

## **Republic of Sudan**

---

### **Butana Integrated Rural Development Project**

### **Supervision report**

### **Main report and appendices**

Mission Dates: 15 October – 3 November 2015  
Document Date: 15-Nov 2015  
Project No. 1332 Loan/DS Grant No. 717  
Report No: 3987-SD



## Contents

Abbreviations and acronyms	iii
A. Introduction	1
B. Overall assessment of project implementation	2
C. Outputs and outcomes	3
D. Project implementation progress	16
E. Fiduciary aspects	18
F. Sustainability	22
G. Impact	23
H. Other- Budget Reallocation	24
I. Conclusion	25

## List of Figures

## List of Tables

## Appendices

Appendix 1:	Summary of project status and ratings	27
Appendix 2:	Updated logical framework (version post MTR): Progress against objectives, outcomes and outputs	31
Appendix 3:	Summary of key actions to be taken within agreed timeframes	37
Appendix 4:	Physical progress measured against AWP&B, including RIMS indicators	45
Appendix 4 B:	Physical progress measured against AWP&B, RIMS (level1, 2, 3) indicators	49
Appendix 5:	Financial: Actual financial performance by financier; by component and disbursements by category	55
Appendix 6:	Compliance with legal covenants: Status of implementation	59
Appendix 7:	Knowledge management: Learning and Innovation	61

## Abbreviations and acronyms

ABS	Agricultural Bank of Sudan
ABSUMI	Agricultural Bank of Sudan Microfinance Initiative
APO	Associate Programme Officer
ASAP	IFAD Adaptation for Smallholder Agriculture Programme
ASARECA	Association for Strengthening Agricultural Research in Eastern and Central Africa
AWPB	Annual Work-Plan and Budget
BCF	Butana Community Federation
BDA	Butana Development Authority
BIRDP	Butana Integrated Rural Development Project
BLMIE	Business and Livestock Market Information Entity
BoD	Board of Directors
CAHWs	Community Animal Health Workers
CBOs	Community Based Organisations
CBS	Central Bank of Sudan / Central Bureau of Statistics
CCI	Community Capability Index
CCU	Central Coordination Unit
CDC	Community Development Centre/Committee; VDC: Village Development Committee
CEAP	Community Environmental Action Plan
CIF	Community Initiative Fund
COSOP	Country Strategic Opportunities Programme
CPM	Country Programme Manager
CPO	Country Programme Officer
DG	Director General
DTs	Development Teams
ECAW	Enhancing Climate Change Adaptation in Agriculture and Water Resources in the Greater Horn of Africa
EUR	Euro
F	Female
FC	Financial Controller
Fe/Male	Female, Male
Fed	Feddan
FMoAF	Federal Ministry of Agriculture and Forestry
FMoLFR	Federal Ministry of Livestock, Fishery and Rangeland
FNC	Forest National Corporation
FS	Financial Statements
GEF	Global Environmental Facility
GoS	Government of Sudan
H/Q	Head Quarter
ha	Hectare
HHs	Households
IA	Institutional Advisor
ICARDA	International Center for Agricultural Research in the Dry Areas
ICB	International Competitive Bidding
ICO	IFAD Country Office
ICSP	Integrated Carbon Sequestration Project
IFAD	International Fund for Agricultural Development
IMP	Integrated Pest Management
INGO	International Non-Governmental Organisation
ISA	International Standards of Auditing
KM	Knowledge Management
LMIS	Livestock Marketing Information System
LMRP	Livestock Marketing and Resilience Programme
LPG	Liquid Petroleum Gas
M	Male
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation

MFIs	Micro Finance Institutions
MFNP	Ministry of Finance and National Planning
MIS	Management Information System
MoAF	Ministry of Agriculture and Forestry
MoIWR	Ministry of Irrigation and Water Resources
MoU	Memorandum of Understanding
MTR	Mid-term Review
NCB	National Competitive Bidding
NGOs	None Governmental Organizations
NR	Natural Resources
NRM	Natural Resource Management
O&M	Operation and Maintenance
ONB	Omdurman National Bank
PA	Policy Advisor
PCU	Project Coordination Unit
PIM	Project Implementation Manual
PIU	Programme Implementation Unit
PO	Procurement Officer
PP	Procurement Planning
PPR	Peste de Petit Ruminants
PVC	Poly Vinyl Chloride
QCBS	Quality Cost-Based Selection
RAP	Rural Access Project
RF	Revolving Fund
RFA	Rural Finance Agent
RFO	Rural Finance Officer
RIMS	Results and Impact Management System
SA	Special Account
SAS	Sayed Abdella Al Sayed Engineering Co
SCGs	Saving and Credit Groups
SCU	State Coordination Unit
SDG	Sudanese Pound
SM	Supervision Mission
SMDC	Sudanese Microfinance Development Company
SMFU	State Microfinance Units
SROI	Social Return On Investment
SWA	State Water Authority
TA	Technical Assistance
TORs	Terms of Reference
ToT	Trainers of Trainers
UNDSS	United Nations Department of Safety and Security
UNICEF	United Nations International Children's Emergency Fund
USD	US Dollar
VAT	Value Added Tax
WA	Withdrawal Application
WSRMP	Western Sudan Resources Management Programme
WUC	Water User Committee
YPP	Young Professional Programme
YPs	Young Professionals
ZOA	Name of Dutch based Relief Organisation

## A. Introduction<sup>1</sup>

1. **Goal.** To improve in a sustainable manner the livelihoods and resilience to drought of the poor rural households.
2. **Specific objectives:**
  - i. Establishing a coherent and cost effective governance framework that ensures a regulated access to land and water resources of the Butana;
  - ii. Improving the access and bargaining position of women and men in the marketing of livestock;
  - iii. Developing the capacity of community-based organizations to engage in environmentally sound, socially and gender equitable development initiatives.
3. **Components<sup>2</sup>:**
  - i. Policy and Institution Building;
  - ii. Natural Resources Management (Water, Range, Forest, Vegetable, Fodder and Agriculture Crops);
  - iii. Livestock and Marketing Development;
  - iv. Community Development, Business Options and Rural Finance<sup>3</sup>.
4. The **Butana Development Agency** (BDA) carries out coordination and backstopping functions to 5 State Coordination Units (SCUs) and their development teams. BIRDIP is being implemented in the area referred to as Butana region which is bounded by River Atbara from the Northeast, River Nile from the Northwest, Blue Nile from the South-West and Gedarif-Kassala Road from the South-East covering a total area estimated at 80,000 km<sup>2</sup>. It falls in nine localities spread over portions of five states; Khartoum, River Nile, Gedarif, Gezira and Kassala. In total there are approximately 700 villages in Butana area of which 140 villages are targeted by BIRDIP. **Direct/indirect beneficiaries:** 40,000 households; **Total cost:** USD 29.8 million; **MTR date:** September, 2012, **Approval date:** 14 December 2006; **Agreement:** 16 Feb-2007; **Effectiveness:** July 2008; Current **project completion** and **closing date:** respectively 30 September 2016 and 31 March 2017.
5. The Government of the Sudan, IFAD, the Federal Ministry of Agriculture and Forestry (FMOAF), Ministry of Finance and National Planning (MoFNP) and Federal Ministry of Livestock, Fisheries and Rangeland (FMOLFR) fielded the seventh supervisory mission (SM) to the Butana Integrated Rural Development Project (BIRDIP) from 15<sup>th</sup> October to 3<sup>rd</sup> November, 2015. The objectives of the supervision mission are: (i) to review both the technical and fiduciary aspects of BIRDIP; (ii) to take stock of the progress made in the implementation of the Project, in particular on aspects and issues highlighted during the latest supervision and follow-up missions; (iii) to provide recommendations on how to improve implementation and address bottlenecks - special focus on BDA structure and roles as well as the NRM governance structure ; (iv) conduct follow-up mission for RAP. In addition, the key issues for proposal of Additional Financing (Oct. 2016 – September 2018) will be addressed during the mission.

---

1 Mission composition: Ms Lucy Maarse, Mission Leader; Mr Omer Egemi, Policy and NRM Consultant; Mr. Swandip Sinha, Microfinance Specialist; Mr Mohamed Abdelatif, Procurement & Implementation Support Specialist; Mr. Aziz Al-Athwary, Financial Management Officer; Ms. Vivi Kurniwan, Disbursement Officer; Ms. Mia Madsen, Associate Programme Officer; Mr. Yonas Mekonen, Associate Programme Officer; Mr Elfadul Ishag, Portfolio Support Officer; Mr. Hani El Sadani, Country Programme Manager; Ms. Fatima Osman Mohamed Ali and Mr. Salah Ankoush Ahmed Rodwan, International Cooperation Directorate, MoFNP; Mr. Hassan Mohammed Ahmed Hamour, deputy coordinator of CCU for IFAD Co-financed Projects; Mr. Mohamed Abdelmotaleb, International Cooperation Directorate and Mr. Hosham Said, Economic security department, FMOAF; Mr Isam Ali Hussein from Federal Ministry of Livestock, Fisheries and Rangeland (FMOLFR).

2 Revision of activities under components and its name slightly revised during MTR.

3 Various RF pilots conducted during reporting period; concerns a new activity line for BIRDIP.

6. The mission met the Locality Commissioner of Sharg Aljazeera, Butana, New Halfa, River Atbara, and Shendi and their Excellences the Minister of Agriculture of River Nile. At Federal level the mission met with the representatives of the MoFNP, FMoAF and FMoLRF; the Director and officers of the Butana Development Agency (BDA); the five State Coordination Units (SCUs) and their development teams (DTs). The mission managed to devote two days<sup>4</sup> for each State. Apart from visiting<sup>5</sup> communities (9), each SCU organised an open dialogue session with community representatives. A wrap-up meeting took place at BDA level, Rufaa, and at federal level, Khartoum, on respectively 2nd and 3rd November, 2015. The latter was chaired by Mr. Mekki Mohamed Abdelrahim, Director General, International Cooperation Directorate, MoFNP with participation of representatives from FMoFNP, FMoAF, FMoLRF, BDA and CCU.

7. The mission would like to express its appreciation for the close cooperation and hospitality extended by the BDA and SCU staff and by all Government counterparts met in BIRDP project area and in Khartoum. The communities visited deserve a compliment for receiving and interacting with the mission albeit facing severe drought.

## B. Overall assessment of project implementation

8. The overall assessment of the project implementation is moderately satisfactory (4). The participatory process of developing the Framework for the Governance of the Natural Resources has finally taking off in full swing due to the hiring of a professional consultant working hand in hand with the NRM specialist, the DTs and Communities. It has triggered the fostering of community engagement in NR governance through respecting and recognising their right and indigenous knowledge, and their experiences made in protecting range and forest land and managing water supply facilities. The mission is pleased to notice that scaling up has taken off. The project has undertaken wide range of community related activities that reflect positively on the livelihoods of the people whereby they have become interested in accessing the market and progressing towards being business oriented. In addition, more and more villages and hamlets in the vicinity of the targeted ones are getting involved in project activities. This is partially due to geographical proximity of these communities; thus leading to raising interest in receiving project services but also as a result of being much better equipped to address these due to the investments in the network of local extension agents as well as the full-time presence of Young Professionals (YPs) at community level for a longer period of time. Procurement at community level which took off slowly (2 years ago) has turned into a catalysing factor; through increasing ownership of undertakings and prominent participation of women who can't enter the nearby livestock market but travel to the small cities to negotiate prices of goods to be purchased. A range of micro finance activities (Saving and Credit groups, access to ABSUMI credits and other micro finance lending institutions) took off during the reporting period, the demands are high and the initial results are positive.

9. The establishment of the Butana Development Authority has been hampered for various reasons. However, this problem received due attention by the prompt action of DG of International Cooperation (MoFNP) namely establishing a committee with key representatives of MoFNP, FMoAF and Senior Coordinator of CCU and ToRs focusing on addressing the causes of non-action since the inception. Meanwhile, the high turn-over of staff at SCU level remains a concern, while the limited or no technical cadres at Locality level forms a hindrance in achieving institutional sustainability.

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date
In line with the Government structure, technical teams at locality levels should be deployed	Locality Commissioner and respective State Ministries	Asap
It is important to provide first priority to the establishment of the BDA	BDA, BoD, MoFNP BDA, SCUs, other stakeholders	Immediately
A comprehensive exit strategy should be developed		March 2016

<sup>4</sup> At two junctions, part of the SM team followed for one day a different programme; namely meeting the chairperson of the BDA Board of Directors, and visiting communities which have started saving and credit activities.

