

Islamic Republic of Afghanistan

Community Livestock and Agriculture Programme (CLAP)

Supervision report

Main report and appendices

Mission Dates: 8 – 31 August 2015
Document Date: 22-Sep 2015
Project No. 1637
Report No: 3950-AF

Asia Pacific Division
Programme Management Department

Contents

A.	Introduction	1
B.	Overall assessment of CLAP implementation	1
C.	Outputs and outcomes	2
D.	CLAP implementation progress	12
E.	Fiduciary aspects	14
F.	Sustainability	16
G.	Other	17
H.	Conclusion	17

List of Tables

Table 1: Disbursement by component of CLAP	2
Table 2: OFWM: Selected Irrigation Schemes by Province and Districts	4
Table 3: Irrigation Schemes - Initially Surveyed by NSP	4

Appendices

Appendix 1:	Summary of project status and ratings	19
Appendix 2:	Updated logical framework: Progress against objectives, outcomes and outputs	23
Appendix 3:	Summary of key actions to be taken within agreed timeframes	37
Appendix 4:	Physical progress measured against AWP&B, including RIMS indicators	43
Appendix 5:	Financial: Actual financial performance by financier; by component and disbursements by category	49
Appendix 6:	Compliance with legal covenants: Status of implementation	51
Appendix 7:	Knowledge management: Learning and Innovation	55

Abbreviations and Acronyms

AWP&B	Annual Work Plan and Budget
BLDU	Balkh Livestock and Dairy Union
BRS	Bank Reconciliation Statements
BVW	Basic Veterinary Worker
CDC	Community Development Council
CLAP	Community Livestock and Agriculture Programme
CPI	Community Productive Infrastructure
DCA	Dutch Committee for Afghanistan
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organization
FFS	Farmer Field Schools
FM	Finance Manager
FO	Finance Officer
ICARDA	International Centre for Agricultural Research in the Dry Areas
ID	Irrigation Directorate
IFAD	International Fund for Agricultural Development
KhDU	Khatiz Dairy Union
KM	Knowledge Management
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MAIL	Ministry of Agriculture, irrigation and Livestock
MCC	Milk Chilling Centre
MIS	Management Information System
MISFA	Microfinance investment Support Facility for Afghanistan
MOF	Ministry of Finance
MOU	Memorandum of Understanding
MRRD	Ministry of Rural Rehabilitation and Development
MTR	Mid-Term Review
MT	Metric Tonne
NGO	Non-governmental Organization
NOL	No Objection Letter
NSP	National Solidarity program
OFWM	On-Farm Water Management
OIC	Office in Charge
PBSASC	Parwan Bastan Seed and Agriculture Service Company
PIM	Project Implementation Manual
PDR	Project Design Report
PD	Programme Director
PMU	Project Management Unit
PST	Programme Support Team
RMLSP	Rural Microfinance and Livestock Support Programme
SFM	Senior Finance Manager
SNaPP2	Support to National Priority Programme 2
SP	Service Provider
TOR	Terms of Reference
USD	US Dollar
VBSE	Village-Based Seed Enterprise
VFU	Veterinary Field Unit
VTC	Veterinary Training Centre
WA	Withdrawal Application
YPC	Young Professional Consultants

Community Livestock and Agriculture Programme (CLAP)

(Project No. 1637/Grant No. I-DSF-8112-AF)

Supervision Mission: 8 – 31 August 2015

A. Introduction¹

1. Community Livestock and Agriculture Programme (CLAP) is a SDR 37.65 million (equivalent to approximately US\$65 million) initiative financed through an IFAD grant. CLAP was approved by IFAD Board in 2012 and became effective on 08 April 2013. The overall goal of the project is “to reduce poverty in rural Afghanistan”. The programme purpose is “to improve food security of 169,500 rural households in selected districts in the provinces of Kabul, Parwan, and Logar by increasing agriculture and livestock productivity”.

2. A joint IFAD-Government Supervision Mission for the Programme has been carried out from 08 August to 04 September 2015 to assess programme progress, identify issues and assist the programme management in overcoming identified issues and prepare for emerging challenges. Specific objectives of the mission were to assist the Government in (i) assessing the project performance and the progress towards the project objectives, (ii) identifying issues in project implementation and possible solutions, (iii) identifying lessons and best practices that could be replicated and scaled-up, and (iv) assessing compliance with fiduciary aspects.

3. The mission consulted government officials, members of the Programme Support Team (PST), Service Providers (BLDU, FAO, ICARDA, DCA, and MISFA), beneficiaries and key stakeholders at both central and provincial/district level. The mission visited three provinces and six districts² as well as SPs in Kabul centre.

4. Following a pre-wrap up meeting with the PST and SPs on 30 August 2015, the mission’s main findings and recommendations were recorded in an Aide Memoire submitted to MAIL at a Wrap-Up meeting held in Kabul on 30 August 2015, chaired by H.E. Assadullah Zamir, Minister, MAIL. This document is a combination of the aide memoire, comments and feedback from all stakeholders and is subject to confirmation by IFAD management. IFAD would like to hereby express its appreciation for the collaboration and hospitality extended by Government authorities and SPs to the mission.

5. The mission would like to thank Mr. Abdul Latif Zahed, Project Director, the partner organizations (DCA, FAO, ICARDA and MISFA), and their respective teams for the support received in organizing and carrying out the mission. The mission would, in addition, like to thank the Government officials and all the people consulted during the mission for their availability and for their frank assessment and constructive feedback.

B. Overall assessment of CLAP implementation

6. **The overall assessment of the project is Moderately satisfactory. Physical progress is Moderately satisfactory.** This is the second supervision and implementation support mission for CLAP. Project implementation has faced security challenges related to the drawn-out election process – this has slowed down the operational establishment by SPs and subsequent activity-based outreach to beneficiaries. In addition, the change in government and suspension of contract/MoU approval by the government has slowed down the recruitment of project staff.

7. Some of the targets are on track and most will be achieved by the end of the project. The Community Development Infrastructure component has yet to deliver tangible results, but all elements

¹ Mission composition: Mr Karim Merchant (mission leader), Mr Zahid Shakeel Qureshi (infrastructure specialist), Mr Jens Kristensen (agribusiness specialist), Dr Khaista Yousafzai (livestock specialist), Mr Kajal Chakraborty (financial management specialist), Ms Judith D’Souza (targeting, gender, poverty, M&E and KM specialist). It was guided by Mr Wais Barmak (country programme advisor), Mr Qaim Shah (senior country programme officer), Ms Yurie Naito (programme analyst).

² Due to a shortage of time and security considerations, the teams was divided up for field visits as follows: Ms Yurie Naito visited Deh Sabz and Mr Zahid Shakeel visited Bagram 14 Aug; Mr Zahid Shakeel visited Qargah 15 Aug; Ms Yurie Naito visited Charikar on 17 Aug; Mr Jens Kristensen and Dr Khaista visited Mazar 22-25 Aug, and Bagram on 26 Aug and Qarabagh on 27 Aug.

of Component 2 have moved rapidly. Due to the politically-driven institutional and policy changes being made by the new Afghan government, an MTR will need to be held earlier than planned to allow adequate time for realignment of the current project design. The MTR is tentatively scheduled in April 2016.

8. **Fiduciary performance:** As mentioned above, due to certain constraints, delivery of CLAP activities have been held back, resulting in a poor rate of delivery (see table below). **Total disbursement** as of 31 July 2015 is US\$ 9.9 million against the total project budget of US\$ 58 million, equating to 17% (see Table 1 below).

Table 1: Disbursement by component of CLAP

	Component 1 Productive Infrastructure, Community Development, Gender Mainstreaming	Component 2 Dairy Development, Poultry Development, Food & Forage, <i>Kuchi</i> Development	Component 3 Project Management & Coordination	Unallocated	Total (USD)
Cumulative since inception to July 2015					
Budget	21,377,000	25,246,000	11,381,000	0	58,004,000
Actual	0	7,636,000	2,269,000		9,905,000
% execution	0	30.25	19.94		17.08

9. **Likelihood of achieving the development objectives:** The Project is still at the initial stages and completed some preparatory activities. Activities are just being initiated and are not at a stage where any conclusion can be drawn as yet. The MTR mission will conduct thorough review in early 2016.

10. **Impact of the security situation:** The security situation continues to be an important challenge in project progress. However, despite the volatility and uncertainty of the security situation in many project target areas, it goes to the credit of PST and SPs that programme implementation and quality remained more or less on track.

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date
The results of a replacement district for Charkh district, Logar province will be finalised in a consultative manner.	PST	Dec. 2015

C. Outputs and outcomes

11. Under Component 1, though no physical work at site has yet started, however project has made significant progress to streamline various start-up hitches. These include; signing of MoUs with both key service providers – OFWM of Irrigation Department (ID) and NSP of MRRD-; selection of irrigation schemes, conducting preliminary surveys of these schemes etc. NSP has also identified and surveyed more than 40 schemes and are ready for project proposal development with cost estimation and actual execution at site by CDCs/IAs through its usual implementation process. Under the sub-component of community development and institutional strengthening, NSP/MRRD and CLAP have jointly identified 62 CDCs in the project area through mutual selection criteria. Many of these CDCs are already active with good Block Grant disbursement records and sub-projects implemented. The first interactions have been through the establishment of prioritised productive infrastructure requirements, and this will be followed by the convergence of other SP activities on agriculture and capacity building within the same CDCs.

12. On the other hand, Component 2 has begun to display tangible results and the proposed early MTR will allow an opportunity to strategically shift all four sub-components closer to the private sector orientated approach being catalysed by the new Afghan administration. As such, the Dairy development sub-component has registered a number of primary cooperatives and now needs to focus on strengthen its membership by adopting new methods of capacity building that incorporate the private sector, thereby becoming more economically viable in the process.

13. The poultry development sub-component was delayed due to a governmental freeze nationwide on all contracts and recruitments, but since the ban was lifted the project has interviewed and selected two NGO, and prepared a draft contract forwarded to IFAD for an NOL. In addition, a more evidence-based approach has been adopted, based upon the significant learning derived from RMLSP, which ensure the most appropriate and sustainable approach will now be followed.

14. Under the Improved food, fodder and forage sub-component, Village Based Seed Enterprises have been regarded as a successful mechanism to ensure farmer owned and led interventions in promoting improved seed. The establishment of an enterprise model will need to be modified to ensure a more competitive and economically viable design drives these institutions towards some level of sustainability. Again, the forthcoming MTR will allow a detailed review to be completed of all institutional and operational elements of the VBSE to ensure a fully appropriate and contextualised approach is utilised.

15. Based upon work undertaken by the Dutch Committee for Afghanistan (DCA), this SP continues to build upon evidence-based learning and continued close interaction with the nomadic Kuchi groups. This constant interaction has created responsive and demand-driven service provision in the areas of animal health and nutrition, along with incremental and sustainable capacity building.

16. Finally, the Programme Management and Coordination component has benefited from the replication of the RMLSP model and lessons learned in addition to the oversight of IFAD PD and his management team. The IFAD team has recently recruited a Country Programme Advisor who has rapidly dealt with a number of political and institutional issues, allowing the project to move forward once again. However, the M&E and KM remains weak and uncoordinated and will need addressing before the MTR.

17. Likelihood of achieving the development objectives: The Project now has tangible results on the ground under part of its Component activities, and it is hoped that based upon a recent inter-ministerial agreement between MAIL/MRRD, Component 1's infrastructure activities will now begin in earnest.

18. Impact of the security situation: The security situation continues to be an important challenge in project progress. However, despite the volatility and uncertainty of the security situation in many project target areas, it goes to the credit of PST and SPs that programme implementation and quality remained more or less on track.

Component 1: Community Development [Moderately satisfactory 4]

19. This component comprises with allocated budget of US\$ 21.37 million and the implementation of around 1,032 priority small and medium scale infrastructure schemes. The component has two parts: (a) 52 Irrigation Schemes to be implemented by Irrigation Department (ID) of MAIL through its On Farm Water Management (OFWM); and (b) 980 small scale community physical infrastructure (CPI) schemes to be implemented by MRRD through NSP.

20. The agreement for CLAP was officially signed between the government of Afghanistan and IFAD on April 8 2013. The six year project costs about USD 65.5 million. Overall objective of the project is to reduce poverty in rural Afghanistan, more specifically, to improve food security of 169,500 resource-poor households in selected districts in three central provinces of Kabul, Parwan and Logar.

21. **Irrigation Schemes by OFWM:** Out of 100 irrigation schemes initially identified through in-house satellite imagery and GIS system, OFWM has selected 25 schemes meeting the selection criteria outlined in PDR. The preliminary survey has also been conducted at site to validate the findings of desk review. The IAs associations have been formed for all these schemes; however the process of IAs' formal registration with MAIL is in progress. Table 2 below gives detail of selected schemes by province and districts.

Table 2: OFWM: Selected Irrigation Schemes by Province and Districts

Province	District	No.	Cost (US\$)*	Command Area (ha)	Length (km)
Kabul	Chahar Asyab	2	90,503	226	11.9
	Dehsabz	4	387,262	968	18.2
	Qarabagh	3	400,000		
Kabul Total		9	877,765	1,194	30.1
Logar	Mohammad Agha	4	320,943	802	16.0
	Pull e Alam	2	600,000		15.5
Logar Total		6	920,943	802	31.5
Parwan	Bagram	4	1,340,848	3,352	17.5
	Charikar	4	570,739	1,427	15.4
	Jabalsuraj	2	410,459	1,026	11.1
Parwan Total		10	2,322,045	5,805	44.0
Grand Total		25	4,120,754	7,802	105.6

*Tentative cost @ \$400/ha Source: OFWM

22. The next step will entail conducting detailed technical survey and design of selected irrigation schemes. OFWM planned to outsource these activities owing to capacity and time constraints, though these tasks were initially envisaged being undertaken by OFWM technical staff themselves. Draft TORs for these services have been finalised and ready to share with IFAD for its NOL and subsequently initiating procurement process.

23. The detailed discussions with OFWM and procurement staff of CLAP indicated that the minimum time required to procure consulting services is around 90 days commencing from finalisation of TORs and NOL from IFAD. While fully understanding and appreciating the time required for procuring such services, it is vital this process is expedited proactively, overlapping certain activities without compromising procurement guidelines. In turn, this will ensure: (a) commencement of field work (for technical survey) before start of the slack period (commencing from early December each year due to extreme weather); (b) use of slack period for design work in the offices; and (c) timely commencement of actual execution on site by April-2016³.

