

Republic of India

Jharkhand Tribal Empowerment & Livelihoods Project

Supervision report

Main report and appendices

Mission Dates: 29 November – 12 December 2015
Document Date: 28 January 2016
Project No. 1649
Report No: 4002-IN

Asia and the Pacific Division
Programme Management Department

Table of Contents

Abbreviations and acronyms	iii
A. Introduction	5
B. Overall assessment of project implementation	5
Overall implementation progress	5
Likelihood of achieving the development objectives	6
C. Outputs and outcomes	6
Components	6
D. Project implementation progress	9
Quality of project management	9
Performance of M&E	11
Coherence between AWPB & implementation	11
Gender focus	12
Poverty focus	12
Effectiveness of targeting approach	12
Convergence	13
Innovation and learning	13
Climate and environment focus	14
E. Fiduciary aspects	14
Quality of financial management	14
Acceptable disbursement rate	15
Counterpart funds	15
Compliance with loan covenants	16
Compliance with procurement	16
Quality and timeliness of audits	16
F. Sustainability	17
Institution building	17
Empowerment	17
Quality of beneficiary participation	17
Responsiveness of service providers	17
Exit strategy	17
Potential for scaling-up and replication	17
G. Other	17
Physical/financial assets	17
Food security	17
Quality of natural asset improvement and climate resilience	17
H. Conclusion	18

Appendices

Appendix 1:	Summary of project status and ratings	5
Appendix 2:	Updated logical framework: Progress against objectives, outcomes and outputs	Error! Bookmark not d
Appendix 3:	Summary of key actions to be taken within agreed timeframes	27
Appendix 4:	Physical progress measured against AWP&B, including RIMS indicators	31
Appendix 5:	Financial: Actual financial performance by financier; by component and disbursements by category	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Appendix 6:	Compliance with legal covenants: Status of implementation	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Appendix 7:	Knowledge management: Learning and Innovation	41

Abbreviations and acronyms

AOS	Annual Outcome Survey
APD	Additional Project Director
AWPB	Annual Work Plan and Budget
BDO	Block Development Officer
BoD	Board of Directors
BPL	Below the Poverty Line
CF	Community Facilitators
CRP	Community Resource Persons
DGS&D	Director General of Supplies & Disposal
DoRD	Department of Rural Development
DoW	Department of Welfare
DPCC	District Project Coordination Committees
DPMU	District Project Management Units
DRDA	District Rural Development Agency
EPA	Entry Point Activity
FAM	Finance and Administration Manager
FAO	Finance & Admin Officer
FNGOs	Facilitating NGOs
GoJ	Government of Jharkhand
GSPEC	Gram Sabha Project Execution Committee
GSRMLP	Gram Sabha Resource Management and Livelihood Plans
HH	Households
HR	Human Resources
ICO	India Country Office
IEC	Information, Education and Communication
IFAD	International Fund for Agriculture Development
IFPRI	International Food Policy Research Institute
IGA	Income Generating Activities
INR	Indian Rupee
INRM	Integrated Natural Resource Management
ISM	Implementation Support Mission
JRM	Joint Review Mission
JSLPS	Jharkhand State Livelihood Promotion Society
JSRLM	Jharkhand State Rural Livelihood Mission
JTDP	Jharkhand Tribal Development Project
JTDS	Jharkhand Tribal Development Society
JTELP	Jharkhand Tribal Empowerment and Livelihoods Project
KM	Knowledge Management
MGNREGA	Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employee Guarantee Act
MGNREGS	Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employee Guarantee Scheme
MIS	Management Information System
MoF	Ministry of Finance
NRLM	National Rural Livelihood Mission
PESA	Panchayat (Extension to Scheduled Areas) Act, 1996
PF	Provident Fund
PFS	Project Financial Statement
PIM	Project Implementation Manual
PME	Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation
PTG	Particularly Vulnerable Tribal Groups
QCBS	Quality and Cost Based System

RIMS	Results Impact Measurement System
SCA	Special Component Assistance
SDR	Special Drawing Rights
SHG	Self Help Group
SOE	Statement of Expenditure
SPCC	State Project Coordination Committee
SPD	State Project Director
SPMU	State Project Management Unit
ST	Scheduled Tribes
TRI	Tribal Research Institute
TSA	Technical Support Agencies
TSP	Tribal Sub Plan
USD	United States Dollar
VDF	Village Development Fund
WA	Withdrawal Application
YG	Youth Group
<i>Gram Sabha</i>	Assembly of all adults in a village
<i>Panchayat</i>	Elected Local Governance Body in Rural Areas
<i>Tola</i>	Hamlet

A. Introduction¹

1. IFAD fielded a Joint Review Mission (JRM) during 29 November-12 December 2015 to jointly review the overall performance of the Jharkhand Tribal Empowerment and Livelihoods Project (JTELP) and its achievements since the previous joint review during 8-16 December 2014. Following a meeting with the State Project Management Unit (SPMU) staff at Ranchi on 30 November 2015, the Mission visited 13 villages, including two Particularly Vulnerable Tribal Group (PTG) villages in nine blocks in seven project districts, Khunti, Gumla, Ranchi, Simdega, Dumka, Godda and Sahibganj during 30 November to 5 December 2015 (6 field days) accompanied by staff from the SPMU and respective District Project Management Units (DPMUs), Technical Support Agencies (TSAs) and Facilitating NGOs (FNGOs). Lohardaga, West Singhbhum, East Singhbhum, Saraikela-Kharsawan, Latehar, Pakur, and Jamtara districts could not be visited due to time constraints as the State Project Director (SPD) suggested that the entire mission team remain together during field visits. Mission members interacted with women and men from project households during field visits, had meetings with staff in DPMUs, TSAs and FNGOs, visited some of the office premises of the DPMUs and saw the entry point activities being implemented (see working paper 1 for visits' details). Mission members also participated in a day-long workshop attended by staff from the PSU, DPMUs, TSAs and FNGOs. Key focus areas of the Mission were to review the overall project implementation progress and compliance with the recommendations of the previous supervision mission and to provide implementation support as required by the project.

2. The overall goal of the project is to improve living conditions of Scheduled Tribes (STs) in general and PTGs in particular, covering select tribal majority blocks and Panchayats in all the 14 Tribal Sub-Plan districts of Jharkhand by empowering and enabling the communities to adopt livelihood options based on sustainable and equitable use of natural resources. The objective of the project is to foster community based institutions to empower village communities, especially women, introduce sustainable natural resource management systems to enhance food security and cash incomes by introducing improved farming practices and proven production technologies. The project is implemented by the Jharkhand Tribal Development Society (JTDS) established by the Government of Jharkhand (GoJ). This is the second Joint Review. The IFAD Loan (No. I-879-IN) for SDR 33.55 million became effective on 4 October 2013, with 31 December 2021 and 30 June 2022 as the respective completion and closure dates.

3. The findings and recommendations of the Mission were shared in a final wrap-up meeting on 11 December 2015 chaired by Dr. Rajiv Arun Ekka, Secretary, Department of Welfare (DoW), GoJ and attended by the State Project Director (SPD) and Additional Project Director (APD) of JTDS. The recommendations were discussed and agreed with the JTELP management team and implementing partners. The DEA wrap-up meeting was held on 15 Dec 2015 in New Delhi chaired by Director (MI), DEA.

B. Overall assessment of project implementation

Overall implementation progress

4. Overall performance is *moderately unsatisfactory*. Implementation has been delayed by approximately one year as start-up activities envisaged in the project design for the pre- and post-loan negotiation phase prior to entry of the project into force could not be carried out due to lack of budget support from GoJ and there were further delays due to national and State elections. The Start Up workshop was conducted during 28 April to 1 May 2015, nearly 18 months after entry of the project into force. The project is now fully operational, with the SPMU established in Ranchi, DPMUs established in all the 14 project districts, three TSA and 21 FNGOs contracted, project villages selected and project activities initiated in villages. Mobilisation of village communities, formation of Gram Sabha Project Execution Committees (GSPEC), Self Help Groups (SHGs), Youth Groups (YGs) and, preparation of Gram Sabha Resource Management and Livelihood Plans (GSRMLP) and implementation of entry point activities have been initiated. The project is being implemented in 1 259

¹ Mission composition: Mr Deep Joshi, IFAD Consultant (Mission Leader; Community Empowerment, INRM, Livelihoods & Convergence); Mr. A. M. Alam, IFAD Consultant (Project Management, M&E) and Mr. Pratul Dube, IFAD Consultant (Financial Management & Procurement). Dr Vincent Darlong, IFAD ICO (Gender, KM, Targeting; backstopping on M&E). Ms Meera Mishra, Country Coordinated participated in the project debriefing with project staff and wrap-up meeting with GoJ on 10-11 Dec 2015. The SPD, APD and JTDS staff participated in field visits and provided review inputs. The Mission is grateful to the Government of Jharkhand and JTDS for the courtesy and cooperation extended during its stay in the State.

villages (design target 1 000) and would serve 153 090 households (design target 136 000) in 30 blocks across 14 Tribal Sub Plan (TSP) districts.

5. The project is now trying to make good the lag in disbursement by accelerating implementation. This could be a major risk if the inherently slow and deliberative processes of community mobilisation, capacity building and participatory planning are compromised in order to meet disbursement targets. For example, activities like irrigation, market oriented production clusters and Farmers' Service Centers included in the AWPB for the current year were to kick off much later and in carefully selected villages after strong rapport has been developed in project villages, significant land development work has been done through convergence with MGNREGA and the community based institutions are strong enough to manage these activities. The project needs to follow the implementation schedule and steps outlined in the PIM till institution building, participatory planning to formulate GSRMLPs and capacity building of key actors in implementation is completed. Implementation of physical activities can then be accelerated and the lag in disbursement covered in subsequent years as the project still has six years to completion.

6. Development of strong community based institutions, participatory planning at the village level and land development and rainwater management are the key elements of this project. Land development and rainwater management are to be financed entirely through convergence with MGNREGS. While efforts have been made at the district level and one meeting has been held with the MGNREGA Commissioner, this would require strong and proactive policy support at the highest levels, continuous follow up at all levels and harmonisation with the highly structured planning, implementation and reporting procedures of MGNREGA. It is for this reason that the previous review mission had recommended convening the State Project Coordination Committee (SPCC). This needs to be addressed immediately.

7. As per the Financing Agreement, the project is to have a full time Project Director as strong, proactive policy support is needed to facilitate convergence and to guide operations across 14 districts. The present incumbent also heads the State Tribal Research Institute. The mission strongly recommends that a full time Project Director be appointed.

8. Most of the recommendations of the previous JRM have been complied with. Those regarding SPCC meeting, convergence facilitation, staff salaries, appointing an HR agency, customising Tally software and finalizing procedure to route SCA to TSP and Article 275(1) funds are pending compliance.

Likelihood of achieving the development objectives

9. Though the project is about a year behind schedule, it is now fully geared for implementation and hence rated as *moderately satisfactory*. With proactive management and adherence to the project design and processes outlined in the PIM, it would be able to make up for lost time and meet its objectives.

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date
1. Convene a meeting of the SPCC to take up issues pertaining to convergence with MGNREGS	Secretary DoW, GoJ	31 Dec 2015
2. Appoint a full time Project Director as per the Financing Agreement	GoJ	31 Jan 2016
3. Follow the project implementation sequence outlined in the PIM at least till all the GSRMLPs have been prepared and converged with MGNREGS	SPMU	Continuous

C. Outputs and outcomes

Components

10. **Component 1: Community Empowerment.** Overall performance is rated *moderately satisfactory*. This component comprises three sub-components: (i) Promotion of SHGs and YGs; (ii) Building the capacity of Community Resource Persons (CRPs), GSPECs and staff of FNGOs and JTDS; and (iii) Special support to the PTGs to enable them to access their entitlements.

11. **Sub-component 1.1. Promotion of SHG and YG.** The project has so far formed 2 442 SHGs. Data on coverage across villages and hamlets, poverty classification of members and number of households included out of the total households is not readily available. Except for a small number of pre-existing groups, most SHGs are less than six months old and some have been recently formed.

Bank accounts have been opened for 118 SHGs, mostly for old SHGs. In some of the villages visited, one or two groups had broken up, which is understandable as groups take time to stabilise. Most groups met in the course of field visits meet weekly and save INR 10 a week. As some of the groups would soon be six months old and eligible to be considered for revolving fund support, the project needs to develop grading protocols so that groups older than six months may be graded and if found eligible, provided the first instalment of revolving fund. The project also needs to collect data regarding the vulnerability status of SHG members identifying members from women headed households, artisans, landless and PTGs. SHGs with 70% or more members from among PTGs are to be given twice as much revolving fund as other groups. The project needs to report such groups separately.

12. The project has also formed 243 Youth Groups. With a few exceptions, these are all male groups. Seven youth groups have opened bank accounts. The groups met said they conduct regular meetings.