<sup>5</sup> After a general introduction by the community development committees (CDCs), groups were formed so as to obtain more in-depth insights in their activities and achievements. As Butana has received this year no or only patchy rainfall, drought was all around and thus little to observe regarding the work related to Natural Resources (range, forest, agricultural and fodder crops, vegetables), but water supply facilities (hafirs, water yards), household level fodder stores, poultry shelters, rehabilitated market and community development centres (small exhibition including cart with achievements, work plans, etc.) could be visited.



## C. Outputs and outcomes

10. **Component 1: Policy and Institution Building Outcome:** An enabling governance framework is developed for natural resources management in Butana. The mission assessed this component as **moderately satisfactory (4)**.

11. **1.1 Legislation of NRM.** The Butana constitutes a distinct social and ecological space that is significantly different from the surrounding areas. Specific natural resource-related issues for the rural communities of the Butana include water scarcity for both humans and livestock; scarcity of fodder for livestock; lack of clarity around access rights, responsibility, and management and maintenance of resources; and the progressive encroachment on (communal) land through village agriculture, artisanal gold mining, agribusiness investments and seasonal pastoralists. For 2015 the mission observes conceptual clarity over the what need to be done on the legislative side to achieve an enabling governance framework of natural resources in the Butana. Led by an experienced policy advisor, a firm and bottom up process of consulting a range of actors on natural resources governance constraints has taken off. The focus is on issues pertaining to water, forests, livestock, rangelands, and small scale rain-fed farming. This process is currently under implementation and rounds with communities and Localities have been finalised, while State and Inter-State level consultations are planned for the last quarter 2015. While being resources intensive, it has provided space for a wide spectrum of communities and communities' networks to be represented, allowing key developmental issues and concerns to be tabled. The process was aided by review and identification of gaps in existing laws and by-laws and the local NRM regulations established by some communities at the local level. The proposed states and inter-states workshops for scaling up discussions on these issues, including harmonization of policies and legislations, are to be commended. However, the possibilities for scaling up the process to the highest level of governance, the federal level, is to be explored and supported as essential step towards the realization of the envisaged framework.

12. **1.2 Policy and strategy.** This dense process, eighteen Community Conferences have been held (including 12 in 2015), and attended by representatives of 139 communities, forms part and parcel of a strategy to accumulate evidences and legislative/policy materials for higher level consultations with localities (*Mahaliyyat*), states (*Wulaiyat*) and Inter-States workshop, scheduled to take place before the end of 2015. The mission recognises the methodology as being strategic with clear, coherent and successive outcomes building on one another, aimed at reviewing legislations and formulating local decrees for more effective enforcement mechanisms and greater coordination around issues of common interests. Ultimately, this inclusive process of embedding the anticipated overall governance framework on locally grounded issues constitute a solid starting point and provide updated evidences for setting the forthcoming BDA agenda on NRM.

13. In recognition to the growing knowledge base accumulated pertaining to NR governance in Butana, the mission share the view that BIRDP could capitalise not only on the content of this NR conferences but exploit, through more targeted documentation<sup>6</sup>, and action-oriented studies<sup>7</sup> the dense and rich process. Along the same line, disseminating BDA conferences resolutions and the policy proposals emanating from it could serve the dual purpose of informing on-going state led initiatives (i.e. the state land use maps in Kassala and Gedarf States produced by ACSAD) and creating awareness about the on-going participatory dynamics among decision makers, especially before reaching higher level of governance. Recognizing the importance of federal level to constructively addressing the issue of NRM, project engagement at federal level – potentially in collaboration with other development partners and CBOs is necessary for the realization of the envisaged framework.

14. **Enhancement of pastoralism.** Pastoralists from neighbouring states as well as from within have vested interests in the Butana as their wet season grazing area. This interest has been reinforced by the separation of South Sudan that denied pastoralists from as far as Sinnar State important pastoral resources. Accordingly, engagement of the pastoralists remains critical for the project's sustainability as well as for promoting social peace in the region. Enhancement of pastoralism was recommended by the MTR. Host communities benefiting from the project advocated for inclusion of nomads in the on-going consultation process constituted by BDA conferences. In this perspective, participation of pastoral tribal leaders in the conferences at all levels looks important. The

---

<sup>6</sup> As intermediate outputs.

<sup>7</sup> Proposed studies could include: pastoral land tenure issues; institutional capacity mapping; environmental impacts of gold mining.

process could also be enhanced and strengthened by filling some knowledge capacity gaps, especially in relation to nature of the pastoral system in the Butana and the mapping and understanding of their problems and priority needs.

15. **1.3. Institutional building, 1.3.1 Butana Development Agency.** Since project start-up; IFAD missions had called for strengthening BDA so that it becomes a functioning and sustainable agency that is able to carry out its envisioned tasks beyond being only a PIU/PCU for implementing the BIRDP. The MTR and subsequent missions made intensive analysis and developed several recommendations regarding BDA mandate, structure, and the way forward beyond BIRDP. These missions focused on the role of BDA in improving NRM governance, community and social development, and fund mobilization. The missions have called for recruiting an institutional advisor to support BDA in the task of institutional building. The vast majority of the missions' recommendations remain un-implemented. On a positive note; there is change in the attitude of staff with regard to strengthening BDA building. During the mission meetings; the chairman of the BoD, commissioners, state authorities, and communities, have unanimously declared supporting to the role of BDA. However, this has not materialized yet with concrete actions in the desired direction, thus leaving the objective of a functional and self-sustained BDA unachieved.

16. At mission on-set, the BDA management declared its intent to finally recruit an institutional advisor on consultancy basis. Some mission members travelled to Khartoum to meet the Chairman of the BoD<sup>8</sup> (27 October 2015). The meeting focused on discussing a draft road map for strengthening the BDA and attempted to reach an agreement regarding how the BDA would become a functioning body. The meeting was attended by Mr. Ahmed Abu Sin, whom the BDA intends to recruit as an institutional advisor. During the meeting, the road map was discussed and agreed upon. The mission has stressed the need to expedite the efforts for institutional strengthening of the BDA.

17. In line with recommendations of the MTR, the nominated institutional advisor has asked that two technical staff be recruited to help in performing his tasks including a fund raising officer. Annex 1 lists the full details of the proposed roadmap. The key elements of the discussed map: the vision for BDA will need to be finalized and approved by the BoD and key stakeholders. The focus of the vision rests on a BDA as catalyst for Butana development, contributing to sustainable and improved NRM through advocacy and coordination of action and legislation at all levels. BDA would mobilize funding to support sustainable rural development, services provision to rural population, and NRM with the ultimate goal of turning into an income generating sustainable institution. In line with the decree establishing BDA, it is expected to be a mediator for the development of Butana and is not meant to take over the role of any existing organization. BDA needs to investigate how community membership can be included in its structure. The BDA stakeholders are the communities, different Governments, private sector participants and other development partners.

18. The strategy for BDA to achieve this vision is: **(i)** Development of an enabling environment for sustainable NRM; **(ii)** Organisation, promotion and investment in sustainable NR based business opportunities; and **(iii)** Enabling sustainable access to finance for poor communities in the Butana region that can enable their integration in BDA supported/invested businesses. An **action plan** for implementing BDA strategy (focusing on BDA strengthening) will be supported through developing a business plan that will include three interlinked lines of action; namely **(a)** Natural resources conservation and development arm which aims at development of enabling NR framework with key stakeholders including the communities and private sector engaged in NR activities in the region; **(b)** Business promotion and investment arm will focus on identifying and developing NR supported business opportunities that can generate high returns (and benefits) across a large number of communities; and **(c)** Financial services arm will support activities such as organising communities, developing their partnership with upstream value chain links and delivering capacity building inputs to enhance business preparedness. The BDA with support of the institutional advisor will need to develop bylaws, institutional structure and job descriptions. The institution building activities are described in full in Annex 1.

19. The MoFNP will need to secure budgetary support for BDA in 2016 from the Federal Government. This will be a limited amount to cover basic costs, however BDA is intended to be mainly income generating / self-financing. The BDA should take some actions towards **testing the implementation of selected business options and financial services**. Details are included in Annex 1, which lists the roadmap.

---

<sup>8</sup> A note was distributed and was discussed by the participants as an action plan for the strengthening of the BDA.

20. As discussed in 2014 mission aide memoire, it is proposed that the BoD membership to be re-visited to include representatives of commissioners and the community and possibly some personalities who could bring value to the BDA operations; e.g. private sector, federal government, Governors, etc. However, community representation<sup>9</sup> should happen one way or another as it will serve as the vehicle for enabling community ownership and participation in the BDA and will also facilitate the investment arms of the BDA.

21. The mission was informed that the MoFNP has formed a committee to look into the BDA legal structure and existing impediments that prevent its effective functioning or provision of financing from MoFNP. The committee is chaired by the Director General for International Cooperation, MoFNP with membership from ministries and agencies that are concerned with the BDA. Some key members of the committee; including the chair, travelled to Rufa'a to meet the mission on 31 October 2015. The committee has indicated that part of their terms of reference is to look into the overall status of the BDA, and make any necessary recommendations for adjustment. The committee chairman re-iterated commitment to the BDA. The outcome of the committee findings and subsequent actions by the higher authorities could have impact on some of the elements of the road map as discussed with the BDA.

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date
In recognition of the enormous volume of work with regard to development of a Framework for Governance of NR, to be completed in 2016, it is recommended that the Policy and Strategy Advisor is to be helped by 2 temporary assistants, a support person and a planning and coordination assistant.	BDA, Policy Advisor	Immediately
Complete the recruitment process of the institutional advisor and supporting technical team	BDA	10 November 2015
Recommendations of the committee are made available to the BDA and institutional advisor and action taking accordingly.	MoFNP	15 November 2015
Finalization of documents that lists BDA vision and strategic framework	BDA Director; Institutional Advisor, Policy Advisor; BoD	November 2015
Development of five years business plan	BDA Director; Institutional Advisor, Policy Advisor; BoD to approve	December 2015
Revisit BoD membership and BDA structure to include the local government, the communities, others	BDA Director; Institutional Advisor, Policy Advisor; BoD; MoFNP	June 2016
Develop bylaws, organizational structure and job descriptions for key posts	BDA Director; Institutional Advisor; BoD	January 2016
Re-look at BIRD versus organizational structure of BDA	BDA Director; Institutional development advisor	February 2016
Raise awareness of key stakeholders with BDA through holding consultations	BDA Director; Institutional development advisor	
Launch of pilot activities to test implementation of business options and financial services:		
(i) Establishment of apex MF institution in RN State	BDA Director; Institutional advisor; business consultants	June 2016
(ii) Identification and implementation of 1-3 pilot businesses		June 2016 Sep 2016
(iii) Development and registration of business arm		
Organize National launch of reformed BDA, signing of MoUs between BDA and all states involved	MoFNP/CCU/BDA Director	Immediately/ continuous

9 Some of the possible approaches for representation of communities in the BDA would be: (i) organizing the communities in the Butana region into a regional apex organisation called the Butana Community Federation (BCF) or opting for a more flexible structure namely building upon their networks; (ii) building on the current Butana conferences formed through policy work. The selected approach should take into consideration the legal status of the BDA and how best it fits.

22. **1.3.2 CBOs.** One of the objectives of the BIRDP is to develop the capacity of community-based organizations to engage in environmentally sound, socially and gender equitable initiatives in the Butana region. Empowered, functional and organised community organizations are central to the implementation of the BIRDP project as well as to the establishment of a framework for NRM in the Butana region. Since the project started a large number of community-based structures have been created around the management of natural resources. The most important of these are Community Development Committees, CDCs, which are now established in all of the 140 targeted project communities. Throughout the project implementation period, progressive and appreciated efforts have been made in the legalization and registration of CDCs.<sup>10</sup> During 2015 the project target was to legalize 35 CDCs, the result achieved was a total of 19 registered CDCs<sup>11</sup>. The project acknowledges that more progress is needed in legalizing more CDCs, as the legalization of CBOs helps to ensure the sustainability of the implemented development interventions. Also, the law requires that CDCs are registered in order for them to be able to register community forests or range reserves.

23. In addition to the 140 established CDCs, communities have established 223 new NRM groups<sup>12</sup>, during 2015 (target for this year was 250). The overall cumulative figure for interest groups over the period 2009-2015 is 906, a positive development as the communities have managed to establish more interest groups than targeted in the MTR. The number of beneficiaries belonging to different interest groups is now 15,986, with 56% of the members being women. Communities have also established local extension networks with community agents providing services to the communities (IPM-trainers, literacy teachers, persons responsible for range and forest, nutrition trainers and Community Animal Health Workers, etc.)<sup>13</sup>.

