a range of livelihoods opportunities and commodities, including: crops, horticulture, poultry, livestock, and pond fisheries under component 4. Also of relevance is increased fisheries output and diversity resulting from investments in beels development and community resources management systems under Component 3.

This includes building the capacity of common interest groups (CIGs) and Beels User Groups to increase their production skills and linking them to service providers for credit, inputs, extension support etc.

Monitoring studies conducted by WorldFish since 2014 show that the project's interventions in the beels is generating tangible benefits. There has been an increase in total fish production and productivity in the beels under the project, from 543 Kg/ha in 2012/13 to 733 Kg/ha in 2017/2018. In terms of biodiversity the number of fish and prawn species have increased from 105 to 126 during the same period. Comparatively non-project beels recorded declining productivity and biodiversity in that time frame.

The project has made significant progress in the last year to reach the target of forming 3,700 CIGs and providing them with various capacity development packages and services. The demonstrations on horticulture crops has been done very well and generated significant interest not only among CIG members but also adjacent farmers. There is evidence of increased crop yields of high quality crops through improved disease and pest protection.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Development Effectiveness		
Vegetable demonstrations Expand successful high value vegetable demonstrations in an outreach programme to scale up successes.	PMU	10/2019
Value chain studies Undertake three value chain studies for successfully demonstrated technologies – brinjal, aroid and duck (meat and eggs) to analyse the potential for enhancing farmers returns.	PMU and service provider	12/2019

Nutrition

Rating: 5

Previous rating: 4

Justification of rating

The project has made good progress in enhancing availability and access to a wider variety of nutritious foods for household consumption, both through direct garden production and those purchased with the increased farm incomes. The nutritional benefits come from increased production from mola polyculture (a highly nutritious species), increased availability of vitamin and mineral rich vegetables, increased availability of meat and eggs (from ducks), while livestock groups in some cases sell sheep to acquire a milk cow, all which lead to increasing protein and micronutrient content of the household diet. The improved sanitation undertaken under the village internal services are also likely to reduce incidents of water borne illness and parasite load.

Main issues

While addressing access and availability it would have been beneficial to undertake some specific nutrition training on utilisation of foods to obtain the maximum dietary benefit. In the case of mola, the beneficiaries demonstrated knowledge on the nutritional aspects of consumption of whole fish and acknowledge the benefits in terms of human health related to increased Vitamin A, Calcium and Zinc from consumption of whole fish. They also acknowledged the need to introduce variation in the diet at a young age ranging from 8 months two years.

Increases in vegetable availability was also appreciated with beneficiaries also recognising for example the high iron availability from consumption of young aroid leaves and stolons. The expansion of vegetable production in the final year should be combined with elements of nutrition training for beneficiaries so that they derive maximum benefit from these innovations.

Apart from improved dietary diversity, prevention of diarrhoeal disease and parasite load is also necessary to optimise nutrition outcomes. The improvement in sanitation on the Haor villages through provision of latrines under the village services will assist. However a training programme on health and hygiene in food preparation and consumption of clean water would add benefits. Overall the inclusion of nutrition awareness training would be desirable, though introduction as a comprehensive activity at this late stage of the project may not be feasible. Instead some nutritional awareness may be mentioned in some of the ongoing training events, however detailed nutritional training (including nutritional food products preparation) should be considered for any future projects as an integral part of project design.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Development Effectiveness		
Mola Polyculture intervention Expand the Mola Polyculture intervention to more interested farmers (250) who already have a pond and the right conditions to benefit Make use of demonstration ponds, learning pathways and linkages to services (e.g. Mola brood ponds) already developed without creating new structures	PMU	01/2020

Adaptation to Climate Change

Rating: 5

Previous rating: 5

Justification of rating

The project made significant efforts to effectively implement climate adaptation activities. A good physical progress was observed in village protection infrastructure (69%) and village internal services (73%). Out of the 175 planned villages, 120 have been protected through the combined CC block-vetiver model. Although only a limited number of killas (temporary storage facilities) have been constructed (39% progress), farmers reported 125 MT paddy was saved during the Haor flash floods in 2017. Vocational trainings are proving to be a key activity for income diversification with a focus on youth and a strong linkage with different government and NGOs providing certificates leading to high job placement. Significant advances were observed for FFEWS and its dissemination to farmers.

Main issues

The mission realises the difficulties to implement infrastructure schemes during the flooding season. CALIP placed more emphasis on climate change adaptation including low cost bio-engineering options for village protection. However, the achievements on beel bank and killa protection using vegetative species and model villages fall short of expected achievements. The project constructed 14 village protection system using only vetiver but omitted chemically treated bamboo and vetiver-geo-jute option.

Knowledge management. Although 3 studies are completed, communicating the results to line departments (at District level) can be improved. With regards to the study on 'monitoring and performance of village protection', more time is required for a credible assessment of use of vetiver for road and slope protection. The contract with BUET ends in October 2019 and this would not suffice for measuring the performance of implemented activities.

Moving forward, LGED needs to realise the importance of multi-sectoral dialogue in responding to climate change related events. More involvement of DAE and the Forestry department is key and the demonstration activities for taro and brinjal show promising undertakings. These demos are a good example of cooperation among various line departments (DAE) in supporting farmers to access better seed varieties (hybrid brinjal varieties), market information and fertilizers but also on the soft training (seed bed preparation, transplanting, optimal dosage of fertilizers). PMU/DMU is encouraged to undertake periodic surveys focusing on IGA and evidence of improved livelihoods which will support the climate resilience building assessment for CALIP and also contribute to any demand analysis for training in specific value chains. An impact assessment to quantify adoption rate (post-demo) and increases in income (for early adopters) is required given that some beneficiaries stated the inability to afford start-up kits following the completion of their training and others have difficulties in replicating on their own due to limited access to irrigation or land.

Under the fisheries sector, Mola is a good option towards climate adaptation (domesticating a wild species within its environment), as it can breed in ponds and is an element of diversification through polyculture (Mola, carp, Tilapia) thus reducing risks and enhancing productivity of the whole system.

FFEWS: IWFM is on track to deliver the recommended agreed actions during the implementation support mission dated October 2018. An internal validation workshop at LGED was conducted on 24th January 2019 with the objective to assess progress on statistical analysis, calibration and validation of the WRF model. The FFEWS system developed by IWFM will be tested for this flash flood season (April-May). A Technical Validation Workshop is planned for the 6th April in BUET with the participation of BWDB, LGED, BMD and national experts on flood and flash flood modelling. Subsequently, IWFM will hold training courses (weather, hydrological and hydraulic modelling) between 9-12 April 2019. Deployment of the FFEWS system is planned for June 2019. BWDB has planned a technical workshop in May 2019 where IWM will present their results. A follow up national seminar will also be conducted in July 2019, in order to assess both models (IWM and IWFM) and formally adopt the forecasting model and dissemination strategy. The mobile-based app developed by BWDB was launched in April 2018 and will be continuously refined to provide early warning in Bengali to farmers.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Development Effectiveness		
Discontinue the testing of different vegetative protection models Discontinue the testing of different vegetative protection models due to limited time in assessing their impact against wave action	PMU	04/2019
FFEWS A no-cost contract extension for IWFM up to July 2020	PMU	04/2019
Completion of HILIP construction works HILIP: Complete selection, design, internal approval and contracting of all remaining works.	PMU/LGED	06/2019
Completion of CALIP construction and piloting works Complete selection, design, internal approval and contracting of all remaining works.	PMU/LGED	06/2019
Infrastructure Develop a mechanism to maintain and monitor slope and road protection infrastructure systems using vetiver after project completion	PMU	06/2020
FFEWS BWDB to forecast model developed at IWFM during 2020 flash flood season.	PMU/BWDB/IWFM	06/2020

b. Sustainability and Scaling up

Institutions and Policy Engagement

Rating: 5

Previous rating: 5

Justification of rating

The project has successfully collaborated with the Ministry of Land to (MoL) to transfer 434 beels to the project. Currently it is advocating for extension of duration of lease of beels to BUGs beyond the project period. Besides, the project assists the fishermen/women (BUG members) to receive fishermen/women IDs from the Department of Fisheries, and to get BUGs registered as cooperative societies with the Department of Cooperatives. Additionally it will be working with the BWDB and Ministry of Water Resources to accept FFWES developer flash flood forecasting models to provide flash flood warning to haor residents.