13. The project has developed a working arrangement with JSLPS whereby they will exclude JTELP Panchayats in blocks where the National Rural Livelihood Mission (NRLM) has not been rolled out except in five blocks where NRLM has already been initiated and SHGs formed; in these five blocks Jharkhand State Livelihood Promotion Society (JSLPS) has agreed to work closely with JTELP. The mission visited one of these five blocks and met with two to three year old SHGs promoted by JSLPS. The SHG members participated actively in the Gram Sabha; though problems are being faced in some of the blocks, it appeared the arrangement would work satisfactorily through continuous follow up and coordination at all levels in the administrative chain.

14. **Sub-component 1.2. Building the capacity of Community Resource Persons (CRPs), GSPECs and staff of FNGOs and JTDS.** JTDS is drawing on JSLPS to train FNGO staff and Community Facilitators (CF). One training of trainers event of four days on the theme of forming SHGs was organised by SPMU for DPMU and FNGO staff. Training of CFs on the same theme has been organised in eight project districts.

15. **Sub-component 1.3. Special support to the PTGs to enable them to access their entitlements.** The project has received proposals for entry point activity (EPA) from 863 villages, of which 623 have been approved, 429 provided with funds and 229 have begun work. In all cases construction of a farm pond is the EPA even though there were superior alternatives in some of the villages visited by the mission (see working paper 1), such as lifting water from a perennial stream near the site of the pond, constructing a check dam a few feet away from the pond, etc. Also farm ponds can be constructed only on fields of farmers who can spare farm land. Village communities need substantial orientation in siting and construction of farm ponds. Where it is not possible to use them for life-saving irrigation, possibilities of converting them into fish pond may be thought of. In the course of field visits mission members came across EPA sites with very hard clay substrate. The rate for excavation of such soils should be revised upwards by at least 60%.

16. Status report on PTG villages and intervention strategies, as per the design of the project, have not yet been developed by the concerned FNGOs. As of now the PTG villages are being treated at par with others and the processes being followed are identical. As PTGs are a priority target group to be extended special support, the project needs to report separately on work done with them.

17. Some of the project villages have more than 200 households. It is difficult for a single part-time CRP to support such large villages. The mission recommends that two CRPs may be provided for villages with more than 200 households.

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date
4. Develop SHG grading protocols and begin grading of groups nearing six months	SPMU	31 Jan 2016
5. Capture vulnerability category, namely women headed households, artisans, landless and PTG, of members in SHG MIS	SPMU, DPMU, FNGOs	31 Jan 2016
6. Separately report SHGs with more than 70% members from among the PTG	SPMU, DPMU, FNGOs	31 Jan 2016
7. Revise earthwork rates for EPA work for sites with hard clay substrate	SPMU	31 Dec 2015
8. Prepare status report of PTG villages along with development strategy for such villages	SPMU, DPMU, TSA, FNGOs	30 Apr 2016
9. Provide an additional CRP for villages with more than 200 households	SPMU	31 Jan 2016

18. **Component 2: Integrated Natural Resource Management (INRM).** Overall performance is rated as *moderately unsatisfactory*. The component consists of (i) Community Mobilization; (ii) Land and Water Resource Development; and (iii) Productivity Enhancement and Crop Diversification².

19. **Sub-component 2.1. Community Mobilization.** FNGOs have established contact with village people in all project villages and Gram Sabhas have been conducted. The sequence to be followed was to meet with the elected Panchayat Mukhia, Ward Members and the traditional village headmen to explain the purpose and modalities of the project, promote SHGs, conduct Tola Sabhas with SHG participation, then conduct Gram Sabha to select GSPEC members representing each Tola as GSPEC is needed only when planning begins to prepare GSRMLP. In the event, GSPECs and Village Development Fund (VDF) committees have already been formed by conducting Gram Sabhas, in some cases without conducting separate Tola Sabhas, before SHGs were formed. Participation in the Gram Sabha was reported to be low in several villages visited though the GSPECs do have representatives from all hamlets and 45% to 50% of the members are women. When asked what they knew about the project in the course of interaction with village people, the most common answer was that it would construct ponds and field bunds, do land levelling and distribute goats, pigs and chickens. That much of the land development and rain water management work would be done through MGNREGS and that the income generating activities are meant only for PTGs, women headed households, artisans and the landless was not clear. FNGOs need to conduct Tola Sabhas again, explain the project concept and modalities and then conduct Gram Sabhas again.

20. **Sub-component 2.2. Land and Water Resource Development.** The project has prepared GSRMLPs for 998 out of 1 259 project villages. While various PRA exercises have been conducted, the plans are essentially collection of activities to be implemented till 2016-17. Prior to actual planning, the project was to organise four day practical training for concerned SPMU, DPMU, TSA and FNGO staff in a village by experts with practical experience of having made INRM based plans and implemented those through convergence with MGNREGS. Following this, exposure visits were to be conducted for selected PRI and GSPEC members to sites where such work has been done or is underway. The TSAs and FNGOs were to jointly make such plans in one village, followed by planning by FNGOs in the remaining villages with TSA's support. Plans were to be based on identification of problems and opportunities in different patches of land in each Tola and consolidated at the village level. Priority was to be given to in-situ conservation of rainwater. Plans were to cover all land in a village and yearly work plans to be extracted out of those. This process has not been followed. Also, rainy season when these plans were prepared is an inappropriate time to carry out planning as people are busy with farming operations, cultivated land is sown with crops and on-site inspection of different patches is not possible. The mission recommends that the GSRMLPs be prepared again.

21. The mission has learned that the GoJ Department of Rural Development (DoRD) is taking up preparation of Panchayat level development plans across the State. This would be initiated as soon as the Panchayat elections currently underway are completed by training CRPs for all the Panchayats. These plans would also include a natural resource development plan and a livelihood plan following a methodology similar to this project. The natural resource development activities in these plans would be funded through convergence with MGNREGA. The project should seek convergence with this initiative of GoJ DoRD. Besides facilitating convergence with MGNREGS, this would also provide JTELP access to training resources for INRM and avoid duplication and confusion in the communities.

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date
10. Conduct Tola Sabhas again, followed by Gram Sabhas to ensure participation of most households and explain the project concept and modalities; record and report the proceedings of such meetings with attendance	DPMUs, TSAs, FNGOs	Beginning immediately
11. Prepare GSRMLPs again following the protocols spelt out in the project design and PIM	DPMUs, TSAs, FNGOs	31 Mar 2016 and on-going
12. Establish convergence with the Gram Panchayat Development Planning and Intensive Participatory Planning processes being launched by the GoJ DoRD	SPMU	31 Dec 2016

² Though the intervention under this sub-component has not really started in new project villages that the mission visited, the project has made some initiatives in terms of planning including some training. The mission discussed a number of other project experiences with the NGOs and DPMUs on productivity enhancement practices in other parts of the country particularly on land and crop productivity. Details on the implementation of this sub-component will be reported in next ISM/ supervision missions in 2016.

22. **Component 3 : Livelihoods Support.** Project performance is rated as *moderately unsatisfactory*. The component encompasses four sub-components, namely: (i) Support for Income Generating Activities to PTGs, landless and artisan households; (ii) Introducing market-oriented farm and forest-based production activities by providing integrated production and marketing support; (iii) Vocational training; and (iv) Innovative interventions.

23. The project has organised training of 36 Paharia PTG youth through Divyayan Krishi Vigyan Kendra, Ranchi. The project needs to monitor how this training is benefiting the trainees. The project has also conducted training in tasar rearing for 75 farmers under the pre-cocoon tasar module in forest areas under the sub-component 'market-oriented farm and forest based production activities by providing integrated production and marketing support'; vegetable production, mango orchards and goat rearing are the other sub-sectors included in the project. While such training activities can be taken up through convergence outside the scope of this project, a specified protocol is to be followed for these activities to qualify under the sub-component as explained below.

24. The GSRMLPs would include activities like irrigation systems, crop production activities, various income generating activities (IGAs) and market oriented production clusters. Each of these is to follow a specified protocol. IGAs are meant only for PTGs, women headed households, artisans and landless households based on business plans developed by FNGOs; crop production activities are to be taken up as demonstrations with selected farmers and monitored for results so that best practices can be replicated; irrigation is meant for selected villages and is to be taken up after land and rainwater management activities have progressed; and market oriented production clusters are to be taken up based on proposals from FNGOs and TSAs with full details regarding linkages and on-going technical and management support. These protocols should be followed when new GSRMLPs are prepared.

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date
13. Follow the implementation protocols prescribed in the project design and PIM for the component on Livelihood Support	SPMU, DPMUs	Continuous

D. Project implementation progress

Quality of project management

25. Overall quality of Project Management is *moderately unsatisfactory*. SPCC meeting has not been held so far. One meeting of the Board of Directors of JTDS held in Jan 2015. While district project coordination committees (DPCC) have been set up in all 14 districts, only 8 of them had any meetings. Similarly, of the 30 Block level project coordination committees, only two meetings were held in Jamtara district. Likewise, there have been neither any review meetings between the SPMU and DPMUs nor between DPMUs and FNGOs along with the TSAs.

26. As and when the SPD is away on travel and out of the project headquarters, Ranchi, the APD should be officially allowed to hold charge of the office and should also be permitted to incur any expenditures not exceeding INR 25 000 on any eligible expenditures categories.

27. The project has completed more than two years since loan effectiveness. During the year under review the project has set up SPMU and 14 DPMUs and provided them with basic office equipment such as desktops, laptops, printers, photo-copying machines, office furniture and other facilities. Additional and the remaining office equipment including a set of three laptops, one desktop, two digital cameras, one or more almirah, one LCD projector, one inverter, etc. for the DPMUs will be procured during the current fiscal. In all 88 staff have been recruited including 17 women while 7 vacancies are yet to be filled up. Of these 88 staff, nearly 30 are re-employed from the previous IFAD-funded project which is insufficient to capitalize on the results of the previous JTDP and explains to some extent the weaknesses noted by the joint review mission in the project implementation approach and non-adherence to PIM. Only three of the re-employed staff have been issued contract letters with effective date from 31 March 2015. New staff are yet to be provided with the letters of contract appointment. Around 10 personnel have reportedly left JTELP in view of inadequate remuneration and other facilities. Although the letters of contract contain considerable facilities such as 16 days' casual leave and 30 days' earned leave, leave encashment, 90 days of maternity leave for female employees, HRA at 20%, medical allowance, EPF at 12.5%, comprehensive health insurance for the employee and family, considering the increasing cost of living, staff have been demanding enhanced salaries and allowances. Where EPF are deducted, these are not deposited in the accounts of the respective employees.

28. The management has been very successful in recruiting the services of 21 FNGOs and three TSAs through a Hiring Agency M/S HR India Solutions. Selected entities have been issued contracts and some of them have been operating since March 2015. While TSA contracts contain salaries linked to price contingencies, no such provisions exist in the case of FNGO contracts. There are also cases of staff attrition in FNGOs and TSA. All FNGOs face cash flow problems and this impacts on their performance as they have to operate on reimbursable basis. As a result there have been delays in the submission of expenditure claims. This issue needs to be effectively addressed.

29. While the Management deserves appreciation for having recruited and placed qualified staff in most of the 14 DPMUs and SPMU as well, they need considerable orientation, training and capacity building as most have no prior experience of the kind of work envisaged in this project. In addition, there is also a need for regular interactive sessions between the staff of DPMUs and FNGOs and TSAs for the purposes of cross-learning and experience-sharing. Such meetings could be conducted and organised at respective DPMU offices.

30. Some 30 staff from the previous IFAD-supported Jharkhand Tribal Development Project (JTDP) have been re-employed in SPMU and DPMUs. Several of them are being paid less than their previously drawn salary. This mission reiterates the recommendation of the previous mission that this be rectified. In order to retain quality professional staff, JTDS should periodically review its HR policies, especially with respect to policies on remuneration, suitability of staff for various roles and staff training. Remuneration needs to be comparable to other similarly funded projects in the State. As recommended by the previous mission, JTDS may use the services of a professional HR agency to review the present policies in this regard.

31. If necessary, the project may seek an Implementation Support Mission (ISM) to hold an orientation workshop on project concept, approaches to the preparation of AWPB and sequences involved in implementation, the methodology for the preparation of GSRMLP, etc. for the staff of PSU, DPMU, FNGOs and TSA.