24. The supervision mission is pleased to learn that communities have established networks on different kinds of levels. The community-based structures consist primarily of CDCs, local extension networks and interest groups, but now more advanced CDCs and local extension teams have initiated links to other strong CDCs and networks. Some of the established CDCs are for example linking up with each other to buy vaccines for animals as a result of difficulties to buy smaller quantities of vaccines, while local extension workers are linking up with local extensions workers in other communities. Another example is the establishment of broad community networks in the areas of management of forest resources and rangeland. The strengthened links between networks and community based structures are contributing to a stronger community development in the Butana region and all the new stakeholders are likely to play an important role in the management of NR in the region. The supervision mission is pleased to see that despite the non-existence of a formal framework from NRM in the Butana region, communities are coming together to find ways of governing their natural resources. The BDAs Peoples Conferences is an example of a forum which ensure that the voices of the communities are also taken into account. During consultations with communities and DTs the disconnect between the CDCs, interest groups, local extension agents and higher institutions was stressed. The mission supports the communities request for further support in order to strengthen the linkage to higher institutions responsible for providing services; i.e. locality technical cadres. For example, CAHWs need to be linked to professional cadres of veterinaries so that they can be monitored and receive support in their work. The communities also stressed the need for a stronger link between communities and the BDA<sup>14</sup>.

25. **1.4. Knowledge Management.** Since the MTR more focus has been put on knowledge management. In 2014 the project created its own website ([www.butanaonline.org](http://www.butanaonline.org)) where reports, studies, case studies, training programmes and news stories on project activities are published. So far the site has had around 44,467 visitors<sup>15</sup>. In 2015, the project has participated in a number of knowledge management and sharing events such as a Knowledge Share Fair, an Agricultural Fair and a Flower exhibition. There have also been 18 NRM forums at community and locality level, 3 exchange visit for the DTs and SCUs, 6 community exchange visits, 3 exchange village days with communities, the project has participated in a number of radio and TV sessions and staff members

---

10 By the end of October 2015, a total of 116 of 140 CDCs have been legally registered.

11 The legalization of CDCs has been slow particularly in Khartoum state and Gezira state, mostly due to complicated registration processes and the long distances community members have to travel in order to register their organizations.

12 Annex 2, Working Paper 'Natural Resources' covers the different new NR related interest groups; i.e. as per reporting period.

13 Many of these local extension workers have started to demand money for their services and are also sometimes offering services to nearby communities.

14 During consultations with communities the team noted that many communities still do not have a clear understanding of the role and responsibilities of the BDA.

15 The average number of visitors of the website lies between 800-900 per month.

have attended learning routes abroad (for detailed list of KM activities see Appendix 7). The project has also developed and produced leaflets, brochures and knowledge plates. The DTs have received training in media production, knowledge support and communication skills. As a result, several innovative short films on different thematic areas have been produced. The supervision mission team is pleased to see this development and to hear that the videos have been used in the efforts of scaling up activities to neighbouring communities. Later this year the project is planning to send DT staff to a GALS training in Uganda to learn more about how to achieve gender equality also on household levels. The project has developed a BIRDP strategy for KM, collection and documentation of knowledge and success stories. The mission acknowledges the DTs own comment that more focus should be put on learning how to tailor KM-products to specific audiences.

26. **1.5 Capacity building of Development Teams (DTs) and Technical Assistance.** The capacities of SCUs staff have improved over the course of the years. However, there is still more need for focusing on certain capacity gaps, especially in relation to analysis, targeting and cross learning. The high turn-over of staff remains a major problem facing BIRDP. Besides impacting the overall performance of the project, this problem has also affected the capacity building programme<sup>16</sup>.

27. **1.6 Studies, pilots, Research.** Progress in this area needs to be accelerated, especially in relation to: (a) the proposed studies on natural resource management where only 31.3% of the MTR target has been achieved; (b) Studies and trainings in support of Carbon sequestration Project that needs to be implemented by BIRDP; and (c) documentation of learning processes and pilots by the project where 25% of the MTR target has been achieved till October 2015. However, good progress has taken place in the production of extension material and handbooks (70%).

28. **1.7. Young Professional Program.** Since rolling out the program after the MTR in 2013, BIRDP has contracted 75 young graduates. Presently, albeit temporarily attached to the project, they number 44. Outcomes of the Young Professional Program (YPP) were anticipated to be mutually beneficial - 'win-win' - serving both the project and graduates' future employability. In this perspective, the YPP has proved to be successful by allowing 19 participants to find employment after the completion of the structured traineeship. The most commonly cited benefits for SCUs include improving and sustaining the project's outreach and field presence over longer period of time. More specifically, Young professionals (YPs) have been instrumental in mobilising communities, building trust, raising awareness on gender inclusion and increasing women participation, supporting project staff in refining and intensifying formation of Saving and Credit Groups (SCGs), and contributing to monitoring by undertaking simple cost benefit analysis of communal farms, ultimately serving as agents of change embedded in targeted communities. The mission observes how the YP program had helped some of the graduates in gaining field experience that complements graduate studies curriculum that sometimes lack field related programs and experiences. Keeping in mind the two objective of the program, the mission recommends the YPP to continue operating<sup>17</sup>.

29. **Component 2: Natural Resources Management** (Water, Range, Forest, Vegetables, Fodder and Agriculture crops); this component was assessed as **Satisfactory (5)** and consisted of 3 subcomponents namely **2.1** Water infrastructures, **2.2** Water harvesting and **2.3** (Rural Access)/Wadi crossings. The drought of 2015 impacted negatively this component.

30. **2.1 Water infrastructure** (hafirs, water yards and hand pumps for people and animals), assessed as **(4) moderately satisfactory**. Shortage of water supplies for humans and animals is one of the main causes of rural poverty in Butana. Following the MTR recommendations focus on water supply continues to get due attention from BIRDP. Interventions in 2015 involved the rehabilitation and construction of 16 hafirs, rehabilitation and construction of 8 water yards and installation of 3 hand pumps. Of total communities (120) who identified water supply as their first developmental priority the interest of 86 communities (71.7%) have been either fully addressed (61 communities) or partially addressed (25 communities) benefiting total of H/Hs (56.7% of the 25,434 H/Hs targeted by BIRDP). The remaining 38 communities still in need of water and look for further intervention. However,

---

16 During the reporting period, capacity building training programme covered 1, Enhancing DTs capacities in uses of maps, remote sensing and GIS; 2, Practical training of DTs on designing and production of extension materials and handbooks; 3, Capacity building of young professionals' in development management, community mobilization ,management and follow-up activities at the community level; 4, DTs training on management and budgets preparation in Jordon; 5, DTs training on formation and management of women saving & lending groups; 6, Training on procurement and contracts process; 7, DTs on-job refreshment training on outcome and output indicators and cost valuation; 8, DTs on-job training in cost-benefit analysis (using project data); 9, DTs training on Social Return on Investment (SROI), planned for November 2015; 10, DTs training in conflict management and peace building, November 2015; 12, DTs training in GALS, planned for December 2015.

17 See also the case study prepared by the mission in Appendix 7, Knowledge management: Learning and Innovation.

addressing the concerns of these communities, especially in Khartoum, Gezira and Gedarif States is constrained by one or a combination of factors including unfavourable geology, poor quality of water and but to a lesser extent, inability of the communities to provide their contribution. In spite of the appreciated interventions of the Project in water supply and the enormous social, economic and environmental impacts achieved, water supply remains a serious issue in the Butana, especially during periods of droughts typified by the present situation in 2015, to be addressed. Project interventions indicate that there are other national (State governments of Kassala, River Nile and Khartoum; Zakat Chamber) and international (UNICEF, CDF, China, etc.) actors<sup>18</sup> engaged in water supply provision, partially through coordination at SCU level. Mapping, cooperating and coordinating with those actors are anticipated to bring an added value to the Project and the communities of Butana. Such cooperation that should involve BDA could also be extended to develop a master plan for water supply in Butana recognizing the fact that water supply, if not scientifically planned, could also be a vehicle for the destruction of the already deteriorating ecosystem of Butana. The absence of Water Corporation and localities together with the lack of clear water policy and competition over water by the gold mining sector are identified<sup>19</sup> as serious problems and threats to the sustainability of water supply interventions. This is a critical issue that needs to be brought to the forefront discussion at higher levels of government. A relevant entry point would possibly be the proposed State and inter-State workshops.

31. **2.2 Water Harvesting** (for forage, forests, fodder, vegetables and crops), assessed as **(5) satisfactory**. The year 2015 is described as the driest year in Butana since 1990. This has severely impacted all interventions under this sub-component, especially agriculture (virtually none existing) and fodder production. However, the drought has importantly demonstrated the viability and enormous potentialities of the **water harvesting measures** to enhance community adaptability and resilience in such a dry place. In spite of drought severity, targeted people are still getting grains whether from previous year storages or purchases from local markets. Although fodder gap is apparent, some groups, exemplified by women in Subagh and Jad Alla and Surroj Manana villages, still managed to collect and store hay from individual and community range enclosures established over the past years. The established individual range reserves, over a total area of 16026 feddans, including 3776 feddans (32.6%) in 2015, provided reasonable amount of fodder and seeds as in Jad Alla village in Gedarif state. Range reseeding continued in 2015 using 11,948 kilograms of natural plants seeds, 60% of the amount was collected locally. Guar cultivation which flourished and sped up over the previous years was made impossible by the drought in 2015. Realizing the critical fodder gap associated with the drought, the Project undertook some measures to minimize the risk. These measures included: agreement with the administration of irrigated schemes to include cultivation of fodder crops in the agricultural rotation which has already started in New Halfa Scheme; support to guar cultivation in Jubrakas; promotion of supplementary feeding; support to fodder storage; and fostering partnership with the INGO ZOA which is interested in promoting and supporting activities to enhance resilience to drought in Subagh area of Gedarif State. Linking livestock groups in targeted villages with micro finance initiatives (ABSUMI) is a proposed agenda. The Project approach focusing on individual range reserves is to be commended owing to the high results yielded including high levels of adoption particularly in guar cultivation.

32. **Irrigated agriculture**, founded on flood, matara irrigation and jubraka using different types and devices of irrigation, was the focus of agricultural activities in 2015. The activities concentrated principally in River Nile State where a total of 458 households including 80 F/H/Hs and 378 M/H/Hs in 2015 alone are engaged. Total number benefited from irrigated agriculture in the State since 2009 is 1508 H/Hs out of whom 513 are F/H/Hs and 995 are M/H/Hs reflecting the growing attention given to women. The jubraka in particular has been greatly commended by women as a source of food, income and improved nutrition. The 50 mataras established in 2015 were founded on revolving fund modality of implementation. Outside the River Nile the intervention remains limited to small restricted areas in Kassala and Gezira States. Supplementary irrigation, however, was used in 17 women farms in Gedarif that were established under rain-fed cultivation.

33. **Forest development**. Although continued in 2015, it was seriously impacted by drought. River Nile was the main State where seedlings production took place. Of the total 8998 seedlings produced by households and community nurseries 7159 (79.7%) were produced in River Nile State reflecting enormous geographical variations among the Butana five States. The total number of trees grown in 18 villages has increased from 245 trees before BIRDIP interventions to 4,512 trees in 2015, indicating

18 20 communities in the targeted villages have been served by those actors.

19 These are problems identified by community representatives in BDA conferences at community and locality levels

high adoption rate and community interests in tree planting, particularly in River Nile State where comparatively high levels of awareness and availability of irrigation are important contributing factors. Besides its environmental impact the intervention reflects economic viability as the number of seedling sold (2119) from home nurseries, essentially women business, generated a reasonable amount of money (SDG 10,079) in 2015 which means a lot for the poor households involved. The intervention also reflects enormous potential for scaling up and sustainability. In addition, tree seed broadcasting was undertaken covering 9,338 feddan most of it (87.9%) in Kassala (48.8%) and Gedarif (39.1%) states. In 2015 new community forest reserves were established in River Nile State only, over 2144 feddans accounting to 3.5% of the area established during 2009-2014 period. However, the registration of community forests remains an important issue to be facilitated by the project having the fact that the rights of communities to registered legalized forests is clearly stipulated in the FNC 2002 law. During the year green education programme continued in Gezira, in collaboration with education authorities, where 42 teachers (31 females + 11 males) were trained on tree planting with the objective of improving environmental conditions in schools and the surroundings. Although sand dune formation and desert creep on agricultural land and villages is a serious problem, especially in River Nile State, efforts to deal with the problem remain limited in 2015.

34. **Areas of concern.** The activities of the GEF financed Sudan – Integrated Carbon Sequestration Project (ICSP) has started this year. About 500 feddans were cultivated in Gezira and Gedarif states, however outside the BIRDP areas. Coordination between the BIRDP and ICSP remains below expectations with **regard** to selection of areas and coordinating activities. The BIRDP is expected to support large number of studies in support of the ICSP as well as training for communities and provision of equipment and goods. The weak coordination between the two projects, delay of FNC support in terms of financing and staff payments is affecting ICSP progress seriously. The fact that FNC staff in Gedarif state are far from the BIRDP – SCU in Gedarif is an important impediment. The physical remoteness of the two PCUs is another impediment. Both projects are urged to improve coordination.

