

Bangladesh

Haor Infrastructure and Livelihood Improvement Project - Climate Adaption and Livelihood Protection

Supervision Report

Main report and appendices

Mission Dates: 03 - 15 March 2018

Document Date: 17/05/2018

Project No. 1100001585

Report No. 4734-BD

Asia and the Pacific Division
Programme Management Department

Abbreviations and Acronyms

Abbreviations and acronyms

AWS	Automatic Weather Station
BMD	Bangladesh Meteorological Department
BRTC	Bangladesh Road Transport Authority
BTEB	Bangladesh Technical Education Board
BUET	Bangladesh University of Engineering and Technology
BUG	Beel User Group
CALIP	Climate Adaptation and Livelihood Improvement Project
DDM	Department for Disaster Management
DPP	Development Project Pro-forma
GOB	Government of Bangladesh
HILIP	Hoar Infrastructure and Livelihood Improvement Project
IDCOL	Infrastructure Development Company Limited
IFAD	International Fund for Agricultural Development
IWFM	Institute of Water and Flood Management
IWM	Institute of Water Modelling
LCS	Labour Contracting Societies
LGED	Local Government Engineering Department
LGD	Local Government Division
LIFE	Local Idea for Employment (NGO)
MTR	Mid-term review
PDO	Peace and Development Organization
PMU	Project Management Unit
SCBRMP	Sunamganj Community-Based Resources Management Project
TMSS	Thengamara Mahila Sabuj Sangha
WRF	Weather Research and Forecasting

A. Project Overview

Region:	Asia and the Pacific Division	Project at Risk Status:	Not at risk
Country:	Bangladesh	Environmental and Social Category:	B
Project Name:	Haor Infrastructure and Livelihood Improvement Project - Climate Adaption and Livelihood Protection	Climate Risk Classification:	not available yet
Project Id:	1100001585	Executing Institution:	not available yet
Project Type:	Rural Development	Implementing Institutions:	not available yet
CPM:	Benoit Thierry		
Project Director:	not available yet		
Project Area:	not available yet		

Approval Date	15/09/2011	Last audit receipt	21/01/2018
Signing Date	18/07/2012	Date of Last SIS Mission	15/03/2018
Entry into Force Date	18/07/2012	Number of SIS Missions	7
Available for Disbursement Date	30/11/2012	Number of extensions	0
First Disbursement Date	29/11/2012	Effectiveness lag	10 months
MTR Date	12/05/2016		
Completion Date	30/09/2020		
Financial Closure	31/03/2021		

Project total financing

IFAD Financing breakdown	ASAP Trust Fund	\$15,047,193
	Asia and the Pacific Division	\$1,043,534
	IFAD	\$55,049,205
Domestic Financing breakdown	National Government	\$32,424,113
Co-financing breakdown,	Spanish Fund	\$29,745,137
Project total financing		\$133,309,182

Current Mission

Mission Dates:	03 - 15 March 2018
Days in the field:	4
Mission composition:	Mr. Shamsul Hoque, Infrastructure Specialist, Ms. Sherina Tabassum, IFAD CPO, Fisheries Specialist, Ms. Paxina Chileshe, Climate Change Adaptation Specialist ECD, IFAD HQ, Ms. Wanaporn Yanyuentham, Gender, Targeting, M&E and KM Specialist, Programme Analyst IFAD HQ, Mr. Didarul Islam, Financial Management Specialist, Mr. Asif Rahman, Procurement Specialist, Mr. and Peter Situ, Mission Leader
Field sites visited:	Gazipur, Mohonganj and Khaliajuri in Netrokona, Austogram, Mithamoin and Itna in Kishoreganj

B. Overall Assessment

Key SIS Indicator #1	Ø	Rating	Key SIS Indicator #2	Ø	Rating
Likelihood of Achieving the Development Objective		5	Assessment of the Overall Implementation Performance		5

Effectiveness and Developmental Focus	5	Project Management	4
Effectiveness	4	Quality of Project Management	5
Targeting and Outreach	5	Knowledge Management	4
Gender equality & women's participation	5	Value for Money	4
Agricultural Productivity	4	Coherence between AWPB and Implementation	3
Nutrition	4	Performance of M&E System	4
Adaptation to Climate Change	5	Requirements of Social, Environmental and Climate Assessment Procedures (SECAP)	4

Sustainability and Scaling-up	5	Financial Management and Execution	4
Institutions and Policy Engagement	5	Acceptable Disbursement Rate	5
Partnership-building	5	Quality of Financial Management	4
Human and Social Capital and Empowerment	5	Quality and Timeliness of Audit	3
Quality of Beneficiary Participation	5	Counterparts Funds	4
Responsiveness of Service Providers	4	Compliance with Loan Covenants	4
Environment and Natural Resource Management	5	Procurement	4
Exit Strategy	5		
Potential for Scaling-up	5		

Relevance	4
------------------	----------

C. Mission Objectives and Key Conclusions

Background and Main Objective of the Mission

The Hoar Infrastructure and Livelihood Improvement Project (HILIP) is supported by the International Fund for Agricultural Development (IFAD) with a loan of US\$ 55 million and a grant of US\$ 1 million and by the Government of Spain through the Spanish Trust Fund with a grant of US\$ 29.7 million. The project further receives funding of US\$ 15 million from the ASAP for activities targeted at climate adaptation and piloting of innovative development approaches, under the supplementary project Climate Adaptation and Livelihood Protection Project (CALIP). HILIP/CALIP is implemented by the Local Government Engineering Department (LGED) and has been effective since July 2012. The project completion date is 30 September 2020. The project has five technical components: (i) Communications infrastructure, (ii) Community infrastructure, (iii) Community resource management, (iv) Livelihood Protection, and v) Capacity and Knowledge for Building Resilience.

The last supervision mission in May 2017 and the implementation support in January 2018 confirmed that HILIP-CALIP was on track to achieve most of its targets. However, implementation delays were observed and some particular areas related to project management, fiduciary aspects and balance of implementation operations needed to be improved and further followed up. IFAD hereby conducted the supervision mission in the country during 03-15 March 2018.

The objective of this assignment is to perform a supervision mission in accordance with the financing agreement and relevant IFAD procedures and requirements. The supervision mission will assess the project's progress towards achieving its objectives, follow up last mission recommendations, review the project's performance in terms of effectiveness and efficiency, report project outreach, outcomes and impact, and generate lessons in order to make recommendations to enhance both project impact and sustainability. The supervision mission is to be conducted participatorily in close consultation with key stakeholders.

The mission undertook intensive field visits during 6 – 9 March 2018, split into two teams to undertake field consultations with local implementing agencies and partners and beneficiaries at village level, sample projects and activities implemented in Gazipur, Mohonganj and Khaliajuri in Netrokona, and Austogram, Mithamoin and Itna in Kishoreganj. A pre-wrap up meeting was held in 14 March in Dhaka with LGED Superintending Engineer and HILIP-CALIP PMU, and a mission Aide-Memoire was shared during the official wrap-up on 15 March 2018 at the Local Government Division of the Ministry of Local Government, Rural Development and Co-operatives, to highlight the mission's key findings and recommendations.

Key Mission Agreements and Conclusions

The mission noticed the need for speeding up implementation mainly under component 3: Community resource management and component 5: Capacity and Knowledge for Building Resilience to further build the beneficiaries' capacities in sustainable natural resources management, livelihood protection and strengthened resilience to the climate changes. The mission recommends a series of measures that can be highlighted as follows:

1. Speed up implementation in the areas of natural resources management, enhanced production and collective marketing, and technical training of involved staff and beneficiaries to further leverage the infrastructure assets that the project has invested in,
2. Give emphasis on modelling good practices in post-production management and marketing to help support IGAs as sustainable business,
3. Maintain the project management efficiency, especially in key areas of M&E, knowledge management, financial management and gender-sensitive targeting, and
4. Complete the required thematic researches and studies, and outcome surveys to help further analyse the beneficiaries' needs, and systematically assess the project outcomes and impacts.

The mission concludes that the HILIP-CALIP has showed good indications of contributing to the rural poverty reduction in the project area; it however needs to pay special attention in pursuing its efforts in reaching the expected outreach target before project completion, and undertaking impact and outcome surveys within the next AWPB to help systematically measure its impact and outcomes.

D. Overview and Project Progress

At the later stage of its implementation, the HILIP-CALIP continues to show observable signs of diversified livelihood coping strategy of the target population. The project management team has been reinforced and key functions continued to perform, without being affected by the change of M&E Officer. Overall project financial progress as of 31 December 2017 achieved a total of USD 79.9 million, or 59% of the all-project allocation. Physical progress was estimated at an average of 69% and showed potential for greater progress at project completion. Achievement at output level varied among components, but primarily concentrated in communication and community infrastructures under components 1 and 2. Achievements at outcome level are yet to be systematically measured by outcome and RIMS surveys. The Project achieved 81% of its outreach target by recording 288,428 direct beneficiaries, of which 48% are female.

Components 1 and 2 of communication and community infrastructures: The project has been able to manifest its momentum in implementation and positive effects on the mobility issue at community level as well as on livelihood improvement of the target population. Particularly, communication infrastructures were found to be made significant welfare gain for the beneficiaries. On the other hand, CALIP has passed almost three and half years and has been able to demonstrate a few successful models, generating positive impacts and capture key learnings for further improvement under various components. Activities on protection of villages and markets from wave actions made good progress though construction of model village and killa are still at early stages of implementation and expected to gain momentum from the upcoming working season of 2017-2018.

Communication infrastructure. On average the component implementation is on track in achieving the targets with an overall physical progress of approximately 72% as of January 2018 which is 16% higher than that of previous mission. However, achievement for Boat Landing Ghats and Minor Earth Work is lagging behind the target; particularly the earth work due to the construction of submersible roads that does not require any road embankment.

The progress of Bridges & culverts (community road), minor earthwork and boat landing platform is found to be not up to the level. It was explained that though the targets of Bridge & Culvert has been reduced in the RDPP, still the need for these cross drainage structures is scarce mainly due to construction of submersible roads and difficulties were also reported in getting suitable boat landing sites and its demand. In line with the revised DPP, special efforts should be given by the PMU to expedite the implementation process. Besides, as these items could be merged with others needful items like additional road infrastructures, related needs should be revisited further and incorporated in the future planning. Preparation of AWPB should address the merged activities and finalize actions to complete remaining of updated target works by December 2018.

Community infrastructure. The cumulative physical progress achieved 65% of the major component reallocated in the annual target. Considering the remaining project implementation time in tandem with very low cumulative progress of minor earth work/road alignment and pilot innovative infrastructure even after drastic reduction of target mainly due to lack of demand and difficulties in finding any field condition responsive idea, the mission recommends to merge these sub-projects with others that are more in demand, for example community roads. Mission has also observed that the concept of market collection centre (MCC) which was popular in the past, now-a-days has been replaced by present day shop based formal market and its demand is diminishing gradually. Accordingly, considering the difficulties in identifying any appropriate MCC, this sub-project is also recommended to merge with the community road.

The pace of irrigation infrastructure, which has increased in reallocated target by nearly 100%, is observed to be very slow only 20%. Considering its importance and effectiveness, implementation of this item needs to be expedited.

CALIP under component 2. It still appeared to be on slow pace in the installation of the community infrastructure under CALIP, with approximately 51% cumulative progress excluding the model village and beel bank protection activities. These two activities continue to lag behind even under revised targets, where model village sub-project has been reduced from five to two on the argument of unavailability of Khas land. Due to complexity of implementation, the target of model village is reduced to 2 (possibly more with the collaboration with other projects under PM office, and the implementation of one model village at Kishoreganj is on-going. Overall, CALIP's activities are being expedited.

Component 3 of Community resource management. The major activities under this component are beel development, canal excavation/re-excavation, LCS training, Swamp tree plantation, Formation and management of Beel User Groups (BUGs), and Support services, Monitoring, legal support, and Development of promotional materials.

Although progress has been made since the last supervision mission in May 2017, the project continues to make the least progress in this component compared to the others. The time-consuming and complicated beel transfer process from the Ministry of Land to HILIP has caused significant delays. As of mission in the country, 383 beels were transferred to HILIP. As HILIP does not expect to receive more than 434, including the 293 from the SCBRMP, the total number of beels for HILIP was reduced to 434. Although new beels have been officially handed over to the project but the project could not get physical access to 39 beels as they are either leased to other parties or under occupation of influential people. Other challenges include reduction in the size of the beel due to heavy siltation. Also, in some cases, the actual size of the beel is as small as that of a pond.

In 2017, only one beel has been developed, i.e.: 4% achieved. While canal re-excavation and establishment of sanctuary recorded no incremental progress. LCS training achieved at only 14%, swamp forestry 6%, and BMC training completed for only 25% of the target. The project should closely monitor and speed up implementation to achieve better results. The

issue of continuous and renewable three-year lease term remains unresolved and raises sustainability concerns.

Under the partnership agreement with WorldFish, WorldFish and HILIP have already recorded a higher yield in fish catches.

Component 4 – Livelihood protection. The implementation progress of this component is on track with average physical progress at 73%. Under the component, interventions under HILIP targets three subsectors namely field crops and high-value horticulture, livestock and poultry, and pond fisheries; and under CALIP capacity building activities revolve around four thematic areas namely village forestry, pond fisheries, advanced skill training, and vocational training. HILIP – supported implementation maintained a steady rate, with most of activities under different subsectors moving towards achieving annual targets. The cumulative achievement were outlined as: CIG group formation at 91% , Crop & horticulture sector at 71%, Livestock and poultry sector at 69%, Fisheries at 72%, Innovative training to graduates LCS members at 64%, other training at 67%, awareness build up on social issues at 68%. The cumulative physical progress was also recorded at 49% under the CALIP-funded activities, with Village Forestry at 58%, Pond Fisheries at 24%, Advanced Improved products Training at 55%, vocational training at 19%. So far component 4 has reached 67,555 beneficiaries, or 72% of its total target under HILIP, and 43,006 or 53% of its total target under CALIP. The project made good efforts in complying with all the agreed actions made during the last supervision mission.

