

Sudan

Butana Integrated Rural Development Project Supervision Report

Main report and appendices

Mission Dates: 20 July - 14 August 2019
Document Date 08/10/2019
Project No. 1100001332
Report No. 5156-SD

Near East, North Africa and Europe Division
Programme Management Department

Abbreviations and Acronyms

ABS	Agricultural Bank of Sudan
ABSUMI	Agricultural Bank of Sudan Microfinance Initiative
AF	Additional Finance
APO	Associate Programme Officer
ASAP	IFAD Adaptation for Smallholder Agriculture Programme
AWPB	Annual Work-Plan and Budget
BDA	Butana Development Authority
BDF	Butana Development Fund
BIRD	Butana Integrated Rural Development Project
BLMIE	Business and Livestock Market Information Entity
BoD	Board of Directors (BDF)
CAHWs	Community Animal Health Workers
CBOs	Community Based Organisations
CBS	Central Bank of Sudan / Central Bureau of Statistics
CCI	Community Capability Index
CCU	Central Coordination Unit
CD	Country Director
CDC	Community Development Centre/Committee;
CEAP	Community Environmental Action Plan
CEAs	Community Extension Agents
CIF	Community Initiative Fund
CN	Community Networks
CPM	Country Programme Manager
CR CVP	Climate Resilient Community Village Plans
DG	Director General
DSA	Daily Subsistence Allowance
DTs	Development Teams
ECAW	Enhancing Climate Change Adaptation in Agriculture and Water Resources in the Greater Horn of Africa
EUR	Euro
F	Female
FC	Financial Controller
Fe/Male	Female and/or Male
Fed	Feddan
FIG	Farmer Interest Groups
FM	Financial Management
FMoAF	Federal Ministry of Agriculture and Forestry
FMoARWF	Federal Ministry of Animal Resources, Wildlife and Fishery
FNC	Forest National Corporation
FS	Financial Statement
GALS	Gender Action Learning System

GBC	Gender-based constraints
GEF	Global Environmental Facility
GIS	Geographical Information System
GoS	Government of Sudan
Gov. A	Government Administration
GPS	Global Positioning System
Ha	Hectare
HHs	Households
HQ	Headquarters
IA	Institutional Advisor
ICARDA	International Center for Agricultural Research in the Dry Areas
ICB	International Competitive Bidding
ICO	IFAD Country Office
ICSP	Integrated Carbon Sequestration Project
IG	Interest Groups
IMP	Integrated Pest Management
INGO	International Non-Governmental Organisation
ISA	International Standards of Auditing
KM	Knowledge Management
KP	Knowledge Products
LAPA	Local Adaptation Plans for Action (manual)
LL	Lesson Learnt
LMIS	Livestock Marketing Information System
LMRP	Livestock Marketing and Resilience Programme
LPG	Liquid Petroleum Gas
LR	Learning Route
LUs	Locality Units
M	Male
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MCC	Meat Commodity Council
MCN	Mother Community Networks
MFIs	Micro Finance Institutions
MIS	Management Information System
MoAF	Ministry of Agriculture and Forestry
MoARWF	Ministry of Animal Resources, Wildlife and Fishery
MoFEP	Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning
MoIWR	Ministry of Irrigation and Water Resources
MoU	Memorandum of Understanding
MTR	Mid-term Review
n.a.	not applicable
NO	No Objection

NR	Natural Resources
NRGF	Natural Resource Governance Framework
NRM	Natural Resources Management
PA_SI	Parastatal Institution
PCR	Project Completion Review
PIM	Project Implementation Manual
PIU	Programme Implementation Unit
PO	Procurement Officer
PP	Procurement Plan
PPM&E	Participatory Planning Monitoring and Evaluation
PPP	Public Private Partnership
PVC	Poly Vinyl Chloride
QCBS	Quality Cost-Based Selection
RAP	Rural Access Project
RF	Revolving Fund
RFA	Rural Finance Agent
RFI	Request for Inspection
RFO	Rural Finance Officer
RIMS	Results and Impact Management System
SA	Special Account
SCGs	Saving and Credit Groups
SCU	State Coordination Unit
SDG	Sudanese Pound
SECAP	Social, Environmental and Climate Assessment Procedures
SHOATS	Sheep and Goats
SM	Supervision Mission
SMDC	Sudanese Microfinance Development Company
SMFU	State Microfinance Units
SNRLP	Sustainable Natural Resources Livelihood Project
SRDC	Sudan Rural Development Company
SROI	Social Return on Investment
STC	Supervisory Technical Committee
SWA	State Water Authority
TA	Technical Assistance
TORs	Terms of Reference
ToT	Trainers of Trainers
UNDSS	United Nations Department of Safety and Security
VDC	Village Development Committee
VSC	Veterinary Service Centre
VSCGs	Village Savings and Credit Groups
WA	Withdrawal Application
YPs	Young Professionals

A. Project Overview

Region:	Near East, North Africa and Europe Division	Project at Risk Status:	Not at risk
Country:	Sudan	Environmental and Social Category:	B
Project Name:	Butana Integrated Rural Development Project	Climate Risk Classification:	not available yet
Project ID:	1100001332	Executing Institution:	not available yet
Project Type:	Agricultural Development	Implementing Institutions:	Butana Development Agency
CPM:	Tarek Ahmed		
Project Director:	not available yet		
Project Area:	Gezira, Kassala, Gedaref, River Nile, Khartoum		

Approval Date:	14/12/2006	Last audit receipt:	12/07/2019
Signing Date:	16/02/2007	Date of Last SIS Mission:	14/08/2019
Entry into Force Date:	07/07/2008	Number of SIS Missions:	24
Available for Disbursement Date:	07/07/2008	Number of extensions:	2
First Disbursement Date:	28/11/2008	Effectiveness lag:	19 months
MTR Date:	01/09/2012		
Original Completion Date:	30/09/2016		
Current Completion Date:	30/09/2019		
Financial Closure:	not available yet		

Project total financing

IFAD Financing breakdown	IFAD	\$24,799,231
	ASAP Trust Fund	\$3,000,000
	Debt Sustainability Framework	\$10,300,000
Domestic Financing breakdown	National Government	\$0
	Beneficiaries	\$0
	National Government (add)	\$2,175,000
	National Government	\$3,233,377
	Local Government	\$1,055,907
	Beneficiaries	\$766,462
	Beneficiaries additional financing	\$978,000
Co-financing breakdown,	Italy	\$381,245
Project total financing:		\$46,689,222

Current Mission

Mission Dates:	20 July - 14 August 2019
Days in the field:	9 days

Mission composition:

- Ms Lucy Maarse, Mission Leader; Natural Resources and Livestock Development;
- Mr. Omer Egemi, Natural Resources and Climate Change;
- Mr Manab Chakraborty, Rural Finance, Business and Community Development;
- Mr Mohamed Abdel-Latif, Civil Engineer and Procurement;
- Mr. Magdi Zumrawi, Civil Engineer;
- Mr. Mohamed Khlass, Financial Management;
- Mr. Adil Osman Idris, Senior Coordinator, CCU (partial) and Mr. Abuelgasim Gafar Abdellah, Deputy Coordinator of CCU;
- Mrs. Neimat Ahmed Babikir and Mrs. Abla Malik Osman (partial), General Directorate of International Relation Department, Mr Adil Sharief M. Khair, Department of Monitoring and Follow-up, Mr. Badawy Tihmad Badary Hamed, Department of Economic Security, FMoAF;
- Mr. Salah Ankoush Ahmed, Department of Foreign Finance, MoFEP;
- Ms. Selma Abdullah Ragab, and Mr. Mohammed Idriss Abdullah , Department of Rangeland and Planning respectively, FMoAR;
- Mr. Ahmed Tarek, CPM, on call.

Field sites visited: Five States (Khartoum, Gedarif, River Nile, Gezira and Kassala) and nine localities

B. Overall Assessment

Key SIS Indicator #1	Ø	Rating	Key SIS Indicator #2	Ø	Rating
Likelihood of Achieving the Development Objective		5	Assessment of the Overall Implementation Performance		4

Effectiveness and Developmental Focus	5	Project Management	5
Effectiveness	5	Quality of Project Management	4
Targeting and Outreach	5	Knowledge Management	6
Gender equality & women's participation	6	Value for Money	4
Agricultural Productivity	5	Coherence between AWPB and Implementation	4
Nutrition	5	Performance of M&E System	4
Adaptation to Climate Change	5	Requirements of Social, Environmental and Climate Assessment Procedures (SECAP)	5

Sustainability and Scaling-up	5	Financial Management and Execution	3
Institutions and Policy Engagement	5	Acceptable Disbursement Rate	3
Partnership-building	4	Quality of Financial Management	3
Human and Social Capital and Empowerment	5	Quality and Timeliness of Audit	5
Quality of Beneficiary Participation	6	Counterparts Funds	2
Responsiveness of Service Providers	4	Compliance with Loan Covenants	4
Environment and Natural Resource Management	5	Procurement	3
Exit Strategy	6		
Potential for Scaling-up	5		

Relevance	5
------------------	----------

C. Mission Objectives and Key Conclusions

Background and Main Objective of the Mission

Butana Integrated Rural Development Project (BIRDP). The BIRDP became effective in July 2008. The project covers the Butana rainy season grazing area that hosts approximately 7 million heads of livestock and is inhabited by about 800,000 persons. The **goal** of the BIRDP is to improve in a sustainable manner the livelihoods and resilience to drought of the poor rural households. The **specific objectives** of the project include: (i) establishing a coherent and cost-effective governance framework that ensures a regulated access to land and water resources of the Butana; (ii) improving the access and bargaining position of women and men in the marketing of livestock; and (iii) developing the capacity of community-based organizations to engage in environmentally sound, socially and gender equitable development initiatives. The project has 4 main components: (i) Policy and Institution Building; (ii) Natural Resources Management (water, range, forest, vegetable, fodder and agricultural crops); (iii) Animal Resources; and (iv) Community Development and Business Options. The Butana grazing area is the geographical outreach of BIRDP and covers 9 localities, 5 States, 140 targeted villages (34,000 Households) of phase 1 which are called mother or old communities and 400 ^[1] satellite or new villages (64,000 Households) under AF phase.

The Project Coordination Unit (PCU) is supported by fully functioning 5 State Coordination Units (SCU) and their development teams (DTs). The project has a total financial resource from i.) the initial IFAD's loan US\$ 29.85 million (in 2008), ii.) additional Financing agreement (AF) grant (in 2017) provided 13.3 million US\$ (10.3 million from IFAD and 3.0 million from IFAD-ASAP) and iii.) an Italian Grant Agreement (2016) to provide an amount of US\$ 381,245. The total project costs are US\$ 43.15 million. The project completion date ^[2] is due on 30 September 2019 and the closing on 30 March 2020.

The **objectives** of the Supervision Mission are: (i) to review both the technical and fiduciary aspects; (ii) to assess the progress made in the implementation of the agreed actions, in particular on aspects and issues highlighted during the last Supervision Mission (Nov. 2018) and the implementation support and follow-up Mission (March 2019); (iii) to provide clear guidance on how the project improves its performance whereby ensuring smooth completion and closure of the project.

The Mission started a briefing at MoAF and participation in the Supervisory Technical (STC) meeting held on 22/07/2019. With the MoFEP and MoAR courtesy calls were made on 23/07/2019. Due to unpredictable circumstances, the Mission had to restrict the travelling but instead the different community members of all five States were invited for various sessions; every day, another set of community - and/or network members participated (26th, 27th, 28th, and 31st July). Two communities were visited on 31/07/2019 namely Aldalilab and Alsheikh Ali community, Gezira State, while a meeting could be held with the Butcher Cooperative Society ^[3] after a joint visit to the Slaughterhouse at Tamboul on 28/07/2019. The Development Teams of the five States presented their progress reports including video and picture shows, while PCU the progress on Agreed Actions, on 25/07/2019. It took three sessions to up-date, finalise and validate the Exit Strategy with the relevant authorities; i.e. Director Generals of the State MoAF (04/08/2019). On other days, the four draft studies were discussed (27/07/2019), the draft Natural Resources Governance Framework (NRGF) (28/07/2019), the outputs of taskforces ^[4] formed (04/08/2019), the financial status (accurate balances; re-visiting budget for remaining period as well as completion period; counterpart funds; withdrawal applications; etc.) (05/08/2019); special meeting with contractors involved in the road construction (06/08/2019). The civil engineer, the procurement – and finance specialist had their own programmes.

Joint wrap up meetings for both projects were held at Rufaa level (07/08/2019) for project staff and a combined wrap-up and Supervisory Technical Committee (STC) at Federal level (08/08/2019), which was shared by the Under-Secretary of MoFEP, Abdelmoneim Mohamed Eltayeb.

^[1] The Supervision Mission of 2018 revealed that against Additional Financing (AF) phase target of 400 communities, 239 were reached and 161 excluded because the communities were either too large (>300 households), or too small (<50 households), or very distant. The latter concerned in particular Khartoum State where the team concluded that it was not feasible to reach out to these remote communities within the given time period, human and financial resources. Thus, of the approximate 700 communities, 379 have been covered till date, 321 communities excluded.

^[2] Including the Italian Grant.

^[3] Earlier called 'Meat Council' but this concerned a wrong translation.

^[4] One task force worked on addressing the constraint relationship between BIRDP and ABSUMI, while another one on the handing over of specific assets namely the slaughterhouse, the offices and quest houses of ABSUMI and the pot-harvest storage facilities.

Key Mission Agreements and Conclusions

Notwithstanding the on-going demonstrations which started in December 2018 and finally resulting in the historical event of signing the constitutional agreement on 4th August, the high inflation rate (46%^[5]), the chronic cash, diesel and fuel

shortage, the physical achievements (including the large number of infrastructural work) are impressive.

ROAD CONSTRUCTION. The mission visited the road which is under-construction to link El Subagh Town to Arab 6 Village (77 Km) and concluded that significant progress has been made in since the last mission (March 2019). By completing pending items, the road will be fully functional and ready to facilitate the movement of the Central Butana rural population during the rainy season.

FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT and EXECUTION. Project **actual commitments and expected payments** will lead to disburse the totality of the amounts available, if all works and services committed and in progress are received before project completion date. Project commitments exceed the total funds under the IFAD Grant Financing and reallocation of certain activities eligible to IFAD financing through the IFAD Loan should be considered.

Regarding the budget, the project executed 56% of the Annual Work Plan and Budget (AWPB) covering the 9-month period of 2019 and the activities related to the winding up period. The Mission noticed that the **actual expenditure under ASAP Grant** exceeds the amount budgeted for the year 2019

The **accumulated pre-financing** reached as of the 30th of June 2019 an amount of 10 638 308.98 SDG, including a carried forward amount from last financial year of 6 088 574,64 SDG. In addition, further contribution is required as per AWPB 2019 until completion and closing date respectively in order to ensure a smooth closing.

PROCUREMENT. Although considerable number of transactions are enrolled in the Procurement Plan (PP), there is still room for improvement.

BUTANA DEVELOPMENT FUND. BDF has progressed relatively slowly during the reporting period. The BDF director, executive manager, a secretary and an accountant are in place. A Work Plan and Budget for 2019 was developed and under implementation; two BDF Bank accounts were opened, and a first fund transfer (2 Million SDG) by BIRDP was made. Another AWPB 2019 to the Government of Sudan was developed and requested but not secured yet. Representatives of Butana networks managed to hold a meeting with BDF Director to discuss functionality of BDF. As noted by the Mission and demanded by community representatives relooking the BoD to effectively represent people of Butana is a necessity. To accelerate functionality of the BDF, both Business Plan and Strategy should be updated.

Ensuring smooth **take off of the new Sustainable Natural Resources and Livelihood Project (SNRLP) following the closing** of BIRDP (30/09/2019), assets shall be made available for the SNRLP. In certain States, (River Nile), the entire Development Team shall remain active as it concerns an integrated entity of the MoAF namely a multi-disciplinary development unit; it implies that this unit is covered in the AWPB of the MoAF. In other States, this set-up is envisaged but might not immediately materialise in terms of operating to the level of River Nile. A timely take off of the SNRLP is however important namely before the closing date of BIRDP.

EXIT STRATEGY PLAN. BIRDP has updated, finalised and validated the exit strategy plan for phasing out whereby a bottom up system of Local Extension Workers (LEWs), Community Development Committee (CDC), Community Networks (CNs) and State Coordination Unit (SCUs) are linked to the Butana Development Fund. The phasing out of fixed and movable assets and up-scaling of activities to a revitalised BDF is foreseen.

[5] Source: Central Bureau of Statistics, 6th August 2019.