35. Over the past years some communities, capitalizing on **indigenous practices and traditional regulatory mechanisms**, managed to draft local laws and regulations to manage and conserve their forests. The Project also managed to train and obtain licenses for 82 voluntary forest guards serving 55 communities. Networking among neighbouring guards has also been initiated and established. However, the guards remain disconnected from higher levels of governance; i.e. Locality and FNC offices, a situation that compromises the sustainability of the intervention. Community training on natural resource issues continued in 2015 where a total of 886 individuals, the majority of whom (82.2%) were women, were trained on water harvesting, nursery establishment, compost making and application, vegetable production, and integrated pest management IPM. Recognizing the enormous and competitive uses of natural resources in Butana the establishment of articulated village Environmental Actions Plans and simple locality land use plans based on community indigenous knowledge are possibly important inputs for the development and realization of the enabling governance framework for natural resources management in Butana.

36. **2.3 Rural Access and Wadi Crossings.** Overall, the performance of the sub-component is considered **moderately satisfactory (4)**. The design of BIRDP has considered marketing and access to markets to be a key pillar towards successful achievement of project objectives. The fact that Butana is quite remote and beneficiaries suffer from access to markets all through and particularly during the rainy season has influenced the project concept and design. Accordingly; BIRDP design has a sub-component to improve physical access to markets especially in the rainy season. The project has financed the capital costs of the construction of the crossings, however during implementation it was found that the scope under BIRDP for the construction of rural access works is deemed insufficient to significantly raise producer's access to markets. Given the isolation of the central Butana area during the rainy season, it was deemed necessary to complement the activities under the sub-component with the construction of a rural feeder road linking the Central Butana area to the main livestock markets. As IFAD did not have an additional financing instrument at that time, a new project "Rural Access Project (RAP)" was launched to cover the gap under the original allocation for the wadi crossing sub-component in BIRDP. In general; the development objective of RAP is a sub-set of that for BIRDP.



37. The RAP invests in rural roads in a way that complements the transport, production and marketing infrastructure supported in the BIRDP. **Butana Ten Crossings Contract:** The contract agreement was signed on 28 September 2014 with HEWA Water Drilling. The duration of the contract is 6 months as well. The total value of the contract, excluding VAT, is SDG 12,025,485 (revised value excluding VAT, is SDG 14,508,882). The work accomplished up to the end of September 2015 is estimated at 49 % of the total revised contract value, while the original contractual completion date is 15 July 2015. Based on the assessment of the mission, the contract can be accomplished by end of March 2016 in harmony with other project components and before the rainy season.

38. **Status of contracts under RAP.** currently there are eight on-going contracts under RAP project (with total estimated cost excluding VAT, is SDG 40,591,933) including five new contracts that were signed after the last supervision mission of RAP in July 2015 to overcome the poor performance of the contractor of the main contract (Alsoubagh to Sitta Arab road). The RAP supervision mission recommended that all urgent works that allow full usage of the road must be completed before the RAP completion date. These urgent works include (i) completion of all crossings works (concrete structures, approaches, pitching); (ii) processing of materials on the road centreline that will make the road accessible. The other two contracts Alsoubagh – Husheib Stretch Seven Crossings and Khor Geegy Crossings are currently under implementation by the same contractor Sayed Abdella Al Sayed Engineering Co (SAS). Despite the delay in the implementation of the two contracts, it is expected that the contracts to be fully completed by end of December 2015 based on the performance of the contractor during the latest period and its technical capacity.

39. **Financing Gap.** As a result of the escalation of prices, the change of the design approach from Engineered Natural Surface to raised embankments and the increased scope and time of the consultancy contract, the available funding from IFAD for the RAP will not be sufficient to cover all the requirements; mainly construction of all urgent works that allow full usage of the road. The current financing gap after extension of the consultancy contract would amount to USD 1.70 million (subject to change). Due to the time constraints, while the possibility that the Government could cover the existing financing gap is very limited, *the mission and the BDA has agreed to finalize the elements of Alsoubagh – Sitta Arab contract that are essential to the functionality of the road; thus achieving most of the project development objectives through utilizing some of the available fund from the BIRDP. These funds will be provided from savings under some of the expenditure categories; see for details the proposed reallocation of funds, Section 'H. Error: Reference source not found', page Error: Reference source not found.* The remaining works (beyond the urgent ones) could be covered either through government financing or in part through the additional financing for the BIRDP, if it materializes.

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date
Take the proper actions to secure fund to cover the financing gap of RAP contracts	BDA	Immediately

40. **Component 3: Livestock development and marketing services.** this component was assessed as '**Moderately satisfactory**' (4) and consisted of five sub-components namely **3.1** Business and Livestock Markets Information Entities (BLMIE), **3.2** Animal feeding innovations and initiatives, **3.3** Comprehensive extension and vaccination campaigns, **3.4** Animal husbandry and management (large and small stock including indigenous poultry), **3.5** Enhancement of Pastoralism. Albeit assessed moderately satisfactory, up-take of feeding strategies, focusing on local breeds, and involvement of female goat and poultry keepers<sup>20</sup> is impressive; first micro finance loans are typically taken up for these activities.

41. **3.1. Business and Livestock market information entities (BLMIE).** the intended set-up of the markets namely provision of services including market information has only been partially materialised; - training of local cadres on market information system was planned in two States for 2015, but is pending; - follow-up and monitoring of the results of training on market information systems not planned; - collection and dissemination of market information planned for all five States

20 Referring to an improved scavenging poultry production model, based on locally available feed resources (scavenging and some supplementary feeding) and materials (night shelter), with a Newcastle Disease vaccination; in a targeted community near Abu Dlig, a lady had taken a loan of 1,500 SDG from the CIF to build a night shelter keeping around 15 local hens, proudly explained that she had almost repaid the loan in 6 months through selling around 10 eggs per day for 1.25 SDG each. Even the male members of the family showed appreciation of the ladies' efforts to generate cash through rearing the local hens. Extension teams are surprised themselves of this activity namely it is rather simple and once knows many other women follow. High return on extension efforts.



and conducted in three States (River Nile, Gezira and Kassala); Livestock surveys planned and conducted in Khartoum State and planned but not yet implemented in Gedarf State. Local media (radio) was used in Gezira, River Nile and Kassala State to disseminate animal product prices. Interacting with traders in the Abudlelig market (Khartoum State) clarified that they obtain their price information through mobile phones as far as Saudi Arabia, while also producers use mobiles as the main mean to secure price information. States which no longer planned and conducted the collection of market prices justified it by showing that the information was unrealistic and false. The provision of veterinary service and fodder trade works in those markets which are set-up in less developed areas such as El-damer and El Subagh; the others have such facilities already established in the vicinity. Regarding management of the markets, the picture is mixed; some are operated by contractors, others by the Locality. In all cases the revenues collected have considerably increased<sup>21</sup>, while both traders and producers appreciate the new environment as being more convenient but all are adamant that the new environment does not influence the price for the producers. Experiences made should be analysed so as to feed the new IFAD Livestock Marketing and Resilient Project (LMRP). Follow up on the missing aspect of the livestock markets constructed by the project (shade trees, gates, shades, toilets for men and women) remains pending, while first signs show that Localities are not serious in providing basic maintenance.

42. **3.2 Animal feeding innovations and initiatives.** Overall, the major achievements made during the reporting period concern the **dissemination** as well as wider **adoption** of certain feeding, breeding and animal health practices by **neighbouring villages**; partially through extension campaigns organised by the DTs and followed up by YPs as well as by the Local Extension Agents namely CAHWs and members of Livestock Interest Groups. Contrary to earlier years, all feeding practices discussed and applied at household level were financed by the livestock owners themselves<sup>22</sup>, whereby making use of CIF (taking small loan through CDC) or through joining hands among 2-4 villages aiming at combined purchase of inputs. In one case, it concerned joint purchase of large number of vaccines against the endemic Botulism. The scaling-up of feeding strategies happens due to demands of neighbouring villages.

43. During the period various cost – benefit analysis were made regarding concentrates<sup>23</sup> and supplementary feeding<sup>24</sup>. In areas closer to markets and/or irrigated areas the up-take of these feeding practices is good and of a different nature namely purchasing inputs in particular cotton-, sesame – and groundnut cake, berseem (hay or green), and sorghum (Siwa, Abu sabeen). Through concerted efforts, the poor too adopt some. Regarding the more isolated villages in Central Butana, it concerns the up-take of local grown products such as Guar hay, chopped sorghum straw, pigeon pea, ground nut holm (Lubia) and above all hay from protected rangeland plots. These communities make also use of communal as well as individual storage facilities; hand baling of hay, storing chopped sorghum straw, etc. Regarding targets set namely 17,000 persons accessing livestock extension services, the cumulative percentage is 102%, but the monitoring efforts cover only the targeted villages while the outreach is actually much higher as neighbouring villages are more and more covered. The Butana people's system for managing the balance between herding and cultivating, has this year been seriously disrupted by no or patchy rainfall, and thus nothing to cultivate, and this reminds the DTs of the importance to focus on securing year around feeding practices including covering years with no rainfall. In this regard, the subsequent recommendations of AM 2013 and 2014 respectively, remain valid namely 'Make an inventory of fodder, feed and grazing availability during the year in the various ecological zones and formulate measures to alleviate constraints', and this can best be done with the communities using appropriate extension approaches<sup>25</sup>.

44. **3.3 Comprehensive extension and vaccination campaigns.** Harmonising the preventive and curative animal health among the five States for servicing the Butana livestock keeping communities remains a kind of dream notwithstanding that the animals (cattle, sheep and goats) in Butana suffer from many diseases of which Botulism is endemic. In the earlier days Butana was known for being

---

21 El Rattaga market from 30000 SDG in 2010 to 320000 in 2014; El Subagh from 68490 SDG in 2010 to 294667 in 2014; Tamboul from 570000 SDG in 2013 to 610000 in 2014; Abugelig 21600 SDG in 2010 to 42200 in 2014; El-damer from 316612 SDG in 2013 to 529200 in 2014; Shandi from 120000 SDG to 120000 in 2014. Source: Locality market data.

22 Including the neighbouring villages, which in project terms are also called satellite villages.

23 On demo basis: Concentrate 'barley sprouts, Aristida, urea', 30 days, lactating goats raising a profit of 340 SDG / she-goat. As practiced at Household level: concentrate 'sorghum grains, groundnut cake, salt blocks, chopped sorghum straw', 30 days, 444 SDG profit per lactating cow

24 As per practice adopted by women: i.) Guar feeding to lactating goats: 30 days' period, 333 SDG profit / she-goat; ii.) Hay (from protected rangeland plots) feeding of lactating goats: 30 days' period, 115 SDG profit / she-goat.

25 It is about mapping exercises regarding annual animal feed, fodder and grazing calendar inventory activities with all users of the NR including nomadic groups and search for solutions.

disease free but the uncontrolled influx of animals, spread of dead animals along canals and so on, made that Anthrax, PPR, Black Quarter, FMD, Tick-borne diseases, etc. are common. The SM of 2014 recommended 'Develop a Butana general animal health strategy, based on public private partnership, and agree on this with the various state veterinary departments', but this turns to be beyond the BIRDP's capacity and deserves attention of the higher authorities to succeed. Earlier, all States would agree on training and working with Community Animal Health Workers (CAHWs), but currently one State (Gezira) no longer allows it. Regarding payment for vaccination, currently four States have introduced it but a Locality can still over rule it and insist on free vaccination. BIRDP keeps contributing to vaccination campaigns but to a lesser extent while CAHWs play an important role in co-organising the campaigns whereby also reaching out to nomadic herds<sup>26</sup>. Overall, surveys conducted show that incidence of diseases has decreased in the targeted communities: i.e. decrease in mortality rates from 10 to 3%; field visits confirmed that CAHWs are highly appreciated by the communities; external and internal parasite campaigns are popular; awareness regarding preventing Botulism is high leading among others to rather demanding community actions to remove, burn and bury carcasses. Albeit assuming that market infrastructures would contribute to obtaining a better price for the producers, this is not the case but an animal in good condition fetches a fair price.

45. **3.4 Animal husbandry and management (large and small stock including indigenous poultry).** Albeit the fact that disease prevention and balanced feeding are key factors in arriving at good reproduction, growth and production, DTs remain preoccupied with genetics. The accent however has clearly moved away from cross breeding towards improving the Nubian goat breeds<sup>27</sup> through selection<sup>28</sup>. Goats and cows receive most attention as these often concern small herds kept at Household level allowing grazing/scavenging in vicinity of the village, while the sheep and camels are covering large distances. The latter receive much less attention while the above mentioning feeding strategies are most relevant for lamb fattening, which is a highly profitable business and facilitates the easier sale of animals on the livestock market. Regarding **3.5 Enhancement of Pastoralism**, some efforts have been made to reach out to them while it is now realised that it is of utmost importance to involve mobile communities in the development process of Governing NRs.