Main issues

The present policy of the government is to lease the beels to BUGs up to the end of the project which is too short for sustainable benefits for the BUG members. The government's another policy is to lease out beels fisherfolks cooperatives that requires all BUGs to be registered as cooperatives societies.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Sustainability and Scaling Up		
Beels and canals Contract out all re-excavation works of beels and canals combined with beel/killa bank protection	PMU/LGED	06/2019
BUGs Engage with the Department of Fisheries for the issuance of fishing IDs to BUGs; consequently facilitate registration of BUGs as cooperatives.	PMU	07/2019
Tripartite meetings Organize tripartite meetings of LGD, MoL and Ministry of Fisheries and Livestock to resolve the transfer of remaining beels, duration of leases and extension of leases that are due to expire.	PMU	08/2019

Partnership-building

Rating: 5

Previous rating: 5

Justification of rating

The project has been collaborating locally with DAE, DLS, Department of Fisheries, and Department of Forestry to implement livelihood component of HILIP-CALIP. It has been collaborating with these departments to utilize departmental trainers as resource persons, and establishing linkages of project beneficiaries with the services of these GoB departments. For example, project beneficiaries receive veterinary services from DLS. A number of project staff and beneficiaries have received training on bamboo treatment in Bangladesh Forest Research Institute.

The project is managing the FFEWS component in collaborating with four agencies: IWFM/BUET, IWM, Meteorological Department, and FFWC/BWDB. It will develop flash flood warning dissemination system in collaboration with BWDB.

Main issues

N/A

Human and Social Capital and Empowerment

Rating: 5

Previous rating: 5

Justification of rating

The project has achieved demonstrable impact on empowerment and created human and social capital. The project empowered poor people, particularly vulnerable groups such as women and young people, through targeted interventions. The project expanded women's access to and control over productive assets – knowledge, capital and natural resources (beels). It enhanced women's mobility through community infrastructure and service, and provision of sanitation. It supported women and men to manage community based resources in groups and empowered them to be decision makers through trainings on group management and productive skills (BUGs, CIGs and LCSs). It supported young people to access vocational trainings to become skilled labourers and to find employment or start their own enterprises.

Main issues

The social and human capital generated through the beel development and community management may not be sustainable if the Ministry of Land does not extend the lease granted to the BUGs for the management of the beels for at least another 6 years. The project beneficiaries, and the ecosystem in general, have only just begun to reap the benefits of common resource management and conservation practises, and taking away lease ownership at this point from the BUGs would not provide sufficient time to get returns on the Government's investments and the social capital thus created.

Quality of Beneficiary Participation

Rating: 5

Previous rating: 5

Justification of rating

Beneficiary participation was observed to be good in the field. The presence of community development facilitators and the undertaking of PRA process has ensured enthusiastic engagement of the target group. Activities and trainings offered by the project mostly respond to beneficiary and market demand. A total of 253,877 people have participated in the various production groups (CIGs), community resource management groups (BUGs), local construction societies (LCSs) and training groups. Furthermore, per project data at MTR, 57% of trained farmers are adopting recommended technologies. The project has been enhancing the ability of the poor HHs to participate in their own decision-making through specific trainings and empowerment generated from the newly created local group.

Main issues

However, an issue remains with beneficiary participation in LCS groups. This is mostly due to the shortage of labour in the Haor area, especially during the harvesting period. This has led to major delays in certain construction work. In view of this, and taking into account that only one year is left for project completion, the mission recommends discontinuation of earthworks being carried out by LCSs.

Responsiveness of Service Providers	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 4
--	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

The project has engaged a number of NGOs and BRTC to organize vocational training courses for project beneficiaries. It has been found that the providers organized good quality training courses on time. In some instances as many as 80% of trainees have received wage employment, and others are opting for self-employment. The project is planning to complete the remaining training courses on time.

Main issues

Although the project is on track on vocational training courses two areas need attention: a) completion of training on tailoring where the contract with the training provider has been signed very recently; and b) BRTC is providing good quality training and on track to complete driving training by the trainees are not receiving driving licenses on time as BRTA (the licensing authority) is not organizing enough licensing tests.

<i>Agreed Action</i>	<i>Responsibility</i>	<i>Agreed Date</i>
Sustainability and Scaling Up		
Service providers Expedite contracting out of service providers for finalising remaining training courses (include business support services)	PMU	05/2019
Trainings Include basic business organisation skills training into each vocational training module. Work with the course providers to develop suitable business skills modules for inclusion in ongoing training	PMU and training service providers	07/2019

Environment and Natural Resource Management	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 5
--	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

This section is rated as satisfactory. The project achievements on community resource management (especially fisheries) and slope and village protection are notable. The collaboration with World Fish shows promising results in terms of promoting polyculture systems which increase fish species and catch relative to available water body. The project's significant impact in the villages is visible through access to roads (easier access for traders), toilets and sanitation facilities, access to clean drinking water, increase in sales of poultry eggs, increase in market price of rice – from 400BDT per 20 kg up to 1,000BDT, and increased employment opportunities. Important to also note the strong community ownership towards these investments prioritized through a participatory approach.

Main issues

Environment and natural resource management are central to the livelihoods of beneficiaries in the Haor areas. The challenges are multiple and diverse (deep Haor, mid and high lands). Heavy siltation is effectively reducing the sizes and

potential productivity of beels. In Sunamganj, this problem is more acute given slash and burn cultivation in the Meghalaya hills and the large number of coal and lime mines which are being quarried (through the use of dynamites) leading to heavy siltation. Coupled with increasing temperatures and warming waters, the deep Haor areas are subject to ever-increasing social, environmental and huge ecological impacts on fish mortality rates.

An emphasis on integrated farming systems would capitalise on the various activities supported by the project. A deeper holistic understanding of the interrelations between crops, livestock, land, water and climate is required to address the environment and natural resource management. For example, vetiver stem and leaves make excellent fodder with high nutritional value if cut and fed when young (which is also an important maintenance practice for village protection works). Inter-cropping is a necessary adaptive and income diversification measure (as mono-cropping can lead to risks of loss of harvest due to pests and diseases). Another important product in the Haor is bamboo, which is currently used for temporary wave protection. In Mukthakai village, beneficiaries reported spending 10,000 BDT per year on bamboo, its planting not being a viable option due to limited land space availability.

Heavy use of chemical fertilizers and pesticides needs to be taken into consideration. The use of manufactured feed application is detrimental also to fish ponds. In addition, related to the livestock sector, an analysis of the demand for veterinary services and the types and causes of diseases (especially during monsoon periods) is required. Para-vets and communities repeatedly stated that the proximity of livestock increases *Peste des petits ruminants* (PPR) for goats and Foot & Mouth disease for cows.

Under the various livelihood studies, the selected companies (CEGIS, BUET) are compiling a matrix ranking of climate risks based on frequency, vulnerabilities, capacities and potential future impacts. Topographical measurements need to be determined and a clear representation of the study area mapped (by taking photographs and tracking GPS locations measuring slope, road width, length of strip where vetiver is grown well, surrounding area conditions, length of distress etc.). Monitoring vegetation types suitable to environmental parameters of the Haor areas such as hydrology, soil etc., and flood tolerance characteristics that influence and regulate growth and propagation of vegetative species will be the bulk of analysis for the last project year. Particular considerations of the agriculture and fisheries sectors are key in order to develop evidence-based policies and also indicate climate risk hotspot areas.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Sustainability and Scaling Up		
Recruitment of CEGIS For the study on the 'examination of dynamics of reforestation and strengthening of ecological resilience' recruit CEGIS via single source selection method.	PMU	06/2019
BUET Contract extension of BUET up to June 2020 (if there is flexibility with the DPP)	PMU	09/2019
ToR Develop TOR for 5th study (pro-poor pathways for development)	PMU/IFAD	10/2019

Exit Strategy

Rating: 5

Previous rating: 5

Justification of rating

The project has well defined exit strategy for each component/activity. The Upazila, Union and Villages roads will be repaired and maintained as part of regular government program. The project has received maintenance funds to maintain roads in all project Upazilas. Maintenance of village markets is the responsibility of MMC. Similarly, any minor repair and maintenance of village protection systems and irrigation channels will be done by respective villagers/users. The same is true for village internal services under CALIP.

Beels are managed by BUGs who are gradually getting registered as cooperative societies. However, there is uncertainty about continued access to beels by BUGs after the project period.

Farmers and traders have been producing and buying/selling farm/non-farm produces which are expected to continue beyond the project period as long as the IGAs are profitable. The flash forecasting models are already used by BWDB for forecasting flash floods in haor areas. The project and its partners are undertaking steps to officially incorporate the models in BWDB system for flash flood forecasting.