Positive changes of rural livelihoods. The mission had the opportunity to visit a number of success cases such as a demonstration of extension support to diversified farming in higher value crops of vegetables, a Mola fish fingerling brood pond, a nursery of swamp trees, and a sanitation napkin small business venture and the general observation is that HILIP and CALIP support in livelihood enhancement has started to help change the agricultural landscape, from the conventional rice and fish-centered cultivation to diversified and nutrition-sensitive high value varieties and species. As immediate effects, increased IGA knowledge and income, and access to better services were among the obtained results.

Successful business models compiled for replication. 10 successful business models were compiled for replication as recommended by the last supervision mission; they are: a) jute products, b) bamboo products, c) tailoring, d) electrician work, e) plan nursery, f) vegetable production, g) duckling production, h) duck rearing, i) fish polyculture, and j) mono-sex tilapia. The next action should be the replication and its monitoring, which should be reflected in the M&E system.

Need for awareness building and support on marketing and linkage to value chain While there are already good notions of cooperative production for enhanced quality and better scale, actions on post production management to reduce loss and obtain better price premium still appeared to be scarce. The previous supervision mission recommended working on business models and this was followed up, more as production model than business models comprising the marketing part at least. Availability of qualified service providers in related area may be an issue but closer linkage the private sector may be helpful, for example with some players such as brokers, collectors and even some retails and wholesales agents in the market collection points of proximity. The project has worked with brokers and collectors in fisheries and vegetables; the mechanism of linkage could be reviewed and fine-tuned where required to help apply a good marketing model to the project-supported IGAs.

Climate change sensitive training. The last supervision mission recommended the integration of climate change sensitive knowledge in technical training and this was followed up. The mission stressed its importance and this needs to be a continued action of including a brief but informative interactive session regarding awareness raising on climate change.

CALIP under component 4. Initial challenges experienced in the procurement of service providers for the training, particularly from the private sector and NGOs have been overcome with three contracts already signed and activities on-going. MoUs have also been signed with Government institutions to provide some vocational training courses. The implementation progress is therefore expected to improve over the coming months. Additional service providers are also being secured for the various courses. Training activities are on-going for the expanded options under the advanced improved products, which will also increase the reach. Livelihood diversification is a key strategy for climate change adaptation and thus the PMU/DMU is encouraged to undertake periodic surveys focusing on the income generation and evidence of improved livelihoods of the participants completing the courses and their families. The evidence based approach will support the climate resilience building assessment for the CALIP and also provide contribute to any demand analysis for training in specific trades and products.

Component 5 - Capacity and Knowledge for building resilience. *The thematic studies* are yet to be launched albeit contract negotiations have been completed for three of the five: Climate change forecasting and participatory scenario development, combined with an assessment of the agriculture and fisheries sectors exposure to climate change risks and; analysis of the environmental impacts of large scale expansion of pond fisheries and climate change effects. Given the 12 months study duration it is crucial the contract process is completed and the launch be expedited. The study for examining the dynamics of reforestation at landscape level and strengthening ecological resilience is in the initial stages of the EoI preparation. Noting that the RfP was approved in June 2017 the procurement process delays are a cause of concern for the mission. This also applies to the study on performance of the infrastructure by BUET, for which IFAD provided feedback in February 2018. The mission notes the expected start date of April 2018 study following the meeting between BUET and the committee in LGED.

The models for the Flash Flood Early Warning System (FFEWS) have been developed and the testing planned over the coming two years to enable the development of the evaluation and monitoring system transfer to designated authorities. The three main implementing partners (Flood Forecasting and Warning Centre (FFWC) at the Bangladesh Water Development Board supported by the Institute of Water Modelling (IWM); Bangladesh Meteorological Department (BMD) and; Institute of Water and Flood Management (IWFM) at BUET) remain optimistic to deliver the results within the

envisaged timeframe. FFWC and IWM have completed training activities for the Weather Research and Forecast (WRF) model, secondary data collection on water levels, rainfall and discharge and river cross section surveys. They continue to update the danger level for the pre-monsoon flash floods based on a customised WRF model for the north east with updated real time data collection including cross-border areas and collection and processing of RADAR data. BMD has completed the long term meteorological data collection and some training activities. Data screening and gap filling, quality control, statistical analysis for long term forecasts and training for the WRF model are ongoing. IWFM has completed desk reviews and field data collection, while the social, technical, hydrological and navigational surveys are ongoing. The statistical analysis, calibration and validation of the WRF model, development of 2D flood inundation maps and related capacity building are also ongoing. The mobile app for disseminating flash flood forecasts to BWDB/LGED field officials is yet to be developed as is the embankment based forecast including flood vulnerability of infrastructures. However, a dedicated webpage for the dissemination of the flash flood early warning message has also been developed.

Policy dialogue has been mainly district level stakeholder consultation workshops for the FFEWS. Further dialogue can only be effectively done once the thematic studies and FFEWS models are tested. Continued concerted efforts are required from the PMU and implementing partners to sustain the momentum and ensure timely delivery of results and the desired impact.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Action plan on speeding up implementation of component 3 Urgently formulate a strategy and action plan to pick up momentum	PMU, PD	02/2018
Expediting thematic studies Conclude contracting and launch studies on climate change scenarios and sector exposure; pond fisheries impact and infrastructure performance	PMU	04/2018
Compliance with recommendations of supervision of May 2017 Awareness and training for BUGs on benefits of a federated network of BMCs, and follow up on comparative analysis of mechanized excavation	PMU	05/2018
Completing thematic studies Process EoI and complete procurement for examining dynamics of landscape reforestation and ecological resilience study	PMU	10/2018
Component 1: Communication infrastructure Continue in taking initiative of expediting construction of boat landing platform, and where applicable merge it with popular road item like village internal services	PMU/DMU	12/2018
Compliance with CALIP-supported activities under comp. 2 and comp. 4 Complying in achieving targets of model village, Killa and beel bank sites, and use of low cost technologies (e.g. cured bamboo and grass) in the remaining 31 sites for village protection	PMU/DMU	12/2018
Post-production and marketing support Work on a practical model of post-production management and marketing based on existing good practices and apply it as one of the support models	PMU/DMU	12/2018
Beel lease Request the Ministry of Land to continue a provision of beel lease (10 years) to BUGs after the project completion	PMU	
Replication of successful business models Promote replication of successful business models where needs are identified and reflect the results in project M&E	PMU/DMU	

E. Project implementation

a. Development Effectiveness

Effectiveness and Developmental Focus

Effectiveness

Rating: 4

Previous rating: 5

Justification of rating

Within the framework of the HILIP/CALIP's development objective, the project has made some good progress in the last few years in particular to the implementation of component 1, 2 and 4. The project outreach was reported as high as 81%. Beneficiary groups become more institutionalised, skilful and less vulnerable. The project made a great effort to finalize its budget reallocation and target revisions to realize and reflect the reality, constraint, demand and budget availability. The implementation progress at output level of both HILIP and CALIP is on track to complete all project activities within the project period. The mission was not able to assess the effectiveness of the achievements at outcome indicators due to lack of available data.

Log-Frame Analysis & Main Issues of Effectiveness

The project management together with M&E unit regularly update the project achievements in the logframe, and the results as of December 2017 was recently provided to IFAD. The direct benefiting households received the project services was reported at 288,428 households (81%) against the total target of 355,624. Due to the delay of HILIP's mid-term outcome assessment, the project is not able to provide the results at outcome level. The comprehensive outcome assessment is being conducted and expected to submit the draft report by April. Therefore, the current periodical reports focus mainly on output delivery with some qualitative analysis.

Given the complex interventions and geographically extreme climatic conditions, it is found that the project made slow progress in some activities, partly due to previously pending budget reallocation, the procedure of Revised DPP, previous changes in project management, earlier vacancies of important positions. The target revision and reallocation of HILIP-CALIP was approved by IFAD in March 2018 and will serve as the base to amend its DPP to allow the project to solve administrative/procedural issues and proceed pending works and that were not included in the original DPP.

Most of the output physical targets of major items were achieved over 80% under **component 1 and 2** of HILIP. Preliminary indications of enhanced access to markets, livelihood opportunities & social services, increased traffic volume and increased quantity of goods marketed. Despite slow progress of implementation of CALIP, has been able to demonstrate few successful models and illustrate the resilience enhancement from the infrastructure development.

Regarding **the Component 3: Community Resource Management**, the physical progress achieved for the current fiscal year is 22% and cumulative is 45%. With this underachievement, the project is not on track and need to expedite the progress. Primary reasons for this underachievement is extreme climatic conditions, including three rounds of flood, accompanied by tornadoes in 2017 and the beel transfer process that entails many steps. The project expects to make up for the loss during the dry season in 2018.

The livelihood improvement under HILIP's component 4 showed an empirical progress with the physical output over 70%. Preliminary indications of improved livelihoods among beneficiaries were observable through enhanced production, diversified on-farm and off-farm IGAs. Market-led production and post-production management are pursued and more focus support is required. CALIP's component 4 proved that the diversified income streams following successful training, particularly vocational and advanced improved products, are enhancing the resilience of the beneficiaries enabling them to cope better and recover after climatic events that negatively impact their agricultural production. The protracted procurement process for private sector training providers has resulted in relatively low levels of achievement. However, progress should improve following the selection of the service providers.

CALIP activities under Component 5: The delays in the procurement of service providers for the thematic studies limit the use of the results in policy dialogue and enhancing the capacity to contend with climate change impacts. The knowledge will however be generated albeit towards the end of the project. Despite initial challenges in the Flash Flood Early Warning System development due to low levels of interaction among partners and limitations in data processing capacity; the concerted efforts from the PMU and the implementing partners will result in beneficiaries receiving timely warnings for the events and thus improving their chances of saving more of their precious boro crop.

Development Focus

Targeting and Outreach

Rating: 5

Previous rating: 5

Justification of rating

Targeted beneficiaries directly benefited from the project services as per its design. The outreach achievement is outstanding, currently at 81% or 288,428 direct beneficiaries. Apart from the geographic targeting, the selection of field level institutions is clearly specified, systematically criteria-based and apply a participatory approach (selection of

important group positions by members themselves). The project has an effective targeting strategy that ensures participation of both male and female beneficiaries, peripheral farmers, and small fishermen. Strong participation of youth in some cases was also demonstrated.

Main issues

The main target group of HILIP& CALIP are poor households living in the Haor and too poor to relocate elsewhere, smallholder farming households, small fishing households deriving a major share of their income from fishing, women from poor households (48% of total outreach) and small traders in local. Based on the observation in the field, most of them have relatively high incidences of poverty and are better off once received the project services because the interventions responding to their needs and priorities. The project applies participatory M&E for data collection by sex-disaggregated data and analysis of gender-sensitive indicators to track the achievement of outreach.

Gender equality & women's participation	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 5
--	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

The project strategy and gender action plan are relevant to the national gender priority. Its results at output level are well reported with high participation of women groups at all field level institutions (LCS, BUG and CIG). These groups are at the core of the delivery model of gender mainstreaming. Women actively participate in all activities and along the development process. Innovations are introduced to women with entrepreneurial mindset. The positive changes in women socio-economic position at household and community levels are observed due to the project's continued gender-sensitive support. Women have become active players on a number of on-farm and off-farm IGAs, with more business-oriented knowledge and practices.

Main issues

Gender strategy and initiatives. The overall gender development is under the supervision of the Gender Advisor and the District M&Es have been designated as gender focal person at the respective districts. The project took an initiative to link its own gender strategy and action plan to the national Climate Change and Gender Action Plan (CCGAP) and plans to report the progress of common and relevant indicators. Gender and Climate Change Adaptability Workshops under the theme of Gender Mainstreaming were organized from April to June 2017 for district project staff to ensure that their understanding about the stereotypical social issues particularly on gender relations and how to involve women in project services and development process.

The major constraint for women to come forward and participate in the development process has been revealed as women's mobility for education and employment and leaving domestic work behind.

Women's participation. High participation of poor and destitute women was recorded; as of February 2018, overall women participation under HILIP and CALIP is about 48% (31% in LCS, 30% in BUG and 40% in CIG). Women also engage in decision making bodies of Beel Management Committees, Market Management Committee and Infrastructure Management committee. While in the overall number of project beneficiaries, there is strong gender balance between male and female, women's participation, especially in the BUG could be enhanced. While women are involved in sorting the fish after harvesting, the mission observed that the women's knowledge in beel management and financial management could be further improved to further empower the women.

Gender empowerment through innovative business model The project looks beyond the usual provision of construction work for LCS by developing a 2017-2019 strategic plan of two Innovative Business Models, namely i) low-cost sanitary napkin production and marketing and ii) environment friendly energy efficient cooking fuel charcoal productions with the setting up of factories for a total of 370 LCS graduates in Sunamganj, Kishoreganj and Netrokona. So far, 20 female LCS graduates are trained on charcoal factory while 40 women (in 2 batches) are trained on sanitary production. The production machines are procured from their own income from LCS work. The mission witnessed the initial step of the sanitary napkin production training in the field. LCS beneficiaries and students in a nearby school expressed their willingness to use the low-cost sanitary napkin and to promote the awareness widely. Prior to this initiative, women and girls used old unhygienic pieces of clothing instead of proper sanitary napkins due to their cost and availability. In many cases, girls need to miss school during their menstruation period. Therefore, this initiative will not only create an employment with additional income a to their families but also improve their hygiene and make it more affordable to communities at large. Its business plan and branding are developed with business oriented and value chain linkage with local suppliers and chain buyers. The mission suggested the project to develop it towards registered/formal cooperatives and improve its packaging and marketing. Under CALIP although all trainings open for all, there is clear preference distinction of participation between men/boy going toward technical vocational training and women/girls opting for advanced improved product training.