46. **Component 4: Community Development, Business Options and Rural Finance.** The outcome of the project intervention is to create empowered and business oriented community-based groups, which is done through training and capacity building of the CBOs. The mission assesses the progress of this component<sup>29</sup> as **satisfactory (5)**. The achievements as per planning for 2015 are presented below.

47. **4.1 CBOs and Management Training.** The CDCs are strengthened as independent stakeholders through training, charging services and sourcing other donors and aid programmes. Since the MTR, the communities have received more in-class and on the job training in management of CBOs and meetings, monitoring of community based interventions, gender sensitization, water harvesting, financial management, procurement procedures, improvement of animal nutrition for birth increase as well as control of internal and external parasites. Regular meetings are one of the most important indicators of the effectiveness of the CDCs. Figures show that the percentage of achievement of planned meetings in the CDCs have increased from 65% in 2014 to 78 % in 2015. This is a result of trainings in meeting management and the involvement of YP to assist and follow up on the meetings. The establishment of procurement committees have also resulted in more frequent meeting patterns. The participatory evaluation tool of Score Cards is used more effectively in

26 Although discussions are taking place with regard to developing a system, in which government veterinary officials, CAHWs and livestock owners interest groups set up their own system for vaccination, it remains a discussion, which BIRDP can't steer to a higher level. The first field example has however been set (CDC network jointly purchasing vaccines against Botulism) and when more follow, it might inspire the decision makers.

27 Concentrating on maximizing the full use of local breeds' genetic potential through better management, care and feeding at crucial moments is of utmost importance and among others ad libitum access to water is key. Starting controlled breeding with selected bucks coming from superior nannies in terms of fertility and milk production and in this way make a gradual genetic improvement of the local breed is relevant when the above mentioned better management is in place.

28 i.) Compile information of phenotype and productivity of Nubian goat breeds; ii.) Develop a description of the Nubian goat breeds' phenotype and productivity; iii.) Identify the communities on which the activity will be implemented; iv.) Choose good Nubian Bucks by the set-forth description; v.) Selection of breeders who own females to which specifications of Nubian goats apply; vi.) Orientation of the chosen communities about the importance of genetic improvement through selection and the high productivity of the Nubian goats; and vii.) Apply the activity with the communities.

29 The component consists of various sub-components namely 4.1 CBOs Organisation and Management Training, 4.2 Social Skill Training, 4.3 Business promotion projects & Community Development projects, 4.4 Training of Trainers Community based extension workers (Development Community-based extension cadre: CBAWs, Water Committee's, range – and other local extension agents).

communities<sup>30</sup>. Gender sensitization is included in all the training delivered to the beneficiaries<sup>31</sup>. The supervision mission is pleased to learn that women inclusion at community level has been successful and that women leadership is increasing<sup>32</sup>.

48. **Classification of the CDCs** by effectiveness show that about 59% of the CDCs rated between excellent, very good and good, while 25% rated middle and 16% rated weak. These numbers indicate a need for further strengthening of the weaker CDCs to ensure sustainability of project interventions in the future. There is a positive development of CDCs effectiveness in 2014 for instance 50% of the CDCs were rated between excellent, good or very good. The mission is pleased to learn that the DTs have already initiated the process of diversifying trainings for CDCs. More mature CDCs are receiving training on business related activities, while weaker CDCs are trained on community organization and mobilization mainly, assisted by the YPs.<sup>33</sup>

49. **4.2 Social Skills Training.** Project interventions in social skills cover mainly adult literacy, First aid and nutrition trainings<sup>34</sup>. So far a total of 1,086 persons had received trainings in social skills in 2015. First Aid trainings have paved the way for the establishment of health facilities near the communities and have also been used as a model for scaling up outside the targeted communities, while the nutrition training has contributed to business oriented thinking among community members. Women have received trainings in home gardening, vegetable production, farm and group management to improve their livelihoods<sup>35</sup>. Communities are organising themselves through the establishment of community development centres. The total number of community development centres up to date is 51. Out of them 42 have been completed and 9 centres are still under construction. The reason for slow construction of the remaining community centres can be attributed to the fact that construction is done during rainy season, and this year the rains have been erratic.

50. **4.3 Business Promotion - Community Development Projects and Micro Finance**<sup>36</sup>. The BIRDP design was formulated when the microfinance sector development initiatives of Central Bank of Sudan were still at infancy and the programmatic approach to rural finance delivery adopted by IFAD Sudan country programme was yet to bear results. Consequently, the rural finance approach in the original BIRDP design was narrow and underdeveloped, confined mainly to the creation of community investment funds (CIF) to meet the livestock restocking needs of target groups.<sup>37</sup>

51. **Community Initiative Fund (CIF).** As at 31 August 2015, BIRDP disbursed SDG 3.7 million to support 198 CIF's which reached 4,387 individual beneficiaries in 84 communities. The average grant size was around SDG 44,000 per community and SDG 844 per beneficiary. Based on MTR recommendations the CIF disbursements by BIRDP were diversified and the cumulative number of CIFs disbursed included livestock restocking (38%), cooking gas units (22%), irrigation units (31%), poultry (4%), donkey driven cart (2%), grain storage (2%), and fodder storage (1%)<sup>38</sup>.

---

30 The Score Cards are used by communities to assess and improve community interventions, and to develop work plans for instance in the areas of water and community range reserve as well as terraces. The number of communities trained in community score cards and that use them as an evaluation tool during 2015 was a total of 7. Since the start of the project a total of 23 CDCs use Score Cards.

31 The overall cumulative number of gender training session from the period 2009 to 2015 is 322. Communities are pleased about awareness raising of gender issues as well as initiatives to strengthen and develop community structures. They say that before the project intervened community members did not join hands to tackle challenges like scarcity of water and lack of fodder for animals. During field visits women speak openly about the change that has taken place and resulted in women now participating in meetings, discussing challenges and taking joint decisions together with the men.

32 For example, in the interest groups the number of women in leadership positions has increased and is now 274. Also in the CDCs women are increasingly taking over leadership roles. The number of women leaders in the CDCs has risen from 62 in 2013 to 104 in 2015. Overall, women participation in the CDCs have steadily increased from 30 % in 2009 to 35.3 % in 2015.

33 Community level trainings were previously conducted at the SCU offices but is now done at community level. Also here, the communities use Score Cards to assess their own weaknesses.

34 Annex 3, represents A working paper on Social Skill Training with data on first aid, nutrition and illiteracy training.

35 The number of women farms has increased from 19 farms in 2013 to 36 farms in 2015. The home gardens are already used in the scaling up of activities.

36 Micro finance concerns a new activity, currently at a piloting stage but planned for the Additional Financing period. Annex 4, Working Paper on Rural Finance, reflects more detailed observations and a range of practical recommendations for those working with this sub-component. It also discusses the potential business options.

37 The CIF involves matching grants, mainly in the form of in-kind assets, from BIRDP to a group of beneficiaries selected by the CDC. The CDC is responsible for monitoring the beneficiaries, collection of asset at the end of business cycle and re-distribution of the assets to a new group.

38 The young professionals deployed at the community level post mid-term supported the adoption of non-livestock activities at the community level. Although the in-kind repayments on re-stocking activities vary widely these CIFs are still active in the communities visited by the mission sometimes in spite of being affected by incidences of high mortality. Cash repayment rate followed for non-livestock activities is moderate at 91%.

52. **ABSUMI.** ABSUMI was successfully piloted by the IFAD supported WSRMP in the Kordofan region as a bank-owned formal microfinance model offering services to IFAD target group. Following a BIRDP and ABSUMI MoU in late 2013 an ABSUMI unit started operations in Abu Dileg Locality (Khartoum State) in November 2014. As of 30 September 2015 the unit disbursed 1,615 loans to women members organized into 103 groups in 17 villages with a portfolio of around SDG 1.5 million and 100% repayment rate. The unit has also mobilised approximately SDG 213,000 in savings. ABSUMI loans have mainly supported livestock related activities (87%), gas stove units (12%), small agricultural inputs and some village level microenterprises. This experience has demonstrated that the ABSUMI model is acceptable at the community level and can deliver sustainable results. The relationship between the BIRDP SCU and the ABSUMI Unit is harmonious and collaborative. A new ABSUMI Unit office financed by BIRDP is under construction and is likely to be completed by the end of the year.

53. The MoU between BIRDP and ABS was developed based on the understanding that the IFAD supported ABSUMI scaling-up project will also be a partner supporting this ABSUMI unit. However, the scaling-up project did not get approval to operate in Abu Dileg which has left a gap in the resource needs of the Unit. The mission recommends that the MoU between ABS and BIRDP for supporting the Abu Dileg Unit should be revised to address any gaps. A new ABSUMI unit is supposed to be established in the Kassala State by the first quarter of 2016 supported by the ABSUMI scaling up project (managed by SDP from Al Obeid). However, BIRDP currently is not involved strongly in discussions related to the launch of this unit. The mission recommends that (i) BIRDP should immediately coordinate with SDP and ABS to finalise and expedite the establishment of the new ABSUMI unit in New Halfa Locality in Kassala State (ii) Any gap in resources for office establishment and furnishing for this unit, caused by the effect of cost escalation on the commitment of partners in the scaling-up project, can be met by BIRDP.

54. **Savings and Credit Groups (SCGs).** Following the success of SCGs in the Kordofan region, BIRDP initiated this intervention on a pilot scale around March-April 2015 with the target of forming 10 SCGs in five villages in the project area. In several cases the community mobilisation for this model was anchored by young professionals present at the community level which boosted acceptability and strong demand and at the end of August 2015, 32 groups with 525 members were formed in 10 communities. Members save at least SDG 20 per month and have mobilised around SDG 43,765 with average savings of SDG 83 per member, SDG 1,368 per community and SDG 4,377 per group within 5-6 months. Some of these groups have started internal lending with loan sizes ranging from SDG 200-400 for 3-5 months at profit margin of 10% per month for the duration of the loan. Internal loans support individual or collective businesses such as retailing clothes and minor trading activities. The experience so far indicates strong acceptability and high potential for replication of this model in the project area. Savings habit is visible and high potential for savings mobilisation has been demonstrated.

55. **Areas of attention.** Some deviations from the recommended methodology was noted such as group size exceeding 20 members and unequal savings by members during meetings. These variations can lead to inequity and conflict in future. Also, rigidity about saving at least SDG 20 per member per month has acted as an entry barrier and households with less savings capacity have stayed out. The young professionals (YPs) need better understanding about the model in order to guide the communities properly. The mission recommends (i) Refresher training on the basics of the SCG methodology specially targeting the YPs, followed by uniformity and standardisation of the SCGs developed so far. Alongside, business training should be provided to the SCGs to enhance their capacity to invest the savings funds productively (ii) the model should be replicated to cover at least 40 communities with at least 4 SCGs per community over the next year (iii) a rural finance manager<sup>39</sup> at the PCU level and rural finance officers (one in each SCU) should be added to expand BIRDP capacity to implement full range of RF interventions (iv) The replication of the SCGs should be done through community level rural finance agents (v) Linkage of stable groups, which good performance over 3 months, to ABSUMI units (where relevant) should be promoted.

56. **Business options.** At the community level potential business activities can be classified into three broad categories according to ownership (i) Individual/household businesses such as small handicrafts, food products and petty trading (ii) collective/group businesses such as grain storage, farming, transportation and trading and (iii) community level commercial and social enterprises such as water yards, health clinics and electricity supply. Over the years the project interventions have also

39 ToR in Annex 4, Working Paper Rural Finance.

developed business opportunities in relatively new areas such as guar fodder, paravets, terracing and cooking gas supply<sup>40</sup>.

57. The mission recommends the following measures as the initial step for developing business practices in the project area **(i)** cascade business training to the communities through the extension teams; **(ii)** develop feasibility studies for potential businesses in collaboration with BDA/ABSUMI/other banks; **(iii)** involve banks as technical advisors (feasibility study, financial management advice) during implementation of demonstrations, enable them to witness profitability of these ventures and encourage them to finance post-demo adoption process; **(iv)** joint identification of set of project promoted businesses for ABSUMI financing and practical guidance by BIRDIP to such clients during implementation; and **(iv)** direct investment and implementation of 2-3 business ideas by BDA. Some potential business ideas are outlined in Annex 4, 'Working Paper on Rural Finance'.