Main issues

N/A

Potential for Scaling-up	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 5
---------------------------------	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

The HILIP project was itself scaled-up version of SCBRMP: expanded to five districts from one districts, and from 11 Upazilas to 28 Upazilas with a much larger resources to implement many activities. The HILIP was complemented with resources from ASAP to implement CALIP. The recently launched PROVATi3 project replicated a number of HILIP-CALIP activities such as construction of rural roads and markets, application of vetiver for road protection, and much larger vocational training program.

Main issues

N/A

c. Project Management

Quality of Project Management	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 5
--------------------------------------	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

Overall project management has been satisfactory (5), same as previous year. The PMU has undertaken steps to recruit six professional staff members as recommended.

Main issues

The PMU has completed recruitment process of six (6) professional staff members (Livelihoods and Training Specialist, Community Resources Management Specialist, Gender Advisor, M & E Specialist (mid-level), District Infrastructure Management Specialist, District Training Specialist) who will be joining in May 2019. Besides the project need to extend service contracts of all project consultants up to June 2020 (single source contract).

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Project Management		
Service contracts Extension of service contracts of all project consultants up to June 2020 (Single source)	PMU	05/2019
Endline Survey and Impact Assessment Study Developing TORs and contracting of service provider for end line survey and impact assessment study	PMU	10/2019

Knowledge Management	Rating: 4	Previous rating: 4
-----------------------------	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

The project has a Knowledge Management strategy, but so far KM has been largely limited to reporting. However, the project's KM implementation strategy is demonstrating improvement. The project has appointed the M&E officer to also be the KM Officer and so far there has been a visible improvement. The project has developed a brochure and a few case studies, namely on vocational training and women's empowerment activities. Plans for dissemination of project's results have been made at local levels, through radio time and skits in the local markets.

Main issues

The mission has encouraged the project to also hold a series of workshops on dedicated thematic areas to attract attention of policy makers to successful project outcomes, namely: (a) hold a day long 'Technical Validation and

Dissemination Workshop' to publicize the early warning system developed by the project. The project should engage renowned water/flood/modeling experts as moderators for the workshop; (b) Organize a high profile National Dissemination Seminar in Mid-May 2019; (c) Build dissemination strategy during to disseminate project's successful outcomes at policy levels; (e) Advocacy workshop to formally adopt the forecasting model by BWDB and dissemination system by BWDB.

Value for Money

Rating: 4

Previous rating: 4

Justification of rating

The project implementation could be considered as efficient as the investments have exceeded 70% of physical progress in major components (component 1 and 2 of HILIP). IFAD disbursement under HILIP is 83% (as of 7 March 2019) versus 80% of elapsed time. Similarly, disbursement of CALIP is 65% against time lapse of 76%. The project has made very good progress in Component 4 Livelihoods (both HILIP and CALIP) and Component 5 Building Resilience. The project lost time due to delay in revision of DPP and halting of project activities during last national election.

Main issues

The appraisal projected a total project cost of USD 134.8 million, and as of 7 March 2019, a total expenditure of USD 83.296 million was recorded against disbursement of USD 94.32 million, or 88.31% of disbursement (which is 70% of total project cost). The project invested significantly in community and communication infrastructures under component 1 and 2. But to complete all activities and invest all project resources, the focus has to be on completion of all infrastructure activities under Component 1 and 2, and beel development under component 3. Up to 7 March 2019, management cost is 16.72% of total actual cost. But the ratio is expected to be somewhat different by the end of the project.

Cost per beneficiary household is estimated at USD 243 presently (USD 277 at appraisal). The project has exceeded target for household under HILIP (currently 152,141) and reached the target for CALIP (currently 190,437).

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Project Management		
Deployment of contractors for minor earth works Approval for discontinuation of LCS and deployment of contractors for minor earth works	IFAD	03/2019
Testing of different vegetative protection models Discontinue the testing of different vegetative protection models due to limited time in assessing their impact against wave action	PMU	04/2019
Completion of remaining construction Complete all designs/estimations, and contract out all remaining boat landing ghats, minor earth works, and maintenance works.	PMU/LGED	06/2019
Completion of HILIP construction works HILIP: Complete selection, design, internal approval and contracting of all remaining works.	PMU/LGED	06/2019
Completion of CALIP construction and piloting works Complete selection, design, internal approval and contracting of all remaining works.	PMU/LGED	06/2019
Infrastructure Develop a mechanism to maintain and monitor slope and road protection infrastructure systems using vetiver after project completion.	PMU	06/2019

Coherence between AWPB and Implementation**Rating: 4****Previous rating: 3****Justification of rating**

The present rating is 4, which is an improvement from previous rating of 3 at the end of supervision mission 2018. The improvement is due to significant annual as well as cumulative achievements against all main activities under Components 1, 2, 4 and 5. However, annual progress of beel development under Component 3 remains poor.

AWPB Inputs and Outputs Review and Implementation Progress

Component 1 has made very good progress in terms of annual and cumulative progress: a) cumulative progress of 88% (annual progress 80%) of Upazila road; b) cumulative progress of 91% (annual progress of 78% of 78%); c) cumulative progress of 80% of boat landing ghats. Similarly, Component 2 funded by HILIP and CALIP has made good progress where main activities made good progress: community road (89%); village market development (91%); village protection works (66%); and market protection works (95%). Under CALIP village protection works (69%) and village internal services (73%) are best performers. Component 3 is performing below the target, both annual and cumulative targets. The main reason identified by the project is delay re-excavation of beels by LCS. Component 4 and 5 are expected to complete all activities as planned for the year.

Performance of M&E System**Rating: 5****Previous rating: 4****Justification of rating**

The project has an efficient M&E system and personnel with relevant experience in place to track physical and financial progress. Primary data is collected during implementation of activities by community development facilitators, social organisation officers and infrastructure officers at the upazila levels. The data is then validated by respective district M&E officers. M&E data is collected and aggregated in a timely manner and is also used for management decision making. The M&E activities capture data aggregated by gender and beneficiary groups. Progress reporting is done bi-annually with good quality narrative reports which also contain qualitative analysis based on data at output level.

M&E System Review

Considering that the project is in the last year of implementation, the mission recommends starting the contracting process of a service provider to develop and undertake the endline survey and impact assessment study, which needs to be completed by June 2020.

Requirements of Social, Environmental and Climate Assessment Procedures (SECAP)**Rating: 4****Previous rating: 4****Justification of rating**

A rigorous Environment and Climate Change Assessment (ECCA) was developed during the design of CALIP. The concept note was informed by the ECCA and was included in the COSOP pipeline. The ECCA is thus regarded as equivalent to the SECAP.

SECAP Review

LGED has rigorous Environmental Management Plans and Screening criteria and methodologies at various stages of infrastructure development (pre-construction, construction and operation). These plans are also being adopted by District and Upazila level staff including Department of Agricultural Extension (DAE) and other Ministries/Departments. With respect to the mitigation of environmental impacts, LGED follows its Environmental Management and Monitoring Plans and assures efforts to provide oversight that the guidelines are applied consistently by its Contractors.

d. Financial Management & Execution**Disbursement by financier**

Type	Name	Current Amount	Disbursed Amount	Actual Rate
Domestic Financing breakdown	National Government	\$32,424,113		
Co-financing breakdown,	Spanish Fund	\$29,745,137		

Acceptable Disbursement Rate

Rating: 4

Previous rating: 5

Justification of rating

There is no significant change in the disbursement target with the implementation progress. The loan proceeds seem to have used, accounted and reported in an acceptable manner.

Main issues

In case of HILIP, the overall disbursement from IFAD increased to 83% as of March 07, 2019, which commensurate the implementation period (80%). Cumulative disbursement comprising of IFAD loan, IFAD Grant and STF stands at SDR 43.3 million (in USD 62.12 million). However, the disbursement percentage would vary while calculated based on US\$ due to loss in currency exchange. In case of CALIP, the cumulative disbursement stands at SDR 6.47 million (and in USD 9.02 million) which is 65% of the total commitment while 76% of the implementation period has elapsed.

The funding of the categories "Civil works (Communication infrastructure)" and "Civil works (Community infrastructure)" was shared between the STF Loan, the Loan 847 and Government contribution. Since the STF Loan has reached 95% of disbursement and will run out soon, and if the prevailing financing percentage is applied consistently until the completion of the project, the Loan 847 will have an unspent balance of approximately USD 5 million, in both categories. Therefore, the mission recommends an amendment to the financing agreement stating that once the STF loan is "spent" 100%, the project can utilize the loan 847 according to the following ratios in "Civil works (Communication infrastructure)" and "Civil works (Community infrastructure)" categories:

Categories	Loan 847	Government contribution	Total
Civil works (communication infrastructure)	50%	50%	100%
Civil works (community infrastructure)	90%	10%	100%

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Financial Management & Execution		
Amendment to the financing agreement Amendment to the financing agreement in order to avoid any jeopardy of project disbursement and activity so that the project can utilize the Loan 847 amount for remaining periods.	HILIP	06/2019

Fiduciary Aspects

Quality of Financial Management

Rating: 4

Previous rating: 4

Justification of rating

The rating will remain same mainly because of not acting on some actions agreed previously along with other reasons including but not limited to delays in submission of Annual Work Plan and Budget (AWPB); the response on audit findings and not having adequate details of advances provided out of the project proceeds.