Current Gender Advisor is working on an half year basis and this does not match with the ongoing challenge of continued advocacy work in promoting women's participation and gender equality. A full-time Gender Advisor is needed.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Full-time Gender Advisor PMU adjusts sufficient provision to maintain the Gender Advisor position on a full-time basis till the project completion	PMU	06/2018
LCS's Sanitary napkin production Explore the possibility and procedure of upgrading LCS's innovative business on sanitary napkin production towards registered/formal cooperatives and improve its low-cost packaging and marketing	PMU/Gender Advisor	07/2018
Gender showcase Showcase the project gender development achievements in media and events of national level such as workshop with video production (in both languages)	PMU/Gender Advisor	12/2018
Linkage of project's GAP to national CCGAP Track the progress of national CCGAP's common and relevant indicators	PMU/Gender Advisor	12/2018

Agricultural Productivity

Rating: 4

Previous rating: 4

Justification of rating

The investments in enhanced production and improved productivity under component 4 of livelihood protection and under CALIP financing for building capacity and knowledge for strengthened resilience to climate change should have leveraged the productive infrastructures under components 1 and 2, investments in NRM under component 3.

Main issues

Improved agricultural productivity is yet to be systematically analysed by the outcome-level and RIMS surveys, that were due since MTR.

Nutrition

Rating: 4

Justification of rating

Despite the lack of systematically analysed results by the mid-term and RIMS surveys, improved food and nutrition security was reported by the project and witnessed by missions' during their field visits since MTR. Increased income from diversified IGAs and continued access to water bodies helped secure the rural poor's food sufficiency and a more diversified and nutritive food structure.

Main issues

n/a

Adaptation to Climate Change

Rating: 5

Previous rating: 5

Justification of rating

In order to build resilient communities the project continues to build capacity for climate smart infrastructure and agriculture. Beneficiaries appreciate the household savings on wave protection with sturdy infrastructure; improved mobility around their communities during monsoon floods; access to water and sanitation facilities and temporary storage facilities for their harvest (killas) reducing their losses. Beneficiaries of the advanced improved products and vocational training courses are also generating income and contributing to the welfare improvements of their families. The benefits of the FFEWS are yet to materialise as the models are being tested before information dissemination to reduce crop losses. Thematic studies are also delayed, partially hampering policy dialogue.

Main issues

A detailed climate risk analysis was undertaken during the design of the CALIP, which identified adaptation measures to build the resilience of the smallholders to pre-monsoon flash floods, increasing wave action and prolonged dry spells (agricultural droughts) The measures are effectively being implemented albeit there are some delays in the activities for

knowledge generation, related capacity building and policy dialogue.

Strong evidence of capacity to construct the community infrastructure (village internal services, road slope protection, village protection, killas) exist in the implementing agency, LGED. The focus is mainly on structural engineering solutions for which the engineers are well trained. Biophysical solutions such as the vetiver grass incorporation in village protection structures and slope protection require more efforts to institutionalise. Beel bank protection activities are also proving a challenge from conceptualisation therefore actual implementation has not commenced.

The initial challenges faced in securing service providers, particularly private entities or NGOs (though these are more expensive with a unit cost of 27,158 to 39,090 Tk compared to 17,644 to 19,050 Tk for Government Institutions), for the advanced improved products training and vocational training have mostly been overcome. Therefore the outlook for the reach and diversification of income generating to enable communities recover quicker from pre-monsoon flash flood events is positive. The targets for the trainings have been revised following the MTR, however the reach for some trainings may be compromised by the challenges that continue to be faced in the identification and recruitment of the participants. Transportation costs and foregoing a potential income during the training period reportedly discourages some potential candidates. Some beneficiaries are also unable to afford start-up kits following the completion of their training and thus their income generation potential is not optimised.

The procurement process for the thematic studies has been protracted, resulting in limitations of the use of the study results and potential of achieving the desired objective of building capacity through improved knowledge and informing policy formulation. The bamboo value chain study has been dropped reportedly due to lack of human capacity to provide the required inputs by the Bangladesh Forestry Research Institute.

The FFEWS activities are on track despite the initial delays in the purchase of essential equipment (fast computers) for the implementing partners. Regular meetings are held and information exchange among the partners has improved. The partners continue to advocate for a cautious approach to the lead time for issuing the warning, three days compared to the potential five days discussed during the design. All the implementing partners exhibit sufficient capacity to develop the system and are committed to providing effective dissemination channels for the warning.

The Project invests in building a swamp forest along the banks of the beels to prevent the excavated soil from returning to the beel during the rainy season. While no new sanctuary has been established this year as of now, the project plans to build them in the remainder of the fiscal year up to July 2018.

The project team and implementing partners continue to capitalise on emerging adaptation opportunities by responding to requests from beneficiaries thus increasing the numbers of infrastructure such as killas, village internal services and also the expansion of the pond fisheries training. The project has very limited scope for climate change mitigation given the organic inputs for most activities and limited assets.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Resilience monitoring Develop a system for monitoring household resilience based on the indicators and definition of resilience provided	PMU	09/2018
Gender and climate change Develop knowledge product on gender and climate change in the Haor	PMU	10/2018

b. Sustainability and Scaling up

Institutions and Policy Engagement	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 5
---	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

The HILIP-CALIP implementation relies on a close collaboration mechanism among government technical agencies. The project has involved the existing institutions and using them as entry point in project implementation, then incorporating the implemented projects as present or and future part of their scope of business. This has helped enhance the likelihood of institutional sustainability. HILIP was built on the SCBRMP's lessons learned, and CALIP is further extending the HILIP's scope of intervention with a specific focus on the community and ecological resilience to climate change. The recently approved design project of Provati3 is replicating a number of HILIP-CALIP activities along river bank and river char areas.

Main issues

n/a

Partnership-building	Rating: 5
-----------------------------	------------------

Justification of rating

Continued close collaboration was observed between LGED and the Ministry of Lands in implementing the beel transfer to the BUGs, and the effective partnership with WorldFish leading to enhanced productivity of the target groups and the continued monitoring of fish catch and biodiversity.

Main issues

n/a

Human and Social Capital and Empowerment	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 5
---	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

As per its design, the project empowered poor people particularly women in need and focused on the expansion women's access to and control over fundamental assets – capital, community infrastructure and service, natural resource including water bodies (beels), knowledge and technologies. In order to foster this development, the groups were formed for social mobilization, received training, technical assistance and support to improve their managerial and organizational capacities as well as technical skills for employment opportunities. However, these capacities need to be strengthened in the limited remaining period to ensure sustainability of all beneficiary groups including BUGs, CIGs and LCSs.

Main issues

Though it might be too early to assess the impact but monitoring data shows the promising results on economic and social empowerment. The use of labor-intensive approaches to work, including beel and canal re-excavation by BUGs and construction work by LCSs leads to local employment-creation.

The project demonstrates strong commitment to develop life skills of the people in the community. The mission observed that BUG, LCS, CIG members showed an ownership and have concrete incentive to ensure the strengthening and long term survival of their groups. For BUGs, as their membership registering BUGs as legal entities ensures access to water resources that would otherwise be inaccessible. This in turn translates into the annual distribution of the profits earned from the collective and sustainable exploitation (fishing) of the water body ensures that all BUG members benefit, and BUGs have proven to be capable of improving the management of water bodies themselves. They are not only trained in improved beel management skills, but also learn financial management and develop leadership skills. For LCS, they were grateful of having village protection work, community infrastructure and internal services that were built by themselves and they showed the commitment to take care small maintenances. Lastly, CIG leaders and better-off farmers are willing to provide extension services to members and non-members in the communities. They improve their wellbeing from receiving livelihood trainings on crops, livestock, fisheries and off-farm activities as the alternatives during the flood period. They are now small entrepreneurs who have regular income and make good profit. Their increased income also accounts for local economic growth.

The project established partnership with a number of agencies of the government to develop skills in youth both male and female, such as, driving so that they can serve in their communities rather than migrating to bigger cities. The mission witnessed some female youth attended driving classes which is quite rare case in rural areas. Housewives, who would otherwise be unemployed and spend unproductive time during the monsoon, due to lack of agricultural activities, are now equipped in alternate income generating skills, such as block, batik and tailoring. These interventions empower the beneficiaries not only financially but also reduces their vulnerability during extreme weather conditions.

Quality of Beneficiary Participation	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 4
---	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

The core strategy of project is grassroots institutional capacity building for enabling sustainable rural transformation. By focusing on the demand by the poor, it has been found full involvement from individuals since it is well understood that the assets will benefit to themselves and entire communities. Agriculture and livestock extension by other CIG farmers after the demonstration was also reported. The project has been enhancing the ability of the poor to participate in their own decision-making thanks to specific training and empowerment generated from the newly created local group.

Main issues

As mentioned earlier, the selection methodology of field level institutions is clearly specified and systematically criteria-based. The focus is given to poor, vulnerable people and in particular women. The project applies a participatory approach from the selection process, training and bottom-up feedback that allows the beneficiaries to express their concerns, priorities and interests regarding project positive and negative social impacts. In BUGs, the earning is equally shared between men and women and this decision was proposed and agreed by members. Nevertheless, in some cases the project reported a difficulty to achieve the number of targeted participants during harvesting period. LCS members

solved this issue by informing their groups in advance so that they could take turn and arrange schedules among themselves.

Responsiveness of Service Providers

Rating: 4

Previous rating: 4

Justification of rating

Despite the challenges of divers demands and geographic remoteness and disparities, WorldFish, paravets, DAE, DLS and DOF technical staff at district and Upazila levels achieved in supporting a more diversified income generation among the rural households in the Haor area. Challenges remain, mainly in bringing continued services to accompany the beneficiaries' on-farm and off-farm income generating activities to graduate into a growing agribusiness, exploring the leverage between built fixed assets such as infrastructures and skills and knowledge training.

Main issues

n/a

Environment and Natural Resource Management

Rating: 5

Previous rating: 5

Justification of rating

Natural resources management is a key component in the project given the dependency of the targeted beneficiaries on their natural resource base. The focus is on water resources management for the fisheries activities, which provide an important livelihood source in the Haor. The livelihoods activities also make an effort to promote best practices particularly for crop production and the CIG involved in livestock. Crop diversification through vegetable extension, poultry, fisheries and love stock activities also ensure satisfactory management of natural resources. Environmental management is integrated in the project activities and training is provided to LCS members. The agricultural production activities mainly use organic inputs though agro-chemicals are used for the paddy production.

Main issues

The community management of beels has notable benefits for the biodiversity in the target region. The income generated from the beels is expected to improve livelihoods and also provide further incentives for improved natural resources management. In addition, fish sanctuaries and swamp forests provide reduce community vulnerability.

The Haor region topography and the geographic location relative to the Meghalaya increases the exposure to siltation of water bodies particularly after heavy rainfall events. Most of the canals and beels continue to be adversely affected by siltation. The resulting declining water retention capacity has an impact on irrigation potential thus compounding the effects of the agricultural droughts. Protection of beel and canal banks needs to be increased and excavation routinely conducted. Constraints for the smallholders include the resources to hire excavators and lack of investment in biophysical protection such as swamp tress and vetiver or chailya grass.

The increase in population results in limited natural vegetation areas around the homesteads as demand for residential units increases. The close proximity of most dwellings leaves little room for appropriate sanitation facilities. In addition the scope for homestead gardens is also limited. More efforts can be made to promote revegetation of the settlements and for village protection.

The use of agro-chemicals for paddy production continues to negatively impact on fisheries with communities. However capacity building in the safe use of agro-chemicals for the crop production activities undertaken by the project can result in better management practices in their application.

Good practices and key messages around environmental and natural resources management need to be consistently disseminated among the beneficiaries to build on the initial training provided.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Improved vegetative coverage Promote suitable practices to maintain vegetative cover within the productive landscape	PMU/Implementing partners	
Good practice dissemination Ensure systematic dissemination of good environmental and natural resources management practices	PMU/Implementing partners	

Exit Strategy	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 5
----------------------	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

LGED and Union Parishads take responsibility for maintenance for Union and Upazila roads and village roads respectively. Community members and individual households take responsibility for village protection works, Market Management Committees for the management and upkeep of rural markets. The BUGs continue to proceed to register themselves as cooperatives and MoUs signed between Local Government Division (LGD) and Ministry of Lands for renewable and longer term leases for BUGs. Private sector actors have been more involved in market linkages and sale of increased agriculture output from the project area, and other local service providers will provide a range of ancillary services required. The mission was able to witness the implementation efforts pursuing such exit strategy.

Main issues

n/a

Potential for Scaling-up	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 5
---------------------------------	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

HILIP was built on the SCBRMP's lessons learned, and CALIP is further extending the HILIP's scope of intervention with a specific focus on the community and ecological resilience to climate change. The recently approved Provati3 replicated a number of HILIP-CALIP activities along river bank and river char areas

Main issues

n/a

c. Project Management

Quality of Project Management	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 5
--------------------------------------	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

Overall, implementation issues were addressed but the PMU and this was reflected in an average satisfactory rate of physical progress. The PMU provided good guidance to district and upazila teams to help maintain the implementation momentum. The project team is fully staffed, with a Deputy Project Director (DPD) joining in May 2017 and a new M&E Officer on board. The ISM recommendation of Jan. 2018 on transfer of 14 SOs and recruitment of new staff members is yet to be fully complied and completed. The reallocation request prepared by the ISM was recently approved by IFAD. The project management is yet to be more sensitive on the time pressure for reaching the overall outreach target. The last Inter-ministerial Steering Committee was held on 09 August 2017 to provide due guidance to the operational management and implementation of the project.

Main issues

Upcoming staff contract renewal. The project implementation is on a good momentum and this needs to be maintained in order to achieve the expected targets at output, outcome and impact levels. A stable and performing team at both national and district levels will play a key role in this regard. The coming renewal of staff contracts needs to take this into account in order to avoid disruption in management and operational efficiency.