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date
14. Ensure that SPCC meeting is conducted at least once a year and the BoD meetings at least once a quarter and flag key issues for their consideration and approval	Chairman JTDS	Continuous
15. Review and protect the salaries of all re-employed JTDS staff	SPD	31 Jan 2016
16. Revise the salaries upwards by 20%, which is within the scope of the Cost Tables	SPD	31 Dec 2015
17. Review and rationalise staff salaries in view of prevailing market situation and the salaries in other Aided Projects by hiring a professional; seek IFAD ICO guidance with respect to fund availability for the same in the Cost Tables	BoD of JTDS	31 Jan 2016
18. Issue letters of appointment to all staff in SPMU and DPMUs who do not have signed appointment letters	SPD	Immediate
19. Create a provision of salary advance to the staff in order to meet their educational expenditures and such advances recovered in 10 equal instalments	BoD of JTDS	31 Jan 2016
20. Appoint a full time administrative officer to handle personnel matters	SPD	31 Jan 2016
21. Ensure that gratuity and Earned Leave payments are made to all eligible JTDP staff using the interest proceeds of IFAD loans	BoD of JTDS	31 Jan 2016
22. Enhance the travelling allowances to JTELP staff in view of increased cost of living by at least by 50%	BoD of JTDS	31 Jan 2016
23. Allow FNGOs to pay salaries admissible for two years' experience in cases where staff earlier appointed now meet this criteria; pursue similar policy for JTDS staff	SPD	Immediate
24. Provide an advance equivalent to one month's expenditure to all FNGOs in the beginning of each month and settle these advances at the time of submissions of their claims	SPD	Immediate
25. Instruct all FNGOs to submit their claims for reimbursement latest by 7 th day of each calendar month	SPD, APD & DPMUs	Immediate
26. Instruct all the 3 Regional Coordinators for TSAs to expedite the processes of endorsement of the TSAs claims and travel dairies	SPD	Immediate
27. Ensure and periodically check and verify that both FNGOs and TSAs deploy quality staff in the field consistence with the TOR provided to them.	SPD, APD & DPMUs	Continuous
28. Use the services of a professional HR Agency to review HR policies and propose amendments in keeping with changing conditions	Chairman JTDS	31 Jan 2016

29. Formalise procedures for allocation of SCA to TSP and Art 275 (1) funds as per GSRMLPs	SPD, Department of Welfare, GoJ	31 Mar 2015
--	---------------------------------	-------------

Performance of M&E

32. This section is rated as *moderately satisfactory*. The Project now has full-time Manager (PME), Data Officer and Documentation Officer allocated for MIS at SPMU. The project has initiated a number of key M&E functions. Its MIS is yet to be developed but has started field data collection using relevant formats (as in PIM). The Project is in the final stage of selecting/procuring survey agency for baseline survey and plans have been made to train the survey enumerators in collaboration with IFPRI (using M&E grant) during January 2016. The project has prepared Annual RIMS report for 2014 (with data only from old JTDP villages in which JTELP is providing handholding and convergence support). The annual RIMS for 2015 needs to be prepared and submitted by January 2016 based on the indicators re-worked by this mission; so also the project needs to undertake the first AOS for 2015 by February-March 2016. In its AWPB 2015-16, the project has planned and allocated adequate resources for training on RIMS, AOS and M&E but none of these have yet been carried out. The project has also planned and allocated resources for MIS design and M&E learning/sharing workshops at the districts and state level but these are yet to be carried out. The project has prepared its progress report which the mission has reviewed. These need much improvement.

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date
30. Undertake the first Annual Outcome Survey for 2015 for which necessary training may be sought from IFPRI (under the M&E grant) if required.	Manager (PME)	31 Mar 2016
31. Prepare and submit the Annual RIMS Report (first level results).	Manager (PME)	31 Jan 2016
32. Carry out the planned M&E tasks as per AWPB 2015-16 immediately particularly (a) training on M&E, RIMS & AOS; (b) State and district level M&E learning and sharing workshops; and (c) MIS design.	Manager (PME)	31 Mar 2016

Coherence between AWPB & implementation

33. During the year 2013-14 the Project had budgeted INR 185.87 million but there was no expenditure as there were no funds available at its disposal. For the year 2014-15 the project has budgeted INR 296.26 million, including activities to be implemented under a project funded by the GoJ, Department of Welfare under SCA to TSP before the inception of JTELP; these activities are ineligible and AWPB performance was 6.28%. Current year's AWPB performance as on Sep 2015 was 26.95% and hence rated as *moderately unsatisfactory*.

Details	2013/14	2014/15	2015/16
AWPB, million INR	185.87	296.26	576.71
Actual expenditure, million INR (IFAD)	0.96	18.61	155.44
% of actual expenditure	0.52	6.28	26.95

34. Staff in SPMU and DPMUs need more training in the preparation of AWPB by consolidating the annual plans prepared by GSPECs on the basis of GSRMLPs with the help of FNGOs. The Additional Project Director (who has been assigned the responsibilities for such activities) should pay more attention to these tasks and attempt at preparation of implementable plans and within available capacity. Prior to planning, he should travel to all districts to ascertain the conditions at the grassroots. Unit costs provided in Cost Tables are indicative. These could be critically reviewed each year and updated where necessary, but with the approval of appropriate authorities³. Narrative summary in the AWPB should be in accordance with the guidelines provided by the IFAD ICO.

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date
33. Use bottom up processes for the preparation of AWPB for each year and in this context follow the guidelines outlined in PIM and also involve all DPMUs	SPD & APD	For next plan
34. Conduct review meetings with each DPMU at least once in a quarter for assessing the progress and implementation constraints and for the purposes of cross-learning and providing facilities to address the constraints	SPD	Continuous
35. Hold periodic review of all SPMU staff at least once in a month	SPD & APD	Immediate
36. Include a clearly focussed procurement plan along with each AWPB for approval by IFAD	SPD & APD	Next plan onwards
37. Include each AWPB in the GoJ budget	SPD	For next plan

³ Sources: (i) Minutes of Loan Negotiation; (ii) Section-3 PIM

Gender focus

35. This section is rated as *moderately unsatisfactory*. The overall gender initiatives in the project remain minimal. The present Manager for Community Institutions and Gender in SPMU joined the project in October 2015 (previous incumbent resigned in July 2015). Gender related activities of the project such as preparing gender mainstreaming strategy and action plans are yet to be initiated. The project should take this up as a priority as per the guidelines provided during the technical start-up workshop and design document. The gender sensitization workshops for the project staff as planned in AWPB 2015-17 are yet to be carried out. Only 17 (under 17%) of the 98 project staff are female. At the field level, the project has ensured that 45% to 50% of members in GSPECs are women; women SHGs have been formed or are in the process of formation. Overall operational measures and procedures for gender equality and women empowerment in the project remain inadequate even after over 24 months of project effectiveness.

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date
38. Prepare the gender mainstreaming strategy with action plans focusing on gender equality and women's empowerment (refer design document for guidelines).	Manager (Gender)	31 Mar 2016
39. Conduct gender sensitization workshops for project and NGO staff as per AWPB 2015-16.	Manager (Gender)	31 Mar 2016
40. Gender and nutrition should be focus of the project AWPB and implementation from 2016-17 onwards as per action plan prepared by JTELP participants in the recently concluded gender and nutrition training ⁴ .	Manager (Gender)	31 Mar 2016
41. Manager (Gender) of the project along with DPMs should have exposure visits to other projects in India (such as ILSP in Uttarakhand, Tejaswini MP) to understand how gender mainstreaming can be done in project activities	SPD	31 Mar 2016
42. Constitute an Internal Complaints Committee as per The Sexual Harassment of Women at Workplace (Prevention, Prohibition and Redressal) Act with guidance from competent authorities; incorporate this as part of HR policy.	SPD	31 Mar 2016

Poverty focus

36. The performance of the project in poverty focus is rated as *moderately satisfactory*. The project has selected poorest villages and panchayats with predominantly poor tribal households including the PTGs, landless and artisans who are the poorest in the communities, and all of whom are BPL families. The planned activities targeting the poorest for IGAs such as goat rearing, backyard poultry and pig rearing have been initiated by providing training to the target groups during the review period (220 participants in backyard poultry, 166 in goat rearing and 40 in pig rearing). The project would do well to roll out the IGAs at the earliest as per AWPB 2015-16, particularly those who have received the required training. It should be kept in mind, however, that these are only meant for PTGs, women headed households, artisans and the landless. The project should not only allocate sufficient resources for these categories of men and women but also track the outreach by gender and performances of IGAs to ensure the poorest men and women benefits.

Effectiveness of targeting approach

37. This section is rated as *moderately unsatisfactory*. The project has initiated works in 1 259 villages predominantly inhabited by target groups constituting the tribal people and others. The total outreach from these villages is 153 090 households (HH) against the appraisal target of 136 000. Of the target villages where project works have been initiated, 75 villages are exclusively inhabited by the PTGs and 289 are inhabited by mixed population of PTGs and other tribal communities, SCs and OBCs. The initial count of total PTG HHs in the project villages is 9 500 against the appraisal target of 10 000 HHs. Inclusion of men and women in the CBOs such as GSPECs, SHGs and YGs have been initiated in all the identified target villages. The project has formed 1 231 GSPEC, 2 442 women SHGs and 243 YGs during the period under review.

38. The field visits sharply brought out the challenge of targeting, which is critical for the project to realise its goals (see working paper 1). Targeting would require focused attention in village meetings

⁴ The training conducted in MP during 23-28 Nov was attended by SPD and Manager (Livelihoods and KM); a copy of the action plan prepared by JTELP during the workshop may be shared with all concerned in the project.

to the most vulnerable—PTGs, women headed households (including old couples without children or other support systems), artisans and landless—and conducting separate meetings where such individuals/ groups can get focused attention. This additional categorization of target groups would facilitate targeting of IGAs.

39. The mission noted that the construction of ponds was the standard EPA pre-decided by the project and all that was left was to decide where the pond would be constructed. Since land is required to construct a pond, those who had land to spare came forward and private assets have been created for the benefit of the better off. Incidentally, ponds are the least cost effective way to harvest rainwater; improving (or constructing) field bunds and treatment of land with 5% model (described in detail in the PIM) is far more cost effective

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date
43. Track the target groups (by HHs, number of people and sex-disaggregated) by poverty categories: (a) PTGs, (b) landless, (c) women-headed households, and (d) artisans.	Manager (Gender) & Manager (PM&E)	31 Mar 2016
44. Conduct workshops on targeting to sensitize project and NGO staff	Manager (Gender)	31 Mar 2016

Convergence

40. One Manager (Convergence) has been appointed at SPMU with a core responsibility for liaison with various government departments and agencies for convergence with JTELP interventions, in particular MGNREGA. So far the efforts have been limited, with two Deputy Commissioners agreeing to include project activities under MGNREGA. No project interventions with MGNREGA have yet been taken up. The Manager (Convergence) needs considerable orientation, support, guidance and capacity building with respect to convergence processes. Both the Manager (Convergence) and District Project Managers should engage with the respective Deputy Commissioners, DRDAs and BDOs for securing more and specific activities under MGNREGA for convergence with JTELP interventions. Continuous follow up is also needed for convergence with JSRLM and the Gram Panchayat Development Planning process underway under the aegis of the DoRD. The project needs to set up systems and mechanisms for regular review of convergence at the district and State level. Also, convening of the SPCC as earlier recommended and setting up systems that the Manager (Convergence) can follow through would facilitate convergence. Overall performance is *unsatisfactory*.

41. Efforts have also been made to bring about coherence with the activities of JSRLM as earlier described. There continue to be problems in some places while in others JTELP and JSRLM are able to work together smoothly. There have also been initiatives to draw support from Jharkhand Renewable Energy Development Agency to provide solar lanterns in PTG villages and with the Drinking Water and Sanitation department to provide hand pumps.

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date
45. Institute a system of regular review of convergence to track plans, actions taken, outcomes and outstanding problems; seek regular policy support from the Secretary DoW, JTDS Board and SPCC	SPD/APD, Manager (Convergence)	Immediate

Innovation and learning

42. Overall, this section is rated as *moderately satisfactory*. The project has recruited a full time Manager for KM with additional tasks of livelihoods. In its AWPB 2015-16, the project has planned publication of a newsletter, development of IEC materials and website maintenance. Of these planned activities, the project has prepared an IEC material (a brochure on the JTELP project in Hindi) to be distributed during the Jharkhand State Foundation Day on 15 November 2015 as advocacy material. The project has also reported preparing a draft leaflet on lac cultivation which is under review. Overall, the project is yet to prepare a “learning agenda” in the form of Knowledge Management Strategy and Action Plan. Under its M&E functions complementing the KM, the project has yet to fully operationalise or implement its AWPB 2015-16 plan of regular village/district/state level reviews as part of learning and sharing agenda.

43. During the year under review the project printed 10 000 leaflets on JTELP and distributed during the State Foundation Day at village level. The project is planning to bring out a quarterly newsletter, “Jan Bhagidari” and a newsletter on lac is under process. The JTDS website is being upgraded for information dissemination.

44. As field operations have just begun in the JTELP project areas, there are no innovations to report. In the JTDP villages 'Birsia Udyamita Kendras' (entrepreneurship centres) have been as part of a GoJ project under SCA to TSP and Article 275(1) provisions. The EPAs provided an opportunity to promote innovative activities but the project has so far only chosen to construct farm ponds.