Main issues

The project has made some notable improvements in financial management operation, especially in achieving some agreed actions of last mission, however out of 12 actions, the project could act on only 5 and there are 3 issues which has become irrelevant over the time due to sluggish actions from the project part. A number of areas need improvements such as i) timely submission of AWPB ii) outstanding advance shown in designated account reconciliation statement to be reconciled with advance register iii) a difference on the per component expenses between manual record and accounting system to be reconciled with each other and iv) speedy response and resolution of audit findings. The mission noted that the project has submitted the AWPB for FY 2018-19 with a delay of 145 days and the budget variance report is absent since AWPB was not incorporated in the system. The details of LCS and training advance was absent, but a balancing amount was reported to be the advance. The designated account reconciliation shows an amount USD 2.85 million on "outstanding advance to be cleared" was paid as advance to LCS, Training and Implementing Partners, which could not be fully reconciled back to the registers maintained for advances. Also, a number of outstanding LCS advances exist relating to FY 2014-15 and FY 2015-16, which require either adjustment and justification of expenditure or recovery of advances. Fifteen (15) WAs have been submitted to IFAD since the last mission, 3 of which were advance requests and 12 were justification. The mission has reviewed the 12 justifications WAs and has verified the documentation related to statements of expenditure (SOE) items on a sample basis. The main findings include inappropriate filing system and incomplete description in SOEs makes difficult to trace the file and vouchers. There was no internal audit after 2016 which was carried out by the internal audit unit at LGED, though there were no significant audit issues raised. The project took almost one year to respond to the audit observations resulting non-resolution of auditor's observations since last supervision mission. The auditors have reported nine audit observations in the management letter attached to the audit report for FY 2017-18 and the issues seem to make substantial deviation of internal control, which the project shall clarify and take necessary steps on the resolution of the observation.

It was noted that LGED submitted 3 withdrawal application for IFAD loan, ASAP and grant to correct the mis-categorization, which currently being reviewed by IFAD.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Financial Management & Execution		
Updated advance register Updated advance register to be attached to the monthly fund flow statement with segregation of LCS/training advances starting from April 2019. Reconcile the advance balance at DA reconciliation with advance register of each district office to be done on monthly basis.	HILIP	05/2019
Produce component wise expenditure statement and budget variance from TOMPRO per month which needs to be reconciled with manual records.	HILIP	06/2019
Adjustment and justification of expenditure of long pending advances relating to FY 2014-15 and FY 2015-16 or recovery of such advances	HILIP	06/2019

Quality and Timeliness of Audit

Rating: 4

Previous rating: 3

Justification of rating

The audit report has arrived on time. Despite the auditor stated that the audit is carried out following International Standards on Auditing, the audit is not in compliance with ISAs.

Main issues

The audit report has arrived on time. Despite the auditor stated that the audit is carried out following International Standards on Auditing, the audit is not in compliance with ISAs.

Counterparts Funds

Rating: 5

Previous rating: 4

Justification of rating

The rating is upgraded mainly because GoB maintained counterpart financing ratio in accordance with the loan agreement over time, although there are areas of improvement including timeliness in making those payments from treasury.

Main issues

Counterpart financing equivalent to US\$ 23.17 million flown to the project as needed. However, due to engagement of other payment offices in the approval process of counterpart financing, the likelihood of delay in making payments increases which in turn delays the incurrence of the project expenses.

Compliance with Loan Covenants	Rating: 4	Previous rating: 4
---------------------------------------	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

The rating was not upgraded despite of the project mostly complying with the legal covenants, because some minor exceptions still exists.

Main issues

The covenants of the financing agreements were complied except for accident/health insurance for the project personnel and insurance of goods financed from the financing proceeds in a manner consistent with sound commercial practice.

Procurement

Procurement	Rating: 4	Previous rating: 4
--------------------	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

The procurement rating remains same as previous year.

Procurement Review

The updated PP, which provides the status of on-going procurement (planned vs actual) is pending. There are delays in procurement experienced in 2018-19 due to the electoral process effecting civil in terms of volume for the 2018-19 fiscal periods. Given the limited window for construction the Project must ensure pending procurement for the 2018-19 fiscal period and new procurement for the 2019-2020 fiscal periods are completed between June - October 2019 enabling the contractors to start and complete the physical construction before seasonal disruptions delay construction. Delays may cause physical construction to extend beyond the Project Completion Date, resulting in risk of expenditure to declared as ineligible expenditures or the expenditures to be borne by the GOB resources.

Contract management and administration of civil works contract should be improved since there are numerous on going civil work contracts which have been delayed up to 3 fiscal years. The project should address non-performance risk as a result of delays. The mission identified cases whereby physical performance in some of these ongoing but delayed contracts to be below 60% contributing to an elevated level of risk as a result of non-performance.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Financial Management & Execution		
Update, monitor and complete all infrastructure procurement Submit the updated procurement plan (planned vs actual) every 2 months, enables tracking and reporting of procurement and award of infrastructure (civil works). Ensure all procurement and award is completed between April-June 2019.	PMU - DMU	06/2019
Action Plan Prepare an action plan identifying follow up and action taken to address all delayed civil work contracts with physical progress of below 60%. Submit action plan updates every quarter.	PMU and DMU	12/2019

F. Agreed Actions

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
----------------------	-----------------------	--------------------

Development Effectiveness		
Discontinue the testing of different vegetative protection models Discontinue the testing of different vegetative protection models due to limited time in assessing their impact against wave action	PMU	04/2019
FFEWS A no-cost contract extension for IWFM up to July 2020	PMU	04/2019
Completion of HILIP construction works HILIP: Complete selection, design, internal approval and contracting of all remaining works.	PMU/LGED	06/2019
Completion of CALIP construction and piloting works Complete selection, design, internal approval and contracting of all remaining works.	PMU/LGED	06/2019
Vegetable demonstrations Expand successful high value vegetable demonstrations in an outreach programme to scale up successes.	PMU	10/2019
Value chain studies Undertake three value chain studies for successfully demonstrated technologies – brinjal, aroid and duck (meat and eggs) to analyse the potential for enhancing farmers returns.	PMU and service provider	12/2019
Mola Polyculture intervention Expand the Mola Polyculture intervention to more interested farmers (250) who already have a pond and the right conditions to benefit Make use of demonstration ponds, learning pathways and linkages to services (e.g. Mola brood ponds) already developed without creating new structures	PMU	01/2020
Infrastructure Develop a mechanism to maintain and monitor slope and road protection infrastructure systems using vetiver after project completion	PMU	06/2020
FFEWS BWDB to forecast model developed at IWFM during 2020 flash flood season.	PMU/BWDB/IWFM	06/2020
Sustainability and Scaling Up		
Service providers Expedite contracting out of service providers for finalising remaining training courses (include business support services)	PMU	05/2019

Beels and canals Contract out all re-excavation works of beels and canals combined with beel/kill bank protection	PMU/LGED	06/2019
Recruitment of CEGIS For the study on the 'examination of dynamics of reforestation and strengthening of ecological resilience' recruit CEGIS via single source selection method.	PMU	06/2019
BUGs Engage with the Department of Fisheries for the issuance of fishing IDs to BUGs; consequently facilitate registration of BUGs as cooperatives.	PMU	07/2019
Trainings Include basic business organisation skills training into each vocational training module. Work with the course providers to develop suitable business skills modules for inclusion in ongoing training	PMU and training service providers	07/2019
Tripartite meetings Organize tripartite meetings of LGD, MoL and Ministry of Fisheries and Livestock to resolve the transfer of remaining beels, duration of leases and extension of leases that are due to expire.	PMU	08/2019
BUET Contract extension of BUET up to June 2020 (if there is flexibility with the DPP)	PMU	09/2019
ToR Develop TOR for 5th study (pro-poor pathways for development)	PMU/IFAD	10/2019
Project Management		
Deployment of contractors for minor earth works Approval for discontinuation of LCS and deployment of contractors for minor earth works	IFAD	03/2019
Testing of different vegetative protection models Discontinue the testing of different vegetative protection models due to limited time in assessing their impact against wave action	PMU	04/2019
Service contracts Extension of service contracts of all project consultants up to June 2020 (Single source)	PMU	05/2019
Completion of remaining construction Complete all designs/estimations, and contract out all remaining boat landing ghats, minor earth works, and maintenance works.	PMU/LGED	06/2019