Agreed action <sup>41</sup>	Responsibility	Agreed date
<b>CIF</b>		
- Initiate transformation of CIFs to village level association of SCGs in 20 communities	BIRDIP	Sep 16
- Initiate the formation and capitalisation of community microfinance apex	BIRDIP	Sep 16
- Limit new CIF disbursement to few	BIRDIP	Sep 16
<b>Savings and Credit groups</b>		
- Refresher training on SCGs basics and enterprise promotion for relevant staff and YPs	BIRDIP	Jan 16
- Implement SCGs in at least 40 communities with at least 4 SCGs per community	BIRDIP	Sep 16
- Adopt the Rural Finance Agent model to develop SCGs and train 80 (RFAs)	BIRDIP	Feb 16
- Recruit Rural Finance Manager (1) at PCU level and Rural Finance Officers (5) (on deputation) at SCU level	BIRDIP	Feb 16
<b>ABSUMI</b>		
- MoU between BIRDIP and ABS for Abu Dileg Unit should be updated	BIRDIP/ABS	Dec 16
- Supply three new vehicles to the Abu Dileg Unit according to commitment in MoU	BIRDIP	Feb 16
- Consider ABSUMI expansion through merit based recruitment of YPs	ABSUMI	Continuous
- Expedite the establishment of the ABSUMI unit in Kassala State	BIRDIP/ABS/SDP	Jan 16
<b>Business options</b>		
- Emphasis on enterprise development training at project and community levels	BIRDIP	Continuous
- Involve ABSUMI/Banks as TA providers in demonstrations	BIRDIP	Sep 16

58. **4.4 Training of Trainers Community based extension workers: Community Animal Health Workers.** The intervention of CAHW has been successful at community level. Throughout the programme reduction on the percentage of disease infections has been reported by communities. In 2015 a total of 3,032 HHs received animal health services facilitated by the project. Also, about 20,471 animal disease cases were treated in 2015. Neighbouring communities also benefited from the CAHW. In 2015 a total of 47 out of 66 planned new CAHW were trained. There was no advanced training on CAHW in 2015, because the trained CAHWs were still not eligible to access advanced trainings. Discussions with communities reveal the need for interventions on awareness and storage of medicines for animals. There is a need to link the extensions services provided by the communities to the services provided by the localities in order to secure sustainability for the future. For example,

40 Annex 4, WP 'Rural Finance' also covers a list of businesses noted during the mission and relevant observations made.

41 Note: These main recommendations should be considered in conjunction with the other recommendations in the AM and Annex 4, Working Paper Rural Finance.

the paravets should be properly linked to veterinaries and monitored; i.e. being part of a referral system.

**59. Integrated Pest Management workers.** At the writing of the AM there was no available data on training of Integrated Pest Management Workers in 2015. In 2014 however, SCU staff trained a total of 159 men and 43 women in IPM. **Tree seedling producers.** Consultations with communities reveal that most community member are content about the tree seedling intervention. Women in particular have benefited from establishing tree nurseries as a source of income. In 2015 a total of 93 women and men were trained in tree seedling activities and a total of 9639 seedlings were produced in the project. **Midwives.** The training of community extension workers as midwives continues to be a challenge at community level due to social constraints. Consultations with communities reveal that candidates for trainings are often provided but the women fail to attend the trainings<sup>42</sup>.

## D. Project implementation progress

**60. Project Management.** The mission rates Project Management as **moderately satisfactory (4)**. In the project set-up, the SCUs represent the implementation arm of the lead project agency, the BDA. Strong coordination is thus required at all stages of implementation. As in previous years, substantial difference in performance of the Development Teams (DTs) is observed, among others, due to high turn-over in some States<sup>43</sup>. To a certain degree the recommendation made at MTR (2012) namely *'to allow diversification<sup>44</sup> among the different States as circumstances are varying, performance is diverging, and hardships are not constant'* has been addressed but in a rather limited manner as much remains centralised at BDA level. The below presented recommendation (para 69, page 19) of following a quarterly approach of planning, fund transfer and reporting, would actually translate in reduced transaction costs, lessen implementation delays and increase responsiveness of DTs, but it also requests for discipline in prompt reporting, adhering to planning, monitoring and financial procedures in place. At the DT level, more horizontal experience sharing (among the different teams and among the same discipline) and critical reviewing of the extension approaches, innovations and piloting could be adopted<sup>45,46</sup> whereby also involving the YPs.

**61. Monitoring and Evaluation.** The mission rates M&E as **moderately satisfactory (4)**. The mission notes the progress which has been made to highlight key achievements in a concise manner using the strengths, weaknesses, opportunities and threats approach (SWOT). This development is paving the way toward a more analytically oriented reporting system which can be used by the management as a tool for reflection, action and timely *corrective* measures. The undertaking of several cost benefits analysis on livestock feeding practices demonstrates the attempts to quantify profitability of newly introduced technologies. It would however be advisable to set the analysis longitudinally (look at several seasons in subsequent years) to assess changes over longer period of time; i.e. prices before and after the rainy season fluctuate, the current failed cropping season pushes prices further up. Seeking to capture induced changes beyond targeted villages would highlight early scaling-up opportunities to indirect beneficiaries thus providing crucial information on how adaptation and diffusion of best practices and social change are taking place. On the reporting table<sup>47</sup>, the mission advises more systematic use of the additional comment's columns so as to provide a more nuanced account<sup>48</sup>. Gradually, BIRDP can and should focus on higher level results. In this regard, more information would be required on RIMS level three indicators, especially in characterising the

42 This is due to the fact of the social obstacle for sending women away for long training periods and the negative view of midwifery work. With regards to this challenge, the supervision mission team is pleased to learn that a total of 15 midwives were trained in midwifery skills in 2015 and 3 received training at midwifery schools. Another positive development is that some communities join efforts to pay for fuel transport for the midwives so that all can benefit from the social service. Another result of the midwifery services is that more birth certificates for newly born are secured.

43 For example, high turnover of staff in certain SCUs is a matter of concern; i.e. under the NR component, only two staff have remained since the project started. The root causes of should be understood followed by State specific mitigation measures.

44 Diversity in terms of incentives for Development Teams (criteria to performance and hardship), scope for developing pilots and innovations, transport means and budget, etc.

45 See MTR mission report, page 18-29 'Learning Cycle', 'New Extension Approach' and 'Multi-Stakeholder Processes'. A Two Volumes practical handbooks 'Bank on Hooves' have been left behind for background reading.

46 For instance, all NR staff meeting on topical issues; all animal production staff addressing the issue of 'year around feed and fodder availability', etc.

47 Referring to appendices 2 (Progress against objectives) and 4 (RIMS).

48 This is especially true for physical infrastructure (construction and rehabilitation) where, for example, having a constructed or rehabilitated livestock market does not imply that all the legal arrangement between the contractors and the localities are in place.

evolving asset base of targeted HHs. Social Return on Investment (SROIs)<sup>49</sup> analysis has proved to be effective in expressing soft interventions (mobilisation, extension sessions, etc.) into economic values.

**62. Coherence AWPB and implementation.** The mission rates coherence between AWPB and implementation as **moderately satisfactory (4)**. The BIRDP succeeded in achieving on average more than 90 % of the overall planned activities on time and within the budget allocation. Delays in implementation are often due to circumstances beyond the purview the DTs and occasionally due to delays in fund transfers; i.e. - contractors not working up to the mark, - communities not being ready in terms of management capacity and/or taking more time to submit the co-contribute to interventions. Contributions of Communities, Localities and State contributions are insufficiently reflected in the planning and financial reporting. There are however number of activities with large budget allocations that are lagging behind; e.g. the ten wadi crossings, cars, slaughter house, and ICSP studies. **Gender focus.** The mission rates the project achievement on Gender as **satisfactory (5)**. There have been impressive achievements with regard to women empowerment and the participation of women in project continues to improve. Feedback from the beneficiaries is positive when it comes to the inclusion and participation of women in CBOs including leadership positions by both men and women. The first organised microfinance activities (including saving and credit groups) have given women good opportunities to invest in restocking and small enterprise development. Women have been empowered to take on leadership positions and have increased their participation in procurement committees<sup>50</sup>. Furthermore, women are part of and show ownership of the scaling up process. Women participation in individual range and forest activities is high, but there are however still some challenges with regards to gender sensitization<sup>51</sup>. For example, the women participation in communal range and forestry is still low due to the fact that these activities often take place in more remote areas. Women participation in community networks as water management committees is there but not always effective. The supervision mission is pleased to learn that staff have been trained on gender sensitization and acknowledges the projects plans to participate in a GALS training<sup>52</sup> in Uganda where staff members will receive trainings on how to achieve gender equality on a household level.

**63. Youth Focus.** The mission rates the project achievement on Youth as **moderately satisfactory (4)**. Rural demographics are rapidly changing, mainly caused by seasonal out-migration of males to urban centres, mining sites and herding of sheep. Youth constitutes a minority of the total project beneficiaries (23%), although the mission noted youth participation in CDCs, especially of female youth<sup>53</sup>. However, unlike women, their participation is not captured<sup>54</sup>. On the other hand, the project has successfully rolled out a well-structured traineeship program targeting fresh graduates and whereby Young Professionals (YP) are posted within the SCUs based on a mutually beneficial - 'win-win' – arrangement serving both the project and their future employability. The YP-programme could be further assessed and potentially used as a model on youth engagement in other projects.

**64. Poverty Focus.** The mission rates the project poverty focus as satisfactory (5). The project targets the poorest communities that are determined based on poverty surveys that were carried out

---

49 At least two BIRD staff were trained on SROI.

50 This is a strong indicator of the social change that has taken place, since previously women would not have been allowed to travel to remote areas because of social constraints.

51 The Butana cultural context is still a very challenging one for women engagement, as the cultural norms and traditions constitute a real obstruction for gender mainstreaming, therefore there is a joint understanding between the DTs and the supervision mission that social change has to come gradually.

52 The Gender Action Learning System (GALS) comprises a series of tools that enable household members to negotiate their needs and interests and find innovative, gender-equitable solutions in livelihoods planning and value chain development. The GALS is an innovative community-led methodology that has been developed with IFAD grant support to Oxfam Novib.

53 Cultural norms on gender might partly explain this phenomenon. Indeed, on several occasions, the mission realised, based on the communities' profile provided for each community that highly educated young female university graduate were members of CDCs interest group while it was less likely to find a male graduate.

54 The mission notes that previous recommendations regarding age disaggregated data of beneficiaries have not yet been taken into account, leaving the project with scarce resources to assess quantification of youth involvement in the project interventions.

at project inception. According to the wealth ranking surveys carried out in the selected communities in 2009, the percentage of (poor + medium) was 90%. During 2015 a reclassification of the wealth of communities has been carried out, but is not yet completed. However, the results from the reclassification of 39 out of 140 communities show striking improvements; i.e. 35.6% of the poor HHs had moved from poor to middle and well off levels, while 28% of the middle HH were transferred to the upper levels. Activities that have contributed to this development are water harvesting and terrace cultivation, adoption of guar cultivation and animal restocking through goat schemes and the CIF.

65. **Innovation & learning.** The mission rated the project efforts with regard to innovation and learning as satisfactory (5). Knowledge management in BIRDP has gained more attention since the MTR, including the creation of a web site where project documents and KM-products can be shared. A simple Knowledge Management strategy is in place while capacities developed<sup>55</sup>. There is great potential in this area and can be developed more, especially in the scaling up of activities. Interactions with communities were held in an innovative format during the mission's field visit with open dialogue session with representative of communities. The case of the six 'village cluster'<sup>56</sup>, interest based intra and inter-villages network<sup>57</sup> offers interesting insights on potential pathways to scaling-up. In terms of innovations, component 3 (Livestock and Marketing Development) is lacking behind.

**Climate and Environment Focus.** The mission rates the climate and environment focus as **moderately satisfactory (4)**. The Butana region area, ranging from desert to semi-arid, is considered an ecologically vulnerable area and is sensitive to the impacts of climate change<sup>58</sup>. This year in particular has been hard on the communities with a shortage of rain insufficient for rainfed cultivation. The mission notes that communities have developed mechanisms to cope with drought. These mechanisms include the establishment of water committees to manage water resources and collect water fees, investments in fodder storages where feed and fodder can be bought in bulk and stored for use during dry periods and the organization of women and men in saving and credit groups where funds can be accumulated and invested in community and individual coping activities; i.e. buying feed and water in particular. The overall approach of the BIRDP is to increase communities' resilience towards effects of climate change; i.e. core in this regard are the water harvesting activities. To cope with the drought situation, the project has promoted activities like hand hay making of rangeland grass (protected plots), storage of feed and fodder to meet the needs during critical dry periods of the year, growing of leguminous species such as Guar, Filipesara and Clitoria, fodder production as part of crop rotation in irrigation schemes, the construction of shelterbelts in terraces and the promotion of local breeds in poultry and goat husbandry. The project has also promoted gas units, as a way to decrease the communities' dependence on wood and use of charcoal, which contributes to improving the vegetation cover<sup>59</sup>.