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date
46. Complete the planned activities for KM as per AWPB 2015-16 (the tasks may be carried out in collaboration of both the M&E and KM managers of the project).	Manager (KM) & Manager (PM&E)	31 Mar 2016
47. Prepare the 'learning agenda' of the project in the form of knowledge management strategy and action plan; refer the project design document.	Manager (KM)	31 Mar 2016

Climate and environment focus

45. This section is rated as *moderately unsatisfactory*. It is expected that JTELP would have beneficial environmental impacts as improving the management of natural resources through conservation of rainwater, reduction in soil erosion, promotion of community forestry, etc. comprise its key strategy. However, so far only farm ponds have been constructed as entry point activity and these would enable farmers owning land in the vicinity of ponds to provide life-saving irrigation to paddy in the event of long dry spells during the monsoons. The project has reported construction of some 350 farm ponds, either completed or in progress, in over 179 villages of old JTDP villages with the fund received from SCA to TSP. The project has also reported promotion of draught resistant legume crops (pigeon pea, chickpea, and groundnut) with support from ICRISAT (grant fund).

46. The GSRMLPs – which constitute the foundation of the project's climate and environment focus - were to be based on extensive diagnostic study of different patches of land and other natural resources, such as streams, springs, forests, etc. While village maps have been made, apparently through PRAs, these only display the physical features, settlement pattern and broad pattern of drainage. There is no record of any diagnostic (it could not have been done in such a short time and while fields had standing paddy crops) and without use of Cadastral maps. The plans are lists of activities to be taken up till March 2017, following the Cost Tables and therefore do not yet present an integrated management of land and water resources.

E. Fiduciary aspects

Quality of financial management

47. The rating for this component is *moderately unsatisfactory*. The project is operating in 14 districts with posts of a Finance & Admin Officer (FAO) and an accountant in each of the districts. Currently the posts of two FAO and two accountants are vacant. At the SPMU the project has a Finance and Administration Manager (FAM) and an accountant. The project has procured Tally software for maintaining its accounts. The software is not operational in some offices and accounts are maintained in excel sheets. The project does not have a uniform Chart of Accounts across all its offices. Ledger accounts are maintained under the budget heads in accordance with which funds are allocated and disbursed. The accounts have not been grouped under the Components and Sub-components. Consequently, the project is not in a position to submit expenditure by Components and Sub-components from the accounting software directly. It has to do so outside the system in excel sheets. The project has been in the process of getting the accounting software customized to suit its requirements but has not yet been able to do the same. The Mission is of the view that the FAM should set up the chart of accounts and group it in accordance with the Components and Sub-components and set up cost centres in accordance with the financing categories after which synchronization of all project accounts at the SPMU would be possible. These features of the accounting software should be made use of for maintenance of proper books of accounts and report generation. The tally vendor's services could be used for imparting training to all users for proper use of the software.

48. Separate bank accounts have been maintained for the Government share and IFAD share and a third bank account has been opened and is being operated only for salaries and allowances, which is not required. Proper accounting of transactions is more relevant than maintaining separate bank accounts. The project should have one project bank account instead of numerous such accounts. Separate books of accounts have been maintained for the SCA to TSP funds received and spent by

the project. In this case too, the expenditure should be recorded by Components and Sub-components and be compared with the available budget during each year. The project has current accounts in most cases with built in term deposit accounts. Funds in excess of INR 25 000 are transferred to term deposits which earn interest. In some cases, however, savings accounts are maintained and these are not linked to term deposits.

49. There is lack of clarity in terms of settlement of claims of FNGOs in respect of documents to be obtained from them for settling the claims and also in respect of TDS provisions. For instance, some of the districts seek documents for reimbursement of office operating and accounting cost whereas others release it on the basis of statement/ declaration by the FNGOs. Further, the documents sought for reimbursement of claims also differ across districts. The Mission is of the view that, in case where supporting documents are available, such as in purchase of furniture and equipment, the original bills should be submitted to JTDS as the FNGO is reimbursed for that amount. In case of salary, the bank advice/statement, rent agreement in case of rent may be obtained from the FNGO; whereas in the case of office operating and accounting costs, the details of expenses along with a declaration from the FNGO should be sufficient as supporting documents may not be available for small operating costs and the amount is capped at INR 10 000 monthly in any case. The FAM should issue clear guidelines about the documents required (in accordance with the agreement with the FNGOs) for settlement of claims. TDS is required to be deducted only for management fee and not for reimbursements, but in some cases the project has deducted tax in respect of advance given to FNGOs to procure equipment.

50. The project has introduced a good system of internal audit by the finance/accounting team of one district in another district. Thus accounts of all the project offices (except SPMU) were audited by another project office. The audit reports were submitted to the respective districts and the FAM. The FAM should compile the observations of all the offices and hold a review meeting to clarify the issues raised during such audit and issue guidelines to avoid incorrect procedures and instead adopt the best practices amongst its offices.

51. Based on the AWPB for the year about 50% of the funds have been released to the project offices under various budget heads. The districts submit monthly Statement of Expenditure (SoE) to the SPMU. The SoE should also include a column for the AWPB head against which expenditure is incurred. This will enable each office to work out its achievement against the budget and also the SPMU for overall compilation of Budget vs. Achievement statement.

52. The project has not yet deposited the provident fund (PF) deductions with the PF authorities since it has to be done online and the project is not geared to do that. The Mission recommends that the assistance of a consultant may be sought for all statutory compliances and depositing of the PF dues.

Acceptable disbursement rate

53. The rating for disbursement is *unsatisfactory* considering the disbursement of the initial advance of USD 3 million to the project. So far only 5.93% of the funds have been disbursed. If the initial advance is not considered the disbursement is only 0.14% of the allocation in which case the rating will be highly unsatisfactory. However, the project had a late start (as explained above) and in reality this is the first year of implementation. The withdrawal Applications (WAs) up to August 2014 has been disbursed by IFAD. The project has submitted three WAs amounting to about USD 0.54 million for the period from September 2014 to September 2015 which were under process at the time of the mission.

Counterpart funds

54. The rating for counterpart funds is *moderately unsatisfactory*. The GoJ prefinances the implementation of the project and the release from the GoJ does not bifurcate funds by government counterpart funds and IFAD share, though the Project AWPB disaggregates the budget. The amount of counterpart funding disbursed for fiscal year 2015/2016 is INR 26.19 million whereas the annual budget for counterpart funding was estimated at INR 206.21 million. Budget execution for counterpart funding is only 13% for FY 2015/2016 at the time of the mission. The GoJ explains that funds released in the previous years are available with the project and as part of treasury management additional funds are not released to reduce idle funds. The disbursements of counterpart funding can increase with the improvement in project overall absorptive capacity. The Mission recommends that adequate

and timely funding to be ensured as the project proposes to improve the implementation performance in the next year.

Compliance with loan covenants

55. The rating for compliance is *moderately satisfactory*. The project has generally complied with the loan covenants except (i) Clause 8.02 of the General Conditions requiring the project to establish an appropriate information management system in accordance with IFAD's Guidelines for Project Monitoring and Evaluation (ii) Clause 8.04 of the General Conditions requiring the project to submit periodic progress reports (iii) Clause 9.02 of the General Conditions requiring the project to submit financial statements within the end of four months from the end of the financial year and (iv) Clause 9.03 of the General Conditions requiring the project to get its audit done and submit the audit report within six months from the end of the financial year.

Compliance with procurement

56. The rating for procurement is *moderately satisfactory*. The project has been fully staffed and FNGOs and TSAs have been procured during the year. The SPMU has procured furniture and some equipment for all the districts using the DGS&D rate contract. The districts have been provided with a desktop and a laptop computer. Forty two laptops and 14 more computers are to be provided to the districts which will be done during the current year. The selection of the FNGOs was done on a fixed cost basis through technical evaluation. The recruitment of the TSAs was done adopting the QCBS method. The project has also procured Tally software for all the districts. Customization is not yet done. The project is likely to procure the remaining goods/ services in accordance with the procurement plan by the end of the fiscal year. The project also has planned to customize Tally software but before it does that it needs to know what is to be customized. Record has been maintained for the assets procured. Vehicles have been insured. The project is in the process of insuring the other assets.

Quality and timeliness of audits

57. The rating for Audit is *moderately unsatisfactory*. The audit of the project for the year 2013-14 and 2014-15 has been carried out but the report had not been submitted till the date of the mission and hence the mission was unable to comment on the quality thereof. IFAD has since received the audit report and the Division of Financial services reviewed it and provided a detailed audit review to the project in January 2016. Although submitted late, the Division of Financial Services is of the opinion that the quality of the work undertaken in conducting the audit is satisfactory.

58. The SPMU should also get the audit done for the earlier project (JTDP) for the year 2012-13 since it has not been done and the audit report be submitted to IFAD. A list of assets procured under the JTDP with their current location should be prepared, certified by the auditor and submitted to IFAD.

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date
48. Prepare a proper chart of accounts, group the account heads in accordance with components and sub components, cost centres in accordance with the categories.	SPMU	31 Jan 2016
49. Maintain accounts in Tally software in all project offices and conduct training project for all users for the proper use of the software.	SPMU	31 Jan 2016
50. Issue clear guidelines for settlement of claims of FNGOs/TSAs and in respect of TDS applicability. Conduct a review meeting of FAOs/ accountants to clarify accounting/ finance related issues	SPMU	31 Jan 2016
51. Seek assistance from a consultant and deposit PF with the PF authorities	SPMU	Immediate
52. Ensure compliance with the financing covenants		
53. Expedite submission of PFS and audit reports for the years 2013-14 and 2014-15	SPMU	Immediate

F. Sustainability

Institution building

59. This is rated as *moderately satisfactory*. The community based institutions being promoted, if nurtured well, would be able to function independently.

Empowerment

60. This is rated as *moderately satisfactory*. SHGs would strengthen women's position in their families and the wider community. The experience of participating in *Gram Sabhas*, making and implementing their own development plans and being able to leverage resources from MGNREGA and other government projects would enhance the sense of agency of the project beneficiaries.

Quality of beneficiary participation

61. This is rated as *moderately unsatisfactory*. Though these are early days, the meetings in villages visited by the mission were well attended. Very few people, however, spoke and the understanding about the project was limited. The project as earlier recommended, needs to ensure wider participation in village and hamlet level meetings and encourage participation in planning and social audit.

Responsiveness of service providers

62. The performance is rated as *moderately satisfactory*. The FNGOs are presently the key service providers. Most are new to the specific project villages as well as the project and would over time be able to establish stronger rapport.

Exit strategy

63. This is rated as *moderately satisfactory*. The project villages are covered under Panchayat Extension to Scheduled Areas (PESA) Act which gives autonomy to the Gram Sabha at the natural village for local governance, including the management of natural resources. The project envisages forming and strengthening such Gram Sabhas and with the experience of project implementation the Gram Sabhas would be able to continue to build on the activities initiated by this project.

Potential for scaling-up and replication

64. The potential is rated as *moderately satisfactory*. JTELP itself builds on the experience of JTDP. The GoJ is taking up a State-wide programme of Gram Panchayat Development Planning which is following processes similar to those envisaged in this project.

G. Other

Physical/financial assets

65. Performance is rated as *moderately satisfactory*. The project has just begun implementation and the only assets so far created are a few farm ponds. As most SHGs are very new, they have limited savings, though the process has begun.

Food security

66. This is rated as *moderately satisfactory*. The design of JTELP is based on the successful interventions in natural resources management, agriculture productivity enhancement and livelihoods that have been implemented by NGOs and JTDP and that have proved to have strong impact on food security. .

Quality of natural asset improvement and climate resilience

67. Overall project performance is rated as *moderately unsatisfactory*. Farm ponds under entry point activity are the only assets so far being constructed. As observed during field visits, the siting of these in some cases could have been better. Similarly, the project could have considered alternative assets, such as check dams on seasonal drains, area treatment, wells, lift/diversion based irrigation, etc. through wider and more intensive interaction with the communities.

H. Conclusion

68. The project is now fully geared with project villages finalised, offices established and staffed at the State and District levels, TSAs and FNGOs contracted and community mobilisation and entry point activities initiated. With proactive management, the project can make rapid progress towards achieving its targets and the overall objective.

69. Key issues needing urgent attention are:

- (a) Convening of the SPCC to facilitate and expedite convergence with MGNREGA and the Gram Panchayat Development Planning process underway under the aegis of the Department of Rural Development;
- (b) Ensuring that the participatory planning and implementation process outlined in the project design and PIM that calls for strong mobilisation of village communities and extensive training of Community Facilitators, FNGO and TSA staff and community leaders is followed in letter and spirit;
- (c) Appointment of a full time Project Director as per the Financing Agreement;
- (d) Completion of the Base Line Survey;
- (e) Timely submission of RIMS and AOS;
- (f) Completion of the Statutory Audit till 2014-15;
- (g) Resolving pending HR issues; and
- (h) Setting up efficient systems for settlement of claims from TSAs and FNGOs.