24. **CPIs by NSP:** With the change of political leadership in Afghanistan, there is a renewed emphasis on irrigation development by the new government. NSP/MRRD has accordingly been directed to re-align its development activities with the priority of the government and to focus more on rehabilitating irrigation infrastructure in the country. MRRD has approached IFAD for change of its scope of work from simple CPIs to mere irrigation schemes. While agreeing in principle, IFAD suggested⁴ submitting a formal request signed jointly by MRRD and MAIL for its NOL. As such, a draft letter has been finalised by MAIL/MRRD for IFAD's NOL. In addition, NSP has commenced preparatory work on a selection of irrigation schemes (based on an initial list of 90 schemes shared by OFWM) and preliminary surveys for 46 irrigation schemes – with raw data shared with the IFAD mission. The Table 3 below illustrates the NSP irrigation schemes by province/districts with irrigated area and beneficiary villages.

Table 3: Irrigation Schemes - Initially Surveyed by NSP

Province / District	No. Schemes	of Irrigated Area (ha)	Incremental (ha)	Area	Beneficiary Villages (No.)
Kabul	10	5,964	443		80
Chahar asyab	5	2,340	225		25

³ Appendix 8 gives break of activities with minimum time required for procuring consulting services for survey and design of irrigation schemes of OFWM.

⁴ Discussed in details on the side-line of SNaPP2 Appraisal Mission during April 2015.

Qarabagh	5	3,624	218	55
Logar	5	2,761	259	96
Muhammad Agha	5	2,761	259	96
Parwan	29	7,763	1,648	136
Bagram	13	3,815	1,220	51
Chaharikar	12	748	158	55
Jabalsaraj	4	3,200	270	30
Grand Total	44	16,488	2,351	312

Source: NSP

25. **Slow Progress of NSP Sub-component:** Though NSP has started preliminary work for initiating irrigation schemes, yet the Mission is of the view that many steps could have been taken much earlier, like drafting and submission of joint letter to IFAD by two ministries for change of scope, community mobilisation in the field, preliminary survey, development of community development plans etc. In order to avoid this constraint again, the project staff will need to take a more pro-active role in follow up and hold frequent formal/informal meetings with NSP counterparts. In addition, NSP should submit a revised work plan in the light of changed scope of work.

26. **Lack of Coordination between CLAP and NSP:** One of the main reasons identified for slow progress of NSP work is lack of coordination amongst CLAP, NSP and OFWM. Based upon discussions with key staff, a lack of clarity even on some of fundamental aspects has emerged. For instance delineation of roles and responsibilities between OFWM and NSP, role of IAs and CDCs, the entry mechanism and implementation methodology adopted by each. While many of these aspects are well covered in PDR and Infrastructure Working Paper, there is a dire need to develop a robust coordination mechanism among key implementing partners. The mechanism should address day-to-day operational issues while putting every player accountable to its responsibilities and achieving corresponding progress.

27. **Changed Scope of OFWM Work:** Outsourcing detailed survey and design of irrigation schemes was not covered in original scope of work as reflected in PDR. Discussions with project staff revealed that additional cost is likely to be met from \$5 million unallocated sum; yet this could reduce no. of schemes (initially 25 from 52) as well. Though the PDR has the required flexibility on final schemes and average costs of a scheme (\$ 100,000), as well as sire selection, the project should submit a formal request to IFAD for its NOL regarding changes in the scope of work.

28. **Targeting Strategy for Irrigation Schemes (OFWM):** The Mission's field visit to 6 potential irrigation sites raised the impression that targeting strategy is apparently being compromised in awarding the schemes to relatively well-off communities. However, accompanying project staff, were not in agreement with the Mission's observations on the grounds that the IA's representatives (met by the Mission) are not a true reflection of overall socio-economic condition of benefitting communities. The office bearers, though belong to same community, yet normally come from relatively upper class (with relatively larger landholdings). While appreciating the arguments, Mission recommends including additional questions relating to socio-economic conditions of communities in the standard questionnaire of OFWM, currently being used for conducting preliminary social survey. This would help assessing the effectiveness of targeting strategy.

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date
Finalize the joint draft letter by MRRD and MAIL and send to IFAD for its NOL	CLAP	15 Sep 2015
Finalize the TORs for Consulting Firm and initiate the process of Procurement	CLAP	15 Sep 2015
Develop a Coordinating Mechanism among CLAP, NSP and OFWM	CLAP, NSP, OFWM	30 Sep 2015
Formulate and Submit revised Work Plan in accordance with the Changed Scope of NSP work	NSP / CLAP	30 Oct 2015
Complete the preliminary field survey of all NSP Schemes	NSP	30 Oct 2015
Appoint an NSP Focal Person/Coordinator for CLAP	NSP	Immediate

29. **Sub-component 1.1 Productive Infrastructure: [Moderately satisfactory 4].** Despite initial delays, the project is gaining momentum since the recent signing of and MoU with NSP/MRRD. NSP has made significant progress in pre-implementation process including village identification, CDC formation, needs assessments, scheme prioritisation, feasibility assessment and project proposal development with cost estimation and the disbursement of first instalments to at least 22 CDCs for initiating infrastructure schemes.

30. The overall scope of work under this sub-component includes approximately 1,032 priority small and medium scale infrastructure schemes to be implemented by MRRD through NSP and MAIL through its 'On-Farm Water Management programme (OFWM)'. Of the total, 52 Irrigation/Agriculture schemes would be implemented by OFWM and 980 are expected to be implemented by NSP. The CLAP infrastructure sub-component broadly covers two categories; (i) irrigation schemes; and (ii) small-scale community-based infrastructure schemes, including water supply, sanitation, drainage and access roads.

31. **Small Scale Community Infrastructure Schemes (NSP/MRRD):** Good progress has been made in the setting-up stage with an MoU signing between MAIL and MRRD in March 2014, which is one of the key milestones achieved by the project so far. Approximately USD 19.61 million out of USD 25.37, the total cost of component 1, is expected to be utilised by NSP/MRRD.

32. NSP/MRRD in turn, has made satisfactory progress in identifying potential communities/villages for implementing small scale community infrastructure schemes. Accordingly, NSP has allocated a sum of USD 3.8 million for the first year implementing infrastructure activities in 62 communities with an estimated 81 infrastructure schemes to be implemented benefitting 12,000 households. The identified schemes broadly fall under five sectors⁵ (i) irrigation-related schemes (32% of total) appear as a top community; (ii) water and sanitation (27%); (iii) transport related (23%); (iv) rural energy/power generation; and (v) rural development (9% each). Table 2 (below) illustrates the number of identified schemes by sector, cost and amount disbursed to communities (CDCs). Schemes have already been identified in 13 districts of Kabul, Logar and Parwan provinces. 22 of these initiated schemes are in 6 districts in two provinces (Logar and Parwan), with the maximum number of schemes (8) initiated in Surkh-i-Parsa district of Parwan province, followed by 5 schemes in Khushi district of Logar province.

33. Given the established outreach and coverage of NSP, there was a strong indication that it would be able to deliver all activities in the first two years of the project. In addition, where full coverage has been achieved in project districts, NSP wanted to work in additional districts to meet targets.

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date
NSP can complete its activities ahead of schedule as it was not regarded as detrimental to delivering the planned integrated package to beneficiaries.	NSP/CLAP	Ongoing
NSP can adopt a flexible implementation approach with an allowance of up to 30% of infrastructure projects in additional districts that are contiguous to project districts. A list of CDCs to be covered by NSP will be delivered.	NSP	5 Dec 2015

34. **Irrigation Schemes (MAIL/OFWM): [Unsatisfactory 2].** The procedural work, such as signing of an MoU between CLAP and MAIL is still to be completed. Discussions with project staff indicate a draft MoU has almost been finalised by both parties and signed by end of December 2014. In this context the MAIL has however submitted a preliminary work plan for implementing the schemes. A closer review of the work plan while relating start and completion times against various activities

⁵ Under these 5 sectors, the infrastructure schemes vary widely by sub-type. For instance under irrigation sector, this includes canal construction, gabion walls and protection structures. Similarly under transport sector, communities have identified schemes including culvert, footbridge, pathway construction, retaining wall and tertiary road. The wide range of schemes, clearly reflects scheme selection is demand-driven and as per actual need of respective beneficiary communities and have not been imposed.

indicates that it would take almost a year (precisely in month 12)⁶ for initiating the actual implementation of irrigation schemes if the WP is adhered to as planned.

35. The mission is of the view that WP needs to be rationalised to expedite the entire process so that an early implementation of schemes could commence. This may be done either by possibly reducing the time required for pre-implementation activities or by commencing various activities simultaneously where applicable.

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date
The MoU between CLAP/OFWM to be signed as soon as possible	CLAP/OFWM	31 Dec 2015
Preliminary WP to be reviewed and rationalised to allow more efficient delivery of activities	CLAP/OFWM	31 Jan 2016

36. **Sub-component 1.2 Community Development: [Moderately satisfactory 4]** NSP/MRRD and CLAP have jointly identified 62 CDCs in the project area through mutual selection criteria. Many of these CDCs are already active with good Block Grant disbursement records and sub-projects implemented. The first interactions have been through the establishment of prioritised productive infrastructure requirements, and this will be followed by the convergence of other SP activities on agriculture and capacity building within the same CDCs.

37. **Sub-component 1.3 Gender Mainstreaming: [Moderately satisfactory 4]** The Gender Officer has developed a Gender Mainstreaming Strategy and has conducted trainings for beneficiaries and staff to guide women's involvement and empowerment in the project activities. However, as the project is still in its initial stages, there is very little to see on the ground.

Component 2 – Livestock and Agriculture Development [Moderately satisfactory 4]

38. This component comprises with allocated budget of US\$ 25.24 million and four sub-components: dairy development, poultry development, food, forage and vegetable production and *Kutchi* development.

39. **Overall performance of this component remains Moderately satisfactory [4].** This component has tremendous potential, and there is strong indication that it can be achieved. However, whilst there is adequate technical capacity within the project management team, the sub-components require a review to ensure they are keeping up with rapidly changing governmental priorities and the overall push for linking with private sector institutions to ensure economic viability in the medium to long term.

40. **Sub-component 2.1: Dairy Development is rated Moderately unsatisfactory [3].** This sub-component consists of four elements that have been reviewed as below.

41. Strengthening national capacity in dairy cattle husbandry: Under this activity the project provided training to 1,705 persons of whom 620 (also mentioned below) were women and 1,085 men. The project also supported the rehabilitation of 6 VFUs and training of 6 para-vets including a para-vet kit and a motorcycle. Training topics included animal health, feeding, fodder production, animal housing, hygienic milking and milk handling. The SP retains a good grasp of the quantitative data around capacity building activities – this will now need to broaden into qualitative data gathering to ensure knowledge is being retained and utilised in a productive manner.

42. Developing institutional capacity among both public and private institutions. The project provided training assistance to establish 9 new cooperatives and revive 17 existing primary dairy cooperatives. The new and revived cooperative receiving support, numbered 1,085 farmers. The fact

⁶ a nine-step process has been suggested in the WP for implementing irrigation schemes., with a process commencing with "schemes identification and staff recruitment to schemes selection, establishing and registering irrigation associations, procurement of technical survey and design and then its commissioning, approval and endorsement of schemes, procurement of physical works and finally physical implementation and handing over".

that 17 existing primary cooperatives required institutional and technical support is indicative of systemic problems around their sustainability as independent, owner-managed institutions, and these issues will need to be examined carefully to establish not only the causes, but also mitigation strategies.

43. Whilst the primary cooperatives have a significant role to play, the project should look at additional activities that can provide them an enabling environment. An alternative to spending time and financial resources on promoting primary cooperatives would be to increase emphasis on activities of direct interest to the farmers. Based upon discussions with cooperative members, a huge interest was articulated for further training in increasing milk production, which provides an opportunity to initially organise farmers into simple producer groups registered with the local DAIL. These groups can then be linked to a real market/dairy plant, the plant in turn could provide support to the group. The project can support the respective dairy plants (both cooperative and private) by cost sharing supply chain managers hired by the respective dairy plants. The supply chain manager will assist dairy plants to organise these farmer groups and provide them with training in all aspects of milk production and breeding. The project can support the dairy groups via the cooperating dairy plant to establish MCCs, procure chilling equipment, modern appropriate milk testing equipment and ensure well-planned and regular training. A qualified SP can be hired to provide the supply chain manager with relevant training on a need basis.

44. Strengthening the capacity of women in the dairy sector: Under this activity, a total of 620 women were trained. The topics of the training included animal health, feeding, fodder production, animal housing, hygienic milking and milk handling. This type of training would have been more meaningful if it had been linked to a specific market, instead of training for the sake of a future expansion of a pre-selected dairy plant. As such, the training regime will need to be reviewed so that it becomes more of a cohesive training plan for the whole sub-component and less ad hoc.

45. Innovation and Diversification Fund. Under this activity it has been proposed to support Khatiz dairy Union (KhDU) to construct a 30 Mt dairy plant. An independent study commissioned by the project recommended it was far more of a priority to focus on fulfilling the capacity of existing public and private dairy plants before looking at the possibility of constructing yet another dairy processing plant that would remain heavily under-utilised. The recommendations included an expansion of the existing Kabul plant by 5 Mt/day/8 hour-shifts and a new 20 Mt plant in Parwan province. However, current utilisation of the existing capacity at the KhDU plant is only at the level of one shift of 5 Mt being processed per day. It is the Mission's strong opinion that a second shift be utilised before investing in a new milk processing facility. In addition, there could be as much as another 80 Mt of un-utilised industrial milk processing capacity in and around Kabul. In addition, it is estimate that the private dairy sector is using 35,000 Mt of milk powder⁷ (equivalent to 370 million litres of reconstituted milk i.e. 10 litres per capita). The main reason for using powder milk is a shortage of quality fresh milk and, private dairy plants visited by the Mission expressed an interest to replace the milk powder with fresh milk if quality meets the requirement. There are also a large numbers of small enterprises processing from a few 100 litres up to 5 MT per day using both fresh and powder milk that need to be technically supported to address the quality and availability of fresh milk.