Completion of HILIP construction works HILIP: Complete selection, design, internal approval and contracting of all remaining works.	PMU/LGED	06/2019
Completion of CALIP construction and piloting works Complete selection, design, internal approval and contracting of all remaining works.	PMU/LGED	06/2019
Infrastructure Develop a mechanism to maintain and monitor slope and road protection infrastructure systems using vetiver after project completion.	PMU	06/2019
Endline Survey and Impact Assessment Study Developing TORs and contracting of service provider for end line survey and impact assessment study	PMU	10/2019
Financial Management & Execution		
Updated advance register Updated advance register to be attached to the monthly fund flow statement with segregation of LCS/training advances starting from April 2019. Reconcile the advance balance at DA reconciliation with advance register of each district office to be done on monthly basis.	HILIP	05/2019
Update, monitor and complete all infrastructure procurement Submit the updated procurement plan (planned vs actual) every 2 months, enables tracking and reporting of procurement and award of infrastructure (civil works). Ensure all procurement and award is completed between April-June 2019.	PMU - DMU	06/2019
Amendment to the financing agreement Amendment to the financing agreement in order to avoid any jeopardy of project disbursement and activity so that the project can utilize the Loan 847 amount for remaining periods.	HILIP	06/2019
Produce component wise expenditure statement and budget variance from TOMPRO per month which needs to be reconciled with manual records.	HILIP	06/2019
Adjustment and justification of expenditure of long pending advances relating to FY 2014-15 and FY 2015-16 or recovery of such advances	HILIP	06/2019
Action Plan Prepare an action plan identifying follow up and action taken to address all delayed civil work contracts with physical progress of below 60%. Submit action plan updates every quarter.	PMU and DMU	12/2019

Haor Infrastructure and Livelihood Improvement Project - Climate Adaption and Livelihood Protection

Logical Framework

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of verification			Assumptions
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2018)	Cumulative Result (2018)	Cumulative Result % (2018)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility	
Outreach Directly benefiting households receiving project services	1 Persons receiving services promoted or supported by the project							Progress report	Annual	PMU	
	Males				18 627	157 072					
	Females				20 180	170 163					
	Total number of persons receiving services				38 807	327 235					
	1.a Corresponding number of households reached							Progress report	Annual	PMU	
	Households			355 564	38 807	327 235	92				
	1.b Estimated corresponding total number of households members										
	Household members				170 751	1 439 835					
Goal Contribute to the reduction of poverty in the Haor Basin	Increase in asset ownership							Multiple Indicator Cluster Survey (MICS) of the Bangladesh Bureau of Statistics.	3 times at baseline, mid-term and completion	PMU	No major natural disasters. No major price inflation for rice
	increase asset ownership			30							
	Reduction of the incidence of child malnutrition							Multiple Indicator Cluster Survey (MICS) of the Bangladesh Bureau of Statistics.	3 times at baseline, mid-term and completion	PMU	
	Reduction of incidence of child malnutrition, by gender			20							

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of verification			Assumptions
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2018)	Cumulative Result (2018)	Cumulative Result % (2018)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility	
Objective HILIP: Improve living standards and reduce the vulnerability of the poor. The project is expected to directly benefit 115,000 rural poor households CALIP: Strengthen the community and ecological resilience to climate change in the Haor region	Households increase in incomes by at least 30% by participating in the project							RIMS surveys at baseline, mid-term and completion. Participatory assessments with target households.	3 times at baseline, mid-term and completion	PMU	No major economic slow down.
	Households			35 000		30 943	88.4				
	Households report reduction in losses and damages from flood waters, wave action and disease							RIMS surveys at baseline, mid-term and completion. Participatory assessments with target households.	3 times at baseline, mid-term and completion	PMU	
	Households			8 000							
Outcome Outcome 1: Enhanced access to markets, livelihood opportunities and social services	Traffic volume for Upazila and Union roads increase							Road user surveys. Market surveys. MICS Surveys. RIMS and baseline survey	Annual	PMU	Slow pace of economic growth.
	Increase in traffic volume and union road			100		72	72				
	Increase in the volume of goods marketed							Road user surveys. Market surveys. MICS Surveys. RIMS and baseline survey	Annual	PMU	
	Increase in goods volume			50		57	114				

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of verification			Assumptions
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2018)	Cumulative Result (2018)	Cumulative Result % (2018)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility	
	Increase in percentage of households reporting benefit from project roads							Road user surveys. Market surveys. MICS Surveys. RIMS and baseline survey	Annual	PMU	
	Households			10							
	Percentage of the project-constructed roads maintain under good condition							Road user surveys. Market surveys. MICS Surveys. RIMS and baseline survey	Annual	PMU	
	Road constructed			90		90	100				
Output Output 1: Upazila and union roads constructed Bridges and culverts on project roads built Boat landing ghats constructed Employment created for project construction works	2.1.5 Roads constructed, rehabilitated or upgraded							Progress report	Quarter	PMU	No major damage to roads by floods and wave action.
	Length of roads			255	23	228	89.4				
	Bridges and culverts constructed							Progress report	Quarter	PMU	
	Length of bridge and culvert			2 700	32	2 285	84.6				
	Boat landing ghats built							Progress report	Quarter	PMU	
	Ghats			40		32	80				
	Minor Earth Work							Progress report	Quarter	PMU	
	Minor Earth Work			50	17	25	50				
	Infrastructure Maintenance							Progress report	Quarter	PMU	
	Infrastructure maintenance			60	0	0	0				

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of verification			Assumptions
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2018)	Cumulative Result (2018)	Cumulative Result % (2018)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility	
Outcome Outcome 2: Enhanced village mobility, increase in farm production and protection against extreme weather events	Traffic volume for village roads increased										Slow pace of economic growth.
	Traffic volume increased			100		63	63				
	Project-built markets well operational							Road user surveys. Market surveys. MICS Surveys. RIMS and baseline survey	Annual	PMU	
	Operational market			100		26	26				
	Project-built markets with Market Management Committee (MMC)							Road user surveys. Market surveys. MICS Surveys. RIMS and baseline survey	Annual	PMU	
	Market managed by MMC			100		76	76				
Output Output 2: Community roads, markets, protection works for villages and markets/informal market collection points constructed HILIP: Women and men employed for construction of project works CALIP: Employment created for construction works	Villages protection works constructed							Progress report, M&E report	Quarter	PMU	No major damage to roads and village protection works by floods and wave action. Public procurement policy continues to allow direct procurement of works through LCS.
	Village protection			100	2	65	65				
	Protection works for village markets done							Progress report, M&E report	Quarter	PMU	
	Protection work			40	3	38	95				
	Protection works for informal market collection centres completed							Progress report, M&E report	Quarter	PMU	
	Protection works			5	1	2	40				
	Daily labour employed							Progress report, M&E report	Quarter	PMU	
	Daily labour			35 000	7 480	42 480	121.4				

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of verification			Assumptions
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2018)	Cumulative Result (2018)	Cumulative Result % (2018)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility	
	Villages protected							Progress report, M&E report	Quarter	PMU	
	Village			200	6	120	60				
	Villages with common infrastructure services							Progress report, M&E report	Quarter	PMU	
	Village			175	8	143	81.7				
	Model villages							Progress report, M&E report	Quarter	PMU	
	Model village			2							
	Killas protected using vegetative species							Progress report, M&E report	Quarter	PMU	
	Killas			28	3	11	39.3				
	Beel-banks protected using vegetative species							Progress report, M&E report	Quarter	PMU	
	Beel banks			50	0	6	12				
	Road slope protected with vetiver grass							Progress report, M&E report	Quarter	PMU	
	Length of roads			50	2	24	48				
	Labor Construction Societies (LCS) groups trained							Progress report, M&E report	Quarter	PMU	
	LCS groups			542	20	438	80.8				
	New or existing rural infrastructure protected from climate events (US\$' 000/Km)							Progress report, M&E report	Quarter	PMU	
	Length of roads			50		50	100				
	Production and processing facilities supported with increased water availability and efficiency							Progress report, M&E report	Quarter	PMU	
	Facilities				554	1 906					
	Households supported with increased water availability or efficiency							Progress report, M&E report	Quarter	PMU	
	Households			5 550	114	3 350	60.4				