Notation

This Aide memoire is endorsed as the official document of the proceedings of the wrap-up meeting held on 11 December 2015 at Ranchi, Jharkhand, India, chaired by the Secretary, Welfare Department, Government of Jharkhand as Representative of the Borrower. The main findings of the Supervision Mission have been discussed with the IFAD Mission members and Project Staff. The final wrap-up meeting with DEA, MoF, GoI was held on 15 Dec 2015 in New Delhi.

Appendix 1: Summary of project status and ratings

Basic Facts

Country	India		Project ID		Loan/DSF Grant No.	I-879-IN
Project	Jharkhand Tribal Empowerment and Livelihoods Project				Top-up Loan/DSF Grant	
Date of Update	11-Dec-2015					
Supervising Inst.						
No. of Supervisions	1	No. of Implementation Support/Follow-up missions	1			
Last Supervision	11-Dec-2015	Last Implementation Support/Follow-up mission	20-Sep-2014			

USD million Disb. rate %

Approval				Total financing	115,591	5.01%
Agreement		Effectiveness lag		IFAD Total	51,001	6.01%
Entry into force	4-Oct-2013	PAR value	-----	IFAD loan	51,001	
First disbursement				DSF grant	Nil	
MTR	4-Oct-2017	Last amendment	NA	IFAD grant	Nil	
Original completion	31-Dec-2021	Last audit	NA	Domestic Total	64,590	
Current completion	31-Dec-2021			Government (Counterpart)	7,927	2.33%
Original closing	30-Jun-2022			Govt - TSP	11,556	21.94%
Current closing	30-Jun-2022			Govt - MGNREGS	44,182	0
No. of extensions				Beneficiaries	925	NA

Project Performance Ratings

B.1 Fiduciary Aspects	Last	Current	B.2 Project implementation progress	Last	Current
1. Quality of financial management	3	3	1. Quality of project management	3	3
2. Acceptable disbursement rate	3	2	2. Performance of M&E	4	4
3. Counterpart funds	4	3	3. Coherence between AWPB & implementation	4	3
4. Compliance with financing covenants	4	4	4. Gender focus	4	3
5. Compliance with procurement	4	4	5. Poverty focus	4	4
6. Quality and timeliness of audits	4	3	6. Effectiveness of targeting approach	4	3
			7. Innovation and learning	4	4
			8. Climate and environment focus	4	4
B.3 Outputs and outcomes	Last	Current	B.4 Sustainability	Last	Current
1. Community empowerment	4	4	1. Institution building (organizations, etc.)	4	4
2. Integrated NRM	4	3	2. Empowerment	4	4
3. Livelihoods support	4	3	3. Quality of beneficiary participation	4	3
			4. Responsiveness of service providers	4	4
			5. Exit strategy (readiness and quality)	4	4
			6. Potential for scaling up and replication	4	4

B.5 Justification of ratings: Low disbursements, non-submission of PFS and audit report (till the time of present supervision mission) and absence of a well-structured accounting and reporting system has resulted in the unsatisfactory ratings in these three parameters.

Overall Assessment and Risk Profile

Last Current

C.1	Physical/financial assets	4	4
C.2	Food security	4	4
C.3	Quality of natural asset improvement and climate resilience	4	3
C.4	Overall implementation progress (Sections B1 and B2)	4	3

Rationale for implementation progress rating

Implementation behind schedule by a year, long delay in recruitment of staff and NGOs, consequent long delay in inception workshop, deviation from intended PIM and design, low achievement against AWPB, little progress on convergence (particularly from MGNREGS) which is a key source of funds and overall poor project management performance.

C.5	Likelihood of achieving the development objectives (section B3 and B4)	4	4
-----	--	---	---

Rationale for development objectives rating

Project now almost fully staffed, implementation partners in place, community mobilisation initiated and project has still six years to completion. Hence the project is likely to achieve its development objectives.

Risks

<i>Fiduciary aspects:</i>	The undue delay of audit, poor rate of disbursement and the lack of a proper accounting and reporting system between district and central offices throughout all project offices is likely to affect the overall project performance.
<i>Project implementation progress:</i>	Coherence between AWPB and performance remain weak with overall technical guidance from the SPMU remaining limited or adequately not coming forthwith.
<i>Outputs and outcomes:</i>	The project lacks adequate knowledge on do-how on INRM; GSRMLP preparations also remain much to be desired.
<i>Sustainability:</i>	Too early to address but nevertheless the staff at SPMU, DPMUs and NGOs require adequate understanding on the issues of sustainability of the project interventions.

Proposed Follow-up

Issue / Problem	Recommended Action	Timing	Status
Overall implementation progress	1. Convene a meeting of the SPCC to take up issues pertaining to convergence with MGNREGS	31 Dec 2015	Not yet convened even once since project effectiveness in Oct 2013
	2. Appoint a full time Project Director as per the Financing Agreement	31 Jan 2016	Present SPD is in dual charge with Director, TRI
	3. Follow the project implementation sequence outlined in the PIM at least till all the GSRMLPs have been prepared and converged with MGNREGS	Continuous	Re-explained during the present supervision mission to all key project staff including the NGOs
Component 1: Empowerment	4. Develop SHG grading protocols and begin grading of groups nearing six months	31 Jan 2016	Action initiated
	5. Capture vulnerability category, namely women headed households, artisans, landless and PTG, of members in SHG MIS	31 Jan 2016	Emphasized during supervision mission and action initiated.
	6. Separately report SHGs with more than 70% members from among the PTG	31 Jan 2016	SPMU has started discussion with field staffs to address the issues and recommendations.
	7. Revise earthwork rates for EPA work for sites with hard clay substrate	31 Dec 2015	
	8. Prepare status report of PTG villages along with development strategy for such villages	30 Apr 2016	
	9. Provide an additional CRP for villages with more than 200 households	31 Jan 2016	
Component 2: INRM	10. Conduct Tola Sabhas again, followed by Gram Sabhas to ensure participation of most households and explain the project concept and modalities; record and report the proceedings of such meetings with attendance	Begin immediately	DPMUs and NGOs have started initial discussion as informed by the project.
	11. Prepare GSRMLPs again following the protocols spelt out in the project design and PIM	31 Mar 2016 and on-going	NGOs and TSAs have initiated to re-visit the current GSRMLPs to revise as required.
	12. Establish convergence with the Gram Panchayat Development Planning and Intensive Participatory Planning processes being launched by the GoJ DoRD	30 Jun 2016	SPMU has initiated to address the issue.

Republic of India
Jharkhand Tribal Empowerment & Livelihoods Project
Supervision Main Report - Mission dates: 29 November – 12 December 2015

Component 3: Livelihoods Support	13. Follow the implementation protocols prescribed in the project design and PIM for the component on Livelihood Support	Continuous	PIM was revisited during the current SM to explain to the project field staffs in particular.
Project Management	14. Ensure that SPCC meeting is conducted at least once a year and the BoD meetings at least once a quarter and flag key issues for their consideration and approval	Continuous	The matter was re-emphasized with SPMU.
	15. Review and protect the salaries of all re-employed JTDS staff.	31 Jan 2016	Matter was repeated both with SPMU and GoJ during wrap-up.
	16. Revise the salaries upwards by 20%, which is within the scope of the Cost Tables	31 Dec 2015	Matter discussed with SPMU and GoJ during wrap-up.
	17. Review and rationalise staff salaries in view of prevailing market situation and the salaries in other Aided Projects by hiring a professional; seek IFAD ICO guidance with respect to fund availability for the same in the Cost Tables	31 Jan 2016	Discussed during project de-briefing and wrap-up meeting with GoJ.
	18. Issue letters of appointment to all staff in SPMU and DPMUs who do not have signed appointment letters	Immediate	Discussed with SPMU including SPD during project de-briefing.
	19. Create a provision of salary advance to the staff in order to meet their educational expenditures and such advances recovered in 10 equal instalments	31 Jan 2016	Matter brought up during project de-briefing and emphasized with GoJ and SPMU.
	20. Appoint a full time administrative officer to handle personnel matters	31 Jan 2016	SPMU to take action at the earliest.
	21. Ensure that gratuity and Earned Leave payments are made to all eligible JTDP staff using the interest proceeds of IFAD loans	31 Jan 2016	SPMU informed that the project will examine the matter and put up to GoJ for necessary administrative approval and directions.
	22. Enhance the travelling allowances to JTELP staff in view of increased cost of living by at least by 50%	31 Jan 2016	
	23. Allow FNGOs to pay salaries admissible for two years' experience in cases where staff earlier appointed now meet this criteria; pursue similar policy for JTDS staff	Immediate	SPMU initiated to examine the matter.
	24. Provide an advance equivalent to one month's expenditure to all FNGOs in the beginning of each month and settle these advances at the time of submissions of their claims	Immediate	Matters under active consideration by the SPMU.
	25. Instruct all FNGOs to submit their claims for reimbursement latest by 7 th day of each calendar month	Immediate	
	26. Instruct all the 3 Regional Coordinators for TSAs to expedite the processes of endorsement of the TSAs claims and travel dairies	Immediate	
	27. Ensure and periodically check and verify that both FNGOs and TSAs deploy quality staff in the field consistence with the TOR provided to them.	Continuous	Project has initiated discussion with FNGOs and TSAs.
	28. Use the services of a professional HR Agency to review HR policies and propose amendments in keeping with changing conditions	31 Jan 2016	The matter re-emphasized with SPMU as the project has been extremely slow to address the issue.
	29. Formalise procedures for allocation of SCA to TSP and Art 275 (1) funds as per GSRMLPs	31 Mar 2015	Project has been slow to take action on the matter; the issue re-emphasized during present SM.
M&E and AWPB	30. Undertake the first Annual Outcome Survey for 2015 for which necessary training may be sought from IFPRI (under the M&E grant) if required.	31 Mar 2016	Do-how explained to project during current mission; Manager M&E has initiated the task.
	31. Prepare and submit the Annual RIMS Report (first level results).	31 Jan 2016	Manager M&E has initiated the compilation based on project indicators.
	32. Carry out the planned M&E tasks as per AWPB 2015-16 immediately particularly (a) training on M&E, RIMS & AOS; (b) State and district level M&E learning and sharing workshops; and (c) MIS design.	31 Mar 2016	SPMU has initiated discussion on the subject.
	33. Use bottom up processes for the preparation of AWPB for each year and in this context follow the guidelines outlined in PIM and also involve all DPMUs	For next plan	Mission provided detailed do-how during the supervision; DPMUs and NGOs have initiated the action.
	34. Conduct review meetings with each DPMU at least	Continuous	SPMU has initiated to address

	once in a quarter for assessing the progress and implementation constraints and for the purposes of cross-learning and providing facilities to address the constraints		the issues to prepare action plans to implement the agreed actions.
	35. Hold periodic review of all SPMU staff at least once in a month	Immediate	
	36. Include a clearly focussed procurement plan along with each AWPB for approval by IFAD	Next plan onwards	
	37. Include each AWPB in the GoJ budget	For next plan	
Gender	38. Prepare the gender mainstreaming strategy with action plans focusing on gender equality and women's empowerment (refer design document for guidelines).	31 Mar 2016	Gender focal person has initiated to address the recommendations; do-how (particularly on preparation of gender strategy) has been discussed during the current supervision mission with the gender focal person.
	39. Conduct gender sensitization workshops for project and NGO staff as per AWPB 2015-16.	31 Mar 2016	
	40. Gender and nutrition should be focus of the project AWPB and implementation from 2016-17 onwards as per action plan prepared by JTELP participants in the recently concluded gender and nutrition training ⁵ .	31 Mar 2016	
	41. Manager (Gender) of the project along with DPMs should have exposure visits to other projects in India (such as ILSP in Uttarakhand, Tejaswini MP) to understand how gender mainstreaming can be done in project activities	31 Mar 2016	
	42. Constitute an Internal Complaints Committee as per The Sexual Harassment of Women at Workplace (Prevention, Prohibition and Redressal) Act with guidance from competent authorities; incorporate this as part of HR policy.	31 Mar 2016	Yet to be constituted; re-emphasized during the current mission.
Targeting	43. Track the target groups (by HHs, number of people and sex-disaggregated) by poverty categories: (a) PTGs, (b) landless, (c) women-headed households, and (d) artisans.	31 Mar 2016	Targeting strategy discussed during the mission; gender focal person responsible for targeting has begun discussion with field staffs.
	44. Conduct workshops on targeting to sensitize project and NGO staff	31 Mar 2016	Plan for workshop initiated as informed.
Convergence	45. Institute a system of regular review of convergence to track plans, actions taken, outcomes and outstanding problems; seek regular policy support from the Secretary DoW, JTDS Board and SPCC	Immediate	Manager (convergence) of the project require training on various aspects of convergence; SPMU to take initiative on the matter.
Knowledge Management	46. Complete the planned activities for KM as per AWPB 2015-16 (the tasks may be carried out in collaboration of both the M&E and KM managers of the project).	31 Mar 2016	KM focal person of the project has initiated a discussion with project staffs both in SPMU and in the fields in order to prepare KM strategy in the form of learning agenda of the project.
	47. Prepare the 'learning agenda' of the project in the form of knowledge management strategy and action plan; refer the project design document.	31 Mar 2016	
Fiduciary	48. Prepare a proper chart of accounts, group the account heads in accordance with components and sub components, cost centres in accordance with the categories.	31 Jan 2016	Manager Finance was unfortunately in the hospital during the current mission. The FM specialist of the mission however explained to the SPMU how to take forward the recommendations to logical conclusions. SPMU has begun initiative for training of the staff on Fiduciary aspects.
	49. Maintain accounts in Tally software in all project offices and conduct training project for all users for the proper use of the software.	31 Jan 2016	
	50. Issue clear guidelines for settlement of claims of FNGOs/TSAs and in respect of TDS applicability. Conduct a review meeting of FAOs/ accountants to clarify accounting/ finance related issues	31 Jan 2016	
	51. Seek assistance from a consultant and deposit PF with the PF authorities;	Immediate	
	52. Ensure compliance with the financing covenants	Immediate	
	53. Expedite submission of PFS and audit reports for the years 2013-14 and 2014-15	Immediate	

⁵ The training conducted in MP during 23-28 Nov was attended by SPD and Manager (Livelihoods and KM); a copy of the action plan prepared by JTELP during the workshop may be shared with all concerned in the project.