46. It is important to mention that the objective of ordinary farmers are to feed their families on a daily basis, farmers are not concerned whether the buyer of their milk is a private dairy or a cooperative dairy plant. Hence, instead of building additional excess processing capacity, it is time to shift financing/attention to build farmers' capacity to increase production and increase the MCC network and organise sales to any available market and thereby fast tract the well-being of poor rural people.

47. Given the complexity of these discussions, the forthcoming project MTR will provide an opportunity to assess the possibility of using an Innovation and Diversification Fund to support the dairy sector with matching grants based on well-defined criteria stipulate in a manual available to all

⁷ Working Paper in Annex 1 of RMLSP SM 2015 report

parties. The matching grant scheme will be based on the principle of competitiveness and transparency and be available for the dairy sector as a whole if benefiting the milk producers.

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date
FAO focus on providing support to farmers productivity and provide evidence that milk yields have been increased by 15% among dairy supported dairy farmers.	FAO and M&E by PMU	February 2016
FAO develop a TA plan for the dairy sector aimed at assisting to improve dairy products on the shelves.	FAO	December 2015
FAO undertake a survey to assess potential areas of milk production where groups are interested in commercial dairy production and locations for milk collection centres (informal or individually-owned)	FAO	January 2016
Develop ToRs for establishing a network of advisors embedded with dairy plants both large and small (both private and cooperative) in the project area. These advisors would act as value chain managers' and support dairy farmers with breeding (appropriate sized animals), feeding, fodder, production, watering, health, housing/stabling, economic and quality of milk.	FAO	February 2016

48. **Sub-component 2.2 Poultry Development [Moderately unsatisfactory 3]** The project has interviewed and selected two NGO and prepared a draft contract forwarded to IFAD for no objection. As soon as the no objection has been obtained, implementation of the sub-component will commence. The approach mentioned in the PDR has been replaced with the RMLSP backyard poultry model developed in Balkh. This change is appreciated by the Mission, given the growing success of this approach. Based on lessons learned from the backyard poultry model implemented in Balkh, the Mission recommends that poultry groups be linked with MFIs. In addition, once this sub-component has commenced, other activities aimed at supporting needs/opportunities (e.g. poultry infrastructures, policies and strategies, etc.) will be defined.

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date
Prior to the commencement of field implementation the PMU shall identify MFIs interested to be linked to the poultry model. The PMU, SPs and selected MFIs shall develop a linkage model introducing savings and credit products to the backyard poultry groups from the onset of implementation. This work shall be completed by October 2015 and presented to IFAD for no objection.	PMU	October 2015

49. **Sub-component 2.3 Improved Food, Fodder, and Vegetable Crops [Moderately satisfactory 4]** Adaptive research trials on variety selection of wheat chickpea, lentil, mung bean, Faba beans, tomato and potatoes were conducted using a large number of advance variety-lines from several international research stations. Based upon the data analysis of these trials, the National Variety Release Committee approved and released two new high yielding varieties of lentil and one of chickpea, with major traits of resistance to Fusarium Wilt and Ascochyta Blight and to drought. In addition, the project has also multiplied breeder seed of newly released wheat, chickpea and lentil varieties in readiness for multiplication by the seven VBSEs (to be established during 2014) and two existing commercial seed companies.

50. The project provided a four day training to 12 enumerators, including nine (6 Male and 3 female) Young Professional Consultants (YPCs) deputed by CLAP and RMLSP on Household Baseline Survey questionnaire. The enumerators were trained on how to use questionnaires for collecting information to understand the status of existing varieties of food, fodder and vegetable crops cultivated by farmers; yield gaps; gaps in good agricultural practices being followed, knowledge, availability and use of certified seed, technological, economic, marketing, social and institutional constraints in the adoption of technologies by the farmers. The collected information was analysed and has been used to prepare the framework for the introduction of project interventions in the target provinces of Kabul, Parwan and Logar.

51. A one-day training in soil health was conducted (participants names were not available). Another one-day training for best agronomic practices was conducted in Logar and Parwan provinces, with a total attendees of around 120 farmers. On the request of Posi-e-shan Research Farm Manager and OIC of ICARDA sub-offices in Baghlan and Balkh, five day refresher training was conducted for 21 persons from diversified stakeholders. The topics of the training included; methods of crop improvement; trials layout, design and statistical analysis of RCBD; variety maintenance and breeder seed production techniques. In addition, video and radio programmes were produced to increase farmers awareness of project activities and transfer important knowledge and messages. This information was disseminated to all farmers in the country and particularly in the project target area through TOLO TV and ARMAN Radio channels. It has been assumed that the audience was conceivably in excess of 10,000 targeted persons. Finally, a total 3,000 SMS messages were also sent to farmers' mobile phone numbers (collected for this purpose) within the project area in order to spread knowledge and information to famers regarding improved seed and its importance.

52. The Mission's visit to a Mungbean participatory-demonstration (2-3 weeks from being harvested) revealed that neither FFS nor farmers field days had been conducted at the site. This then raises the issue of the current approach being used by the SP. Meeting with the SP, revealed that at some participatory-demonstration field days were only conducted at harvest time. However, according to the AWPB and the SP's annual progress report 2014, only three field days were conducted. It is the Mission's strong opinion, that the approach to FFS delivery be reviewed and the PMU-M&E shall further examine the cost/benefit of participatory-demonstration model used by the SP. The findings will be reviewed during the MTR in 2016.

53. Village-Based Seed Enterprises (VBSEs): ICARDA's analysis of the results from implementing the VBSE model (15 VBSEs) during 2006 (under two USAID-finance projects) conclude that the model is financially sustainable, that the VBSE brand for quality seed has become popular in eastern Afghanistan and the seed business has now become an attractive investment opportunity for rural enterprises.

54. Based upon this premise, the Mission visited the Parwan Bastan Seed and Agriculture Service Company (PBSASC), formed through merger/collaboration of several VSBES established by ICARDA in 2006. It was noted that the SP had replaced one of the original nine planned VBSEs in order not to create competition with the PBSASC. The Mission was informed that a similar seed company (merger/collaboration of several VBSEs) in a different location also replaced yet another planned VBSE for the same reason as above. The mission was informed that in the past, the government and donors bought seed from the company for distribution to farmers, but both government and donors had stopped/reduced this practice. Therefore, the management of the PBSASC requested that the project subsidise their seed, otherwise the farmers could not afford it.

55. Meetings with the SP revealed that the justification for establishing VBSEs was because such enterprises can deliver cheaper seed than the seed companies, like PBSASC. The observations of the Mission calls this premise into question, especially as to why the VBSEs are totally project financed and shielded from competition with private seed companies if they supposed to be financially viable and an attractive business opportunity for rural enterprises; and why were two VBSEs replace with commercial seed companies if seed is unaffordable by the farmers.

56. In addition, the SP's collaboration/transfer of knowledge with the relevant Afghan research institutions is also not clear despite meetings with the SP and reviewing progress reports. To ensure that the necessary capacity is being embedded in national research institutions, the SP should prepare an annual plan showing how the capacity is built/transferred to the national research system. Transfer of the required capacity will ensure long term, sustainable returns from the USD 6.825 million, investment in developing the seed delivery system.

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date
Careful monitor prices of seed from existing VBSEs and those established under the project and from involved commercial seed	PMU-M&E	February 2016

enterprise. Who customers (very poor, poor, better off and well off farmers) of the seed from the various types of seed enterprises shall also be examined. The results of this monitoring/investigation shall be presented to the MTR 2016.

Evaluate the capacity building plan for national research personnel and monitor that capacity is transferred to the national system through regular interview of relevant researchers from the national research institutions. The first finding of this monitoring shall be provided to the MTR 2016.	PMU-M&E	February 2016
--	---------	---------------

57. **Sub-component 2.4 - Livestock Development among the *Kutchi* [Satisfactory 5]** Provincial offices have been established in the project targeted provinces and a needs assessment survey has been completed based on approximately 365 interviews of *Kutchi* (male and female) and data entry and analysis has been completed. It was decided that selection of a specific geographical location is not relevant for *Kutchi* community due to their unique nomadic lifestyle. Field activities should be launched based on their Khel's (Tribes) as every Khel has same location for summer and winter and same migration routes.

58. In the second quarter of 2014, a VFU assessment to identify eligible and active VFUs was completed. In total, 22 VFUs were surveyed in the three provinces of which 18 (6 in Kabul, 9 in Logar, 3 in Parwan) were identified for support. The identified VFUs signed an agreement with DCA.

59. Project orientation workshops were held in Dehsabz, Bagram and Mohamad Agha attended by *Kutchi* tribal leaders, the *Kutchi* representative at MAIL and *Kutchi* directorate. A four-day extension workshop was held in Kabul for VFUs and project extension workers. They also had a field visit to practically meet with *Kutchi* community to apply the lessons learned. Initially, the extension work started in four districts of Bagram, Charikar, Dehsabz and Mohamad Agha by establishing 29 groups (15 male, 14 female). In addition 17 extension groups were established by the contracted VFUs who also convey monthly extension messages. Twelve BVWs were identified and selected from the *Kutchi* community in areas where VFUs and para-vets have limited or no access. Selected BVWs received a one month training and BVW kit from Charikar Veterinary Training Centre. The above animal health personnel vaccinated 16,381 animals, treated 86,889 animals for various diseases and illnesses and dewormed 86,889 animals.

60. The SP provided technical guidance to establish three pilot women self-help groups in each of the three target provinces. The self-help groups were trained and supported to establish small enterprises such as poultry production, milk products and lamb fattening.

61. The project and the Directorate of *Kutchi* assisted the Kuchi to establish a grass root shura in two districts of Parwan province and one in Qarabagh. Each shura comprises of 14 representatives, which will coordinate issues with MAIL *Kutchi* project. The community engagement is important for successful project implementation and long term sustainability. In addition, the project is in the process of establishing two fodder banks to reduce winter season feed deficiency for semi-sedentary *Kutchi* staying in targeted areas over the winter season. Initially, it was planned that the fodder banks be operated and managed through the *Kutchi* cooperatives. However, application procedures are rather complicated under the new cooperative law, and it is also very expensive to register a cooperative. Instead, the fodder banks will be registered as a group association with the respective DAILs. Pilot extension groups will be engaged in facilitating and supplying the animal feeds for the fodder banks

62. Based on a field meeting with entire *Kutchi* communities currently served by the SP under the project, the Mission's assessed all activities to be satisfactory. Large numbers of the *Kutchi* community expressed their appreciation for the support and was able to articulate the monetised value of the support, and the adoption rate of interventions e.g. on time vaccination and its reduction in mortality, urea treatment of wheat straw and the savings in fodder, economics of their income generating activities and proper use of milking kits and yoghurt drying equipment obtained with the support from the project. The model is commendable and the PMU-M&E shall document these

activities and prepare relevant information material for awareness raising and model replication. The yoghurt dryer kit is a very commendable innovation, and it is proposed that the project request an engineer to assist to further improve the equipment making it more durable for transportation when the community is on the move.

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date
Document the workable activities and prepare relevant information material for awareness and replication of the models	PMU-M&E	February 2016
It is proposed that the project request an engineer to assist to further improve the mobile yoghurt kit making it more durable for transportation when the community is moving between grazing areas.	DCA	Before end of 2015

D. CLAP implementation progress [Moderately satisfactory 4]

63. Quality of project management was found to be **Satisfactory [5]**. The Programme Support Team (PST) has generally responded pro-actively and adjusted to the challenges of the project. It has supported the Programme Support Team (PST) is a replication of the successful and efficient RMLSP model. The coordination with SPs and government counterparts is moderately satisfactory, but is facing a number of constraints due to changes in ministerial mandate by the new Afghan government.

64. **Performance of M&E: [Moderately Unsatisfactory 3]**. The Mission appreciates the revised PIM is a much stronger document that will serve as a template for future IFAD projects. In addition, a number of activities and recommendations are at various stages of implementation – to some extent the delay can be attributed to exogenous circumstances, but its lack of mitigation shows continuously poor management capacity within the unit.

65. Currently, the workshops are being carried out with SPs to ensure M&E tools are agreed upon and utilised in delivering against the Logframe, M&E matrix and will be included in the AWP&B for 2016. In addition, the harmonising of M&E processes between the PST and SPs has also taken an inordinate amount of time with only one SP managing to meet the expected deadlines and quality marque. A combination of reluctance from the SPs and poor follow-up has delayed the finalisation of this process.

66. The M&E Unit is currently recruiting 2 M&E Officers, which will contribute to the unit's capacity and ability to deliver against many of its delayed objectives and timelines. Amongst these tasks is the finalisation of an MIS preparation for an earlier MTR than planned.

67. In addition, in order to facilitate the monitoring and evaluate activities co-financed by IFAD in relation to changes being recommended under Component 2, it will be necessary for the PST to prepare tables for all activities providing details of the current year and a summary of previous years. Such information will provide an overview of the consistency of the (e.g. training provided and whether the training is systematic). Data organized in this manner can also facilitate sampling of activities for detailed evaluation. An example for monitoring training for support to cooperative member is presented in Appendix 9). Similar tables should be prepared for all activities.

68. The PST shall also sample some of the activities on a regular basis and make in-depth analysis of the outcome and impact of the activity e.g. has the training in animal husbandry resulted in increased milk yield and if yes what is the B/C and if no why did it not have any outcome/impact and what should be changed to improve the results. Together with the activity tables such analysis shall form the write up to be included in the semi and annual progress report prepared by the PST.

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date
Harmonisation of M&E with SPs to be completed	M&E unit of PST and SPs	30 Oct 2015
Baseline and indicator work will need to be completed to support the MTR process	M&E unit of PST and SPs	31 Dec 2015
Fill the M&E Officer positions at the earliest	PD	30 Sept 2015
Finalisation of the MIS	M&E unit of PST	30 Nov 2015

69. **Gender and Poverty focus section [Moderately satisfactory 4].** The entire programme is linked to empowering women in different social and economic contexts. Through on-going training programmes, and as the Component 2 activities become more operational, the concept of empowering women will be further mainstreamed among the beneficiaries and at organizational level. The Component 2 interventions, such as dairy development and VBSE business models aim to engage both women and men to enhance women's capacity in income generating activities.

70. While each training is documented in detail, there is no database to record all training sessions, against the AWP&B or against overall planned activities through the programme period, including key information such as purpose, number of participants, links to other Components and to follow up to record impact. Such information should also be reflected in the management information system (MIS), which the PST is planning to develop, for regular reporting and decision making purposes.