D. Overview and Project Progress

Component 1. Policy and Institutional Building. The component has three sub-components: (i) 'policy and strategy' that covers NRM legislations and undertaking relevant studies; (ii) 'institutional development' comprising establishment of Butana Development Fund BDF and support to Government partners; and (iii) 'capacity building at various levels' which covers 'technical assistance' (TA), 'Young Professionals' (YP) and 'Knowledge products' (KP).

Policy and strategy. The progress in this component is satisfactory. The Four proposed studies (land tenure, water resources in Butana, impacts of artisanal gold mining and updating of the ecological study) have been finalized and validated with effective participation and representation of communities and authorities. The NRGF has also been finalized and validated through interstate workshop held at PCU in July 2013. The workshop was attended by wide range of stakeholders at different levels of governance including relevant Federal Ministries, (MoAF, MoAR, Ministry of Mining, National Council for Environment and Natural Resources, Higher Council for Environment and Natural Resources, National Forest Corporation, General Directorate of Range and Pastures), CCU of IFAD funded projects in Sudan, IFAD country office (ICO), BDF, state level line ministries, relevant departments and state legal advisors; authorities at locality level and community representatives. The NRGF was validated and unanimously endorsed by the stakeholders. Recommendations for the realization of the NRGF have been made and incorporated in the document. The key results of the Four studies have also been integrated in the final NRGF; i.e. the details are presented and discussed in 'Technical Paper 1.: Experience of Developing Natural Resource Governance Framework for Butana', page 55. Dissemination of the Framework and support to its integration in State and Locality levels development frameworks and budgets is an immediate task.

Institutional development. BDF has progressed but relatively slowly during the reporting period. The BDF director, a secretary and an accountant are in place, while the executive manager selected. A Work Plan and Budget for 2019 was developed and under implementation; two BDF Bank accounts were opened, and a first fund transfer (2 Million SDG) by BIRDP was made. Another AWPB 2019 to the Government of Sudan was developed and requested but not secured yet. The second meeting for BDF Board of Director BoD was also held (in July 2019). Representatives of Butana networks managed to hold a meeting with BDF Director discussing functionality of BDF. As noted by the Mission and demanded by community representatives relooking the BoD to effectively represent people of Butana is a necessity. To accelerate functionality of the BDF both its business plan and Strategy should be updated.

Capacity building at various levels. Institutional capacity building targeting DTs, YP, CBOs, project staff and project partners progressed remarkably during the reporting period with an average achievement of 92.3%. The training involved, among others, training for DTs and YP on M&E; training for DTs, YPs and Locality staff on GALS methodology; training of DTs and YP in value chain, revision of the methodology of preparing the LAPA Plan. External LR/Study-tour on sustainable development had also be achieved.

Knowledge Management. BIRDP achievements in the field of KM and dissemination deserves big compliment. Considering the late start in KM (2013) and way the project struggled with it at that time the achievements should be praised. During project lifetime the number of people reached by knowledge products is 100,000 accounting for 75.4% of the planned target (132,493). Dissemination of knowledge among communities involved different communication channels including posters, leaflets, knowledge films, and media programs (radio and TV sessions). The exchange visits among Networks, between new and mother communities/villages and interstate exchange visits for VSCGs proved to be an important driving force behind the success of up scaling during the AF. In the process the culture of knowledge sharing among project staff involving the five DTs has been institutionalized. To promote benefit of general public and upcoming IFAD SNRLP project it is important that relevant knowledge products made available in print and on CCU-IFAD web. In particular, manuals on rural microfinance and water management, CR CVP, livestock surveys studies and seasonal fodder calendars should be completed and shared before end of September 2019.

Young Professionals. The project has achieved remarkable success in implementing the Young Professionals YP programme. Piloting 26 YP in 2013 the Project managed to fully engage and train 474 YP (424 females and 50 males) in 2019. Besides their role in community mobilization, awareness raising and up scaling, the YP have gained enormous experience and self confidence that enabled large number of them to make the way easily in the labour market. The overwhelming majority of the YP are females belonging to Butana directly and indirectly reflecting the project contribution to employability and poverty reduction.

Component 2. 'Climate Resilient Natural Resources Management (range, forest, vegetables, crops, water). The Component seeks to enhance resilience to climate change through effective use and management of water, range lands, forests and agriculture while promoting access to markets. It has three sub-components: (i) establishment of functional water structures; (ii) improved water harvesting and agro-forestry systems; and (iii) construction and maintenance of feeder rural road. The platform for the implementation of this component is the development, approval, and implementation of Climate Resilient Community Village Plans (CR CVPs). During the reporting period all communities under AF (239) have established and continue following up on the implementation of their plans. The development of the plans reflects the improved awareness of the communities about their natural resources and their commitment and preparedness to protect these resources.

BIRDP role in resolving the critical water problem in Butana and its remarkable achievements have been stressed and

appraised by all stakeholders including communities and authorities. This involved construction, reconstruction and rehabilitation of hafirs and borehole. During its lifetime the project managed to construct/rehabilitate 318 sources exceeding the planned target (102) by 211.7%. During the reporting period of 2019 a total of 66 water sources have been constructed/rehabilitated. The provision of water has positively impacted all aspects of life in the Butana including population stability, improvement and diversification of agricultural production; improved nutrition and health particularly among women and children, improved enrolment of children in education, improved housing environment, income generation and investment in other service institutions, improved relationship between pastoralists and farmers and reduction of conflict over water sources.

Land under improved management practices stands at 333,060 ha accounting for 63.5% of the planned target (524,618 ha). Land under climate resilient practices has significantly expanded to exceed the planned target (37,176 ha) of the project to reach 65,880 ha. 83% of the land planned for Guar cultivation (4,817 ha) has been realized. 77 community range reserves covering around 65,000 ha have established by the project during its lifetime including 853 ha during the first half of 2019. Investment in individual range reserves also continued during 2019 to reach 1,206 ha, exceeding the planned target (1,115 ha). Establishment of community forests reached 30,500 ha accounting for 85% of the planned target during the project lifetime (35,880 ha). 85 community forests are currently managed and protected by communities. Terrace improvement/rehabilitation under water harvesting practices continued in 2019 to cover 42,553 ha, accounting for 106% of the planned target. 34 women groups farms where vegetables and fodder are grown have been established benefiting around 850 women. During 2009-2019, 112 women group farms have been constituted and functional including 59 farms under AF. Jubraka cultivation has remarkably scaled up and institutionalized.

The '**Arab 6 - El Subagh**' Road. The road is divided into six packages with different lengths. The construction contracts in these packages awarded to five national contractors is as shown in Table 1. Fortunately, the work in Package 2 (km 16.7 to km 28.95) and Package 3 (km 28.95 to km 43.3) was completely finished in Dec. 2018.

Table 1: The contractors and their road packages

Package	Chainage		Length (Km)	Contractor
	From	To		
1	0 + 000	16 + 700	16.70	Kaf & Shirian Alshimal
2	16 + 700	28 + 950	12.25	Kaf & Bassonda
3	28 + 950	43 + 300	14.35	Kaf & Hewa
4	43 + 300	50 + 000	6.70	
5	50 + 000	67 + 000	17.00	Kaf, SAS & Bassonda
6	67 + 000	74 + 000	10.60	

Of **Package 1 (0 to 16.7)** the remaining work is 44% and concerns work on the subbase; i.e. Shirian Alshimal contractor completed the earth works up to the subbase level in Package 1 (0 to km 16.7; 2% of the Subbase layer. The overall performance of Shirian Alshimal Contractor in Packages 1 (16.7 km) is 56%. In the remaining period up to 30 Sept. 2019, the contractor is willing to execute 50% of the remaining Subbase amount. Therefore, his progress is expected to be 78%.

Of **Package 4 (km 43.3 to km 50)** the remaining work is 52% and concerns mainly the subbase. The earth works in Package 4 (km 43.3 to km 50) was awarded to Hewa contractor and 67 culverts. Hewa Contractor succeeded to complete the earth works up to the subbase level and started to supply the subbase material on site. Hewa Contractor completed the construction of 56 culverts on 31 March 2016. A contract on 2nd Feb. 2019 to construct 11 box culverts was given to Hewa Company. Due to the delay in the work, the last mission (March 2019) agreed to keep 5 box culverts of big sizes (three cells or more) and change 6 box culverts of small sizes (two cells) to 7 pipe culverts of diameter 120 cm in order to complete the work by the end of June 2019. The work progress in two crossings of pipe culverts is about 80% completed and the pipes were supplied on the remaining 5 crossings. The concrete works in 2 box culverts on the Slab while the other 3 box culverts on the walls. The repair work of the damaged stone pitching and earth works at El Geegy Bridge completed while at El Dikair Box culvert was not started yet. The overall performance of Hewa contractor in culverts is

about 48%. The contractor is planning to complete the remaining work on 30th September 2019.

Packages 5 and 6 (km 50 to 77). Bassonda contractor is working in **Package 5** (km 50 to km 67) and **Package 6** (km 67 to km 77) and 32% of the work is remaining. The contractor completed most of the work in the embankment and the lower Subgrade layers (95%). The work in the Upper Subgrade and Subbase layers is going on. The overall performance of the contractor in the earth works is about 68%. The contractor is expecting to execute 55% of the remaining work on 30th Sept. 2019 and his performance will increase to 83%.

Assessment. The progress made on construction of the road is significant since the last supervision mission. As the Contractors could not complete the work before the mission started, new work plans were submitted for the remaining time to the closing date on 30 September 2019 as given in Table 2 presented below.

Table 2: The contractors new work plans for the remaining time up closing date

Activity	Shirian Alshimal (16.7 Km)	Hewa (6.7 Km)	Bassonda (26.7 Km)
Embankment	0	100%	98%
Lower Subgrade	100%	100%	95%
Supper Subgrade	100%	100%	84%
Subbase	2%	100%	5%
Progress	56%	100%	58%

Component 3. Animal Resources. In order to arrive at year around balanced feeding of livestock in the Butana systems where seasonal tracking with animals is common partly due to shortage of fodder and feed, partly as part of their traditional practices, it is of utmost importance to know which fodder is available in which season, what can be conserved, and what is to be added from outside. In addition, which livestock herds from outside will also graze and browse the range and forest areas. To address this, has been a major issue for the Development Teams namely how to handle it. Last year, all teams finally managed to prepare such calendars with a number of communities, but in 2019, all teams managed to prepare these calendars and it was learnt that it helped the livestock keepers in analysing the situation and strengthening and adopt their fodder conservation practices whereby hand hay baling of range grasses and/or the fodder crop Guar turn popular and are practiced at large. Among the women, the hay baling is popular as it allows them to adequately feed their goats and obtain good quantities of milk. Feeding of molasses and chopping of sorghum stalks is popular in certain communities especially there were cattle are kept (e.g. Kassala State).

In terms of Core Livestock Extension Activities to State, Fe/male participation and for year 2019, 2018 and 2017, these are shown in Table 3, presented below. Considering that it concerns only the months January – June, the number of training have been relatively high. In terms of planned against achieved, of the above mentioned three activities (feeding practices, control of Botulism, control of internal and external parasites), 184 were planned for 2019, and 232 implemented (126%), while for 'supplementary feeding', 55 sessions were planned and 40 achieved (73%). Investing in the management of the veterinary centres by Community Animal Health Works (CAHWs), 17 sessions took place (77%) of the 22 planned, while 46 CAHWs were trained (115%) of the 40 planned.

CAHWs manage to take the initiative for vaccination campaigns for control of epidemic diseases especially through their networks. They manage to mobilise the livestock keepers, create awareness and collect money, involve the veterinary doctor who supplies the vaccines and supervises the vaccinations; i.e. for the 1st half year of 2019, about 70,000 doses were administered. Especially, the more mature At -Tasab Network in Khartoum State, manages to care through their CAHWs for various animal health activities. CAHWs are also active in spraying of animals to control ticks and other external parasites for which the HH pay; i.e. it concerns 15 communities in Khartoum and Kassala State, while in Gedarif State a special group was formed to care for external parasite control in 26 communities while concerned communities managed to establish a fund to purchase veterinary drugs and vaccines.

Table 3: Core Livestock Extension Activities to State, Fe/male participation and for year 2019, 2018 and 2017

State	Feeding practices		Local Breed improvement (selection)		Supplementary feeding (flushing up)		Control of Botulism		Control of internal and external parasites		Total number	
	Men	Women	Men	Women	Men	Women	Men	Women	Men	Women	Men	Women
River Nile	122	213	87	96	46	86	24	14	1921	2434	2200	2843
Khartoum	270	626	1110	434	615	633	1111	536	699	340	3805	2569
Gazera	–	–	16	139	–	–	193	187	26	48	235	374
Gadaref	208	196	6	222	106	146	211	172	371	253	902	989
Kassala	239	265	25	27	7	32	–	–	507	347	778	671
Total 2019 (No.)	839	1300	1244	918	774	897	1539	909	3524	3422	7920	7446
Total 2019 (%)	39	61	58	42	46	54	63	37	51	49	52	48
Total 2018	688	1183	727	693	676	766	282	194	3153	2469	5526	5305
Total 2017	464	926	720	635	64	157	165	33	1437	978	2850	2729

Component 4. Community Development, Business Option and Rural Micro Finance. During 2009-2019, the cumulative achievement against **Key Logframe indicators** are as follows: i.) preparation of community development plans 75 achieved against target of 85 (88%); ii.) number of effective community agents 70 against target of 75 (93%); iii.) community capability index value 78 against target of 85 (92%); iv.) number of persons accessing rural financial services 11,399 against a target of 10,000 (114%). Much of the push for achieving came during the AF phase due to sharper focus on strengthening existing Farmer Interest Groups (FIG), CDC, networks and Local Extension Agents (LEA). For instance, against a target of registration of 242 CBOs during the AF phase, 290 were registered up to June 2019 including 73 during Jan-June 2019.

The number of persons in FIGs related to agricultural activities decreased from to 19,847 in 2018 to 18,530 in 2019. The decreased is largely due to fall in male participation in irrigated vegetable cultivation. On other hand there has been perceptible increase in the number of persons in forest and range activities and livestock development. 120,058 members have been reached in over the last 3 years, 43% of them in 2019 alone. The project strategy has encouraged mobilizing and organizing **youth** in groups and providing funds for their group ventures. Till 2019, 212 groups were formed, and 6.99 Mio SDG disbursed in 33 ventures (3 blacksmith centres; 15 gas refilling centres; 5 Agriculture Service Centres; 7 Brick making machines, 1 Fodder Farm; 1 Bakery Oven; 1 Tire making centre) involving 374 persons. Between Jan-June 2019, 19 additional groups with 212 members were established.

BIRDP training offerings included animal health and nutrition, tree seedling production, water harvesting techniques, IPM, forest protection, vegetable production, social and business skills. A total of 3254 persons -34% of them women - were trained between 2009-2019 against a target of 3020 persons. 443 were trained during Jan-June 2019. Between 2017-2019, 386 LEAs Agents were trained, of which 168 were trained during Jan-June 2019.

Adult education was provided to 11684 persons – 98% women - during 2009-2019 against a target of 9624. 1765 persons were provided adult education during Jan-June 2019. Functional literacy among women is an important stepping-stone in community participation. During 2009-2019, 8787 persons provided nutrition classes against a target of 7385 persons. 1143 persons were trained during Jan-June 2019. During 2009-2019, 11116 persons - of which 84% female – were trained in first aid against a target of 9510 persons. In Jan-June 2019, 632 persons trained.

Since its' inception in 2017 till June 2019, a total of 2392 of which 2368 is female and 24 male Village Saving and Credit Groups (VSCG) were formed against a target of 2200 groups. There are 8608 members (95% female) covering 219 communities in 9 Localities. 119 of these groups having 1906 members were formed in Jan-June 2019. The total savings mobilized during 2017-2019 is 4.4 million SDG. During Jan-June 2019, 2.42 million SDG was deposited by 8456 saving members, 79% of the amount was lent out to members. Repayment rate of inter-loans was 94.5% among all female groups and 80.6% among male groups. The size of loan for women was approximately 742 SDG while that of men was 2603 SDG. ABSUMI provided SDG 4.1 million to 1566 group members through Abu Deleg Khartoum, while Sudan Rural Development Co. Ltd. Provide SDG 3.23 million to 182 members in River Nile.

Work on the **Pro poor post-harvest storage facilities (Kassala state) (Italian grant^[6])**, shortly called the warehouses at Arab 7 and Wad Alratoli in Kassala State started in mid-2018. By end August 2019, the warehouses will be handed over to the communities after some due repair is carried out at Wad Alratoli. The warehouse will have simple equipment while all sophisticated equipment for pesticide residue and aflatoxin detection transferred to Agricultural Research Corporation (ARC), New Halfa which has a fully staffed lab. Both the warehouses are likely to receive registration as producer association by August end. The fumigation of sacks stored at two warehouses is responsibility of State Plant Protection Directorate. Most of studies and capacity building activities planned for 2019 are implemented or scheduled for August 2019, while installing, testing and handing over the above-mentioned sophisticated laboratory equipment is on-going.