Appendix 2: Updated logical framework: Progress against objectives, outcomes and outputs

Results Hierarchy	Indicators	Means of Verification	Assumptions & Risks	Progress up to 30-Sep-2015
A. GOAL				
Improve living conditions of the Tribal communities and in particular, particularly vulnerable tribal groups (PTGs) in the Tribal Scheduled Area districts.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -At least 75% of households with improvement in household asset ownership index. -Reduction in the prevalence of child malnutrition by gender. -At least 75% of households that have improved food security and incomes. - Reduction in IMR from 67 and increases in % of child immunisation from 34. % . 	RIMS+ impact surveys at baseline, mid-terms and completion	Relative stability in the price of food and in general economic conditions are conducive to poverty reduction.	
B. DEVELOPMENT OBJECTIVE				
Empower and enable 136,000 tribal households including 10,000 PTGs households to take up livelihood opportunities based on sustainable and equitable use of natural resources in 164 village Panchayats falling in 30 Blocks of 14 TSP districts.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -Sources of household incomes -# of HH reporting increased incomes (expenditure). -# of women reporting improved empowerment (decisions, mobility) -# of communities reporting secure and well-managed natural resource base 	RIMS + impact surveys Annual outcome surveys Participatory gender and community evaluations	Policies of Tribal development, political stability and security situation allow communities access to economic opportunities and natural resources	
C. OUTCOME AND OUTPUTS				
COMPONENT 1.0: Community empowerment:				
OUTCOME: increased community awareness, strengthened Gram sabha PECs, women's groups, youth's groups and PTGs households.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Process of selection of new villages in all 14 programme districts have been completed; handholding support done in 330 old JTDP villages. - Handholding support provided to 1463 SHGs promoted under JTDP mainly supporting the members for income generating activities. 	Progress Report.	Project able to coordinate and converge with other programmes for community development to avoid duplication.	1259 villages with more than 50% tribal HH in the Panchayat have been selected in 30 blocks of 14 TSP districts for JTELP. Hand holding support has been provided in 179 villages of JTDP. Around 400 SHG groups have been supported through hand holding in JTDP villages.
Sub-component 1.1: Promotion of SHGs and Youth groups				
1.1.1 Promotion of 5000 new SHGs of women 1.1.2 Promotion of 328 youth groups 1.1.3 Seed capital support tot 5000 SHGs 1.1.4 Seed capital support to 328 youth groups 1.1.5 In all 30 FNGOs engaged and contracts issued				2442 new SHGs have been promoted. 237 Youth Groups have been promoted. In all 30 blocks FNGOs have

Results Hierarchy	Indicators	Means of Verification	Assumptions & Risks	Progress up to 30-Sep-2015
				been engaged, contract issued and working as per the JTELP design.
Sub-component 1.2: Capacity building				
1.2.1 Training provided to 1000 Community facilitator cum Accountants 1.2.2 Training provided to 328 CRPs on SHG mobilisation 1.2.3 Exposure visit organised for 164 Panchayat groups 1.2.4 Leadership/ book-keeping training organised to 5000 SHGs 1.2.5 Learning aids prepared and 164 events organised		Project/FNGO progress reports M&E Reports Participatory M&E reports		Training provided to 161 community facilitator. 1 exposure visit has been organised. Leadership training has been organised for 80 SHG groups.
Sub-component 1.3: Special support to PTGs				
1.3.1 Training of 68 CRPs in 68 PTG villages				
1.3.2 Training of 68 village health worker (VHWs)				
1.3.3 Training of 68 village animal health workers (VAHWs)				
1.3.4 Training of 55 Traditional Birth Attendants (TBAs)				
1.3.5 Distribution of 10,126 solar lanterns				
1.3.6 Distribution of 10,126 medicated mosquito nets				
1.3.7 Seed capital support to 500 PTG SHGs				
COMPONENT 2.0: Integrated Natural Resources Management				
OUTCOME: Land and water resources conserved and used sustainably for the benefit of tribal communities.	Around 1000 of households reporting improved supplies of water, reduced soil erosion, and improved availability of grazing & fuel wood from old JTDP villages where handholding support and some land & water management activities have been undertaken with convergence fund from SCA to TSP.	Project/FNGO progress reports M&E Reports Annual outcome surveys Participatory M&E reports	Major natural disasters (droughts, floods) do not negate soil and water conservation works	
Sub-component 2.1 Community mobilisation				
2.1.1 Three Technical support agency (TSA) recruited 2.1.2 Three sets of office equipment procured for TSA 2.1.3 Training FNGO on INRM & MGNREGA 2.1.4 Training 164 CRPs in INRM 2.1.5 Training 164 PECs in INRM 2.1.6 Exposure visits organised for 164 PECs				Three TSAs have been recruited. TSA has set up office in three regions. 2 ToT have been arranged for INRM and 1 tot on PRA. 24 trainings have been done for PECs.
Sub-component 2.2: Land and Water Resources Development				
2.2.1 In all 1350 new and old villages covered under INRM 2.2.2 In all 1230 mates trained for measurements & record-keeping 2.2.3 Master CRPs engaged for 492 person-days 2.2.4 VDF provided to 68 PTG villages 2.2.5 VDF provided to other 932 tribal villages	Around 100 old JTDP villages covered with approximately 1200 HH benefitted		Possible to identify suitable locations. Communities able to reach agreement on soil and water conservation works. Adequate resources available from MGNREGA for implementation	229 ponds construction work is going on under EPA-INRM activities

Results Hierarchy	Indicators	Means of Verification	Assumptions & Risks	Progress up to 30-Sep-2015
Sub-component 2.3 Productivity enhancement and crop diversification				
2.3.1 Some 1330 village irrigation infrastructure is constructed	In 74 villages around 112 irrigation ponds have been constructed In 6 villages for 450 HH climate resilient agricultural practise have been proposed			EPA proposal for 863 no of irrigation ponds have been prepared
2.3.2 In all 164 farmer service centres designed and constructed				
2.3.3 In all 17,200 crop demonstrations conducted at 6 per village				
COMPONENT 3.0: Livelihood support				
OUTCOME: Improved food security and increased income from use of natural resources and off-farm employment.		Project/FNGO progress reports M&E Reports Annual outcome surveys Participatory M&E reports	Inputs needed for agricultural and production technologies available. Markets for cash crops accessible via local roads, and profitable. Employment opportunities available for graduates of vocational training.	
Sub-component 3.1 Support to IGA development				
3.1.1 About 17,500 hh provided training in IGA activities	3.1.1 50 SHG supported in agro-based micro enterprises		Tribal communities respond to opportunities to improve food security, produce products for sale, and take up vocational training opportunities	35 person trained under IGA training
3.1.2 Some 5,000 hh supported in setting up of backyard poultry units	3.1.2 Around 500 HH has been provided with poultry unit			
3.1.3 Some 1000 hh supported in pig-rearing units	3.1.3 Around 450 HH has been provided with pig rearing unit			
3.1.4 Some 5500 hh supported in goat-keeping units	3.1. 4 Around 400 HH has been provided with goat rearing unit			
3.1.5 Some 6000 hh supported with artisan and other activities				
Sub-component 3.2 Integrated Production and market support				
3.2.1 setting up of 14 vegetable growers clusters				
3.2.2 setting up of 3 Tasar cocoon rearing clusters				
3.2.3 Setting up of 4 Tasar cocoon rearing cluster in non-forest area				
3.2.4 Setting up of 14 mango clusters				
3.2.5 Setting up of 60 goat clusters				
3.2.6 Setting up of 110 lac rearing clusters				
Sub-component 3.3 Vocational training				
3.3.1 Study on vocational training conducted				
3.3.2 Some 420 rural youth received long-term training in skills			70 person received training	
Sub-component 3.4 Innovative interventions				
3.4.1 Some 200 ha in 50 villages covered under community forestry				
3.4.2 Ten PTG villages selected for habitat planning & improvement				
3.4.3 Lac rearing on Semialata plants in 10 clusters			One cluster under convergence	

Results Hierarchy	Indicators	Means of Verification	Assumptions & Risks	Progress up to 30-Sep-2015
3.4.4 Gender action learning systems in one Panchayat				
COMPONENT 4.0: Project management				
OUTCOME: staff expertise strengthened and their capacity to coordinate inclusive services to stakeholders enhanced and convergence of interventions established and NGOs contracts effectively handled.	-SPMU set in Ranchi and 14 DPMUs, one in each district; possession of office buildings in progress.		Quality staff available in other departments for secondment or in open market; service security and favourable terms of employment	
Sub-component 4.1 State Project Management Unit				
4.1.1 Full compliment of staff recruited and placed	4.1.1 SPD, APD, Manager-Convergence, Accountant, Driver and Office assistant are in place at SPMU.	Project/FNGO progress reports M&E Reports Annual outcome surveys Participatory M&E reports		4.1.1Full staff recruited and placed
4.1.2 All office equipment purchased	4.1.2 Inverter for SPMU and Vehicles for SPD and APD procured.			4.1.2 Lap top, furniture, DG, procured
4.1.3 Surveys and studies conducted and completed				Base line survey agency has been almost selected
4.1.4 Reports prepared and sent				Progress report prepared
4.1.5 Audits completed and reports sent				Audit work has been done and report will be submitted soon
Sub-component 4.2 District Project Management Unit				
4.2.1 Full complement of staff in 14 DPMU recruited and placed	4.2.1 8 DPMs, 2 FAOs, 2 accountants, 1 PM&EO, 1 NRMO are in place at DPMUs			4.2.1- DPM,FAO,PMEO,NRMO,accountant,DEO recruited in all 14 DPMU
4.2.2 All office equipment procured				Office equipment procured
4.2.3 DPMUs provided office space in DC offices	4.2.3 Office space for 14 DPMUs have been allocated in either district collectorate or any other govt. premises.			DPMU provided space in collectorate building
Sub-component 4.3 M&E and Knowledge management				
4.3.1 Monthly review meeting conducted in 164 PECs, 14 DPMUs & at SPMU				Monthly review meeting organised-2no.in SPMU
4.3.2 Some 448 workshops at DPMU level & 32 at PMU level conducted				.
4.3.3 70 RIMS & M&E training conducted				M&E training conducted-4 no
4.3.4 Seven annual surveys, 2 KAPS surveys & 14 other studies conducted				
4.3.5 Website set up and documents uploaded;				
4.3.6 Gender workshops organised and 7 KM workshops conducted				
4.3.7 Facilities for Legal literacy and training provided				

