

Socialist Republic of Viet Nam

Adaptation to Climate Change in the Mekong Delta (AMD) Project in Ben Tre and Tra Vinh

Supervision report 2016

Main report and appendices

Mission Dates: 14-March-2-April-2016
Document Date: 4-April-2016
Project No. 110001664
Report No: 4054-VN

Asia and the Pacific Division
Programme Management Department

Table of Contents

Abbreviations and acronyms	ii
A. Introduction	1
B. Overall assessment of AMD implementation	2
C. Outputs and outcomes	3
D. AMD implementation progress	13
E. Fiduciary aspects	17
F. Sustainability	19
G. Other	21
H. Conclusion	21

Appendices

Appendix 1: Summary of project status and ratings	23
Appendix 2: Updated logical framework: Progress against objectives, outcomes and outputs	25
Appendix 3: Summary of follow-up in key agreed actions	37
Appendix 4: Physical progress measured against AWP&B, including RIMS indicators	49
Appendix 5: Financial: Actual financial performance by financier; by component and disbursements by category	73
Appendix 6: Compliance with legal covenants: Status of implementation	79
Appendix 7: Knowledge management: Learning and Innovation	83

Abbreviations and acronyms

ABAC	Agri-business Advocacy Committee
AMD	Adaptation to Climate in the Mekong Delta (project)
AWPB	annual work plan and budget
BMO	Business Membership Organisation
CA	Cooperative Alliance
CBDRM	community based disaster risk mitigation
CCA	Climate Change Adaptation (models in both provinces, fund in Tra Vinh)
CFAF	Co-Financing for Adaptation Fund
CIF	Commune Investment Fund
CIG	common interest group
CPC	Commune People's Committee
CSA	Climate smart agriculture
DARD	Department of Agriculture and Rural Development
DA	Designated Account
DoNRE	Department of Natural Resource and Environment
DPC	District People's Committee
DPI	Department of Planning and Investment
FMM	Financial Management Manual
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
DPPR	Decentralized Project for Poverty Reduction
GoV	Government of Viet Nam
IFAD	International Fund for Agriculture Development
MARD	Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MIS	Management Information System
MTR	Mid-term Review
MFI	Micro Finance Institution
Mo-SEDP	Market-Orientated Socio-Economic Development Planning
NGO	Non-Government Organization
NTP-NRD	National Target Programme on the New Rural Development
ODA	Official Development Assistance
PCF	People's Credit Fund
PCU	Project Coordination Unit
PIM	Project Implementation Manual
PPC	Provincial People's Committee
PPP	Public – Private Partnership
PSC	Project Steering Committee
WDSF	Pro-Women Development Fund
RFS	Rural Finance Specialist
RIMS	IFAD Results and Impact Management System
SBV	State Bank of Viet Nam
SCG	Savings and Credit Groups
SOE	Statements of Expenditure
SRDP	Project: Sustainable Rural Development for the Poor
TAG	Thematic Ad Hoc Group
ToR	Terms of Reference
ToT	Training of trainers
VBARD	Viet Nam Bank for Agriculture and Rural Development
VC	Value Chain
VCFU	Value Chain Facilitation Unit
FU	Farmers' Union
VMB	Village Management Board
VND	Vietnamese Dong
WDSF/WDF/WSF	Women's Development / Support Fund
WU	Women's Union

A. Introduction¹

1. The financing agreement for the Adaptation to Climate Change in the Mekong Delta (AMD) project in Tra Vinh and Ben Tre provinces was signed on 28 March 2014. The project is due to be completed on 31 March 2020². The Project Development Goal is to achieve *sustainable livelihoods for the rural poor in a changing environment*, and the more specific project objective is to *strengthen the adaptive capacity of target communities and institutions to better contend with climate change*. The total programme cost for the two provinces is USD 49.4 million, of which the IFAD loan is USD 22 million; ASAP co-financing grant USD 12 million; Government of Vietnam contribution USD 7.6 million; and beneficiary contribution USD 7.8 million. Project activities in Ben Tre cover 30 communes in 8 districts, and in Tra Vinh 30 communes in 7 districts.
2. The second IFAD Supervision Mission of AMD was undertaken in partnership with the Tra Vinh (TV) and Ben Tre (BT) Provincial Project Coordination Units (PCUs) during 14 March - 2 April 2016, the whole duration of which was spent at the field. The mission objectives were to: (i) review project performance during 2015-2016 and assess quality of initial outcomes; (ii) follow-up with the agreed actions by supervision mission 2015; (iii) support project management and technical staff in any questions that are pertinent, and (iv) to ensure project's appropriate direction, agree with the provincial authorities and the PCU on key actions prior to MTR 2017, in view of the project design development objectives and sustainability.
3. In Tra Vinh and Ben Tre, the Supervision Mission met with staff of PCU and partner agencies including Coordination Office for National Programme on Climate Change under the Department of Natural Resources & Environment (DONRE), Department of Agriculture and Rural Development (DARD), Department of Planning and Investment (DPI), Women's Union (WU), TV CIDA SME Development Project and BT Coconut Association. The mission visited 8 communes in Tra Vinh districts of Chau Thanh, Cau Ngang, Cang Long, Tieu Can, Tra Cu and Duyen Hai, and 8 communes in Ben Tre districts of Chau Thanh, Mo Cay Nam, Ba Tri, Thanh Phu and Giong Trom. During these visits, the mission met with Commune project units, District People's Committees and district line agencies, and selected groups of farmers. The mission also met a number of private enterprises that are involved in the project implementation. Key findings were discussed between the mission and the TV and BT PCUs on 23 March and 1 April respectively. A final wrap up meeting with representatives' of the BT and TV Province People Committees was held 2 April in BT.
4. The Supervision Mission would like to extend sincere thanks to the Provincial People's Committees (PPC), PCUs, representatives of line agencies, local governments at the district and communal levels, local farmers and private enterprises for the kind support and cooperation.

¹ Mission composition: Mr. Nguyen Ngoc Quang, Team Leader for Tra Vinh and SEDP, CC, and M&E Specialist; Mr. Sauli Hurri, Team Leader for Ben Tre, VCD and PPP specialist; Mr. Nguyen Thanh Tung, IFAD CPO, RMF and Project Management Specialist; Ms. Nguyen Thu Hoai, IFAD Financial Specialist; Mr. Phan Duy Toan, SEDP, Infrastructure and Procurement Specialist. In addition, Mr. Henning Pedersen, IFAD Country Director and Ms. Doan Phuong Lien Interpreter/Translator joined the mission from 29 March-2 April; Ms. Nguyen Yen Hai, MPI-FERD Deputy Director General, Ms. Pham Thuy Anh, Office of Government and Ms. Nong Thi Hong Hanh, MPI, joined commune meetings in both provinces.

² Important dates include:

- Project effectiveness – 28 March 2014
- Project Completion – 31 March 2020
- Loan closing date – 30 October 2020

B. Overall assessment of AMD implementation

5. The current implementation performance or **likelihood of achieving development objectives** of the AMD is ranked as ***moderately satisfactory***. In view of the thorough investment preparations, the **annual implementation progress** is also assessed as ***moderately satisfactory***. The project however now urgently needs to move from preparatory phase to full scale implementation phase. This is required to ensure continued project performance prior to the MTR, and more importantly, in the aftermath of salinity intrusion disaster 2016³ the households of both Ben Tre and Tra Vinh are in dire need of climate change adaptation support. Failing to achieve significant progress in 2016 will result in downward shift in project assessment at the MTR.
6. Progress is noted in the following key aspects: **(i) Manuals and implementation structure finalized:** Formulation and promulgation of the PIM, FMM and implementation guidelines for the various project instruments including climate informed SEDP, CC adaptive research, CIF, CCA, and PPP; **(ii) Climate informed SEDP:** Climate-informed and market-oriented SEDP planning mechanism established and rolled out in 92 communes including 32 non-project communes; **(iii) CCA models identification and selection:** 149 agricultural and non-agricultural Climate Change Adaptation models identified and assessed for adaptation and financial viability; subsequently, 48 agricultural models selected for wide roll-out at household level; **(iv) CCA/CFAP Fund:** selected Climate Change Adaptation models replicated through co-investments with 194 individual households and 25 CIGs; USD 301,000 disbursed as the first part of the investments; **(v) Private Sector Engagement:** PPP introduction workshops organized with participation of potential partner enterprises and other stakeholders; 51 enterprises submitted letters of interest, 20 of which passed the pre-screening by PCUs and the SNV; The first nine PPP co-investment proposals are being developed; Ben Tre has approved the first PPP proposal for implementation; Tra Vinh has assessed six value chains for investment potential; **(vi) Community Investment Fund:** Planned 61 infrastructure schemes in 60 project communes for CIF funding; Ben Tre completed 10 first CIF works and has 20 more in pipeline for 2016; Tra Vinh has 31 works in investment pipeline for 2016; **(vii) Rural Finance:** In both provinces the Women Union Funds have been officially established with IFAD support and the organizations progress satisfactorily towards MFI registration. As of April 2016 the newly established Tra Vinh Fund is servicing 2,490 clients in 384 SCGs, and respectively, the Fund in Ben Tre which has operated somewhat longer has 11,881 clients in 2,702 SCGs.
7. As of 29 February 2016, in **Tra Vinh** the total project accumulated disbursement was USD 1,670 million against the total approved project cost of USD 24.848 million (6,7%). This included a disbursement of USD 1.024 million (9,2%) from the IFAD Loan and USD 0.646 (4,5%) from the IFAD ASAP grant. GoV had met 9.9% of its total commitment for the project period. Project disbursement in 2015 achieved 70% of AWPB. In **Ben Tre** the total disbursement for both loan and grant and by all financiers stood at USD 1,887 million against a total approved project cost of USD 24,660 million (7,7%). This included a disbursement of 9,5% of the approved loan amount of USD 10,930 million by IFAD and 6,8% of the approved IFAD ASAP grant amount of USD 6.002 million. GoV had met 8,8% of its total commitment for the project period. Project disbursement in 2015 achieved 76% of AWPB.
8. To improve the project performance prior to MTR, the following issues and challenges need to be addressed: **(i) Implementation progress:** At this stage, the project has satisfactorily prepared for rolling out the project instruments, however implementation and disbursement processes need to be significantly accelerated during the coming year; **(ii) Counterpart funding and ODA allocations:** The pace of implementation in both provinces have suffered from insufficient level of counterpart funding. In Tra Vinh, additionally, the ODA allocation 2015

³ El Nino draughts 2016 caused severe damage in AMD provinces. Nearly all surface waters are salinated and households lack fresh water for family consumption, crop irrigation and animals. Government and development partners have called for urgent response, and some adjustment in AMD work plan is recommended as described below in Outputs and outcomes.

was delayed until the very end of the year and below the planned amount. The full commitment of both PPCs is required to rectify this matter; (iii) **CCA/CFAF and PPP fund implementation:** Farmers need to develop their own CCA/CFAF plans, and sufficient outreach needs to be ensured. Also, the most efficient models need to be prioritized as per experience from first round. Regarding PPP, the fund implementation is behind schedule and needs urgent acceleration; (iv) **Capacities and delegation within PCU:** Increased delegation of component management is necessary. Additional management capacity and technical assistance is required in the area of climate change adaptation. The SM 2015 requested appointment of a Climate Change Specialized Deputy Project Director, however such has not been appointed; (v) **Decentralization:** The project implementation should be decentralized to line agencies and districts where appropriate, for acceleration, up-scaling and replication of project interventions. The agencies have experience of project implementation however especially in Tra Vinh their capacities are yet to be fully mobilized to implement the AMD.

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date
Implementation progress and decentralization: (i) Significantly accelerate the overall implementation and disbursement progress before the MTR next year; (ii) Review current responsibilities and resource allocation with the aim of increased decentralization of project implementation to CPCs/DPCs and line agencies.	PCU, DPCs, CPCs, line agencies	April 2016 onwards
Counterpart funding and ODA allocations: (i) Required level of counterpart funding to be provided; (ii) Sufficient ODA allocations ensured and PPCs to provide pre-financing of eligible expenditures as required due to delays.	PPCs, PCUs	As of now
CCA and PPP: (i) Review CCA approach following lessons from first round, (ii) accelerate PPP implementation.	PCU	Q2/2016
PCU delegation and capacity: (i) Delegate component management to qualified existing staff; (ii) Appoint qualified Deputy Project Directors to be in charge of climate adaptation; (iii) Senior Technical Advisor to coordinate Value Chains/PPP; (iv) Update IFAD VN on changes by June 2016.	PCU	Q2/2016

C. Outputs and outcomes

Component 1: Building Adaptive Capacity

Overall assessment of the component is rated moderately satisfactory

Sub-Component 1.1: Climate Change Knowledge Enhancement

9. The *sub-component is rated moderately satisfactory*. To improve understanding about climate change impact and potential adaptation strategies for Tra Vinh and Ben Tre, this sub-component introduces three activities: (a) Evidence base for adaptation; (b) Water quality monitoring and reporting; and (c) Knowledge management and dissemination.
10. (a) **Evidence base for adaptation.** Led by PCU, in cooperation with key partners including DARD, DOIT, Tra Vinh University and Ben Tre DOLISA, this output comprises three areas of work as follows. **Identification and replication of existing CCA models:** Since 2014, consultations and field visits are conducted to identify the existing agricultural and non-agricultural models which are cost efficient and adaptive to climate change. As a result, **In Tra Vinh:** 81 agricultural models and 13 non-agricultural models were initially identified. Ten meetings with participation of 841 staff from province, district and commune levels were organised to analyse the identified agricultural models. 28 models were selected and introduced to CCA fund for replication by farmer groups. **In Ben Tre:** 55 models were initially identified. 20 models were selected through 15 review meetings with participation of 508 people. For proper replication of the selected models, 69 trainings courses with 2389 participants (in TV) and 50 training courses with 1817 participants (in BT) on model application were organised at district and commune levels. To date, 18 selected models in TV, and 20 selected models in BT have been replicated in the field through the CCA/CFAF fund (see sub-comp 2.2). **Piloting of new potential CCA models:** In Tra Vinh, since early 2015 DARD

Extension Centre and Tra Vinh University have introduced 20 CCA models that have potential for farm level implementation. In a series of technical workshops and meetings, the models were reviewed and 16 got selected to be piloted with AMD financing. Similarly, in Ben Tre, 37 demonstration models were identified by DARD and PCU. 11 models were selected through a careful review process in terms of climate change adaptation and cost-benefit effectiveness. These models are tested in the field for future replication. **Identification of main themes/topics for climate change adaptive research:** With local agencies and research institutions, AMD helps provinces to research and develop new adaption measures: (i) initiated a Thematic Ad hoc Group (TAG) to coordinate the CCA related research activities, (ii) identified 6 most relevant research themes by support of the international research group Cognitive Edge, and furthermore in TV, (iii) finalized manual for adaptive research implementation; and (iv) called for climate change adaptation research proposals.

11. However against the project targets, the overall implementation progress of this output is still slow, and requires efforts for improvement: (i) The non-agricultural models are not yet properly analysed, and action plan to roll out these models is yet to be developed; (ii) The technical assistance provided by Cognitive Edge was slow resulting in delays of CC adaptive research activities; (iii) In BT the preparation for CC adaptive research is not yet in place; and (iii) In TV the coordination between PCU and line agencies (DARD, DPI, DOIT, DONRE) requires improvement in terms of planning and financial management.

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date
Assess the non-agricultural models proposed by DOIT and other technical agencies. Develop action plan for roll-out of selected non-agricultural models.	PCU, DOIT	April, 2016
For Tra Vinh: Improve the CCA coordination mechanism: (i) organise quarterly meetings between PCU and agencies; (ii) AMD planning and financial staff to support agencies in daily management when requested.	PCU	2016
For Ben Tre: Prepare action plan for timely roll-out of the adaptive research process.	PCU	April, 2016

12. **(b) Water quality monitoring and reporting.** AMD is to develop a salinity monitoring and forecasting system that provides timely water quality information for government agencies, farmers, planners and researchers. With such information, farmers will be able to make better-informed decisions on farm operations and planning. A Technical Assistance team of combined international and national expertise will (i) develop technical specifications for the network of monitoring stations and the data and knowledge platform; (ii) build the capacity of stakeholders to operate and use the system; (iii) support the investment owner in the procurement of the monitoring stations; (iv) carry out a life cycle cost analysis for the system sustainability, (v) propose a cost recovery modality to cover long-term operational costs and (vi) establish possible system start-up investments for the operating agency. With support by IFAD, TOR for the technical assistance has been developed in 2015. It is to be implemented through a joint procurement by the two AMD provinces.
13. As agreed by the two provinces, DONRE Ben Tre was assigned to be the investment owner of the TA contract. A Joint Procurement and Contract Management Committee (JPMC) was established with participation by relevant stakeholders from both provinces and led by DONRE BT. The JPMC is to manage the procurement process and review all deliverables of the TA. Accordingly, an MOU has been developed by DONRE Ben Tre specifying the tasks and responsibilities of each member of the JPMC. The Request for Proposals was sent out in October 2015, and five short-listed candidates were invited to submit their full proposals. The proposals were reviewed and the technical evaluation report with recommendation of TA selection was submitted for IFAD's review 13 March 2016 and no-objection was provided. Given the current severe salinity intrusion in two provinces, the mission is concerned about the slow implementation progress of the output.

14. Procurement of handheld salinity monitoring sensors, **in Ben Tre**: (i) a needs assessment was conducted by DONRE and PCU concerning demand for handheld salinity monitoring sensors; (ii) a procurement plan of 623 sensors was developed and approved; (iii) the first package of 187 sensors was purchased and distributed to farmers and local extensionists; and (iv) trainings on sensor use were organised. Farmers appreciated this timely support by the project. While this activity has been satisfactorily implemented in BT, it is not yet initiated in Tra Vinh although the need is similarly urgent.
15. Due to the severe 2016 salinity intrusion, water supply systems for consumption and agricultural production have become a critical issue. Project partners and beneficiaries have requested support from the project for the use of CIF and/or CCA/CFAF funds to install small water tanks, small-scale water reservoirs and dig wells. The mission agrees that there is urgent need to alleviate the current and future water shortages. Following proposed water management plans by communities and households, the CIF/CCA/CFAF investments in water tanks and reservoirs are justified for agricultural models as well as domestic use. With respect to digging wells, especially for agricultural use, the mission is concerned with the overexploitation of the limited ground water resources. Any support for wells should be preceded by a water resource sustainability assessment by DONRE/PCU.

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date
As required, use investment instruments CIF/CCA/CFAF for water storage and filtering systems. Prior to financing of shallow wells, assess sustainability of underground water use.	PCU/ DONRE/ DPCs	Q2-3/ 2016
For Tra Vinh: Conduct needs assessment for handheld sensors and undertake procurement accordingly.	PCU	April, 2016

16. **(c) Knowledge management and dissemination.** The public awareness and understanding about project activities has been improved through KM. Specific achievements include: (i) finalisation of all project manuals including PIM, FMM, CCA/CFAF, SCG, SEDP, PPP, and their distribution to partners and communities; (ii) contract with provincial television and newspaper to monthly broadcast/issue CC adaption topics. **Specifically for TV**: (i) production of 10,000 folders, 1000 pens and 3000 hand-fans with project information on each item; (ii) publication of quarterly project newsletter; (iii) organisation of 6 study tours for project staff and partners to learn about CC policy, SEDP implementation, and CCA models in other provinces, and (iv) organisation of 53 training courses for 2143 participants on climate change and disaster risk management. **In BT**: (i) production of 10,200 brochures about AMD project and effective models, 15,000 leaflets on climate change and WDF, and 10,000 brochures about CFAF and PPP; (ii) organisation of 12 training courses for 3590 people on climate change and disaster risk management; (iii) learning route to Cambodia for 26 staff and farmers; and (iv) organisation of 2 study tours for WDF and DPI to learn about management and implementation of WDF and SEDP. As a quick reaction to the severe salinity intrusion, in cooperation with the Ben Tre Science and Technology Association, the project is producing a leaflet which contains information about appropriate salinity levels for each crop/animal. This will be soon distributed to farmers as an important reference for farming, and the practice should be replicated in Tra Vinh.
17. However, the mission notes that the awareness and understanding of local communities about climate change, especially salinity intrusion and climate change adaptation still requires improvement. Due to this, inappropriate adaptation measures are practiced in many communes (e.g. ground water for irrigation).

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date
Continue provision of trainings and materials on CCA and DRM to farmers, focus on introduction of effective adaptation measures	CCCO/ DARD/ FU/ PCUs	April, 2016 onwards
Tra Vinh to learn from experience of Ben Tre: produce farmer leaflets informing appropriate salinity levels for each crop/animal.	TV PCU	April, 2016

Sub-Component 1.2: Climate Informed Planning

18. The *subcomponent is rated moderately satisfactory*. The AMD objectives regarding introduction of Climate Informed Planning mechanisms are as follows: (a) Commune level Climate-informed SEDP planning implemented annually; (b) Climate-informed provincial SEDP plans developed for 5-year periods; (c) Climate change policy dialogues between all stakeholders facilitated.
19. **(a) Climate-informed SEDP.** This activity has been satisfactorily implemented in both provinces. The progress to date includes: **two provinces:** (i) finalisation of the climate informed SEDP manual and its distribution to related agencies and communes for implementation; (ii) organisation of one SEDP lessons learnt workshop with participation of 90 (in TV) and 150 (in BT) planning staff at all levels. **For TV:** (i) organization of two TOT training courses on SEDP implementation for 53 planning staff; (ii) training of 685 commune staff by the TOT-participants, for SEDP implementation; and (iii) appropriate deployment of climate informed SEDP in 49 communes including 30 project communes, with participation of 8404 villagers. **For BT:** (i) organisation of a SEDP TOT training course for 46 planning staff; ToT further trains 295 commune planning staff on SEDP implementation; (ii) implementation of SEDP in 43 communes (including 30 project communes) with 5617 participants. In 2016, DPI in two provinces plans to replicate climate informed SEDP to 189 communes/wards (TV: 106 communes/wards provincial wide, BT: 81 communes). In both provinces, PPC already approved the plan and allocated to each non-project commune 20 million VND (in TV) and 15 million VND (in BT) for SEDP implementation.
20. Regarding district level SEDP, in 2016 the **TV province** plans to commence pilots in two districts Cau Ngang and Chau Thanh. Preparation for this initiative to date includes (i) contract with a consultancy group to conduct feasibility study on district level SEDP implementation; and subsequently (ii) development of a district level SEDP manual. **For BT province:** the SEDP district has been successfully initiated in Thanh Phu commune. Quality of the district SEDP was highly appreciated by agencies and communities. The province plans to replicate this initiative to two more districts including Ba Tri and Giong Trom.
21. Although climate informed SEDP process is satisfactory in both provinces, there is still room for improvement with respect to: (i) There are capacity gaps in implementation due to high turn-over of staff after the recent Party congress as well as introduction of SEDP in new communes; (ii) Current planning tools still require improvement in terms of resource identification and allocation, and identification of market opportunities and service providers; (iii) A comprehensive action plan for SEDP roll-out throughout the province is yet to be developed.

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date
Organise refresher and new training courses on climate informed SEDP for project and non-project communes respectively.	DPI, PCU	April 2016 onwards
Organize lessons learnt workshops/cross visits for two provinces and for project and non-project communes to share experiences toward improvement of SEDP implementation.	DPI, PCU	April 2016 onwards
Develop and implement an action plan with appropriate budget allocation (provincial budget, project budget, and other financial sources) for SEDP roll-out throughout the province.	DPI, PCU	April 2016 onwards

22. **(b) Climate-informed Provincial SEDP.** AMD project is to provide technical assistance to DARD, DONRE and DPI for integration of climate change issues into sectoral action plans and the provincial SEDP. **Tra Vinh** is currently under the preparation for the new SEDP 2016-2020. To date, the first versions of sectoral (DPI, DARD, DONRE) and provincial (PPC) five year plans (2016-2020) have been developed. However the mission notes that the PCU support in this regard has been limited. There has been no framework agreement or relevant coordination between PCU and agencies. In **Ben Tre** the AMD has supported the development of DARD, DONRE, and DPI climate informed sector action plans for 2016-2020, as well as the CC aspects of provincial SEDP 2016-2020.