Increased partnership with WorldFish. The WorldFish has played a crucial part in implementing the contracted activities and its potential should be further explored to help achieve quality progress, such as in beneficiary training and fishery-related interventions and support, while output targets are lagging behind.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Compliance with last ISM Complete the recruitment of new staff (additional 35 CDFs) as recommended by last ISM subject to RDPP approval	PMU	12/2018
Maintaining stable and performing project operational team Coming renewal of staff contracts needs to be undertaken to avoid disruption in management and operational efficiency	LGED and PMU	

Justification of rating

The project knowledge management strategy is well elaborated and provides the guidance to promote the project performance and results, enable policy environment and facilitate proactive multi sectoral planning including AWPB; coordinated implementation, communication, monitoring and evaluation of all HILIP/CALIP activities. Challenges and constraints of the implementation are well captured and taken into consideration in the project management decision. Knowledge and documentation could be better disseminated widely.

Main issues

The technical teams and M&E unit work together and continue to produce the knowledge and media products including regular progress reports, articles on local newspaper, LGED monthly newsletters, case studies for best award practice by district from 2015 to 2017, some only in local language and some also in English in order to promote knowledge dissemination and project visibility. In the recent progress report, the list of all comprehensive knowledge product is provided. Nevertheless, the accessibility remains a concern as the stock of knowledge products is mainly shared among project staff at PMU and field level and beneficiaries as materials for training. The mission suggested the project to archive and upload all knowledge publications on its LGED-HILIP/CALIP website at <http://www.lged.gov.bd/HILIP/CALIP> as well as to make bilingual publications in the future.

Some challenges and constraints in the project implementation are identified as follows:

- Consecutive Flash floods shortens the construction period and hampering progress. Slow achievement in some infrastructure is observed.
- Transportation of construction materials is time consuming and costly during working season. All materials need to be procured and set up in advance and when the construction cannot be completed by the dry season, some investment is lost due to the flood.
- Non availability of labors during the harvesting period remains an issue. In some cases, the project faced the difficulty to achieve the targeted participants in particular to LCS and CIG.
- The sustainability of BUG with legal entity found complex.
- Water bodies including beels, rivers and canals are continuously silted-up. With the climate change effect, natural resources may no longer remain its natures and identities.
- The achievement of FFEWS development requires an international collaboration for collecting cross boundary hydrological data.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Sharing of overseas learning Submit the overseas learning report on Agricultural Value Chain, Infrastructure and Livelihood Development to IFAD and promote the knowledge and good practices to project staff	PMU/PD	03/2018
Knowledge dissemination Upload all knowledge documents on project LGED website and IFADAsia portal and continue to disseminate lessons and good practices on IFADAsia Facebook and among other IFAD and LGED projects.	PMU/M&E unit	

Justification of rating

Project implementation could be considered as efficient as the project investments has reached a physical progress rate of over 70% and financial disbursement at 60% at the time of supervision. However, some project activities under components 3 and 4 experienced low disbursement rates of less than 50%, affecting the expected leverage effect on investments on infrastructures. Revision of capacity building under CALIP investments occurred late and would have limited time of building sufficient capacities and generating timely expected results to accompany the beneficiaries in other project-supported activities, especially in the area of strengthened resilience to climate change and improved coping strategy of livelihood.

Main issues

The appraisal projected a total project cost of USD 134.8 million and as of 31 Dec. 2017, a total expenditure of USD 79.9 million was recorded, or nearly 60% of disbursement. The project invested significantly in community and communication infrastructures under component 1 and 2, which represented 69% of total expenditures. However, investments under components 3 and 4 of NRM and Livelihood Protection experienced low disbursements, as NRM remained at a single digit rate level and Livelihood Protection at 37% only. Those two components are crucial in providing means to beneficiaries to

leverage investments of fixed assets in the form of infrastructure and their low performance should have affected the overall project's effectiveness in pursuing steady movements towards expected outcomes and impact.

Expenditure ratio of technical components over management component is adequate, or at 0.12 as of 31 Dec. 2017, better than the projected ratio of 0.17 of Appraisal. Saying so, under-spending in project management may lead to low sufficiency of implementation support, especially in the context of poor transport efficiency in the Haor region.

Cost per beneficiary household is estimated at USD 196 presently, also lower than the appraisal's USD 277. This is mainly due to the under-performance of achieving the outreach target, which is not yet met in half while one year and half remains before project completion date.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Increased action planning in building leverage Plan interventions under components 3 and 4 in accordance with beneficiary needs and recruit qualified public and private service providers for technical training	PMU	03/2018
Building linkage between tangible and intangible assets Link IGA support under component 3, 4 and 5 to communities that have benefited investments in infrastructures	PMU and all stakeholders	

Coherence between AWPB and Implementation

Rating: 3

Previous rating: 3

Justification of rating

As of 31 Dec. 2017, the AWPB 2017-2018 achieved less than 18% in financial term and the annual physical progress could not be outstanding without adequate level of expenditures. While measures were undertaken since 2018 to help speed up the implementation, the coherence would likely remain low due to the limited time remained for the financial year.

AWPB Inputs and Outputs Review and Implementation Progress

The AWPB 2017 – 2018 budgeted a total of BDT 1,100 million and as of 31 Dec. 2017, only BDT 191 million were recorded as disbursed amount. Except component 5 of Capacity and knowledge for building resilience and component 6 of Project management, annual disbursement rates of other technical components were below 40%, with total disbursement rate at less than 18%.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Speed up implementation Speed up annual implementation of technical components to reach a good level of financial and physical progress of AWPB 17 - 18	PMU	06/2018

Performance of M&E System

Rating: 4

Previous rating: 4

Justification of rating

Participatory and comprehensive monitoring and evaluation has been put in place to track the progress of target achievements from upazila to district and PMU level. The mission observed an improvement in quality and timeliness of periodic progress report and ORMS logframe. In addition, the project management utilized the M&E data to support the budget reallocation and target revisions. Training feedback from beneficiaries and more analysis at outcome level should be captured.

M&E System Review

Data reporting. The project outreach as of February 2018 is approximately 288,428 households (81% of the total target), of which 48% is women. The PMU/M&E unit made a great effort to validate data and timely submit ORMS logical framework with updated results and progress report as of February 2018. The mission observed an improvement of periodically narrative progress reporting with good collaboration at all levels and also between M&E unit and component specialists. Qualitative analysis is included with systematical and evidence-based data at output level. The weakness in M&E relates mainly to the lack of results at outcome level and deeper analysis beyond the achievement of training participation by following feedback from trained participants which is vital for improved knowledge management and lessons learned i.e. how many of them make earnings from knowledge and skills received from training, if not which other

sources of income and what are reasons behind the findings.

Project mapping. It was agreed that the project would finish the intervention mapping exercise (types of project activities by location) since December 2017. However, the cost estimate is over the budget allocation (BDT 4.0 is required but 2.5 million is available). The output is expected to feed into the Bangladesh portfolio M&E online platform developed to harmonize the M&E system across all projects which can be access via <http://bangladesh.cosop.org/>. The mission recommended the project to simplify the mapping design and model within the available budget and complete it by June 2018.

CALIP baseline and HILIP MTR. There is a significant delay of CALIP baseline and HILIP's mid-term outcome assessment due to a previous absence of procurement specialist and MEK specialist, a long procedure of contracts issuance and time limitation of data collection in the field only during the dry season. The CALIP baseline study and HILIP's mid-term outcome assessment are being conducted and expected to submit the draft reports to IFAD by the mid of March and end of April respectively.

Project MIS development. During the meeting with PMU in Dhaka, the project presented a project MIS feature development. Apart from procurement process and ToRs for IFAD approval, there is room to improve on linkage with i) the IFAD reporting requirements (current M&E system including SIMES, ORMS logframe, AWPB &PP, progress report) and ii) project financial management and accounting.

M&E good practices. The M&E activities capture data aggregated by gender and beneficiary groups. The target revisions and reallocation proposal are strategically developed based on M&E data and lessons learned to make necessary adjustments to improve the project performance and achievement. The review of implementation is regularly conducted to ensure the participatory and bottom-up feedback from field staff and stakeholders.

Participatory and comprehensive monitoring and evaluation has been put in place to track the progress of target achievements from upazila to district and PMU level. The mission observed an improvement in quality and timeliness of periodic progress report and ORMS logframe. In addition, the project management utilized the M&E data to supported the budget reallocation and target revisions. Training feedback from beneficiaries and more analysis at outcome level should be captured.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
CALIP baseline study Submit the draft CALIP baseline study	PMU and M&E	03/2018
HILIP mid-term outcome assessment Expedite the process and conduct the HILIP midterm outcome assessment	PMU and M&E	04/2018
Mapping of project intervention Carry out the mapping of intervention by simplifying its design and model within the available budget	PMU	06/2018
Comparative analysis of mechanized excavation Follow up on comparative analysis of mechanized excavation	PMU	07/2018
Mid-level MEK specialist at PMU Assign a mid-level MEKMS to support in PMU M&E unit	PMU and M&E	12/2018
Intensify M&E Follow up feedback from trained participants and beneficiaries to track the effective of intervention provided by the project and include the results at outcome level in the progress report.	PMU and M&E	
ORMS logframe and SIMES update Update the ORMS logframe and SIMES excel spreadsheet including component analysis/graphs and submit to IFAD on a quarterly basis	PMU and M&E	

Justification of rating

The Environment and Social Review Note (ESRN) prepared during the design of HILIP acknowledged the existence of Environmental Assessment guidelines in LGED. Relevant sections from the guidelines are included in the manuals used by District and Upazila teams. However, discussions during the mission confirmed that not all infrastructure proposals and subsequent sub-projects undertake the assessments or produce Environmental and Social Management Plans. However, efforts are made by district teams to promote good practices including site management and minimising potential adverse impacts during the construction phases. Training on environmental management is provided to LCS members. An Environment and Climate Change Assessment was developed during the design of CALIP.

SECAP Review

Efforts should be made to consistently apply the LGED guidelines and screen the infrastructure projects through the envisaged environmental assessments. Districts teams will need to improve the monitoring of the recommendations made as a result of the assessments. Awareness of the guidelines should be improved and contractors duly informed of the need to adhere to the guidelines and related standards.

The social impacts of the project are evidently positive with incorporation of the appropriate conflict resolution mechanisms to enable effective community natural resources management. Elite capture is still prevalent in some areas though incidences are much lower as a result of the project.

Climate risk considerations were included in the HILIP though the focus was on submersible roads and structural solutions for village protection. The CALIP placed more emphasis on climate change adaptation including biophysical low cost options for village protection and opportunities for livelihoods diversification.

d. Financial Management & Execution

Disbursement by financier

Type	Name	Current Amount	Disbursed Amount	Actual Rate
Domestic Financing breakdown	National Government	\$32,424,113		
Co-financing breakdown,	Spanish Fund	\$29,745,137		

Acceptable Disbursement Rate

Rating: 5

Previous rating: 5

Justification of rating

The disbursement rate remains the same as the rate of the previous mission, as there is no major change in this part and achieving disbursement targets with the pace of implementation progress. Also, the disbursement was accounted and reported accurately and timely except for few minor issues as noted below.

Main issues

The overall disbursement for **HILIP** has reached to 74% as of February 2018 which is in line with the implementation period (72%). The overall cumulative disbursement of HILIP (comprising IFAD loan, IFAD Grant and STF) in SDR 39.07 million (Euro converted to SDR for STF) and in USD 56.20 million (including advances) till February 28, 2018, which is 74% against SDR but 65% against USD of total allocation. Differences in % of disbursement between SDR & USD due to foreign exchange difference. It should have pointed out that the overall disbursement rate drops to 52% against SDR when the IFAD advance is excluded. **CALIP** has reached 58% of its total implementation period. The cumulative disbursement is SDR 5.43 million (including advances) as February 28, 2018 which is 55% of total allocated amount and the disbursement rate drops to 24% against SDR when the IFAD advance is excluded.

The mission noted the reason for low rate of justification is mainly delays in adjustment of LCS advances. In order to reduce the delays in the justification of LCS advances, the mission recommended in May 2017 to implement liquidation of LCS advances with the submission of certifier Material Purchase Form (MPF) and Receiving and Inspection Report (RIR) which is to be followed and implemented to faster the LCS adjustment. The mission insists on the importance of reconciling the DAs and justifying all differences identified, as this an essential control procedure. The consolidated reconciliation at 31/01/2018 prepared by the PMU at the mission's request shows a balance of USD 10,686,054 that requires further clarification as to show the purpose and uses of this amount. The mission recommends explaining this amount in the DA reconciliation to be prepared in the next reporting period which shall include but not limited to separating unjustified expenses and advances to LCS/training.

Fiduciary Aspects

Quality of Financial Management

Rating: 4

Previous rating: 4

Justification of rating

There will be no change in the rating mainly because of a number of agreed actions of last mission yet to be attained, accounting software TOMPRO is now operationalized but yet to be harmonized with manual records in terms of budgeting, component wise expenditure, balance of outstanding advances, accounting and financial reporting. The other contributing factors includes, poor file management, inadequate review process in preparing WAs, delay in adjusting LCS advances and not taking actions on the unreconciled DA balances along with not performing an acceptable physical verification of fixed assets.

Main issues

Staffing - Staffing at PMU level appears to be adequate. Based on recommendation of the last mission's, preparation of ToR and change in title of FM assistant at DMU's is under process to agree with DPP.

Budgeting – The project has submitted Annual Work Plan Budget (AWPB) for FY 2017-18 to IFAD on August 22, 2017 which was delayed by 114 days. TOMPRO was updated with the AWPB for FY 2017-18 at PMU along with 4 DMUs out of five. However, the budget variances in TOMPRO are still to match with manual records and the execution rate of AWPB for FY 2017-18 stands at 17.45% as of January 2018.

Flow of funds - The mission noted several transactions claimed for FY 2013-14 in WA 25A which was five years old. Also, there are many LCS advances remained unadjusted. The mission recommended to carry out a review on the unreconciled balance at DA to find any such event as stated here.

Internal Control – The physical stock take was carried out by the Custodian of the fixed asset register instead of a formal committee. Ideally, the committee should exclude procuring officer/finance officer, direct user and the custodian of fixed asset registrar. The Finance and Administrative Manual is also not yet finalized. The auditor has reported several issues on internal control weakness in the management letter attached to the audit report for FY 2017-18, the project has not yet responded to the issues raised. However, ten (10) audit issues for FY 2015-16 have been resolved out of eleven (11) and the pending one is relating to inappropriate deduction of VAT/Tax.