71. At the organizational level, female staff comprise 21% of overall CLAP programme staff. Focusing on officer and above category, the rate decrease to 14%. Whilst the figure is encouraging, it is still lower than the target of at least 25% female professional level staff as indicated in the logical framework. As there are still vacant positions to be filled, the PST is encouraged to continue its effort in identifying suitable female candidates through recruitment processes.

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date
Create a consolidated database to record all training sessions including purpose, location, number of participants, links to other Components and to monitor outcome of the training, to allow monitoring against AWP and planned activities during programme period. The information to be shared with the M&E Specialist to be included in the MIS reporting.	Gender Officer, M&E Specialist	30 Sept 2015
Ensuring affirmative actions from PST in recruitment of women (officer level) staff	PD, HR Officer and Gender Officer	To be reviewed at next IFAD mission
Strengthen coordination between trainings and the progress of other Components' activities in order to allow beneficiaries, especially the women, to apply the newly acquired skills in a timely manner to enhance income generation.	PD, Project Managers	30 Sept 2015
Establish a regular information sharing mechanism between PST management and technical specialists including Gender Officer, to ensure activities are implemented in a harmonised manner.	PD, Project Managers	30 Sept 2015
Continue the support to capacity building of the Gender Officer through identification of relevant regional training and exposure to other IFAD programmes	Gender Officer, PD and HR Officer	30 Jan 2016

72. **Innovation and learning is deemed Moderately satisfactory [4].** Presently, only a KM policy has been drawn up by the previous KM Officer in 2014 and it still requires an action plan and implementation modality framework. A library has been set up at the office which contains all the knowledge products developed for the two projects. However this is a spill-over of the RMLSP project, as activity under CLAP is yet to be initiated. However, there is a need for stressing knowledge management as an important part of the overall project management in order to promote continued innovation and learning.

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date
Related KM actions should be planned and executed under the framework of AWPB	PD and Project Manager	30 Jan 2016
Fill the KM Specialist positions at the earliest	PD	30 Sept 2015

73. **Climate and environment focus** - the project is aligned with both IFAD Climate Change Strategy and ENRM Policy. ECCD has endorsed this project as **Category B** as far as its environmental classification is concerned, and recommended for continuous monitoring of land/water management and climate change-related aspects during project implementation.

E. Fiduciary aspects

74. **Financial management.** The implementation performance of this activity is rated as **Moderately satisfactory [4]**. The Finance and Accounts Department of the project consists of a Senior Manager Finance (SFM), Finance Manager (FM), two Finance Officers (FOs) and a Petty Cashier responsible for the finance and accounts function of CLAP project and also the RMLSP project. All the financial books and records are maintained in the PST. The Senior Finance Manager and one of the Accounts Officers have received training from IFAD on Financial Management and Procurement.

75. The Mission reviewed the books and records and the internal controls of the project, further corroborated with interviews of the personnel of accounts/ finance and procurement department, and the Mission's findings are as follows:

- (a) The project follows a cash basis of accounting and no accruals are taken into cognisance. The project's internal controls mechanisms appear to be generally satisfactory. Adequate controls lie in place in respect of remittance receipts, transfer of funds from the designated accounts and fixed assets accounting. The project does not grant any advance of any nature and cash payments, although minimal are well controlled. A few of the recommendations made in the last supervision year have been complied with and the rest under process;
- (b) The project has only one account (a Special Account in US Dollars), fully controlled by the Ministry Of Finance (MoF) from where IFAD disbursements flow in, and from where all the payments are effected. For every payment, the transaction is initiated by the FO in charge of CLAP, followed by review by the FM and the SFM and approved by the Project Director. This is followed by a review of the MAIL finance department and internal audit unit and the final approval of the Deputy Minister for onwards forwarding to MoF. The MoF, on satisfaction of the authentication of the expenses and on further review of the supporting documents, authorises payment from the Special Account. The project makes entry in the books of account maintained in Quick Book software upon receiving the bank statements. Authorisations and authentication at appropriate levels were observed in respect of any kind of payment made;
- (c) Bank Reconciliation Statements (BRS) are prepared on a monthly basis and no issues arose in this regard. The Mission verified the closing balance of the Special Account reflected in the BRS as on 31 July 2015 with the balance reflected in the bank statement and also cross verified the figure, taking into consideration the last audited balance, receipts from the period 21 December to 31 July, 2015 and the expenses for the same period;
- (d) Fixed Assets registers have been maintained in the project. The fixed assets have distinctive numbers for identification and verification. Physical verification is done semi-annually with the last physical verification done on 08 April, 2015 and no discrepancy was noticed;
- (e) IFAD has disbursed an amount of USD 3.8 million on 15 December 2014, to the MRRD for funding of activities under Component 1 of the Finance Agreement (i.e. "Community Development including Productive Infrastructure and Institutional Strengthening). However, to date no expenditure has been incurred out of these funds. The Mission reviewed the Chart of Accounts of the MoF where all projects of the government under each ministry are listed. However, the name of the project did not appear under the MRRD line. Unless a project is opened at the MoF, there is no possibility of any funds being spent against this component. The MRRD needs to take appropriate steps so that the project is listed in the MoF Chart of Accounts;
- (f) As per the MOU between MAIL and MRRD, MRRD is supposed to submit six monthly financial reports to the PST/ MAIL recording relevant CLAP transactions. However, the first six monthly financial report (to 20 June 2015) has yet to be received from MRRD;
- (g) The Financial Statements for the year ended 20 December 2014 , did not disclose the information of the component managed by MRRD namely component 1,at all . The information in this regard needs to be appropriately disclosed in the various sections of the

financial statements like Receipt and Payments Accounts (by Category and Component), Statement of Budget vs Actual and Withdrawal Application Schedule;

- (h) The Mission's review of the Financial Statements for the year ended 20 December, 2014 also revealed the following errors: (a) non-inclusion of the Government Contribution figure in the previous year column; (b) arithmetical error in closing balances as on 31 December for Government Contribution and Total Financing and Cash Balances; (c) erroneous disclosure in the Withdrawal Application Schedule [apart from those mentioned in paragraph (g) above regarding this];
- (i) The SPs have generally adhered to the conditions stipulated in the agreements entered namely opening of separate bank accounts, maintenance of separate books of account, furnishing of AWP&B, periodical Progress Reports and audited / certified financial statements as required by the agreements.

76. Withdrawal Applications (WA): To date, the project has submitted eight WAs to IFAD aggregating USD 11 million, out of which the IFAD has already released a sum of USD 9.9 million. The balance of USD 1.1 million represents the WA for the second installment for the Initial Advance for the PST. Out of the amount of USD 9.9 million, only USD 1.23 million has been released against WA for actual expenditure incurred by the PST and DCA and the balance of USD 8.66 million represents amounts paid by IFAD as initial advance to the PST, MRRD and three SPs (i.e. DCA , ICARDA and FAO).

- (a) The project has yet to make WA for expenses incurred by the PST for the period December 21, 2014 till July 2015 totaling, USD 0.27 million. Similarly WAs are yet to be made for FAO for expenses from January 2014 to June 2015 and for ICARDA expenses from January to June 2015 totaling USD 0.64 million and USD 0.31 million respectively, although expense statements have been received from the SPs.
- (b) In respect of FAO's claim for expenses of USD 0.63 million as mentioned in paragraph (j) above, the PST would need the support of FAO to reclassify the expenses in line with the categories spelt out in the Finance Agreement to facilitate ease in preparing the WA.
- (c) No claim has been received for expenses incurred by DCA for the period December 2014 to date. For ICARDA, a claim statement has not been received for expenses for the period 26 January 2014 to 31 December 2014, although a sum of USD 0.32 million is reflected in the audited accounts furnished by them.

77. **Disbursement.** The implementation performance of this activity is **rated as Unsatisfactory [2]**. Till 15 August, 2015, IFAD has released an aggregate amount of SDR 6.72 million (USD 9.91 million (including the initial Deposit of SDR 0.92 million). The rate of disbursement till such date is approximately 17.08 % (including the Initial Deposit). The project has made a WA for a sum of USD 1.4 million which is pending release from IFAD. In the event of disbursement of this, the rate of disbursement is likely to move up to 19.92 %.

78. **Counterpart funds.** The implementation performance of this activity is rated as **Satisfactory [5]**. No counterpart funding is envisaged from the Government towards fund the CLAP activities. However, through MAIL, the Government has made in-kind contributions in the form of office space, electricity, internet, water, security expenses, etc. On a monthly basis, a journal is raised and postings made in the financial management system to capture the in-kind contribution. The total in-kind contributions for the period 21 December 2014 to 31 July 2015 and the accumulated amount till 31 July amounted to USD 19,355 and USD 74,655 respectively.

79. **Compliance with loan covenants.** The implementation performance of this activity is rated as **Moderately satisfactory [4]**. The Programme has generally complied with the Programme Loan Covenants. Section 7.01 (b) (ii) of the General Conditions was regarding AWPB was not adhered to, as the AWPB for 2015 was not furnished to IFAD within the time stipulated. Paragraph 25 of the Letter to Recipient regarding the appointment of auditors was not adhered to, as the auditors for the fiscal year 2015 have not been appointed so far.

80. **Procurement.** The implementation performance of this activity is rated as **Satisfactory [5]**. Since the last Supervision Mission, the project has made substantial procurements of equipment, goods and services. The procurement of such equipment has been made in accordance with according to the Procurement Law 2008 and The Rules of Procedure of Public Procurement 2009 of Afghanistan which are consistent with the IFAD Procurement Guidelines. The various methods of procurement which were followed were: (i) NCB; (ii) RFQ; (iii) ITQ; (iv) QCBS; and (v) Single Source Selection. The Mission examined the procurements on a test basis with tender documents, quotations, suppliers' list, evaluation statements (technical and financial), works order, agreements and other relevant documents and found the procurement procedures to be satisfactory. Concurrence has been obtained from IFAD wherever necessary.

81. **Audit.** The implementation performance of this activity is rated as **Moderately unsatisfactory [3]**. Audit for the year ended 20th December 2014 was carried out by a firm of Chartered Accountants who had issued an unqualified report. The audit was carried out in accordance with the Internal Standards of Auditing. The auditors have also given a Management Letter as required by their TOR. However the Auditors report failed to highlight the non-disclosure of the transactions pertaining to MRRD and the arithmetical errors/ incorrect information contained in the Financial Statements as mentioned in paragraphs 2(h) and 2 (i) above respectively. The project needs to start maintaining an Audit Log.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
A Project Code needs to be opened for CLAP project under MRRD , in the MoF Chart Of Accounts	MRRD Finance Department	15 September 2015
MRRD to submit six monthly financial reports to PST/ MAIL for the record of relevant CLAP transactions	MRRD Finance Department	On a half yearly basis
The Financial Statements of CLAP to include all relevant information on component 1 managed by MRRD	PST Finance Team	On an annual basis
Withdrawal applications to be made for PST , SP FAO and SP ICARDA aggregating USD 1.23 million.	PST Finance Team	30 September 2015
<u>PST to call for Expense Statement</u>	PST Technical Team/ PST Finance Team	30 September 2015
(a) From ICARDA for the period 9.2.14 to 31.12.2014 to the tune of USD 0.32 million reflected in their audited accounts		
(b) From DCA for expenses for the period December 2014 till date		
PST needs to maintain an Audit Log.	PST Finance Team	On a continuous basis on the completion of each audit.

F. Sustainability

82. **Institution building is deemed Moderately satisfactory [4]:** The project will avoid creating new institutions and mechanisms wherever possible, and work through CDCs, existing interest groups and leading community members. The main focus remains building awareness, strengthening skills and building capacity in as equitable a manner as possible. In addition, all activities will take advantage of various stakeholder institutions' comparative advantage in tandem with lessons learned from similar activities within the RMLSP programme.

83. **Empowerment is deemed Moderately satisfactory [4]:** Whilst it is yet too early to assess empowerment-related activities, all the SPs have a significant track record on mobilisation and capacity building alongside RMLSP. A similar partnership is envisaged with CLAP as selection, mobilisation and training begins next year.

84. **Responsiveness of Service Providers Moderately satisfactory [4]:** SPs are finding flexible project implementation approaches to deal with a variety of anticipated and emerging constraints. In the case of insecurity in Logar province, SPs have developed contextualised and discrete forms of engagement and outreach to ensure targets are met. In the case of emerging and unforeseen

constraints, SPs have either mustered their own resources or developed solutions and requested the advice of the project, which shows their ability and maturity to identify and promote solutions.

85. **Exit strategy Moderately satisfactory [4]:** It is far too early to consider an assessment of a project exit strategy. However, many lessons can be drawn from the manner in which RMLSP has consolidated its activities and managed a coherent approach that aligns a combination of project design, SP activities and responsive changes that reflect maturing capacities of CDCs and beneficiary groups. Integration of lessons learned from RMLSP Exit Strategy workshop on 28 May 2014 can be applied in due course.

86. **Potential for scaling-up and replication Moderately satisfactory [4]:** With implementation still in its nascent phase, the project must glean as many lessons from RMLSP as possible to ensure a robust and evidence-based implementation modality that replicates best practices.

G. Other

87. **Food security is found Moderately satisfactory [4]:** All activities in Components 1 and 2 are following a sequenced and integrated approach to address issues of facilitating beneficiaries' graduation from subsistence farming and a low level of nutrition to that of petty commodity or surplus production over the life of the project.

88. **Quality of natural asset improvement and climate resilience remains Moderately satisfactory [4]:** With only a few activities recently commenced a review of the success in improving natural assets in a climate and conflict sensitive manner will be undertaken during the next Supervision and Implementation Support missions.

H. Conclusion

89. At institution level, CLAP will continue to build upon relationships with MRRD and various other programmes within MAIL. It's management structure based upon the RMLSP model remains a unique selling point to other donors.