23. In response to the current critical salinity situation, DARD and DONRE in Ben Tre request for AMD technical and financial support to develop immediate action plans. The mission agrees with this proposal, and suggests Tra Vinh to learn from the activity.

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date
For Tra Vinh, PCU to identify support needs for CCA inclusion in sectoral plans and provincial SEDP, and if required mobilize technical assistance accordingly.	PCU/ PSC/ DPI/ DARD/ DONRE	April 2016 onwards
PCU to support DARD and DONRE in development and implementation of immediate CC response action plans.	PCU/ DARD/ DONRE	April 2016 onwards

24. **(c) Climate Change Policy Dialogue. In Tra Vinh:** Concrete objective of this output is to support the Climate Change Coordination Office (CCCO) in Tra Vinh to develop a strategic plan for management and coordination of climate change response. The CCCO office was established in 2014 with 2 full-time and 6 part time staff. Costs for staff salary, office equipment and an experimental lab are covered by the project. To date, the implementation progress includes: (i) Recruitment and management of TA for evaluation of the existing provincial CC adaptation plan (2010-2015), and development of the CCA plan for 2016-2020; (ii) Recruitment of TA for development of a medium term strategic plan for CCCO; and (iii) development of a website to update the CC and CCA issues, especially the real time salinity intrusion database produced from the early warning salinity monitoring system. **In Ben Tre,** implementation results include: (i) Organisation of two training courses on CC, hydrology, and meteorology for 264 participants at all levels; (ii) Recruitment of TA to support the development of five year sectoral DRM and CCA action plan; and accordingly (iii) Development and approval of the 2016-2020 sectoral DRM and CCA action plan.
25. The mission notes that the organizational arrangements of the climate change policy dialogue are appropriate however the implementation is still relatively slow, especially in TV. Two agreed actions from the SM 2015 including coordination of different CCA programs, and development of CCA strategies are still to be properly implemented. It is a matter of concern that the upcoming salinity monitoring and forecasting station, once completed, will add another layer of work to the already slowly delivering CCCO. The mission therefore agrees with the CCCO proposal in TV to recruit one more full time staff in charge of station maintenance once the installation is complete, and updating of the website database. Further, CCCO in both provinces is to continue focusing on the following activities (i) Coordination of the increasing amount of government and donor funded CCA programs in the province, including those by IFAD, World Bank, JICA, CIDA and Oxfam; and (ii) Development of appropriate CCA strategies, taking into account the evolving conditions of the various agro-ecological zones in the two provinces (fresh water, brackish, coastal). Such dialogues should include stakeholders from provincial, regional and national levels.

Component 2: Investing in Sustainable Livelihoods

Overall assessment of the component is rated moderately satisfactory

Sub-Component 2.1: Rural Finance for Resilient Livelihoods

26. *The subcomponent is rated satisfactory.* The sub-component aims at improved access to finance by the project beneficiaries through (a) rural micro-finance services of women's saving and credit groups; (b) building up capacities of the Women's Development Fund (WDF) in Ben Tre and Women's Support Fund (WSF) in Tra Vinh to become independent microfinance institutions; and (c) facilitation of investment by the commercial financial service providers to the AMD value chain stakeholders.
27. **(a) Savings and credit groups.** In Tra Vinh the Women's Support Fund (WSF) for 2015 has established 384 new Savings and Credit Groups (SCG) with 2,490 members (35% poor and near-poor, 42% from Khmer ethnic minority group). The WSF has provided loans to 2,355 members, and total value of all outstanding loans amounts to VND 9.8 billion. To achieve this

result, the WSF has: (i) updated the SCG manual based on knowledge gained through learning routes to other IFAD-supported social funds and with technical assistance by international and national consultants; (ii) organized 25 TOTs on SCG manual for 673 participants from 5 project districts and 20 communes; (iii) convened 154 communication workshops for member mobilization at 155 villages in 18 project communes; and (iv) organized 30 training courses for 914 SCG members.

28. For 2016 the WSF TV aims to develop 1,236 new SCGs with 6,179 members and deliver VND 36.5 billion of loans to 8,018 SCG members. WSF expects to expand its current operation from 17 to 37 project communes and increase number of district branches from 4 to 7.
29. In Ben Tre the Women's Development Fund (WDF) has developed 415 new SCGs in addition to 311 existing SCGs established under DBRP. The 726 SCGs have generated VND 1.179 billion of savings which are on-lent to SCG members. So far 2,897 SCG members (74% from poor households) have received loans. Total outstanding amounts to VND 11.289 billion. The average loan size is therefore VND 3.89 million which reflects satisfactory poverty-targeting. WDF has organized 9 training courses on household business management for 248 SCG members and combined the communications on SCG development with climate change adaptation measures. For 2016 WDF aims at delivery of VND 15 billion to about 13,000 members. To ensure this ambitious target the WDF needs to submit funds requests to PCU in a timely manner to ensure availability of liquidity. The mission also recommends that the WU continue to integrate the SCG development with other AMD activities.

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date
Organize trainings on AMD approaches/activities for WU Fund staff.	PCU/ WU/ WU Fund	2016
BT Organize social communication for development of new SCGs combined with replication of CCA approaches	WU/ WDF	April 2016 onwards
Provide SCGs with trainings on business planning, CSA models and other AMD technical support, following CIG methods.	PCU/ DSTs/ WU/ WU Fund	April 2016 onwards
For Tra Vinh, maximum efforts should be made for VBSP to collect and transfer the outstanding loans committed for WSF.	VBSP/ WU/ WSF	April 2016

30. **(b) MFI development.** In Tra Vinh capacities of the WSF have been strengthened over the last year due to: (i) The signing of the subsidiary loan agreement between MOF and the PPC of Tra Vinh in June 2015; (ii) The recruitment of a full-time Director and a Deputy Director; (iii) The upgrading of finance and accounting systems including appropriate software; (iii) The formulation of a business plan based on the Ben Tre model; (iv) Initial revenues covering parts of the operational costs (OSS QI/2016: 29%, increased from 12% in 2015); (iv) Training courses and workshops.
31. However the mission identified the following issues: (i) The **WSF Business Plan** needs strengthening in terms of balancing of income and operational cost in order to achieve full costs recovery by end of 2017; (ii) The **WSF Supervision Board** has yet to include representation by DOF and the PCU Chief Accountant and the overall awareness of the board is limited regarding WSF operations; (iii) **Knowledge management and communication:** the WSF has yet to promote learning through exchange visits and workshops between staff at all levels and SCG members.

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date
Recruit international/national consultants to revise the WSF Business Plan and overall Strategic Plan.	PCU, WU/WSF	2016
Augment WSF Supervision Board composition and provide training to its members.	WU/WSF	April 2016
Conduct exchange visits and workshops among WSF staff and SCG members. Promote WSF visibility through TV, newspapers and web.	WU/WSF	2016

32. In Ben Tre the WDF has further progressed towards registration as a microfinance institution (MFI). (i) Throughout the province including project areas, the WDF has expanded its services to 76 communes (46 communes outside AMD target areas) and 2,702 SCGs with 11,881 members (71% poor). (ii) The Fund delivered total outstanding loans of VND 42.785 billion (about USD 2 million) and generated VND 7.605 billion of savings. (iii) For 2015 the WDF has opened one more district branch, recruited 10 more fulltime professional staff and established new Risk Management Section at its Headquarters. (iv) AMD has assisted the WDF in organizing 23 training courses for 2,152 participants on credit management, accounting and application of ICT. (v) The WDF Strategic Plan 2015-2020 was developed with IFAD technical assistance. (vi) Current operational self-sufficiency (OSS) is estimated of 103% and financial self-sufficiency (FSS) is about 75%. Number of clients per credit officer stands at 382 and is expected to increase in coming years. In general the WDF in Ben Tre is assessed as one of the most advanced social funds in all the IFAD-supported provinces. To prepare for future transformation to MFI the following activities are recommended.

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date
Undertake independent audit to WDF; Initiate contacts with the State Bank on preparation for MFI application	PCU, WU/WSF	2016
For safe money transfers, PCU transfers a vehicle to the WDF.	PCU/WU/WSF	2016
Exchange visits to other MFIs in or outside the country.	WU/WSF	2016

33. **(c) Value Chain Financing.** The AMD is to strengthen agribusinesses and farmers groups as potential customers to the banks in Ben Tre and Tra Vinh. The overall purpose of this is to make these clients more creditworthy by reducing risks both for themselves and subsequently for the banks, and potentially leveraging additional funding to value chains. The instruments serving this purpose include technical assistance for investment and business planning, improved public infrastructure and direct co-investments under the PPP and CFAF/CCA funds. The co-investments by these funds, in particular, will also reduce the collateral requirements for the clients. These transactions also require bank services which is an incentive for the engagement by financial institutions.
34. As of now, such collaboration between the AMD and potential partner banks is still at a very initial stage, especially due to delay of PPP investments. After the initiation of the PPP, from 2016 onwards the PCUs in each province are to organize bi-annual Agro-finance Workshops. A workshop schedule to this effect is to be established, and preparations initiated accordingly in each province. These include: (i) mapping of the currently available financial service providers in agricultural sector, (ii) assessment of financial institutions' interests and conditions for potential partnerships with AMD PPP enterprises and CFAF/CCA implementing households; (iii) capacity assessment of the value chain stakeholders as per financial institutions' conditions, and (iv) identification of required project support to bridge the gaps between financial institutions and VC actors.

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date
Preparations for a Value Chain Financing Workshop 2016 initiated in each province, separately.	PCUs	Q2/2016

Sub-Component 2.2: Investing in Climate Change Adaptation

35. The *subcomponent is rated as moderately satisfactory*. The objective of the subcomponent is to enable communities, rural households and agri-businesses to create/protect local livelihoods through three financing instruments: (a) Commune Investment Fund; (b) Co-Financing for Adaptation/Climate Change Adaptation Fund; and (c) Public Private Partnership fund.
36. **(a) Community Investment Fund. In Tra Vinh,** main achievements to date include (i) the list of 58 CIF investment schemes for the AWPB 2016 was identified from commune value chains analyses and climate-informed SEDP process in 30 project communes; (ii) 31 out of 58 planned

- CIF schemes of total VND 36.7 billion, including 21 asphalt roads (15.7 km), six concrete roads (5.6 km), one bridge (8.5 m) and three culverts, and three electricity low voltage lines are under survey and design stages; (iii) five training courses on procurement, investment project management, site clearance and investment procedures were organized for 285 DPST/CDB staff; (iv) guidelines on site clearance procedures and relevant templates for CIF schemes were drafted by PCU; (v) cost-benefit analyses were conducted for 31 CIF schemes under the AWPB 2016. **In Ben Tre**, main achievements to date are (i) the Procurement/CIF manual and the guidelines for preparation of CIF proposals were drafted and updated by PCU, (ii) training courses on procurement and CIF investment management were organized for 384 project staff and officials from provincial/district line agencies, (iii) ten CIF investment schemes under the AWPB 2015 including 8 roads in combination with river embankments to prevent salinity intrusion, one dam and one drainage system were implemented; (iv) 68 CIF proposals were prepared by CDBs and submitted to PCU for appraisals⁴.
37. The salinity intrusion of early 2016 has seriously affected both AMD provinces. In Ben Tre for example, the water supply was impaired for 88,000 households, 19,744 hectares of agricultural land was devastated, including all rice and large parts of vegetables, ornamental trees, fruits and aquaculture. To the extent possible, AMD needs to assist alleviating the situation through CIF fund as explained above at 1.1b.
38. **In Tra Vinh** specific constraints for CIF implementation include (i) the total available budget of VND 55.6 billion including government counterpart fund of VND 10 billion comprised only 40% of the total annual planned budget. A request for additional budget of VND 81.6 billion including government counterpart fund of 18.3 billion was submitted to DPI and MPI. Due to uncertainties of additional budget approval, the project started surveys and designs of only 31 out of 58 planned CIF schemes; (ii) a number of CDBs have experience as investment owners under IMPP and Program 135 before. However, with new regulations on infrastructure investment management under Decree 59/2015/ND-CP, the PCU is concerned whether CDBs can undertake direct project management tasks for CIF schemes or alternatively recruit consultant/district project management unit for CIF project management tasks. For small-scale CIF schemes (the total investment cost of less than VND 2 billion as specified in Article 21 of Decree 59/2015/ND-CP), CDBs as investment owners should be encouraged to undertake direct project management tasks with support by PCU/DPST and relevant district line agencies as needed; (iii) Guidelines and trainings on community supervision, and operation and maintenance (O&M) yet to be done.
39. **In Ben Tre**, specific challenges include: (i) CDBs recruited consultants to prepare technical-economic reports and CIF investment proposals prior to submission to PCU for appraisal. However, only 10 out of 34 CIF investment proposals were approved for investment in 2015. Subsequently, it is foreseen that only about 30% of 68 CIF investment proposals submitted by CDBs will be approved for implementation under the AWPB 2016. To avoid waste of resources in development of too many detailed CIF investment proposals, never to be financed, a rapid appraisal should precede technical-economic reports; (ii) Erosion of river banks in Ben Tre have become more serious in recent years. Measures to protect and develop existing ecosystems such as mangrove plantation at river banks should be undertaken as part of CIF investments.

⁴ A set of criteria for appraisal of CIF investment proposals include: inclusion in the list of eligible investments, community contribution, climate change adaptation; value chain development, targeting the poor, and economic effectiveness of investment.

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date
Tra Vinh. PPC to commit sufficient counterpart fund for planned activities under the AWPB 2016 including CIF. PCU and communes to move with surveys and designs of 100% of planned CIF investments in AWPB 2016.	PPC, DPI PCU, CDBs	Q2/2016
Tra Vinh. CDBs with sufficient capacity to directly undertake project management tasks for CIF investments. The remaining CDBs capacitated to follow the process in 2017.	PCU, DPST, CDB	Q2/2016 onwards
Tra Vinh. Prepare detailed templates of procurement and contract documents, and relevant investment procedures for CIF investment and share (including soft copy) with CDBs.	PCU	Q2/2016
Ben Tre. Rapid appraisal of CIF investment proposals before preparation of technical-economic reports.	PCU, DCO, CDB	Q2/2016 onwards
Ben Tre. Review CIF investment proposals, and prioritize to implement CIF schemes under the AWPB 2016 for prevention and control of salinity intrusion into agriculture production lands, and for development of fresh water reservoirs.	PCU, DCO, CDB	Q2/2016

40. **(b) Co-Financing for Adaptation Fund Ben Tre; Climate Change Adaptation Fund Tra Vinh.** The CFAF/CCA fund is to co-finance investment into upgraded production systems, enabling increased income and climate change resilience of the rural households. The co-financing amount of 2.2 million USD is to be distributed to minimum 1500 beneficiary households in each province, through a competitive grant mechanism.
41. The CCA and CFAF funds are managed by qualified teams and have progressed significantly since 2015. (i) CCA/CFAF manuals have been finalized, published and broadly disseminated among project staff and potential co-investors. (ii) Agricultural and non-agricultural investment models have been identified and assessed, and results constitute the basis for replication through CCA/CFAF Fund. (iii) Capacity building was carried out for all related staff of AMD and implementing partners on CCA/CFAF management and support. (iv) Business planning training was carried out with potential co-investing CIGs and households. (v) CCA/CFAF investment boards were established in all project districts and these announced the first round of CCA/CFAF competition with details as per the manuals. (vi) **Investments in Tra Vinh:** 241 households and 16 CGs received assistance in business plan development from the Provincial Centre for Agricultural Extension. 174 out of 184 developed business plans were approved by the CCA Boards with total investment amount of about USD 0.5 million including USD 0.23 million AMD contribution. To date, 150 contracts have been signed with 139 individual households and 11 CGs (with 151 members), and USD 183 000 has been disbursed as the first part of these investments. The total amount of CCA fund beneficiaries adds up to 290 HHs including 71% from poor/near-poor, 29% from female-led and 66% Khmer ethnic group households. (vii) **Investments in Ben Tre:** 235 households and 29 CGs received assistance in business plan development from mass organizations at the local level. To date, 69 out of 143 proposals have been approved and contracts signed with 55 individual households and 14 CIGs, with the total investment amount of USD 290.000 including USD 130.000 AMD contribution. USD 118.000 has been disbursed as the first part of these investments. The total amount of CFAF beneficiaries adds up to 197 HHs including 79% from poor/near-poor and 15% from female-led households. Additionally, 57 HHs have new jobs through the investments, nearly all of which are poor or near-poor.
42. Farmer co-investment fund is a new instrument for the AMD provinces. Important lessons arise from the first competition round, requiring corrective action by the PCUs: (i) Most farmers did not develop their own investment plans due to insufficient quality/volume of coaching and unrealistic expectations for proposal quality. Instead, the support staff have developed plans on behalf of the farmers, causing high transaction cost and limitations in learning/empowerment of the farmer households; (ii) Large part of the CCA/CFAF co-investments have been by individual households, supporting only one family, which limits the outreach of the CCA/CFAF fund and

leaves the group collaboration and joint investment aspect with lesser importance; (iii) The best farmers' practical capacities were not yet utilized for a full scale farmer-to-farmer training programme; (iv) Some investment models especially cow breeding are popular however had high initial investment costs and relatively low cost-efficiency. High efficiency and CCA innovative investments should be prioritized; (v) **The unexpectedly serious drought** and salinity intrusion of early 2016 could not be managed by many farmers and the range of models could not yet provide for a sufficient solution to overcome the extreme conditions. Per the crisis experience, non-agricultural models are the most efficient, and for the agricultural models, a water management solution needs to be included in co-investments as appropriate. Also, the CC-affected poor farmers cannot currently contribute the required 20% beneficiary in-cash contribution; (vi) In Tra Vinh, the disbursement of the funds by the farmers was slow due to procedural difficulties especially those related to overly detailed investment plans which required lengthy amendment process.

43. To strengthen the quality of CCA/CFAF co-investments in view of the above issues, the supervision mission and PCU have agreed on a detailed action plan including summarized details as follows:

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date
To ensure that farmers develop their own CCA/CFAF plans: (i) simplify the CCA/CFAF proposal template and make it more practical, and ensure through community meetings that the households prepare the contents of their respective plans; (ii) explain the CCA/CFAF boards that proposal quality expectation should not exceed farmer capacity, (iii) organize a systematic and intensive training programme on business planning aiming at practical improvement of producer households' budgeting skills, (iv) organize farmer-to-farmer trainings and provide lead farmers with allowances. For the above steps, send a thorough action plan and all templates to IFAD by end of April.	PCU, DARD, DPCs	April 2016 onwards
To ensure sufficient outreach: (i) at least 60% of the remaining CCA/CFAF fund should be implemented with farmer groups that invest jointly and be encouraged to apply revolving fund mechanism, (ii) 40% of the fund can be invested with individual households, about half of which is invested with business households to have indirect benefits at HHs beyond the investment owner (threshold may be higher for BHHs: 5 mil per created job, up to total 100 million), (iii) due to salinity disaster, reduce poor and near-poor households' in-cash contribution to 10% and calculate all relevant labour days as part of the in-kind contribution.	PCU, DPCs	As of now
To ensure poverty reduction and CCA/CFAF impact: (i) assess the financial and CCA/water management viability of models, (ii) modify or stop investing in models that did not survive the climate conditions or that do not show satisfactory cost-efficiency, (iii) expand the successful models, (iv) include new models that show potential.	PCU, DARD	2016
To ensure timely use of the funds by farmers, avoid overly detailed investment items in the CCA/CFAF plans.	PCU, DPCs, CPCs	As of now

44. **(c) Public Private Partnership Fund** is for a competitive enterprise co-investment programme, with the aim of job creation and improved market opportunities for farmer households. PPP Funds in both provinces will invest 0.9 million USD with the aim of benefitting about 2000 households. The importance of off-farm job creation and the PPP funds is increasing due to extreme salinity intrusion.
45. Both PCUs have adequately prepared for implementation of the PPP fund, however investments are yet to be started. The preparations include: (i) PPP manual finalized and published in both provinces; (ii) Senior Technical Advisors engaged in both provinces to coordinate the PPP activities, and in addition in Tra Vinh, a full-time specialist is designated solely for the PPP fund management; (iii) Strategic value chains selected for potential PPP investment. Provincial workshops held to disseminate the opportunity among potential partners; (iv) Expressions of interest and PPP concept notes called for and received from 23 enterprises in Tra Vinh and 28 in Ben Tre; (v) Potential PPP candidates shortlisted – 12 in Tra Vinh and 8 in

Ben Tre; (vi) SNV-led training held in Ben Tre for the AMD staff and key stakeholders in both provinces; (vii) SNV and the PCUs currently provide TA to 9 first enterprises in their detailed preparation of the PPP proposals; (viii) Detailed action plan 2016 is developed including schedule of first PPP investments; (ix) In Ben Tre, the first proposal was approved in January 2016 for AMD co-investment amount of USD 22,600. The quality of the PPP investment plan is satisfactory as well as its foreseen development impact; and (x) Close collaboration is maintained with the DPIs, Tra Vinh CIDA SME Development programme and Ben Tre Coconut Association to ensure sustainability.

46. Due to limited experience in PPP co-investments and their required financial analysis method, the PPP scheme is delayed. During the coming year (i) there is a risk that the delays continue in upcoming steps of the PPP implementation, (ii) all IFAD PPP proposals will need to go through quality control because of limited Vietnam experience in financial analysis and business planning, (iii) local BDS providers need further strengthening and continued support by the SNV services, and further, (iv) for the agricultural input material supply chains, the increasing salinity levels in the surface waters creates a risk that need to be assessed and solutions proposed as part of PPP proposals.

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date
In both PCUs, one Senior Technical Advisor and one full-time qualified project staff to act as PPP team, and daily management of the PPP scheme to be delegated to this team.	PCU	Q2/2016
Prepare quarterly PPP status reports (list of enterprises' status in PPP preparation). Send these reports and all PPP proposals to IFAD.	PCU	2016-2017
Continue the partnership with SNV and as required engage additional private consultancy services to provide business planning TA for potential PPP candidates.	PCU	Q2/2016

D. AMD implementation progress

Quality of project management

47. Rated as *moderately satisfactory*. In both Tra Vinh and Ben Tre provinces the mission appreciates efforts by the PSC and PCU in improving capacities of co-implementing agencies through training programmes on climate change and the project adaptation approaches, completion and promulgation of implementation guidelines for CCA and PPP grant facilities, recruitment of additional staff to PCU, and delegation of full authority for the PD to approve simple changes of AWPB. However the mission is concerned with the current project management performance in terms of: (i) low disbursement rates; (ii) lack of proper human resources and delegation of work at the PCU; (iii) lack of qualified technical assistance to assist the project in implementation management; (iv) due to government policies on ODA disbursement control, there is a challenge for both PCUs to ensure sufficient level of available funds for full-scale implementation for 2016 onwards; (v) for Tra Vinh, the change of leadership at the PSC and limited PCU coordination capacity pose a challenge for the project to fully engage provincial agencies and DPCs in the implementation. In Tra Vinh, there are also parallel implementation arrangements at the district/commune levels lacking active involvement of district technical agencies.
48. The below agreed actions from SM 2015 have not been properly implemented and need to be addressed: (i) **Capacities and delegation at the PCU**. Increased delegation of component management is necessary. Additional management capacity and technical assistance is required in the area of climate change adaptation. The SM 2015 requested appointment of a CCA Deputy Project Director, however such has not been appointed; (ii) **Project implementation by line agencies**. While the cooperation arrangements between the PCU and DARD, DPI, DONRE and WU are in place, vertical implementation arrangement including resource allocation from the province agencies to their district level units have not been setup.