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of verification			Assumptions
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2018)	Cumulative Result (2018)	Cumulative Result % (2018)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility	
	2.1.5 Roads constructed, rehabilitated or upgraded							Progress report, M&E report	Quarter	PMU	
	Length of roads			300	33	266	88.7				
	LCS employed for the project construction work							Progress report	Quarterly	PMU	
	Households			15 900	540	9 337	58.7				
	2.1.6 Market, processing or storage facilities constructed or rehabilitated							Progress report	Quarterly	PMU	
	Market facilities constructed/rehabilitated			65	2	58	89.2				
Outcome Outcome 3: Enhanced access of the poor men and women to sustainable water bodies with increased production capacity and biodiversity	Households improved access to water sources							World Fish Centre report & PMU fishery RIMS baseline and monitoring Surveys.	Annual	PMU	Interference and control by water lords of lease right of poor fishers Transfer of leases to BUGs is not obstructed and terms of leases provide long terms access to water bodies at reasonable cost. Price of fish.
	Households			13 020		12 250	94.1				
	Fishers increase their income by at least 50% from fish production							World Fish Centre report & PMU fishery RIMS baseline and monitoring Surveys.	Annual	PMU	
	Households			6 510							
	BUGs managed and operated well							World Fish Centre report & PMU fishery RIMS baseline and monitoring Surveys.	Annual	PMU	
	BUGs			100	11	88	88				

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of verification			Assumptions
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2018)	Cumulative Result (2018)	Cumulative Result % (2018)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility	
	Increased average fish catch per hectare							World Fish Centre report & PMU fishery RIMS baseline and monitoring Surveys.	Annual	PMU	
	Kg			200		182	91				
Output Output 3: 500 Beel User Groups established of which 141 are new	Beel User Groups formed of which 141 are new							Progress report	Quarterly	PMU	BUG members not controlled by water lords.
	BUGs			141	92	475	336.9				
	Beel User Groups formed with combined membership of 13 020 by gender							Minutes of Scheme Takeover Project Progress Reports, M&E report	Quarter	PMU	
	BUG members			13 020		10 555	81.1				
	Females					3 804					
	Beels improved							Minutes of Scheme Takeover Project Progress Reports, M&E report	Quarter	PMU	
	Beels			215	1	60	27.9				
	Canal excavated							Minutes of Scheme Takeover Project Progress Reports, M&E report	Quarter	PMU	
	Canal			100	3	41	41				
	Sanctuaries established							Progress report	Quarterly	PMU	
	Sanctuaries			80	25	60	75				

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of verification		Assumptions
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2018)	Cumulative Result (2018)	Cumulative Result % (2018)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility
	Area under swamp forestry							Progress report	Quarterly	PMU
	Swamp tree planted			300 000	1 000	182 000	60.7			
Outcome Outcome 4: Enhanced production, diversification and marketing of crop and livestock produce	1.2.4 Households reporting an increase in production							RIMS, Baseline, MTR, Impact assessment	Annual	PMU
	Households			20 000		19 000	95			
	1.2.2 Households reporting adoption of new/improved inputs, technologies or practices							RIMS, Baseline, MTR, Impact assessment	Annual	PMU
	Households			50	57	57	114			
	Males			50						
	Females			50						
Output Output 4: Employment and enterprise opportunities created, activities building awareness on social issues initiated, and demonstrations on crop/horticulture, livestock and fisheries implemented	Employment and enterprise opportunities created							Project Progress Reports, M&E report	Quarter	PMU
	Enterprise			960		690	71.9			
	Activities initiated to build awareness on social issues							Project Progress Reports, M&E report	Quarter	PMU
	Activities			256	4	198	77.3			
	Groups receiving vocational training							Progress report	Quarterly	PMU
	batch			450	49	180	40			
	Persons trained in various production technologies (CALIP)							Project Progress Reports, M&E report	Quarter	PMU
	Total				9 726	56 197				
	2.1.1 Rural enterprises accessing business development services							Progress report	Quarter	
	Rural enterprises			960	0	690	71.9			
	1.1.4 Persons trained in production practices and/or technologies							Progress report	Quarterly	PMU

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of verification			Assumptions
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2018)	Cumulative Result (2018)	Cumulative Result % (2018)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility	
	Total persons trained in crop			41 720	2 597	35 721	85.6				
	Total persons trained in livestock			36 500	4 270	38 204	104.7				
	Total persons trained in fishery			9 575	0	9 794	102.3				
	People trained in community management topics							Progress report	Quarterly	PMU	
	Men trained in bookkeeping										
	Total persons trained in planning			220 233							
Outcome Outcome 5: Enhanced capacity and knowledge to contend with climate change impacts	At least equal number of villages adopted CALIP tested low-cost village protection system							MMC surveys. Third Party Surveys. Department of Agriculture, Fisheries and Livestock Data.	Annual	PMU	Adaptation to climate change expertise available Political willingness to adopt evidence-based policy guidance The inter-agency coordination is ensured through proper monitoring.
	Village			175		120	68.6				
	No. of policy options identified to support of climate adaptation in the Haor area							MMC surveys. Third Party Surveys. Department of Agriculture, Fisheries and Livestock Data.	Annual	PMU	
	Policy options				0	0					

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of verification			Assumptions
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2018)	Cumulative Result (2018)	Cumulative Result % (2018)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility	
Output CALIP: Weather and Flash Flood Forecasting operational Research findings of various technologies and systems are disseminated Policy briefs advocate research findings Climate sensitive policy dialogue leading to enhanced frameworks	No. of people reached by agro-meteorology weather forecast							Progress report	Quarter	PMU	Evidence based issue identification is done to engage stakeholders.
	Total			300 000							
	No. of institutions reached by FFEWS							Progress report	Quarter	PMU	
	Institution			3		3	100				
	Action research studies published							Progress report	Quarter	PMU	
	Studies			4	3	3	75				
	Individuals engaged in NRM and climate risk management activities							Progress report	Quarter	PMU	
	Total			30 550	13 807	29 066	95.1				
	Males					24 465					
	Females					4 601					
	Poor smallholder household members supported in coping with the effects of climate change							Progress report	Quarter	PMU	
	Males					103 865					
	Females					76 386					
	Total household members			180 640	78 259	180 251	99.8				
	International and country dialogues on climate supported							Progress report	Quarter	PMU	
	Dialogues			2	0	0	0				
Policy 1 Policy-relevant knowledge products completed							Progress report	Quarterly	PMU		
Number			2								

Bangladesh

Haor Infrastructure and Livelihood Improvement Project - Climate Adaption and Livelihood Protection

Supervision Report

Appendix 1: Financial: actual financial performance; by financier by component and disbursements by category

Mission Dates: 17 - 28 March 2019

Document Date: 30/04/2019

Project No. 1100001585

Report No. 5038-BD

Asia and the Pacific Division
Programme Management Department

Appendix 1: Financial: actual financial performance by financier; by component and disbursements by category

Table 2A: Financial performance by financier (as of 28/02/2019)

Financier	Appraisal (USD '000)	Disbursements (USD '000)	Per cent disbursed
IFAD loan	55,000	37,747	69%
IFAD grant	1,000	518	52%
Spanish Trust Fund loan	30,000	23,859	80%
ASAP Trust Fund grant	15,000	9,021	60%
Government	33,840	23,176	68%
Total	134,840	94,320	70%

Table 2B: Financial performance by financier by component (USD '000) (as of 28/02/2019)

Component	IFAD loan			IFAD grant			Spanish Trust Fund			ASAP TRUST GRANT			Government			Total		
	Appraisal	Actual	%	Appraisal	Actual	%	Appraisal	Actual	%	Appraisal	Actual	%	Appraisal	Actual	%	Appraisal	Actual	%
1.Communications Infrastructures	12,000	8,704	73%				12,000	8,692	72%				23,000	15,087	66%	47,000	32,483	69%
2.Community Infrastructure	16,000	11,782	74%				15,000	11,861	79%	8,600	3,830	45%	7,000	4,800	69%	46,600	32,273	69%
3.Community Resources management	6,000	595	10%	1,000	433	43%	3,000	460	15%				1,000	108	11%	11,000	1,596	15%
4.Livelihood Protection	3,000	2,426	81%							4,300	1796	42%	564	212	38%	7,864	4,434	56%
5.Capacity and Knowledge for Building Resilience (CALIP)										1,700	1,227	72%	223	310	139%	1,923	1,537	80%
6.Project Management	18,000	9,800	54%							400	185	46%	2,053	988	48%	20,453	10,973	54%
Sub-Total Expenditures	55,000	33,308	61%	1,000	433		30,000	21,013		15,000	7,038	47%	33,840	21,504		134,840	83,296	62%
Outstanding IFAD Advances/Unspent	-	4,439			85			2,846			1,983			1,672			11,024	
Total	55,000	37,747		1,000	518		30,000	23,859		15,000	9,021		33,840	23,176		134,840	94,320	70%