90. Whilst Component 2 has finally begun to deliver, it has been the institutional issues around Component 1 that has prevented CLAP from delivering well to date. The change in governmental priorities under the new administration and increasing insecurity have hampered progress. In addition, Logar province was flagged from the outset as an insecure province, but so far UN Agencies and INGOs are cleared for regular movement in two out of the three districts, with only Charkh district remaining insecure and consistently difficult to access – this is now under consultative mitigation. The lack of a minister at MAIL has made it difficult to recruit staff, have contracts signed and budgets approved between MAIL and the MoF. In addition, the strategic changes within MAIL, MRRD and several other key ministries will require CLAP to respond rapidly. It is therefore recommended that the proposed MTR is brought forward to April 2016 in order to provide guidance and an amended strategic path closely aligned to evolving governmental objectives. This will allow CLAP to achieve set targets and deliverables in line with the AWP&B for 2016 and onwards.

Appendix 1: Summary of project status and ratings

Basic Facts

Country	Afghanistan			Project ID	1637 [1100001637]	Loan/DSF/Grant/ASAP FI No.	1000004454
Project	Community Livestock and Agriculture Project					Top-up Loan/DSF/Grant/ASAP FI No.	
Date of Update	05-Jan-2016						
Supervising Inst.	IFAD						
No. of Supervisions	2	No. of Implementation Support/Follow-up missions	0				
Last Supervision	30-Aug-2015	Last Implementation Support/Follow-up mission					

USD million Disb. rate %

Approval	13-Dec-2012			Total financing	65.51	
Agreement	08-Apr-2013	Effectiveness lag	3.9	IFAD Total	58.00	
Entry into force	08-Apr-2013	PAR value	-----	IFAD loan	0.00	0
First disbursement	12-Nov-2013			DSF grant	58.00	24
MTR		Last amendment		IFAD grant		
Original completion	30-Jun-2019	Last audit	23-Jun-2015	ASAP grant	0.00	0
Current completion	30-Jun-2019			Domestic Total	7.06	
Current closing	31-Dec-2019			Beneficiaries	3.48	0
No. of extensions	0			National Govern	3.58	0
				External Cofinancing Total	0.46	
				FAO	0.46	0

Project Performance Ratings

B.1 Fiduciary Aspects	Last	Current	B.2 Project implementation progress	Last	Current
1. Quality of financial management	4	4	1. Quality of project management	5	5
2. Acceptable disbursement rate	3	2	2. Performance of M&E	4	3
3. Counterpart funds	4	5	3. Coherence between AWPB & implementation	4	4
4. Compliance with financing covenants	5	4	4. Gender focus	4	4
5. Compliance with procurement	5	5	5. Poverty focus	4	4
6. Quality and timeliness of audits	4	3	6. Effectiveness of targeting approach	5	5
			7. Innovation and learning	4	4
			8. Climate and environment focus	4	4
B.3 Outputs and outcomes	Last	Current	B.4 Sustainability	Last	Current
1. Community Dev	4	4	1. Institution building (organizations, etc.)	4	4
2. Livestock & Agric Dev	4	4	2. Empowerment	4	4

3. Quality of beneficiary participation	4	4
4. Responsiveness of service providers	4	4
5. Exit strategy (readiness and quality)	4	4
6. Potential for scaling up and replication	4	4

B.5 Justification of ratings

The CLAP has been caught up in the security concerns in one of the project areas as well as government's initiative in streamlining ministries' policy changes which slowed down the implementation speed especially the Component 1. However, during the current mission key issues have been identified and concrete action plans, mainly through the planned MTR mission in early 2016, were discussed in detail with the PST, SPs and MAIL.

Overall Assessment and Risk Profile

	Last	Current
C.1 Physical/financial assets	4	4
C.2 Food security	4	4
C.3 Quality of natural asset improvement and climate resilience	4	4
C.4 Overall implementation progress (Sections B1 and B2)	4	4

Rationale for implementation progress rating

The overall implementation progress has been slow despite the fact that some physical activities have progressed well. Field visits confirm that the delayed construction of internal infrastructure has been started and undergoing. The agricultural support, and social and livelihood support subcomponents have progressed satisfactorily.

C.5 Likelihood of achieving the development objectives (section B3 and B4)	4	4
--	---	---

Rationale for development objectives rating

Implementation for all project components is progressing in a more coordinated manner towards achieving the objectives. The main constraint had been a the finalisation of an agreement between MAIL and MRRD on Component 1, and this is progressing well.

C.6 Risks Short description of major risks for each section and their impact on achievement of development objectives and sustainability	
Fiduciary aspects	no major risks.
Project implementation progress	The slow start-up and restriction on mobility of project staff due to security threats continue to be the main risk factors for CLAP. Since the last supervision Mission, all activities in Charkh, Logar were put on hold due to insecurity – this has not improved and a multi-stakeholder process in underway to identify a replacement district
Outputs and outcomes	Component 1 has now found a way to deliver through both MAIL/OFWM and MRRD/NSP. However, there remain issues over the capacity of the former. Contingency planning will be required to ensure targets are met. In addition, Under Component 2 there will need to be a strategic shift for two of the sub-components in response to externalities. Advancing the MTR to March 2016 will allow the project to undertake this in a timely manner
Sustainability	no major risks at this point.

Proposed Follow-up

Issue / Problem	Recommended Action	Timing	Status
Slow progress of implementation	Project Management Committee (PMC) will further coordinate with relevant agencies to finalise and implement the MOU between MAIL/MRRD	30 Sept 2015	On-going: draft MoU now at signing stage
More M&E indicators need to be developed	Project M&E will recruit full complement of staff and develop a the tools and ability to perform oversight of a growing IFAD portfolio. Greater planning and depth is required to develop durable mechanisms to deliver against multiple expectations (MAIL/IFAD/SPs, etc.)	31 Jan 2016	On-going: recruitment for 2 M&E Officers is under way. Training needs are being identified. Training is being identified and a more strategic and coherent approach is being considered
Knowledge management requires improvement	The KM Officer post remains vacant since the last SM. The KM strategy still lacks an action plan. In addition, there is a need for stressing knowledge management as an important part of the overall project management in order to promote continued innovation and learning. Targets are falling behind and this will hinder the required preparation for an earlier-than-planned MTR. Much work still needs to be undertaken	From Sept 2015 and continued	ongoing

Additional observations

Appendix 2: Updated logical framework: Progress against objectives, outcomes and outputs

Results hierarchy	Indicators	Means of verification	Assumptions
Goal: To contribute to reduce poverty in rural Afghanistan	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - % decrease in population below the poverty line (Target: 10% decrease from 2012 baseline) - % decrease in child malnutrition (under 5 yrs old, chronic, acute-underweight)(Target: 5% decrease from 2012 baseline)^a 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Impact surveys (including RIMS anchor indicators) at baseline and completion. - Impact Evaluation Report 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Price of food does not increase relative to earnings. - No major natural disasters or major conflict situation.
Purpose: To improve food security of 169,500 rural households in selected districts in the provinces of Kabul, Parwan, and Logar by increasing agriculture and livestock productivity	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - % increase of agriculture/livestock productivity (measured as quantity of milk/cow, n. of eggs/chick, yield/ha) among households targeted by the project <p>Targets:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 100% increase in milk/cow - 200% increase in annual income from milk production/hh - Increase in net income of poultry keeping hh (Target: +400%) - 15%-40% increase per hectare from the adoption of high yielding varieties (forage/vegetable) Yield/ha (kg) of certified seeds (1st and 2nd planting): wheat (3.4, 2.55); lentil (0.5, 0.38); chickpea (1.0; 0.73); mung bean (0.9, 0.7); potato (19.1, 14.34); tomato (38.3, 28.69); onion (31.9, 23.91); beans (0.7, 0.48) - No. of households with increased agriculture/livestock productivity (Target: 169,500) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - RIMS plus survey and rolling baseline - Annual Outcome Survey. - Impact Evaluation Report - Knowledge Products - Newspaper items - Study reports 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - No security problems in the rural areas for conducting surveys and studies. - The vulnerable and poor HHs gain relatively more in terms of food and nutritional security, assets building and income - Project implementation structure has ¼ female staff members
Objective 1: Community Development Capacity of local communities and local institutions enhanced, cultivable land increased, agriculture production/productivity increased, health condition improved and water-borne diseases decreased	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - % increase in agriculture productivity (yield/ha) (Target: +10%) - No of households benefiting from productive infrastructures (Target: 115,000) - Portion of population enjoying access to clean drinking water, basic sanitation, - Portion of population benefiting from irrigation infrastructure and water storage facilities, - Net reduction in water born diseases - MAIL's capacity in water management & - 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - RIMS survey - Reports of civil work conducted - Completion report of contractors (civic work) - Reports of SPs in charge of other sub/components - CDC's records, minutes, etc. - Work schedules 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Smooth implementation procedures and smart fund flow - Community Participatory Monitoring (CPM) system functional including women - Performance supervisory system of NSP operational in place - ANDS -overarching framework for women's rural development and their involvement in the

Results hierarchy	Indicators	Means of verification	Assumptions
	<p>infrastructure technologies significantly improved</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - % of beneficiaries expressing satisfaction on the quality of services provided by local government agencies staff (measured through questionnaires) (Target: at least 80%) - % of organization members expressing satisfaction on the quality of management of community organizations (measured through questionnaires) (Target: at least 80%)b 		<p>agricultural sector – acknowledged</p>
<p>Objective 2: Productive Infrastructures</p> <p>Crop yield increased, income opportunities increased, health conditions improved (thanks to the construction of small-scale productive infrastructures)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - % reduction in water-borne diseases(Target: 8% reduction from baseline) - % increase in No. of hh having access to drinking water and sanitation facilities(Target: 1.3% increase from baseline) - % increase in agriculture productivity (yield/ha)(Target: 10% increase from baseline) - Portion of population obtaining temporary employment through community based infrastructure schemes - Portion of poorer and disadvantaged section of population benefit most 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - RIMS and reports of civil work conducted - Completion report of contractors (civic work) - Reports of SPs in charge of other sub/components - CDC's records, minutes, etc. - Work schedules - Monitoring data/reports of Provincial M&ED 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Smooth implementation procedures and smart fund flow - Community Participatory Monitoring (CPM) system functional including women - Performance supervisory system of NSP operational in place - ANDS -overarching framework for women's rural development and their involvement in the agricultural sector – acknowledged
<p>Objective 3: Gender Mainstreaming</p> <p>Role/Involvement of women in productive activities and productive potential increased</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - % increase of women who have control of productive assets - % increase in net income among women - % of female professional staff (among MAIL/DAIL and SPs) (Target: at least 25%) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Staff records - RIMS reports - Specific gender impact surveys - Case studies - Progress and Annual reports of SPs, DAIL/MAIL 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Project implementation structure has ¼ female staff members
Outcome (community development component)			
<p>Outcome 1.1. Enhancing capacity of CDC to identify sub project, design and complete sub projects</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - % of covered CDC are functional and having regular meetings - % decrease in conflict in communities - Number of community plans included in Government plans* - Number of project implemented by CDC without 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Baseline and end line report - NSP annual Report - NSP PIM repot - M&ED report - AOS report 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Security condition allow smooth implementation of project - No major natural disasters or major conflict within communities

Results hierarchy	Indicators	Means of verification	Assumptions
	any support - Number of infrastructure are functional and maintained by CDC - Number of DCD member nominated for district consul	- RIMs report	
Outcome 2.1. Communities mobilized, activated and prepared to successfully participate in the participatory designed infrastructure schemes (agri/irrigation, water supply, water conservation based on rain water harvesting and sanitation)	- Number of community projects are functional* - Portion of marginalised and deprived section of population participating and benefiting from community infrastructure schemes - Portion of population obtaining temporary employment through community based infrastructure schemes - Portion of poorer and disadvantaged section of population benefit most - Results (irrigation and basic infrastructure, etc.) complement dairy/poultry/seed/animal health sub-components	- Social safeguard screening report - Survey data (site selection, etc.) - Progr. and Reports of training/sensitizations conducted - Progress report of SPs	- Complying to selection criteria of schemes (NSP, OFWM) - CDCs willing to contribute counterpart funding (cash, in-kind) - No adverse or negative environmental impact
Outcome 3.1. Enhancing women capacity (leadership, decision making, literacy)	- Number of CDC with women membership - % of women in established cooperatives - Number of women can read and write - Number of women headed HH restocking their animals - Women participate in the to-be-established Poultry Board, - Organised female poultry keepers (VPPGs) liaise with other poultry oriented farmer organisation (Poultry Associations) - # of women having membership of self help groups	- NSP quarterly, annual report - SP annual report	- Head of the families allow women to join development activities - women interested to get membership of cooperatives
Outcome 2.2. Through community-led canal lining, water course improvements and water diversion, water resource management strengthened	- Portion of population saying that they do more with 'each drop of water' then before - Net increase of crop (agri/fodder) yield (as result of more water at the right time) - Net decrease of water conflicts - Net time (f/m) saved is used for productive activities - Functional Irrigation Associations	- Progress reports of SPs and project teams - CDCs reports (minutes, listings, etc.) - Case studies, stories	- Appropriate technologies used for lining of water courses - NSP Technical manuals used and up-dated at regular intervals - No on-going water disputes - Water course located in secure area - Traditional community water management institutions (Mirab) acknowledged

Results hierarchy	Indicators	Means of verification	Assumptions
Output (community Development)			
Output 1.1. CDC trained and capacitated	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - No of people trained on community management topics* - No of CDC trained (project selection and implementation and other relevant subjects) - No CDC trained on M&O of projects - No skill labours trained 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - NSP monthly data, - NSP quarterly report - PST reports - RIMS Report 	As above
Output 2.1. Preparation phase completed CDC mobilization, CDP revision ,project selection, design)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Community plans formulated* - No of FP identified - No of CDC selected and mobilized 		
Output 2.2. Sub project completed (water supply)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - No of water supply completed - No of HH benefiting from water supply schemes. 		
Output 2.3. Sub project completed (water supply)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Drinking water system constructed/ Rehabilitated* - No of Infrastructure sub projects completed - No of HH benefiting from Infrastructure sub projects - Length of canal lining constructed - Length of protection/retaining wall constructed - marginalized land under irrigation 		
Output 3.1. Women trained and capacitated	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - No of women trained in leadership - No of women trained Backyard poultry Keeping, dairy processing and hygiene, marketing, animal health / husbandry and enterprises development 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - SPs reports - Project reports 	
Output 3.2. Literacy courses for women organized	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - No of literacy courses organized - No women literacy trainers hired - No of women attending literacy courses - No of women graduated from literacy courses 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - SPs report - Literacy courses attendance sheet 	
Livestock and Agriculture Development Component			
Objective 2: Livestock and Agriculture Development Increased agriculture and livestock productivity	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Improve livestock and Agriculture production* - Increase in average hh income from dairy, (Target: +200%) (Expected n. of beneficiary hh: 3,000) - Increase in net income of adopters (Target: at least 20%-30%) (Expected n. of beneficiary hh: 81,000) - Increase in net income of livestock keepers (Target: +25%) (Expected n. of beneficiary hh: 20,000) - Increase in income of poultry beneficiaries (Target+&250) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - RIMS, - Reports of civil work conducted - Completion report of contractors (civic work) - Reports of SPs in charge of other sub/components - CDC's records, minutes, etc. - Work schedules 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Attractive market for milk does not imply selling all milk; sufficient milk kept for home consumption - Close interactions and synergies with other components/sub-components of CLAP, overall coordination via CDCs (esp. female CDCs) and adherence to Project Gender Strategy