This in turn leads to the lack of active involvement of district-level technical units such as the agriculture section, the agriculture extension centre, the economy and infrastructure section and the district farmer's unions; (iii) **District coordination of project implementation (for Tra Vinh)**. As noted by the SM 2015, all activities should be thoroughly embedded into the work of the district line agencies. Thus, the DPC chairperson or the vice-chairperson is suggested to assume the overall responsibility of the AMD activities and coordination of all line agencies at the district level. The fulltime AMD Project District Coordinator (District Support Officer) should be facilitating the process rather than take full responsibility of all ground-level work. The involved agencies should not be limited to the current DST members only, but also to include other agencies such as the FU and Economic/Infrastructure sections as outlined in the annual work-plans; (iv) **Task and performance based fund allocation**. In view of the above point, for Tra Vinh the project management should strengthen decentralization to the district-level implementing agencies including a task-oriented funds allocation system within PCU and district-level technical agencies. For Ben Tre the decentralization is already on-going, however more resources should be allocated to the district agencies. Further, the PSCs of both provinces should use the principle of performance based funds allocation to provincial agencies, DPCs and CPCs.

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date
PCU capacity and delegation. (i) Appoint new Deputy Directors to assist the PDs in coordination of project implementation and CCA technical issues; (ii) Delegate component management to qualified existing staff; (iii) Senior Technical Advisor to coordinate Value Chains/PPP.	PSC,PCU	April 2016 onwards
Line agencies. (i) Quarterly meetings to be held with technical agencies to agree follow-up actions and relevant AWPB adjustment; (ii) Involve all relevant agencies as co-implementing agencies and clearly define coordination roles of the component lead agencies.	Line agencies, PCUs	April 2016 onwards
Coordination at the district level. For Tra Vinh: (i) Engage district-level agencies in specific project activities with clear tasks and relevant budgets; (ii) Chairman or delegated Vice-chairman of DPCs take full responsibility for the project performance and coordination of the district technical agencies. For Ben Tre: (i) Increase funds allocations to the district agencies based on agreed AWPB.	PSC,PCUs, DPCs,	April 2016 onwards
Task and performance based fund allocation. (i) PCUs to discuss and agree required changes of project implementation mechanisms to accelerate the project delivery among provincial line agencies, DPCs and CDBs; (ii) Introduce performance-based system to reallocate funds from poor-performing provincial agencies, districts/communes to those that show high motivation and performance.	Provincial agencies, DPCs, PCUs, CDBs	April 2016 onwards

Performance of M&E

49. Rated as *satisfactory*. The project has implemented its M&E system satisfactorily in two provinces. To date achievements include: (i) finalisation of M&E manual with monitoring tables, and distributing the manual to districts and communes for implementation; (ii) organisations of M&E trainings for M&E staff at all levels; (iii) properly implementation of required M&E activities including cost-benefit analysis of agricultural models, CCA effectiveness survey, and poverty reduction database update. Following the recommendation from the last supervision mission, an IFAD mission supported the project in two provinces with application of the result based management instruments in project planning, reporting, and management. In order to further improve the M&E and to practically prepare for the MTR in 2017, the following M&E activities require more attention in the coming period: (i) properly implement the result based management system for concrete measurement of project outcomes and impacts; (ii) follow the IFAD standard in the annual RIMS reports (e.g. participants but not "turns of participants"), and (iii) focus on poverty outreach in deployment of project activities.

Coherence between AWPB & implementation

50. Rated as *moderately satisfactory*. The AWPB 2016 was developed in November, and approved by IFAD in December and PPC in January, 2016. Over the last reporting period, priorities were put on: (i) Climate informed SEDP implementation in 92 communes; (ii) Development and implementation of 6 strategic value chains in TV; (iii) Selection of CCA 48 models for replication; (iv) Consolidation of CGs/CIGs as a foundation for CCA/CFAF fund implementation; (iv) Rolling out 219 CCA schemes in the field; (v) implementation of 10 infrastructure schemes in BT; (vi) implementation of one PPP in BT, and preparation for PPP implementation through organisation PPP introduction workshops and meetings with potential enterprises; and (vi) establishment of WU Funds and continued implementation of rural credit activities. However, the project implementation progress, although significantly improved compared to last year, is still slow. Attention is required for the following activities: (i) CCA adaptive research, (ii) CCA/CFAF fund rolling out; (iii) PPP implementation; and (iv) recovery of IMPP micro-credit fund for TV.

Gender focus

51. Rated as *moderately satisfactory*. Gender focus is adopted by the project in both provinces through the target of 50% women participation in project activities. In BT, a gender mainstreaming manual was recently developed. To date, participation rate of women in project activities accounts for 49% in TV and 48% in BT. Under specific activities, (i) 50% (TV) and 46% (BT) of MOSEDP group members are female; (ii) women account for 52% (TV) and 51% (BT) in all capacity building activities of the project; (iii) 100% (both provinces) of SCG members are women; and (iv) women account for 45% (TV) and 40% (BT) among the beneficiaries from CCA/CFAF implementation. The mission notes that the SM2015 recommendation on development of gender mainstreaming guideline (TV), and accordingly provision of capacity building for project staff and partners (both provinces) was not yet properly implemented by the project.

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date
(i) TV to learn from BT to develop a simple gender mainstreaming manual with clear instructions to involve and empower women in project activities. Pay more attention to Khmer women. (ii) Both provinces to provide training courses following the manual.	PCUs	2016

Poverty focus

52. Rated as *moderately satisfactory*. The selection of project communes is adequate. 60 selected project communes are the poorest and most difficult communes with poverty and near poverty rate (33.9% in 2013 in TV; 18.59% in 2013 in BT) being higher than the provincial poverty rate (TV: 28.5% in 2013, BT: 14.75%). The mission notes that poverty and near poverty rates in the project areas and in the province have increased due to the application of new poverty standards by the government. Through field interviews and observations, the mission appreciates the efforts of the project to involve of the poor, especially the Khmer poor (in TV), in the project activities. Under specific activities: (i) the proportion of poor people participating in MoSEDP was 50% (TV) and 34% (BT); (ii) in project capacity building activities, about 52% (TV) and 40% (BT) were poor; (iii) the portion of poor in SCG was 35% (TV) and 69.8% (BT); and (iv) 71% (TV) and 71.1% (BT) of the participants in CCA/CFAF schemes were poor. The mission suggests that future project activities, especially the SCG, CCA/CFAF, and CIF, should continue to pay attention to the poor/near poor, especially the Khmer (TV) in order to reach the target of 25,000 poor/near poor indicated in project design. In addition, due to the decreasing number of poor and near poor households in the project areas, consideration should be given to include the medium status households in the target group.

Effectiveness of targeting approach

53. Rated as *moderately satisfactory*. Initial project implementation statistics and field observations show that project activities are reaching out to the marginalised groups including poor, ethnic minority (TV), and women. The climate informed SEDP instrument was highly appreciated by partners and communities as an important planning tool to mobilise resources and empower people. Project financing instruments including CCA/CFAF, SCG, PPP, and CIF have showed positive results in terms of capacity building for partners and local people. However, the instruments are still at piloting stage and not yet sufficiently effective in reaching out to the poor at a larger scale, especially the poor Khmer (TV). The mission notes that at the early stage of the project, the measurement of the effectiveness of the instruments is still to be strengthened. As indicated in the M&E part, the mission recommends the project to systematically conduct evaluations of different instruments to consolidate the achievements of the project, and adjust the targeting strategy of the instruments accordingly.

Innovation and learning

54. Rated as *moderately satisfactory*. The AMD project is a learning project. As explained in the above sections, it introduces new innovative instruments to sustainable development of the two target provinces, most importantly the salinity monitoring mechanisms, CCA model development, CFAF/ CCA funds and the PPP fund. For promotion of province-wide learning, the project has a specific output under sub-component 1.1, under which the progress includes **in TV**: (i) production of 10,000 folders, 1000 pens and 3000 hand-fans with project information on each item; (ii) publication of quarterly project newsletter; (iii) organisation of 6 study tours for project staff and partners to learn about CC policy, SEDP implementation, and CCA models in other provinces, and (iv) organisation of 53 training courses for 2143 participants on climate change and disaster risk management. **In BT**: (i) production of 10,200 brochures about AMD project and effective models, 15,000 leaflets on climate change and WDF, and 10,000 brochures about CFAF and PPP; (ii) organisation of 12 training courses for 3590 people on climate change and disaster risk management; (iii) learning route conducted to Cambodia for 26 staff and farmers; and (iv) organisation of 2 study tours for WDF and DPI to learn about management and implementation of WDF and SEDP. As a quick reaction to the severe salinity intrusion, in cooperation with the Ben Tre Science and Technology Association, the project is producing a leaflet which contains information about appropriate salinity levels for each crop/animal. This will be soon distributed to farmers as an important reference for farming, and the practice should be replicated in Tra Vinh.

Climate and environment focus

55. Rated as *moderately satisfactory*. The project is specifically designed to address the climate change issues. Throughout the project document, most of instruments including CC-SEDP, CIF, CCA/CFAF, and PPP are proposed to deliver the CC adaptation and environmental protection objectives. To date, 219 CCA/CFAF grants (150 in TV, 69 in BT) have been initiated with CIGs in the project communes. The grants focus on environmentally friendly and safe quality agricultural production models including: (i) fodder plantation for intensive cattle raising; (ii) introduction and promotion of saving water irrigation for various crops; (iii) intensive oyster raising adapting to changing environment; (iv) introduction of bio-fertiliser for maize and peanut production, and (v) application of organic methods in coconut farming. These initial good practices, along with the continuous CCA/CFAF and PPP in the coming years, will ensure the achievement of project's objectives in terms of climate and environment focus and simultaneously contribute to the provincial agricultural development strategy towards high-quality and safe agricultural production.

E. Fiduciary aspects

56. **Financial Management in TV.** *Rated as satisfactory except for the slow project progress.* The project financial management system is well established from provincial down to the district and commune level. The PCU financial section functions well. In view of the guidance from the previous mission, PCU has further strengthened the filing systems which are now well maintained and effective. Internal control systems are in place, which shows an improvement compared to 2015. However, until March, 2016, only operation cost and some CCA expenditures have been occurred at the district and commune level. The mission strongly recommends the project management to review the budget and work plan in Q1/2016 and take strong actions from Q2 to speed up the project disbursement rate.
57. The mission expresses serious concern about the Tra Vinh provincial commitment for 2016 counterpart funding. One of the reasons for slow disbursement in 2015 was the lack of GoV contribution to the project. The mission request a stronger commitment by GOV in providing counterpart fund to the project as per the mutually approved 2016 AWPB. Pending to the fund allocation from MPI, PPC is recommended to advance fund to the project to enable continuity of project delivery in 2016.
58. **Financial Management in BT.** *Rated as satisfactory.* The project financial management system is well set up at all implementation levels. The disbursement rate in 2015 was improved compared to 2014. In view of appropriate plans and preparation for implementation of the budgeted work plan, it is likely that the project disbursement rate in 2016 will be significantly accelerated.
59. **Disbursement in TV.** *Rated as moderately unsatisfactory.* As of 29 February 2016, the total project accumulated disbursement was USD 1,670 million against the total approved project cost of USD 24.848 million (6,7%). This included a disbursement of USD 1.024 million (9,2%) from the IFAD Loan and USD 0.269 (4,5%) from the IFAD ASAP grant. GoV had met 9.9% of its total commitment. Project disbursement in 2015 achieved 70% of AWPB.
60. **Disbursement in BT.** *Rated as moderately unsatisfactory.* The total disbursement for both loan and grant and by all financiers stood at USD 1,887million against a total approved project cost of USD 24,660 million (7,7%). This included a disbursement of 9,5% of the approved loan amount of USD 10,930 million by IFAD and 6,8% of the approved IFAD ASAP grant amount of USD 6.002 million. GoV had met 8,8% of its total commitment. Project disbursement in 2015 achieved 76% of AWPB.
61. **Counterpart funds in TV.** *Rated as moderately unsatisfactory.* GoV has not allocated funds to meet requirement of the approved investments in the AWPB 2016. Only 10 billion VND was allocated to project investment while the approved investment budget for 2016 is 28.2 billion. Given the shortage of 18 billion VND, the project is not able to respect the 2016 AWPB to the anticipation of IFAD and GOV.
62. **Counterpart funds in BT.** *Rated as moderately unsatisfactory.* GOV has not allocated funds to meet requirement of the approved investments in the AWPB 2016. Only 15.9 billion VND was allocated to project investments while the approved investment budget for 2016 is 21.9 billion VND.
63. **Beneficiary contribution.** In Tra Vinh the beneficiary contributions for CCA, PPP and CIF implementation are foreseen to begin during 2016. For Ben Tre, the initial contributions amount up to USD 103.800, mainly from the CFAF fund.
64. **Withdrawal Application.** As at 29 February 2016, TV submitted nine and BT five withdrawal applications for the IFAD loan and the ASAP grant. The mission has reviewed the WAs and noted that eligible expenditures have been claimed into the WA with correct exchange rate.
65. **Project Accounting in TV.** The accounting software is operational. It was reported that errors occurred occasionally when attempting to generate a report. The mission recommends the

- project to make necessary arrangements to have the pending errors fixed properly. **Assets Management.** Management of the project assets is integrated in the software and also in a MS Excel based table maintained at the PCU. Asset registers are maintained at the district and commune level with physical verifications carried out on annual basis. Currently, PCU possesses four motor vehicles with only one driver assigned. The mission suggests PCU reallocates such vehicles to project implementing partners as per justified demand. **Contract management.** The Contracts Register is maintained, updated and shared with IFAD.
66. **Project Accounting in BT.** The accounting software is operational. It produces reports for contract management, assets, and monitors disbursements against AWPBs. **Assets Management.** Management of the project assets is integrated in software and also in a MS Excel based table maintained at the PCU. **Contract management.** The Contracts Register is maintained, updated and shared with IFAD.
 67. **Authorised Allocation of Project Designated Accounts:** Currently, the authorised allocation to the Project Designated Account is USD 1.5 million for IFAD loan and USD 500 thousand for ASAP grant. As all the project activities are decentralised to districts and communes level and with the high disbursement plan for 2016, this allocation threshold will not be sufficient to implement activities at all levels. The mission recommends increasing the authorised allocation threshold to USD 2.2 million for the IFAD loan and USD 1 million for the ASAP grant.
 68. **Cost norm for ASAP grant:** Currently the project applied the GoV cost norm (Decision 219) for ASAP grant. However, the GoV cost norm poses difficulties in implementing several activities, therefore the mission recommends application of the EU-UN cost norm for selected activities such as interpretation services and TA. This is a common practice among IFAD grants in Vietnam.
 69. **Credit line at the WU TV:** As of 29 February 2016, WU received 6 billion VND from PCU and has disbursed 8,7 billion VND (using 2 billion VND of WU's fund). Accounting software is recently installed at the provincial office of Women's Union. The software is foreseen to be fully operational from April onwards, and is soon to be rolled out to all districts.
 70. **Credit line at the WU BT:** As of 29 February 2016, WU received 8,9 billion VND from PCU and has disbursed 11 billion VND (using 2,1 billion VND of WU's fund). Accounting software was installed at the office of WU and all districts. The errors and operational weakness of the software were fixed and the system now functions well. The service provider continuously improves the reporting features.
 71. **Compliance with loan covenants in TV and BT.** *Rated as satisfactory.* All the loan covenants are being complied.
 72. **Audit.** *Rated as satisfactory.* For Tra Vinh a timely audit covering the 2014 issued "unqualified opinion" and separate opinions on the project financial statement, SA and SOE. For Ben Tre a no-objection was provided to include 2014 audit to the 2015 audit due to minor AMD expenditures. Both AMD Ben Tre and Tra Vinh will have a common 2015 audit to submit to IFAD. Currently, the projects have selected the audit company and the work will start in April 2016.
 73. **Procurement in TV.** *Rated as moderately satisfactory.* The procurement and infrastructure investment manual was drafted by PCU and approved by PCU (November 2014). A three-day training course on new Procurement Law and four-day training course on investment project management were organized for CDB and DPST staff. Random review of procurement documents at PCU and implementing agencies showed that the project complied with procurement procedures of the project procurement manual. The contract register was prepared and updated regularly by PCU. However, for service contracts, individual consultant selection method tends to be applied dominantly using predetermined short list of qualified consultants. Wider advertisement for consultant selection through project website and other

public media such as NGO Resource Centre website (www.ngocentre.org.vn) should be applied to encourage wider participation of interested consultants.

74. **Procurement in BT.** *Rated as moderately satisfactory.* The procurement and CIF manual was drafted and updated (December 2015) by PCU. Training courses on procurement and CIF investment management were organized for project staff and relevant provincial/district line agencies. PCU provided active supports to implementing agencies on procurement activities such as consultant selection for automatic salinity forecasting and water quality monitoring system (ASWQM). In 2015, the project completed procurement for 27 packages including 4 goods packages, 9 services packages, 7 non-consulting services packages and 7 work packages of the total contract value of VND 11.3 billion. Force account method was applied for 7 out of total 10 work contracts using CIF fund in 2015. Prior reviews of CDB's procurement activities for CIF investment are conducted by PCU. Copies of procurement documents are maintained in separate files for each contract at PCU.

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date
GoV funds for 2016 AWPB: PPC to allocate for counterpart funding for 2016 AWPB	PPC	
Audit: AMD Tra Vinh and AMD Ben Tre to coordinate the 2016 audit in order to submit a 2016 common audit to IFAD on time	PCUs	
Authorised allocation: increase to US\$2.2 million for IFAD loan and US\$1 million for ASAP grant; Cost norm: Use EU-UN cost norm for selected ASAP funded activities	PCUs, IFAD	
Procurement TV: Advertise widely on the project website and other public media such as NGO Resource Centre website for consultant selection to encourage participation of interested consultants.	PCU, IAs	April 2016 onwards

F. Sustainability

Institution building

75. *Rated as moderately satisfactory.* The mission noted commitments of the PPCs/PSCs in coordinating relevant agencies to promote innovative approaches and establish institutions introduced by AMD. However, in order to ensure the sustainability of the approaches and institutions the mission recommends that: (i) the PPCs and DPs ensure that the Finance and Planning Sections under DPCs support and consolidate commune SEDPs in respective districts. Sufficient government funds should be sustainably provided for replication of the SEDP process in all communes; (ii) The DARDs coordinate its district-level technical agencies to institutionalize application of the value chain approach for development of agricultural commodities; (iii) PPCs to allocate sustainable funding for operation of the CCCO since the financial support by AMD for this Office will be soon terminated; (iv) Tra Vinh WSF should revise its business plan and 2015-2020 Strategic Plan to ensure financial sustainability by end of 2017.

Empowerment

76. *Rated as moderately satisfactory.* The project activities are appreciated by partners and beneficiaries. The project instruments including SEDP, CIF, PPP, CCA/CFAP, and SCG play important role in engaging and empowering local communities in decision making processes. Specifically, SEDP plans and the subsequent CIF investments have (i) facilitated the participation of the local communities to communicate their needs and difficulties to decision makers, (ii) strengthened the capacities of the HHs in climate change adaptation, market access, and economic development, and (iii) consolidated poor HHs position, especially poor Khmer within society through involvement in the decision making process. The initiation of PPP (in BT), CCA/CFAP, SCG through group establishment, and provision of technical and financial support has improved the social cohesion and promoted collective actions within the communities. However, the mission notes that (i) many CIGs still lack management capacity, (ii)

a significant amount of non-CIG people are left out of most project support, and (iii) number of poor, near poor-and ethnic minority that benefited from project activities is still limited, requiring more attention from the project in the coming period.

Quality of beneficiary participation

77. Rated as *moderately satisfactory*. Quality of participation is positively viewed by project beneficiaries and partners. Project records reflect a large number and active participation of people (about 15,000) in project activities. As mentioned in the above paragraph of empowerment, the climate informed SEDP process has created a space for participation of people, especially the poor (50% in TV, 34% in BT) and women (50% in TV, 46% in BT). The awareness raising and capacity building process at all levels have involved a significant number of participants (10,000 participants: 40% poor, and 50% women in TV; 10,000 participants: 38% poor, 47% women). And, the initial implementation SCG and CCA/CFAF also involved about 1000 rural people (60% poor, 70% women) in TV, and 3200 people (71% poor, 90% women) in BT. These activities helped to raise the voices of beneficiaries in the process of setting priorities for investments, and to engage directly in implementation and monitoring of approved activities at later stage. The mission views that the comprehensive implementations of all project instruments in the coming time will continue to ensure the quality of beneficiary participation.

Responsiveness of service providers

78. Rated as *satisfactory*. The AMD has engaged a range of service providers to the project implementation, both in direct support of project beneficiaries as well as management/planning support to the AMD and partner institutions. Regarding direct support of beneficiaries: DARD, Women's Union, Farmers Union and AMD staff have extended strong efforts to communities in agricultural technique, business planning and group establishment/management. This work has been responsive to the needs of rural people however in some cases sustainability of the delivered products must be improved (see details and related recommendation above at 2.2 b: CCA/CFAF business planning service). Regarding management and planning support, international NGOs have been engaged to support the project: (i) SNV 4P programme supports the PPP fund, (ii) Oxfam supports the CCA-SEDP establishment, (iii) Albeit at a very slow pace Cognitive Edge supports the climate change research agenda, and (iv) Partnerships with Tra Vinh CIDA SME project and Ben Tre Coconut Association are established for business environment improvement.

Exit strategy

79. Rated as *moderately satisfactory*. At this stage of the implementation, the project has yet to develop an exit strategy. During the coming year prior to the MTR an exit strategy needs to be developed. Project should pay specific attention to PPP and CFAF/CCA investments assets management and shifting full ownership to implementing partners.

Potential for scaling-up and replication

80. Rated as *moderately satisfactory*. The SEDP, MFI and water quality monitoring instruments are already included in the provincial government mechanisms, and impact is scaled up to non-project areas. The further instruments included in the AMD project design are considered highly relevant by the provincial stakeholders and have good potential for later up-scaling, especially CCA modelling, CFAF/CCA and PPP funds. The Climate Change Adaptation measures as well as market oriented poverty reduction methodologies are likely to be up-scaled also regionally in the Mekong Delta area.

G. Other

Physical/financial assets

81. Rated as *moderately satisfactory*. The project investment instruments such as CIF, CCA and PPP are at initial stage, and impact on physical or financial assets is still to materialize. In Tra Vinh, at visited communes the mission noted initial results from CCA models. Breeding cows produced first calves, groundnut plantation models resulted in reduction of about 10% production costs, and 10-20% increase in productivity. From saving and credit activities, so far 2,355 SCG members including 35% poor and near-poor members received credit of total VND 9.8 billion for production and income generation activities. In Ben Tre, CIF road investments in combination with river embankments are to prevent salinity intrusion into production lands and to provide access for transportation of agriculture products. Purchased 187 portable salinity measuring instruments prevent losses caused by salinity intrusion to agriculture lands, as result of improved decision by farmers. So far, Women Development Fund provided total VND 8.9 billion of credits to SCG members. About 90% of households who received loans from the WDF have significant incomes increases.

Food security

82. Rated as *moderately satisfactory*. The bench-mark RIMS survey in both provinces in 2014 indicated that food security is still a problem in the project communes in TV, while in BT food security is no more an issue. In TV, 10% of the poor suffered 4.3 months food shortage, and 1% suffered 2 months food shortage. There is not yet updated database on impact of project activities on food security, while the mid-term RIMS survey is scheduled for 2016, and will provide such information. However, with a remarkable poverty reduction rate over the years (see Poverty focus part), and the appreciation of communities and partner regarding to project instruments, the mission is confident that project impact on food security is significantly positive.

Quality of natural asset improvement and climate resilience

83. Rated as *moderately satisfactory*. As indicated in the part of Climate and environment focus, the project designated various instruments including SEDP, CIF, CCA/CFAF, and PPP to protect environment and help farmers adapt to climate change. Initial implementation of these instruments showed positive impact on quality of natural asset improvement and climate resilience. The mission observed various positive impact on environment including: (i) fodder plantation for intensive cattle raising; (ii) introduction and promotion of saving water irrigation for various crops; (iii) intensive oyster raising adapting to changing environment; (iv) introduction of bio-fertiliser for maize and peanut production; and (v) application of organic methods in coconut farming. The mission, however, notes that salinity intrusion is becoming more severe for households in the project areas. In view of this, the future interventions should take into consideration of water saving irrigation methods, salinity resistant crop varieties, and CC adaptation strategies.