## E. Fiduciary aspects

67. **Financial management.** The Financial Management has been rated **moderately satisfactory, (4)**. **Organization and Staffing:** the BDA that acts as the central PMU of BIRDP. The financial unit of the BDA and SCUs are staffed by qualified personnel and consist of Financial Controller (FC) who has been working for IFAD projects for a long period of time and assisted by an accountant at the BDA, and an accountant seconded from government for each of the five SCU. The procurement and different technical units are separated from the financial management unit with exception of procurement at SCUs which is carried out by the SCUs Accountants. No changes to the structure of

55The project has organized trainings for DTs in knowledge production, communication skills, formulation and preparation of successful stories, data collection and analysis, GIS systems, photography, video skills and production and dissemination of knowledge products. The supervision mission is pleased to learn that the DTs have started to use their skills in video production by producing short videos on project activities.

56 These clusters of networked villages foster cross learning and exchanges of experiences on common issues. They also pull financial resource to undertake larger public goods such as the construction of water yard.

57 Referring to Local Extension Networks, networks of CDCs, networks of forest guards, etc.

58 Environmental degradation is wide spread due to: (i) the use of the wide level disc in cultivating vast areas without any control, (ii) expansion of mechanized rainfed farming, (iii) trees cutting (charcoal production) and burning of grasses, (iv) excessive gold mining, over grazing, uncontrolled extraction of building materials, etc. Even the expansion of irrigated schemes contributes to it; stagnant water increase water- and vector-borne diseases (Malaria, Bilharzia, Tick borne diseases), carcasses floating in canals, extensive use of fertilizers, insecticides and pesticides, etc.

59 The demand for gas units among communities has been high and the gas units have been appreciated, especially by women, as they now have more time to focus on business initiatives as well as other community related activities.



the financial management unit is envisaged, however in the event of any turn over in any of FM unit positions of the project, the risk should be re-assessed.

**68. Budgeting.** BIRDP AWPB preparation follows bottom up approach and goes through several stages of preparation, review and approval. Each of the five SCUs prepares its own AWPB in alignment with state budget and in accordance with beneficiaries needs -based on theoretically best estimates-. AWPBs are then consolidated by Monitoring and Evaluation Specialist along with the BDA one in line with IFAD financing agreements and requirements. The consolidated AWPB is discussed between BDA and SCUs and final version is presented to the BDA Board of Directors (BoD) for approval. Subsequently, the approved AWPB by BDA-BoD is discussed with MoFNP with primary focus on the counterpart fund contribution. Finally, the approved AWPB by MoFNP is submitted to IFAD for review and concurrence. The final AWPB is usually ready for submission to IFAD by end of October for the previous year. However, the first version of 2015 AWPB was submitted to IFAD on 1<sup>st</sup> March 2015 following informal reviews by IFAD and meetings, and the last version submitted in June 2015. The actual expenditures as at 30 September 2015 are equivalent to 36% and 34% of the year to date budget and full year budget respectively, and historical trend shows low spending rate<sup>60</sup> against approved AWPBs. In 2015, the main reason is the low spending on some of the large budget items. *The Mission recommends: (i) the project to adhere to FA of timely submission of AWPB; and (ii) regularly monitor the actuals against budgets, take the corrective action or revise the AWPB accordingly in case of significant variance.*

**69. Funds flow and Disbursement Arrangements.** The BIRDP has a separate designated account in EUR opened at Omdurman National Bank (ONB) in Khartoum for IFAD loan and another account for the GOS counterpart contribution in ONB Gedarif. The funds flow from the loan designated account and the counterpart contribution account to the BDA pooled operating account opened and maintained in the Sudanese French Bank in local currency of SDG. The funds then flow from the BDA operating account to each of the SCUs sub-operating bank accounts opened and maintained in different commercial banks at each of the five states. The operating and sub-operating accounts are used to pay for the eligible expenditures incurred at BDA and SCUs levels. The designated account is used mainly to transfer funds to the BDA operating account and rarely for payments such as project staff travel allowances on aboard trainings. The fund flows from the BDA pooled operating account to each of the five SCUs is made on monthly basis against proposed activities submitted from SCUs, and subsequently reviewed by the technical and FM units and approved by the BDA Director. This arrangement however deemed to be a cumbersome and lengthy process. *The mission recommends that transfer of funds to SCUs sub-operating accounts is to be made on quarterly basis against approved AWPBs of each of the SCUs and any unspent funds from the preceding quarter to be deducted from the following quarter transfer.* The beneficiaries' cash contributions to Community Initiative Funds (CIFs) are deposited in advance to the relevant operating/sub-operating accounts and projects pays 100% of the costs to suppliers.

**70. Internal Controls.** The mission noted that segregation of duties exists with regard to preparing, reviewing and authoring transactions at BDA and SCUs levels. However, the internal controls currently in place are informal in the absence of an operational PIM, which is at draft stage and has not been finalised since the inception phase of the project. Fixed assets register is maintained in excel sheets by the BDA procurement officer for the overall project and by the accountants at the SCUs level. However, the registers are not updated regularly and do not contain full information e.g. location, custodian, etc. The assets are not tagged and physical counts do not take place in systematic intervals. *The mission recommends updating the fixed asset registers, tagging the assets and forming a committee to carry the physical count by the year end for 2015 external audit.*

**71. Accounting.** Accounts are maintained on cash basis and the Financial Statements are prepared on the same basis too. The access based accounting system was specifically developed for IFAD projects in Sudan and is housed in the computers of the finance staff. The FC carries out the back-up on regular basis. The approved annual budget is entered into the system and upon which the entry of expenditures transactions begins. The system is designed to allocate costs and expenses to all-ready defined costs centres and allocation % based on financing % as per different financier share and counterpart's contribution. As soon as the accountant selects the expenses account, the system allocates the expense automatically to the correspondent financiers. The compilation of BDA and SCUs accounts is carried out by FC after he reviews them on monthly basis. However, the mission noted that expenditure transactions entries for the first quarter of the 2015 were only inputted until

---

<sup>60</sup> The low rate is due to the fact that major investments are pending namely wadi crossings, purchase of cars and slaughterhouse facility.

later period due to delays in uploading the annual budget and the upgrade of the accounting system to produce Smart SOE. The system has also procurement and HR modules. The access based system is basic but deemed adequate to the needs of the project. It requires a regular maintenance and intervention from the developer to fix the bugs to enable generating accurate reports. The mission noted that the HR system does not generate reports on the outstanding salaries advances and inaccurate uses and sources of funds. *The Mission recommends requesting the system developer to fix these loopholes permanently to enable generating accurate and reliable reports.*

**72. Financial Reporting and Monitoring.** Financial Reports are available from the system and can be customized to a great degree. The beneficiaries' in kind contribution is recorded based on the best estimated value, and is part of the financial statements (FS) generated by the system. FC verified the FS before issuance to ensure the accurateness and reliability of the information. The mission recommends reflecting the in kind beneficiaries' contribution as a note to the financial statements given the judgement element of evaluating the value. The semi-annual reports are prepared by the project and planned to be submitted to IFAD with slight delays and can also be submitted for other periods upon request. **Internal Audit:** the project does not have an internal audit function as it was not envisioned for the Project.

**73. Disbursement:** Disbursement is rated as **moderately unsatisfactory (3)**. Since the last supervision mission in Nov 2014, 6 withdrawal applications have been submitted and processed by IFAD amounting to EUR 2 534 778. Four (4) of these applications were replenishment to the SA for EUR 1 907 313 and two (2) of them were direct payment of EUR 627 465. As at 20th October 2015, the disbursement percentage, including and excluding the authorised allocation to the Special Account were 63.06% and 56.44% respectively, with 89% of the project life elapsed since the loan effectiveness date. The authorised allocation of the loan is EUR 1 300 000 and cash outflow projection over the coming year indicates an increase in the disbursement towards the completion date. The mission agreed to (i) increase the current authorised allocation to EUR 2 million, and apply the direct payment modality for payments of USD 250 000 equivalent or above and (ii) start the recovery of the authorised allocation six months before the completion date of the project.

**74. Use of SOE and adequacy of supporting documentation.** The project has been selected for the piloted SMART SOE to show better audit trail and has been implemented starting Jan 2015 following an upgrade of the accounting system to generate them. The mission examined on a sample basis equivalent to EUR 646 894 –representing 35% of the claimed amount under SOE since the last year supervision mission. Examination took place at BDA, Jazeera SCU and Gedarif SCU and noted that; i) expenditures are duly authorised and entered in the accounting system; and ii) supporting documents are filed adequately and easily retrievable. In few cases it was noted that VAT has been claimed to IFAD and this is to be adjusted in the coming WA; engineers' certification of civil work progress reports is not signed; bank cheques released by the bank with only single signatory in Gedarif SCU; and advances to Central Coordination Unit of IFAD project charged as an expenses and no supporting documents are obtained.

**75. Counterpart funds.** The counterpart fund contribution is rated **moderate unsatisfactory, (3)**. The GOS counterpart contribution had a carried forward deficit of SDG 1.8 million from last year of 2014; this deficit has been advanced by the project from IFAD loan proceeds. During the period Jan - Sept 2015 an amount of SDG 2.4 million has been transferred to the project account, against actual expenditure for the same period equal to SDG 2.1 million leaving an accumulated deficit of SDG 1.5 million by end of Sept 2015. This deficit has been covered from the proceeds of IFAD Loan, which is not acceptable. *The mission recommends an immediate refund of the deficit and the project management and GOS to ensure timely transfer of the counterpart contribution to the project account to avoid similar situation in the future.* The project continues to be unable to include the amounts paid directly by the MOFNP against customs exemption, in addition the project did not capture the States contributions covering seconded staff salaries and office running costs of the SCUs and in kind contribution to activities. *It is therefore recommended that FC to follow up with MoFNP to obtain the exact amount of the custom duties; and to calculate the States' contributions to reflect the accurate overall contributions of GoS.*

**76. Compliance with loan covenants.** Compliance with loan covenants has been rated as **moderately satisfactory, (4)**. The project is in compliance with Financing Agreement legal covenant with exception of (i) semi-annual narrative and financial reports are submitted to IFAD with delays; (ii) untimely flow of the counterpart contribution; (iii) delays in submission of AWBP for 2015; and

(iv) PIM is not finalised yet. A list of key covenants and the compliance therewith is compiled in Appendix 6.

**77. Procurement.** Overall, the performance of procurement is considered to be **moderately satisfactory (4)**. Procurement processes continues to follow the same approach, envisioned at project design with the CCU carrying out all large procurement transactions that use National Competitive Bidding (NCB), International Competitive Bidding (ICB), and Quality and Cost Based Selection methods. Other procurement methods are managed at the BDA H/Q and the SCUs in the five states. The BDA H/Q is responsible as well for preparation and update of the procurement plans. **Procurement at the CCU level:** The 2015 procurement plan has included seven procurement transactions to be handled by the CCU. Two transactions have been competed so far while the bidding documents of the remaining five procurement transactions have been prepared and implementation of some has started. **Procurement at the BDA level:** The BDA has succeeded in making good progress with respect to compliance with IFAD Procurement Guidelines; such as compliance with procurement methods procedures, IFAD review thresholds, filing, etc. However, some weaknesses still exist on the SCUs level, including inadequate implementation capacity, improper documentation of the evaluation process, etc. **Procurement Planning:** The preparation of procurement plan has improved significantly with adoption of a format that allows sensible procurement planning. The 2015 procurement plan was found to meet the basic requirements. However; the mission noted the following weaknesses: (i) non-timely implementation and lack of update of the PP to match implementation realities; and (ii) lack of update of PP with regard to actual implementation. *The mission provided a series of suggestions to further improve these points, including updates of the procurement plan at least on quarterly basis to include all procurement activities as well as any necessary changes to reflect implementation realities. The updated plan should be sent to IFAD for NO Objection.*

**78. Contract Register.** The mission reviewed the project register of contracts –on sample basis. The mission noticed the following: (i) All local shopping transactions were enrolled in the register but without issuance of PO; (ii) The payment status in the register maintained by the procurement officer is not updated with payment status. *To further improve the quality of reporting, the mission recommends that the project should update the contract register to mitigate, the above points including the paid and remaining balance against each contract.*

**79. The Procurement filing system.** The mission was pleased to find out that the BDA has started to establish a dedicated procurement filing system, however it is limited only to the most recent procurement activities (year 2015) and in several cases it does not include all the relevant documents. In line with good procurement practices, *the mission recommends that the filing system should be extended further to include procurement transactions from previous years.* **Procurement post review** was conducted on sample basis for the contracts carried out over 2015. Nine contracts were included in the post review. Annex 6<sup>61</sup>, provides the details of the post review process. The mission has noticed that there are still gaps such that the SCUs are not able to carry out the procurement function effectively because of the heavy workload and capacity gaps. Due to the above constraints, the project has not updated the procurement plan effectively and delay in carrying out procurements was reported. Furthermore; the mission noted (based on the post review) in some instances non-compliance with Procurement requirements. The mission and the BDA director discussed possible ways to improve the SCU procurement practices. *The mission and BDA have agreed that the project should continue to have the support of a short term consultant with his/her role being extended more effectively to support the day to day procurement functions at the SCUs and conduct more effective on the job training for the its procurement teams.*

**80. Quality and Timeliness of Audit.** Quality and Timeliness of Audit has been rated as **satisfactory, (5)**. Financial statements for 2014 have been audited by National Audit Chamber of Sudan. The auditors conducted their audit in line with International Standards of Auditing (ISA). The audit report and management letter were received by the due date of 30 June 2015. Auditors expressed an unqualified opinion on the financial statements but not on the designated account and eligibility of SOE.