Accounting & Reporting - Accounting software TOMPRO found to be in sync with the manual cash book. Considerable amount of efforts was given by the agency into the system to include annual budget, clear backlog, produce WA and smooth data entry for financial reporting purposes. The budget variance, component wise expenditures, sources and uses of fund and advances are still to match with manual records. Last submitted WA 25A claims several mis-categorization of expenses category 4 instead of category 3. Generating the WA directly from TOMPRO in future would provide reliable data and to do so, a professional firm should be hired to check back the transactions in the system from the project's inception and make necessary adjustments, in case discrepancies are found. Six (6) WAs have been submitted to IFAD since the last mission, 4 of which were advance requests and 2 were justification. The mission has reviewed the 2 justifications WAs, and has verified the documentation related to statements of expenditure (SOE) items on a sample basis. The main findings include incomplete description in SOEs makes difficult to trace the file and vouchers, Improper control in file management and record keeping in Kishoregonj DMU, mis-categorization of expenses in WA 25A amounting to USD 137,104 (sum of several transactions) which was charged in category 4 instead of category 3, instances where claims for reimbursement of DMU expenditure were submitted prior to the actual date of disbursement, deposits challan of VAT/Tax were not collected from treasury office. Consolidated Designated Account reconciliation has not been carried out monthly resulting the amount of USD 10,686,054 was not explained with proper segregation of expenditures (not yet justified) and advances. The mission recommends preparing the DMU wise fund flow statement monthly stating the actual expenditure and advance payments.

Internal audit- Internal audit at LGED is mainly to aide transaction process but not in compliance with the internal auditing standards and practices. However, the observation raised by IA unit is yet to be attended and resolved

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Finalization of project reallocation IFAD to communicate the approval to the reallocation proposed in the Implementation Support Mission report	IFAD, PMU	02/2018
Training on TOMPRO Training by FMS of DMU Finance on TOMPRO to generate accurate and timely financial data and reports as required and sync all module with each other.	FMS	04/2018
Recruitment of audit firm for data system correction Hiring an audit firm to identify all error/omission and miscoding of entries in TOMPRO and provide assistance to correcting and rectifying all data entered since inception of the project, also conduct Risk based internal audit based on international standard.	PMU	04/2018
Correction of categorization Make necessary correction of entries in WA 25A and inform to IFAD. Produce and submit correct WA from TOMPRO in next submission of WA.	FMS and FAs	04/2018
ToRs on FAs Review and revision of ToR of DMU Finance Assistance	XEN, PD, FMS	04/2018
Operational manual submission Submission of finalized Finance and Administrative manual to IFAD (to incorporate the TOMPRO system and other current practices and required documentation and process) and disseminate to all DMUs.		05/2018
Revise DPP Based on the Implementation Support Mission report, the project to amend the Development Project Proposal (DPP) to reflect revised HILIP/CALIP activities and the project completion date (30 Sept 2020) as per the signed FA and communicate to IFAD	PMU	06/2018
Submission of LTB amendment Amendment of LTB with regards of thresholds for procurement prior review by IFAD more than USD 100,000 for Goods and Works and USD 30,000 for services	IFAD, PMU	06/2018
Fund flow preparation per DMU Preparation of fund flow statement per DMU with segregation of LCS/training advances from cumulative expenditures and inclusion of schedule of advances with aging and details of cash forecast in the periodic fund demand.	FMA	
Monthly generation of record and reports from TOMPRO Produce statement of Sources and Uses of Funds, category and component wise expenditure statement and budget variance from TOMPRO per month. Identify and resolve if any deviations with manual records.	FMS	

Justification of rating

The rating is downgraded from the previous one due to delays in submission of audit report for FY 2016-17. FAPAD explained that during August and September of 2017 its auditors were compelled to assist to a training on the International Standards of Supreme Audit Institutions (ISSAIs), which were adopted by the Office of the Comptroller and Auditor General of Bangladesh and soon to be applied by FAPAD. This training affected the planning of FAPAD for the FY 2017. FAPAD recognized that they were 15 to 20 days late in the presentation of the audit reports to IFAD

Main issues

Annual external audit of all IAs is conducted by FAPAD (Foreign Aided Projects Audit Directorate) under the C&AG of Bangladesh. The mission noted that the submission of audit report for FY 2016-17 was delayed by 20 days from the legal submission date. The auditor has expressed unqualified audit opinion on Financial Statements, Special Account and Statement of Expenditures (SoE), however the auditor has neither expressed any opinion nor issued the report on budget to actual comparison which is required by IFAD as recommended in last mission.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Provide to IFAD the response to management letter of auditors Provide IFAD the reply to management letter of the auditors for all the 15 observations for FY 2016-17 as translated in English	PMU	04/2018
Resolution letter from FAPAD Resolve all observations for FY 2016-17 and 1 pending observation for FY 2015-16 with FAPAD and provide IFAD the resolution letter from FAPAD.	PMU	11/2018

Counterparts Funds

Rating: 4

Previous rating: 4

Justification of rating

The rating would remain same as previous mission, as there is no significant change in this part.

Main issues

The GoB contribution flows to the project in the form of duties/taxes exemption, co-financing of infrastructure (50% of communication infrastructure and 10% of community infrastructure) and operating expenses (30%). Payments under GoB and donor financing are normally made and recorded simultaneously in the HILIP-CALIP books of accounts. According to PMU records, cumulative expenditures funded by GoB stands at \$16.12 million equivalent BDT as of 31/01/18. The current cumulative expenditure of USD 16.12 million represents 48% of the total GoB commitment (USD 33.84 million).

Compliance with Loan Covenants

Rating: 4

Previous rating: 4

Justification of rating

The project has mostly complied with the legal covenants with some exceptions as noted.

Main issues

The covenants of the financing agreements were compiled except for accident/health insurance for the project personnel, finalization of financial/administrative procedures manual, submission of detailed financial statements of the operations, resources and expenditures related to the project (*required to be submitted within four (4) months of the end of fiscal year as per Article IX, sec 9.02 of General Conditions of FA*). In addition, the mission has noted a delay in the submission of the 2017-18 AWPB and procurement plan to IFAD for no objection and audited financial statements.

Procurement

Procurement

Rating: 4

Previous rating: 4

Justification of rating

The rating of procurement review remain same as there is no improvement in status of procurement plan submission timeline. Procurement plan document was not updated for actual procurement to give the visibility of the performance vs. plan. However, there is significant improvement in clearing back log of service procurement after recruitment of intermittent procurement consultant. Also procurement process duly complied with the guidelines and transparent in general. The rating also affected for not maintaining contract register which is a necessary for contract management and

Procurement Review

Submission of Annual Procurement Plan (APP) 2017-18 to IFAD was late for 54 days. It was difficult to measure procurement performance from APP as the row for actual was blank. However, from review of related documents and discussion with intermittent procurement consultant and Sr. Assistant Engineer (Sr.AE) it appears that there is significant progress in procurement of services. Conversely procurement of works is slower since the project is waiting for revised DPP which will require modification in existing procurement plan.

The mission reviewed the procurement of services for the period July 17 – February 18. Quality and Cost Base Selection method has been followed for most of the service procurement and the process complied with IFAD guidelines for obtaining 'No Objection'. Two service procurement contracts exceeded IFAD approved amount which apparently a mistake from both IFAD and borrower. It is suggested to do necessary correction or it may create confusion in future. The mission also reviewed some procurement of works through the Electronic Government Procurement (EGP) and found necessary compliance with Public Procurement Act, 2006 and Public procurement Rules, 2008.

The mission observed that contract register was not properly updated in TOMPRO accounting system. It occurred due to practice of entering contract data at the time of payment instead of after signing the contract. Sr. AE agreed to update the register at earliest and establish a control mechanism to update contract register in TOMPRO after signing the contract. Sample check of Payment Monitoring Form reflected proper booking of contract payment in accounting system.

From the review of service contract management it was observed that in some cases inception report was not submitted by the service provider within specified timeline. There was no documentation regarding follow-up for such delay. Sr. AE informed that the inception reports were submitted on time but they did not accept those reports to ensure quality of the service. Also acceptance of such incomplete report may create the obligation of payment as per contract. It is suggested to maintain proper documentation of monitoring process to avoid sloppiness in contract management.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Update contract register in TOMPRO Establish a control mechanism to update contract register in TOMPRO after signing the contract	PMU	03/2018

e. Additional Aspects

F. Agreed Actions

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Finalization of project reallocation IFAD to communicate the approval to the reallocation proposed in the Implementation Support Mission report	IFAD, PMU	02/2018
Action plan on speeding up implementation of component 3 Urgently formulate a strategy and action plan to pick up momentum	PMU, PD	02/2018
Update contract register in TOMPRO Establish a control mechanism to update contract register in TOMPRO after signing the contract	PMU	03/2018
CALIP baseline study Submit the draft CALIP baseline study	PMU and M&E	03/2018
Increased action planning in building leverage Plan interventions under components 3 and 4 in accordance with beneficiary needs and recruit qualified public and private service providers for technical training	PMU	03/2018

Sharing of overseas learning Submit the overseas learning report on Agricultural Value Chain, Infrastructure and Livelihood Development to IFAD and promote the knowledge and good practices to project staff	PMU/PD	03/2018
Expediting thematic studies Conclude contracting and launch studies on climate change scenarios and sector exposure; pond fisheries impact and infrastructure performance	PMU	04/2018
HILIP mid-term outcome assessment Expedite the process and conduct the HILIP midterm outcome assessment	PMU and M&E	04/2018
ToRs on FAs Review and revision of ToR of DMU Finance Assistance	XEN, PD, FMS	04/2018
Provide to IFAD the response to management letter of auditors Provide IFAD the reply to management letter of the auditors for all the 15 observations for FY 2016-17 as translated in English	PMU	04/2018
Training on TOMPRO Training by FMS of DMU Finance on TOMPRO to generate accurate and timely financial data and reports as required and sync all module with each other.	FMS	04/2018
Correction of categorization Make necessary correction of entries in WA 25A and inform to IFAD. Produce and submit correct WA from TOMPRO in next submission of WA.	FMS and FAs	04/2018
Recruitment of audit firm for data system correction Hiring an audit firm to Identify all error/omission and miscoding of entries in TOMPRO and provide assistance to correcting and rectifying all data entered since inception of the project, also conduct Risk based internal audit based on international standard.	PMU	04/2018
Compliance with recommendations of supervision of May 2017 Awareness and training for BUGs on benefits of a federated network of BMCs, and follow up on comparative analysis of mechanized excavation	PMU	05/2018
Operational manual submission Submission of finalized Finance and Administrative manual to IFAD (to incorporate the TOMPRO system and other current practices and required documentation and process) and disseminate to all DMUs.		05/2018
Revise DPP Based on the Implementation Support Mission report, the project to amend the Development Project Proposal (DPP) to reflect revised HILIP/CALIP activities and the project completion date (30 Sept 2020) as per the signed FA and communicate to IFAD	PMU	06/2018

Speed up implementation Speed up annual implementation of technical components to reach a good level of financial and physical progress of AWPB 17 - 18	PMU	06/2018
Full-time Gender Advisor PMU adjusts sufficient provision to maintain the Gender Advisor position on a full-time basis till the project completion	PMU	06/2018
Mapping of project intervention Carry out the mapping of intervention by simplifying its design and model within the available budget	PMU	06/2018
Submission of LTB amendment Amendment of LTB with regards of thresholds for procurement prior review by IFAD more than USD 100,000 for Goods and Works and USD 30,000 for services	IFAD, PMU	06/2018
Comparative analysis of mechanized excavation Follow up on comparative analysis of mechanized excavation	PMU	07/2018
LCS's Sanitary napkin production Explore the possibility and procedure of upgrading LCS's innovative business on sanitary napkin production towards registered/formal cooperatives and improve its low-cost packaging and marketing	PMU/Gender Advisor	07/2018
Resilience monitoring Develop a system for monitoring household resilience based on the indicators and definition of resilience provided	PMU	09/2018
Gender and climate change Develop knowledge product on gender and climate change in the Haor	PMU	10/2018
Completing thematic studies Process Eol and complete procurement for examining dynamics of landscape reforestation and ecological resilience study	PMU	10/2018
Resolution letter from FAPAD Resolve all observations for FY 2016-17 and 1 pending observation for FY 2015-16 with FAPAD and provide IFAD the resolution letter from FAPAD.	PMU	11/2018
Gender showcase Showcase the project gender development achievements in media and events of national level such as workshop with video production (in both languages)	PMU/Gender Advisor	12/2018
Compliance with last ISM Complete the recruitment of new staff (additional 35 CDFs) as recommended by last ISM subject to RDPP approval	PMU	12/2018

Linkage of project's GAP to national CCGAP Track the progress of national CCGAP's common and relevant indicators	PMU/Gender Advisor	12/2018
Post-production and marketing support Work on a practical model of post-production management and marketing based on existing good practices and apply it as one of the support models	PMU/DMU	12/2018
Compliance with CALIP-supported activities under comp. 2 and comp. 4 Complying in achieving targets of model village, Killa and beel bank sites, and use of low cost technologies (e.g. cured bamboo and grass) in the remaining 31 sites for village protection	PMU/DMU	12/2018
Mid-level MEK specialist at PMU Assign a mid-level MEKMS to support in PMU M&E unit	PMU and M&E	12/2018
Component 1: Communication infrastructure Continue in taking initiative of expediting construction of boat landing platform, and where applicable merge it with popular road item like village internal services	PMU/DMU	12/2018
ORMS logframe and SIMES update Update the ORMS logframe and SIMES excel spreadsheet including component analysis/graphs and submit to IFAD on a quarterly basis	PMU and M&E	
Building linkage between tangible and intangible assets Link IGA support under component 3, 4 and 5 to communities that have benefited investments in infrastructures	PMU and all stakeholders	
Maintaining stable and performing project operational team Coming renewal of staff contracts needs to be undertaken to avoid disruption in management and operational efficiency	LGED and PMU	
Improved vegetative coverage Promote suitable practices to maintain vegetative cover within the productive landscape	PMU/Implementing partners	
Intensify M&E Follow up feedback from trained participants and beneficiaries to track the effective of intervention provided by the project and include the results at outcome level in the progress report.	PMU and M&E	
Fund flow preparation per DMU Preparation of fund flow statement per DMU with segregation of LCS/training advances from cumulative expenditures and inclusion of schedule of advances with aging and details of cash forecast in the periodic fund demand.	FMA	