Appendix 3: Summary of key actions to be taken within agreed timeframes

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date
Overall implementation progress		
1 Convene a meeting of the SPCC to take up issues pertaining to convergence with MGNREGS	Secretary DoW, GoJ	31 Dec 2015
2 Appoint a full time Project Director as per the Financing Agreement	GoJ	31 Jan 2016
3 Follow the project implementation sequence outlined in the PIM at least till all the GSRMLPs have been prepared and converged with MGNREGS	SPMU, Manager (Convergence)	Continuous
Outputs and Outcomes - Empowerment		
4 Develop SHG grading protocols and begin grading of groups nearing six months	SPMU	31 Jan 2016
5 Capture vulnerability category, namely women headed households, artisans, landless and PTG, of members in SHG MIS	SPMU, DPMU, FNGOs	31 Jan 2016
6 Separately report SHGs with more than 70% members from among the PTG	SPMU, DPMU, FNGOs	31 Jan 2016
7 Revise earthwork rates for EPA work for sites with hard clay substrate	SPMU	31 Dec 2015
8 Prepare status report of PTG villages along with development strategy for such villages	SPMU, DPMU, TSA, FNGOs	30 Apr 2016
9 Provide an additional CRP for villages with more than 200 households	SPMU	31 Jan 2016
Outputs and Outcomes - INRM		
10 Conduct Tola Sabhas again, followed by Gram Sabhas to ensure participation of most households and explain the project concept and modalities; record and report the proceedings of such meetings with attendance	DPMUs, TSAs, FNGOs	Begin immediately
11 Prepare GSRMLPs again following the protocols spelt out in the project design and PIM	DPMUs, TSAs, FNGOs	31 Mar 2016 and on-going
12 Establish convergence with the Gram Panchayat Development Planning and Intensive Participatory Planning processes being launched by the GoJ DoRD	SPMU	30 Jun 2016
Outputs and Outcomes – Livelihoods Support		
13 Follow the implementation protocols prescribed in the project design and PIM for the component on Livelihood Support	SPMU, DPMUs	Continuous
Project management		

14	Ensure that SPCC meeting is conducted at least once a year and the BoD meetings at least once a quarter and flag key issues for their consideration and approval	Chairman JTDS	Continuous
15	Review and protect the salaries of all re-employed JTDS staff.	SPD, Chairman JTDS	31 Jan 2016
16	Revise the salaries upwards by 20%, which is within the scope of the Cost Tables	SPD, Chairman JTDS	31 Dec 2015
17	Review and rationalise staff salaries in view of prevailing market situation and the salaries in other Aided Projects by hiring a professional; seek IFAD ICO guidance with respect to fund availability for the same in the Cost Tables	BoD of JTDS	31 Jan 2016
18	Issue letters of appointment to all staff in SPMU and DPMUs who do not have signed appointment letters	SPD	Immediate
19	Create a provision of salary advance to the staff in order to meet their educational expenditures and such advances recovered in 10 equal instalments	BoD of JTDS	31 Jan 2016
20	Appoint a full time administrative officer to handle personnel matters	SPD	31 Jan 2016
21	Ensure that gratuity and Earned Leave payments are made to all eligible JTDP staff using the interest proceeds of IFAD loans	BoD of JTDS	31 Jan 2016
22	Enhance the travelling allowances to JTELP staff in view of increased cost of living by at least by 50%	BoD of JTDS	31 Jan 2016
23	Allow FNGOs to pay salaries admissible for two years' experience in cases where staff earlier appointed now meet this criteria; pursue similar policy for JTDS staff	SPD	Immediate
24	Provide an advance equivalent to one month's expenditure to all FNGOs in the beginning of each month and settle these advances at the time of submissions of their claims	SPD	Immediate
25	Instruct all FNGOs to submit their claims for reimbursement latest by 7 th day of each calendar month	SPD, APD & DPMUs	Immediate
26	Instruct all the 3 Regional Coordinators for TSAs to expedite the processes of endorsement of the TSAs claims and travel dairies	SPD	Immediate
27	Ensure and periodically check and verify that both FNGOs and TSAs deploy quality staff in the field consistence with the TOR provided to them.	SPD, APD & DPMUs	Continuous
28	Use the services of a professional HR Agency to review HR policies and propose amendments in keeping with changing conditions	Chairman JTDS	31 Jan 2016
29	Formalise procedures for allocation of SCA to TSP and Art 275 (1) funds as per GSRMLPs	SPD, Department of Welfare, GoJ	31 Mar 2015
Monitoring & Evaluation and AWPB			
30	Undertake the first Annual Outcome Survey for 2015 for which necessary training may be sought from IFPRI (under the M&E grant) if required.	Manager (PME)	31 Mar 2016
31	Prepare and submit the Annual RIMS Report (first level results).	Manager (PME)	31 Jan 2016
32	Carry out the planned M&E tasks as per AWPB 2015-16 immediately particularly (a) training on M&E, RIMS & AOS; (b) State and district level M&E learning and sharing workshops; and (c) MIS design.	Manager (PME)	31 Mar 2016
33	Use bottom up processes for the preparation of AWPB for each year and in this context follow the guidelines outlined in PIM and also involve all DPMUs	SPD & APD	For next plan
34	Conduct review meetings with each DPMU at least once in a quarter for assessing the progress and implementation constraints and for the purposes of cross-learning and providing facilities to address the constraints	SPD	Continuous
35	Hold periodic review of all SPMU staff at least once in a month	SPD & APD	Immediate
36	Include a clearly focussed procurement plan along with each AWPB for approval by IFAD	SPD & APD	Next plan onwards
37	Include each AWPB in the GoJ budget	SPD	For next plan

Gender		
38 Prepare the gender mainstreaming strategy with action plans focusing on gender equality and women's empowerment (refer design document for guidelines).	Manager (Gender)	31 Mar 2016
39 Conduct gender sensitization workshops for project and NGO staff as per AWPB 2015-16.	Manager (Gender)	31 Mar 2016
40 Gender and nutrition should be focus of the project AWPB and implementation from 2016-17 onwards as per action plan prepared by JTELP participants in the recently concluded gender and nutrition training ⁶ .	Manager (Gender)	31 Mar 2016
41 Manager (Gender) of the project along with DPMs should have exposure visits to other projects in India (such as ILSP in Uttarakhand, Tejaswini MP) to understand how gender mainstreaming can be done in project activities	SPD, APD	31 Mar 2016
42 Constitute an Internal Complaints Committee as per The Sexual Harassment of Women at Workplace (Prevention, Prohibition and Redressal) Act with guidance from competent authorities; incorporate this as part of HR policy.	SPD	31 Mar 2016
Targeting		
43 Track the target groups (by HHs, number of people and sex-disaggregated) by poverty categories: (a) PTGs, (b) landless, (c) women-headed households, and (d) artisans.	Manager (Gender) & Manager (PM&E)	31 Mar 2016
44 Conduct workshops on targeting to sensitize project and NGO staff	Manager (Gender)	31 Mar 2016
Convergence		
45 Institute a system of regular review of convergence to tract plans, actions taken, outcomes and outstanding problems; seek regular policy support from the Secretary DoW, JTDS Board and SPCC	SPD/APD, Manager (Convergence)	Immediate
Knowledge Management		
46 Complete the planned activities for KM as per AWPB 2015-16 (the tasks may be carried out in collaboration of both the M&E and KM managers of the project).	Manager (KM) & Manager (PM&E)	31 Mar 2016
47 Prepare the 'learning agenda' of the project in the form of knowledge management strategy and action plan; refer the project design document.	Manager (KM)	31 Mar 2016
Fiduciary aspects		
48 Prepare a proper chart of accounts, group the account heads in accordance with components and sub components, cost centres in accordance with the categories.	SPMU	31 Jan 2016
49 Maintain accounts in Tally software in all project offices and conduct training project for all users for the proper use of the software.	SPMU	31 Jan 2016
50 Issue clear guidelines for settlement of claims of FNGOs/TSAs and in respect of TDS applicability. Conduct a review meeting of FAOs/ accountants to clarify accounting/ finance related issues	SPMU	31 Jan 2016
51 Seek assistance from a consultant and deposit PF with the PF authorities.	SPMU	Immediate
52 Ensure compliance with the financing covenants.	SPMU	Immediate
53 Expedite submission of PFS and audit reports for the years 2013-14 and 2014-15	SPMU	Immediate

⁶ The training conducted in MP during 23-28 Nov was attended by SPD and Manager (Livelihoods and KM); a copy of the action plan prepared by JTELP during the workshop may be shared with all concerned in the project.

Appendix 4: Physical progress measured against AWP&B, including RIMS indicators

Component/		Indicators			Period: 01-04-15 to 30-9-15 (FY-2015-16)			Cumulative	Appraisal	
Sub-component or Output		Project indicators	RIMS indicators	Unit	AWP&B	Actual	%	Actual	Target	%
Component 1: Community Empowerment										
	Sub-component 1: Promotion of SHGs and Youth Groups									
	SHG formation			No.	5500.00	2442.00	44.40	2442.00	5500.00	44.40
	Seed capital to women SHG	No. of Groups received seed capital	No. of Groups received seed capital	No	2500.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	2500.00	0.00
	YG formation				328.00	237.00	72.26	237.00	328.00	72.26
	Support to youth groups	No. of Groups received financial support	No. of Groups received financial support	No	168.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	328.00	0.00
	Youth group competition	No. of competition held		No	168.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	328.00	0.00
	Kala Jatha (street plays)	No. of Street plays performed		No	1265.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	1265.00	0.00
	Year 1 FNGOs service contracts	No. of contracts signed with FNGO		No	30.00	30.00	100.00	30.00	30.00	100.00
	Sub-component 2: Capacity building							0.00		
	A. Training of SHGs & PECs							0.00		
	SHG mobilization methodology	No. of person received training	No. of persons trained	No	30.00	18.00	60.00	18.00	60.00	30.00
	TOT on SHG/PEC mobilization	No. of SHG/PEC members received training		No	210.00	42.00	20.00	42.00	300.00	14.00
	SHG/PEC leadership Training	No. of office bearers of SHG/PEC received training		No	60.00	8.00	13.33	8.00	30000.00	0.03

	SHG: Book Keeping Training	No. of SHG members received training		No	2000.00	2.00	0.10	2.00	15000.00	0.01
	ToT on Micro Planning/IGA business	No. of person received training		No	14.00	24.00	171.43	24.00	630.00	3.81
	Learning Aid Preparation	No. of documents prepared		LS	1.00		0.00	0.00	8.00	0.00
	Learning events	No. of events held		No	1350.00		0.00	0.00	1300.00	0.00
	B. Training of staff/NGOs									
	Exposure visits to other states/projects	No. of person visited	No. of person visited	Person days	28.00	10.00	35.71	10.00	1650.00	0.61
	Overseas visits	No. of person visited		Person days	50.00	10.00	20.00	10.00	300.00	3.33
	<i>Sub-component 3: Special support to PTGs: A. Training</i>									
	<i>Part time CRP</i>			Person	60.00		0.00	0.00	476.00	0.00
	<i>Trg. Of village Health worker</i>	No. of HW received training		No.	60.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	136.00	0.00
	<i>Health camp</i>	No. of persons got treatment	No. of persons got treatment	No.	60.00	1.00	1.67	1.00	408.00	0.25
	B. Support facilities									
	<i>Solar lantern</i>	No. of HH received	No. of HH received	No	420.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	10126.00	0.00
	<i>Medicated Mosquito nets</i>	No. of HH received	No. of HH received	No	450.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	10126.00	0.00
	<i>Seed capital to PTG SHG</i>	No. of groups received seed capital	No. of groups received seed capital	No.	250.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	1000.00	0.00
	Component 2:INRM-1-community Mobilization									
	<i>B.TSA</i>			L.S.	3.00	3.00	100.00	3.00		
	<i>C. Training</i>									
	<i>State level INRM methodology harmonization//GSRMLP training</i>	No. of persons trained		No.	4.00	1.00	25.00	1.00	4.00	25.00

	<i>Training of FNGO on GSRMLP</i>	No. of persons trained		No.	13.00	2.00	15.38	2.00	15.00	13.33
	<i>Training/workshop of PEC and CRP</i>	No. of persons participated in workshop			30.00	34.00	113.33	34.00	60.00	56.67
	D. Training									
	D. Part time CRP & Master CRP									
	Payment to CRP	How many CRPs received payment		No	1260.00	0.00	0.00	1260.00		
	Land & Water Resources Development									
	Land & Water Development	No of infrastructure develop for the water harvesting structures	No of acreages covered	No.	1265.00	229.00	18.10	229.00	8100.00	2.83
	Training-Training of mates	No of mates trained	No of mates being trained under MNREGA	No.	30.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	40.00	0.00
	Engaging of Master CRP	No of Master CRP engaged in INRM	No of Master CRP engaged in INRM	Person day	486.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	492.00	0.00
	F.VDF									
	VDF for PTG villages	No of PEC received VDF capital to PVTG	No of PEC received VDF capital to PVTG	village	165.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	68.00	0.00
	VDF for other villages	No of PEC received VDF capital to other villages	No of PEC received VDF capital to other villages	village	1100.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	1000.00	0.00
	2.3-Productivity enhancement									
	INRM									
	A. Irrigation Facilities	No of Irrigation infrastructure Facilities developed	No. of beneficiaries, Area under irrigation	village	300.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	1260.00	0.00
	B. Farmers Service Centre									
	Training Power triller operation	Training to Power triller operation in District level		Person-month	80.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	320.00	0.00