^[6] For more details, consult 'Technical Paper 2: Community Development, Business Options and Rural Finance'.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Butana Development Fund Ensure BDF access to special budget in MoFEP	BDF DG; BDF Exe. Mng., STC	08/2019
Governance of Natural Resources & Climate Change Initiate and manage a process for reviewing & harmonizing laws at federal & state level pertained to NRs	NRM Officer, NR Policy expert; PC; STC	08/2019
Rural Micro Financing 4 new vehicles will be released by ABSUMI immediately for branch work in Tamboul and El Halfa. The performance of ABSUMI in Butana area would be subject to review by the Board of Directors of ABS.	PC BIRD, STC	08/2019
Rural Micro Financing ABSUMI provide a letter to BIRD committing itself to start Tamboul and New Halfa branch.	PC, ABSUMI	08/2019
Rural Micro Financing The two branch offices along with the furniture and furnishing is handed over to ABSUMI.	PC, SCU, STC	08/2019
Rural Micro Financing BDF collaborates with ABSUMI for transfer of ownership of building and land at Abu Deleg and Tamboul to ABSUMI.	BDF DG, SCU, STC	08/2019
Pro poor post-harvest storage facilities (Kassala State) (Italian grant) Handover the two warehouses to two producer associations at Arab 7 and Wad Alratoli.	PC, Kassala SCU	08/2019

Pro poor post-harvest storage facilities (Kassala State) (Italian grant) Ensure that the sophisticated equipment for detection of pesticide residues and aflatoxin is installed, functional and transferred to Agricultural Research Corporation (ARC), New Halfa.	Com. Dev. Officer, SCU Kassala, STC, PC	08/2019
Road Construction To complete the essential works to ensure the accessibility of the road.	TL, PC, STC	09/2019
Governance of Natural Resources & Climate Change Undertake prompt measures to edit, translate, print out, launch and prepare material (briefs/pamphlets in Arabic and English) to disseminate the NRGF	NRM Officer, NR Policy expert; PC; STC	09/2019
Governance of Natural Resources & Climate Change Initiate, discuss and approve with Communities to integrate relevant recommendations of NRGF into their Climate Resilient Community Village Plans	NRM Officer, NR Policy expert; PC; STC	09/2019
Governance of Natural Resources & Climate Change Undertake measures at locality, state and Federal level to promote awareness of the NRGF and its streamlining in development frameworks and State AWPB	NRM Officer, NR Policy expert; PC; STC	09/2019
Governance of Natural Resources & Climate Change Test, finalise and disseminate manual for operation and management of water sources	NRM Officer, NR Policy expert; PC; STC	09/2019
Rural Micro Financing BIRD Rural Finance team will produce an illustrated operation manual.	Com. Dev Officer, PC	09/2019
Butana Development Fund Prepare an implementable workplan and budget for 2020 for funding by MoFEP	BDF Exe. Mng., BDF DG	10/2019
Butana Development Fund Hire consultant to update BDF business plan and strategy	BDF Exe. Mng., BDF DG	11/2019
Butana Development Fund Relook at BoD of BDF	GoS; STC, BDF DG	01/2020
Butana Development Fund In collaboration of BDF BoD undertake prompt measures to build understanding about BDF among communities and decision makers	BDF DG; BDF Exe. Mng., STC	01/2020

<p>Pro poor post-harvest storage facilities (Kassala State) (Italian grant)</p> <p>Handhold the two producer associations on warehouse operation.</p>	<p>Dept. of Plant Protection</p>	
--	----------------------------------	--

E. Project implementation

a. Development Effectiveness

Effectiveness and Developmental Focus		
Effectiveness	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 5

Justification of rating

Analysis of the AWPB shows that remarkable progress had been achieved in the implementation of the Plan. 49 of the planned activities were implemented by 80% or more including 27 activities achieved by 100% or more. This is in addition to 12 (13.5%) activities implemented by 60%-79%. The shortage of cash to SCUs associated with delays in the transfer of counterpart resources and submission of withdrawal applications were described as the main constraints to the full realization of the Work plan.

The overall achievements as per up-dated Logframe are in principle up to the mark except for target set for outreach. In retrospect, the target set for the Additional Financing had more implications than expected especially in terms of reaching out to the isolated areas (Khartoum State in particular); i.e. 239 additional communities were reached instead of the planned 400. As such BIRDP presented an elegant and efficient example of how scaling up can take place; in less than two years (2017-2018) 239 additional communities have been reached against 140 communities during phase one (2009 – 2016). Many HHs of the AF phase are in the vicinity of the older communities and they had already shown interest. In summary, 70% (379) of the communities targeted (540) were reached; the number of HHs targeted are 90,000 and 70% (63,043) has been reached while in terms of HH members, the target set was 540,000 and 81% (436,648) were reached.

Log-Frame Analysis & Main Issues of Effectiveness

The theory of change and assumptions made were partially correct but less in terms of access to livestock markets for women, development of dairy value chain and livestock producer groups. All these are related to component 3 'Animal Resources', while for component 4 'Community Development, Business Option and Rural Micro Finance', it lacked originally a rural finance activity which was included post MTR. The VSCGs did work but access to RMF institutions is still lacking behind. Also, the business approach has been included over time

The immediate availability of cash remains the main challenge to fully implement the work plan for 2019. However, in all meetings with the MOFEP held during the Mission there was strong commitment that counterpart contribution will be made available before the end of August 2019.

Regarding the achievements made in terms of Development Objective, Outcome and Output of the four components, these are in general above the targets set with a few exceptions due to circumstances. In addition, the revised Logframe, set as per AF plan, with less but also new indicators, awaits inputs of the on-going impact study for a number of demanding indicators such as 'people reporting secure access and user rights to land'. The achievements made for a similar one but related to water namely 'people reporting secure access and users rights to water' is very high against the target set; i.e. namely the 'end target' set is 10,000 (5,000 male, 5,000 female) and respectively 23,203 (464%) men and 28,359 (567%) women have secured access to drinking water. The various lesson learnt reflect validity of the theory of change.

The various lesson learnt reflect validity of the theory of change.

Development Focus		
Targeting and Outreach	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 5

Justification of rating

In Phase I BIRDP reached 238 communities and in AF 240 communities. Thus, a total of 378 communities have been covered. The project right from the design stage has employed poverty and livelihood analysis in the process of targeting project interventions to help determine who will engage in, and benefit from the different activities undertaken. Subsequent assessments of monitoring of targeting performance has helped in sharpening targeting.

Main issues

BIRDP interventions are targeted at well-defined geographical areas, and poor communities. Using various participatory wealth ranking techniques, households were ranked poor 52%, average 34% and well off 10% in the AF phase. The targeting of the pastoralist communities has been difficult but was also not part of the design.

Gender equality & women's participation**Rating: 6****Previous rating: 5****Justification of rating**

Unlike in the past, women actively participate in community meetings, and assume leadership positions in CDC, and networks. Women are well represented in leadership positions viz. 1/3rd of CDC office bearers, water management and procurement committees are women. Men appreciate newfound empowerment of women and their enhanced role in decision making at home and outside. The GALS approach has made major contribution to improving household food and nutrition security and boost self-dignity of women. The prerequisite set at Mid-Term namely 'to ensure that women have access to water' has proven to be successful; simply women spare a lot of time when there is a close by source of drinking water.

Main issues

Women have expanded access to and control over productive assets –savings, common land, knowledge and technologies related to fodder storage, home garden, water and range management. With credit from VSCGs, women run petty trade in bakery, vegetables, hay bales, goat milk cheese, etc. Women constituted 64% of beneficiaries in different types of extension and training programmes so far, and 99% of VSCG membership.

Gender Transformation. At the onset of the project (2009 – 2012) and in line with the relative conservative rural Butana setting, it was complex to involve women as they would not be allowed to leave their house, would be too busy with fetching water, were not interested as not used to participate in any public activity, while men would even refuse to allocate land for irrigated women gardens. Currently, village women participate in meetings of the Mission at Rufaa level, which is far away from their village, and would express themselves confidently, take leadership positions in the Village Development Committee and Networks, are economically empowered and due to her new status is fully involved in household decision making. Men firmly appreciate the changes and explain how their different attitude has contribute to improved wellbeing at household and community level; i.e. gender norms have changed and contributed to improving the inequities between women and men. The range of approaches tested as by mid-term BIRDP was not yet successful in gender mainstreaming, has gradually led to arriving at proven and context-based gender transformative approaches, which have been documented. See Note on Gender Achievements attached in Appendix 4 for more details.

Agricultural Productivity**Rating: 5****Previous rating: 5****Justification of rating**

It is expected that the initiated Impact Study as well as the Project Completion Review shall invest in the Economic Financial Analysis (EFA) which is definitely very positive for improved terrace cultivation, goat feeding, vegetable gardens and range and forest strengthening.

Main issues

Focus on water harvesting and climate resilient practices have proved effective with acceptance and large-scale adoption. Continued support to terrace rehabilitation, successful scaling up of jubraka cultivation and increased investment in women groups farms together with investment in water supplies for irrigation purposes have combined to revitalize and diversify agricultural production in the Butana area. The contribution to enhanced food security and nutrition, animal feeds, improved incomes and enhanced resilience to climate change had been widely recognized. The role of jubraka in improving food security at the household level has been particularly stressed which explains the rapid scaling up and momentum the intervention has gained. The adopted approaches of fodder conservation combined with improved animal health services has significantly contributed to the improved livestock productivity. The contribution of improved agricultural and livestock production, the mainstay of rural economy in Butana, is widely stressed and appreciated.

Nutrition**Rating: 5****Previous rating: 4****Justification of rating**

Improved nutrition, particularly among children and women is one of the remarkable achievements of the project. This is the result of improved availability of food and its diversity, enhanced levels of employability and income generation. Reduction in prevalence of night blindness associated with improved nutrition has been stressed by communities. Improved nutrition is attributed to the combined effect of project interventions in water supply, animal health, household jubrakas and women groups farms, fodder production and storing, introduction of guar, training in home economics, hygiene and adult education and the constitution of saving and credit groups. One could indicate that system thinking applies namely it is about understanding the livelihood system and arriving at a mix of interventions which reinforce each other to achieve the improved nutritional status.

Main issues

Arriving at improved nutrition is not a linear process but a multitude of factors play a role. In case of BIRD, women saving time through improved access to drinking water has triggered a lot namely more time implied that women could participate in activities. Overcoming taboos regarding selecting village women to participate in a one-year mid wife training is another aspect. The trained mid wives are normally popular and also provide attention to feeding mother and child. In nutritional classes, balanced diets are promoted while literacy training also has practical topics related to nutrition. BIRD should document how this system approach has succeeded.

Adaptation to Climate Change

Rating: 5

Previous rating: 5

Justification of rating

Recognizing the high levels of vulnerability and risks to the impacts of climate change and vicissitudes of nature among the Butana population, the project has effectively managed to enhance and strengthen population adaptation to climate change. Building on indigenous knowledge and cultural heritage the Project successfully managed to engage communities in climate resilient interventions that proved effective in reducing their vulnerabilities, especially to drought. Resolving water problem and the focus on water harvesting for cultivation of crops and fodder, particularly guar has demonstrated its social, economic and environmental value. The capacity building in crop production, animal raising, community mobilization and awareness raising about the importance of managing and protecting natural resources remain important inputs. The development of CR CVP and the mapping exercise involved has further contributed to enhance the awareness of communities about their natural resources and the importance of their protection.

Main issues

To sustain such an investment continued effort for consolidation, remain important. This involves fostering partnerships with other actors on climate change, support to local entrepreneurship and service providers and support to enhance investment in innovative initiatives such as stabilized sand blocks. Recognizing the fact that some communities under AF have not matured yet linking them to the coming SNRLP is essential.

Diversification of local economy through various interventions, including VSCGs, development and flourishing of small businesses at household level and the project investment in women group farms adds another economic impetus for strengthened adaptation to climate change.

b. Sustainability and Scaling up

Institutions and Policy Engagement

Rating: 5

Previous rating: 5

Justification of rating

The project has created dynamic process of engagement. The cooperation with Government institutions has remarkably improved. The interstate workshop organized in Rufaa in July 2019 for the validation of the NRGF and attended by 3 acting federal ministers is strong evidence. Some State governments (e.g. River Nile) managed to fully integrate the SCU within the Ministry while providing commitment to pay the running cost of the SCU during the period between project completion and closing (Oct 2019-March 2020). Commitment to integrate the project activities in the State development plan and budget has been stressed. A significant process of civic-government engagement has also been constituted including some CDCs being able to map and curtail external encroachment on their NRs.

Main issues

NR networks are active and form an important chain between CDCs and government institutions. In August 2019 they organized themselves and sent representatives to Khartoum to discuss with BDF DG issues pertaining to BDF functionality while voicing the right of Butana people for effective and just representation in BDF BoD. Community governance institutions have gained recognition and legitimacy as hubs for community development and informed advocacy for peoples' rights to development.

Sustainability requires cooperation and continuous engagement among the different stakeholders. The civic-government engagement in particular needs to be strengthened and institutionalized. Full ownership and implementation of the Exit Strategy provides an important input for the realization of that. BDF in particular should work more pro-actively to ensure that.

Partnership-building

Rating: 4

Previous rating: 4

Justification of rating

BIRDP track record on institutional partnership is a mixed one. It lacked relevant, suitable policy framework for managing institutional partnerships with private companies, think tanks, NGOs, and other stakeholders. Realising that it is imperative to involve communities for ensuring both sustainability and their coverage in satellite communities, in the AF phase, BIRDP has invested in CDCs and in aggregated them into 17 networks: 1 in 2015, 9 in 2017, 4 in 2018, and 3 in 2019. The Networks have greatly contributed in conflict resolution over rangelands, and safeguarding forests, and in the case of Tasab Network, managing a primary livestock market. Another successful example is Tamboul Butchers Cooperative which has emerged as a public private producer partnership between Gezira State government agencies, local traders, and butchers.

Main issues

The approach to external partnership was largely ad-hoc. BIRDP did reach out to communities for partnership. Both BIRDP and communities benefit from shared resources and learning associated with joint activities.

A policy framework might have helped in building coherence, predictability, consistency, and protection of mutual interest of BIRDP and partners. Establishing and nurturing a partnership is a dynamic process. The first step in building a partnership is to identify the right institutions, explain why the partnership is mutually beneficial, roles of the entities involve, and clear expectation of outcomes. If possible, a partnership should be built on appropriate structures already existing in the area. The procedure of forming partnership includes several phases: preparation, drawing up a contract (where thought necessary), establishing a work programme, implementing the work programme, and monitoring and evaluation on an ongoing basis. BIRDP did not develop any mechanism for forming, norming, and building institutional partnership.

Despite specific provision in the MoU signed between ABSUMI and BIRDP in July 2018, BIRDP has unilaterally decided without communication to ABSUMI to deliver only 4 out of the 8 vehicles. In the absence of vehicles, ABSUMI did not operationalise the El Halfa and Tamboul branches. During this Mission, BIRDP has agreed to release the balance 4 new vehicles to help make El Halfa and Tamboul branches operational. BIRDP has good relationship with Sudan Rural Development Company (SRDC), a microfinance provider in River Nile.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Partnership IFAD-GoS and Agricultural Bank of Sudan (ABS) A consultant is engaged to review the functioning of partnership between IFAD-GoS and ABS for promoting ABSUMI's role in rural finance related aspects of IFAD-GoS projects.	ICO ABS, STC	12/2019

Human and Social Capital and Empowerment

Rating: 5

Previous rating: 5

Justification of rating

BIRDP has empowered women, youth, agro-pastoralists, and marginalised communities by instilling a sense of autonomy and self-confidence in them to act individually and collectively to change social relationships, and mobilise support for common initiatives to protect rangelands, build hafirs, and venture into youth led social enterprises. The formulation of natural resource framework through a multi-layered participative process is a good example of social change. Therefore, the major achievement of BIRDP is empowering countless individuals, building quality grassroots institutions, skilling local agents for development work, and nurturing networks of interest groups and community organisations.

Main issues

Together as collectives, people have regained their voice in public affairs, learnt to manage common natural resources and community initiative funds, dialogue with civic authorities on matters of their interest, and extract financial, moral and administrative support for their initiatives to protect rangelands, build ponds (hafirs), and solar electrify water yards. Positive and accelerated mobility of population along the poverty index was noted. Population stability strengthened social relations and cohesion and increased community participation and cooperation are conspicuous indicators.