Results hierarchy	Indicators	Means of verification	Assumptions
Objective 3: Dairy Development Dairy milk production, processing and marketing increased, dairy coops, union, and federation created and enabling capacity and policy environment	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Increase in average number of cattle per family (Target: from 1.254 to 1.75) - Increase in milk production (Target 150% per cow) - Increase in milk consumption at hh level (Target: 1.5 l/day) - Increase in average hh income from dairy target: +200 - Net increase of local employment due to dairying; (\pm 132%) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - RIMS I and II data, - Records and reports of collection centres and processing plant - Progress reports of local service providers - In-depth survey on sample basis, - MAIL records, 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - High Input High Output dairy approach does not undermine food production neither deteriorates sustainable agriculture practices - Security situation will not get worse - No abnormal droughts or water shortage - Optimal coordination with relevant stakeholders - Cooperation with other actors active in the poultry sub sector in particular those working with women - Policy for poultry sub-sector is finalised - Poultry board will be established
Objective 4: Kuchi development Enhanced livelihoods and resilience against predictable livestock emergencies of pastoralists and agro-pastoralists communities (Kuchi) in Parwan, Kabul and Logar Provinces	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Net changes in the average number of livestock owned per HH (Baseline+25%) - Net annual income increased of livestock keeping HHs (Baseline +25%) - 50 Percentage of Kuchi HHs able to have access year-round appropriate feed for their animals - Net changes in livestock production (milk) (target +0.05 l) - #Good Practices and lesson learnt from the project recorded and disseminated - Percentage of women engaged in project activities (Target +15%) - New and existing institutions able to sustain the successful interventions - Kuchi councils and kuchi board functional and relevant 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - RIMS I and II data - Evaluation reports - Final Project Report - AOS Reports - Relevant Reports of Directorate of Tribal Affairs - Baseline data & follow-up surveys - Kuchi board by law - Council Attendances Sheets 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Bad Security situation doesn't prevent access to Kuchi HHs - No serious droughts or water shortage - Optimal cooperation among the relevant stakeholders - Cooperation with WISP, WOCAT realistic - No conflict between Kuchi and Hazara nation - Government and stakeholders adhere to the privatization protocol
Objective 5: Poultry keeping Improve on a sustainable basis the livelihoods, incomes, food security and nutritional status of poor and vulnerable rural	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Net changes in HH food -, nutritional security and assets - Net annual income (\$250/non-monetary) of poultry 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - RIMS I and II data - Evaluation reports - Final Project Report 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Security situation will not get worse - No abnormal droughts or water

Results hierarchy	Indicators	Means of verification	Assumptions
households.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> keeping HHs - Percentage of HHs able to secure home-based year-around balanced feeding for their fowl (traditional breeds) - Net Productive Output per Hen (improved traditional), per batch (commercial), - Good Practices regarding traditional and small scale poultry (fowl) identified and used in FFS, - New and existing institutions able to sustain the successful interventions, 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Relevant Reports Human Health Department / specific survey data - Baseline data & follow-up surveys 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> shortage - Optimal coordination with relevant stakeholders - Cooperation with other actors active in the poultry sub sector in particular those working with women - Policy for poultry sub-sector will be finalised - Poultry board will be established
Objective 6: Improved Food, Fodder, and Vegetable Crops New drought resistant and high yielding improved varieties of wheat, food and forage legumes, and vegetables developed and adopted	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Number of farmers adopting new seeds and related best practices (Target: +81,000) - % increase of food, fodder, and vegetable production (Target: +25-40% over existing rates) - Increase in net income of adopters (target: at least +20-30%) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - RIMS Annual Report - Outcome monitoring reports. - Project Progress Reports. - Study and Surveys reports - Case Studies Knowledge Products 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Climatic conditions favourable - Demand for cereal products persist - Government policies and strategies supportive of agriculture and livestock development - Resource teams confident and able to visit communities in remote areas
Outcome Livestock and Agriculture development component			
Outcome 3.1. Developed regarding dairy husbandry (incl. health, breeding, feed and fodder production), dairy processing and marketing at field, district and provincial level (MAIL, Dairy producer organisation, Input & Service providers)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Net increase of marketable milk; \pm aver. 7 litres/HH/day - Net reduction in reported diseases, ailments among Dairy Animals - Net increases in the annual revenue of dairy processing plant. - Net increase in fodder quantity and quality (improved seeds) - Net increase in female extension and field workers (ToT approach) - % increase in usage of concentrate feed 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Case studies & stories - Monitoring reports (technical indicators; calving interval, milk production, etc.) - Project progress report 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - No abnormal droughts or water shortage - Optimal coordination with relevant stakeholders - Security situation will not get worse - Cooperation with WISP, WOCAT realistic

Results hierarchy	Indicators	Means of verification	Assumptions
Outcome 3.2. Public and Private Institutions established and capacitated	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Dairy producer organizations set-up and functional* - Dairy industry federation set-up and functional - Women representation in coops and federation substantial - Dairy sub-sector policy, strategy and rules and regulations in place (led and implemented by MAIL) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Case studies & stories - Monitoring reports (technical indicators; calving interval, milk production, etc.) - Project progress report 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - No abnormal droughts or water shortage - Optimal coordination with relevant stakeholders - Security situation will not get worse - Cooperation with WISP, WOCAT realistic
Outcome 3.3. Enhanced Women participation in the project activities	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 50% of innovation/diversification fund allocated to target women. - % of female YPC with full time employment 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Annual outcome survey report - SP Annual report. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Local communities allow women to participate in the training and visits
Outcome 4.1. Improved access to quality veterinary services to pastoralists and agro-pastoralists (Kuchi Community) through a comprehensive community-based approach	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Percentage of pastoralists and agro-pastoralists(Kuchi community (m/f) who say that they have access to quality veterinary services - Percentage of pastoralists and agro-pastoralists (Kuchi community (m/f) who say that the health of their animals is satisfactory - 50% decreased in livestock mortality - Increased client base of VFU staff(Para-vet) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Baseline and periodic surveys - Project monitoring reports - Kuchi department reports 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Government and stakeholders adhere to the privatization protocol
Outcome 4.2. Improved access to appropriate year round livestock feeds	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Proportion of Kuchi (pastoralists and agro-pastoralist) who say that they have no shortage of livestock feeds. - Rangeland management guideline developed? 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Baseline and periodic surveys - Monitoring reports of project staff and government line departments 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - No serious droughts or water shortage
Outcome 4.3. Access to markets and value of livestock products increased and related livelihoods enhanced through value chain development	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Percentage of Kuchi pastoralists and agro-pastoralists who say that their income is has improved due to adding value to their products - Type, and quantity of value added products 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Market surveys - Baseline and periodic surveys - Monitoring reports 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Market instability doesn't significantly affect products marketing - Imported products don't significantly undermine the local produce
Outcome 4.4. Improved income of settled female Kuchis through small income generating schemes	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Percentage increment in income of settled female Kuchis (baseline+20%) - % of settled Kuchis reported increase in herd size 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - HH income survey - AOS survey report 	

Results hierarchy	Indicators	Means of verification	Assumptions
Outcome 4.5. Successful restocking interventions for Kuchis who lost their livestock (Based on the results of a pilot in year 1-2)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - % of Kuchi that have been restocked successfully - % of restocked animals alive up to end of the project. - No Good Practice(s) regarding restocking of Kuchi herds documented, shared and accepted by MAIL, Tribal Affairs, CDC, etc. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Assessment surveys - Monitoring reports - Records of Kuchi departments and other stakeholders 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Availability of shoats preferred by the Kuchis on the market
Outcome 4.6. In order to arrive at sustainable and productive agro – and silvi pasture systems, research, studies and surveys will be conducted to complement and underpin the approaches and technology options deployed	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Number of findings which were relevant for achieving Kuchi project outcome - % of Kuchi HHs adopting new technology for livestock production. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Published documents 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Qualified researchers are available and able to travel to the field - Stakeholders are willing to participate in the surveys/provide information
Outcome 5.1. Enhancing poultry production and productivity in three provinces and promote sustainability of the development efforts through organization of women's Village Poultry Production Groups (VPPGs)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - % of VPPGs are functional - % reduce mortality, - % of HHs satisfied with to access services (ethno veterinary, veterinary, extension, etc.) needed. - Women engaged in small scale commercial poultry production, say that they enjoy FFS, Portion of Leaders of FPPOs who say that they have both monetary and non-monetary benefits of providing services to the members 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Study report/article published w.r.t. on-farm testing - Baseline and periodic survey - Project monitoring reports - In- and output data of commercial flocks (ad random sample) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Link to/cooperation with Govt. / other actors regarding animal biodiversity (animal genetic resources) possible Access to experiences of other projects / actors active in small scale poultry systems - Institutions (MAIL, projects, programmes, etc.) willing to share data and cooperate - Women are allowed to operate commercially viable poultry enterprises of different sizes (25 – 500, even 1000, etc.)
Outcome 5.2. To provide income generation opportunities to rural vulnerable households and improve their food security.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - % increase in annual income \$250, - %of pullets survived after one year/HH. - % of HHs reported increases in the number of pullets. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Market surveys - Value chain analysis - Baseline and periodic surveys - Monitoring reports - Reports of FPPOs 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Market instability doesn't significantly affect products marketing - Imported products don't significantly undermine the local produce - Kabul poultry association extends cooperation

Results hierarchy	Indicators	Means of verification	Assumptions
Outcome 6.1. High yielding improved varieties released through fast-track adaptive research	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - New high yielding improved varieties of food – (wheat, chick pea, lentil), fodder crop (alfalfa, grass pea, vetch, clover) and vegetables (mung bean, potato, tomato, onion) successfully released; minimum 6 - Concerned breeder and foundation seeds available at Improved Seed Enterprise of MAIL minimum 6 <u>onion revised to Garlic</u> - Concerned registered seed available to VBSEs minimum 6 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Progress reports research teams (ARIA) - Progress reports of ISE of MAIL, - Records of VBSEs 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Partnerships and linkages developed with key actors (ARIA) Agriculture Directorate of respective provinces. - Improved Seed Enterprise of MAIL - f/m farmers willing to be involved in testing and selection of suitable varieties - participatory varietal selection (PVS) –scientists consult f/m farmers, f/m farmers evaluate varieties under their own cultivation practices- approach adopted
Outcome 6.2. Accelerate adoption of newly released high yielding varieties	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - VBSEs produce 1000 – 2000 MT certified seed per year - VBSEs linked with potential buyers (PRTs, NGOs, Seed Distribution Programmes) - Production of target crops increased by 25-40 % - storage losses reduced by more than 80 % 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Records of VBSEs - ANSOR records of members - RIMS reports - Case studies 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Working through VBSEs implies f/m farmer participation, decentralized seed production, business-orientation, access to appropriate technology and enterprise sustainability - F/M Farmers with minimum resources (land, irrigation water) and relevant experiences willing to devote some land for seed production - VBSEs receive inputs (machinery, appropriate equipment, registered seed, input for marketing seed, etc.) in time - VBSEs willing to engage in seed business - Pro-poor approach of 'of the f/m farmer, by the f/m farmer, and for the f/m farmer' adhered too,

Results hierarchy	Indicators	Means of verification	Assumptions
Outcome 6.3. Establish and provide resources and technical support to farmer-led Village Based Seed Enterprises (VBSEs):	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Number Village Based Seed Enterprises (VBSEs) established and functional* - Number of functioning storages and processing facilities - All VBSE members trained in seed production, processing and marketing, - Poor and landless f/m farmers in VBSE; i.e. $\geq 25\%$ - Female farmers in VBSE; at least 2 VBSE with active enterprising women, - VBSE has pro-poor modalities in place (e.g. contract farming (contract grower, share-cropping); generated employment for poor, landless and women 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - RIMs report 	
Outcome 6.4. Capacity Development	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Number of researches conducted by MAIL - Number of VBSE functional 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Annual Report 	
Output (Integrated Diary Scheme)			
Output 3.2.1. A system for the provision of animal health services established.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - People trained in livestock production and technology* - HHs receiving facilitated animal health services* - Number of VFU and AI technician trained and equipped - Number of HH received A.I services - Number of animals vaccinated, de wormed, treatment - Number of mortality case decrease best on regular vaccination. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -SPs monthly report, Field visits report -Project progress report -RIMS report 	
Output 3.2.2. Animal Feed recourse developed	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - People trained in crops production and technology* - Increased cultivation of improved fodder seeds. - Ha of land improved fodders crops grwon.* - Number of demonstrations plots established 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -SPs monthly report, Field visits report - RIMs report 	
Output 3.2.1. Dairy federation established	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - New livestock production groups established/strengthened* - No of people in livestock group established* - No of women got membership in coops - No of women got membership in federation. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - SPs monthly report, Coops and federation record, field visits. - RIMS report 	Dairy federation consul registered with GoAF