H. Conclusion

84. In view of the thorough investment preparations, the AMD implementation performance in both project provinces is also assessed as *moderately satisfactory*. Key progress is made in following: (i) Finalization of all project manuals PIM, FMM, SEDP, CCA/CFAF, CIF, PPP, SCG/MFI and the respective implementation structures; (ii) Roll-out of climate-informed and market-oriented SEDP planning mechanism in all 60 project communes and 32 non-project communes, (iii) Identification and assessment of 149 agricultural and non-agricultural CCA models, and subsequent selection of 48 models for implementation; (iv) CCA/CFAF co-investments with 194 individual households and 25 CIGs; USD 301,000 disbursed as first part of the investments, (v) PPP fund received expressions of interest from 51 enterprises; 20 enterprises identified as potential partners; 9 first enterprises receive technical assistance to

- develop business plans; first proposal approved for implementation in Ben Tre; (vi) Approval of 160 CIF infrastructure schemes in 60 project communes; Ben Tre completed 10 first CIF works and has 20 more in pipeline for 2016; Tra Vinh has 31 works in investment pipeline for 2016; (vii) Women Union Fund established in both provinces, and progressing satisfactorily towards MFI registration. The new Tra Vinh Fund is servicing 2,490 clients in 384 SCGs, and respectively, the Fund in Ben Tre which has operated somewhat longer has 11,881 clients in 2,702 SCGs.
85. The project however urgently needs to move from preparatory and piloting phase to full scale implementation phase. Especially in the context of 2016 salinity intrusion disaster, it is of outmost importance that the physical support measures are timely implemented. The following agreed actions should receive specific attention:
- **Implementation progress and decentralization:** (i) Significantly accelerate the overall implementation and disbursement progress before the MTR next year; (ii) Review current responsibilities and resource allocation with the aim of increased decentralization of project implementation to CPCs/DPCs and line agencies;
 - **Counterpart funding and ODA allocations:** (i) Required level of counterpart funding to be provided; (ii) Sufficient ODA allocations ensured and PPCs to provide pre-financing of eligible expenditures as required due to delays;
 - **CCA and PPP:** (i) Review CCA approach following lessons from first round, (ii) accelerate PPP implementation;
 - **PCU delegation and capacity:** (i) Delegate component management to qualified existing staff; (ii) Appoint qualified Deputy Project Directors to be in charge of climate adaptation; (iii) Senior Technical Advisor to coordinate Value Chains/PPP; (iv) Update IFAD VN on changes by June 2016.
86. Through adopting the above key points as well as the other recommendations outlined in the Aide Memoire, Ben Tre and Tra Vinh will be in a stronger position to accelerate AMD implementation prior to the MTR.

Appendix 1: Summary of project status and ratings

Project 1664 [1100001664] Project for Adaption to Climate Change in the Mekong Delta in Ben Tre and Tra Vinh Provinces

Basic Facts

Country	Viet Nam	Project ID	1664 [1100001664]	Loan/DSF/Grant/ASAP FI No.	2000000433, 2000000434
Project	Project for Adaption to Climate Change in the Mekong Delta in Ben Tre and Tra Vinh Provinces			Top-up Loan/DSF/Grant/ASAP FI No.	
Date of Update	2-Mar-2016				
Supervising Inst.	IFAD				
No. of Supervisions	3	No. of Implementation Support/Follow-up missions	6		
Last Supervision	March 2016	Last Implementation Support/Follow-up mission	February 2016		

					USD million	Disb. rate %
Approval	11-Dec-2013			Total financing	49.34	7.2
Agreement	28-Mar-2014	Effectiveness lag		IFAD Total	34.00	8
Entry into force	28-Mar-2014	PAR value		IFAD loan	22.00	9.4
First disbursement	16-Oct-2014			DSF grant	-	
MTR		Last amendment		IFAD grant	-	
Original completion	31-Mar-2020	Last audit		ASAP grant	12.00	5.6
Current completion	31-Mar-2020			Domestic Total	15.34	5.3
Current closing	30-Sep-2020			Beneficiaries	7.77	1.3
No. of extensions	0			National Govern	7.58	9.3

Project Performance Ratings

B.1 Fiduciary Aspects	Last	Current	B.2 Project implementation progress	Last	Current
1. Quality of financial management	5	5	1. Quality of project management	4	4
2. Acceptable disbursement rate	3	3	2. Performance of M&E	4	5
3. Counterpart funds	4	3	3. Coherence between AWPB & implementation	4	4
4. Compliance with financing covenants	4	5	4. Gender focus	4	4
5. Compliance with procurement	4	4	5. Poverty focus	4	4
6. Quality and timeliness of audits	4	5	6. Effectiveness of targeting approach	4	4
			7. Innovation and learning	4	4
			8. Climate and environment focus	4	4
B.3 Outputs and outcomes	Last	Current	B.4 Sustainability	Last	Current
1. Building Adaptive Capacity	4	4	1. Institution building (organizations, etc.)	4	4
2. Investing in Sustainable Livelihoods	4	4	2. Empowerment	4	4
			3. Quality of beneficiary participation	4	4
			4. Responsiveness of service providers	4	5
			5. Exit strategy (readiness and quality)	4	4
			6. Potential for scaling up and replication	4	4

B.5 Justification of ratings

The AMD in both provinces has thoroughly prepared for implementation of all project instruments. The manuals and planning mechanisms are in place. However, most of the physical investment instruments are still moving slowly. Overall performance is

moderately satisfactory. Improvement is noted in the areas of M&E and partnerships with various service providers, as well as compliance with procedural requirements of audit and procurement. The level of counterpart funding has lowered rating because the GoV could not fully meet the committed amount of 2015, which is agreed to be rectified in 2016.

Overall Assessment and Risk Profile

	Last	Current
C.1 Physical/financial assets	4	4
C.2 Food security	4	4
C.3 Quality of natural asset improvement and climate resilience	4	4
C.4 Overall implementation progress (Sections B1 and B2)	4	4

Rationale for implementation progress rating

The quality of AMD management in both provinces, for overall management, project planning and financial management, is moderately satisfactory due to experience gained in the previous projects DPRB (BT) and IMPP (TV). The overall financial management of the AMD is rated as satisfactory, however disbursement as well as level of counterpart funding are now rated as moderately unsatisfactory due to delays in kick-start of investment instruments. The project has been urged to accelerate investments by MTR 2017, and provincial leaders are committed to this task. The Country Office expects learning processes regarding CCA for the overall Vietnam country programme.

C.5 Likelihood of achieving the development objectives (section B3 and B4)	4	4
--	---	---

The AMD preparations are done appropriately by the two PCUs and implementing partners. Also, the AMD design is highly relevant in the context of Mekong Delta climate change, and all stakeholders are committed to the project implementation. At the current stage however most of the investments are still in preparatory phase rather than being fully implemented. By the time of MTR next year the project in both provinces is urged to initiate full scale roll-out, for the likelihood of achieving development objectives to remain at moderately satisfactory level. By following SM recommendations,

C.6 Risks

Fiduciary aspects	- The level of counterpart financing was insufficient in 2015 in TV - ODA allocation mechanism of the central government has changed in 2015, causing delays in implementation
Project implementation progress	- Overall pace of investments was still slow in 2015 - Capacities and delegation in PCUs and among implementing partners need strengthening, especially, both PCUs need to hire Deputy Directors.
Outputs and outcomes	- The CCA research programme needs to be accelerated especially in BT - Sufficient financing is yet to be made available for CIF investments, and subsequently, surveys/designs are not yet initiated for 100% of the AWPB planned works - The CFAF/CCA investments modality requires some review to ensure appropriate outreach and impact - The PPP investment programme is starting slowly
Sustainability	- The CCCO operational financing is yet to be institutionalized - The Women Funds are progressing towards sustainability however not yet financially self-sustainable - The CFAF/CCA did not yet sufficiently support grass root farmer association, and revolving mechanisms are used to limited extent

Proposed Follow-up

Issue / Problem	Recommended Action	Timing	Status
Implementation progress and decentralization	(i) Significantly accelerate the overall implementation and disbursement progress before the MTR next year; (ii) Review current responsibilities and resource allocation with the aim of increased decentralization of project implementation to CPCs/DPCs and line agencies.	April 2016 onwards	
Counterpart funding and ODA allocations	(i) Required level of counterpart funding to be provided; (ii) Sufficient ODA allocations ensured and PPCs to provide pre-financing of eligible expenditures as required due to delays.	As of now	
CCA and PPP	(i) Review CCA approach following lessons from first round, (ii) accelerate PPP implementation.	Q2/2016	
PCU delegation and capacity	(i) Delegate component management to qualified existing staff; (ii) Appoint a qualified Deputy Project Director to be in charge of climate adaptation; (iii) Senior Technical Advisor to coordinate Value Chains/PPP; (iv) Update IFAD VN on changes by June 2016.	Q2/2016	

Appendix 2: Updated logical framework: Progress against objectives, outcomes and outputs

TRA VINH

Results Hierarchy	Indicators					Means of Verification		
	Name	Baseline	YR1		Name	Baseline	YR1	
Project Goal: Sustainable livelihoods for the rural poor in a changing environment.	At least 25,000 poor and near poor households (Ben Tre: 10,000; Tra Vinh: 15,000) with at least 25% improvement in household assets ownership index (*)	Targets corresponding to the statistics (poor and near-poor) of each province. Surveyed households have access / property such as electrical, television, phone, motorcycle, bicycle, car and boat with percentage respectively 99%, 90%, 91%, 77%, 71%, 1% and 9%.	-			RIMS baseline, mid-term and completion	Baseline and completion	PCU
	40% reduction in the prevalence of child malnutrition (*)	Percentage of chronic malnutrition children: 23% male, 18% female; acute malnutrition children: 13% male, 16% female; underweight children: 12% male and 10% female.	-			RIMS baseline, mid-term and completion	Baseline and completion	PCU
Project development objective: Adaptive capacity of target communities and institutions to better contend with CC strengthened.	At least 25,000 poor and near poor households (Ben Tre: 10,000; Tra Vinh: 15,000) with increased 30% of adaptive indicator at least. (*)	Adaptive household indicator is measured on three aspects, including (i) the diversification degree of livelihoods and income sources of households; (ii) Access to credit for investment into adaptive activities; and (iii) Direct participation in the village and commune SEDP process which has an impact on the financial resources of the province.	-			RIMS Baseline and completion. Thematic survey	Baseline and completion	
Component 1: A comprehensive agriculture sector CC adaptation management framework operating with participating communities, institutions and provinces.	At least 30,000 people (Ben Tre: 15,000; Tra Vinh: 15,000) trained on climate-informed farming system and technology. (poverty/gender/ethnic)	-	290 people trained, in which 83 female, 191 Khmer and 204 near poor and poor people			Project Management Information System (MIS)	Annually	PCU, DARD, districts, communes
Sub-component 1.1. "Climate Change Knowledge Enhancement"								
Output 1.1.1: Participative	At least 15 climate resilient farming system packages (Ben Tre 7; Tra	-	AMD and DARD has reviewed and selected 16 plans			Project Management	Annually	PCU, DARD,

Appendix 2: Updated logical framework: Progress against objectives, outcomes and outputs

Results Hierarchy	Indicators					Means of Verification		
	Name	Baseline	YR1		Name	Baseline	YR1	
development of gender sensitive models for farmers & aquaculturists to formally engage in climate resilient, profitable, production.	Vinh 8) tested with suitable scale (based on each proposal of farming system package) with at least 40 farmers each		registering model implementation from the units in the province. DARD is currently contributing selected plans			Information System (MIS)		districts, communes
	▪ At least 600 households (TV: 320; BT: 280) participate in the test of 15 climate resilient farming system packages.	-	AMD and DARD has reviewed and selected 16 plans registering model implementation from the units in the province. DARD is currently contributing selected plans			- Annual report - Project Management Information System (MIS)	Annually after tested	DARD
	▪ At least 14 (BT: 8; TV: 6) value chains identified	-	The project contracts with consultants to review, analyze, evaluate and develop development plans for 6 value chains, including: (i) rice, (ii) peanuts; (iii) hot red chilli peppers, (iv) corn; (v) black tiger shrimp and (vi) beef.			- Annual report - Project Management Information System (MIS)	Annually	DARD
	▪ Number of people trained in value chain, market access, and economic analysis	-	1,177 people trained			Annual report	Annually	DARD
	▪ Number of enterprises/people participating in the value chain development planning process (gender and ethnic minority disaggregated)	-	545 enterprises/people participating. In which, 239 female, 391 Khmer people			Research and studies reports Independent evaluation reports	Mid-term and completion	Research institutions
Output 1.1.2: Sustainable salinity monitoring system with web-based open source database established.	▪ At least 1,500 (BT: 1,000; TV: 500 - 1000) households (groups) provided and trained in using the handheld salinity monitoring equipment.	After the automatic water-quality monitoring system established, these activities will be carried out	Not implemented yet			Project Management Information System (MIS)	Annually after the system is in operation	DARD, PCU

Results Hierarchy	Indicators					Means of Verification		
	Name	Baseline	YR1		Name	Baseline	YR1	
Sub-component 1.2. "Climate-Informed Planning"								
Output 1.2.1: Preparation activities to integrate community-based adaptation and disaster risk mitigation into SEDP.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Number of staff of concerned line agencies and villagers trained in DRM/CC (gender/ethnic) 	-	2,434 trained people, including 601 female (24.6%) and 614 Khmer (25.2%)			Report of implementing agencies	Annually	DARD, DONRE
Output 1.2.2: Provincial Departments of Planning & Investment have guidelines and tools for climate-informed SEDP planning and the capacity to independently train district and commune staff.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 60 project communes annually develop SEDP with integration of disaster risk mitigation and climate change concerns 	-	30/30 project communes have developed SEDP with integration of climate change concerns			Project Management Information System (MIS)	Annually	PCU
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Number of government staff trained in climate-informed, market oriented SEDP 	-	653 government staff trained			Report of implementing agencies	Annually	DPI, districts, communes
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Number of staff/farmers/enterprises participating in the annual SEDP planning meetings at commune level (poverty/gender/ethnic) 	-	8,676 participants, including 3,643 female (42%), 1507 Khmer (17.3%) and 714 poor and near poor (8.2%)			Report of implementing agencies	Annually	DPI, districts, communes
Component 2: Increased and more inclusive financing for market oriented, climate smart agriculture and agri-business investments	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 50% of households (who are in need of credit) in project communes are able to access credit for climate resilient farming activities. 	WDAF established	50% loans used for the right purposes (1,959 / 2,420 members receive loans with amount of 4.62/9.27 billion dong			Thematic survey	Annually	PCU
Sub-component 2.1. Rural Finance for Resilient Livelihoods								
Output 2.1.1: Savings and Credit Groups established.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> At least 1 140 new women's SCGs (Ben Tre: 580; Tra Vinh: 560) established with at least 11 400 (BT: 5 800; TV: 5 600) members (poverty/gender/ethnic). 	-	365 groups established with 2,661 members			Annual report	Annually	WU

Appendix 2: Updated logical framework: Progress against objectives, outcomes and outputs

Results Hierarchy	Indicators					Means of Verification		
	Name	Baseline	YR1		Name	Baseline	YR1	
Sub-component 2.2. Investing in Climate Change Adaptation								
Output 2.2.1: Climate resilient, risk reducing, small-scale commune works and infrastructure constructed.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The number of beneficiaries (poverty/gender/ethnic). 	-	About 7,821 people will be benefited from 58 works			Project Management Information System (MIS)	Annually after invested	PCU
Output 2.2.2: Poor and near poor households can affordably invest in profitable climate adaptation technology.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> At least 3 000 (BT: 1 500; TV: 1 500) households (50% of poor and near poor) co-financed to invest in climate resilient farming system. 	-	290 households participating and receiving grants from CCA (83 female, 191 Khmer, 204 poor and near poor, accounting for over 70%).			Project Management Information System (MIS)	Annually	PCU
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Of 30 000 people (BT: 15 000; TV: 15 000) trained/improved capacity building related to CCA, 4 000 (BT: 2 000; TV: 2 000) people provided with skills on preparing sub-projects/business plans 	-	980 people trained/improved capacity building, including 592 people (potential to access CCA) trained on business planning skills			Project Management Information System (MIS)	Annually	PCU
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 10 000 (BT: 5 000; TV: 5 000) households replicate CCA model. (*) 	-	Not implemented yet			-Thematic survey - RIMS completion - Project Management Information System (MIS)	Completion	PCU
Output 2.2.3: P-PC funds allocated competitively, enabling SMEs, CIGs & Co-ops to invest in sustainable, climate-sensitive production & raise	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> At least 3 600 (BT: 1 800; TV: 1 800) households benefited from PPP models (poverty/gender/ethnic). 	-	Not implemented yet			Project Management Information System (MIS)	Annually after invested	PCU
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 300 (BT: 150; TV: 150) sustainable jobs generated from PPP models (poverty/gender/ethnic). 	-	Not implemented yet			Project Management Information System (MIS)	Annually after invested	PCU

Results Hierarchy	Indicators					Means of Verification		
	Name	Baseline	YR1		Name	Baseline	YR1	
	working standard and opportunities for laborers.							

**Of 15 indicators must consist of mandatory RIMS indicators and other RIMS indicators*

*** The distribution of the indicators as illustrated*

**** The intermediate indicators to achieve the purpose and the outputs which are not required*

Appendix 2: Updated logical framework: Progress against objectives, outcomes and outputs

BEN TRE

Narrative Summary	Indicators						Means of Verification			Assumptions
	Key Performance Indicators	Baseline data	2014	2015	MTR	Final review	Source	Frequency	Responsible	
Project's goal: Sustainable livelihoods for the rural poor in a changing environment.	40% reduction in the prevalence of child malnutrition (weight versus age; height versus age; weight versus height) (% G, %B)	5%, 8% 12%, 13% 3%, 10%					Baseline and final RIMS	Once every 03 years	PCU	
	10,000 poor and near poor households with at least 25% improvement in household assets ownership index	NA	Not yet surveyed	Being surveyed by employed consultant			Baseline and final RIMS	Once every 03 years	PCU	
	At least 40% reduction in income poverty in project communes (**);	Poor rate: 9.74% Near poor rate: 7.35%	Poor rate: 9.74% Near poor rate: 7.35%	Increased poor rate 41% (6,963 poor HHs in 2014; 11,889 poor HHs in 2015); Near poor rate reduce 30% (5,252 near poor HHs in 2014; 4,031 near poor in 2015) (multidimensional criteria)			DOLISA data on poor and near poor	Annual	DOLISA	
Project Development Objective: <i>Adaptive capacity of target communities and institutions to better</i>	Indicator 1: 100% of provincial communes and districts effectively implementing annual climate smart, participatory market oriented SEDP formulation.	NA	100% communes and wards establish CC and market oriented-integrated SEDP	100% communes and wards establish SEDP; 26% commune establish Climate			Annual report of DPI	Annual	DPI	Socioeconomic conditions remain reasonably stable in the project area and climatic disasters are manageable (A) Supporting Government Departments (DARD, DoNRE

Narrative Summary	Indicators						Means of Verification			Assumptions
	Key Performance Indicators	Baseline data	2014	2015	MTR	Final review	Source	Frequency	Responsible	
<i>contend with CC strengthened.</i>				smart SEDP (43/164 communes, wards and towns)						DOLISA & DPI) do not internalize AMD work programs and targets (R)
Outcome 1: A comprehensive agriculture sector CC adaptation management framework operating with participating communities, institutions and provinces	Indicator 2: At least 15,000 turns of people trained with regard to technologies and CCA pathways (poor/gender/ethnic group).	Na	0	3,613 people (905 women, 394 poor)			Project MIS	Annual	PCU, DARD, districts and communes	Government issues enabling decrees for integration of CC into SEDP (A) Integrated disaster risk management & vulnerability reduction planning will not be effectively integrated into village-, commune- and district-level planning (R) Inter-institutional cooperation & articulation is maintained & reasonably effective (R)
Output 1.1.1: Participative development of gender sensitive models for farmers & aquaculturalists to formally engage in	Indicator 3: At least 7 different viable pro-poor climate resilient farming system packages, each adopted by at least 40 poor & near poor households	Na	0	11 (demonstration models)			Project MIS		PCU, DARD, districts and communes	
	Indicator 4: At least 280 HHs engaged in testing the 7 farming system packages	Na	0	294			Project MIS		PCU, DARD, districts and communes	

Appendix 2: Updated logical framework: Progress against objectives, outcomes and outputs

Narrative Summary	Indicators						Means of Verification			Assumptions
	Key Performance Indicators	Baseline data	2014	2015	MTR	Final review	Source	Frequency	Responsible	
climate resilient, profitable, production	Indicator 5: At least 6 VCs identified	Na	Not yet implemented	Employed consultants are developing adaptive VC strategic plan for each district			Annual report		DARD	
	Indicator 6: Number of people trained regarding VCs, market access and economic analysis	Na	0	238 (66 women).			Annual report		DARD	
Output 1.1.2 Sustainable salinity monitoring system with web-based open source database established.	Indicator 7: Invest in the development of a proper-designed automated salinity monitoring system	Na	Not yet implemented	Contractor selected and being submitting IFAD for no- objection.			Economic-technical analysis report		DONRE	
	Indicator 8: At least 10,000 HHs (groups) provided the handheld sensors and received training on using them.	Na	0	187 handheld sensors provided (including 157 HHs and 30 commune extension staffs), over 1,600 direct HH users, 80% HHs benefited from timely salinity information via commune radio systems, and village meetings			Project MIS		DARD, PCU	
Output 1.1.3 Tra Vinh University and other regional research	Indicator 9: At least 13 peer-reviewed scientific papers published on climate	Na	0	0			Project MIS		Research units	

Narrative Summary	Indicators						Means of Verification			Assumptions
	Key Performance Indicators	Baseline data	2014	2015	MTR	Final review	Source	Frequency	Responsible	
organizations implementing an adaptive, climate smart agricultural and aquaculture varietal research program	adapted testing models.									
Output 1.2.1: Preparation activities for community-based adaptation and disaster risk mitigation plans	Indicator 10: Government staff and people trained in climate smart, market oriented and disaster risk management SEDP (gender and ethnic minorities disaggregated)	Na	0	347 (110 women)			Implementation partner's Report		DARD, DONRE	Provincial governments committed to participatory market-led adaptive socio-economic development planning (A)
Output 1.2.2: Provincial Departments of Planning & Investment have guidelines and tools for market oriented, climate smart SEDP planning and the capacity to independently train district and commune staff in market oriented	Indicator 11: Climate smart and disaster-risk management SEDP	Na	0	DPI has developed the Manual.	-	-	Project MIS		PCU	Provincial government integrate commune level NTP funding into the MoSEDP process (A)
	Indicator 12: 30 project communes carry out Climate smart and disaster-risk management SEDP formulation annually	Na	0	43 (including non-project communes in Thanh Phu district).			Project MIS		PCU	The vulnerable stakeholders may participate in the SEDP process at the limit (R)
	Indicator 13: Number of local government staffs are trained in terms of Climate smart, market oriented SEDP	Na	0	341			Implementation partner's Report		DPI, districts and communes	Provincial government do not support private sector participation in SEDP development (R)
	Indicator 14: Number of staffs/people/ enterprises involved in the annual commune meetings for SEDP formulation (poor/	Na	4,035 (1,657 women; 1,413 poor)	5,617 (2,291 women; 1,464 poor)			Implementation partner's Report		DPI, districts and communes	Inadequate skills

Appendix 2: Updated logical framework: Progress against objectives, outcomes and outputs

Narrative Summary	Indicators						Means of Verification			Assumptions
	Key Performance Indicators	Baseline data	2014	2015	MTR	Final review	Source	Frequency	Responsible	
strategic planning.	gender/ ethnic group disaggregated)									base amongst local service providers (R)
Outcome 2. Increased and more inclusive financing for market oriented, climate smart agriculture and agri-business investments	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Indicator 15: 50% of households in project communes having loan demand and accessing credit for adaptive farming activities 	Na	Not yet surveyed	90%			Thematic surveys		PCU	No major change in financial climate, lending terms (A) Financial service providers remain interested to invest in project targeted value chains (A) Prices of key commodities remain reasonably stable (A) Quality & availability of freshwater in the project Provinces remains adequate for development of project livelihood activities (R)
Output 2.1.1 Savings and Credit Groups established	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Indicator 16: At least 580 new women's SCGs having at least 5,800 members established (poor/ gender/ ethnic group disaggregated) 	Na	0	726 groups 2,901 members (2,897 loan borrowers, 2,579 women, 1,122 poor)			WU's report		WU	Government completes the regulatory framework for the implementation of MFI legislation (A) Insufficient skills base of local service providers to participate in the
Output 2.1.2 Women's Union Social	Indicator 17: Establish one MFI	Na	Not yet established	International consultant has employed and			WU's report		WU	