Huge investment has been made in training, capacity building and cross learning and using one focused window of intervention namely 'Natural Resources' (water, range, forest, crops) has been the key of success. The just initiated household impact study will enquire into the various human development and social mobilisation approaches BIRDP used to bring about behavioural changes in the target communities.

Quality of Beneficiary Participation

Rating: 6

Previous rating: 5

Justification of rating

BIRDP has invested considerably in the orientation, mobilization and participation of the communities and developing their capacities. Active community participation, including participation of men, women, and youth is quite visible. In the process a fine balance between women and men has been established in participating in physical activities as well as representation in community institutions and leadership positions. A balance in age structure had also been maintained where youth, males and females, are effectively represented and actively engaged in the planning, implementation and follow up of project interventions. Youth groups and committees are also active in protecting forests, promoting use of alternative energy and house building material.

Main issues

The participation of women in the CDCs, VSCGs, training courses, procurement committees, fodder cultivation, - conservation and hay storage, women group farms, among many others, has provided for a dynamic process at the village level. Communal and collective actions geared towards the common good of the community have been institutionalized and so is the concept of voluntarism. Aspects of community cooperation and collaboration are conspicuous adding to social cohesion and strengthened people's sense of belonging to each other.

Besides providing for improved individual capacities the numerous meetings that brought large number of community representatives together (NRM forums at community level, Locality NRM forums, State level forums), exchange visits, training sessions, etc have significantly contributed to improve quality of beneficiary participation.

Responsiveness of Service Providers

Rating: 4

Previous rating: 4

Justification of rating

BIRDP collaborates actively with FMoAF, FMoAR, and their State level counterparts. At State level, there is also cooperation with the Ministry of Social Welfare and Security. BIRDP has relationship with organisations, business and individuals who offers service in exchange of payment. BIRDP has established relations with individual consultants, national technical organisations, 378 CDCs, 32 youth groups, several national universities, ABSUMI and SRDC, few NGOs, and private traders. The involvement of community in planning, procurement, and implementation, have greatly imparted a sense of ownership among community-based service providers.

Main issues

The use of individual consultants with affiliation to various government and quasi government agencies have induced new dynamism in completion of special studies during the reporting period. Frequent delay in contract award, and payment have negatively affected BIRDP's standing as employer.

Environment and Natural Resource Management

Rating: 5

Previous rating: 5

Justification of rating

A characteristic feature of the population in Butana is enhanced awareness about the importance of natural resources. Communities also reflect strong commitment and determination to protect and manage these resources. Voluntary forest guards and the youth groups organized to enhance sustainability of natural resources are in place. Mapping of community land and natural resources and the establishment of community networks around the issue of natural resource management indicate that commitment. The natural resource forums and conferences held together with the networks established around NRs have provided for social harmony while bringing people together around the shared interest of improved management and protection of resources.

Main issues

The social momentum created together with the benefits gained from interventions in NRM and the successful scaling up process founded on horizontal and vertical learning provide important indicators of sustainability. The remarkable engagement of women and youth and their empowerment through NRM and livelihood interventions provide an additional impetus for sustainable natural resource management.

Linking the apparently active local level processes to higher policy level remains the main challenge for the realization of the NRGF, while more communities showed interest to join NR networks including those targeted under the sister project ICSP.

Exit Strategy	Rating: 6	Previous rating: 5
----------------------	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

The project team has effectively managed to develop an articulated Exit Strategy with clear time frame and definition of the role of the various actors involved. The strategy was thoroughly discussed and agreed upon by the various stakeholders including communities, BDF, and government authorities at different levels. The Strategy involves the establishment of more community networks as well as strengthen linkages between networks and Local Extension Workers LEWs with potential partners and relevant government institutions as important sustainability measures. BDF, one of the main owners of the Strategy is anticipated to be more proactive in positioning itself as development actor in the Butana while securing the deployment of YP.

Main issues

An important measure for the realization of the Strategy is its `ownership by the various stakeholders. This requires ensuring that the Strategy should be shared and thoroughly discussed with the relevant stakeholders at the level of the Federal, State and Local Governments. Seeking the integration of relevant project activities in the development frameworks and budgets of the States and Localities is essential.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Exit Strategy Plan Implement the validated Exit Strategy Plan and sensitise all actors accordingly	All BIRDP teams, STC	09/2019
Exit Strategy Plan Seek support from all relevant State Governments for keeping in-tact the development teams of the SCUs.	STC, SCU, BDF	09/2019
Exit Strategy Plan Preventing any gap between closing of BIRDP (30/03/2020) and smooth taking off of the new Sustainable Natural Resources and Livelihood Project (SNRLP)	STC, ICO	03/2020

Potential for Scaling-up	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 6
---------------------------------	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

The AF phase was based on consolidating and scaling up whereby taking the Mother Communities as starting points for reaching out to satellite communities under the guidance and facilitation of various project actors. Field experience and the progress achieved show that the project has managed to support a efficient process of scaling up. The scaling up of networks is on-going whereby more communities express their interest to join.

Main issues

Scaling-up takes time before all implementing actors have a common understanding as to quickly it is understood as expanding project activities. The scaling-up experiences made by BIRDP deserve to be considered when designing new IFAD programmes in Sudan especially the current December design activity regarding the SNRLP. It should also be documented.

c. Project Management

Quality of Project Management	Rating: 4	Previous rating: 3
--------------------------------------	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

Thanks to the Development Teams, the STC, and the advisors at PMU level, good progress was made. Various problems had to be addressed during the Mission (revising the AWPB 2019, preparing WA's, speeding up No Objection demands, etc.). The reports provided to the STC showed some discrepancies. More efforts are required to smooth the relationship

with ABSUMI, BDF and ICSP. Regarding the latter, at field level there is cooperation, but fund flow remains hampered. Overseeing the procurement has been another weakness of the Management Team.

Main issues

The STC under the chairmanship of the undersecretary of MoAF should remain functional until the closing date. It is important that the implementation of agreed actions is closely monitored through providing accurate and up-to-date evidences.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Supervisory Technical Committee (STC) The STC should continue and strictly monitor the implementation of all Agreed Actions and hold 3 meetings between Aug.-Sept. 2019 and later on a bi-monthly basis.	STC, CCU	09/2019

Knowledge Management

Rating: 6

Previous rating: 5

Justification of rating

The SCU teams have taken the lead in producing large number of quality videos, radio programmes, audio-visuals, pamphlets, posters, manuals, and booklets on climate change, resilience and NRM. The project continued to strengthen the SCUs teams in producing and utilizing the KP in enhancing the community capabilities on climate change, resilience and NRM. The number of people reached by knowledge products is 132493, 32.5% higher than the planned outreach target. The establishment of KM Group at the level of the Project and the support availed by the IFAD Country Office have contributed significantly to that. A culture of sharing and documentation has been presently constituted. The knowledge generated also provide an important asset to inform planning and decision making in NRM in other parts of the country.

Main issues

The project has to disseminate various knowledge products for the benefit of general public and upcoming IFAD projects. BIRDP may make them available on CCU-IFAD web and consider additional prints of relevant KPs for dissemination. Rest to be ensured that the manuals on water management, and microfinance should be completed by end September.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Knowledge Management Multiply and share knowledge products with relevant stakeholders	M&E Officer	09/2019
Knowledge Management Ensure uploading of relevant products on CCU-IFAD website	M&E Officer	09/2019

Value for Money

Rating: 4

Justification of rating

Value for money (VFM) is about striking the best balance between the “four E’s” – economy, efficiency, effectiveness and social equity. The Additional Financing project document estimated cost benefit ratio of the project to be 1.65. BIRDP has invested huge amount of resources in human resource development, capacity building, training, and cross learning. The project, however, lacked tools for assessing the value for money of the training programmes, and capturing the positive behavioural changes brought about social empowerment. The forthcoming project impact assessment should address this critical gap.

Main issues

A quick-and-dirty calculation comparing the average cost per HH for phase 1 and AF phase shows that scaling up approach used for the AF phase considerable reduces the costs; i.e. see Table 4, presented below.

Table 4: Progress and cost comparison between BIRDP Phase 1 and BIRDP AF Phase

Item	BIRDP Phase 1	BIRDP AF
Total IFAD budget (\$ million)	24.80	13.30
No. of Communities covered	140.00	239.00
No. of HHs covered	22,510.00	22,808.00
Communities reached / year	17.50	80.00
Average costs per community (\$)	177,142.00	55,648.00
Average costs per HH (\$)	1,102.00	583.00

The recently concluded ecological zonation study partly addressed the four 'E's, the Household Impact study may further highlight monetizable and non-monetizable (e.g., change in social cohesion, lives saved; disease outbreaks reduced) benefit.

Coherence between AWPB and Implementation

Rating: 4

Previous rating: 3

Justification of rating

Contrary to previous years, a timely NO for the AWPB 2019 was obtained. However, the discrepancy between the AWPB 2019 versus the activities and categories entered in the finance system remained unchecked until the current supervision mission. Also, the strict monitoring of implementation of activities and in particular of the civil work has not been up to the mark which might lead to over expenditure of certain categories. Earlier SCU and PMU teams would be involved in reviewing the financial reports but with the going of the former FC this habit has disappeared.

Performance of M&E System

Rating: 4

Previous rating: 4

Justification of rating

The mission was pleased to observe that the monitoring and evaluation is back on track; the Jan. – June 2019 progress report was made available to the Mission, as well as up-to-date and detailed physical progress reports for the current year and period 2009 - 2019, and an accurate Logframe was shared.

M&E System Review

Progress remain restricted to presenting data while little analysis is provided. It would be interesting to make extra efforts in preparing the final progress report for the nine months of 2019 (Jan. – Sept. 2019) namely providing basic analysis and narrating the successes and why. In addition, including a summary is advisable.

Otherwise, data are collected on a quarterly basis and provided by the Development Teams at State level, verified by the relevant PMU officers and entered in the system by the M&E officer. Analysing physical achievements against Financial Expenditures doesn't take place systematically. They are, among others used, to prepare Knowledge Products.

During the SM, the physical progress reports covering 2009 up to June 2019 were reviewed and as per request corrections were made. The on-going impact study scheduled to finalise before the end of September should provide data for a number of composite indicators (asset ownership; coping with CC, etc.), insights in 'value for money', etc. The up-dated Ecological Zonation Study^[7] did provide insights into achievements; i.e. overall, the land use 'rangeland' increased from 40.6% in 2012 to 50.4 % in 2019. Much however depends on the ecological zone as well as the State; e.g. in Khartoum State 'Forest area' did increase but in Gedarif it did decrease

^[7] Source: BIRDP: Ecological Zonation Study, 2019.

Requirements of Social, Environmental and Climate Assessment Procedures (SECAP)**Rating: 5****Previous rating: 4****Justification of rating**

Although the SECAP [7] related documents such as ESMP/ESIA/IPP/RAP/ESMF/FPIC Plan/Climate risk analysis have not been produced neither is it formally integrated in the AWPB, the project remained strongly inclined towards improving food and income security of the poor, and building resilience in the face of climate change. The proven project interventions narrated last year remain valid and have intensified. These were i.) the Environmental Management planning tool namely Climate Resilient Community Village Plans (CR CVP); ii.) Development of water infrastructure; iii.) Improved Agriculture practices; iv.) Social protection of range and forestland; v.) Women vegetable gardens; vi.) Mapping year around fodder resources to provide timely information to herders about the overall availability and quality of animal fodder; vii.) Preventive and curative animal health services are disseminated to the communities and networks; viii.) Community Initiative Fund (CIF), involving in-kind grants for livestock restocking, cooking gas units, fodder storage, irrigation equipment, etc.

Regarding 'livestock', the improved feeding especially leguminous Guar and molasses contribute to better digestibility and less CH 4 emission, while more quantity and quality of rangeland biomass leads to more carbon sequestration.

[7] A SECAP was included in the Additional Financial proposal but no specific monitoring actions were planned neither undertaken. The planned Climate Change consultant who was supposed to provide attention to SECAP was not taken on board.

SECAP Review

SECAP parameters are greatly influenced by external factors viz. heat wave, availability of water, pest attack, political stability, social strife etc. This project has withstood major political disruptions in recent months, this itself is a positive achievement definitely due to the maturity of the various institutions (CDCs, Networks, Development Teams, etc.).

d. Financial Management & Execution**Disbursement by financier**

Type	Name	Current Amount	Disbursed Amount	Actual Rate
Domestic Financing breakdown	National Government	\$0	\$0	
	Beneficiaries	\$0	\$0	
	National Government (add)	\$2,175,000	\$0	0.0%
	National Government	\$3,233,377	\$0	0.0%
	Local Government	\$1,055,907	\$0	0.0%
	Beneficiaries	\$766,462	\$0	0.0%
	Beneficiaries additional financing	\$978,000	\$0	0.0%
Co-financing breakdown,	Italy	\$381,245	\$379,190	99.5%

Acceptable Disbursement Rate**Rating: 3****Previous rating: 3****Justification of rating**

The project completion date is in less than two months and has disbursed SDR 24.38 million—inclusive of initial advance against the total allocation of SDR 26.32 million by 31st July 2019. The combined disbursement rate at 92% in terms of SDR from IFAD Financing (Loan, Grant and ASAP) should reach 97% once the Withdrawal Application under review by IFAD are processed. Project actual commitments and expected payments will lead to disburse the totality of the amounts available, considering that all works, and services committed and in progress are received before project completion date. Project commitments exceed the total funds under the IFAD Grant Financing and reallocation of certain activities eligible to IFAD financing through the IFAD Loan should be considered.

Main issues

The mission notes the following:

- **IFAD Loan:** The disbursement from the Loan excluding initial advance and including withdrawal application under processing and expenditures incurred but yet to be claimed is 96%. Any remaining balance not yet justified at project closure should be paid back to IFAD.
- **IFAD Grant:** The disbursement from the Grant excluding initial advance and including withdrawal application under processing and expenditures incurred but yet to be claimed is 78%. Several payments are expected under actual commitments which should be delivered before completion date. The total pending unpaid commitments exceed SDR 2 Million which exceed the remaining balance under the IFAD Grant Financing (SDR 1.6 Million). The mission agreed with the project, to identify activities that are eligible under IFAD Loan, but currently planned under IFAD Grant in order to reconsider their financing through the Loan.
- **ASAP Grant:** The disbursement from the ASAP Grant excluding initial advance and including withdrawal application under processing is 99.4%. The remaining balance from the initial advance of an amount of 8 767 SDR should be paid back to IFAD at project closure.
- **Italian Grant:** The disbursement from the Italian Grant excluding initial advance and including withdrawal application under processing is 99.5%.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Reconsider financing of activities Eligible activities under IFAD Loan Financing and actually planned under IFAD Grant should be rescheduled in order to avoid any excess in commitments compared to available balance.	PC/FC	08/2019
Reimbursement of initial advance unjustified balance Project should reimburse IFAD at closing date any unjustified balance of the initial advance	MoFEP	03/2020
Submission of Withdrawal Application In order to ensure smooth closing and availability of funds, project should submit monthly Withdrawal Application to IFAD during the remaining period	FC	

Fiduciary aspects

Quality of Financial Management

Rating: 3

Previous rating: 3

Justification of rating

Overall, the quality of financial management has remained stable since the last supervision mission. The budget monitoring and control continued to be a major weakness with no immediate corrective actions taken to address significant variances between budget and actuals. The verification of expenditures claimed by the project under SOE identified some ineligible expenditures of an amount 454,355.00 SDG and that the completeness of the supporting documents is weak and the filing system needs to be improved.

Main issues

- **Staffing:** The recruitment of the vacant post of the PCU accountant has been concluded and the accountant of Kassala SCU has been selected to fill this position. A new accountant was hired for Kassala SCU, and an additional accountant was recruited to reinforce Khartoum SCU in February 2019. The finance team is fully in place, but still leaks knowledge of IFAD rules and guidelines.
- **Accounting:** At each SCU and for each Financiers, there is a dedicated accounting database under MS Access. At PMU level, a consolidation of the different databases is performed by financier (IFAD Loan, IFAD Grant, ASAP Grant and Italian Grant). The government contribution is calculated by the system based on the percentages of the financing agreement, which may lead to errors when reporting VAT.

The accounting databases are saved locally, and on a monthly basis the FC assistant reviews and controls the data. However, no formal policy clarify roles and responsibilities for external backup and different versions might exist. As part

of the closure of the project, the mission recalls that it has to archive project accounting documents and records, including the accounting database, for a period of ten years.