Results hierarchy	Indicators	Means of verification	Assumptions
Output 3.2.2. Enterprises development	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Enhance capacity of Kabul dairy factory processing up to 30MT/ shift - New equipment installed (names) - Enlarge animal feed storage capacity - Marketing campaign for milk and milk products contracted 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - SPs monthly report 	-No shortage of water
Output 3.3.1. Modalities for innovation and diversification fund developed	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - No female YPC recruited and graduated - No of women trained - No of women participating in exchange visits 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - SPs monthly report - PST HR report 	- Availability of female fresh graduated in the relevant field
Output (Kuchi sub component)			
1.1. Functional and sustainable veterinary services facilitated	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Number of Mobile VFUs operating sustainably preferably by Kuchi - Herd Health package developed and in use - # of m/f preferably Kuchi BVWs fully active and their services appreciated - Formalised Monitoring System to monitor VFUs in place and DAIL involved 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Through data analysis of M&E systems - Surveys - Annual Planning Progress reports - Study reports - Supervision missions 	
1.2. Year-around appropriate feeding achieved	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Number of fodder banks established and utilized by the target Kuchi community - Number of Kuchi trained on preparation of Urea-treatment, Silage making, etc 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - SP report - Project report 	
1.3. Value addition turned popular and achieved high adoption rate	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Number and type of satisfactory value additions - Type and frequency of coordinating with others (other sub components, other actors, etc.) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - SP report - Project report 	
1.4. Settled female Kuchis engaged in income generation activities	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Number of settled Kuchis(women) engaged in income generating activities through self-help groups 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - SP report - Project report 	
1.5. Kuchies who restocked their herds are satisfied	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Household received animal from restocking/ redistribution* - Best methods/practices of restocking Kuchi herds recorded 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - SP report - Project report - RIMs Report 	

Results hierarchy	Indicators	Means of verification	Assumptions
1.6. Through cooperation with others (in/outside the country), best technology options and approaches in sustainable, ecologically sound Pastoralism in AFG generated.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Number and type of cooperation (research, surveys, studies) - Number of appropriate technology options and approaches introduced which appeal to stakeholders; MAIL, communities, CDCs, etc. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - SP report - Project report 	
Output (Backyard poultry)			
1.1. 20000 rural women trained in poultry husbandry.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - No of Master – and village poultry trainers able to work with FFS method successfully - No of women trained - Inputs provided (via FFS; subsidies, incentives, etc.) - No of pullets coops constructed - No of good practices recorded and disseminated. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -SP monthly report - Project report - RIMs report 	
1.2. A system of inputs supply (pullets, feed, vet med etc) and product marketing established	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - No of Master – and village poultry trainers able to work with FFS method successfully - Number and type of technology options developed and adopted by commercial oriented female poultry entrepreneurs - No of suppliers linked with VPPGs 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -SP monthly report - Project report -RIMs report 	
1.3. Poultry health programme established and institutionalized.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - No of pullets vaccinated - No of VGL selected and trained. - No of VGL provided with pullets health Kits. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -SP monthly report - Project report -RIMs report 	No outbreak of pullets diseases.
1.4. Women provided with poultry package and trained	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Household received poultry from restocking/redistribution* - Women trained in poultry raring and keeping - Amount of pullets feed distributed 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -SP monthly report - Project report -RIMs report 	
Output(Food, Vegetable and fodder crops)			
1.1. Adoption of newly released high yielding varieties accelerated through adoption of participatory approaches	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - People trained in crop production and technology* - 1200 high visible participatory demonstrations established; spread over targeted districts, - 120-180 f/m participants per FFSs; minimum 25 FFSs - Results of FFSs disseminated through CDCs, Shura and other forum; contact details of seed 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Curriculum training - Work Plans of Research and Extension teams - Workshop and conference proceedings - Reports of FFSs - CDC reports - Radio program 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Seeds of newly released varieties / other inputs timely available to f/m farmers participating in participatory demonstration plots - Extension teams timely capacitated to work with Farmer Field School (FFS) approach

Results hierarchy	Indicators	Means of verification	Assumptions
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> outlets (VBSEs) included - Demonstration plots established - Radio program produced and broadcasted - At least, 1000 f/m farmers adapted newly released varieties 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Records of performance demonstration plots 	
1.2. Village Based Seed Enterprises (VBSEs) established in 12 districts of 3 target provinces (one in each district)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Apex organization formed and formulated* - 9 (seven new and 2 existence) VBS established in registered with GoA - Newly established VBSEs joined ANSOR - VBSE member received agricultural implementations for seed production and processing - VBSE members trained in seed production, processing and marketing - In each province seed stores constructed for VBSEs - VBSEs achieved the capacity to produce between 1000 – 2000 MT certified seeds/ year - About 81,000 additional farmers accessed improved varieties and certified seeds - VBSEs linked with potential buyers (NGOs, Seed Distribution Program) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - RIMs report - SP report 	
1.3. MAIL teams (research, extension) capacitated to confidentially work with PVS and FFS approaches	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Minimum of 15 researchers skilled in and apply PVS approach - Extension workers able to conduct FFSs and promote entrepreneurship - FFSs conducted: 25, spread over the targeted districts, - Extension workers and selected f/m farmers confident with Best Practices (use of improved seed, fertilizer, manure and water optimized) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -Research report (result) -SP, project report 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Good Practices to realise full potential of improved varieties identified and applied

^a It will not be possible to attribute the achievement of these results to project activities.

^b The measurement of these qualitative indicators would rely on Focus Group Discussions and Key Informant Interviews as MOVs. This will be fine-tuned and finalised during the establishment of the M&E system at project start-up.

^c This will be measured through a qualitative measure (i.e. women self-perception, measured through Focus Group Discussions or Key Informant Interviews and possibly Most Significant Change measures, as may be found suitable during establishment of detailed M&E system during start-up).

Appendix 3: Summary of key actions to be taken within agreed timeframes

Action Area	Action Agreed	Date	Whom	Progress
Project Implementation	The results of a replacement district for Charkh district, Logar province will be finalised in a consultative manner.	December 2015	PST	The results of a replacement district for Charkh district, Logar province will be finalised in a consultative manner.
Component 1	Finalise the joint draft letter by MRRD and MAIL and send to IFAD for its NOL	15 Sept 2015	CLAP	Finalize the joint draft letter by MRRD and MAIL and send to IFAD for its NOL
	Finalize the TORs for Consulting Firm and initiate the process of Procurement	15 Sept 2015	CLAP	Finalize the TORs for Consulting Firm and initiate the process of Procurement
	Develop a Coordinating Mechanism among CLAP, NSP and OFWM	30 Sept 2015	CLAP, NSP, OFWM	Develop a Coordinating Mechanism among CLAP, NSP and OFWM
	Formulate and Submit revised Work Plan in accordance with the Changed Scope of NSP work	30 Oct 2015	NSP / CLAP	Formulate and Submit revised Work Plan in accordance with the Changed Scope of NSP work
	Complete the preliminary field survey of all NSP Schemes	30 Oct 2015	NSP	Complete the preliminary field survey of all NSP Schemes
	Appoint an NSP Focal Person/Coordinator for CLAP	Immediate	NSP	Appoint an NSP Focal Person/Coordinator for CLAP
	Finalise the joint draft letter by MRRD and MAIL and send to IFAD for its NOL	15 Sept 2015	CLAP	Finalise the joint draft letter by MRRD and MAIL and send to IFAD for its NOL
Component 2	FAO focus on providing support to farmers productivity and provide evidence that milk yields have been increased by 15% among dairy supported dairy farmers.	February 2016	FAO and M&E by PMU	FAO focus on providing support to farmers' productivity and provide evidence that milk yields

			have been increased by 15% among dairy supported dairy farmers.
FAO develop a TA plan for the dairy sector aimed at assisting to improve dairy products on the shelves.	December 2015	FAO	FAO develop a TA plan for the dairy sector aimed at assisting to improve dairy products on the shelves.
FAO undertake a survey to assess potential areas of milk production where groups are interested in commercial dairy production and locations for milk collection centres (informal or individually-owned)	January 2016	FAO	FAO undertake a survey to assess potential areas of milk production where groups are interested in commercial dairy production and locations for milk collection centres (informal or individually-owned)
Develop ToRs for establishing a network of advisors embedded with dairy plants both large and small (both private and cooperative) in the project area. These advisors would act as value chain managers' and support dairy farmers with breeding (appropriate sized animals), feeding, fodder, production, watering, health, housing/stabling, economic and quality of milk.	February 2016	FAO	Develop ToRs for establishing a network of advisors embedded with dairy plants both large and small (both private and cooperative) in the project area. These advisors would act as value chain managers' and support dairy farmers with breeding (appropriate sized animals), feeding, fodder, production, watering, health, housing/stabling, economic and quality of milk.
Prior to the commencement of field implementation the PMU shall identify MFIs interested to be linked to the poultry model. The PMU, SPs and selected MFIs shall develop a linkage model introducing savings and credit products to the backyard poultry groups from the onset of implementation. This work shall be completed by October 2015 and	October 2015	PMU	Prior to the commencement of field implementation the PMU shall identify MFIs interested to be linked to the poultry model. The PMU, SPs and selected MFIs shall

presented to IFAD for no objection.

develop a linkage model introducing savings and credit products to the backyard poultry groups from the onset of implementation. This work shall be completed by October 2015 and presented to IFAD for no objection.

Careful monitor prices of seed from existing VBSEs and those established under the project and from involved commercial seed enterprise. Who customers (very poor, poor, better off and well off farmers) of the seed from the various types of seed enterprises shall also be examined. The results of this monitoring/investigation shall be presented to the MTR 2016.

February 2016 PMU-M&E

Careful monitor prices of seed from existing VBSEs and those established under the project and from involved commercial seed enterprise. Who customers (very poor, poor, better off and well off farmers) of the seed from the various types of seed enterprises shall also be examined. The results of this monitoring/investigation shall be presented to the MTR 2016.

Evaluate the capacity building plan for national research personnel and monitor that capacity is transferred to the national system though regular interview of relevant researchers from the national research institutions. The first finding of this monitoring shall be provided to the MTR 2016.

February 2016 PMU-M&E

Evaluate the capacity building plan for national research personnel and monitor that capacity is transferred to the national system though regular interview of relevant researchers from the national research institutions. The first finding

			of this monitoring shall be provided to the MTR 2016.
Document the workable activities and prepare relevant information material for awareness and replication of the models	February 2016	PMU-M&E	Document the workable activities and prepare relevant information material for awareness and replication of the models
It is proposed that the project request an engineer to assist to further improve the mobile yoghurt kit making it more durable for transportation when the community is moving between grazing areas.	Before end of 2015	DCA	It is proposed that the project request an engineer to assist to further improve the mobile yoghurt kit making it more durable for transportation when the community is moving between grazing areas.
Harmonisation of M&E with SPs to be completed	30 Oct 2015	M&E unit of PST and SPs	Harmonisation of M&E with SPs to be completed
Baseline and indicator work will need to be completed to support the MTR process	31 Dec 2015	M&E unit of PST and SPs	Baseline and indicator work will need to be completed to support the MTR process
Fill the M&E Officer positions at the earliest	30 Sept 2015	PD	Fill the M&E Officer positions at the earliest
Finalisation of the MIS	30 Nov 2015	M&E unit of PST	Finalisation of the MIS
Harmonisation of M&E with SPs to be completed	30 Oct 2015	M&E unit of PST and SPs	Harmonisation of M&E with SPs to be completed
Create a consolidated database to record all training sessions including purpose, location, number of participants, links to other Components and to monitor outcome of the training, to allow monitoring against AWP and planned activities during programme period. The information to be shared with the M&E Specialist to be included in the MIS reporting.	30 Sept 2015	Gender Officer, M&E Specialist	Create a consolidated database to record all training sessions including purpose, location, number of participants, links to other Components and to monitor outcome of the training, to allow monitoring against AWP and planned activities during programme period. The information to be shared with the M&E

Ensuring affirmative actions from PST in recruitment of women (officer level) staff	To be reviewed at next IFAD mission	30 Sept 2015	PD, HR Officer and Gender Officer	Specialist to be included in the MIS reporting.
Strengthen coordination between trainings and the progress of other Components' activities in order to allow beneficiaries, especially the women, to apply the newly acquired skills in a timely manner to enhance income generation.			PD, Project Managers	Ensuring affirmative actions from PST in recruitment of women (officer level) staff
Establish a regular information sharing mechanism between PST management and technical specialists including Gender Officer, to ensure activities are implemented in a harmonised manner.	Sept 2015		PD, Managers30	Strengthen coordination between trainings and the progress of other Components' activities in order to allow beneficiaries, especially the women, to apply the newly acquired skills in a timely manner to enhance income generation.
Continue the support to capacity building of the Gender Officer through identification of relevant regional training and exposure to other IFAD programmes	Jan 2016		Gender Officer, PD and HR Officer	Establish a regular information sharing mechanism between PST management and technical specialists including Gender Officer, to ensure activities are implemented in a harmonised manner.
Related KM actions should be planned and executed under the framework of AWPB	Jan 2016		PD and Manager30	Continue the support to capacity building of the Gender Officer through identification of relevant regional training and exposure to other IFAD programmes
Fill the KM Specialist positions at the earliest	30 Sept 2015		PD	Related KM actions should be planned and executed under the framework of AWPB
				Fill the KM Specialist positions at the earliest

Outputs

Sustainability

Fiduciary Aspects	A Project Code needs to be opened for CLAP project under MRRD , in the MoF Chart Of Accounts	15 Sept 2015	MRRD Finance Department	A Project Code needs to be opened for CLAP project under MRRD , in the MoF Chart Of Accounts
	MRRD to submit six monthly financial reports to PST/ MAIL for the record of relevant CLAP transactions	On a half yearly basis	MRRD Finance Department	MRRD to submit six monthly financial reports to PST/ MAIL for the record of relevant CLAP transactions
	The Financial Statements of CLAP to include all relevant information on component 1 managed by MRRD	On an annual basis	PST Finance Team	The Financial Statements of CLAP to include all relevant information on component 1 managed by MRRD
	Withdrawal applications to be made for PST , SP FAO and SP ICARDA aggregating USD 1.23 million.	Sept 2015	PST Finance Team ^{30th}	Withdrawal applications to be made for PST , SP FAO and SP ICARDA aggregating USD 1.23 million.
	<u>PST to call for Expense Statement</u>	30 Sept 2015	PST Technical Team/ PST Finance Team	<u>PST to call for Expense Statement</u>
	(a) From ICARDA for the period 9.2.14 to 31.12.2014 to the tune of USD 0.32 million reflected in their audited accounts			(a) From ICARDA for the period 9.2.14 to 31.12.2014 to the tune of USD 0.32 million reflected in their audited accounts
	(b) From DCA for expenses for the period December 2014 till date			(b) From DCA for expenses for the period December 2014 till date
Other	PST needs to maintain an Audit Log.	On a continuous basis on the completion of each audit	PST Finance Team	