Note: Financial performance by financier by component was prepared based on manual records due to a difference exists on the per component expenses between manual record and accounting system

Table 2C: IFAD loan disbursements (SDR/EURO, as at 28/02/2019)

IFAD Loan (SDR, as at 28/02/19)					
Category	Category description	Allocated (SDR)	Disbursed (SDR)	Available balance (SDR)	Percentage disbursed
1A	Civil works - Communication	7,827,000	6,174,995	1,652,005	79%
1B	Civil works - Community	13,242,000	7,725,364	5,516,636	58%
II	Vehicles & equipment	764,000	726,168	37,832	95%
III	TA, studies, training, workshops	4,843,000	2,445,874	2,397,126	51%
IV	Salaries & allowances	6,134,000	4,369,574	1,764,426	71%
V	Operating expenses	1,640,000	900,953	739,047	55%
	Unallocated	0	0	0	
	Advanced to designated account	0	3,976,079	-3,976,079	
	TOTAL	34,450,000	26,319,007	8,130,993	76%

IFAD Grant (SDR, as at 28/02/19)					
Category	Category description	Allocated (SDR)	Disbursed (SDR)	Available balance (SDR)	Percentage disbursed
III	Technical Assistance, Studies, Training and Workshops	630,000	291,797	338,203	46%
	Advanced to designated account	0	66,954	-66,954	
	TOTAL	630,000	358,751	271,249.10	57%

SPANISH TRUST FUND LOAN (EURO, as at 28/02/19)					
Category	Category description	Allocated (EURO)	Disbursed (EURO)	Available balance (EURO)	Percentage disbursed
1A	Civil works - Communication	6,400,000	7,471,615	-1,071,615	117%
1B	Civil works - Community	15,000,000	9,440,052	5,559,948	63%
	Advanced to designated account	0	3,612,164	-3,612,164	
	TOTAL	21,400,000	20,523,831	876,168	96%

ASAP Grant Disbursements - CALIP (SDR, as at 28/02/19)					
Category	Category description	Allocated (SDR)	Disbursed (SDR)	Available balance (SDR)	Percentage disbursed
I	Civil works	5,699,000	2,480,143	3,218,857	44%
II	Technical Assistance, Studies & workshops	4,174,000	1,784,035	2,389,965	43%
III	Recurrent costs (Salaries & operating costs)	27,000	26,497	503	98%
	Advanced to designated account	0	2,180,289	-2,180,289	
	TOTAL	9,900,000	6,470,963	3,429,037	65%

Bangladesh

Haor Infrastructure and Livelihood Improvement Project - Climate Adaption and Livelihood Protection

Supervision Report

Appendix 2: Physical progress measured against AWP&B

Mission Dates: 17 - 28 March 2019
Document Date: 30/04/2019
Project No. 1100001585
Report No. 5038-BD

Asia and the Pacific Division
Programme Management Department

Appendix 2: Physical progress measured against AWP&B

Local Government and Engineering Department
Haor Infrastructure and Livelihood Improvement Project
Physical Progress Report up to February/ 2019 (Annual & Cumulative)

Component – 1 : Communications Infrastructure (HILIP)

SL No.	Activities	Unit	RDPP Target	FY 2018 - 19			Cumulative Achieved up to Febr/ 2019	% against total RDPP target
				AWPB (FY: 2018-19)	Achieved Annual up to Feb/2019	% Achieved Annual		
1	Upazila Roads	km	105	5	4	80%	92	88%
2	Union Roads	km	150	9	7	78%	137	91%
3	Bridges & Culverts on UZR	m	420	30	21	70%	370	88%
4	Bridges & Culverts on UNR	m	650	30	30	100%	583	90%
5	Bridge & Culvert on CoR	m	1050	50	30	60%	662	63%
6	Bridge & Culverts in Sunamgonj	m	700	0	0	0%	700	100%
	Total Bridge & Culvert		2820	110	81	74%	2315	82%
7	Boat Landing Ghats	no	40	0	0	0%	32	80%
8	Minor Earth Work/road alignment	km	50	5	2	40%	24	48%
10	Infrastructure maintenance	Km	60	15	0	0%		For maintenance work 50.21km. road approved; tender and tender evaluation is

								under process.
								77%

Component – 2 : Community Infrastructure (HILIP):

HILIP Part

0	Activities	Unit	RDPP Target	FY: 2018 - 19			Cumulative Achieved up to Feb/ 2019	% against RDPP target
				AWPB (FY: 2018-19)	Achieved Annual up to Feb/2019	% Achieved Annual		
1	Community Road	km	300	10	8	80%	268	89%
2	Development of Village Market	no	65	3	2	67%	59	91%
3	Market Collection Center	no	5	2	1	50%	2	40%
4	Village Protection Works	no	100	9	5	56%	66	66%
5	Market Protection Works	no	40	3	3	100%	38	95%
6	Irrigation infrastructure	no	55	3	2	67%	18	33%
7	km. of minor earth work/road alignment undertaken	km	50	10	9	90%	9	18%

8	Pilot Innovative Infrastructure	LS.	5	5	0	0%	0	Idea for Innovative infrastructure already developed. Selection of site, operation procedure and maintenance guideline is under process
9	km of road maintenance/ Infrastructure maintenance	km	40	10	0	0%	0	For maintenance work 23.05 km. road approved; tender and tender evaluation is under process.
								73%

Component – 2 : Community Infrastructure (CALIP):

CALIP Part:								
SL No.	Activities	Unit	RDPP target	FY: 2018 - 19			Cumulative Achieved up to Feb/ 2019	% against RDPP target
				AWPB (FY: 2018-19)	Achieved Annual up to Feb/2019	% Achieved Annual		
1	Village Protection Infrastructure	no	175	11	6	55%	120	69%
2	Village Internal Service	no	200	15	10	67%	145	73%

3	Model Village develop	no	2	0	0	0%	0	Earthwork and Protection work already completed for One model village and another is under process.
4	Pilot Testing of beel bank protection	no	50	4	0	0%	6	12%
5	Pilot Testing of Killa protection	no	28	3	3	100%	11	39%
6	Pilot Testing of Upazila/ Union road slope protection	km	60	14	14	100%	24	40%
								60%

Component – 3 : Community Resource Management

SL No.	Activities	Unit	RDPP Target	FY 2018 - 19			Cumulative Achieved up to Feb/ 2019	% against RDPP target
				AWPB (FY: 2018-19)	Achieved Annual up to Feb/2019	% Achieved Annual		
1	Beel developed (Old)> 20 acres	no.	45	15	10	22%	31	69%
2	Beel developed (New)>20 acres	no.	40	12	5	13%	5	13%
3	Beel developed (Old)< 20 acres	no.	100	24	12	12%	40	40%
4	Beel developed (New)< 20 acres	no.	30	5	2	7%	12	40%
Beel developed (Total)		no.	215	56	29	13%	88	41%

5	Canal re-excavated	km	100	25	10	10%	49	49%
6	LCS group trained	no.	435	95	40	42%	318	73%
7	Swamp tree planted	no	300,000	59000	32000	54%	213000	71%
8	Third party monitoring done	no	5	1	1	100%	4	80%
9	Promotional materials developed	no	8	1	1	100%	5	63%
								61%

Component – 4 : Livelihood Protection (HILIP)

SL No.	Activities	Unit	RDPP Target	FY 2018 - 19			Cumulative Achieved up to Feb/ 2019	% against RDPP target
				AWPB (FY: 2018-19)	Achieved Annual up to Feb/2019	% Achieved Annual		
CIG Formation								
1	CIG Formation (Crop & Horticulture)	Group	1680	116	116	100%	1680	100%
2	CIG Group Formation (Poultry & Livestock)	Group	1600	66	66	100%	1600	100%
3	CIG Group Formation (Fisheries)	Group	336	0	0	0%	336	100%
4	CIG Group Formation (Innovative Business Creation)	Group	84	11	11	100%	84	100%
Sub-Total (CIG Formation)			3700	193	193	100%	3700	100%
Demonstration								
1	Demonstration on Crop & Hort.	no.	924	150	141	94%	849	92%
2	Demonstration on	no.	1565	250	128	51%	1072	68%