- **AWPB:** The project executed 56% of the Annual Work Plan and Budget (AWPB) covering the 9-month period of 2019 and the activities related to the winding up period. The mission noticed that the actual expenditure under ASAP Grant exceeds by 212,675 USD the amount budgeted for the year 2019. Unless a revised version of the AWPB is submitted and non-objected by IFAD, this amount will be considered ineligible. In addition, the initial AWPB prepared by the project does not strictly respect the categories as foreseen in the respective Financing Agreements. The mission agreed with the project to submit a revised version of the AWPB, in order to (a) adjust the amount budgeted under ASAP grant, (b) reallocate eligible civil work activities from IFAD Grant to IFAD Loan to avoid any overdraft in the IFAD grant, and (c) adjust the allocation by category, in line with project commitments and expected payments for the remaining period, with no impact on the total allocated budget.
- **Treasury and funds flow:** The Designated Accounts reconciliations show differences which mainly represent the pre-financed amounts from IFAD financing to cover government expenditures. As the project is approaching completion/closure dates, it is imperative that FC carries out the reconciliations systematically on a monthly basis to verify differences. In addition, the project Financial Controller should strictly monitor the available balance under each Financiers and prevent any cross-financing. To ensure smooth closing of the project and availability of funds, monthly Withdrawal Applications should be submitted to IFAD, regardless the submission threshold.
- **Internal Audit:** The internal auditor is in place and prepared his report for the first half of the year. However, no clear action plan was implemented to mitigate identified risks by the project team.
- **Project closing:** The Mission highlights that in accordance with IFAD's General Conditions, only project expenditures related to goods delivered and services rendered/completed before project completion date are eligible under IFAD Financing.
- **SOE Testing:** A sample of expenditures claimed under WAs claimed between January-August 2019 was reviewed (detailed tables presented in annexes). The mission noted the following:
 1. Ineligible expenditures related to VAT claimed under ASAP Grant for an amount of SDG 453,205.00
 2. Ineligible expenditures related to exchange rate difference under IFAD Grant of an amount of SDG 1,150.00
 3. IFAD No Objection is not properly filed by the Accounting team, which was not able to present IFAD No Objection on some contracts subject to IFAD NO.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Produce monthly financial reports to management. A monthly financial progress report of budget versus actuals and commitments must be produced for monitoring by STC, PCU and SCU during their monthly meetings. The corrective actions for significant variances should be minted. The FC must monitor actuals and commitments by category on regular basis under each financier and provide timely advice to project management as to ensure that amounts do not exceed the allowable overdraft percentage of 30% without a formal amendment to finance agreement.	FC/STC	07/2018
Constant monitoring of the liquidity level from all financier and to ensure no cross financing FC must monitor liquidity levels (cash inflow and out flow by financier by each implementing unit) and in consultation with SCUs accountants on regular basis. He should follow up with IFAD Disbursement unit to ensure that this is corrected over the system and to ensure controls are in place to avoid the re occurrence.	FC, PC, STC	07/2018

Automate financial reports and reconciliations of Designated Account by financier The FC should follow up and work closely with the system developer to automate key reports and reconciliations and ensure clear guidelines are in place on how to record the refund of the pre-financing over the system and impact on the exchange rate on expenditures/WAs.	FC/STC	08/2018
Prepare monthly financial reports and shared them with management and the supervisory committee to assist in decision making on major variances FC and Director to prepare monthly financial reports and share them with management and the supervisory committee to assist decision making on major variances.	FC/ Director	10/2018
System developer to automate key reports and reconciliations System developer to automate key reports and reconciliations and give clear guidance on how to record the refunds of prefinanced expenditures in the system and impact of exchange rates on expenditures/WAs	FC	12/2018
Recruitment of an assistant accountant PMU/ Gadarif Coordinator to recruit an assistant accountant	PMU/ Gadarif Coordinator	01/2019
AWPB revision Revise AWPB and submit it to IFAD No Objection, and reconsider Civil Work activities financing	PC/FC	08/2019
Reimburse the ineligible expenditures Ineligible expenditures identified of an amount of SDG 454,355.00 should be reflected in the next Withdrawal Application	FC	08/2019
Completion of activities To be eligible under financing, all activities should be completed before completion date	PC	09/2019

Quality and Timeliness of Audit

Rating: 5

Previous rating: 4

Justification of rating

The audit report and management letter were submitted two days after the deadline. The audit was conducted by National Audit Chamber in accordance with International Standards for Auditing

Main issues

The auditors expressed unqualified opinion on the project's financial statements. The financial statements, accompanying notes and disclosures were prepared in accordance with IPSAS cash basis. Moreover, some inconsistencies/typo were noted in the accounting basis applied between the audit opinion which refers to IPSAS Cash and note no.2 of accounting policies which refers to modified cash basis and wrong financial year.

Counterparts Funds

Rating: 2

Previous rating: 2

Justification of rating

The accumulated pre-financing reached as of the 30th of June 2019 an amount of 10,638,308.98 SDG, including a carried forward amount from last financial year of 6,088,574.64 SDG. In addition, further contribution is required as per AWPB 2019 until completion and closing date respectively in order to ensure a smooth closing. The project should submit monthly forecast and financial report as requested by MoFEP to allow timely processing. The practice of pre-financing is contrary to the Loan covenants and the Mission strongly recommends that MoFEP to transfer the pre-financed amount by 31/8/2019 and to make sufficient and timely transfers to the project bank account to avoid any shortage of cash preventing project from fulfilling its commitments.

Main issues

As at 30th of June 2019, the government contribution based on actual project payments for 2019 should have reached 8,049,880.28 SDG. However, the government paid 583,357.67 per month in 2019 corresponding to 3,500,146.02 as of 30th of June 2019. An additional pre-financing is thus created during the year for an amount of 4,549,734.26 SDG.

In addition, further contribution is required as per AWPB 2019 until closing date in order to ensure a smooth closing. The project should submit monthly forecast and financial report as requested by MoFEP to allow timely processing. The practice of pre-financing is contrary to the Loan covenants and the Mission strongly recommends that MoFEP to transfer the pre-financed amount by 31/8/2019 and to make sufficient and timely transfers to the project bank account to avoid any shortage of cash preventing project from fulfilling its commitments.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Submit all supporting documents and reports required by MoFEP on the utilization of the counterpart funds on monthly basis Submit all supporting documents and reports required by MoFEP on the utilization of the counterpart funds on monthly basis	FC/STC/CCU	07/2018
MoFEP to transfer the pre-financed amount up to June 2018, and then on monthly/quarterly basis in advance and for the remaining period MoFEP to transfer the pre-financed amount up to June 2018, and then on monthly/quarterly basis in advance and for the remaining period	MoFEP/CCU Coordinator	08/2018
Collect and record the figures on the tax exemption, custom duties from MoFEP and in kind contributions made by the states governments	FC/ CCU/ MoFEP	10/2018
MoFEP to allocate and transfer sufficient balances to cover the deficit and government contribution of 2019 budget Allocate and transfer sufficient balances to cover the deficit and government contribution of 2019 budget	MoFEP/ Director/ FC	03/2019
Provisioning of Counterpart Funds Release all counterpart funds against AWPB in line with project achievement, and the pre-financed part estimated as of the 30th of June 2019 at an amount of 10,638,308.98 SDG	PC/FC	08/2019

Compliance with Loan Covenants

Rating: 4

Previous rating: 4

Justification of rating

Compliance with loan covenants has been rated as moderately satisfactory (4) and no increase in rating. A list of key covenants and the compliance is compiled in Appendix 3.

Main issues

Delays in transferring counterpart funds keeps causing pre-financing of governments commitments from foreign financing

proceeds. During debriefing, new commitments were made regarding timely transferring of counterpart funds. Timely submission of the AWPB happened including providing up-dates and seeking no objection.

Procurement		
Procurement	Rating: 3	Previous rating: 4

Justification of rating

Although the project keeps the success made with respect to the timely initiation of the procurement process for considerable number of transactions enrolled in the PP, there is still room for improvement. Some of the areas that still need improvement include: a) procurement should be following the approved plan; b) the need to ensure that Procurement processes are in compliance with IFAD Procurement Guidelines in what relates to i) compliance with IFAD prior review requirements; ii) the preparation of bidding documents (including technical specifications which were found inadequate, the evaluation and post qualification criteria in the bidding documents is either absent, unclear or incomplete); iii) the evaluation process; iv) filing system and v) the contract administration.

Procurement Review

Structure of the Procurement Unit. The PCU Procurement Unit is consisting of one procurement officer has got experience in managing procurement activities. Some gaps are identified at the level of the selection of consulting services and implementation of ICB method following the World Bank Guidelines.

Procurement Planning. The 2019 procurement plan was found to meet the basic requirements. However; the mission noted that several Goods transactions were separated without proper justification. In line with good procurement practices, the low-value procurement activities should be grouped together under one tender for purposes of economies of scale.

Bidding Documents. The All procurement activities implemented during the review period were made through the application of less-competitive methods (Shopping and Selection of Individual Consultants) except the assignment for Project Impact Assessment that was carried out using QCBS method. The mission noted that the template adopted for shopping method was insufficient in terms of ITBs, GCCs and SCCs. Moreover, in many cases, the bidding documents were issued with inadequate technical specifications or even without any technical specifications at all. This is quite serious as it could lead to poor quality of the delivered goods or completed works. It was also noted that some requirements were unclear or unrealistic such as delivery completion time that bidders cannot meet.

Procurement Progress. The revised version of 2018 procurement plan has included 408 Goods, Works and Non-Consultancy Services procurement transactions, and 6 consultancy assignments with total cost estimate SDG 284 million. As of August 06, 2019, the procurement process for 276 packages worth SDG 206.2 million was completed by the PCU, CCU and SCUs constituting **72.5%** of the planned amounts in terms of budget and **68%** in terms of number.

Contract Register. The mission reviewed the project register of contracts –on sample basis. The register of contracts was found in conformity with IFAD requirements; however, it was found incomplete with respect to contracts awarded in the current year and. Moreover, some important information is missing, such as financier and date of IFAD No Objection.

The procurement filing system. The mission has reviewed –on sample basis- the procurement filing system of the PCU and copies of the filing of the SCUs. It was noted that the filing system miss some important documents.

Procurement post review. As part of the mission activities, procurement post review has been conducted on sample basis for the contracts carried out over 2018. The reviewer has noted that:

1. Evaluation is not conducted in accordance with the criteria stated in the bidding documents;
2. Technical specifications were inadequate in all reviewed transactions;
3. Inadequate evaluation and post-qualification criteria, general and special conditions;
4. No standard contract form was developed for individual consultants;
5. In some cases. 100% of the contract value was paid without receiving equivalent guarantee;
6. Weak records keeping and filing, and weakness in ensuring contract management (supervision)/administration (monitoring) during contract implementation to completion resulting into cost overruns;
7. In several cases, the SCUs addressed inappropriate vendors to solicit quotations which led to de facto Direct Contracting;
8. Award of contracts were done with value exceeding the allocated budget and cost estimate in the procurement plan without obtaining IFAD No Objection;
9. Inspection and acceptance reports were not included in the procurement files for many cases.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Procurement Review Ensure the completion of all on-going contracts before the Project Closing Date	PCU	09/2019
Procurement Review Ensure that complete documentation of procurement processes is kept on procurement files, including proof of receipt of goods, works and services by the ultimate beneficiaries and shall retain such records and documents for at least ten (10) years thereafter.	PCU	09/2019

F. Agreed Actions

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Overview and Project Progress		
Butana Development Fund Ensure BDF access to special budget in MoFEP	BDF DG; BDF Exe. Mng., STC	08/2019
Governance of Natural Resources & Climate Change Initiate and manage a process for reviewing & harmonizing laws at federal & state level pertained to NRs	NRM Officer, NR Policy expert; PC; STC	08/2019
Rural Micro Financing 4 new vehicles will be released by ABSUMI immediately for branch work in Tamboul and El Halfa. The performance of ABSUMI in Butana area would be subject to review by the Board of Directors of ABS.	PC BIRDP, STC	08/2019
Rural Micro Financing ABSUMI provide a letter to BIRDP committing itself to start Tamboul and New Halfa branch.	PC, ABSUMI	08/2019
Rural Micro Financing The two branch offices along with the furniture and furnishing is handed over to ABSUMI.	PC, SCU, STC	08/2019
Rural Micro Financing BDF collaborates with ABSUMI for transfer of ownership of building and land at Abu Deleg and Tamboul to ABSUMI.	BDF DG, SCU, STC	08/2019
Pro poor post-harvest storage facilities (Kassala State) (Italian grant) Handover the two warehouses to two producer associations at Arab 7 and Wad Alratoli.	PC, Kassala SCU	08/2019

Pro poor post-harvest storage facilities (Kassala State) (Italian grant) Ensure that the sophisticated equipment for detection of pesticide residues and aflatoxin is installed, functional and transferred to Agricultural Research Corporation (ARC), New Halfa.	Com. Dev. Officer, SCU Kassala, STC, PC	08/2019
Road Construction To complete the essential works to ensure the accessibility of the road.	TL, PC, STC	09/2019
Governance of Natural Resources & Climate Change Undertake prompt measures to edit, translate, print out, launch and prepare material (briefs/pamphlets in Arabic and English) to disseminate the NRGF	NRM Officer, NR Policy expert; PC; STC	09/2019
Governance of Natural Resources & Climate Change Initiate, discuss and approve with Communities to integrate relevant recommendations of NRGF into their Climate Resilient Community Village Plans	NRM Officer, NR Policy expert; PC; STC	09/2019
Governance of Natural Resources & Climate Change Undertake measures at locality, state and Federal level to promote awareness of the NRGF and its streamlining in development frameworks and State AWPB	NRM Officer, NR Policy expert; PC; STC	09/2019
Governance of Natural Resources & Climate Change Test, finalise and disseminate manual for operation and management of water sources	NRM Officer, NR Policy expert; PC; STC	09/2019
Rural Micro Financing BIRDP Rural Finance team will produce an illustrated operation manual.	Com. Dev Officer, PC	09/2019
Butana Development Fund Prepare an implementable workplan and budget for 2020 for funding by MoFEP	BDF Exe. Mng., BDF DG	10/2019
Butana Development Fund Hire consultant to update BDF business plan and strategy	BDF Exe. Mng., BDF DG	11/2019
Butana Development Fund Relook at BoD of BDF	GoS; STC, BDF DG	01/2020
Butana Development Fund In collaboration of BDF BoD undertake prompt measures to build understanding about BDF among communities and decision makers	BDF DG; BDF Exe. Mng., STC	01/2020
Pro poor post-harvest storage facilities (Kassala State) (Italian grant) Handhold the two producer associations on warehouse operation.	Dept. of Plant Protection	

Sustainability and Scaling up		
Exit Strategy Plan Implement the validated Exit Strategy Plan and sensitise all actors accordingly	All BIRDP teams, STC	09/2019
Exit Strategy Plan Seek support from all relevant State Governments for keeping in-tact the development teams of the SCUs.	STC, SCU, BDF	09/2019
Partnership IFAD-GoS and Agricultural Bank of Sudan (ABS) A consultant is engaged to review the functioning of partnership between IFAD-GoS and ABS for promoting ABSUMI's role in rural finance related aspects of IFAD-GoS projects.	ICO ABS, STC	12/2019
Exit Strategy Plan Preventing any gap between closing of BIRDP (30/03/2020) and smooth taking off of the new Sustainable Natural Resources and Livelihood Project (SNRLP)	STC, ICO	03/2020
Project Management		
Supervisory Technical Committee (STC) The STC should continue and strictly monitor the implementation of all Agreed Actions and hold 3 meetings between Aug.-Sept. 2019 and later on a bi-monthly basis.	STC, CCU	09/2019
Knowledge Management Multiply and share knowledge products with relevant stakeholders	M&E Officer	09/2019
Knowledge Management Ensure uploading of relevant products on CCU-IFAD website	M&E Officer	09/2019
Financial Management & Execution		
Submit all supporting documents and reports required by MoFEP on the utilization of the counterpart funds on monthly basis Submit all supporting documents and reports required by MoFEP on the utilization of the counterpart funds on monthly basis	FC/STC/CCU	07/2018
Produce monthly financial reports to management. A monthly financial progress report of budget versus actuals and commitments must be produced for monitoring by STC, PCU and SCU during their monthly meetings. The corrective actions for significant variances should be minted. The FC must monitor actuals and commitments by category on regular basis under each financier and provide timely advice to project management as to ensure that amounts do not exceed the allowable overdraft percentage of 30% without a formal amendment to finance agreement.	FC/STC	07/2018