Beel lease Request the Ministry of Land to continue a provision of beel lease (10 years) to BUGs after the project completion	PMU	
Replication of successful business models Promote replication of successful business models where needs are identified and reflect the results in project M&E	PMU/DMU	
Knowledge dissemination Upload all knowledge documents on project LGED website and IFADAsia portal and continue to disseminate lessons and good practices on IFADAsia Facebook and among other IFAD and LGED projects.	PMU/M&E unit	
Good practice dissemination Ensure systematic dissemination of good environmental and natural resources management practices	PMU/Implementing partners	
Monthly generation of record and reports from TOMPRO Produce statement of Sources and Uses of Funds, category and component wise expenditure statement and budget variance from TOMPRO per month. Identify and resolve if any deviations with manual records.	FMS	

Haor Infrastructure and Livelihood Improvement Project - Climate Adaption and Livelihood Protection

Logical Framework

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of verification			Assumptions
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2017)	Cumulative Result (2017)	Cumulative Result % (2017)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility	
Outreach Directly benefiting households receiving project services	1.a Corresponding number of households reached							Progress report	Annual	PMU	
	Households			355 564	72 530	288 428	81.1				
	1 Persons receiving services promoted or supported by the project							Progress report	Annual	PMU	
	Males				229 847	329 313					
	Total number of persons receiving services				341 994	501 225					
	Females				112 147	171 912					
Goal Contribute to the reduction of poverty in the Haor Basin	Increase in asset ownership							Multiple Indicator Cluster Survey (MICS) of the Bangladesh Bureau of Statistics.	3 times at baseline, mid-term and completion	PMU	No major natural disasters. No major price inflation for rice
	increase asset ownership			30							
	Reduction of the incidence of child malnutrition							Multiple Indicator Cluster Survey (MICS) of the Bangladesh Bureau of Statistics.	3 times at baseline, mid-term and completion	PMU	
	Reduction of incidence of child malnutrition, by gender			20							

Objective HILIP: Improve living standards and reduce the vulnerability of the poor. The project is expected to directly benefit 115,000 rural poor households CALIP: Strengthen the community and ecological resilience to climate change in the Haor region	Households increase in incomes by at least 30% by participating in the project						RIMS surveys at baseline, mid-term and completion. Participatory assessments with target households.	3 times at baseline, mid-term and completion	PMU	No major economic slow down.	
	Households			35 000							
	Households report reduction in losses and damages from flood waters, wave action and disease						RIMS surveys at baseline, mid-term and completion. Participatory assessments with target households.	3 times at baseline, mid-term and completion	PMU		
	Households			8 000							
Outcome Outcome 1: Enhanced access to markets, livelihood opportunities and social services	Traffic volume for Upazila and Union roads increase						Road user surveys. Market surveys. MICS Surveys. RIMS and baseline survey	Annual	PMU	Slow pace of economic growth.	
	Increase in traffic volume and union road			100							
	Increase in the volume of goods marketed						Road user surveys. Market surveys. MICS Surveys. RIMS and baseline survey	Annual	PMU		
	Increase in goods volume			50							
	Increase in percentage of households reporting benefit from project roads						Road user surveys. Market surveys. MICS Surveys. RIMS and baseline survey	Annual	PMU		
	Households			10							

	Percentage of the project-constructed roads maintain under good condition							Road user surveys. Market surveys. MICS Surveys. RIMS and baseline survey	Annual	PMU	
	Road constructed			90							
Output Output 1: Upazila and union roads constructed Bridges and culverts on project roads built Boat landing ghats constructed Employment created for project construction works	2.1.5 Roads constructed, rehabilitated or upgraded							Progress report	Quarter	PMU	No major damage to roads by floods and wave action.
	Length of roads			250	33	205	82.0				
	Bridges and culverts constructed							Progress report	Quarter	PMU	
	Length of bridge and culvert			2 700	361	2 253	83.4				
	Boat landing ghats built							Progress report	Quarter	PMU	
	Ghats			40	4	32	80.0				
	Minor Earth Work							Progress report	Quarter	PMU	
	Minor Earth Work			50	2	7	14.0				
	Infrastructure Maintenance							Progress report	Quarter	PMU	
	Infrastructure maintenance			200							
Outcome Outcome 2: Enhanced village mobility, increase in farm production and protection against extreme weather events	Traffic volume for village roads increased										Slow pace of economic growth.
	Traffic volume increased			100	76	77	77.0				
	Project-built markets well operational							Road user surveys. Market surveys. MICS Surveys. RIMS and baseline survey	Annual	PMU	
	Operational market			100	13	50	50.0				

	Project-built markets with Market Management Committee (MMC)							Road user surveys. Market surveys. MICS Surveys. RIMS and baseline survey	Annual	PMU	
	Market managed by MMC			100	76	77	77.0				
Output Output 2: Community roads, markets, protection works for villages and markets/informal market collection points constructed HILIP: Women and men employed for construction of project works CALIP: Employment created for construction works	Villages protection works constructed							Progress report, M&E report	Quarter	PMU	No major damage to roads and village protection works by floods and wave action. Public procurement policy continues to allow direct procurement of works through LCS.
	Village protection			100	12	63	63.0				
	Protection works for village markets done							Progress report, M&E report	Quarter	PMU	
	Protection work			40	7	27	67.5				
	Protection works for informal market collection centres completed							Progress report, M&E report	Quarter	PMU	
	Protection works			5	0	1	20.0				
	Daily labour employed							Progress report, M&E report	Quarter	PMU	
	Daily labour			35 000	3 505	25 850	73.9				
	Villages protected							Progress report, M&E report	Quarter	PMU	
	Village			200	37	93	46.5				
	Villages with common infrastructure services							Progress report, M&E report	Quarter	PMU	
	Village			175	54	120	68.6				
	Model villages							Progress report, M&E report	Quarter	PMU	
	Model village			2	0	0	0.0				
	Killas protected using vegetative species							Progress report, M&E report	Quarter	PMU	
	Killas			28	4	10	35.7				
	Beel-banks protected using vegetative species							Progress report, M&E report	Quarter	PMU	
	Beel banks			50	1	1	2.0				
	Road slope protected with vetiver grass							Progress report, M&E report	Quarter	PMU	
	Length of roads			50	7	17	34.0				

	Labor Construction Societies (LCS) groups trained						Progress report, M&E report	Quarter	PMU
	LCS groups			542					
	New or existing rural infrastructure protected from climate events (US\$' 000/Km)						Progress report, M&E report	Quarter	PMU
	Length of roads			50	50	50			
	Production and processing facilities supported with increased water availability and efficiency						Progress report, M&E report	Quarter	PMU
	Facilities				1 352	1 352			
	Households supported with increased water availability or efficiency						Progress report, M&E report	Quarter	PMU
	Households			2 550	1 050	2 240			
	2.1.5 Roads constructed, rehabilitated or upgraded						Progress report, M&E report	Quarter	PMU
	Length of roads			300	51	233			
	LCS employed for the project construction work						Progress report	Quarterly	PMU
	Households			15 900					
	2.1.6 Market, processing or storage facilities constructed or rehabilitated						Progress report	Quarterly	PMU
	Market facilities constructed/rehabilitated			65	13	50			

Outcome Outcome 3: Enhanced access of the poor men and women to sustainable water bodies with increased production capacity and biodiversity	Households improved access to water sources						World Fish Centre report & PMU fishery RIMS baseline and monitoring Surveys.	Annual	PMU	Interference and control by water lords of lease right of poor fishers Transfer of leases to BUGs is not obstructed and terms of leases provide long terms access to water bodies at reasonable cost. Price of fish.		
	Households			13 020								
	Fishers increase their income by at least 50% from fish production						World Fish Centre report & PMU fishery RIMS baseline and monitoring Surveys.	Annual	PMU			
	Households			6 510								

	BUGs managed and operated well						World Fish Centre report & PMU fishery RIMS baseline and monitoring Surveys.	Annual	PMU		
	BUGs			100	77	77				77.0	
	Increased average fish catch per hectare						World Fish Centre report & PMU fishery RIMS baseline and monitoring Surveys.	Annual	PMU		
	Kg			200	5	182				91.0	
Output Output 3: 500 Beel User Groups established of which 141 are new	Beel User Groups formed of which 141 are new						Progress report	Quarterly	PMU	BUG members not controlled by water lords.	
	BUGs			141		383					271.6
	Beel User Groups formed with combined membership of 13 020 by gender						Minutes of Scheme Takeover Project Progress Reports, M&E report	Quarter	PMU		
	Females					3 804					
	BUG members			13 020		12 250					94.1
	Beels improved						Minutes of Scheme Takeover Project Progress Reports, M&E report	Quarter	PMU		
	Beels			205	5	23					11.2
	Canal excavated						Minutes of Scheme Takeover Project Progress Reports, M&E report	Quarter	PMU		
	Canal			100	0	36					36.0
	Sanctuaries established						Progress report	Quarterly	PMU		
	Sanctuaries			80	0	45					56.3

	Area under swamp forestry						Progress report	Quarterly	PMU		
	Swamp tree planted			300 000	14 500	117 000					39.0
	Number of households in vulnerable areas with increased water availability for agricultural production and processing						Progress report	Quarterly	PMU		
	Households			3 000							
	Individuals engaged in NRM and climate risk management activities						Progress report	Quarterly	PMU		
	Males										
	Total			1 530							
	Females										
Outcome Outcome 4: Enhanced production, diversification and marketing of crop and livestock produce	1.2.4 Households reporting an increase in production						RIMS, Baseline, MTR, Impact assessment	Annual	PMU	Seed for improved varieties and improved technologies are available.	
	Households			20 000							
	1.2.2 Households reporting adoption of new/improved inputs, technologies or practices						RIMS, Baseline, MTR, Impact assessment	Annual	PMU		
	Males			50							
	Females			50							
	Households			50							
Output Output 4: Employment and enterprise opportunities created, activities building awareness on social issues initiated, and demonstrations on crop/horticulture, livestock and fisheries implemented	Employment and enterprise opportunities created						Project Progress Reports, M&E report	Quarter	PMU		
	Enterprise			960							
	Activities initiated to build awareness on social issues						Project Progress Reports, M&E report	Quarter	PMU		
	Activities			256							
	Groups receiving vocational training						Progress report	Qaurterly	PMU		
	batch			450	37	71					15.8
	Persons trained in various production technologies (CALIP)						Project Progress Reports, M&E report	Quarter	PMU		
	Total				3 120	34 460					
	2.1.1 Rural enterprises accessing business development services						Proppress report	Quarter			
	Rural enterprises			960							

	1.1.4 Persons trained in production practices and/or technologies						Progress report	Quarterly	PMU		
	Total persons trained in livestock			36 500	3 200	21 620				59.2	
	Total persons trained in fishery			9 575	800	6 500				67.9	
	Total persons trained in crop			41 720	5 462	29 802				71.4	
	People trained in community management topics						Progress report	Quarterly	PMU		
	Men trained in bookkeeping										
	Total persons trained in planning			220 233							
Outcome Outcome 5: Enhanced capacity and knowledge to contend with climate change impacts	At least equal number of villages adopted CALIP tested low-cost village protection system						MMC surveys. Third Party Surveys. Department of Agriculture, Fisheries and Livestock Data.	Annual	PMU	Adaptation to climate change expertise available Political willingness to adopt evidence-based policy guidance The inter-agency coordination is ensured through proper monitoring.	
	Village										
	No. of policy options identified to support of climate adaptation in the Haor area						MMC surveys. Third Party Surveys. Department of Agriculture, Fisheries and Livestock Data.	Annual	PMU		
	Policy options										

Output CALIP: Weather and Flash Flood Forecasting operational Research findings of various technologies and systems are disseminated Policy briefs advocate research findings Climate sensitive policy dialogue leading to enhanced frameworks	No. of people reached by agro-meteorology weather forecast						Progress report	Quarter	PMU	Evidence based issue identification is done to engage stakeholders.	
	Total			300 000							
	No. of institutions reached by FFEWS						Progress report	Quarter	PMU		
	Institution			3	3	3					100.0
	Action research studies published						Progress report	Quarter	PMU		
	Studies			4	0	0					0.0
	Individuals engaged in NRM and climate risk management activities						Progress report	Quarter	PMU		
	Males										
	Total			30 550	15 259	15 259					49.9
	Females										
	Poor smallholder household members supported in coping with the effects of climate change						Progress report	Quarter	PMU		
	Total household members			180 640	39 733	101 990					56.5
	Females										
	Males										
	International and country dialogues on climate supported						Progress report	Quarter	PMU		
	Dialogues			2							
Policy 1 Policy-relevant knowledge products completed						Progress report	Quarterly	PMU			
Number			2								

Bangladesh

Haor Infrastructure and Livelihood Improvement Project - Climate Adaption and Livelihood Protection

Supervision Report

Appendix 1: Financial: actual financial performance; by financier by component and disbursements by category

Mission Dates: 03 - 15 March 2018
Document Date: 17/05/2018
Project No. 1100001585
Report No. 4734-BD

Appendix 1: Financial: Actual financial performance by financier; by component and disbursements by category

Table A: Financial performance by financier (as of 01/03/2018)

Financier	Appraisal (USD '000)	Disbursements (USD '000)	Per cent disbursed
IFAD loan	55,000	33,665	61%
IFAD grant	1,000	445	45%
Spanish Trust Fund loan	30,000	22,090	74%
ASAP Trust Fund grant	15,000	7,591	51%
Government	33,840	16,123	48%
Total	134,840	79,914	59%