Narrative Summary	Indicators						Means of Verification			Assumptions
	Key Performance Indicators	Baseline data	2014	2015	MTR	Final review	Source	Frequency	Responsible	
Funds and/or transformed into viable Micro-Finance Institutions capable of financing private farmers, traders and commercial value chains.				already developed the Strategic plan period 2015-2019.						project activities (R)
Output 2.1.3. Farmers and agribusinesses can more easily access credit from diversified financial service providers.	Indicator 18: At least 50% of the loan amount of SCGs used for adaptive farming options	Na	Not yet surveyed.	Not yet surveyed.			Annual thematic survey (2017 and 2020)		PCU	
Output 2.2.1 Climate resilient, risk reducing, small-scale commune works and infrastructure constructed.	Indicator 19: Number of works (civil works facilitating production) invested (km of road and km of irrigation system)	Na	0	10			Annual communal reports		PCU	Business regulatory system remains favourable (A)
	Indicator 20: Number of beneficiaries (poor/ gender/ ethnic group disaggregated)	Na	0	9,281 (4,739 women, 1,429 poor)			Project MIS		PCU	Sufficient interest in market traders to participate (A) Leveraged beneficiaries capable of providing their contribution (A)

Appendix 2: Updated logical framework: Progress against objectives, outcomes and outputs

Narrative Summary	Indicators						Means of Verification			Assumptions
	Key Performance Indicators	Baseline data	2014	2015	MTR	Final review	Source	Frequency	Responsible	
Output 2.2.2 Poor and near poor households can affordably invest in profitable climate adaptation technology.	Indicator 21: At least 1,500 HHs (50% poor and near poor) being financed to undertake profitable, leveraged CCA investments	Na	0	212 (142 poor, 67%)			Project MIS		PCU	
Output 2.2.3 PPP funds allocated competitively, enabling SMEs, CIGs & Co-ops to invest in sustainable, climate smart production & raise working standard and opportunities for laborers	Indicator 22: At least 1,800 HHs benefited from PPP models (poor/ gender/ ethnic disaggregated)	Na	0	400 beneficiaries HHs (125 poor, 232 women)			Project MIS		PCU	Business regulatory system remains favourable (A)
	Indicator 23: 150 sustainable jobs created from PPP (poor/ gender/ ethnic disaggregated)	Na	0	400 initial jobs created while involving PPP			Project MIS		PCU	Sufficient interest in market traders to participate (A) Leveraged beneficiaries capable of providing their contribution (A)

Appendix 3: Summary of follow-up in key agreed actions

Agreed actions	Responsibilities	Agreed date	Implemented actions
Disseminate the technical instruction for model identification and replication to all stakeholders at all levels	PCU	April, 2015	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - AMD organized a training course to disseminate the technical instruction of IFAD Country Office for project staff on April 17, 2015 - IFAD's specialist trained project staff at all levels on household economic analysis in February, 2016
Draft the MoU outlining tasks and responsibilities of JPMC and send to all intended members	DONRE BT	April, 2015	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - IFAD Country Office has developed a joint procurement framework until September, 2017. - AMD Tra Vinh has developed a minute on the joint procurement and sent the draft to AMD Ben Tre for comments.
Send out RFP to invited parties	PCU & DONRE BT	By May 2015	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - PPC Tra Vinh has authorized PPC Ben Tre to approve the plan for selection of bidders. - The investment owner – DONRE Ben Tre contracted TA to be the party calling for bidders. Bids are being analyzed.
Accelerate the information dissemination program about the project, its objectives, instruments, and resources	PCU	April, 2015	PCU has developed relevant documents and materials and organized training courses according to the recommendation of the supervision mission. It is emphasized on project approaching strategy from value chains and project's co-financing funds (CIF, CCA, PPP...
(i) Urgently develop the CC-informed SEDP manual; (ii) include lessons by the Oxfam; (iii) include simple templates for DRM and CCA planning, (iv) include simple tools for Value Chain and Cost-Benefit analysis.	PCU/DPI Tra Vinh	April, 2015	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - DPI organized the first workshop to update the manual in October, 2014 and the second workshop in February, 2015; - DPI, Oxfam and AMD Tra Vinh have organized a meeting to come to a common agreement on the manual 2016 on May 13, 2015; - The third workshop to include the sustainable poverty reduction element was organized in November, 2015; - The manual 2016 has been finalized after three workshops - Developed district-level CC-informed SEDP manual
Ensure exchange between the two provinces in the process of manual development and implementation. The two provinces should aim at common shared manual, to the extent possible.	PCU/DPI	May, 2015	The SEDP manual has been jointly discussed among 4 provinces, including: AMD Tra Vinh, AMD Ben Tre, PRC Ben Tre and PRC Tien Giang; Oxfam's specialists
Continue training planning staff at all levels in implementation of climate-informed SEDP.	DPI/PCU	May, 2015	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - DPI has implemented and consolidated SEDP planning task forces at all levels - Organized 2 ToT courses for SEDP task forces at provincial level by end of June, 2015
Organise technical workshops inviting stakeholders from two provinces to share and discuss experiences and lessons learnt in the first year climate informed SEDP implementation	PCU/DPI	April - November/ 2015	In coordination with AMD project, PRC project, Oxfam's specialist, DPI has organized 3 workshops to draw out lessons learnt and finalized the climate-informed and sustainable poverty reduction SEDP manual for the planning cycle 2016
Organise technical discussions about the feasibility of five year plans (DARD, DONRE, DPI, PPC). Consider to mobilise and integrate different resources including AMD.	PCU/PPC	May, 2015 onwards	DPI has recommended PPC to organize a workshop to technically discuss about the feasibility of five year plans: (DARD, DONRE, DPI, PPC on (i) climate change element, (ii) integration of different resources

Ensure prompt approval and signing of the subsidiary loan agreement by MOF.	PPC/PCU/M OF/IFAD	May, 2015	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - PPC has approved the loan using and payment option. The option then has been submitted to MOF on May 5, 2015 - The subsidiary loan agreement has been signed between MOF and PPC
Tra Vinh: (i) Start establishment of new SCGs and mobilization of savings prior to delivery of loans; (ii) enable the existing SCGs to continue the revolving saving and credit mechanisms within the groups, and maintain savings within the groups, not to be transferred to WDAF unless a fully voluntary scheme of mutual benefit is entered into.	WDAF	2015	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The provincial Women's Development Assistance Fund has been put into operation at the beginning of 2015. 4 transaction offices in 4 out of 7 districts has been established and focused on the introduction of the Fund; guided on the establishment of groups/clusters until June, 2015; - Established 365 groups/28 clusters in 18 communes; disbursed loans to 2,661 members with the amount of VND 8.7 billion
Full-time professional manager to be recruited by AMD to manage operations of WDAF and training of staff.	IFADF/PCU	ASAP	Contracted a full-time professional manager and she has started her work at the Fund's head office since December, 2015.
A new financing and accounting software to be installed in Tra Vinh WDAF	WDAF/PCU	ASAP	ANA company (supplier) is installing the online software and implementing trial operation at the Fund's head office and 7 transaction offices in districts
Organize elaborate training programmes for WDAF staff at head office and district branches.	WDAF/PCU	2015	The Fund has organized elaborate training courses (without hiring consultants). Combined practical lessons learnt and field visits from in the Women's Economic Development Fund of Ben Tre province and the Micro-finance institution of Thanh Hoa province; Attended training courses of Viet Nam Women's Union
VBSP transfer of funds: Agreement between PPC and VBSP will be modified that at least VND 8 billion is transferred by end of 2015, and respectively VND 8 billion and the rest of about VND 7 billion for 2016 and 2017.	PPC/VBSP	June, 2015	PPC has issued the official letter No. 1964/UBND-KTTH dated on June 22, 2015 on transferring fund from VBSP to WADF under the process: VND 8 billion in 2015, VND 8 billion in 2016 and the rest in 2017
Formalize the agreed schedule of funds transfer for the VND 23 billion from VBSP to WDAF	PPC, VBSP, WDAF	June, 2015	PPC has issued the official letter No. 1964/UBND-KTTH dated on June 22, 2015 on transferring fund from VBSP to WADF
Mission of IFAD international expert to assess WDAF capacity and provide with strategic guidance	WDAF/PCU/IFAD	6/2015	IFAD has invited Dr. Jorma Ruosti to assess the WDAF's capacity. As a result, The Fund's institutional capacity has been rated as "qualified enough" to start using the AMD capital for on-lending to its SCGs and their members.
(i) Ben Tre and Tra Vinh PCUs to coordinate for the Agro-finance workshop schedule; (ii) Preparations for VC stakeholder access-to-finance facilitation to be initiated by both PCUs, including call for and facilitate commercial banks to involve in PPP implementation process	BT and TV PPCs	2015	Moved to 2016 in order to ensure necessary conditions for the implementation under 6 value chains
The planning processes to be upgraded urgently to enable CCA and VC assessments as support to PY3 civil works.	DPI, PCU	By May 2015	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 19 value chains have been identified at commune levels to be input for the climate-informed SEDP planning process - Through SEDPs, the list of works has been identified - Conducted field visits to review the list of works. The approval was divided into two stages.

			The project will invest 58 works in 2016 (PY3)
Force account and community participation infrastructure procurement threshold of 30 000 USD to be raised to up to 60 000 USD. IFAD to amend the Letter to Borrower accordingly; F-A and community participation methods to be used for min. 40% (TV) of investments.	PCU	As of now	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The procurement manual has been revised, accordingly force account and community participation infrastructure procurement threshold of 30 000 USD has been raised to up to 60 000 USD - Developed the option of procurement with community participation applied for simple infrastructure schemes, without having requirement of complicated techniques combining with vocational training
Training to be provided for the relevant project and government staff for the new procurement law.	PCU	2015	Organized 5 training courses on knowledge and capacity building (i) investment owner, (ii) bidding profession, (iii) site clearance process, (iv) procedures for civil works, (v) procurement preparation process for 285 participants including relevant project staff at all levels and staff of implementing agencies
(i) CCA model replication strategy to be developed in close consultation with all relevant stakeholders, most importantly with the CFAF/CCA coordinators at the district level. (ii) Potential CCA models to be assessed and model-specific replication plans developed by interested agencies and enterprises, following a template by the PCU; (iii) CCA model ToTs and subsequent farmer-to-farmer trainings to be initiated in large scale.	PCUs DPCs, DARD, FU, WU, other agencies, lead farmers, enterprises	By July, 2015	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The manuals of CCA Fund and PP Fund have been disseminated and widely implemented at all levels (CCA: 32 workshops, PPP: 2 workshops); Provided training in the implementation process for project staff and members of district-level approval teams (2 courses) - Provided training in developing business plan, writing sub-projects for target groups; training in production technique for CCA Fund's recipients - A detailed coordination plan in 2016 for PPP Fund has been developed and disseminated. - The first round of CCA Fund has been implemented in October, 2015
Finalize all manuals including CFAF/CCA and PPP, and distribute finalized manuals; widely disseminate the information on the two Funds to implementing agencies/counterparts and potential beneficiaries	PCU	April, 2015 onwards	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Manuals have been fully approved and widely disseminated. - Developed propaganda materials for the Funds of CCA and PPP such as folders, hand fans, project's bulletins on newspaper, television station...
(i) CFAF/CCA investment proposal support officers to be selected at the district and commune levels; (ii) The support officers to be trained in investment planning as per CFAF/CCA application requirement; (iii) Farmer group investment planning trainings to be initiated, prior to CFAF/CCA grant competition.	PCU, DPCs, CPCs, FU, WU, lead farmers, enterprises	By 9/2015	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Contracted TA to provide training in developing business plans for officers of provincial departments - The Provincial Center for Agriculture and Aquaculture Extension has provided technical assistance in developing business plans, documents and materials and technical training, handbooks for monitoring models - Provided skill training for the Fund's operation staff (district and commune levels), including: manual, propaganda, implementation process, disbursement process; Provided training in developing business plans for 1,104 potential recipients
Initiation of the CFAF/CCA scheme by first grant competition round, using maximum 20% of the total available budget (Ben Tre and Tra Vinh 10%), having evaluation and multiplication for the next year according to selection criteria and optimal plans	PCU, DPCs	Q3-4/2015 onwards	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Being implemented based on the approved manual and the implementation process - Implemented the first grant competition round (CCA) in October, 2015 with 174 business plans approved - Organized a workshop to draw out lessons learnt and decentralize completely to district and commune levels for the implementation in 2016 (March 1, 2016) - Tỷ lệ giải ngân vốn CCA vòng 1 gần 12% - The CCA fund's disbursement rate in the first round is nearly 12%.
Competent national or international TA to assist in	PCU, DPCs	Q1/2016	- Moved to 2016 due to the business plans haven't completed yet

<i>comprehensive evaluation of the first co-investments for lessons learnt.</i>		<i>onwards</i>	
Hold local commodity workshops and provincial PPP workshops for identification of potential partner enterprises. Discuss collaboration opportunities widely, including enterprise-led supplier and labourer trainings, infrastructure needs, improved access to finance/ land/ services and PPP co-financing.	PCU, DPCs	Q2/2015	Organized 3 workshops to collect comments in order to finalize 6 key commodity value chains of the project linking provincial commodity value chains; Identified and consulted with 58 companies/enterprises, facilities, business households that are appropriated for the access to PPP Fund
(i) Develop a comprehensive plan for enterprise support in business planning and preparation of PPP proposals; (ii) Assess the training needs of relevant staff in PPP proposal assessment; (iii) Strictly require detailed financial analysis of all PPP proposals to be approved, including assessment of business plan viability, and impact on household incomes.	PCU, DPI, BT DOIT, TV SME Project	Q2/2014	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - In coordination with SNV, SME, DOIT, Tra Vinh University, the project has provided capacity building training in writing sub-projects under PPP Fund for enterprises - Participated in the training course on PPP financial analysis held by IFAD in Ha Tinh in July, 2015; the training course on PPP financial analysis held by SNV in Ben Tre in October, 2015 - A training course on developing sub-projects and PPP financial analysis in the development of business plans of PPP's enterprises is expected to be organized by SNV in March, 2016.
<i>For Tra Vinh, engage additional expertise in the implementation of the PPP scheme, potentially by hiring a Chief Technical Advisor and entering into close partnership with the CIDA/DPI project for SME Development; Consult closely with the Ben Tre PCU regarding PPP manual development</i>	<i>PPC, PCU, DPI, SME project</i>	<i>Q2 - 3/2015</i>	<i>A Chief Technical Advisor has not been hired yet. The project advisor and PPP staff are implementing the PPP scheme</i>
Project orientation and planning: (i) Quarterly meetings to be held in each district with DPCs, involved provincial and district agencies and project communes to discuss project strategies, review implementation performance and agree follow-up actions and relevant AWPB adjustment. (ii) Approval process to be accelerated by authorizing the PD to approve modifications of AWPB if no change in level of IFAD and counterpart funding required.	Provincial agencies, DPCs, PCU, CDBs	2015	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - DPSTs organize quarterly meetings with the participation of district agencies, project communes. PCU and provincial agencies will participate in meetings in 2016. - PCU maintains the meeting regime under progress report regulation to adjust AWPBs and solve difficulties during the project implementation - The authorization of PD to approve modifications of AWPB has been implemented as the agreed action plan. After having no-objection of IFAD, PD has approved the revised AWPB 2015 in case that no change level of Government's counterpart funding.
Project implementation arrangement/guidelines: PCUs to a workshop to discuss and agree upon changes of project implementation mechanisms for (i) coordination among provincial line agencies and DPCs and CDBs; (ii) integration of AMD sub-components and with other programmes/projects; (iii) decentralization of resources to district/commune levels.	Provincial agencies, DPCs, PCU, CDBs	2015	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - It is suggested to PPC an adjustment to enhance the role of provincial line agencies, coordination, monitoring rather than the implementation of activities at provincial level - Expanded the scope of participation for provincial line agencies and localities based on the quality and efficiency of operation - PCU enhances the project management based on performance; decentralize resources to provincial line agencies district/commune levels and take responsibility for explanation

<i>PCU capacity improvement: (i) Appoint a qualified Deputy Project Director in both PCUs, based on technical capacities; (ii) Recruit a Senior Technical Advisor on Agriculture and Climate Change Adaptation, based in Ben Tre but working for both provinces; (iii) Recruit a Senior Technical Advisor on Value Chains/PPP based in Tra Vinh but working for both provinces.</i>	<i>PCU and related agencies</i>	<i>2015</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The appointment of a qualified Deputy Project Director based on technical capacities is being suggested to PPC. - A Senior Technical Advisor on Value Chains/PPP based in Tra Vinh but working for both provinces has not been recruited yet. The project advisor and PPP staff are currently implementing this position for AMD Tra Vinh
Coordination at the local level: Engage DPC and CPC agencies in implementation of project instruments such as CCA, PPP, CFAF/CCA funds, and organize training courses accordingly	PCU, DPCs, CPCs		Enhanced the decentralization and participation of district/commune levels during project implementation; CCA Fund has been decentralized to districts for approval, communes for contract monitoring and disbursement of grant... In 2016, districts and communes will implement project activities according to the decentralization
Task-oriented allowance system: PCUs to discuss and initiate implementation of an task-oriented allowance system.	PCU	2015	Developed a route to reduce 30% of the allowance per total number of people participating the project. In 2015, number of officers that receive allowance in districts has been reduced from 4 to 1 (head of DPST). In 2016, it is anticipated to reduce allowance of WDAF (Fund Management Council, Control Committee)
<i>Two provinces, develop a simple gender mainstreaming manual with clear instructions to involve and empower women in project activities. Tra Vinh province pays more attention to Khmer women. Two provinces, provide training courses following the manual.</i>	<i>PCU TV and BT</i>	<i>2015</i>	<i>This activity has not been implemented yet by AMD Tra Vinh</i>
IFAD funds for 2015 AWPB: PPC to seek IFAD funds for inclusion in the 2015 ODA plan and in the meanwhile pre-finance legible expenditures	PPC	March, 2015 onwards	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - According to the official letter No.1266 dated on March 9, 2015 of MPI, PPC has consolidated and submitted to MPI, total requested fund of VND 50.4 billion - The PPC has issued the official letter No.1324 on May 5, 2015. Accordingly, AMD Tra Vinh was accepted to temporarily borrow VND 10 billion from the provincial budget source - In December, 2015, MPI has announced that AMD Tra Vinh would be allocated additional fund of VND 50 billion
Withdrawal Applications: PCU sends all pending WAs to MOF	PCU	March, 2015	6 withdrawal applications in 2015 have been approved by IFAD and MOF (100%)
Cost norm for TA contract: PPC send an letter to MOF requesting for clarification of this issue	PCU	March, 2015	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - PCU has sent a letter to MOF to consult on this issue on March 27, 2016. MOF has issued an official letter to clarify that Circular No.219/BTC is the base for implementation. - PCU has suggested that EU cost norms should be applied for grant. IFAD has agreed on this application and PPC has also approved it at the official letter No.1201/UBND-KTTH dated on April 21, 2015
Support from Tra Vinh Treasury: Treasury to give stronger support and/or priority to the project in order to help speed up the project transactions.	PPC/Treasury	March, 2015	PCU has worked with the Director and the Expenditure Control Department of the Provincial Treasury. PCU and the Treasury have agreed solutions and solved their shortcomings in budget allocation and settlement procedures

BEN TRE

N o	Recommendations made by the SM	Project actions	Main agencies in charge	Implementing time
A- Key recommendations				
1	Coordination/Implementation arrangements: Review current responsibilities and resource allocation with the aim of increased decentralization to DPCs/CPCs.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - PCU reviews activities decentralized to provincial agencies and adjusts resource allocation (if needed); Coordinate the departments rapidly deploy activities as planned, - Developed and signed MOUs with 8 districts; Allocate additional budget for implementing activities according to the actual needs of the district targeting poverty reduction and with the viewpoint of flexible adjustment according to the progress of the district project implementation progress. - Provide support to departments, district and commune regarding organizing activities and disbursement procedures; control the outputs and performance orientation targeting the project objectives. 	PCU	Since Quarter 2/2015
2	Multiplication of the CCA models: Involve multiple actors for the identification, assessment and multiplication process of CCA models, as per the Guidance Note agreed upon during the mission	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Disseminate and guides the implementation steps; identify and replicate the climate change adaptation models under the general guidance by IFAD (including pro-poor models of agricultural and non-agricultural). - Call for the involvement and consultation from government agencies, private sector and local communities in the process of identifying and scaling up the adaptation model. - Analyze the models, evaluate the effectiveness regarding cost - benefit, especially in terms of social impact to set a basis for reviewing, selecting and replicating the adaptation model. 	PCU, DARD, DPCs, CPCs, FA.	Since Quarter 2/2015
3	Institutional capacities: (i) Develop a comprehensive capacity building programme at all levels, focusing on CCA, market oriented planning and co-investment implementation; (ii) Engage two Senior Technical Advisors. One for Climate Change Adaptation based in Ben Tre and one for Private Sector Engagement based in Tra Vinh, both working for both provinces.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> (i) Organize the capacity building trainings for all levels as per AWPB identified within the following fields: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Training on project management and climate change knowledge (PCU is in charge). - Training in guidance for implementing the project investment tools, including CFAF, PPP, and CIF (PCU is in charge). - Training for TOT team and training for district, commune, village staffs in analysis, evaluation, integration approach into commune SEDP (DPI is in charge). - Training on procurement professional for coordinator at provincial, district levels and communal project owners; Capacity building on management, administration and leadership for top- manager staffs (DPI is in charge). - Capacity training on community-based disaster risk management; capacity building training for TOT group on value chain development, investment economic analysis, and skill for working with the community (DARD is in charge). - Organize Farmer Field School training for the community groups to apply the adaptation models (DPC is in charge) - Organize training in preparing proposals and financial analysis for farmer groups, enterprises involved in the value chain and adaptation models (DPCs and PCU are in charge) (ii) – Draft a TOR and employ an agricultural and CC adaptation senior advisor working in Ben Tre 	PCU, line agencies and DPCs	Quarter 2-3/2015
4	Private sector partnership: Widely inform the private sector on project support through various channels. Identify potential private sector partners. Hold consultations. Initiate	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Introduce about project objectives and investment tools of the project to the private sector via the mass media channels, workshops, and business forums, etc. that attracts more attention, identify potential partners and further orientation of appropriate between AMD and enterprises - Connect with private sector including business association, Vietnam Women Entrepreneurs Association, 	PCU, Associations, enterprise	Since Quarter 2/2015

	collaboration for value chain development and replication of financially viable CCA models. Assign staff responsibilities accordingly.	potential businesses associated with the value chain of the Project; Commercial banks such as Agribank, Vietnam, LienViet Postbank in order to create a solid linkage to support farmers, production groups implementing adaptive models and the development of value chain from PPP facility. - Assign the Project staffs to set partnership with the private sector of the Project (staff in charge of PPP and value chain).	s, and commercial banks	
5	AWPB and financial management: (i) Quarterly meetings at district level with provincial agencies' participation to review performance of project districts and communes and to agree on AWPB adjustments; (ii) Authorize PD to approve the revised AWPB with no change of counterpart funding requirement, following IFAD NOL.	(i) Maintain quarterly meetings organized in districts with the participation of the project implementation agencies at provincial level, district departments to agree and coordinate between the activities of the sub-component and component of the Project; deliver orientation, solve the difficulties facing by the districts and communes during project implementation. (ii) PCU carries out evaluation of quarterly implementation and will, if necessary, adjust according to the actual needs against AWPB, actual implementation progress, ensure proper coordination implementation of the project effectively and timely. The adjustment of AWPB is decided by the Project Director and report those decisions to the Steering Committee in regular meetings, if the adjustment does not change the total amount of counterpart funding by the Government and does not change the basic contents of the AWPB. The allocation, budget adjustments within the AWPB decided by PD based on the capacity, accountability and implementation progress of the project implementing agencies at all levels.	PCU	Since Quarter 2/2015
6	Pending activities: Finalize and sign subsidiary agreement on WDF/WDAF financing; complete guidelines for CC-informed SEDP, CFAF/CCA and PPP.	(i) PCU coordinates with WU to advise the PPC to accelerate signing the re- loan contract with the Ministry of Finance; Perform the withdrawal procedures when signing the agreement. (ii) Technical support for DPI to develop and finalize the CCA-SEDP Manual including integrated guidelines to analyze the economic situation and climate change indicators with simple tools and formats to easily implement at the commune level. (iii) CFAF and PPP: - Consultation for finalizing the CFAF and PPP; then submit to IFAD and PPC for approval. - Introducing and training for staffs at all level about the Manuals; - Widely disseminate these investment tools to potential partners and beneficiaries. - Pilot the funds through the first call for investments according to the competition mechanism and based on the proposals from the stakeholders.	IFAD, PCU, WU. DPI PCU and DPCs	Quarter 2/2015 April – May 2015 Since April 2015
7	Collaboration between two provinces: Provinces to strengthen and widen collaboration to include manual development, CCA model development, value chain development, private sector financing arrangements and exchange of senior expertise.	- PCU Ben Tre and Tra Vinh discuss and share ideas during the development of manuals for investment tools and SEDP manual. - Organizing inter-provincial meetings quarterly to share experiences and learn from each other about these activities: development of adaptive models, value chain, linking the private sector, the cooperative agreements with public and private sector, etc.	PCU	Since Quarter 2/2015
8	Poverty reduction: Objectives to be mainstreamed into the project strategy and guidelines, alongside the CCA	- Review and supplement the poverty reduction objective in the overall project strategy. - Allocating funds for DOLISA and DPC to implement activities targeting poverty reduction in project communes (focus on income generation models for poor households / landless near poor, or less productive land) Notes: The project activities should target the beneficiaries who are vulnerable groups, including the poor and female-headed households (minimum 30% poor, 40% female)	PCU, DOLISA, DPCs, and CPCs	Quarter 2/2015
B. Recommendations by components				
Component 1				