Constant monitoring of the liquidity level from all financier and to ensure no cross financing FC must monitor liquidity levels (cash inflow and out flow by financier by each implementing unit) and in consultation with SCUs accountants on regular basis.He should follow up with IFAD Disbursement unit to ensure that this is corrected over the system and to ensure controls are in place to avoid the re occurrence.	FC, PC, STC	07/2018
MoFEP to transfer the pre-financed amount up to June 2018, and then on monthly/quarterly basis in advance and for the remaining period MoFEP to transfer the pre-financed amount up to June 2018, and then on monthly/quarterly basis in advance and for the remaining period	MoFEP/CCU Coordinator	08/2018
Automate financial reports and reconciliations of Designated Account by financier The FC should follow up and work closely with the system developer to automate key reports and reconciliations and ensure clear guidelines are in place on how to record the refund of the pre-financing over the system and impact on the exchange rate on expenditures/WAs.	FC/STC	08/2018
Collect and record the figures on the tax exemption, custom duties from MoFEP and in kind contributions made by the states governments	FC/ CCU/ MoFEP	10/2018
Prepare monthly financial reports and shared them with management and the supervisory committee to assist in decision making on major variances FC and Director to prepare monthly financial reports and share them with management and the supervisory committee to assist decision making on major variances.	FC/ Director	10/2018
System developer to automate key reports and reconciliations System developer to automate key reports and reconciliations and give clear guidance on how to record the refunds of prefinanced expenditures in the system and impact of exchange rates on expenditures/WAs	FC	12/2018
Recruitment of an assistant accountant PMU/ Gadarif Coordinator to recruit an assistant accountant	PMU/ Gadarif Coordinator	01/2019
MoFEP to allocate and transfer sufficient balances to cover the deficit and government contribution of 2019 budget Allocate and transfer sufficient balances to cover the deficit and government contribution of 2019 budget	MoFEP/ Director/ FC	03/2019
Reconsider financing of activities Eligible activities under IFAD Loan Financing and actually planned under IFAD Grant should be rescheduled in order to avoid any excess in commitments compared to available balance.	PC/FC	08/2019

AWPB revision Revise AWPB and submit it to IFAD No Objection, and reconsider Civil Work activities financing	PC/FC	08/2019
Provisioning of Counterpart Funds Release all counterpart funds against AWPB in line with project achievement, and the pre-financed part estimated as of the 30th of June 2019 at an amount of 10,638,308.98 SDG	PC/FC	08/2019
Reimburse the ineligible expenditures Ineligible expenditures identified of an amount of SDG 454,355.00 should be reflected in the next Withdrawal Application	FC	08/2019
Procurement Review Ensure the completion of all on-going contracts before the Project Closing Date	PCU	09/2019
Procurement Review Ensure that complete documentation of procurement processes is kept on procurement files, including proof of receipt of goods, works and services by the ultimate beneficiaries and shall retain such records and documents for at least ten (10) years thereafter.	PCU	09/2019
Completion of activities To be eligible under financing, all activities should be completed before completion date	PC	09/2019
Reimbursement of initial advance unjustified balance Project should reimburse IFAD at closing date any unjustified balance of the initial advance	MoFEP	03/2020
Submission of Withdrawal Application In order to ensure smooth closing and availability of funds, project should submit monthly Withdrawal Application to IFAD during the remaining period	FC	

Butana Integrated Rural Development Project

Logical Framework

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of Verification			Assumptions
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2019)	Cumulative Result (2019)	Cumulative Result % (2019)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility	
Outreach	1.b Estimated corresponding total number of households members							Progress Reports; Surveys; Approved CR CVPs	half yearly	PCU/DTs	
	Household members			540 000	27 918	436 648	80.9				
	1.a Corresponding number of households reached							RIMS baseline and impact surveys; ASAP surveys (including benchmark setting); UNICEF MICS survey; Wealth surveys; Score Card; CCI	half yearly	PCU/DTs	
	Women-headed households										
	Non-women-headed households										
	Households			90 000	4 653	63 043	70				
	1 Persons receiving services promoted or supported by the project							Progress Reports; Surveys; Approved CR CVPs	half yearly	PCU/DTs	
	Females			50 000	12 284	62 400	124.8				
	Males			50 000	15 643	79 865	159.7				
	Young			100 000	6 980	35 497	35.5				
	Total number of persons receiving services			200 000	27 927	142 265	71.1				
	Communities receiving project services										
	Villages			540	0	379	70.2				

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of Verification			Assumptions
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2019)	Cumulative Result (2019)	Cumulative Result % (2019)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility	
Project Goal Improve in a sustainable manner the livelihoods and resilience to drought of the poor rural households	Prevalence of malnutrition in children under age of five years							RIMS baseline and impact surveys; ASAP surveys (including benchmark setting); UNICEF MICS survey; Wealth surveys; Score Card; CCI	half yearly	PCU/DTs	- Continued political and macro-economic stability - Government continues its commitment to poverty reduction and development of Butana
	Males	22.3	16.75	15		11.2	74.7				
	Females	26.1	17.65	17		9.2	54.1				
	Poor smallholder household members supported in coping with the effects of climate change										
	Household members			192 000	2 686	164 880	85.9				
	HHs with improved assets ownership										
	Household		0	90 000		44 240	49.2				
Development Objective The capacity of CBOs to engage in climate resilient, environmentally sound, socially and gender equitable development initiatives and management of NRs developed.	Persons -incl. pastoralists – receiving project services							Progress Reports; Surveys; Approved CR CVPs	half yearly	PCU/DTs	
	Males			50 000	15 643	104 178	208.4				
	Females			50 000	12 284	106 194	212.4				
	Male youth			40 000	3 908	23 199	58				
	Female youth			60 000	3 072	31 220	52				
	Total			100 000	27 927	210 372	210.4				

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of Verification			Assumptions
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2019)	Cumulative Result (2019)	Cumulative Result % (2019)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility	
Outcome Effective governance framework that ensures regulated access to land and water resources of the Butana	People reporting secure access and user rights to land							Impact Assessment Surveys; Minutes CDCs; Progress Reports	End current phase (2016), mid-term AF (2018) and end	PCU/DTs	Favourable government policies; Clarity on user rights; Ability to capture pastoralist movements
	Males			35 000		311	0.9				
	Females			17 000		56	0.3				
	Males youth			26 000		323	1.2				
	Females youth			8 000		54	0.7				
	People (pastoralists) reporting secure access and user rights to water							Impact Assessment Surveys; Minutes CDCs; Progress Reports	End current phase (2016), mid-term AF (2018) and end	PCU/DTs	
	Males			5 000		23 203	464.1				
	Females			5 000		28 359	567.2				
Output Policy and Strategy (incl. NRM legislation); Framework (FW) for Governance of NRs established; Relevant studies conducted ('Land tenure, ownership and access rights'; 'Mapping Study on NRs incl. WATER and Land Use Mapping', 'on impact of gold mining')	Study conducted							Reports of Policy Advisor; Content Framework; Minutes CDCs; ToRs studies; Agenda & Reports of W/shops, PCs	half yearly	PCU/BDA	Framework approved by all actors; Presidential decree (Feb., 2015) 'Range Org. and Dev. of Fodder Resources Law' activated at all five States
	Study	0		3	3	3	100				
	Workshop conducted							Reports of Policy Advisor; Content Framework; Minutes CDCs; ToRs studies; Agenda & Reports of W/shops, PCs	half yearly	PCU/BDA	
	Workshop	0		10	1	23	230				
	Conference	0		20	2	10	50				

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of Verification			Assumptions
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2019)	Cumulative Result (2019)	Cumulative Result % (2019)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility	
Output Institutional Development building occurred	BDA (Butana Dev. Agency) established							Minutes BoD; Annual turn over; Progress reports BDA; Outcome pilots (business)	half yearly	PCU/BDA	Presidential decree on BDA respected by all parties Sufficient staff allocated to Locality Units; low turnover of LU - and SCU teams
	BDA			1		1	100				
	Govt. partners supported: locality units (LUs) that are capacitated and reporting performance improvement							progress reports Locality Units; Surveys	half yearly	PCU/DTs	
	Locality unit	0		9		9	100				
	1.1.4 Persons trained in production practices and/or technologies										
	Men trained in crop	0				13 306					
	Women trained in crop	0				6 437					
	Young people trained in crop	0				7 897					
	Men trained in livestock	0			63	4 988					
	Women trained in livestock	0			13	4 993					
	Young people trained in livestock	0				6 672					
	Persons trained in crop	0				19 743					

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of Verification			Assumptions
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2019)	Cumulative Result (2019)	Cumulative Result % (2019)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility	
	Persons trained in livestock	0			76	9 981					
	People trained in post-production, processing and marketing										
	Males			700		3 241	463				
	Females			700		1 164	166.3				
	Studies										
	Study	0		15	3	16	106.7				
	Policy 1 Policy-relevant knowledge products completed										
	Number	0		750	13	464	61.9				
	People trained in income generating activities										
	Males				1 338	7 950					
	Females				223	5 193					
	People reached with Knowledge Products										
	Persons	0		100 000	41 100	97 580	97.6				
	People trained in NRM - rangelands										
	Females			13 500		29 460	218.2				
	Males			31 500		42 939	136.3				
Output Drinking water / sanitation	Drinking water system constructed / rehabilitated										
	Water system	0		75		248	330.7				
Outcome Improved climate resilient natural resources management (range, forest, vegetables, crops)	Approved and implemented Climate Resilient Community Village Plans (CVPs)							Content approved CVPs; Surveys / GPS maps	Quarterly	DTs/ LUs/ PCU	Sufficient Technical Support received on planning and monitoring CVPs.

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of Verification			Assumptions
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2019)	Cumulative Result (2019)	Cumulative Result % (2019)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility	
											Cooperation with other actors active in water supply facilities.
	CVPs	0		280		379	135.4				
	Time spent collecting water							CDCs minutes; Surveys; Data WUCs	half yearly	DTs/LUs/PCU	
	Min/day/HH			30		30	100				
Output Improved Water harvesting per agro-ecological zone and enhanced agro-forestry systems.	Land under rainfed agroforestry practices									DTs/LUs/PCU	Acquainted with Climate Risk Assessment. Constructive partnership with FNC.
	Hectares of land			50 000	1 955	4 461	8.9				
	1.1.2 Farmland under water-related infrastructure constructed/rehabilitated										
	Hectares of land			302		3 776	1 250.3				
	3.1.4 Land brought under climate-resilient practices										
	Hectares of land			333 060	4 780	524 618	157.5				
	Land under climate-resilient practices							Progress reports; CDCs minutes; Surveys / GPS maps	half yearly	DTs/LUs/PCU	
	Land area			65 880	4 780	99 910	151.7				
Output Rural roads used and maintained	2.1.5 Roads constructed, rehabilitated or upgraded							Surveys; Minutes CDCs;Progress reports	Quarterly	DTs/LUs/PCU	Road & wadi crossing constructions in place.
	Length of roads (km)			61		74	121.3				

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of Verification			Assumptions
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2019)	Cumulative Result (2019)	Cumulative Result % (2019)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility	
Outcome Improved access to advisory services and bargaining position of men and women in marketing	People (including pastoralists) with access to secondary and primary markets							Data markets; Score card exercise		DTs/LUs/PCU	Market data reliable; 20% pastoralists access markets. Localities / States maintain secondary - and People primary markets.
	Males			26 000	3 220	26 850	103.3				
	Females			26 000	3 510	18 135	69.8				
	% of fully functioning primary (P) and secondary (S) livestock markets							Data markets; Score card exercise		PCU/DTs/LUs	
	Market			30		37	123.3				
Outcome Better Animal husbandry and - management (large and small animals incl. traditional poultry)	Mortality rate of large and small animals incl. traditional poultry (random sample of 150 head)										
	Mortality rate			5		3	60				
Outcome Community Development, Business Options and Rural Micro Finance	Implemented Community-based group Development Plans, CVPs, and others implemented							Records CEAs / networks / groups; Progress reports; Score card exercises	half yearly	DTs/LUs/PCU	Rural finance taking off as planned. Payment for services happens.
	Rate			85		75	88.2				
	Community Extension Agents being effective							Records CEAs / networks / groups; Progress reports; Score card exercises	half yearly	DTs/LUs/PCU	
	Rate			75	70	70	93.3				
Output Organisation, Management and Social Skills of CDCs, groups, networks enhanced.	Community Capability Index (CCI) value							CCI surveys; Progress reports; Studies	half yearly	DTs/LUs/PCU	CEAs/networks active in service provision.
	Rate			85		78	91.8				
Output Business promoted through access to Rural Finance	People with access to rural financial services							M&E Rural Finance Data; Progress reports	half yearly	DTs/LUs/PCU	Relevant credit products developed.
	People			10 000	1 475	11 399	114				
	Community extension agents trained										

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of Verification			Assumptions
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2019)	Cumulative Result (2019)	Cumulative Result % (2019)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility	
	People	0		2 500	523	3 479	139.2				

Sudan

Butana Integrated Rural Development Project

Supervision Report

Appendix 1: Financial: actual financial performance; by financier by component and disbursements by category

Mission Dates: 20 July - 14 August 2019
Document Date 08/10/2019
Project No. 1100001332
Report No. 5156-SD

Near East, North Africa and Europe Division
Programme Management Department

Appendix 1: Financial: Actual financial performance by financier; by component and disbursements by category

Table 1A: Financial performance by financier as at 31 July 2019

a) under original loan:

Financier	Appraisal (USD '000)	Disbursements (USD '000)	Under Process (USD'000)	% disbursed	Expected Disbursement %
IFAD Loan	24 799	23 828	472	96%	98%
Federal Government	7 233	4 407	0	61%	61%
State Government	2 856	193	0	7%	7%
Beneficiaries Contribution	1 666	436	0	26%	26%
Total	36 555	28 864	472	79%	80%

b) under additional financing

Financier	Appraisal (USD '000)	Disbursements (USD '000)	Under Process (USD'000)	% disbursed	Expected Disbursement %
IFAD Grant	10 313	6 491	1 557	63%	78%
ASAP Grant	3 009	3 006	0	100%	100%
Government	2 172	510	0	23%	23%
Communities	977	13	0	1%	1%
Total	16 471	10 020	1 557	61%	70%

Table 1B: Financial performance by financier by component as at 31 July 2019 (USD '000)

a) under original loan:

Component	IFAD Loan			Federal Government			State Government			Beneficiaries			Total		
	Appraisal	Actual	%	Appraisal	Actual	%	Appraisal	Actual	%	Appraisal	Actual	%	Appraisal	Actual	%
1. Policy and Institutional Support	6 218	8 193	132%	3 134	3 344	107%	2 226	31	1%		57	n.a	11 578	11 625	100%
2. Natural Resource Development	11 744	11 246	96%	2 939	438	15%	0	28	n.a	300	99	33%	14 983	11 811	79%
3. Animal Resource Development	3 557	1 895	53%	1 148	106	9%	630	88	14%		29	n.a	5 335	2 119	40%
4. Community development and Business Options	3 280	2 966	90%	12	519	4316%	0	46	n.a	1 366	251	18%	4 658	3 782	81%
Total	24 799	24 300	98%	7 233	4 407	61%	2 856	193	7%	1 666	436	26%	36 554	29 336	80%

b) under additional financing

Component	IFAD Grant			ASAP Grant			Government			Communities			Total		
	Appraisal	Actual	%	Appraisal	Actual	%	Appraisal	Actual	%	Appraisal	Actual	%	Appraisal	Actual	%
1. Policy and Institutional Building	740	662	89%	580	580	100%	123	0	0%	0	0	n.a	1 443	1 242	86%
2. Natural Resources Management	4 808	3 575	74%	2 429	2 426	100%	1 215	13	1%	945	9	1%	9 397	6 023	64%
3. Livestock and Marketing development	215	171	79%	0	0	n.a	25	9	36%	32	0	0%	272	180	66%
4. Community development and Business Options	1 836	1 392	76%	0	0	n.a	310	2	1%	0	2	n.a	2 146	1 396	65%
5. Project Management	2 714	2 248	83%	0	0	n.a	499	487	98%	0	2	n.a	3 213	2 738	85%
Total	10 313	8 048	78%	3 009	3 006	100%	2 172	510	23%	977	13	1%	16 471	11 577	70%

Table 1C: IFAD, ASAP (SDR, as at 31-07-2019) and Italian Grant (USD, as at 31-07-2019) disbursements

IFAD Loan 1000002751 (SDR, as at 31/07/2019)