	Training District level mechanic	Training to mechanic related to ag. Machine in District level	Training to mechanic related to ag. Machine in District level	Person-month	60.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	168.00	0.00
	Training CRP in agriculture	No of Training organized for the CRP related to Agriculture	No. of CRP engaged in Ag. Training	No.	90.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	1476.00	0.00
Component 3:Livelihood support										
	3.1 Support for IGA									
	1.Investment cost									
	<i>Backyard poultry</i>	No. of units built	No. of persons involved in the activity	No.	220.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	5000.00	0.00
	Pig rearing unit	No. of units built	No. of persons involved in the activity	No.	40.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	1000.00	0.00
	Goat rearing unit	No. of units built	No. of persons involved in the activity	No.	166.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	5500.00	0.00
	<i>Benificiary training</i>	No. of persons trained		Person	3400.00	35.00	1.03	35.00	17500.00	0.20
	3.2: Integrated Production and Marketing									
	1.Investment cost									
	Vegetable Cluster	No of persons involved	No of persons involved	Cluster	30.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	56.00	0.00
	a.Tasr silkworm in forest- Tasar Year-3	No of persons involved	No of persons involved	Cluster	1.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	16.00	0.00
	c.Mango custer-Year 3	No of persons involved	No of persons involved	Cluster	2.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	70.00	0.00
	e. Lac rearing cluster-Year 3	No of persons involved	No of persons involved	Cluster	10.00		0.00	0.00	220.00	0.00
	3.3 Vocational Training									

	Training	Type of training and persons received training	Type of training and persons received training	Person-month	420.00	70.00	16.67	70.00	2520.00	2.78
	3.4 Innovative intervention									
	A. Community Forestry									
	Exposure visit	No. of persons visited	Area under community forestry	L.S.	1.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	5.00	0.00
	Guideline preparation	Documents prepared		L.S.	1.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	1.00	0.00
	Preparation of Management Plan	No. of plans prepared		village	10.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	50.00	0.00
	C. Lac rearing on <i>Semialata</i> plantation									
	Training(Field level)	No. of people trained	No. of people involved	cluster	100.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	600.00	0.00
	Promotional cost									
	Travel to field workers	Amount received		per year	10.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	40.00	0.00
	Component 4									
	G. Annual audits									
	Internal audit			No	56.00	14.00	25.00	14.00	448.00	3.13
	Statutory audit			No	1.00	1.00	100.00	1.00	8.00	12.50
	H. National Consultants /d			No	2.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	8.00	0.00
	I. Legal consultants /e			No	1.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	8.00	0.00
	4.2 Monitoring & Knowledge Management									
	project start up at state level (3 day)			No	1.00	1.00	100.00	1.00	1.00	100.00
	2.Monthly Review meetings									
	at Gram Shabha Level			No	1200.00	998.00	83.17	998.00	96000.00	1.04
	at District Level			No	168.00	98.00	58.33	98.00	1344.00	7.29
	at State level				12.00	1.00	8.33	1.00	96.00	1.04
	3.Learnings & Sharing Workshop									
	Qtly Workshop at GP level			No.	4000.00		0.00	0.00	32000.00	0.00
	Qtly Workshop at District level			No.	56.00	4.00	7.14	4.00	448.00	0.89

	Qtly Workshop at State level		No.	4.00	1.00	25.00	1.00	32.00	3.13
	5.RIMS and M&E Training								
	State level training (3 day residential)	No. persons trained	No.	1.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	1.00	0.00
	District level training (1 day Nonresidential)	No. persons trained	No.	14.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	70.00	0.00
	6.Surveys & Studies								
	Annual Outcome Survey		No	1.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	7.00	0.00
	Annual Outcome Survey Training (2 day Nonresidential)	No. persons trained	No	14.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	70.00	0.00
	KAPS survey Training	No. persons trained	No	1.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	2.00	0.00
	7.Travel Allowance & out Sourcing								
	M & E Support		LS	1.00		0.00	0.00	7.00	0.00
	MIS Design		LS	1.00		0.00	0.00	1.00	0.00
	PME Consultant		LS	1.00		0.00	0.00	3.00	0.00
	Participatory M&E Consultant		LS	1.00		0.00	0.00	2.00	0.00
	8.Knowledge Management						0.00		
	Documentation Consultant		LS	1.00		0.00	0.00	8.00	0.00
	Publication of News letter		No	2.00		0.00	0.00	16.00	0.00
	Study Reports		LS	1.00		0.00	0.00	16.00	0.00
	WEB site maintenance		month	12.00		0.00	0.00	96.00	0.00
	IEC Materials		LS	1.00		0.00	0.00	16.00	0.00
	KM trainings & Workshop		Year	1.00		0.00	0.00	7.00	0.00
	Documentation		LS	1.00		0.00	0.00	9.00	0.00
	9.Gender Sensitization						0.00		
	Staff Workshop		LS	1.00		0.00	0.00	4.00	0.00
	Legal literacy TOT		LS	1.00		0.00	0.00	2.00	0.00

Appendix 5: Financial: Actual financial performance by financier; by component and disbursement by category

Table 5A: Financial performance by financier (amount in USD'000)

Financier	Approval	Disbursements (up to 30-11-15)	% disbursed
IFAD Loan	51,001	3,066.52	6.01%
Government	7,927	184.55	2.33%
TSP	11,556	2,535.86	21.94%
NREGA	44,182		-
Beneficiary Contribution	925		-
Total	115,591	5,787.03	5.01%

Note: Since the GoJ has disbursed a lesser amount than the amount IFAD has disbursed to the Govt. , the share of GoJ is taken as the amount spent on its account

Appendix 6: Compliance with financing agreement covenants: Status of implementation

Section	Covenant	Target/Action Due Date	Compliance Status
B – Clause 6	The Borrower shall open and maintain a Designated Account in USD in a bank acceptable to the Fund	On Loan effectiveness (04-10-2013)	Complied
B – Clause 7	There shall be a Project Account denominated in local currency opened and operated by the SPMU in a bank mutually acceptable to JTDS and the Fund	On Loan effectiveness (04-10-2013)	Complied
B – Clause 8	There shall be 14 sub project accounts, one for each DPMU and shall be opened and maintained in a bank mutually acceptable to JTDS and the Fund	On Loan effectiveness (04-10-2013)	Complied
B – Clause 9	The Borrower shall cause the State to provide approx. USD 7,900,000 to the Project as counterpart financing and approx. USD 55,700,000 as parallel financing from SCA to TSP and MGNREGS	During the project period	Compliance has commenced
E- Clause 2 (a)	JTDS shall have been duly registered with the State Registrar of Societies	Prior to first withdrawal (June 2014)	Complied
E- Clause 2 (b)	The SPCC and the SPMU shall have been duly established	Prior to first withdrawal (June 2014)	Complied. However , the meeting of SPCC as required has not been held
E- Clause 2 (c)	A State Project Director (SPD) shall have been duly appointed	Prior to first withdrawal (June 2014)	Complied
E- Clause 2 (d)	The Designated Account shall have been duly opened by the Borrower	Prior to first withdrawal (June 2014)	Complied
E- Clause 2 (e)	The Project Account shall have been duly opened by the SPMU	Prior to first withdrawal (June 2014)	Complied
E- Clause 2 (f)	The Project Agreement in form and substance acceptable to the Fund shall have been duly concluded between the Fund and the State of Jharkhand	Prior to first withdrawal (June 2014)	Complied with
II-C- Clause1	The JTDS shall prepare a draft PIM in consultation with the Fund to be approved by the Board of JTDS	Prior to first withdrawal (June 2014)	Complied

II-C Clause 2	The JTDS shall adopt the PIM substantially in the form mutually agreed with the Fund	Prior to first withdrawal (June 2014)	Complied
Section 4.02 of GCFADF	<i>Withdrawals</i> No Withdrawal shall be made from the Loan until the first AWPB has been approved by the Fund and all other conditions specified in the Financing Agreement have been fulfilled	Prior to first withdrawal (June 2014) AWPB to be submitted by 31 Jan, 2015	Complied with Complied with some delay
Section 4.08 of GCFADF	<i>Eligible Expenditures</i> The financing shall be used exclusively to finance expenditure required for the project and covered by the relevant AWPB during the Project Implementation period in accordance with the Financing Agreement	During the project period	Compliance has commenced
Section 7.05 of GCFADF	<i>Procurement</i> Procurement of goods , works and services financed by the Loan shall be subject to the provisions of the“ Guidelines for Procurement under Financial Assistance from the International Fund for Agricultural Development”(1982) in accordance with Part B and Part C of the Schedule	Throughout the project period	Ongoing compliance
Section 7.06 of GCFADF	<i>Use of Goods and Services</i> All goods, services and buildings financed by the Project shall be used exclusively for the purpose of the Project	Throughout the project period	Ongoing compliance
Section 7.08 of GCFADF	<i>Insurance</i> The Borrower shall insure all goods and buildings used in the Project against such risks as shall be consistent with sound commercial practice	Throughout the project period	Only vehicle is insured.
Section 7.11 of GCFADF	<i>Key Project Personnel</i> The Borrower/ Recipient shall appoint the Project Director and key project personnel in the manner specified in the Agreement or otherwise approved by the Fund. Efforts shall be made for their continuity and the Project shall insure the key Project personnel against health and accident risks to the extent consistent with sound commercial practice or its customary practice in respect of its national civil service, whichever is appropriate	Throughout the project period	Complied with
8.02 of GCFADF	<i>Monitoring</i> The PCU shall establish ,as soon as practicable but in no event later than 90days after the Effective Date, and thereafter maintain an appropriate information management system in accordance with The Fund's“ Guidelines for Project Monitoring and Evaluation” to enable it to continuously monitor the Programme in accordance with paragraph2 ofSchedule3A and Section8.02 (Monitoring of Project Implementation)of the General Conditions based on indicators agreed by the Borrower and the Fund	By 04-01-14	Not Complied with
8.03 of GCFADF	<i>Progress Reports</i> The PCU shall submit to The Fund periodic progress reports on the Project in such form and substance as the Fund shall reasonably request.	By 30 th June and 31 st December every year	Complied with

8.03 of GCFADF	<i>Mid-Term Review</i> The Borrower, through the Lead Programme Agency, the Fund And The Cooperating Institution, shall jointly carry out a Review of Programme implementation no later than thirty-six(36)months after the Effective Date(the Mid-Term Review")		Not yet due
9.01 of GCFADF	<i>Financial Records</i> The Project parties shall maintain separate accounts and records in accordance with consistently maintained appropriate accounting practices adequate to reflect the operations, resources and expenditures related to the Project until the Financial Closing Date and shall retain such accounts and records for at least 10 years thereafter.	Throughout the project period	Compliance commenced
9.02 of GCFADF	<i>Financial Statements</i> The Borrower/ Recipient shall deliver to the Fund detailed financial statements of the operations, resources and expenditures related to the Project for each fiscal year prepared in accordance with standards and procedures acceptable to the Fund and deliver such financial statements to the Fund within 4 months from the end of each Fiscal Year.	31 st July every year	Not complied
9.03 of GCFADF	<i>Audit Reports</i> (a) The Borrower shall each Fiscal Year have the accounts of the Project audited in accordance with the auditing standards acceptable to the Fund and its Guidelines on Project Audits by independent auditors acceptable to the Fund (b) Within 6 months of the end of each Fiscal Year furnish a certified copy of the audit report and reply to the Management Letter of the auditors within one month of receipt thereof	30-09-2014/ 30-09-2015	Not Complied

Appendix 7: Knowledge management: Learning and Innovation

Learning

1. Community empowerment programme, particularly those involving tribal people and the PVTGs (particularly vulnerable tribal groups) are unique and challenging. In spite of the fact that JTDS has been working in the empowerment project over the past one decade or so through JTDP, yet with the changes in staff, the institutional knowledge, experiences and memories are not always easy to translate into action. Therefore, both the processes and quality of empowerment of the tribal people in current project of JTELP remain much to be desired.
 2. Major part of JTELP programme area is affected by left wing extremism (LWE) as per definition of the Government of India. Hence, the pace and speed of implementation of programme interventions remain challenging. On the other hand, the project has to adopt most flexible approaches as different tribal communities are at different level of development framework. Adoption of free prior informed consent appears to be one of the best options to enable the communities to be fully involved and participate in the JTELP interventions.
-

Innovation: Describe any interesting innovation noted during supervision

1. For the PVTGs, particularly for the women, their experiences of coming together for the first time through SHGs, its processes of formation, empowerment trainings, and savings and credits are all innovative experiences. The women were excited and hopeful of reaping benefits out of this innovative experience. However, the number of records and registers that they have to maintain appears a bit of challenges as most of them are illiterate and have to depend on community facilitators or NGOs.
 2. Habitat improvement for the PVTGs is another innovation which is at an early stage of implementation. During the participatory processes of discussion with the communities on their ideas of 'habitat improvement' the community participants were however not too clear on the ideas of 'habitat improvement'. The project would require more facilitative discussion with communities on the matter so as to generate most practical approaches to implementation of the intervention having community acceptance and appreciation for sustainable results.
-