Appendix 4: Physical progress measured against AWP&B, including RIMS indicators

Objective Hierarchy	Indicator		Period: Jan-Dec 2015			Cumulative Actual	Appraisal Target	%
			AWP&B	Actual	%			
Goal: To contribute to reduce poverty in rural Afghanistan Development objective: To improve food security of 169,500 rural households in selected districts in the provinces of Kabul, Parwan, and Logar by increasing agriculture and livestock productivity.	% decrease in population below the poverty line (Target: 10% decrease from 2012 baseline)					0	10%	
	% decrease in child malnutrition (under 5 yrs old, chronic, acute-underweight)(Target: 5% decrease from 2012 baseline) ^a					0	5%	
	% increase of agriculture/livestock productivity (measured as quantity of milk/cow, n. of eggs/chick, yield/ha) among households targeted by the project Targets:					0	100% increase in milk/cow	
	- 100% increase in milk/cow							
	- 100% increase in annual milk production/hh					0	100%	
	- 1.16 m eggs produced by beneficiary hh in Yr 6					0	1.16 m	
	- Yield/ha (kg) of certified seeds (1 st and 2 nd planting): wheat (3.4, 2.55); lentil (0.5, 0.38); chickpea (1.0; 0.73); mungbean (0.9, 0.7); potato (19.1, 14.34); tomato (38.3, 28.69); onion (31.9, 23.91); beans (0.7, 0.48)					0	15-45%	
	- No. of households with increased agriculture/livestock productivity (Target: 169,500)					0	169,500	
Outcome 1 (Community Development) Capacity of local communities	- % increase in agriculture productivity (yield/ha) (Target: +10%)					0	10%	

and local institutions enhanced, cultivable land increased, agriculture production/productivity increased, health condition improved and water-borne diseases decreased.	- No of households benefiting from productive infrastructures (Target: 115,000).					0	115,000	
Output 1.1 (Productive Infrastructures) Crop yield increased, income opportunities increased, health conditions improved (thanks to the construction of small-scale productive infrastructures).	- % reduction in water-borne diseases(Target: 8% reduction from baseline)					0	8%	
	- % increase in No. of hh having access to drinking water and sanitation facilities(Target: 1.3% increase from baseline).					0	1.3%	
	- % increase in agriculture productivity (yield/ha)(Target: 10% increase from baseline)					0	10%	
Output 1.2 (Community Development and Institutional Strengthening) Capacity of beneficiary communities/community organizations and local government agencies strengthened.	- % of beneficiaries expressing satisfaction on the quality of services provided by local government agencies staff (measured through questionnaires)					0		
	<div> <div>(Target: at least 80%)</div> <div> - % of organization members expressing satisfaction on the quality of management of community organizations (measured through questionnaires) (Target: at least 80%)^b </div> </div>					0	80%	
Output 1.3 (Gender Mainstreaming) Role/Involvement of women in productive activities and	- % increase of women who have control of productive assets					0		
	- % increase in net income among women ^c					0		

productive potential increased.	- % of female professional staff (among MAIL/DAIL and SPs) (Target: at least 25%).					14%	25%	56%
Outcome 2 (Livestock and Agriculture Development) Increased agriculture and livestock productivity	- Increase in average hh income from dairy					0	200%	
	▪ (Target: +200%) (Expected n. of beneficiary hh: 3,000)*					215	3,000	14%
	- Increase in net income of poultry keeping hh					0	25,000	
	▪ (Target: +400%) (Expected n. of beneficiary hh:25,000)							
	- Increase in net income of adopters							
	▪ (Target: at least 100%) (Expected n. of beneficiary hh: 81,055)					0	81,055	
Output 2.1 (Dairy Development) Milk production and productivity increased; dairy milk processing and marketing improved	- Increase in net income of livestock keepers							
	▪ (Target: +25%) (Expected n. of beneficiary hh: 20,000)					0	20,000	
Output 2.2 (Poultry Development) Traditional fowl systems strengthened; small-scale commercially viable poultry systems developed	- Increase in average number of cattle per family (Target: from 1.254 to 1.75)					0	200%	
	- Increase in milk consumption at hh level (Target: 1.5 l/day)							
	- Increase in average hh income from dairy (Target: +200%)							
	- Increase in egg production for traditional birds (Target: 12 per annum)					0	12%	
	- Decrease in mortality rate (Target: from 3% to 1.5%)					0	3-1.5%	
	- Increase in net income of poultry keeping hh (Target: +400%)					0	400%	

Output 2.3 (Improved Food, Fodder, and Vegetable Crops) New drought resistant and high yielding improved varieties of wheat, food and forage legumes, and vegetables developed and adopted.	- Number of farmers adopting new seeds and related best practices (Target: +80,000)					0	80000	
	- % increase of food, fodder, and vegetable production (Target: +30-60% over existing rates)					0	30-60%	
	- Increase in net income of adopters (target: at least +100%).					0	100%	
	- Beneficiary selection for demo plots (wheat)		120	120	100%	120	120	100%
	- Procurement of inputs: Wheat certified seed, Urea and DAP (package) for demo plots		120	120	100%	120	120	100%
	- Baseline survey (No. sample)		open	362		362	630	57%
	- Data collection of Mung bean variety trial (2 trials)		2	2	100%	2	2	100%
	- Excremental trials/ nurseries obtained from international centers (wheat, chickpea, lentil, Mung bean)		24	24	100%	24	45	53%
	- Distribution of the trials/ nurseries (wheat, chickpea, lentil, Mung bean)		24	24	100%	24	45	53%
	- % reduction in prevailing mortality rates for shoats and cattle (Target: +10%) - Increase in daily milk production (Target: +0.05 l) - Increase in net income of livestock keepers (Target: +25%)							
Output 2.4 (Livestock Development among the Kutchi) Livelihoods among Kutchi enhanced	- Vaccination		200,000	103,309	51%	103,309	2,000,000	5 %
	- Treatment		75000	83,901	100%	83,901	600,000	13 %
	-							
	- De worming		95,000	117,805	100%	117,805	800,000	14 %

	- Farmers trained in extension by sessions		750	248	30%	248	4,500	5 %
	- VFU monthly Support Package (Report Writing, Rent etc) \$40 pm		33	33	100%	33	35	94%
	- Need assessment Survey		1	1	100%	1	2	50%
	- Refurbishments of selected VFUs		3	3	100%	3	15	20%
	- Train VFU staff and field extension workers on extension package		15	22	100%	22	150	14%

Appendix 5: Financial: Actual financial performance by financier; by component and disbursements by category

Table 5A: Financial performance by financier on 31 July 2015

Financier	Appraisal (USD '000)	Disbursements (USD '000)	Per cent disbursed
IFAD loan	-	-	-
IFAD grant	58,004	9,905	17.08
Co-financier	456	-	-
Government	3,576	75	2.10
Beneficiaries	3,478	-	-
Total	65,514	9,980	15.23

Table 5B: Financial performance by financier by component (USD '000) till 31 July 2015

	IFAD loan			IFAD grant			Co-financier			Government			Beneficiaries			Total		
Component	Appraisal	Actual	%	Appraisal	Actual	%	Appraisal	Actual	%	Appraisal	Actual	%	Appraisal	Actual	%	Appraisal	Actual	%
Community Development	-	-	-	21,377	-								2,303	-	-	23,680	-	-
Livestock and Agricultural Development	-	-	-	25,246	7,636	30.25	456	-					1,175	-	-	26,877	7,636	28.41
Project Management	-	-	-	11,381	2,269	19.94		-		3,576	75	2.10		-	-	14,957	2,344	15.67
														-	-			
Total	-	-	-	58,004	9,905	17.08	456	-		3,576	75	2.10	3,478	-	-	65,514	9,980	15.23

Table 5C: IFAD loan disbursements (SDR, as at 31 July 2015)

Category	Category description	Original Allocation	Revised Allocation	Disbursement	W/A pending	Balance	Per cent disbursed
75045	AUTHORISED ALLOCATION	-	-	918,774	779,839	-918,774	
122426	CIVIL WORKS AND COMMUNITY INFRASTRUCTURES	12,750,000	12,750,000	638		12,749,362	0.01
122427	VEHICLES MOTORCYCLES EQUIPMENT AND MATERIALS	2,640,000	2,640,000	228760		2,411,240	8.67
122428	TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE TRAINING AND STUDIES	7,600,000	7,600,000	152317		7,447,683	2.00

Islamic Republic of Afghanistan
Community Livestock and Agriculture Programme (CLAP)
Supervision report - Mission dates: 8 - 31 August 2015
Appendix 5: Financial: Actual financial performance by financier; by component and disbursements by category

122429	SALARIES AND ALLOWANCES	6,620,000	6,620,000	331729		6,288,271	5.01
122430	INCREMENTAL OPERATING COSTS	1,430,000	1,430,000	135098		1,294,902	9.45
122431	POLICY SUPPORT FUND	320,000	320,000	23057		296,943	7.21
122432	SPECIAL FINANCING FACILITY	2,270,000	2,270,000			2,270,000	
122433	UNALLOCATED	4,020,000	4,020,000			4,020,000	
250001	ADVANCE -FAO			970,553		-970,553	
250002	ADVANCE- ICARDA			732,410		-732,410	
250003	ADVANCE- MRRD			2,605,738		-2,605,738	
250004	ADVANCE- DCA			622,727		-622,727	
	Total	37,650,000	37,650,000	6,721,801		30,928,199	17.85

Appendix 6: Compliance with legal covenants: Status of implementation

Section	Covenant	Target/Action Due Date	Compliance Status/Date	Remarks
Grant Agreement Section B – Para 3	The recipient shall open and maintain a Designated Grant Account denominated in USD in a bank acceptable to the Fund for purpose of receiving Grant Financing for the project. The Designated Grant Account shall be operated by the Ministry of Finance .	On Grant effectiveness	Complied	
Grant Agreement Section E – Para 2 Sub Clause (a) and SECTION 7.11 of the General Conditions.	The National Project Director shall have been appointed	Prior to Grant effectiveness	Complied	
Grant Agreement Section E – Para 2 Sub Clause (b)	The Programme Support Team (PST) must have been established	From first year of programme	Complied	
Grant Agreement Section E – Para 2 Sub Clause (c)	The Project Steering Committee shall have been established	From first year of programme	Complied	
Grant Agreement Section E – Para 3 Sub Clause (a)	A MOU shall have been executed between the LPA and the MRRD	From first year of programme	Complied	
Grant Agreement Section E – Para 3 Sub Clause (a)	Contracts for Services shall have been executed between the LPA and the Service Providers	Throughout the programme period	Complied	

Section	Covenant	Target/Action Due Date	Compliance Status/Date	Remarks
Grant Agreement Schedule 1 , Part II , Paragraph 8 (a) to 8 (c)	The PIM shall have been finalized and approved by the Fund and adopted by the LPA	From first year of programme	Complied	
Grant Agreement Schedule 1 , Part II , Paragraph 9	The LPA and the Fund shall jointly carry out a Mid Term Review no later than the third anniversary of the date of entry into force	Scheduled in March 2016	Not yet due	
Grant Agreement Schedule 3 – Para 7	The agreement/contract of services of each Service Provider (SP) shall specify that the SPs will make available to the recipient through the PST the statement of sources and uses of funds in respect of each fiscal year within two months of the end of each fiscal year.	Throughout the programme period	Complied	
Grant Agreement Schedule 3 – Para 8	The agreement/contract of services of each Service Provider (SP) shall specify that the SPs will appoint an external independent auditor to audit their financial statements relating to the project and should be submitted to the recipient through the PST, within five months after the end of each fiscal year.	Throughout the programme period	Complied	
General Conditions – Section 4.02 (b)	No withdrawal shall be made until the first AWP&B has been approved by the Fund.	From first year of programme	Complied	
General Conditions – Section 7.01 (b) (ii)	The LPA shall submit the draft AWP&B to the Fund no later than sixty days before the beginning of the relevant project year	On an annual basis throughout the programme period	Not Complied	There was delay in submission of the AWPB by almost 4 months

Section	Covenant	Target/Action Due Date	Compliance Status/Date	Remarks
General Conditions – Section 7.08 (b) (ii)	The Recipient shall insure goods which are financed by the Financing against hazards in accordance with sound commercial practice.	Throughout the programme period	Not Complied	No insurance companies in Afghanistan
General Conditions – Section 8.03 (a)	The LPA should submit progress reports to the Fund containing at least the minimum information spelt therein.	Throughout the programme period	Complied	
Letter to Recipient- Paragraph 6	The proceeds of the financing shall not be used for the payment of taxes	Throughout the programme period	Complied	
Letter to Recipient- Paragraph 25	The first auditor should have been appointed within 120 days from the date of entry into force	From first year of programme	Not Complied	
Letter to Recipient- Paragraph 25	For each fiscal year, the auditors should be appointed within 120 days of the beginning of the fiscal year.	From first year of programme	Not Complied	Auditors for audit of fiscal year 2015 have not yet been appointed. However as per standard practice in Afghanistan and owing to restrictions / practical procurement difficulties, the auditors for a particular fiscal year are appointed only on the completion of the relevant financial year.
General Conditions –Section 9.03 (b)	The recipient shall within six months of the end of fiscal year furnish to the Fund, the audited financial along with the audit report.	Throughout the programme period	Complied	Audited Accounts for the year ended 20 th December 2014 , were sent to IFAD by 20 th June , 2015
Letter to Recipient-	The procurement of goods , works or services will be	Throughout the	Complied	

Section	Covenant	Target/Action Due Date	Compliance Status/Date	Remarks
Paragraph 25	undertaken in accordance with the provisions of procurement laws of Afghanistan to the extent they are consistent with IFAD Procurement guidelines	programme period		

Appendix 7: Knowledge management: Learning and Innovation

Learning

It is still too early to begin documenting learnings. Currently, CLAP is more of a beneficiary of evidence-based and contextualised approaches from RMLSP

Innovation: Describe any interesting innovation noted during supervision

Presently, only a KM policy has been drawn up by the previous KM Officer in 2014, and it still requires an action plan and implementation modality framework. A library has been set up at the Project office which contains all the knowledge products developed for the two IFAD-funded projects. However this is a spill-over of the RMLSP project, as activity under CLAP is yet to be initiated. However, there is a need for stressing knowledge management as an important part of the overall project management in order to promote continued innovation and learning.