Category Description	Current Allocation	Disbursement	Disbursement as per SOF	WA Under review by IFAD	WA under preparation	Current Disbursement
Civil Works	5 440 000	6 427 130	118%	0	0	118%
Vehicles, Equipments and Machinery	1 820 000	1 907 363	105%	141 585	40 783	115%
Technical Assistance, training and inputs	5 650 000	4 057 606	72%	165 830	30 631	75%
Grants	1 320 000	740 631	56%	0	0	56%
Salaries and allowance	1 420 000	1 428 683	101%	0	0	101%
Operation and maintenance	1 150 000	1 213 686	106%	0	0	106%
Authorized Allocation	0	372 159	N/A	0	-35 707	N/A
Unallocated	0	0	N/A	0	0	N/A
Total	16 800 000	16 147 258	96%	307 414	35 707	98%

ASAP Grant 2000001633 (SDR, as at 31/07/2019)

Category Description	Current Allocation	Disbursement	Disbursement as per SOF	WA Under review by IFAD	WA under preparation	Current Disbursement
Works	1 341 000	1 751 801	131%	214 123	0	147%
Consultancies	360 000	95 583	27%	0	0	27%
Equipments and Materials	234 000	76 977	33%	0	0	33%
Authorized Allocation	0	222 890	N/A	-214 123	0	N/A
Unallocated	215 000	0	0%	0	0	0%
Total	2 150 000	2 147 251	100%	0	0	100%

IFAD Grant 2000001634 (SDR, as at 31/07/2019)

Category Description	Current Allocation	Disbursement	Disbursement as per SOF	WA Under review by IFAD	WA under preparation	Current Disbursement
Works	1 818 000	1 546 560	85%	514 483	88 209	118%
Consultancies	1 836 000	1 093 790	60%	103 537	44 183	68%
Equipments and Materials	1 386 000	793 571	57%	262 248	68 827	81%
Grants and subsidies	162 000	13 617	8%	1 551	1 009	10%
Salaries and allowance	1 431 000	969 468	68%	208 169	42 379	85%
Authorized Allocation	0	1 669 798	N/A	-272 497	-122 303	N/A
Unallocated	737 000	0	0%	0	0	0%
Total	7 370 000	6 086 805	83%	817 492	122 303	95%

ITALIAN Grant 200000146200 (USD, as at 31/07/2019)

Category Description	Current Allocation	Disbursement	Disbursement as per SOF	WA Under review by IFAD	WA under preparation	Current Disbursement
WORKS	245 000	110 909	45%	0	181 781	119%
CONSULTANCIES	40 245	6 433	16%	0	6 958	33%
GOODS, SERVICES AND INPUTS	75 000	18 572	25%	0	42 050	81%
TRAINING	21 000	10 120	48%	0	1 739	56%
ADVANCE ACCOUNT 2	0	233 157	N/A	0	-232 528	N/A
Total	381 245	379 190	99%	0	0	99%

Sudan

Butana Integrated Rural Development Project Supervision Report

Appendix 2: Physical progress measured against AWP&B

Mission Dates: 20 July - 14 August 2019
Document Date 08/10/2019
Project No. 1100001332
Report No. 5156-SD

Near East, North Africa and Europe Division
Programme Management Department

Appendix 2: Physical progress measured against AWPB 2019 – period January – June 2019

Com	Code	Activity by Category	Unit	Year Jan-June 2019		%	Remarks
				Plan	Achieved		
Component 1.: Policy and Institutional Building							
1	a.	Development of NR Governance Framework					
	1.a.3a.1	Services of National Policy Expert	Person/Day	60	50	83%	
	1.a.3a.2	Camlet Resilience Consultant	Person/Day	25	-	0%	
	1.a.3a.3	Services of Legal Assistant for National Policy Expert	Lump sum	2	2	100%	
	1.a.3a.4	Editing and Translating NRGF	Lump sum	1	-	0%	
	1.a.3a.5	Printing of the NRGF (Arabic and English version)	Lump sum	2	-	0%	
	1.a.3a.5	Documentation Process for NRGF	Workshop	10	5	50%	
	1.a.3a.6	Validation & Consultation Workshop	Workshop	1	1	100%	
	1.a.3a.7	Study of land tenure, Ownership and access rights	Study	1	1	100%	
	1.a.3a.8	Study of Mapping on NRs including water land use mapping	Study	1	1	100%	
	1.a.3a.9	Study on impact of gold mining	Study	1	1	100%	
	1.a.3a.10	Updating of the Ecological Zone study	Study	1	1	100%	
	1.a.3a.11	NRM Forums at community level /workshop on conflict reservation	Forum/Workshop	-	-	-	
	1.a.3a.12	Orientation workshop on Forest & Rangelands Laws	Workshop	3	3	100%	
	1.a.3a.13	Workshop for voluntary forest guards	Workshop	2	-	0%	
	1.a.3a.14	Federal and Interstate Forum for NRM	Forum	1	-	0%	
	b.	Institutional Capacity Building					
	1.b.3a.1	Training for DTs and YPs on using of SROI method	Training	1	-	0	
	1.b.3a.2	Refresh training for DTs, YPs and Locality staff on GALS methodology	Training	5	5	100%	
	1.b.3a.3	Training for DTs and YPs on value chain development	Training	-	-	-	
	1.b.3a.4	Review the methodology of preparing the LAPA plan	Review	1	1	100%	
	1.b.3a.5	Training on Evaluating and Managing for Sustainable Development Impact (External)	Training	-	-	-	
	1.b.3a.6	LR on Development of animal health and production (External)	LR/Study-tour	-	-	-	
	1.b.3a.7	Training in executive management and project sustainability (External)	Training	-	-	-	
	1.b.3a.8	Training on time Management and maintenance of vehicles and operations (External)	Training	-	-	-	
	1.b.3a.9	LR/Study-tour on sustainable development (External)	LR/Study-tour	1	1	100%	
	1.b.3a.10	Training programme on Financial Management + Other development team (External)	Lump sum	-	-	-	
	1.b.3a.11	Other training, exposure, workshops and learning route	Lump sum	1	-	-	
	1.b.3a.12	Service provider to follow the YPs field work (National Service Coordinator)	Lump sum	-	-	-	
	1.b.3a.13	Plan & Execution of 10 Events for 60 Technicians - ICSP (KM, M&E and Remote	Person	40	40	100%	

Com	Code	Activity by Category	Unit	Year Jan-June 2019		%	Remarks
				Plan	Achieved		
		Sensing training)					
	1.b.3a.14	Plan & Execution of 10 Events for 60 Technicians (Int. transformation leadership and emotional intelligence)	Person	15	-	-	
	1.b.3a.15	Awareness Campaigns at Local Communities (addressing issues related to climate change and carbon sequestration)- ICSP	Campaign	4	-	-	
	1.b.3a.16	Training for Developing Non-wood Products (External training in Procurement)- ICSP	Person	15	-	-	
	1.b.3a.17	Awareness Rising Sessions for State & Local Managers (climate change and carbon sequestration and the lesson learned from ICSPS intervention)- ICSP	Workshop	1	-	-	
	1.b.3a.18	Training Forestry Professionals and Policy Makers (Int. Brazilian Federal Institute addressing Climate change and carbon Trading issues)	Person	15	-	-	
	1.b.3a.19	Young provisional program	YP	95	100	95%	
	c.	Knowledge Management					
	1.c.2.1	Equipment for production of knowledge materials		1	1	100%	
	1.c.3a.1	Production of Knowledge materials (Posters/Leaflets)	Posters/Leaflets	46	47	102%	
	1.c.3a.2	National KM Advisor	Person/Month	1	1	100%	
	1.c.3a.3	Production of Knowledge materials for NRGF (film, etc.)	Lump sum	2	2	100%	
	1.c.3a.4	Consolidation workshop to validate good practices by academia and researchers	Workshop	-	-	-	
	1.c.3a.5	Production of different knowledge films	Film	5	2	40%	
	1.c.3a.6	Documentation and dissemination the experience of community networks	Network	1	-	0%	
	1.c.3a.7	Media programs (Radio and television sessions)	Sessions	55	49	89%	
	1.c.3a.8	Community radio programme	Sessions	18	24	133%	
	1.c.3a.10	Exchange visits for Community-networks	Visit	-	-	-	
	1.c.3a.11	Exchange visits between communities	Visit	13	8	62%	
	1.c.3a.12	Exchange visits for savings and credit groups (outside State)	Visit	1	-	0%	
Component 2.: Climate Resilient Natural Resources Management (range, forest, vegetables, crops, water)							
2	a.	Development of Water Infrastructure					
	2.a.1.1	Hafirs construction (New)	Hafir	9	6	67%	On-going (3)
	2.a.1.2	Hafirs fencing	Hafir	34	32	94%	
	2.a.1.3	Water yards rehabilitation + retention payment & Completion	Water yard	26	20	77%	
	2.a.1.4	Water yards construction and Installation (new)	Water yard	29	29	100%	
	2.a.1.5	Construction of water hand-pumps	Hand-pump	10	10	100%	
	2.a.3a.1	Water structures consultant	Person/Month	3	3	100%	
	2.a.3b.1	Input for improving of Hafirs water (pumping units, tanks, etc.)	Hafir	11	11	100%	
	2.a.3b.2	Inputs and materials for installation of water yards (pumping units, tanks, etc.)	Water yard	11	9	82%	
	b.	Rainwater Harvesting, Range and Forest Management					
	2.b.1.1	Hafirs for supplementary irrigation for women's vegetable farms	Hafirs	-	-	-	
	2.b.3a.1	Establishment of new women home Jubraka	Jubraka	-	-	-	
	2.b.3a.2	Development of exist women home Jubraka	Jubraka	-	-	-	

Com	Code	Activity by Category	Unit	Year Jan-June 2019		%	Remarks
				Plan	Achieved		
	2.b.3a.3	Establishment of communal women's farms	Farm	-	-	-	
	2.b.3a.4	Establishment and development of individual reserves	Feddan	2,750	2,871	104%	
	2.b.3a.5	Establishment and development of community range-reserves	Feddan	1,300	2,032	156%	
	2.b.3a.6	Establishment and development of community forests	Feddan	2,400	1,824	76%	
	2.b.3a.7	Improvement of traditional terraces	Feddan	5,500	4,655	85%	
	2.b.3a.8	Establishment of irrigated forest	Feddan	-	-	-	
	2.b.3a.9	Technical support for range measurements	Report	5	5	100%	
	2.b.3a.10	Technical support for Sand dune fixation	Feddan	400	400	100%	
	2.b.3a.11	Technical support for Establishment of tree-belts (around farms, Hafirs, etc.)	Km	3	5	167%	
	2.b.3a.12	Establishment and development of range-reserves	Reserve	-	-	-	
	2.b.3a.13	Registration of community forests	Feddan	2,700	3,575	132%	
	2.b.3a.14	Capacity building for community networks (workshop)	Workshop	-	-	-	
	2.b.3a.15	Community Forestry Development Workshop	Workshop	3	3	100%	
	2.b.3a.18	Introduction of Fire Lines (ICSP)	KM	-	-	-	
	2.b.3a.19	National Project Manager (ICSP)	Person/Month	9	6	67%	
	2.b.3a.20	M&E Officer (ICSP)	Person/Month	9	6	67%	
	2.b.3a.21	Financial Controller (ICSP)	Person/Month	9	6	67%	
	2.b.3a.22	Procurement Consultant (ICSP)	Person/Month	3	1	33%	
	2.b.3a.23	Project State Coordinator - Gedaref & Gazeera (ICSP)	Person/Month	9	6	67%	
	2.b.3a.24	Financial consultant	Person/Month	9	6	67%	
	2.b.3a.25	ICSPS Interior Auditor	Person/Month	9	6	67%	
	2.b.3a.26	Coordinator assistant Gedaref	Person/Month	9	6	67%	
	2.b.3a.27	Coordinator assistant Gezira	Person/Month	9	6	67%	
	2.b.3a.28	Forests Extensions Gedaref	Person/Month	3	1	33%	
	2.b.3a.29	Forests Extensions Gezira	Person/Month	3	1	33%	
	2.b.3a.30	13 Drivers	Person/Month	3	1	33%	
	2.b.3a.31	Local Accountants (ICSP)	Person/Month	9	6	67%	
	2.b.3a.32	3 Matters	Person/Month	3	1	33%	
	2.b.3a.33	6 Additional Forest Guards - (ICSP)	Person/Month	3	1	33%	
	2.b.3b.1	Inputs for development of irrigation systems for existing women farms (Solar units and/or Others)	Unit	26	24	92%	
	2.b.3b.2	Inputs for development of drinking water facilities (Solar units and/or Others)	Unit	12	10	83%	
	2.b.3b.3	Inputs for Establishment of communal women's farms	Farm	34	34	100%	
	2.b.3b.4	Inputs fodder and vegetable seeds	Kg	2,850	3,201	112%	
	2.b.3b.5	Inputs for range and forest development (natural trees seeds)	Kg	10,800	10,800	100%	
	2.b.3b.6	Farm Tractors (ICSP)	Tractor	1	1	100%	
	2.b.3b.7	Farm Tractor Accessories for SCUs (Water harvesting activates)	Accessories	1	1	100%	
	c.	Crossings and Rural Roads (Final Completion of the Roads)					

Com	Code	Activity by Category	Unit	Year Jan-June 2019		%	Remarks
				Plan	Achieved		
	2.c.1.1	Construction of road package #1(earthworks +erosion work +structures) Incurred from last year	Package 1	1	-		
	2.c.1.2	Construction of road embankments package #2((earthworks +erosion work + structures) Incurred from last year	Package 2	1	-		
	2.c.1.3	Construction of road embankments package #3(earthworks +erosion work structures) Incurred from last year	Package 3	1	-		
	2.c.1.4	Construction of road embankments package #4 (earthworks + erosion work + structures) Incurred from last year	Package 4	2	-		
	2.c.1.5	Construction of road embankments package #5 (earthworks + erosion work + structures) Incurred from last year	Package 5	2	-		
	2.c.1.6	Construction of road embankments package #6 (earthworks + erosion work + structures) Incurred from last year	Package 6	2	-		
Component 3: Livestock and Marketing Development							
		Operation of Livestock Markets and Other Infrastructure					
	3.a.1.1	Construction/Rehabilitation of primary livestock markets	P. Market	1	1	100%	
	3.a.1.2	Completion / Rehabilitation of primary Slaughterhouse/Slaps	Slaughterhouse/Slaps	2	1	50%	
	3.a.3a.1	Collection and dissemination of market information	Report	15	15	100%	
	3.a.3a.2	Evaluation of existing secondary and primary livestock markets	Assessment	-	-	-	
	3.a.3a.3	Training in the management and operation of primary slaughterhouses	Course	1	-	0%	
3	b	Animal Husbandry and Management					
	3.b.3a.1	Updating of livestock survey	Survey	5	5	100%	
	3.b.3a.2	Inventory and mapping of animal nutrition resources	Study	3	3	100%	
	3.b.3a.3	Prepare /development of seasonality calendar of animal feeding resources	Calendar	5	5	100%	
	3.b.3a.4	Mapping of animal diseases using GIS – (including nomads)	Map	2	1	50%	
	3.b.3a.5	Support Community mobilization on poultry, animal feeding, botulism, internal external parasite & vaccination)	Community	184	232	126%	
	3.b.3a.6	Livestock forums	Forum	-	-	-	
	3.b.3a.7	Communities mobilization to towards livestock vaccination campaigns	Community	-	-	-	
	3.b.3a.8	Improve animal nutrition (dissemination of animal supplementary feeding)	Community	55	62	113%	
	3.b.3a.9	Communities' mobilization to prevent Abu Regaba disease	Community	-	-	-	
	3.b.3a.10	Improvement of coarse animal feeds	Community	-	-	-	
	3.b.3a.11	Improvement of Nubian goat breeds by selection	No.	12	12	100%	
	3.b.3a.12	Meetings of livestock activities coordination team	Meeting	2	1	50%	
	3.b.3a.13	Assess the results of Shamy and Nubian goats	Assessment	2	2	100%	
	3.b.3a.14	Activation of veterinary services centres (Managed by CAHWs)	Centre	17	17	100%	
Component 4.: Community Development, Business Options and Rural Micro Finance							
4	a.	Community Development Committees, Interest Groups and Networks					
	4.a.1.1	Construction and completion of community development centers	Center	5	4	80%	