1	Disseminate the technical instruction for model identification and replication to all stakeholders at all levels. Involve other agencies beyond DARD in the implementation of subcomponent 1.1	PCU provides guidelines on process to identify and develop adaptive models under general guidance by IFAD (pro- poor farming and non- farming models).	PCU	April 2015
		In addition, the model implementation agencies are allocated funds (including DARD, DOLISA and FA), PCU increases decentralization to the districts participating in the establishing and development of models being practiced at the locality.		Since 6/2015
		Exchange experience with Tra Vinh regarding the successful models for further replication.		
Water quality monitoring and reporting				
2	Draft the MOU outlining tasks and responsibilities of JPMC and send to all intended members	Establish the Joint- Procurement Management Committee (JPMC) of Ben Tre – Tra Vinh.	DONRE and PCU	4/2015
		Ben Tre DoNRE shall draft the Regulation on coordination between the two provinces, outline the tasks and responsibilities of the JPMC and consult comments to complete the Regulation which is the basis for implementation.		By 5/2015
3	Send out RFP to invited parties	Finalize the TOR to employ the technical consulting company	DONRE and PCU	By 5/2015
		Prepare the bid documents; submit for approval of the contractor selection plan according to the limited international bidding method.		Until August – Sep 2015
		Carry out bidding process, evaluate bids complying with the IFAD and Vietnamese Government regulations.		
4	Accelerate the information dissemination program about the project, its objectives, instruments, and resources	- Continue the communication activities for the project via mass media (newspaper, local TV, leaflets, etc.)	PCU and DARD	Since 3/2015
		- Organize capacity building in terms of climate change awareness for staffs at all levels and the community.		
		- DARD shall rapidly conduct (TOT) trainings, support at least 30 TOT staffs (who are district and commune staffs and excellent farmers) and skills to provide training to the community, and skills to directly train in the field, production techniques of replication models.		
		- Documentation of the adaptive models for replication, dissemination, and mobilization of the community to apply.		
5	Complete all the manuals including CFAF/CCA and PPP and distribute final versions; disseminate information about the two funds widely to implementing partners and potential beneficiaries	Printing and disseminating the implementation Manual of CFAF, PPP, CIF through various forms (newspapers, radio, conferences, issuing leaflets and communication through communal meetings, self-control group’s meetings or directly introduce to the target groups, etc.) in order to help partners such as commercial banks, businesses and potential beneficiaries understand and participate in the Fund activities.	PCU and DPCs	Since 4/2015
Sub- Component 1.2 Climate- informed planning				
6	(i) Urgently develop the CC-informed SEDP manual; (ii) include lessons by the Oxfam; (iii) include simple templates for DRM and CCA planning, (iv) include simple tools for Value Chain and Cost-Benefit analysis.	- Refer to the available documents, lessons learning on SEDP with CCA integrated approach (from Oxfam, from Tra Vinh and other provinces) to develop Manual with simple methods and tools, integrate CC issues into commune SEDP. This Manual will be used together with the existing manual issued in 2014.	DPI	By the end of 5/2015
		- Organize consultation workshop to finalize the Manual.		
		- Print and officially issue for implementation.		
7	Ensure exchange between the two provinces in the process of manual development and implementation. The two provinces should aim at common shared manual, to the extent			

	possible			
8	Continue training planning staff at all levels in implementation of climate-informed SEDP.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Organize TOT for the planning staff at all levels to carry out training for communal and village staff, in terms of analytical and evaluation skills and application of tools and methods to integrate climate change factors into SEDP (at least 01 TOT courses for staff, training courses for 8 districts) - Attend training course organized by the central ministries for provincial planning staffs. - Organize training course for provincial and district planning staffs. 	DPI	Since 5/2015
9	Organize technical workshops inviting stakeholders from two provinces to share and discuss experiences and lessons learnt in the first year climate informed SEDP implementation.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Organize study tours regarding integration of CCA, green growth, sustainable development for SEDP planning staff at commune, district and provincial levels. - After finishing climate- informed SEDP formulation in 2016, a workshop to share experiences between the two provinces will be organized. 	PCU/DPI	Since 10/2015
10	Organize technical discussions and develop a road map for implementation of long-term climate-informed sectorial SEDP	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Based on exiting 5-year plan 2016 - 2020, the implementing including DONRE, DARD and DPI shall review their sector plans, mainstreaming CCA issues, to clarify the implementation road map for 5 years. - Organize the consultation workshop to agree on the sectorial plans and specific roadmap for respective agencies. 	DARD, DONRE and DPI	Since 6/2015
Component 2				
Sub- component 2.1: Rural finance for resilient livelihoods				
11	Ensure prompt approval and signing of the subsidiary loan agreement by MOF.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - PCU coordinates with WU to advise the PPC to accelerate signing the re- loan contract with the Ministry of Finance; Perform the withdrawal procedures when signing the agreement - Sign the re- loan agreement to conduct withdrawal procedures and disbursement. 	PPC/MOF /IFAD/ PCU and WU	Since 4/2015
12	Increase level of compulsory and voluntary savings	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Making plan to increase the level of compulsory savings and voluntary for old and new loans according to the recommendation of the credit consultant (increase up to 15% amount of savings for each of the next lending cycle) - Dissemination for the fund, encourage old and new SCGs deposit voluntary and compulsory savings required when accessing to a new loan or loan in the next cycle (collecting 01 months prior to the loan disbursement, which means there are 13 times collected instead of 12 times in the 01-year cycle). 	WU and WDF	Since 6/2015
13	Complete the 2015-2020 Strategic Plan and organize further training courses for staff on credit management and accounting	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Develop and finalize the strategic plan of the WDF transferring into MFI period 2015-2020; Submit for approval of IFAD. - Organize capacity building for WDF staffs according to the AWPB (especially the credit officers and accountants to effectively operate the fund) 	WU and WDF	Since 4/2015
14	Provide sufficient equipment and office space for staff at district branches.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Establish 01 exchange office in Mo Cay Nam district. - Facilitate the equipment for the new exchange office in Mo Cay Nam district and others for Thanh Phu and Ba Tri district branch where there is not separate office. - Procurement additional equipment for the branches. 	WDF	Since 4/2015
15	Involve financial institutions in the PPP and CFAF/CCA preparation processes.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Sign MOUs with Agribank, Lien Viet Postbank to lend to potential stakeholder of the value chains, PPP and CFAF. - Those commercial banks will assist the stakeholders to develop the business plans when they propose for PPP and CFAF. 	PCU	Since Quarter 3/2015
16	(i) Ben Tre and Tra Vinh PCUs to coordinate for the Agro-finance workshop schedule; (ii)	PCU Ben Tre cooperates with PCU Tra Vinh to develop a plan to organize the Agro-finance workshop. The Plan shall include:	PCU and WU	Since 2/2015

	Preparations for VC stakeholder access-to-finance facilitation to be initiated by both PCUs.	+ Schedule + Assess the accessibility of the relevant parties to the financial resources in the development of the value chain: i) determine the financial service providers currently operating in the agricultural sector; ii) evaluate the level of interest and call for the involvement of credit organizations in cooperation with businesses to invest in PPP and CFAF households; (iii) assess the capacity of stakeholders in the value chain in terms of financial institutions; and (iv) determine the necessary support from the project to bridge the gap between financial institutions and actors in the value chain.		
Sub- component 2.2 Investing in climate change adaptation				
17	The planning processes to be upgraded urgently to enable CCA and VC assessments as support to PY3 civil works.	- Organize the consultation workshop to finalize the implementation guidance for CIF in association with the commune SEDP formulation. - Clearly define the criteria for assessment of climate change adaptation and development of value chain in the selection of investment projects financed by CIF applicable to the 2nd year of project implementation.	PCU	Before Quarter 2/2015
18	Force account and community participation infrastructure procurement threshold of 30 000 USD to be raised to up to 60 000 USD. IFAD to amend the Letter to Borrower accordingly; F-A and community participation methods to be used for min. 60 %(BT) / 40% (TV) of investments.	- PCU shall formally deliver written proposal to IFAD to adjust the threshold that applies for the method of Force account from US\$30,000 up to < US\$60,000.	PCU and IFAD	4/2015
		- After the no objection letter by IFAD, PCU shall introduce to the communes and apply the method of FA and with the participation of the community for at least 60% of the total projects.		Since 5/2015
19	Training to be provided for the relevant project and government staff for the new procurement law.	PCU shall coordinate DPI to provide procurement professional training (procurement procedures, procurement methods) for 30 project commune staffs, project staff at all levels and relevant agencies.	PCU	5/2015
20	(i) CCA model replication strategy to be developed in close consultation with all relevant stakeholders, most importantly with the CFAF/CCA coordinators at the district level. (ii) Potential CCA models to be assessed and model-specific replication plans developed by interested agencies and enterprises, following a template by the PCU; (iii) CCA model ToTs and subsequent farmer-to-farmer trainings to be initiated in large scale.	- Finalize CFAF after the consultation workshop. - Develop the action plan to replicate the models based on the list of selected models. - Clarify the process for evaluation, selection and replication for the models and instruct the relevant parties.	PCU, DARD, DPCs and CPCc	Prior to 6/2015
		- TOT training, technical training for implementing the models and training in preparing the investment proposals before widely applying them in the field.		Since 6/2015
21	(i) CFAF/CCA investment proposal support officers to be selected at the district and commune levels; (ii) The support officers to be trained in investment planning as per CFAF/CCA application requirement; (iii) Farmer group investment planning trainings to be initiated, prior to CFAF/CCA grant competition.	- CDB, project commune coordinators, commune staffs and the mass organization staffs will directly support farmers groups / CIG in developing investment proposals, disburse, settlement procedures under CFAF financing. - Training on CFAF implementation process, the specific forms in the process of investment/ disbursement for CFAF sub-projects for commune and district staffs - Before deploying the CFAF competition, the districts shall provide training for specific potential target groups (regarding investment business planning, the necessary procedures for disbursement ...)	PCU, DPCs and CPCs	Prior to 9/2015
22	Initiation of the CFAF/CCA scheme by first grant competition round, using maximum 20% of the total available budget	Piloting the first round of financing in the districts under the AWPB 2015 budget; Additional budget can be adjusted to satisfy the actual need under progress of CFAF in the districts.	PCU, and the DPCs	From Quarter 3 to

				Quarter 4/2015
23	Competent national or international TA to assist in comprehensive evaluation of the first co-investments for lessons learnt.	Recruiting national or international consultants to support a comprehensive assessment of investments of CFAF to draw the lessons of experience. Conduct a comprehensive review and lesson learning from the first round of financing to revise properly.	PCU, and DPCs	Since Quarter 1/2016
24	Hold local commodity workshops and provincial PPP workshops for identification of potential partner enterprises. Discuss collaboration opportunities widely, including enterprise-led supplier and laborer trainings, infrastructure needs, improved access to finance/ land/ services and PPP co-financing.	- PCU shall review to identify local product value chains, potential partners and action plan for value chain development.	PCU, DOIT and enterprises	Since Quarter 2/2015
		- Dissemination of information about VCs and PPP, discuss and call for investment of PPP to potential enterprises.		
		- Discuss and agree on the collaboration with the partners.		
25	(i) Develop a comprehensive plan for enterprise support in business planning and preparation of PPP proposals; (ii) Assess the training needs of relevant staff in PPP proposal assessment; (iii) Strictly require detailed financial analysis of all PPP proposals to be approved, including assessment of business plan viability, and impact on household incomes.	- Complete manual and guide PPP implementation for project staff and related agencies; introduce PPP Fund to potential enterprises.	PCU, DOIT and FA	Quarter 2/2014
		- Evaluate the capacity training needs of the enterprise (training in business planning, project investment), training demand of the staffs of implementing partners (in appraisal and evaluation of investment proposals and analysis detailed financing, etc.).		Since Quarter 2/2015
		- Organize capacity training for enterprises and managers.		
26	(i) Initiate the first co-investment competition round, using maximum 20% of the total available budget; (ii) Draft comprehensive Value Chain Action Plans for all PPP value chains;	Piloting the first round of financing in the districts under the AWPB 2015 budget; Additional budget can be adjusted to satisfy the actual need under progress of PPP in the districts	PCU, DOIT and DARD	Quarter 3-4/2015
		Coordinating with the Department of Trade and Industry, Department of Agriculture and Rural Development to develop action plans for the VC to join PPP; introduce to the partners and businesses to implement the plan.		
27	Competent national or international TA to assist in comprehensive evaluation of the first co-investments for lessons learnt.	Conduct a comprehensive review and lesson learning from the first round of financing to revise properly.	PCU	Quarter 1/2016
Component 3				
28	Project orientation and planning: (i) Quarterly meetings to be held in each district with DPCs, involved provincial and district agencies and project communes to discuss project strategies, review implementation performance and agree follow-up actions and relevant AWPB adjustment. (ii) Approval process to be accelerated by authorizing the PD to approve modifications of AWPB if no change in level of IFAD and counterpart funding required.	See the item 5 under the main recommendations		
29	Project implementation arrangement/guidelines: PCUs to a workshop	- Share experiences between the two provinces Tra Vinh - Ben Tre on coordination mechanisms, management of AMD; Organizing Project Steering Committee meeting to discuss and clarify the	PSC, PCU	Since 4/2015

	to discuss and agree upon changes of project implementation mechanisms for (i) coordination among provincial line agencies and DPCs and CDBs; (ii) integration of AMD sub-components and with other programmes/projects; (iii) decentralization of resources to district/commune levels.	mechanism of coordination among provincial departments and DPCs in the implementation of project components, mechanism for integrating with other programs/projects. - PCU shall clearly define the project activities and properly allocated budget for provincial implementing partners. - Balance and allocate additional resources to districts and communes (focus on implementation and replication of models, adaptation value chain development and infrastructure)		
30	PCU capacity improvement: (i) Appoint a qualified Deputy Project Director in both PCUs, based on technical capacities; (ii) Recruit a Senior Technical Advisor on Agriculture and Climate Change Adaptation, based in Ben Tre but working for both provinces; (iii) Recruit a Senior Technical Advisor on Value Chains/PPP based in Tra Vinh but working for both provinces.	Coordinating with PCU Tra Vinh to conduct according the SM recommendations	PCU	Since 4/2015
31	Coordination at the local level: Engage DPC and CPC agencies in implementation of project instruments such as CCA, PPP, CFAF/CCA funds, and organize training courses accordingly.	- Enhancing the direction and coordination of DPCs and CPCs in implementation of project activities in the respective areas. - Districts and communes shall organize monthly meetings to review the progress and coordinate accordingly. - Organize trainings to enhance capacity in terms of leadership and management for top leaders at all levels.	PCU, DPCs and CPCs	Since Quarter 3/2015
32	Task-oriented allowance system: PCUs to discuss and initiate implementation of a task-oriented allowance system.	PCU shall made FMM manual adjustment; Clarify and determine the level of allowance based on each specific task to apply for the project implementation partners at the provincial, district and commune levels; PPC shall approve and issues throughout project management system.	PCU	4/2015
33	Two provinces develop a simple gender mainstreaming manual with clear instructions to involve and empower women in project activities. Tra Vinh province pays more attention to Khmer women. Two provinces, provide training courses following the manual	- Coordinate with Tra Vinh to develop a manual for gender mainstreaming, focusing on support for poor women-headed and more decision making empowered for women. - Introduce the Manual to the project implementing partners and the community and ensure the indicator regarding participation of women in project activities.	PCU	5/2015 Since 6/2015
Fiduciary aspects				
34	Counterpart Fund: Government to approve the full budget for project in 2015 as per the AWPB	AMD is allocated counterpart as per AWPB 2015.	PPC	Since 4/2015
35	Accounting software: to update and correct the software at the soonest possible	Review the operation of accounting software from communes to districts and province; coordinate with the supplier to update and revise all the errors to finalize and ensure proper working of the software.	PCU	Since 4/2015
36	Audit: Unaudited financial statement to be sent to IFAD	PCU shall finalize and submit the financial report 2014 to IFAD	PCU	Prior to April 015

Appendix 4: Physical progress measured against AWP&B, including RIMS indicators

(From 3/2015 to 02/2016)

TRA VINH

Objectives/Expected results	Indicators		Implementation Objectives						In which (people)			
	Project	RIMS	Approval total	AWPB 2015	Results Accumulated	% (Accumulation)	Results AWP B 2015	% (2015)	Women	Khmer	Poor and near poor	Enterprises
Component 1: Building Adaptive Capacity Objective: A comprehensive agriculture sector CC adaptation management framework operating with participating communities, institutions and provinces.	At least 30,000 people (Ben Tre: 15,000; Tra Vinh: 15,000) trained on climate-informed farming system and technology. (poverty/gender/ethnic).(**)		15,000	NT	290	-	290	-	83	191	204	-
		70% of households and agro-businesses in project communes able to articulate climate-informed SEDP. (poverty/gender/ethnic).(**)	NT	8,910	8,676	97.4%	8,676	97.4%	3,643	1,507	741	13
		At least 70% of farmers and aquaculturists registered with automated salinity monitoring system that use salinity updates for water-use decision making. (poverty/gender/ethnic).(**)	NT	NT	0	0%	0	-	-	-	-	-

			At least 8 different viable pro-poor climate resilient farming system packages , each adopted by more than 400 poor & near poor households	NT	NT	18	-	18	-	83	191	204	-
Subcomponent 1.1. Climate Change Knowledge Enhancement													
Output 1.1.1: Participative development of gender sensitive models for farmers & aquaculturists to formally engage in climate resilient, profitable, production.													
1.1.1.1	Review, selection of adaptive non-farm models		A list of selected models developed	NT	1	2	100%	1	100%	36	15	-	-
Output 1.1.1.2: Implementation of tested and upscale farming models under PAR method													
1.1.1.2.1	Consult communities using PAR tools for selection of adaptive models		Nr of workshop organized	NT	7	7	100%	7	100%	-	-	-	-
			Nr of participants	NT	601	601	100%	601	100%	132	108	-	-
1.1.1.2.2	Workshop to select models and topics that are climate resilient		Nr of workshop organized	NT	3	4	133%	3	100%	-	-	-	-
			Nr of participants	NT	240	297	124%	235	98%	83	17	-	-
1.1.1.2.3	Workshop to introduce selected livelihood models for further test and upscale in 30 project communes		Nr of workshop organized	NT	1	1	100%	1	100%	-	-	-	-
			Nr of participants	NT	80	75	94%	75	94%	75	19	5	-
1.1.1.2.5	Review tested and upscale farming		Nr of participatory surveys organized	NT	30	1	3%	1	3%	-	-	-	-

	models under PAR method		Nr of participants	NT	1,200	16	1%	16	1%	8	-	1	-
Output 1.1.1.3. Identify key topics for CC adaptive research and studies													
1.1.1.3.1	Workshop to introduce the CC adaptive research topics selected through PAR process to concerning agencies		Nr of workshops organized	NT	1	1	100%	1	100%	-	-	-	-
			Nr of participants	NT	150	25	17%	25	17%	8	-	-	-
Output 1.1.1.4. Value chain development planning, market accessing, economic analysing for integrating into SEDPs				1									
1.1.1.4.2	Contract TA to provide ToT training in value chain, marketing and collective economy		Procedure for contracting TA completed	NT	1	1	100%	1	100%	-	-	-	-
1.1.1.4.3	Conduct ToT training in value chain, marketing and collective economy	% people put skills and knowledge from the training into practices	Nr of workshop organized	NT	1	1	100%	1	100%	-	-	-	-
			Nr of participants	NT	30	31	103%	31	103%	7	-	-	-
1.1.1.4.4	Conduct training in value chain, marketing and collective economy	% participants understands the training contents	Nr of workshop organized	NT	30	31	103%	31	103%	-	-	-	-
			Nr of participants	NT	1,080	1,146	106%	1,146	106%	245	351	25	-
1.1.1.4.5	Contract TA to provide training in planning methods for value chain upgrading		Procedure for contracting TA completed	NT	1	1	100%	1	100%	-	-	-	-
1.1.1.4.6	Conduct training in planning methods for value chain upgrading (farm and non-farm models)	% staff put skills and knowledge from the training into practices	Nr of training organized	NT	8	9	113%	9	113%	-	-	-	-
			Nr of people trained	NT	316	287	91%	287	91%	100	24	-	-

1.1.1.4.7	Develop value chain upgrading plans (short chains) at the commune level (identify challenges and propose measures to improve the effectiveness of CC adaptive investments, including infrastructure for CC adaptation, CCA, PP-P,...)		Nr of meetings organized	NT	30	30	100%	30	100%	-	-	-	-
			Nr of participants	NT	1,080	1,243	115%	1,243	115%	239	391	15	-
1.1.1.4.8	Upgrade the current key value chains of the province and new comparative value chains (at the commune level) (targeting to have 6 value chains fully analyzed) in order to identify adaptive investments (infrastructure, CCA, PP-P...)		Nr of plans to upgrade the value chains approved	NT	TBM	6	30% (progresses)	6	30% (progress)	-	-	-	-
1.1.1.4.13	Trading promotion activities for rural agricultural products (market linkages, CCA, PP-P,...)		Nr of events organized	NT	TBM	7	NT	7	NT	-	-	-	-
			Nr of enterprises involved	NT	TBM	223	NT	223	NT	31	7	15	-
			Nr of participants	NT	630	601	95%	601	95%				
Output 1.1.3: Knowledge management and dissemination													
1.1.3.1	Systemize the knowledge outputs												
	- Monthly project updates on television		Nr of programs broadcasted	NT	12	15	125%	12	100%	-	-	-	-