Table B: Financial performance by financier by component (USD '000) as of 31/01/2018

	IFAD loan			IFAD grant			Spanish Trust Fund			ASAP TRUST GRANT			Government			Total		
Component	Appraisal	Actual	%	Appraisal	Actual	%	Appraisal	Actual	%	Appraisal	Actual	%	Appraisal	Actual	%	Appraisal	Actual	%
1.Communications Infrastructures	12,000	6,765	56	-	-	-	12,000	6,764	56	-	-	-	23,000	12,470	54	47,000	26,000	55
2.Community Infrastructure	16,000	11,741	73	-	-	-	15,000	11,573	77	8,600	3,264	38	7,000	2,418	35	46,600	28,996	62
3.Community Resources management	6,000	416	7	1,000	427	43	3,000	188	6	-	-	-	1,000	44	4	11,000	1,075	10
4.Livelihood Protection	3,000	2,267	76	-	-	-	-	-	-	4,300	555	13	564	51	9	7,864	2,873	37
5.Capacity and Knowledge for Building Resilience (CALIP)	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	1,700	1,229	72	223	302	135	1,923	1,531	80
6.Project Management	18,000	7,792	43	-	-	-	-	-	-	400	-	-	2,053	838	41	20,453	8,630	42
Sub-Total Expenditures	55,000	28,981	256	1,000	427	43	30,000	18,526	140	15,000	5,048	123	33,840	16,123	278	134,840	69,104	
Outstanding IFAD Advances	-	4,684	-	-	18	-	-	3,564	-	-	2,543	-	-	-	-	-	10,810	
Total	55,000	33,665	61	1,000	445	45	30,000	22,090	74	15,000	7,591	51	33,840	16,123	48	134,840	79,914	59

Tables C: IFAD-managed disbursements - HILIP (SDR/EURO, as at 01/03/18)

IFAD LOAN in SDR, as at 01/03/18					
DESCRIPTION	CAT#	Allocated (SDR)	Disbursed (SDR)	%	Available balance (SDR)
Civil works - Communication	1A	6,580,000	4,393,990	67%	2,186,010
Civil works - Community	1B	10,130,000	6,242,285	62%	3,887,715
Vehicles & equipment	2	560,000	726,168	130%	-166,168
TA, studies, training, workshops	3	3,940,000	1,959,030	50%	1,980,970
Salaries & allowances	4	8,270,000	2,972,200	36%	5,297,800
Operating expenses	5	1,520,000	563,395	37%	956,605
Unallocated		3,450,000	-	0%	3,450,000
Advanced to designated account		0	6,562,096	0%	-6,562,096
TOTAL		34,450,000	23,419,164	68%	11,030,836

IFAD GRANT in SDR, as at 01/03/18					
DESCRIPTION	CAT#	Allocated (SDR)	Disbursed (SDR)	%	Available balance (SDR)
Civil works - Communication	1A	0	0	0%	0%
Civil works - Community	1B	0	0	0%	0%
Vehicles & equipment	2	0	0	0%	0%
TA, studies, training, workshops	3	630,000	168,372	27%	461,628
Salaries & allowances	4	0	0	0%	0%
Operating expenses	5	0	0	0%	0%
Unallocated		0	0	0%	0%
Advanced to designated account		0	137,796	0.00%	-137,796
TOTAL		630,000	306,168	49%	323,832

SPANISH TRUST FUND LOAN in EURO, as at 01/03/18					
DESCRIPTION	CAT#	Allocated (EURO)	Disbursed (EURO)	%	Available balance (EURO)
Civil works - Communication	1A	8,430,000	5,877,181	70%	2,552,819
Civil works - Community	1B	12,970,000	6,739,133	52%	6,230,867
Vehicles & equipment	2	0	0	0%	0
TA, studies, training, workshops	3	0	0	0%	0
Salaries & allowances	4	0	0	0%	0%
Operating expenses	5	0	0	0%	0%

Unallocated	0	0	0%	0%
Advanced to designated account	0	6,347,574	0%	-6,347,574
TOTAL	21,400,000	18,963,888	89%	2,436,112

Table 2C-2: ASAP grant disbursements - CALIP (SDR, as at 01/03/18)

ASAP Grants-CALIP in SDR, as at 01/03/18					
DESCRIPTION	CAT #	Allocated (SDR)	Disbursed (SDR)	%	Available Balance (SDR)
Civil works - Community	1B	4,700,000	1,400,372	30%	3,299,628
Technical Assistance, Studies, training & workshops	3	3,900,000	982,697	25%	2,917,303
Recurrent costs (Salaries & operating costs)	4	300,000	26,496	9%	273,503
Unallocated		1,000,000	0.00	0%	1,000,000
Advance to designated account		0	3,027,515	0%	-3,027,515
Total		9,900,000	5,437,080	55%	4,462,920

Bangladesh

Haor Infrastructure and Livelihood Improvement Project - Climate Adaption and Livelihood Protection

Supervision Report

Appendix 2: Physical progress measured against AWP&B

Mission Dates: 03 - 15 March 2018

Document Date: 17/05/2018

Project No. 1100001585

Report No. 4734-BD

Asia and the Pacific Division
Programme Management Department

Appendix 2: Physical progress measured against AWP&B

Component 1: Communication Infrastructure (HILIP):

SI No.	Activities	Unit	RDPP Target	Reallocated Target	Annual Target FY2017-18	Annual Achieved up to Jan' 2018	%	Cumulative achievement up to January 2018	% achieved against Reallocated Target
1	Upazila roads	km	100	100	10	8	80%	83	83%
2	Union roads	km	150	150	25	9	36%	122	81%
3	Bridges and culverts (Upazila road)	m	700	375	36	15	42%	274	73%
4	Bridges and culverts (Union road)	m	1.050	575	18	10	56%	473	82%
5	Bridges & culverts (community road)	m	1.600	1050	120	90	75%	627	60%
6	Bridge & culverts in Sunamgang Dist.	m	700	700	0	0	0%	700	100%
7	Boat Landing Ghats	no.	50	40	2	0	0%	32	80%
8	Minor Earth Work	km	250	50	16	2	13%	9	18%
Total of Comp. 1			4600				44%	2320	71%

Component 2: Community Infrastructure (HILIP):

Sl. No.	Activities	Unit	RDPP target	Reallocated Target	Annual Target FY2017-18	Annual Achieved up to Jan' 2018	%	Cumulative achievement up to January 2018	% against Reallocated Target
1	Community road	km	350	300	20	10	50%	233	78%
2	Village market development	no.	78	65	5	3	60%	54	83%
3	Market collection centre	no.	90	5	0	1	0%	2	40%
4	Village protection, raising and development work done	no.	78	100	12	4	33%	65	65%
5	Market Protection works	no.	52	40	7	4	57%	27	68%
6	Irrigation Infrastructure	no.	26	50	5	2	40%	10	20%

7	Plate compactor	no.	24	24	0	0	0%	24	100%
8	Minor earth work/road alignment	km	403	50	5	2	40%	2	4%
9	Pilot innovative infrastructure	no.	15	5	0	0	0%	0	0%
Total of Comp. 2 (HILIP)							36%		64%

Component 2: Community Infrastructures (CALIP):

SL No.	Activities	Unit	RDPP Target	Reallocated Target	Annual Target FY2017-18	Annual Achieved up to Jan' 2018	%	Cumulative achievement up to January 2018	% achieved against Reallocated Target
1	No of Village protection Infrastructure	no	224	175	35	12	34%	99	57%
2	Village common internal services	no	168	200	30	20	67%	123	62%
3	Model Village develop	no	5	2	0	0	0%	0	0%
5	Pilot Testing of beel bank protection	no	50	50	10	2	20%	3	6%
6	Pilot Testing of killa protection	no	20	28	5	1	20%	10	36%
	Pilot Testing of Upazila/Union road slope protection	km	50	60	8	5	63%	20,24	34%
Total of Comp. 2 (CALIP)							50%		51%

Component 3: Community Resource Management (CRM)-HILIP

SI No.	Activities	Unit	RDPP Target	Reallocated Target	Annual Target FY2017-18	Annual Achieved up to Jan' 2018	%	Cumulative achievement up to January 2018	% achieved against Reallocated Target
1	Beel Developed (Old)>20 acres	no.	30	45	18	1	6%	8	18%
2	Beel Developed (New)>20 acres	no.	120	35	30	0	0%	0	0%
3	Beel Developed (Old)<20 acres	no.	75	100	56	0	0%	15	15%
4	Beel Developed (New)<20 acres	no.	80	25	16	0	0%	0	0%
5	Sub-Total		305	205	120	1	1%	23	11%

6	Khal/canal re-excavated	km	100	100	25	5	20%	40,80	41%
7	Swamp Forestry	no.	213500	300000	102500	6000	6%	117000	39%
8	Union brought under support services	no.	168	150	18	10	56%	142	95%
9	BMC received/attended training/ exposure	Group	100	100	20	5	25%	56	56%
10	Third party monitoring	no.	5	5	1	1	100%	4	80%
11	Promotional materials developed	no.	8	8	1	1	100%	3	38%
Total of Comp. 3							22%		45%

Component 4: Livelihood Protection

Sl. No	Activities	Unit	RDPP target	Reallocated Target	Annual Target FY2017-18	Annual Achieved up to Jan' 2018	%	Cumulative achievement up to January 2018	% achieved against Reallocated Target
1	CIG Group Formation (Crop & Horticulture)	No	1680	1680	356	287	81%	1511	90%
2	CIG Group Formation (Poultry & Livestock)	No	1680	1600	376	259	69%	1483	93%
3	CIG Group Formation (Fisheries)	No	336	336	66	45	68%	315	94%
4	CIG Group Formation (Innovative Business Creation)	No	84	84	14	8	57%	67	80%
	Sub - Total CIG Formation		3780	3700	812	599	74%	3376	91%
1	Demonstration on Crop & Hort.	No	924	924	106	53	50%	655	71%
2	Demonstration on Poultry & Livestock	No.	1256	1256	104	30	29%	869	69%
3	Demonstration on Fisheries	No.	336	336	30	8	27%	232	69%
	Sub - Total (Demonstration)		2516	2516	240	91	38%	1756	70%
Demo based training									
1	Crop & Horticulture	Batch	924	924	106	68	64%	670	73%

2	Poultry and Livestock	Batch	1256	1365	104	61	59%	1009	74%
3	Fisheries	Batch	336	336	30	25	83%	249	74%
	Sub - Total	Batch	2516	2625	240	154	64%	1928	73%
(Demonstration Based Training)									
1	IGA Training on Crop & Hort.	Batch	1330	1330	116	70	60%	938	71%
2	Others Training , IGA Training , Linkage development , Orientation Training	Batch	172	172	30	10	33%	59	34%
3	IGA Training / others training on Fisheries sector	Batch	84	84	10	9	90%	65	77%
4	Sub - Total (IGA and Others Training)	Batch	1586	1586	156	89	57%	1062	67%
1	Exchange visit for crop and Horticulture sector farm	Batch	200	200	16	7	44%	124	62%
2	Exchange visit to Farm, Hatchery	Batch	235	235	10	6	60%	202	86%
	Sub - Total (Exchange visit)	Batch	435	435	26	13	50%	326	75%
1	Field Days Observation on Crop Demonstration	Batch	132	132	16	10	63%	100	76%
2	Field Days Observation on Fisheries	Batch	101	101	16	6	38%	34	34%
	Sub - Total (Field days)		233	233	32	16	50%	134	58%
Sl. No	Activities	Unit	RDPP target	Reallocated Target	Annual Target FY2017- 18	Annual Achieved up to Jan' 2018	%	Cumulative achievement up to January 2018	% achieved against Reallocated Target
1	Para- Vet Training @ 30 person per batch	Person	840	840	180	0%	0	390	
2	Vaccination & De-Worming @ 500 cattle per event	Event	112	126	28	19	68%	89	71%
3	Artificial Insemination Program @ 100 cattle per event	Event	56	70	14	7	50%	43	61%
			1008	1036	222	26	12%	522	50%
1	Innovative Training to LCS Graduates Members @ 10 person per batch	Person	960	960	140	20	14%	610	64%
2	Build Awareness on Social issues	Event	256	272	28	14	50%	184	68%

3	Recognition Award on Best Practices	Person	546	618	60	0	0%	338	55%
	Sub Total (Livelihood CDF Support	No.	165	200	165	165	100%	165	83%
	Total of Comp. 4 (HILIP & CALIP)		14001	14181	2121	1187	56%	10401	73%

Component-4 : Livelihood Protection: CALIP

Activities	Unit	RDPP target	Reallocated Target	Annual Target FY2017-18	Annual Achieved up to Jan'2018	%	Cumulative achievement up to January 2018	% achieved against Reallocated Target
1. Village Forestry								
Training on bamboo production activities	Batch	1680	1120	215	80	37%	673	60%
Training on Murta production	Batch	1680	350	13	8	62%	345	99%
Training on koros/ hizol production	Batch	252	252	130	53	41%	154	61%
Training on vetiver grass production	Batch	1680	420	60	19	32%	302	72%
Training on medical/fruit plants production	Batch	420	840	264	87	33%	244	29%
Training of Trainers	Batch	0	5	0	0	0%	5	100%
Total		5712	2987	682	247	36%	1723	58%
2. Pond Fisheries								
Demonstrations Mola Fish	No.	0	84	42	0	0%	0	0%
Brood Pond culture	No.	0	28	14	1	7%	0	0%
Training to farmers	No.	252	220	65	12	18%	102	46%
Exchange visit to successful farmers	No.	126	103	45	1	2%	13	13%
Visit to hatchery	No.	126	104	46	2	4%	16	15%
Total		504	539	212	16	8%	131	24%
3. Advanced Improved product Training								
Wood products	Batch	42	6	0	0	0%	6	100%
Bamboo products	Batch	84	84	19	11	0%	57	68%
Cane products	Batch	70	6	0	0	0%	6	100%