Com	Code	Activity by Category	Unit	Year Jan-June 2019		%	Remarks
				Plan	Achieved		
	4.a.1.2	Construction of development service center	Centre	1	1	100%	
	4.a.3a.1	Review the composition of interested groups and prepare the resilience plan	Community	349	288	83%	
	4.a.3a.2	Re-registration of existing CBOs	Community	58	43	74%	
	4.a.3a.3	Registration of new CBOs	Community	98	30	31%	
	4.a.3a.4	Follow-up implementation of CDCs meetings	CDC	349	312	89%	
	4.a.3a.5	Assess the effectiveness of the CDCs	CDC	5	5	100%	
	4.a.3a.6	Assessment of CAHWs	Report	2	2	100%	
	4.a.3a.7	Community training on operating and management of solar units	Course	11	2	18%	
	4.a.3a.8	Village health program in collaboration with State Ministry of Health.	Village	-	-	-	
	4.a.3a.9	Training of communities on planning and management skills	CDC	100	95	95%	
	4.a.3a.10	Training of teachers in adult education and nutrition (ToT)	Course	1	1	100%	
	4.a.3a.11	Adult education programme	Class	65	54	83%	
	4.a.3a.12	Training on nutrition, maternity and child health	Class	43	38	88%	
	4.a.3a.13	Training of community on first aid and home nursing	Class	40	40	100%	
	4.a.3a.14	Training procurement committees	Community	19	21	111%	
	4.a.3a.15	Training of community on cutting, drying and storage of fodder (hay making)	Community	31	-	0%	
	4.a.3a.16	Community training on primary market information systems	Course	-	-	-	
	4.a.3a.17	Gender sensitization sessions	Sessions	173	139	80%	
	4.a.3a.18	Training of water committees in operation and management of water sources	Community	105	102	97%	
	4.a.3a.19	Training of communities on GALS	Group	100	-	0%	
	4.a.3a.20	Follow-up and evaluation of existing youth groups to manage natural resources	Group	14	14	100%	
	4.a.3a.21	Start-up communities networking workshop	Workshop	-	-	-	
	4.a.3a.22	Training of community-network (different skills)	Network	11	3	27%	
	4.a.3a.23	Training of women on vegetable and fodder farming	Community	66	77	117%	
	4.a.3a.24	Training communities on milk processing	Community	22	22	100%	
	4.a.3a.25	Training community on protective measures to control internal and external parasites of animals	Community	90	74	82%	
	4.a.3a.26	Awareness Training & Cap. Building in Agro forestry (Int. training in Procurement) (ICSP)	Person	12	-	NA	
	4.a.3a.27	Support to Farmers for Irrigated Plantations (Inputs for HHs: Crops seeds and fruit seedling) (ICSP)	Unit	1	-	NA	
	4.a.3a.28	Improved Stoves Distribution (ICSP)	Unit	5,724	-	NA	
	4.a.3a.29	Preparation & Dissemination of Measures for Improved Stoves Use (ICSP)	Person	30	-	NA	
	4.a.3a.30	Incentives for Use of Impr. Stoves, Tree Plantation & Forest Conservation (ICSP)	Unit	1	-	NA	
	4.a.3b.1	Input and materials for community training on protective measures to control internal and external parasites of animals	Lump sum	-	-	-	
	4.a.3b.2	Inputs and materials for adult education classes	Lump sum	-	-	-	
	4.a.3b.3	Inputs and materials for nutrition and mother and child health	Lump sum	-	-	-	

Com	Code	Activity by Category	Unit	Year Jan-June 2019		%	Remarks
				Plan	Achieved		
	4.a.3b.4	Inputs and training materials for first aid and home nursing	Lump sum	-	-	-	
	4.a.3b.5	Materials for furnishing network development center (Extension Service Centre)	Lump sum	-	-	-	
	4.a.3b.6	Input / furnishing of community development centers	Center	-	-	-	
4	b.	Business Options through Microfinance					
	4.b.1.1	Construction of office/Rest-house (Supporting new ABSUMI units)	Office/Rest-house	1	-		
	4.b.3a.1	Formation, activation and follow up of savings and lending groups	Group	269	547	203	
	4.b.3a.2	Training community trainers (TOT) on the formation of savings and credit groups	Course	10	10	100	
	4.b.3a.3	Training of communities saving and credit groups	Group	161	119	73	
	4.b.3a.4	Training on Methodology of Microfinance techniques of Scaling-up	Course	-	-		
	4.b.3a.5	Refresh training on Microfinance (ToT)	Course	-	-		
	4.b.3a.6	Vocational skills for youth group	Course	3	4	133%	
	4.b.3a.7	Community training on local poultry production	Community	85	58	68%	
	4.b.3a.8	Communities training on water harvesting techniques	Course	30	28	93%	
	4.b.3a.9	Training on techniques for establishing home nurseries and producing of seedlings	Community	40	34	85%	
	4.b.3a.10	Training communities on production and use of organic fertilizers	Course	10	10	100%	
	4.b.3a.11	Train trainers on value chains for livestock	Course	-	-	-	
	4.b.3a.12	Capacity building of communities in small enterprises and marketing	Community	-	-	-	
	4.b.3a.13	Training community on cost and benefit analysis	Community	21	15	71%	
	4.b.3a.14	Consultancies and technical support (Italian Grant)	Person/Month	1	1	100%	
	4.b.3a.15	National consultant for Microfinance	Sum	2	2	100%	
	4.b.3a.16	International consultant for Microfinance	Sum	1	1	100%	
	4.b.3a.17	Exposure trips training and technical assistance (Support ABSUMI units)	Sum	-	-	-	
	4.b.3a.18	MIS license and installation (Support ABSUMI units)	Sum	-	-	-	
	4.b.3b.1	Inputs for training on local poultry production	Sum	60	58	97%	
	4.b.3b.2	Inputs for training on local poultry production	Sum	-	-	-	
	4.b.3b.3	Inputs for training women on the production of vegetables and fruit /individual Jubraka	Jubraka	-	-	-	
	4.b.3b.4	Equipment for supporting microfinance service centers	Lump sum	2	2	100%	
	4.b.3b.5	Furniture and office equipment (Support existing ABSUMI unit)	Lump sum	-	-	-	
	4.b.4.1	Support to microfinance Apex	Sum	-	-		
4	c.	Community Extension Agents and Net works					
	4.c.3a.1	Basic training of Community Animal Health Workers (CAHWs)/Paravet	Course	2	2	100%	
	4.c.3a.1	Refreshment training for Community Animal Health Workers (CAHWs)/Paravet	Course	-	-	-	
	4.c.3a.2	Training of voluntary forest guards	Course	3	3	100%	
	4.c.3a.3	Basic training on integrated pest management (IPM)	Course	2	1	50%	
	4.c.3a.4	Training of extension agents on facilitation skills	Course	-	-	-	
	4.c.3a.5	Training on midwifery	Midwives	5	5	100%	

Com	Code	Activity by Category	Unit	Year Jan-June 2019		%	Remarks
				Plan	Achieved		
	4.c.3a.6	Follow-up and evaluation of existing youth groups to manage natural resources	Group	1	1	100%	
	4.c.3a.7	Formation and financing initiatives of youth groups	Group	16	17	106%	
Component 5: Project Management							
5	a.	SCU Management & Operation					
	5.a.1.1	Construction and rehabilitation of offices and other facilities	Offices/facility	4	4	100%	
	5.a.1.2	Works for BDF	Lump sum	-	-	-	
	5.a.2.1	Vehicles replacement (PMU, SCUs and support for ABSUMI units)	Vehicle	18	18	100%	
	5.a.2.2	Farm Tractors and attachments (including one tractor and attachment for ISCP)	Tractor	7	7	100%	
	5.a.3a.1	Civil Engineer/Hydrologist cum water engineer	Person/Month	90	60	67%	
	5.a.3a.2	Project Legal adviser	Person/Month	9	6	67%	
	5.a.3a.3	Ministerial Technical Committee	Lump sum	6	5	83%	
	5.a.3a.4	Central Steering Committee	Lump sum	2	2	100%	
	5.a.3a.5	Advisory Services for BDF	Lump sum	1	1	100%	
	5.a.3a.6	BDF Meetings	Lump sum	2	-	0%	
	5.a.3a.7	Linking BDF – Localities	Lump sum	2	-	0%	
	5.a.3a.8	CCU Annual Services (Contracts for 2018 & 2019)	Lump sum	1	1	100%	
	5.a.3a.9	Annual audit	Lump sum	1	1	100%	
	5.a.3a.10	Annual supervision for the financial system	Lump sum	3	2	67%	
	5.a.3a.11	Impact assessment of project activities and interventions	Assessment	1	-	0%	
	5.a.3a.13	Team leader Civil Engineer	Person/Month	8	6	75%	
	5.a.3a.14	Road Engineer (technical assistance for completion of crossings and rural roads).	Person/Month	8	6	75%	
	5.a.3a.15	Survey Engineer (technical assistance for completion of crossings and rural roads).	Person/Month	8	6	75%	
	5.a.3a.16	Materials Engineer (technical assistance for completion of crossings and rural roads).	Person/Month	8	6	75%	
	5.a.3a.17	Lab technician (to support in completion of crossings and rural roads)	Person/Month	8	6	75%	
	5.a.3a.18	Motor-grader specialist/driver (to support in completion of crossings and rural roads)	Person/Month	8	6	75%	
	5.a.3b.1	Inputs of office equipment (toners for printers, photocopier...etc.)	Lump sum	9	6	67%	
	5.a.3b.2	Inputs of clothing for Staff uniforms (drivers, grades ... etc.)	Lump sum	6	6	100%	
	5.a.3b.3	kitchen utensils	Lump sum	7	7	100%	
	5.a.3b.4	Tools, equipment and materials for office cleaning	Lump sum	14	12	86%	
	5.a.3b.5	Office furniture and electrical equipment (Fans, Air-conditioner, etc.)	Lump sum	4	3	75%	
	5.a.3b.6	Computers, accessories, printers, photocopier, etc.	Lump sum	7	7	100%	
	5.a.5.1	Remuneration for BIRDP PMU technical and support Staff (a), (b)	Person/Month	12	6	50%	
	5.a.5.2	Remuneration for BDF Team	Person/Month	8	-	0%	
	5.a.5.3	Remuneration for BDF Subject matter Officers	Person/Month	6	-	0%	

Com	Code	Activity by Category	Unit	Year Jan-June 2019		%	Remarks
				Plan	Achieved		
	5.a.5.4	DSA BDF Team	Person/Month	6	-	0%	
	5.a.5.5	DSA and field days allowance for BIRDP PMU & BDF technical and support Staff	Person/Month	9	6	67%	
	5.a.5.6	Phone and Communication allowance for BIRDP PMU technical support Staff	Person/Month	9	6	67%	
	5.a.5.7	Health allowance for BIRDP PMU technical support Staff	Person/Month	1	-	0%	
	5.a.5.8	Social insurance for BIRDP PMU technical support Staff	Person/Month	9	6	67%	
	5.a.5.9	Annual leave allowances for BIRDP PMU technical support Staff	Person/Month	9	-	0%	
	5.a.5.10	Benefits of after service BIRDP PMU technical & support Staff (arrears)	Person/Month	3	6	200%	
	5.a.5.11	Annual vacation allowance	Lump sum	9	-	0%	
	5.a.5a.1	Topping for state coordination staff	Person/Month	60	30	50%	
	5.a.5a.2	DSA and field days for state coordination staff	Person/Month	60	30	50%	
	5.a.5b.1	Banking Services	Lump sum	48	24	50%	
	5.a.5b.2	Office cleaning services	Lump sum	48	24	50%	
	5.a.5b.3	Maintenance of office equipment	Lump sum	41	20	49%	
	5.a.5b.4	Gas filling services	Lump sum	48	24	50%	
	5.a.5b.5	Hospitality and visitor services	Lump sum	48	24	50%	
	5.a.5b.6	Major and light maintenance for vehicles and heavy machineries	Lump sum	23	20	87%	
	5.a.5b.7	Internet services	Lump sum	48	24	50%	
	5.a.5b.8	Stationery and office small tools	Lump sum	8	6	75%	
	5.a.5b.9	Vehicles & Generator fuel	Lump sum	13	8	62%	
	5.a.5b.10	Replace vehicles batteries	Lump sum	14	7	50%	
	5.a.5b.11	Vehicles oils and air filters	Lump sum	13	7	54%	
	5.a.5b.12	Vehicles Insurance	Lump sum	25	25	100%	
	5.a.5b.13	Vehicles License	Lump sum	1	1	100%	
	5.a.5b.14	Replacement of vehicles and heavy equipment tires	Lump sum	17	9	53%	
	5.a.5b.15	Vehicles tire maintenance services	Lump sum	21	12	57%	
	5.a.5b.16	Electricity and water service (office + R, H)	Month	60	30	50%	
	5.a.5b.17	Vehicles seats cover and accessories	Lump sum	5	-	0%	
	5.a.5b.18	Transportation, handling and advertising services	Lump sum	13	6	46%	
	5.a.5b.19	Annual meetings of PMU and SCUs	Meeting	13	8	62%	
	5.a.5b.20	Rents of hotels /rest-house for missions, visitors and housing for staff	Month	31	15	48%	
	5.a.5b.21	Supervision missions	Lump sum	2	2	100%	

Sudan

Butana Integrated Rural Development Project Supervision Report

Appendix 3: Compliance with legal covenants: status of implementation

Mission Dates: 20 July - 14 August 2019
Document Date 08/10/2019
Project No. 1100001332
Report No. 5156-SD

Near East, North Africa and Europe Division
Programme Management Department

Appendix 3: Compliance with legal covenants: status of implementation

Section	Covenant	Target/Action Due Date	Compliance Status/Date	Remarks
Section 3.03-a	Lead Project Agency (LPA) shall open and maintain a Project Account.	Before project inception	Complied with	- Project Account opened before loan effectiveness and the same accounts are being used for the Grant financing proceeds
Section 3.05-b	The Borrower shall deposit counterpart funds in an Initial amount of Euro 240,000 and shall replenish BDA project account quarterly in advance to fund AWPB.	Before project inception/continued	Partially complied with	- GoS transferred the initial amount to the project account at project inception. However, replenishment is not happening on quarterly basis, as it should happen. - Moreover, delays in transferring counterpart funds has in many instances caused pre-financing of Government commitments from foreign financing proceeds. - The erstwhile BDA (Butana Development Agency) has been abolished and the new Butana Development Fund (BDF) established.
Section 3.06 – Loan/Section 7.05 – Grant	The LPA and each other project party shall procure all items financed by the loan in accordance with schedule-4 of the Loan agreement and section 7.05 of the Grant agreement.	Immediately/continued	Partially complied with	- The Project procurement practices have improved overtime and are becoming more in line with the provisions of FAs prescribed procurement method. Yet, considerable number of cases of deviation in procedures remained.
Schedule-3A, 4	The Borrower shall ensure that all vehicles procured under the project are insured and used for project implementation	Immediately/continued	Complied with	- All projects vehicles are fully insured.
Section 5.02-b - Loan/Section 9.03 Grant	The Borrower/Recipient shall have the financial statements (FS) relating to the project audited each fiscal year and shall submit certified audit reports to the Fund no later than 6 months after year end	Annually	Complied with	- Audit reports submitted to IFAD annually, in compliance with IFAD deadline.
Section 4.02 – Loan/Section 9.04 (a) – Grant	The Borrower through the LPA shall submit to the Fund semi-annual and consolidated annual progress reports	Annually	Partially complied with	- Interim (semi-annual) FS are submitted to IFAD but with some delays.
Section 3.02-b – Loan/Section 7.01 (b) - Grant	Draft AWPB to be submitted to the Fund for its comments and approval not later than 60 days before the beginning of the relevant project year		Not fully complied with	- Submission AWPB 2019 submitted in time.

Section	Covenant	Target/Action Due Date	Compliance Status/Date	Remarks
Section 4.03 – Loan/Section 8.03 (b) – Grant Schedule-3. B. 1.1 – Loan/Section E.1 (b) – Grant Section E.1 (a) - Grant	A mid-term review to be carried jointly by the borrower and the Fund during the fourth project year Project Implementation Manual to be prepared not later than 90 days after the effective date	4 th anniversary of the project 90 days after project effectiveness	Complied with Not fully complied with	- A mid-term review was done jointly by IFAD and GoS in September 2012 - BIRDP never managed to draft a well-developed PIM. - At least Financial Management is covered properly in the PIM
Section E.1 (c) - Grant	Configuration of account system to include additional financing Recruitment for the vacant post of finance controller	Before disbursement of additional financing Before disbursement of additional financing	Complied with	- The Project accounting system has been configured, tested and was produced from the system - Up to three times, a project finance controller was recruited but left within a short period. Ultimately, the existing accountant was promoted to the position of FC and assistant accountant to accountant and a new assistant accountant appointed.
Section E.1 (d) - Grant	Receipt of a report from the Government on satisfactory details pertaining to strengthening the Butana Development Agency (BDA)	Before disbursement of additional financing	Complied with	- Current FC has not the right qualifications however - The Government has abolished the BDA and established the Butana Development Fund (BDF). The BDF director general is in place and core office staff is now recruited. GoS and BIRDP budgets have allocated for FY 2019.