	- Develop and disseminate publications about project		Nr of publications shared	NT	TBM	1	100%	1	100%	-	-	-	-
1.1.3.2(A WPB 2016)	Training of trainers (ToT)												
	Organize study tours		Nr of tours organized	NT	TBM	6	NT	4	NT	67	15	5	-
Sub-component 1.2: Climate informed SEDP planning													
Output 1.2.1: Preparation activities to integrate disaster risk reduction and community based adaptation into SEDPs													
1.2.1.1	Provide ToT training to increase awareness about community based disaster risk management	% staff put skills and knowledge from the training into practices	Nr of training organized	NT	1	1	100%	1	100%	-	-	-	-
			Nr of participants	NT	40	45	113%	45	113%	9	4	-	-
1.2.1.2	Provide training to increase awareness about community based disaster risk management for communities	% participants understands the training contents and increases their awareness	Nr of training organized	NT	98	52	53%	52	53%	-	-	-	-
			Nr of participants	NT	3,920	2,098	54%	2,098	54%	537	589	22	-
Output 1.2.2: The Provincial Department of Planning & Investment have guidelines and tools for market oriented, climate smart SEDP planning and the capacity to independently train district and commune staff in market oriented strategic planning													
1.2.2.1	Workshop to finalize the SEDP guidelines		SEDP guidelines finalized	NT	1	1	100%	1	100%	-	-	-	-

1.2.2.2	Contract TA to develop the guidelines for climate smart SEDP consolidation at the district level		The climate smart SEDP guidelines for district level drafted	NT	1	0,5	50%	0,5	50%	-	-	-	-
1.2.2.3	Organize a study tour to a province where the climate smart SEDP planning is well developed		Nr of tours organized	NT	1	1	100%	1	100%	-	-	-	-
			Nr of participants	NT	20	20	100%	20	100%	5	-	-	-
1.2.2.4	Provide ToT training in climate smart SEDP process	% staff put skills and knowledge from the training into practices	Nr of training organized	NT	2	2	100%	2	100%	-	-	-	-
			Nr of people trained	NT	60	53	88%	53	88%	15	-	-	-
1.2.2.5	Provide training in SEDP process for planning staff at commune level	% staff put skills and knowledge from the training into practices	Nr of training organized	NT	30	30	100%	30	100%	-	-	-	-
			Nr of people trained	NT	750	685	91%	685	91%	124	191	2	-
1.2.2.6	Carry out 2016 climate smart SEDP planning		Nr of people participating in SEDP meetings at commune level	NT	8,910	8,676	97%	8,676	97%	3,643	1,507	741	-
1.2.2.8	Workshop to review the commune SEDP process and finalize the guidelines		Nr of workshops organized	NT	1	1	100%	1	100%	-	-	-	-
			Nr of participants	NT	100	90	90%	90	90%	24	-	-	-
Output 1.2.3. Policy dialogues													
1.2.3.1	Review the action plan for the implementation of the NTP climate adaptation in Tra Vinh province (attached to the Decision No 264/QĐ-UBND) and develop CC adaptation plan 2016 – 2020 for Tra Vinh province		The action plan reviewed and modified	NT	1	0.28	28%	0.28	28%	-	-	-	-

1.2.3.3	National TA to develop the multi-parties coordination and management strategy		The multi-parties coordination and management strategy approved	NT	1	1	100%	1	100%	-	-	-	-
1.2.3.4	Contract TA to develop a website for CCCO		The website developed and staff trained in operation	NT	1	1	100%	1	100%	-	-	-	-
1.2.3.6	Procure equipment for the laboratory of the DONRE for water quality analysis		Equipment procured and staff trained in operation	1	1	1	100%	1	100%	-	-	-	-
1.2.3.7	Procure facilities and equipment for the CCCO		Equipment procured and staff trained in operation	1	1	2	100%	1	100%	-	-	-	-
1.2.3.8	Cover salaries and allowances of CCCO's staff		Timely support level from AMD to ensure proper operation of the CCCO	NT	NT	2	200%	1	100%	-	-	-	-
1.2.3.9	Cover the operation costs for the CCCO		Timely support level from AMD to ensure proper operation of the CCCO	NT	NT	2	200%	1	100%	-	-	-	-
Component 2: Investing in Sustainable Livelihoods - Objective: Increased and more inclusive financing for market oriented, climate smart agriculture and agri-business investments.		50% of households (who are in need of credit) in project communes are able to access credit for climate resilient farming activities		50%	NT	4.62/9,27 billion dong	50% of loans follows the purpose (including 1,959 /2,420 members)	4.62/9,27 billion dong	50%	2,095	989	823	-
			100 (BT: 50; TV:50) new enterprises/cooperatives at commune level (medium, small, micro) environmental sustainability in project communes remain	50	NT	-	NT	-	-	-	-	-	-

		profit operation after the project completion											
		Less than 5% non-performing loans in WU SCG portfolios	NT	NT	-	NT	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Sub-component 2.1: Rural finance for Resilient Livelihoods													
Output 2.1.1 Savings and Credit Groups established													
2.1.1.1	Introduce the Fund to commune and village authorities at 18 newly participating communes in 4 districts, including Cang Long, Chau Thanh, Tra Cu and Cau Ngang		Nr of training conducted	NT	22	22	100%	22	100%	-	-	-	-
			Nr of participants	NT	660	596	90%	596	90%	341	182	-	-
2.1.1.2	Provide TOT training in group and cluster forming, books and members management		Nr of training conducted	NT	1	1	100%	1	100%	-	-	-	-
			Nr of participants	NT	30	41	137%	41	137%	39	16	-	-
2.1.1.3	Provide training in the Fund's operation guidelines and the SCG establishment manual in districts and 18 participating communes		Nr of training conducted	NT	18	18	100%	18	100%	-	-	-	-
			Nr of participants	NT	540	451	84%	451	84%	323	170	-	-
2.1.1.5	Village meetings to Introduce the Fund to the target groups in 18 commune		Nr of training conducted	NT	155	154	99%	154	99%	-	-	-	-
			Nr of participants	NT	7,750	4,879	63%	4,879	63%	4,431	1,808	1,160	-

2.1.1.7	Print manuals and accounting books			NT	NT	1	100%	1	100%	-	-	-	-
Output 2.1.2: Women's Union Social Funds and/or transformed into viable Micro-Finance Institutions capable of financing private farmers, traders and commercial value chains													
2.1.2.1	Leverage capital for SCGs		Nr of SCGs receiving loans from the Fund	NT	320	353	110%	353	110%	-	-	-	-
			Nr of borrowers	NT	3,200	2,095	65%	2,095	65%	2,095	770	926	-
			Nr of savers	NT	TBM	2,420	NT	2,420	NT	-	-	-	-
			Value of gross loan portfolio	NT	TBM	8,731	NT	8,731	NT	-	-	-	-
2.1.2.2	Provide a ToT training in household economy management	% staff put skills and knowledge from the training into practices	Nr of training organized	NT	1	2	100%	1	100%	-	-	-	-
			Nr of people trained	NT	30	49	77%	23	77%	46	8	-	-
2.1.2.3	Training to increase capacity for borrowers in household economy management	% members put skills and knowledge from the training into practices	Nr of training organized	NT	322	30	9%	30	9%	-	-	-	-
			Nr of people trained	NT	9,660	914	9%	914	9%	914	-	238	-
2.1.2.4	Provide capacity building training for WDAF's staff at all levels	% staff put skills and knowledge from the training into practices	Nr of training organized	NT	5	4	80%	2	40%	-	-	-	-
			Nr of people trained	NT	130	97	75%	45	35%	95	13	-	-
2.1.2.5	Procure equipment for the Fund operation branches at 4 districts and a server for the head office		Equipment procured	7	4	5	125%	4	100%	-	-	-	-
2.1.2.6	Procure a management software for the Fund		A qualifying software procured	NT	1	0,5	50%	0,5	50%	-	-	-	-

2.1.2.8	Cover salaries and allowances for the staff of the Fund Office		Timely support level from AMD to ensure proper operation of the WDAF	NT	NT	2	100%	1	100%	-	-	-	-
2.1.2.9	Cover O&M costs for the Fund Office		Timely support level from AMD to ensure proper operation of the WDAF	NT	NT	2	100%	1	100%	-	-	-	-
2.1.2.10	Conference to summarize the implementation of the Fund		Nr of workshops organized	NT	3	2	67%	2	67%	-	-	-	-
			Nr of participants	NT	240	138	58%	138	58%	101	28	-	-
2.1.2.11	Study tours to other provinces		Nr of tours organized	NT	2	4	200%	2	100%	-	-	-	-
			Nr of participants	NT	40	42	105%	29	73%	41	8	-	-
Output 2.1.3. Farmers and agribusinesses can more easily access credit from diversified financial service													
Sub-component 2.2: Investing in Climate Change Adaptation													
Output 2.2.1: Climate resilient, risk reducing, small-scale commune works and infrastructure constructed													
2.2.1.1	Provide training in investment management and issues related to works construction for CPMUs	% staff put skills and knowledge from the training into practices	Nr of training organized	NT	3	3	100%	3	100%	-	-	-	-
			Nr of participants	NT	120	192	160%	192	160%	74	17	-	-
2.2.1.2	List of infrastructure works proposed by project communes			NT	1	1	100%	1	100%	-	-	-	-
2.2.1.3	Field visit to review the registered infrastructure works			NT	NT	1	100%	1	100%	-	-	-	-
2.2.1.4	Meetings to review the commune SEDPs to		Nr of meetings organized	NT	NT	30	100%	30	100%	-	-	-	-

	decide the infrastructure works and allocate the fund (CDF) competitively												
Output 2.2.2: Poor and near poor households can affordably invest in profitable climate adaptation technology													
2.2.2.1	Workshop at the provincial level to finalize the CCA manual		Nr of workshops organized	NT	1	1	100%	1	100%	-	-	-	-
			Nr of participants	NT	70	50	71%	50	71%	19	-	-	-
2.2.2.2	Provide training in identifying adaptive models and cost-benefit analysis	% staff put skills and knowledge from the training into practices	Nr of training organized	NT	2	1	50%	1	50%	-	-	-	-
			Nr of participants	NT	60	49	82%	49	82%	24	5	-	-
2.2.2.3	Workshop to introduce the CCA fund		Nr of workshops organized	NT	1	2	200%	2	200%	-	-	-	-
			Nr of participants	NT	70	189	270%	189	270%	75	14	-	-
2.2.2.4	Provide training in coordination skills for the Fund operation staff	% staff put skills and knowledge from the training into practices	Nr of training organized	NT	2	1	50%	1	50%	-	-	-	-
			Nr of participants	NT	140	49	35%	49	35%				
2.2.2.5	Provide training in how to develop sub-projects for potential households	% members put skills and knowledge from the training into practices	Nr of training organized	NT	14	14	100%	14	100%	-	-	-	-
			Nr of participants	NT	700	592	85%	592	85%	206	180	233	-
2.2.2.6	Introduce the CCA widely to targeting households and groups of farmers		Nr of events organized	NT	30	30	100%	30	100%	-	-	-	-
			Nr of participants	NT	2,100	2,124	101%	2,124	101%	670	995	604	-
2.2.2.8	CCA appraising boards, CPMUs, DPSTs organize field visits to review and appraise the sub-projects for CCA		Nr of tours organized	NT	TBM	7	100%	7	100%	-	-	-	-
			Nr of proposals reviewed	NT	TBM	56	100%	56	100%	56	11	-	-
2.2.2.9	Co-finance CC adaptive models		Nr of HHs and farmer groups granted and co-financed	NT	300	150	50%	150	50%	-	-	-	-
			Nr of beneficiaries	NT	NT	290	NT	290	NT	83	191	204	-
2.2.2.10	Training on skills of	% members put	Nr of training organized	NT	NT	28	NT	28	NT	-	-	-	-

	establishment, management, operation of groups/teams and book record (for grant receivers)	skills and knowledge from the training into practices											
			Nr of participants	NT	NT	290	NT	290	NT	83	191	204	-
Output 2.2.3: PP-C funds allocated competitively, enabling SMEs, CIGs & Co-ops to invest in sustainable, climate smart production & raise working standard and opportunities for labourers													
2.2.3.1	Workshop at the provincial level to finalize the PPP manual		Nr of workshops organized	NT	1	1	100%	1	100%	-	-	-	-
			Nr of participants	NT	70	57	81%	57	81%	15	3	-	-
2.2.3.2	Workshop to introduce the PPP Fund		Nr of workshops organized	NT	2	2	100%	2	100%	-	-	-	-
			Nr of participants	NT	140	86	84%	86	84%	30	5	-	48
2.2.3.4	Provide training in developing investment proposals for PPP potential enterprises	% staff put skills and knowledge from the training into practices	Nr of training organized	NT	1	1	100%	1	100%	-	-	-	-
			Nr of participants	NT	30	6	20%	6	20%	4	-	-	-
Component 3. Project Coordination: - Objective: Project activities being coordinated and implemented to achieve the its objectives and expected progress; ensure effective and efficient financial management; procure facilities and equipment in line with IFAD regulations; and maintain on-time reporting system													
Output 3.1: The project management system at all levels established													
3.1.1	PSC's periodic coordination meetings		Nr of meetings organized	NT	6	5	83%	2	33%	-	-	-	-

3.1.2 (AWPB 2016)	PCU's periodic coordination meetings		Nr of meetings organized	NT	12	6	50%	6	50%	-	-	-	-
3.1.5	Develop and publish project management regulations and guidelines,...		Nr of guideliness shared	NT	NT	8	NT	4	NT	-	-	-	-
3.1.6	Participate in training and workshops organized by IFAD and others		Nr of training/workshops organized	NT	TBM	69	NT	51	NT	-	-	-	-
Output 3.2: Necessary facilities and equipment for project management and implementation procured													
3.2.2	Procure facilities and equipment for project coordination and management units at all levels		% of procurement packages in compliance with IFAD regulations and expected progress	NT	27	27	100%	23	85%				
Output 3.3: The M&E system and reporting ensured in line with IFAD requirement													
3.3.1	Workshop to report participatory analysis and review findings of adaptive research topics		Nr of workshops organized	NT	1	1	100%	1	100%				
			Nr of participants	NT	70	49	70%	49	70%				
3.3.2	Provide training in M&E and report writing for project M&E staff at all levels and staff of project implementing agencies	% staff equipped with skills and knowledge to ensure the smooth implementation of tasks	Nr of training organized	NT	1	1	100%	1	100%	-	-	-	-
			Nr of participants	NT	60	57	95%	57	95%	28	4	0	0
3.3.4	Field visits to project communes and districts			NT	TBM	2	NT	2	NT				
	Result-based management training	% staff equipped with skills and	Nr of training organized	NT	NT	1	NT	1	NT	-	-	-	-

		knowledge to ensure the smooth implementation of tasks	Nr of participants	NT	NT	54	NT	54	NT	27	4	-	-
Output 3.4: Lessons learned, success cases and best practices shared and replicated				NT	NT								
3.4.1	Knowledge sharing events		Nr of projects and provinces visiting AMD for knowledge sharing	NT	NT	13	NT	9	NT	-	-	-	-
3.4.3 (AWPB 2016)	Take part in IFAD's annual Learning Route		Lessons learned applied in the project context	NT	1	2	200%	1	100%	-	-	-	-
3.4.5	Project newsletters			NT	NT	5	NT	4	NT	-	-	-	-
3.4.6	Provide training in archives for project staff	% staff equipped with skills and knowledge to ensure the smooth implementation of tasks	Nr of training organized	NT	1	1	100%	1	100%	-	-	-	-
			Nr of participants	NT	50	49	98%	49	98%	26	5	-	-
Output 3.5: Effective financial management, internal and independent auditing satisfactory to donor's requirements													
3.5.1	Training in financial management for project accounting staff	% accounting staff at all levels being able to well undertake the assigned tasks	Nr of training organized	NT	5	10	200%	5	100%	-	-	-	-
			Nr of participants	NT	140	361	258%	151	108%	151	84	20	-
3.5.2	Internal control		Nr of periodic internal control conducted	NT	2	3	150%	3	150%	-	-	-	-
3.5.3	Independent auditing		Nr of periodic independent auditing conducted	1	1	1	100%	1	100%	-	-	-	-

BEN TRE

Objectives/Expected results	Indicators		Targets					
	RIMS and logframe indicators	Project indicators	Total	Planned 2015	Cumulative achieved	(%) Cumulative	Achieved 2015	(%) 2015
1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9
Component 1: Building adaptive capacity Objective: A comprehensive agriculture sector CC adaptation management framework operating with participating communities, institutions of the province	No. of different viable pro-poor climate resilient farming system packages , each adopted by more than 400 poor & near poor households		4	NT				
	% of farmers and enterprises in project communes able to articulate climate-informed SEDP. (poverty/gender)		70%	NT				
	% of people registered with automated salinity monitoring system that use salinity updates for water-use decision making.		70%	NT				
Sub-Component 1.1: Climate change knowledge enhancement								
Output 1.1.1: Studies/farming models for climate resilient production developed	No. of climate resilient farming models particularly analyzed in terms of natural, economic and financial conditions.		TBM	NT	16		16	
	Main contents related to DRM/CC identified, then integrated into SEDP.		TBM	NT				
	% of trained people are able to apply knowledge to develop value chain development plan.		70%	NT				
	No. of value chains being implemented effectively.	No. of CC value chains identified.	4/6 vc	NT				
		No. of climate resilient farming models tested with suitable scale.	7	20	11	157%	11	55%
		No. of households participate in the test of climate resilient farming models.	280	TBM	192	69%	192	

		No. of people trained in value chain, market access, and economic analysis.	TBM	300	238		238	79%
1.1.1.1 Select climate resilient farming models in community for scale up in the service of poverty reduction; Examine new proposals to test the most suitable climate resilient farming models for applying in project area		Evaluation reports and shortlist approved	1	1	1	100%	1	100%
1.1.1.2 Organize the workshops on available applied studies for scaling-up and recommendations for new studies appropriate to ecological areas		No. of workshops organized		1	1		1	100%
		No. of participants		100	74		74	74%
1.1.1.3 Provide a TA for formulation of adaptive value chain plans for each district.		No. of consultant working months		8	2		2	25%
1.1.1.4 Enhance capacity on PAR/value chains/economic analysis for related stakeholders.		No. of trainings/workshop		6	5		5	83%
		No. of participants		300	238		238	79%
1.1.1.5 Implement applied studies and implement sustainable climate resilient models under PAR process for project communes.		No. of packages/models		20	11		11	55%
Output 1.1.2: A sustainable salinity monitoring system with web-based open source database established	Near real time updates from automated salinity monitoring system disseminated	An automatic water-quality monitoring system invested and put into use.	TBM	TBM				
	% of households using the water quality testing equipment for water-use decision making in their production practice		80%	NT				
		No. of households (groups) provided and trained in using the handled salinity monitoring equipment.	1.000	500	187	19%	187	37%
		Water quality testing equipment supplied.	TBM		187		187	
1.1.2.1 TA for formulating the economic-technical report/software of water quality and salinity monitoring investment project in Ben Tre and Tra Vinh (implement from 2015-2017)		No. of national and international consultant working months		8	2		2	25%
1.1.2.2 Select groups of community to pilot supply salinity monitoring manual tools in manufacturing area.		No. of HHs (groups) equipped handled tools.		500	187		187	37%

1.1.2.3 Organize consultation workshops on automatic salinity monitoring system.		No. of workshop		2	0		0	0%
		No. of participants		120	0		0	0%
1.1.2.4 Implement procurement packages for salinity monitoring system (advance liquidation, continue payment in 2016)		No. of selected tenders		3	0		0	0%
1.1.2.5 Enhance capacity on environment monitoring/natural disaster/ hydrometeorology forecast skills for related stakeholders.		No. of trainings/workshop		2	0		0	0%
		No. of participants		150	0		0	0%
Output 1.1.3: Climate change adaptation knowledge management and dissemination	No of successful researches/models published in scientific papers.	No. of peer-reviewed scientific papers/resilient models.	TBM	TBM	0		0	
		Turns of TOT trained	NT	120	90		90	75%
		Turns of people trained under FFS and others	NT	360	1579		1579	439%
1.1.3.1 Conduct training courses in skills and techniques for TOT.		No. of trainings courses		4	3		3	75%
		No. of participants		120	90		90	75%
1.1.3.2 Organize and participate in regional and national workshops/conferences/ events on knowledge management/up-scaling models/market.		No of workshop		4	0		0	0%
		No. of participants		100	0		0	0%
1.1.3.3 Knowledge management (KM): AMD related information dissemination; knowledge dissemination columns on climate change and sustainable livelihoods on local Newspapers and Television, open-air dissemination (visual posters/panels on climate change)		No. of service contract		3	4		3	100%
1.1.3.4 Provide training for community in CC basic knowledge/resilient solution for capacity enhancement.		No. of training courses		8	8		8	100%
		No. of participants		320	440		440	138%
1.1.3.5 Provide training for farmers on production techniques to apply in resilient models (FFS training).		No. of training courses		16	47		47	294%
		No. of participants		320	1579		1579	493%
1.1.3.6 Conduct regional study tours to learn CC adaptation experience and appropriate production models for all-level key staff and leaders		No. of study tours		2	0		0	0%
		No. of participants		40	0		0	0%
1.1.3.7 Compilation, documentation, printing and dissemination of successful models.		No of service contract		4	5		4	100%
Sub-Component 1.2: Climate-informed planning								
Output 1.2.1: Community based adaptation and disaster risk mitigation planning		Turns people trained in DRM/CC.	NT	TBM	347		347	

	% of trained people are able to apply knowledge to develop SEDP		70%	NT				
1.2.1.1 Conduct training courses in community based adaptation and disaster risk mitigation.		No. of training courses		4	11		11	275%
		No. of participants		300	347		347	116%
Output 1.2.2: Department of Planning and Investment have guidelines and tools to develop climate smart, market-oriented SEDP planning and the capacity to independently train commune and district staff in market-oriented strategic planning		DARD's & DoNRE's provincial-level CC Action Plans updated & integrated into sectorial priorities for the 2016-2020 and 2021-2024 SEDP.	6	TBM	3	50%	3	
		Turns of people trained in SEDP	NT	TBM	341		341	
	% of staff trained are knowledgeable about climate-informed market oriented SEDP process		70%	TBM				
		Turns of people participated in SEDP	TBM	TBM	5617		5617	
	% of SEDP ensures the efficiency on elements: (i) Adaptation to climate change, (ii) market		100%	NT	100%	100%	100%	
1.2.2.1 Provide TA for mainstreaming CC factors/indicators into commune MO-SEDPs and promulgate the guideline manuals.		No of consultants working months		5			0	0%
1.2.2.2 Organize the provincial workshop on quality of SEDP planning at all levels and integrating develop indicators; district SEDP 2016-2020 outline.		No of workshops		3	1		1	33%
		No. of participants		200	79		79	40%
1.2.2.3 Conduct training courses for TOT and commune and district planning staff on skills of analysis, SEDP planning and integrating develop indicators into SEDP.		No. of training courses		6	5		5	83%
		No. of participants		400	341		341	85%
1.2.2.4 Provide domestic and abroad trainings in leadership and management for leaders, key stakeholders at all levels; to combine study tours to learn experiences of agriculture and rural development models and CC; trainings in attracting investment in rural area (PPP)		No. of training courses/ study tours		4	9		9	225%
		No. of participants		220	624		624	284%
1.2.2.5 Hold (workshops/meetings) to select adaptive CC priority lists for communes to develop SEDP 2016.		No. of communes implemented		30	30		30	100%
		No of participants		5000	5617		5617	112%