Murta products	Batch	140	0	0	0	0%	0	0%
Jute and other products products 20/batch)-Block Batik, Nakshi Katha, Carchupi, Packing+Candle making, Pickle, Confectionary	Batch	42	282	100	53	0%	139	
Total		378	378	119	64	54%	208	55%
4. Vocational Training								
Diesel engine/pump repairing	Batch	21	17	5	3	60%	9	53%
Motor cycle repairing	Batch	21	44	18	9	50%	12	27%
Mobile phone /computer repairing	Batch	21	39	18	1	6%	4	10%
Tailoring	Batch	42	91	5	3	60%	8	9%
House wiring/ electrician	Batch	50	80	23	9	39%	23	29%
Plumbing	Batch	40	30	5	2	40%	5	17%
Refrigerator repairing	Batch	30	29	15	5	33%	8	28%
Welding	Batch	30	19	8	1	13%	4	21%
Mason/concrete	Batch	50	0	0	0	0%	0	0%
Tiles/mosaic	Batch	50	0	0	0	0%	0	0%
Driving cum Auto Mechanic/Others	Batch	145	101	11	11	100%	12	12%
Total		500	450	108	44	41%	85	19%
Total of Com.4 (CALIP)		7094	4354	1121	371	33%	2147	49%

Component-5: Capacity and Knowledge for building resilience: CALIP

Component –5 : Capacity and Knowledge for Building Resilience (CALIP)								
SL No.	Activities	Unit	RDPP Target	Reallocated Target	FY 2017-18			Cumulative achievement up to January 2018
					Annual Target FY2017-18	Annual Achieved up to Jan' 2018	%	
								% achieved against Reallocated Target

1	Climate change forecasting and participatory scenario development And Assessment of the agriculture & fisheries sector and exposure to climate risk	No.	1	1	1	0	0%	0	0% (Contract negotiation done)
2	Analysis of the environment impacts of large scale expansion of pond fisheries and climate change affects	No.	1	1	1	0	0%	0	0% (Contract negotiation done)
3	Examining the dynamics of reforestation at landscape level and strengthening ecological resilience	No.	1	1	1	0	0%	0	0%
Weather and Flash flood warning system									
1	Technical assistance to BMD by IWFM	No.	LS (5)	LS (5)	1	0	0%	2	40%
2	Fast computer system for BMD	No.	1	1	0	0	0%	1	100%
3	Develop rainfall dissemination system for Hoar	No.	LS (1)	LS (1)	0,2	0,1	50%	0,4	40%
Sub-Total: Weather and Flash flood warning system						0	%	3,4	49%
FFEWS and capacity building and KM by IWFM									
1	Downscaling GFS forecasting and technical assistance to BMD by IWFM	No.	LS (5)	LS (5)	LS (1)	0	0%	2	40%
	fast computer system				0	0	0%	1	100%
2	Develop FFEWS for haor region by IWFM	No.	LS (1)	LS (1)	0,2	0,1	50%	0,4	40%
3	Training and KM by IWFM	No.	LS (5)	LS (5)	LS (1)	0	0%	2	40%
Sub-Total :FFEWS and capacity building and KM by IWFM								5,4	49%
FFEWS and capacity building for FFWC, BWDB									
1	Fast computer system for flood forecasting	No.	1	1	1	0	0%	0	0%
2	Performance evaluation of FFEWS models & management cost	No.	LS (3)	LS (3)	1	0	0%	1	33%
3	Funds for development of FFEWS by IWM	No.	LS (5)	LS (5)	1	1	100%	3	60%

Sub-Total: FFEWS and capacity building for FFWC, BWDB	4	45%
--	----------	------------

Dissemination system for FFEWS by CALIP

1	Develop dissemination system of FFEWS for communities and institutions	No.	1	1	1	0	0%	0	0%
2	International training of weather and FFW	No.	2	3	1	0	0%		0%
3	Monitoring the performance of village protection, model village, Upazila road slope protection	No.	LS (2)	1	1	0	0%	0	0%
4	Pro-poor adaption pathways framework	No.	LS (1)	1	0	0	0%	0	0%
5	Policy Dialogue, Workshops, seminars & international symposiums	No.	10	10	3	0	0%	4	40%
6	Digital Elevation model (DEM) data for FFEWS	No.	0	1	0	0	0%	0	0%
Sub-Total: Dissemination system for FFEWS by CALIP								4	15%
Total of Capacity and Knowledge for Building Resilience									40%

Component 6: Project Management

SI No.	Activities	Unit	RDPP Target	Reallocated target	Annual Target FY2017-18	Annual Achieved up to Janc.2018	%	Cumulative achievement up to January 2018	% achieved against Reallocated Target
1	no. of 4WD jeeps procured	no.	3	2	1	0	0%	2	%
2	no. of pickup procured	no.	10	5	3	0	0%	5	100%
3	no. of speed boat procured	no.	4	4	0	0	0%	4	100%
4	no. of country boat	no.	5	0	5	0	0%	0	0%
5	no. of motorcycles procured	no.	70	70	0	0	0%	70	100%
6	Bicycle	no.	100	100	0	0	0%	100	100%
Sub-Total for Transport Procured			192	181	9	0	0%	181	100%
1	PMU equipped with computer and furniture	no.	1	1	1	0	0%	1	100%

2	no. of DMU equipped with computers and furniture	no.	5	5	5	0	0%	5	100%
3	no. of UMU equipped with computers and furniture	no.	14	14	14	0	0%	14	100%
Sub-Total for Computer and office furniture procured			20	20	20	0	0%	20	100%
1	Motorcycle (Resource Management)	no.	20	20	20	20	100%	20	100%
2	Motorcycle (livelihood)	no.	155	155	155	65	42%	69	45%
3	Vehicles 4 WD Jeep (class-2)	no.	4	25	4	2	42%	3	12%
4	Pickup	no.	10	20	5	2	42%	5	25%
5	Motorcycle (New Office)	no.	70	70	70	29	42%	38	54%
6	Speed boat	no.	5	5	4	2	42%	3	60%
7	Country Boat	no.	5	0	0	0	0%	0	0%
Sub-Total for Petrol And Lubricant (HILIP) & CALIP			269	295	258	120	47%	118	40%
1	Financial Management Support	no.	1	1	1	1	100%	1	100%
2	no. of MIS/software support	no.	2	3	1	0	0%	1	33%
3	no. of baseline survey	no.	1	1	0	0	0%	1	100%
4	no. of RIMS survey	no.	2	2	1	0	0%	1	50%
5	no. of gender mainstreaming study	no.	3	3	1	0	0%	0	0%
6	no. of mid-term impact assessment	no.	1	1	1	0	0%	0	0%
7	no. of project completion impact study	no.	1	1	0	0	0%	0	0%
8	Environment & other studies and surveys	no.	1	1	0	0	0%	1	100%
Sub-Total for Surveys and Studies (HILIP):			12	13	5	1	20%	3	23%
CALIP									
1	Village & slope protection /Assessment of climate change impact on Gender	no.	LS (1)	1	1	0	0%	0	0%
2	Model Village development	no.	LS	1	0	0	0%	0	0%

SI No.	Activities	Unit	RDPP Target	Reallocated target	Annual Target FY2017-18	Annual Achieved up to Jan.2018	%	Cumulative achievement up to January 2018	% achieved against Reallocated Target
3	Irrigation & action research/Midterm impact Study	no.	LS	1	0	0	0%	0	0%
4	Project completion impact study	no.	LS	1	0	0	0%	0	0%
5	Baseline survey conducted	no.	LS	1	1	0	0%	0	0%
6	Survey for project mapping	no.	LS	1	1	0	0%	0	0%
Sub-Total for Surveys and Studies undertaken (CALIP):			7	6	3	0	0%	0	0%
1	no. of training conducted (batch)	no.	20	20	4	4	100%	20	100%
2	no. of district gender workshop	no.	10	10	0	0	0%	10	100%
3	no. of national start-up/review workshop	no.	1	1	0	0	0%	1	100%
4	no. of Start-up workshop and progress review & planning meeting at PMU and district level	no.	53	53	20	8	40%	30	57%
5	no. of overseas training/study tour for 80 participants	no.	80	80	40	10	25%	15	19%
Sub-Total for Staff training & Workshop (HILIP)			164	164	40	10	25%	76	46%
1	National Start-up Workshop	no.	1	1	0	0	0%	1	100%
2	Start-up and District Orientation Workshop	no.	5	5	5	0	0%	1	20%
3	Staff orientation & Capacity Building	no.	5	5	5	1	20%	1	20%
4	Gender Workshop	no.	10	10	5	1	20%	1	10%
5	Annual review & Planning Workshop	no.	5	15	5	0	0%	5	33%
Sub-Total for Project orientation and Review (CALIP):			26	36	8	2	25%	9	25%
1	no. of GOB regular staff included in PMU	no.	7	7	8	8	100%	8	114%
2	no. of TA consultants recruited for PMU	no.	11	20	17	14	82%	11	55%
3	no. of GOB contract staff recruited for PMU	no.	9	10	9	9	100%	9	90%
	no. of GOB contracted staff recruited in DMU	no.	73	73	71	71	100%	71	97%

4	no. of GOB contracted staff recruited for UMU	no.	160	160	160	160	100%	160	100%
5	no. of GOB regular staff included from XEN office	no.	25	20	15	15	100%	15	75%
6	no. of GOB regular staff included from UZ LGED office	no.	40	40	4	4	100%	4	10%
Sub-Total for Project staff and TA recruited (HILIP):			325	330	284	281	99%	278	84%
SI No.	Activities	Unit	RDPP Target	Reallocated target	Annual Target FY2017-18	Annual Achieved up to Jan.2018	%	Cumulative achievement up to January 2018	% achieved against Reallocated Target
1	National Start-up Workshop	no.	1	1	0	0	0%	1	100%
Sub-Total for Project staff and TA recruited (CALIP):			2	2	2	2	100%	2	100%
1	Travelling and other allowances provided to PMU	no.	8	17	8	4	50%	8	47%
2	Travelling and other allowances provided to DMU	no.	40	80	40	22	55%	40	50%
3	Travelling and other allowances provided to UMU	no.	112	160	112	80	71%	112	70%
Sub-Total for Staff travelling cost and allowance provided :			160	257	160	106	66%	160	62%
1	LGED Implementation Support	no.	5	5	1	1	100%	2	40%
1	no. of PMU office established and maintained	no.	1	1	1	1	100%	1	100%
2	no. of district office established and maintained	no.	5	5	5	5	100%	5	100%
3	no. of upazila office established and maintained	no.	14	14	14	14	100%	14	100%
Sub-Total for Project office established and maintained :			20	20	20	20	100%	20	100%
1	no. of 4WD jeeps maintained	no.	4	4	4	2	50%	4	100%
2	no. of pickup maintained	no.	10	10	5	3	60%	5	50%
3	no. of speedboat maintained	no.	5	5	4	2	50%	5	100%
4	no. of country boat maintained	no.	5	0	0	0	0%	0	0%

5	no. of motorcycles maintained	no.	245	245	13	7	54%	245	100%
Sub-Total: Vehicle maintained			269	264	13	7	54%	259	98%
Total of Component 6			1466	1588	822	549	67%	1126	71%
Grand Total									64%

Bangladesh

Haor Infrastructure and Livelihood Improvement Project - Climate Adaption and Livelihood Protection

Supervision Report

Appendix 3: Compliance with legal covenants: status of implementation

Mission Dates: 03 - 15 March 2018

Document Date: 17/05/2018

Project No. 1100001585

Report No. 4734-BD

Asia and the Pacific Division
Programme Management Department

Appendix 3: Compliance with legal covenants: Status of implementation

Section	Covenant	Target/Action Due Date	Compliance Status/Date	Remarks
Section B.8 Section B.3 CALIP	Borrower/Recipient to open four designated accounts in USD for the IFAD loan, IFAD grant, and ASAP grant, and in EUR for the Spanish Trust Fund (STF) loan		Complied	Accounts held at the Bangladesh Bank (central bank)
Section B.9 Section B.4 CALIP	Borrower/Recipient to open (i) 1 project account in BDT to receive and hold financing transferred from the 3 HILIP designated accounts, (ii) 1 project account in BDT to receive and hold financing transferred from the ASAP designated account and (iii) 10 district project accounts (2 in each of the 5 Haor districts in the project area)	Conditions precedent to withdrawal	Complied	Single project account held at Janata Bank, operated by the Project Director (as is the practice in Bangladesh Government)
Section B.5 CALIP GC Section 11.01	Exemption from duties and taxes for all goods, works and services financed from IFAD, STF or ASAP	Continuous	Complied	
Section B.10	Borrower/Recipient to provide counterpart financing in the amount of USD 32 million	Continuous	On-going	Counterpart financing in the form of tax exemption and co-financing of expenditure in categories 1, 2 and 5 (see aide-memoire) Financial, administrative and accounting procedures manual drafted, still being finalized Fiscal year 2017-18 AWPB has been submitted on August 22, 2017
Schedule 1 – II.14	Project Implementation Manual to be drafted and submitted to IFAD for approval	At start of project	Partially complied	
GC Section 7.01(b)	AWPB to be submitted to the Fund, for its review and comments	30 April 2016	Complied (Lately submitted)	
GC Section 7.08	Insurance of goods and buildings financed from the financing proceeds in a manner consistent with sound commercial practice	Throughout project life	Not complied	No insurance for project assets except for vehicle
GC Section 7.11	Insurance of project personnel against health and accident risks	Throughout project life	Not complied	
GC Section 8.03(b)	A Mid-Term Review (MTR) to be carried out jointly by the Borrower/Recipient and IFAD.	By 30/09/2016	Complied	MTR conducted from 12 to 27 May 2016
GC Section 9.02	Project financial statements (PFS) submitted to IFAD	Annual, By 31 October	Complied	PFS submitted to FAPAD for annual audit
GC Section 9.03	Audit report submitted to IFAD	Annual, By 31 December	Complied	Audit Report for FY2016- 2017 submitted in January 2017