	Poultry & Livestock							
3	Demonstration on Fisheries	no.	336	50	0	0%	254	76%
Sub - Total (Demonstration)			2825	450	269		2175	
Demo based training (25/batch)								
1	Demo based Training on Crop & Horticulture	Batch	924	150	143	95%	851	92%
2	Demo based Training on Poultry and Livestock	Batch	1565	250	237	95%	1290	82%
3	Demo based Training on Fisheries	Batch	336	50	38	76%	292	87%
Sub-Total (Demo based training)			2825	450	418		2433	
IGA and Others Training (25/batch)								
1	IGA Training on Crop & Horticulture	Batch	1330	150	124	83%	1094	82%
2	Others Training , IGA Training , Linkage development , Orientation Training	Batch	333	101	10	10%	81	24%
3	IGA Training / others training on Fisheries sector	Batch	84	15	3	20%	65	77%
Sub-Total (IGA and Others Training)			1747	266	137		1240	
Exchange Visit								
1	Exchange visit for crop and Horticulture sector farm	Batch	200	30	27	90%	156	78%
2	Exchange visit to Farm, Hatchery	Batch	235	15	0	0%	202	86%
Sub-Total of Exchange Visit			435	45	27		358	
Field Days								
1	Field Days Observation on Crop Demonstration	no.	132	30	12	40%	114	86%

2	Field Days Observation on Fisheries	no.	101	30	0	0%	40	40%
Sub-Total of Field Days			233	60	12		154	

SL No.	Activities	Unit	RDPP Target	FY 2018 - 19			Cumulative Achieved up to Feb/ 2019	% against RDPP target
				AWPB (FY: 2018- 19)	Achieved Annual up to Feb/2019	% Achieved Annual		
1	Paravet training -30 persons per batch	Person	28	9	2	7%	21	75%
2	Vaccination & De- Worming @ 500 cattle per event	Event	126	30	26	87%	116	92%
3	Artificial Inscimination Program @ 100 cattle per event .	Event	103	20	9	45%	55	53%
Sub - Total (Animal Health care)			257	59	37		192	
Livelihood Common Activities								
1	Innovative employment/business initiative to LCS Graduates Members @ 10 person per batch	Person	960	0	0	0%	690	72%
2	Build Awarenes on Social issues	Event	272	30	15	50%	209	77%
3	Recognition Award on Best Practices	Person	618	80	0	0%	382	62%
1	CDF Support	no.	200	165	165	100%	165	83%
Sub-Total of Livelihood Common Activities			2050	275	180		1446	
								80%

Total of Livelihood Protection Component (HILIP)								
Component – 4 : Livelihood Protection (CALIP)								
SL No.	Activities	Unit	RDPP Target	FY 2018 - 19			Cumulative Achieved up to Feb/ 2019	% against RDPP target
				AWPB (FY: 2018-19)	Achieved Annual up to Feb/2019	% Achieved Annual		
	Village Forestry							
1	Bamboo production	Batch	1120	15	10	67%	1115	100%
2	Murta production	Batch	350	0	0	0%	350	100%
3	Hizol/Koroch production	Batch	252	14	14	100%	252	100%
4	Vetiver production	Batch	420	13	13	100%	420	100%
5	Medicinal Plant production	Batch	840	15	10	67%	835	99%
6	TOT on village forestry	Batch	5	0	0	0%	5	100%
Sub-Total of Village Forestry			2987	57	47		2977	
Pond Fisheries (CALIP)								
1	Training of Pond fisheries farmers	Batch	252	25	20	80%	221	88%
2	Farm visit	Batch	126	36	20	56%	73	58%
3	Hatchery visit	Batch	126	38	30	79%	78	62%
Sub-Total of Pond Fisheries			504	99	70		372	

SL No.	Activities	Unit	RDPP	FY 2018 - 19	Cumulative	% against
--------	------------	------	------	--------------	------------	-----------

			Target				Achieved up to Feb/ 2019	RDPP target
				AWPB (FY: 2018-19)	Achieved Annual up to Feb/2019	% Achieved Annual		
Component -4: Training on Improved wood/Bamboo/cane sector (CALIP)								
1	Wood products	Batch	6	0	0	0%	6	100%
2	Bamboo products	Batch	84	20	5	25%	69	82%
3	Cane product	Batch	6	0	0	0%	6	100%
4	Murta products	Batch	0	0	0	0%	0	0%
5	Jute/other products	Batch	282	90	66	73%	258	91%
	Sub-Total of Improved wood/bamboo/cane products		378	110	71		339	90%

SL No.	Activities	Unit	RDPP Target	FY 2018 - 19			Cumulative Achieved up to Feb/ 2019	% against RDPP target
				AWPB (FY: 2018-19)	Achieved Annual up to Feb/2019	% Achieved Annual		
1	Training on Diesel engine/pump repair	Batch	17	1	1	100%	7	41%
2	Training on motor cycle repair	Batch	44	17	15	88%	42	95%
3	Training on mobile phone/computer repair	Batch	39	5	5	100%	34	87%
	Tailoring	Batch	91	0	0	0%	9	10%
5	House wiring/electrician	Batch	80	8	0	0%	30	38%
6	Plumbing	Batch	30	2	0	0%	15	50%
	Refrigerator repairing	Batch	29	9	8	89%	20	69%

7	Welding	Batch	19	2	1	50%	5	26%	
13	Training on Driving cum Auto-mechanics	Batch	101	40	27	68%	48	48%	
Sub-Total of Vocational Training				450	84	57	68%	210	47%
Total of Livelihood Protection Component (CALIP)									90%
Component –5 : Capacity and Knowledge for Building Resilience (CALIP)									
SL No.	Activities	Unit	RDPP Target	FY 2018 - 19			Cumulative Achieved up to Feb/ 2019	% against RDPP target	
				AWPB (FY: 2018-19)	Achieved Annual up to Feb/2019	% Achieved Annual			
1	Climate change forecasting and participatory scenario development And Assessment of the agriculture & fisheries sector and exposure to climate risk	No.	1	1	0.3	30%	0.4	40%	
2	Analysis of the environment impacts of large scale expansion of pond fisheries and climate change affects	No.	1	1	0.3	30%	0.4	40%	
4	Examining the dynamics of reforestation at landscape level and strengthening ecological resilience	No.	1	1	0	0%	0	0%	
Sub-Total of Action Research						0%		0%	
	Weather and Flash flood warning system								

2	Fast computer system for BMD	No.	1	0	0	0%	1	100%
3	Develop rainfall dissemination system for Hoar	No.	1	0.2	0.1	1%	0.70	70%
FFEWS and capacity building and KM by IWFM								
1	Downscaling GFS forecasting in/c fast computer system and technical assistance to BMD by IWFM	No.	1	0	0	0%	1	100%
2	Develop FFEWS for haor region by IWFM	No.	1	0.2	0.2	100.00%	0.80	80%
3	Training and KM by IWFM	No.	1	0	0	0%	0	0%
FFEWS and capacity building for FFWC, BWDB								
1	Fast computer system for flood forecasting	No.	1	1	1	100%	1	100%
2	Performance evaluation of FFEWS models & management cost	No.	1	0.33	0	0%	0.66	66%
3	Funds for development of FFEWS by IWM	No.	1	0.2	0.2	100%	0.8	80%
Dissemination system for FFEWS by CALIP								
1	Develop dissemination system of FFEWS for communities and institutions	No.	1	0	0	0%	0	0%

[illegible]

Bangladesh

Haor Infrastructure and Livelihood Improvement Project - Climate Adaption and Livelihood Protection

Supervision Report

Appendix 3: Compliance with legal covenants: status of implementation

Mission Dates: 17 - 28 March 2019
Document Date: 30/04/2019
Project No. 1100001585
Report No. 5038-BD

Asia and the Pacific Division
Programme Management Department

Appendix 3: Compliance with legal covenants: status of implementation

Section	Covenant	Target/Action Due Date	Compliance Status/Date	Remarks
Section 4.02	PCU to open and maintain a Project Account (in ...); GO? to make an initial deposit equivalent to USD ??????			
Section 4.02	GO? to replenish Project Account quarterly in advance			
Section 4.03	Procurement of goods, works and services carried out in accordance with the procedures laid down in Schedule 3			
Section 4.04	Insurance of vehicles, equipment and civil works financed from the loan proceeds to be consistent with sound commercial practice.			
Section 4.05, section 11.10(b)	Audit report submitted to IFAD.			
Section 4.06	Progress reports to be submitted to IFAD on a quarterly basis.			
Schedule 4, para 7	AWPB to be submitted to the Fund, for its review and comments			
Schedule 4, para 8(a)	A Mid-Term Review (MTR) to be carried out jointly by the Borrower and IFAD.			
Schedule 4, para 16	Project to be exempted from all import duties, excise taxes and value added tax (VAT) on investment expenditures			