1.2.2.6 Organize conference/forum for dialogue and formulate participatory, market oriented and adaptive SEDP.		No of events		4	10		10	250%
1.2.2.7 Provide TA to update and integrate CC factors/indicators into 5 year 2016-2020 plan of DONRE; and conduct workshop for finalizing plans		Plan updated		1	1		1	100%
1.2.2.8 Provide TA to update and integrate CC factors/indicators into 5 year 2016-2020 plan of DARD; and conduct workshop for finalizing plans		Plan updated		1	1		1	100%
1.2.2.9 Provide TA to update and integrate CC factors, develop indicators into 5 year 2016-2020 SEDP; and conduct workshop for finalizing plans.		No of national consultants working months		6	0		0	0%
1.2.2.10 Formulate communal-level market-oriented and participatory SEDP 2016 in AMD areas (include activities of SEDP formulation in 30 communes of AMD)		30 SEDPs of 30 project communes		30	60		30	100%
Output 1.2.3: Policy dialogues on pro-poor CC adaptation agricultural and rural development organized	Pro-poor CC adaptation rural agricultural strategies developed.		NT	TBM	0		0	
		No of trainings/ workshop/events on CC policy.	TBM	NT	0		0	
		Turns of people trained.	TBM	NT	0		0	
1.2.3.1 Provide TA for CCCO to develop coordination and adaptation management strategy (formulate, review plans, scenarios ...)		No of packages	1	1	0	0%	0	0%
		No of consultants working months		6	0		0	0%
1.2.3.2 Organize workshops/conferences in CC adaptation in agriculture and pro-poor economic development policy in environment, agricultural and rural fields.		No of workshops		3	0		0	0%
1.2.3.3 Provide TA for formulate plans and database on poverty reduction.		Lump sum (million VND)		200	180		180	90%
Component 2: Investing in sustainable livelihoods Objective: Increased sustainability and effectiveness of CC adaptation investments	% max non-performing loans in WU SCG portfolios		5%					
	% of rural HHs with increased income of at least 30% from wage and non-farm-sector employment		30%					

	New enterprises / cooperatives environmental sustainability remain profit operation after the project completion.		50					
		% of households (in need of credit) in project communes are able to access credit for climate resilient farming activities	50%					
Sub- component 2.1 Rural finance for resilient livelihoods								
Output 2.1.1 New WU's Savings and Credit Groups established		No of SCGs established	580	100	726	125%	726	726%
		No of SCGs' members participated	5800	700	2901	50%	2901	414%
2.1.1.1 Organize training courses in SCG and social fund's branch management at all districts.		No of trainings		8	21		21	263%
		No. of participants		800	1235		1235	154%
2.1.1.2 Organize training courses for poor and difficult women in project communes on using loans effectively.		No of trainings		30	28		28	93%
		No. of participants		1200	1259		1259	105%
2.1.1.3 Establish new SCG in project communes.		No of new SCG established		100	726		726	726%
Output 2.1.2: Current credit network of WU's Social Fund transformed into viable Micro-Finance Institutions capable of financing private farmers, traders and commercial value chains	MFI established		1	NT	0		0	
2.1.2.1 Provide TA for WU to develop micro-finance development strategy, capacity and institutional building.		No of consultant working months		2	1		1	50%
2.1.2.2 Organize trainings in financial skills for Social Fund's staff (loan appraisal, risk management etc.)		No of trainings		4	3		3	75%
		No. of participants		120	46		46	38%
2.1.2.3 Organize study tours to learn micro-finance institution management experience in domestic and foreign countries.		No. of study tours		2	1		1	50%
		No. of participants		50	40		40	80%
2.1.2.4 Procurement of equipment for district branch		Procured package		1	1		1	100%
Output 2.1.3: Farmers and agribusinesses can more easily access credit from diversified financial service providers through co-financing for adaptation and value chain investments	% value of loans of SCGs used for climate-smart farming systems		50%	1				
	% of rural finance disbursed		100%	TBM				
		No of people accessed credit	TBM	TBM	2897		2897	
2.1.3.1 Provide loans for new SCGs.		WA approved		1	1		1	100%

2.1.3.2 Organize the inter-provincial pro-agri-rural finance workshop (connect all stakeholders in banking and finance sector for development agenda)		No of workshops		2	1		1	50%
		No. of participants		100	3		3	3%
Sub-component 2.2 Investing in climate change adaptation								
Output 2.2.1: Climate resilient, risk mitigation, small-scale commune works and infrastructure constructed		No of works invested	TBM	10	10		10	100%
		No of amount invested in resilient infrastructure (USD1,000)	5.000	400	448	9%	448	112%
		No of beneficiaries	TBM		9.281		9.281	
		% of beneficiaries confirms the relevance & effectiveness of project financed commune works and investments.	80%					
		Area of aquacultural and agricultural production irrigated and protected from salinity intrusion	NT					
		Productivity and yield increased	NT					
		Increased market access level	NT					
2.2.1.1 Implement rural infrastructure work using CIF in project communes through Mo-SEDP formulation exercises.		No of works invested		10	10		10	100%
2.2.1.2 Organize trainings for commune project owners and related stakeholders on CIF regulation; procurement procedures, process and bidding		No of trainings		3	2		2	67%
		No. of participants		250	240		240	96%
2.2.1.3 Organize trainings for the community on community supervision and building under FA mode.		No of trainings		4	0		0	0%
		No. of participants		400	0		0	0%
2.2.1.4 Organize national study tours to learn commune investment and new rural development experiences.		No of study tours		9	8		8	89%
Output 2.2.2: Poor and near poor households can affordably invest in profitable climate adaptation technology		No of households (50% of poor and near poor households) co-financed.	1500	40	212	14%	212	530%
		No of CFAF amount invested in co-financing for climate change adaptation. (USD1,000)	2200	195	220	10%	220	113%

		% people (groups) trained are able to prepare business proposals.	2000	320	0	0%	0	0%
	No of people provided with skills on preparing sub-projects/business plans.		70%					
	No of amount contributed by beneficiaries (USD1,000)		2200	98	100	5%	100	102%
	No of households replicate CCA model		5000	60	0	0%	0	0%
2.2.2.1 Select feasible and pro-poor applications to implement and finance approved applications of CFAF.		No of amount invested (CFAF funding and counterpart funding).		195	220		220	113%
2.2.2.2 Organize workshops to disseminate and guidance for preparing proposals/ business plans for CFAF.		No of workshops		16	30		30	188%
		No. of participants		800	1495		1495	187%
2.2.2.3 Organize trainings in establishing proposals for financing/business plans.		Number of trainings		16	0		0	0%
		No. of participants		320	0		0	0%
2.2.2.4 Organize domestic study tour on management and implementation the CFAF.		No of study tours		5	4		4	80%
		No. of participants		250	170		170	68%
Output 2.2.3: P-PP fund allocated competitively, enabling SMEs, CIGs & Co-ops to invest in sustainable, climate-sensitive production & raise working standard and opportunities for laborers		No of amount invested in PPP. (USD1,000)	900	0	0	0%	0	
	No of amount contributed by enterprises. (USD1,000)		940	0	0	0%	0	
		No of SMEs (each SME provides services for at least 100 households) provided information and market linkage better on the input and output of climate-informed value chains	25	NT	0	0%	0	
		No of households benefited from PPP models.	1800	NT	0		0	
		No of sustainable jobs generated from PPP models.	150	NT	0		0	
		No of workshops promoting value chain SP and business linkage	TBM	4	1		1	25%
	% people trained in vocational skills having stable jobs (for at least 6 months).		50%	NT				

	Numbers of contract farming between farmers and enterprises signed		TBM	NT				
2.2.3.1 Select the proposals under PPP, approve and disburse applications approved by PPP.		No of amount invested in PPP (PPP funding and counterpart funding). (USD1,000)		148	0		0	0%
2.2.3.2 Conduct workshops to disseminate and call for PPP to SMEs and co-operatives.		No of workshops		4	0		0	0%
		No. of participants		400	0		0	0%
Output 2.2.4 Lack of production land laborers received vocational training for employment and income	% labors in vocational skills having stable jobs (for at least 6 months)		50%	NT				
2.2.4.1 Conduct vocational trainings (pilot support the SMEs for vocational trainings in combination with recruiting workers for their SMEs; support CIG for job creation for rural labors ...)		No of vocational trainings		18	14		14	78%
		No. of participants		360	288		288	80%
Output 2.2.5 A center for testing and examination of shrimp seed quality established		A center established and put into use since PY3.	1	NT	0	0%	0	
2.2.5.1 Need assessment to formulate Aquaculture baby shrimp and breeding Certification Center.		No of consultants working months		4	1		1	25%
Component 3. Project coordination: - Objective: Project activities coordinated and implemented to achieve its objectives and progress; ensure effective financial management, well-conducted procurement and on time reporting		Number of people trained in project management	NT	300	152		152	51%
Output 3.1 Project management organization at all levels established		% female project staff at all levels	50%	50%				
3.1.1 Hold Provincial Project Steering Committee's periodic meetings/ inter-provincial meetings twice a year.		No. of meetings		5	4		2	40%
3.1.2 Repair and upgrade PCU office		No. of packages		1	0		0	0%
3.1.3 Procure equipment for PCU and key participating parties		No. of packages		1	1		1	100%
Output 3.2 Capacity of project management staff developed and enhanced	% project staff at all levels satisfied the job requirements		100%	TBM				
3.2.1 Organize bi-annual/annual progress assessment workshop and project AWPB deploying workshop.		No. of workshop		2	1		1	50%

3.2.2 Participate in workshops/events organized by IFAD within and outside the country		No of events		2	3		3	150%
3.2.3 Organize and participate in study events between IFAD projects		No of events được thực hiện		2	1		1	50%
3.2.4 Organize and participate workshop/meeting to discuss project inter-provincial implementation approach and strategy between Ben Tre and Tra Vinh		No of workshops		4	0		0	0%
		No. of participants		60	0		0	0%
3.2.5 Trainings in project management (project coordination skills, leadership, management skill; financial management, accounting, gender issues, etc.) for key stakeholders.		No. of training courses		5	4		4	80%
		No. of participants		200	152		152	76%
Output 3.3 The M&E system established and effectively operate		% M&E reports timely developed	100%	100%	100%		100%	100%
3.3.1 Organize annual survey		No. of survey	4	1	0		0	0%
		No. of consultant working months		1	0		0	0%
3.3.2 Organize training courses for M&E staff at all levels		No. of training courses		3	0		0	0%
		No. of participants		100	0		0	0%
Output 3.4 Internal and independent auditing in line with IFAD requirements	% project communes having satisfactory financial statements		100%					
		No. of independent audit reports satisfied	6	NT	0	0%	0	
3.4.1 Conduct financial audit 2014.		No. of consultancy packages	6	1	0	0%	0	0%
3.4.2 Organize internal control group.		No. of times of internal control		2	1		1	50%
Output 3.5 Operation cost of project coordination units at all levels	% of project management units at all levels timely settle the recurrent cost		90%	NT				
3.5.1 Salaries and allowances for project staff at provincial levels		Lump sum (million VND)		7.730	7.316		7.260	94%

Appendix 5: Financial: Actual financial performance by financier: component and disbursement by category

BEN TRE and TRA VINH

Table 5A: Financial performance by financier (USD '000) as of 29/02/2016

Financier	Approval (USD'000)	Disbursements (USD '000)	Per cent disbursed (%)
IFAD loan	22,060	2,062	9.35%
IFAD grant	12,035	678.22	5.64%
GOV	7,644	713.71	9.34%
Beneficiaries	7,768	103.8	1.34%
Total	49,507	3,558	7.19%

BEN TRE

Table 5A: Financial performance by financier (USD '000) as of 29/02/2016

Financier	Approval (USD'000)	Disbursements (USD '000)	Per cent disbursed (%)
IFAD loan	10,930	1,038.1	9.5%
IFAD grant	6,002	408.8	6.8%
Government of Vietnam	3,844	336.4	8.8%
Beneficiaries	3,884	103.8	2.7%
Total	24,660	1,887	7.7%

Table 5B: Financial performance by financier by component (USD '000) as of 29/02/2016

	IFAD loan			IFAD grant			Government			Beneficiaries			Total		
Component	Approval	Actual	%	Approval	Actual	%	Approval	Actual	%	Approval	Actual	%	Approval	Actual	%
I	808.0	0.0	0.0	4,525.0	255.8	5.7	1,030.0	0.4	0.0				6,363	256	4
II	7,730.0	657.2	8.5	679.0	146.8	21.6	1,596.0	133.7	8.4	3,510.0	103.8	2.7	13,515	1,042	7.7
III	1,307.0	380.9	29.1	196.0	6.13	3.1	675.0	202.2	30	374.0			2,552	589	23.1
Unallocated	1,085.00		-	602.0		0.0	543.00	-	-	-	-	-	2,230		
Total	10,930	1,308	9.5%	6,002	408.8	6.8%	3,844	336.4	8.8%	3,884	0	2.7	24,660	1,887	7.7

Table 5C: IFAD Loan disbursements (SDR) as of 29/02/2016

Category	Category description	Original (SDR)	Disbursement (SDR)	W/A pending (SDR)	Balance (SDR)	Per cent disbursed (%)
		Allocation				
I	Work	1,330,000		124,673	1,205,327	9.37
II	Equipment and Material	260,000	41,468	37,013	181,329	30.2
III	Consultancies	430,000	42,528	0	387,472	9.9
IV	Training	800,000	33,947	57,603	708,451	11.44
V	Credit, Guarantee Funds	1,050,000		279,081	770,919	26.6
VI.A	Grants and Subsidies A (Co-financing fund for adaptation)	1,010,000			1,010,000	0
VI.B	Grants and subsidies B	580,000			580,000	0
VII	Operating Costs	380,000	15,608	19,425	344,967	9.22
VIII	Salary and Allowances	560,000	51,429	42,377	466,193	16.75
	Unallocated	700,000			700,000	0
	Initial deposit		793,259		-793,259	
	Total	7,100,000.0	978,429	560,172	6,354,658	21.67

Table 5C: IFAD Grant Disbursements (SDR, as of 29/02/2016)

Category	Category description	Original (SDR)	Disbursement (SDR)	W/A pending (SDR)	Balance (SDR)	Per cent disbursed (%)
		Allocation				
II	Equipment and Material	300,000		2,727	297,273	1
III	Consultancy	1,010,000		57,492	952,508	5.69
IV	Training	1,610,000		156,055	1,453,945	9.69
VI.A	Grants and Subsidies A (Co-financing fund for adaptation)	440,000	75,856		364,144	17.24
VII	Operating Costs	140,000			140,000	0
	Unallocated	390,000			390,000	0
	Initial deposit		406,574		-406,574	
	Total	3,890,000.0	406,574	292,130	3,191,296	7.51

TRA VINH

Table 5A: Financial performance by financier (USD '000) as of 29/02/2016

Financier	Approval (USD '000)	Disbursements (USD '000)	Per cent disbursed (%)
IFAD loan	11,130	1,023.90	9.2%
ASAP grant	6,033	269.42	4.47%
Government Vietnam	3,800	377.31	9.93%
Beneficiaries	3,885	0	0
Total	24,848	1,671	6.72%

Table 5B: Financial performance by financier by component (USD '000) at 29/02/2016

Component	IFAD loan			IFAD grant			Government Viet nam			Beneficiaries			Total		
	Approval (TV)	Actual	%	Approval (TV)	Actual	%	Approval (TV)	Actual	%	Approval (TV)	Actual	%	Approval	Actual	%
I	909			5,028	243.7	4.85	1,161	13.67	1.2				7,098	257.37	3.63
II	8,723	530.40	6.08	750			1,817	16.84	1	3,885			11,330	547.24	4.83
III	1,498	493.50	32.95	254	25.72	10.1	782	346.80	44.3				2,534	866.02	34.2
Unallocated															
Total	11,130	1,0234	9.2	6,033	269.42	4.47	3,800	377.31	9.9	3,885			24,848	1,670.63	6.72

Table 5C: IFAD Loan disbursements (SDR '000) as of 29/02/2016

Category	Category description	Original	Disbursement	WA Pending	Balance	Per cent disbursed
		Allocation				
I	Works	1,340.00			1,340.00	
II	Equipment and Material	260.00	61.65	33.67	164.68	36,66%
III	Consultancies	430.00	5.67	3.89	420.44	2,22%
IV	Training	870.00	61.72	27.36	780.92	10,24%
V	Credit, Guarantee Funds	1,050.00	95.26	183.65	771.09	26,56%
VI-A	Grants and Subsidies - A	1,020.00			1,020.00	
VI-B	Grants and Subsidies - B	590.00			590.00	
VII	Operating Costs	350.00	77.41	30.99	241.60	30,97%
VIII	Salaries and Allowances	640.00	99.08	34.59	506.33	20,89%
	Unallocated	700.00			700.00	
	Initial Deposit		1,066.74		-1,066.74	
	Total	7,250.00	1,467.53	314.15	5,468.32	24.5%

Table 5C: ASAP Grant disbursement (SDR '000) as of 29/02/2016)

Category	Category description	Original Allocation	Disbursement	WA Pending	Balance	Per cent disbursed
I	Works					
II	Equipment and Material	300.00	12.05	14.15	273.80	8,73%
III	Consultancies	1,010.00	11.77	31.08	967.16	4,24%
IV	Training	1,610.00	106.05	10.46	1,493.49	7,24%
VI-A	Grants and Subsidies - A	440.00			440.00	00%
VII	Operating Costs	140.00	0.99	0.52	138.49	1,08%
VIII	Salaries and Allowances	30.00	2.10	0.70	27.21	9,32%
	Unallocated	400.00			400.00	
	Initial Deposit		350.6		-350.6	
	Total	3,930.00	483.56	56.91	2,389.53	14%

Appendix 6: Compliance with legal covenants: Status of implementation

Section	Covenants	Target/ Action due date	Status	Remarks
Financing Agreement. Section B.7 a	Designated account:) In each Province of the Project Area, there shall be two (2) designated accounts (DAs) (collectively referred to as the "Designated Accounts"), opened and operated by the Ministry of Finance (MOF) of the Borrower/Recipient in accordance with Section 4.04(d) of the General Conditions in a bank acceptable to the Fund, for receiving and holding the Loan and Grant proceeds in USD. All accounts shall be protected against set-off, seizure or attachment on terms and conditions proposed by the Borrower/Recipient and accepted by the Fund		Complied	TV has opened two bank accounts for receiving the IFAD Loan and ASAP grant proceeds denominated in USD. These accounts are under MoF's administration. BT has opened two bank accounts for receiving the IFAD Loan and ASAP grant proceeds denominated in USD. These accounts are under MoF's administration.
Financing Agreement. Section B.7 b	Project Accounts shall be opened and maintained in local currency to receive and hold financing transferred from the Designated Accounts at the same provincial commercial bank for the Project operation. The Project Accounts shall be operated by each PCU.		Complied	Project accounts have been opened at State Treasury
Letter to the borrower. Para 24	Procurement methods will depend on the nature of the expenditure and the estimated value of the related contract. The following are the methods for work and goods packages: (i) National competitive bidding applied for packages with estimated cost equivalent or exceeding USD 60,000; (ii) Local competitive bidding applied for packages with estimated cost less than USD 60,000; (iii) Procurement with community participation or Force Account applied for infrastructure schemes that can use intensive un-skilled labour and simple techniques such as concrete roads, lined canals, storages, etc. with the estimated cost less than USD 30,000; (iv) Direct contracting could be applied for very small packages with estimated cost less than USD 5,000.		Complied	

Section	Covenants	Target/ Action due date	Status	Remarks
Letter to the borrower. Para 25	Methods for selecting consultants under the AMD include (i) Quality and Cost Based Selection applied for service packages with estimated cost equivalent to or exceeding USD 30,000; (ii) Select Based on Consultants' Qualifications applied for service packages with estimated cost less than USD 30,000; (iii) Single Source Selection could be applied only in exceptional circumstances and shall be approved by IFAD in the procurement plan.		Complied	
Letter to the borrower. Para 26	For the purposes of IFAD's Project Procurement Guidelines, the following shall be subject to prior review by the Fund: (a) Award of any contract for goods and work estimated to cost USD 60 000 or more; (b) Award of any contract for consulting services estimated to cost USD 30 000 or more.		Complied	
Letter to the borrower. Para 28	All contracts, with or without prior IFAD approval, shall be listed in the Register of Contracts with the dates of approval. The Register shall be updated and submitted to the IFAD on a six-monthly basis		Complied	
Financing Agreement. Section B.8	Counterpart financing: The Borrower/Recipient shall cause the Lead Project Agencies to provide counterpart financing for the Project.		Complied	
Financing Agreement. Section B.9	Procurement of goods, works and consulting services financed by the Financing shall be carried out in accordance with the provisions of the Fund's "Procurement Guidelines" approved by the Fund's Executive Board in September 2010, ("The Procurement Guidelines").		complied	
Financing Agreement. Section E.2.a	The PCUs shall have been duly established		Complied	
Financing Agreement. Section E.2.b	The Project Implementation Manual shall have been developed by each PCU and adopted by the PPC and is acceptable to the Fund		Complied	

Section	Covenants	Target/ Action due date	Status	Remarks
Financing Agreement. Section E.2.c	The Project Steering Committees (PSCs) shall have been duly established in Ben Tre and Tra Vinh Provinces.		Complied	
Financing Agreement. Section E.2.d	The Project Directors and Project Accountants shall have been duly appointed.		Complied	
Financing Agreement. Section E.2.g	A computerized Accounting System has been identified for the Project by the PCUs.		Complied	

Appendix 7: Knowledge management: Learning and Innovation

Learning

CFAF/CCA Fund: The CFAF/CCA fund is to co-finance investment into upgraded production systems, enabling increased income and climate change resilience of the rural households. The co-financing amount of 2.2 million USD is to be distributed to minimum 1500 beneficiary households in each province, through a competitive grant mechanism. Important lessons arise from the first competition round: (i) Most farmers did not develop their own investment plans due to insufficient quality/volume of coaching and unrealistic expectations for proposal quality. Instead, the support staff have developed plans on behalf of the farmers, causing high transaction cost and limitations in learning/empowerment of the farmer households; (ii) Large part of the CCA/CFAF co-investments have been by individual households, supporting only one family, which limits the outreach of the CCA/CFAF fund and leaves the group collaboration and joint investment aspect with lesser importance; (iii) The best farmers' practical capacities were not yet utilized for a full scale farmer-to-farmer training programme; (iv) Some investment models especially cow breeding are popular however had high initial investment costs and relatively low cost-efficiency. High efficiency and CCA innovative investments should be prioritized; (v) The unexpectedly serious drought and salinity intrusion of early 2016 could not be managed by many farmers and the range of models could not yet provide for a sufficient solution to overcome the extreme conditions. Per the crisis experience, non-agricultural models are the most efficient, and for the agricultural models, a water management solution needs to be included in co-investments as appropriate. Also, the CC-affected poor farmers cannot currently contribute the required 20% beneficiary in-cash contribution; (vi) In Tra Vinh, the disbursement of the funds by the farmers was slow due to procedural difficulties especially those related to overly detailed investment plans which required lengthy amendment process.

Innovation: Describe any interesting innovation noted during supervision

Water salinity, Climate Change Risks and adaptation solutions in Mekong Delta context:

El Nino draughts 2016 caused severe damage in AMD provinces. Nearly all surface waters are salinated and households lack fresh water for family consumption, crop irrigation and animals. In Ben Tre for example, the water supply was impaired for 88,000 households, 19,744 hectares of agricultural land was devastated, including all rice and large parts of vegetables, ornamental trees, fruits and aquaculture.

AMD introduces an innovative and comprehensive set of instruments for the provinces to adapt to this change of climatic conditions. The first area of work is to develop a salinity monitoring and forecasting system that provides timely water quality information for government agencies, farmers, planners and researchers. With such information, farmers will be able to make better-informed decisions on farm operations and planning. Handheld salinity sensors are also being distributed for local level monitoring. Secondly, a range of relevant institutions is engaged to research and develop agricultural models that can survive the increasing salinity levels in the surface waters. The models are developed so that they are financially viable and socially/environmentally sustainable and mass-scale training programmes are rolled out to facilitate broad adoption of improved practices..

Based on the information provided by the salinity monitoring mechanism and CC adaptation research/development, the project introduces a comprehensive province-wide Climate Informed Planning mechanisms as follows: (a) Commune level Climate-informed SEDP planning implemented annually; (b) Climate-informed provincial SEDP plans developed for 5-year periods; (c) Climate change policy dialogues between all stakeholders facilitated. Based on the climate-informed planning mechanisms, the investment funds PPP, CIF and CCA/CFAF are used to invest in water supply and storage solutions for agricultural and domestic use, development of adapted and alternative livelihoods, and for introduction of private sector to speed up economic development and income generation opportunities in non-farming economy.

Such comprehensive mechanism which includes monitoring, research, development, planning and investment enables a sustainable and effective adaptation process in the Mekong Delta.