Agreed action	Resp.	Agreed date
Take the proper actions to secure fund to cover the financing gap of RAP contracts	BDA	Immediately
Timely submission of AWBP as per FA	BDA	1 <sup>st</sup> Nov, each year

61 Annex 6 is not included in the Supervision Mission report but shall be included in the follow-up mission report.

Agreed action	Resp.	Agreed date
Increase the authorized allocation of IFAD grant to 2 million EUR	IFAD	31 Oct. 2015
Transfer funds to SCUs on quarterly basis based on the approved AWBP	BDA	1 <sup>st</sup> Jan. 2016
Developer to fix loopholes in the accounting system and HR module	FC	15 Nov. 2015
Update fixed asset register regularly; perform physical count and tagging for fixed assets.	POs	25 Dec. 2015
Immediate refund of the deficit in the counterpart contribution that was covered from the loan proceed	GOS / BDA	Immediately
Finalisation of the PIM	BDA	25 Dec. 2015
The procurement plan to be constantly updated.	BDA	Continuously
Maintain a complete procurement centralized files.	BDA / CCU	Dec. 2015
Update the register of contracts to contain information on the paid and remaining balance.	BDA	Jan. 2016
Standard Bidding Document for shopping should be developed and used for the local shopping transactions	BDA / SCUs	Immediately
Recruit a consultant to support procurement activities at the SCU and carry out refresher on-the-job training for project staff at the BDA/SCUs level.		Nov. 2015
The IFAD Arabic newly issued handbook for procurement should be fully utilized by the project.	BDA / IFAD	Immediately
Transfer of funds to SCUs sub-operating accounts is to be made on quarterly basis against approved AWBPs of each of the SCUs and any unspent funds from the preceding quarter to be deducted from the following quarter transfer.	BDA / SCUs	1 <sup>st</sup> January 2016 onwards

## F. Sustainability

**81.** The mission rates the overall sustainability as **moderately satisfactory (4). Institutional sustainability:** Institutional sustainability in BIRDPA needs to be seen under two complementary angles: the likelihood of communities based organizations to grow, embrace emerging issues on a self-sustained basis on one hand and the BDA's ability to impose itself as a strategic self-financing agency steering development in the Butana on the other. The mission commends the progress made in supporting the lower level of governance where a growing awareness<sup>62</sup> has been observed but note that further efforts should be made in positioning and strengthening the Butana vis-à-vis other stakeholders; to mention are the Technical cadres at Locality level. The BDA Peoples conferences and the formation of a task force chaired by locality commissioners, eventually leading to state level workshop, intends to connect these levels more coherently. During the mission, two important side meetings related to accelerating BDA's institutional strengthening took place, with the members of the BDA Board of Director and a delegation from the MoFNP, respectively.

**82. Environment sustainability.** The communities have adopted environmental friendly practices and are more aware of the challenges of climate change. CBOs have successfully managed to register community forests and formed networks of CBOs focusing on the management of range and forest reserve. Communities have for instance created a system of voluntary Forest Guards, with a high potential of being used as a model for scaling up in other communities. Also, the co-financing of cultivation terraces has moved from 15 to 100% payment by the beneficiaries themselves in some states, which is a strong indicator of the sustainability of this intervention. There are however some challenges with regards to the sustainability of these activities since the link between the community-based networks and higher levels of institutions is lacking. Another remaining challenge is the lack of a coherent NRM-framework and enforcement mechanisms in localities and state level. A functioning NRM governance is essential for the long term sustainability of the project intervention.

**83. Sustainability at community and household level.** Efforts of community development have been highly successful. The targeted communities have developed a strong organizational structure and created strong CDCs and community networks, the communities are empowered to make

62 The emanation of the clustered network of villages mentioned earlier as a lobbying force is a reflection of this strength.

decisions, collect funds and make procurement decisions. All above mentioned contributes to the sustainability of the project and is an indication of the likelihood of the strong communities to continue on their own even when the projects end. There is however a potential risk that the weaker CDCs might fall apart when the project ends. These should be strengthened in order to increase sustainability at community and household level.

**84. Exit Strategy.** Echoing the double facet of institutional sustainability, strategic thinking supporting the phasing out of the project need to be linked to an enabling environment for the institutions it has established to continue thriving. The mission noticed a growing number of communities that are engaging in collective venture and joint management of assets (i.e. water infrastructure, fodder stores, etc.). Accompanying this process through anticipating financial and organisational needs will prove crucial. Facilitating linkages between RF service providers and existing S&CGs enhance the financial and commercial viability of embryonic community led enterprises. Albeit that exit is acknowledged<sup>63</sup> no exit strategy is in place, which indeed should be drafted soonest possible.

**85. Scaling up.** As of now all of the targeted communities have been reached, and scaling up of activities outside the target communities has started; i.e. those targeted are called Mother Villages and those outreached as part of scaling-up Satellite Villages. A positive sign is that many communities have on their own **initiative** started spreading project interventions to other communities. This is for example the case with home tree nurseries, where many of those who have been trained are passing over the skills to neighbours without project support. During the period of 2009 to 2015 a total of 45 community agents of mature communities have actively been involved in up-scaling activities. Other scaling up interventions include adaptation of cultivation of guar, Jubrakas, nutrition and first aid training as well as CAHW.<sup>64</sup> In addition to the engagement at community level, in 2015 a total of 12 local or national NGOs were involved in up-scaling activities<sup>65</sup>.

**86. Cooperation & synergies.** The project is gradually moving towards a facilitating role in linking up beneficiaries with private sector providers. The scaling up of terraces construction and rehabilitation stands out in this regard as farmers have shown substantial interest in paying up, on average to 90% of the services provision. The mission observes a growing partnership between ABSUMI and some SCUs where the micro-finance institutions are present. Joint interventions with various co-financing modalities has also become the norm in Khartoum state where the locality is financially stronger. Lastly, in Gedarif state, an international NGO, ZOA, has expressed interest in supporting fodder production to build resilience during drought. ICARDA keeps working with the programme regarding integrated fodder production.

## G. Impact

**87.** Coverage target of 140 communities have been reached and the number of beneficiaries directly or indirectly receiving project services outpaced by more than 50%, currently standing at 68,869 from the initial target of 40,000 persons. Despite taking place during a drought year, the mission observes that BIRDP has grown stronger in terms of achievements at community level. Impacts are emerging at community and individual HHs level. Stronger CDCs are now able to steer NR governance at local level much more effectively and the appetite for formal registration of communal range and forest is growing with 2 communities having managed to mobilise funds for what is a cumbersome administrative process. Collective endeavours are fostering solidarity, cooperation and collaboration. Increased social capital will prove essential in confronting communities with what has emerged as their major concerns during the BDA conferences, access to water, encroachment on range and forest resources, concerns regarding security (more weapons around, more rustling of animals and thefts, conflicts regarding access to fodder and water, etc.), and non-availability of basic services such as primary schools and rural health centres.

**88.** At individual level, HHs have increased their resilience to drought and developed innovative coping mechanisms. The project's intervention around home, Jubraka's, goat feeding and communal gardens are diversifying diets: in some communities, consumption of vegetable has been multiplied by

---

63 The BDA and DTs do mention the importance of completing planning activities (water supply, others), consolidation, differentiating to support to communities in line with their performance, documenting processes and experiences, capacity building of locality technical cadres, etc.

64 In 2015 90 neighbouring communities benefited from the established CAHW.

65 For example, the Sudanese NGO Hashasha has scaled up range enclosure activities in Gedarif state and a national NGO named Solo, has promoted individual jubrakas in Kassala state.

five, next to more goat milk. Beyond improving the nutritional status of HHs, they have given women an opportunity to actively engage in vegetable production and contributed to increased income. The introduction and uptake of guar is proving beneficial to mitigate fodder deficit and positively impact milk production from 0.5 to 1.3 liter a day for goats. Increased production is now allowing reserve to be formed and stored; i.e. ghee. Construction of water yards and hafirs has improved access and water availability. Coupled with expansion of rehabilitated terraces, sustainable intensification of sorghum supported by the project with improved seeds<sup>66</sup>, leguminous fodder varieties, sprout growing (fodder), compost making is all contributing to improving food and nutritional security. The number of households that have improved food security is now 25,572. Project activities have spurred social transformation in targeted communities. Increased women participation is creating entrepreneurship opportunities for small business and ABSUMI will scale up the financial capability of existing saving and credit groups and expand community investments. A sense of shared belonging in the Butana is emerging, where communities are speaking about ownership of development process and have gained leverage in advocating for shared problems. The communities also speak about the importance of transparency in managing the CDCs and CBOs as well as the need to strengthen the link between CDCs and community based networks with higher institutions in the Butana region; i.e. technical teams at locality level in particular. According to the Minister of Agriculture and Livestock in River Nile State "The biggest achievement of BIRDP project is the process of social change that takes place in the Butana at present. IFAD provided us with the approach of how to engage with such closed societies".

## H. Other- Budget Reallocation

89. The following table shows the proposed re-allocation among different categories to allow meeting the project needs during the coming year. The re-allocation is prepared so that it allows consolidation of key activities during the remaining short period of the project. The table should be sent further to IFAD for final approval before the re-allocation can become final.

Category	% Fin	Loan Amount Allocated Expressed in SDR	Disbursed		Balance	Proposed Reallocation
				%		
I Civil Works	94	5,440,000	3,433,004	63%	2,006,996	6,845,500
II Vehicles, Equipment and Other		1,820,000	1,597,656	88%	222,344	2,154,300
(a) Vehicles	100	820,000	674,226	82%	145,774	974,200
(b) Machinery and Other	98	1,000,000	923,430	92%	76,570	1,180,100
III Technical Assistance, Training and Other		5,650,000	2,281,802	40%	3,368,198	4,546,300
(a) Technical Assistance and Training	100	4,290,000	2,249,291	52%	2,040,709	4,213,800
(b) Inputs and Materials	100	1,360,000	32,511	2%	1,327,489	332,500
IV Grants	75	1,320,000	272,437	21%	1,047,563	812,800
V Recurrent Costs		2,570,000	1,897,020	74%	672,980	2,441,100
(a) Salaries & Allowances	77	1,420,000	1,153,002	81%	266,998	1,374,700
(b) Operations & Maintenance	100	1,150,000	744,018	65%	405,982	1,066,400
Authorised Allocation - Special Account			1,111,928.45		-1,111,928.45	
<b>Total</b>		<b>16,8000,000</b>	<b>10,593,847</b>		<b>6,206,153</b>	<b>16,8000,000</b>

## I. Conclusion

90. As the Development Teams hand-in-hand with the Young Professionals and the more advanced Local Extension Agents networks can take the lead in consolidating and scaling-up the activities, the BDA/PCU team should fully focus on the higher level activities namely the development of the Framework for the governance of Natural Resources and the BDA. This can however only materialise

<sup>66</sup> Relevant for semi / irrigated plots, but not adopted in rainfed cultivation as the local varieties provide more fodder and produce better when rainfall is low.

when SCUs are more empowered. Overall, to succeed, a less centralised management is needed starting at the functioning of the BDA/PCU team itself.

91. Next, providing priority to putting in place a comprehensive Exit Strategy, while fine tuning and aligning the Knowledge Strategy with the CCU Knowledge Management Team.

92. During the reporting period, the uptake of the pilot Micro Finance activities has been impressive and this showed that the right momentum is in place for investing in Micro Financing. It henceforth deserves the full attention to ensure that all plans prepared are implemented as planned.

93. Since plenty of drivers for scaling-up are in place while an enabling environment for sustaining and furthering the developments is feasible when BIRDIP is given more time, it is due time to prepare the Additional Financing proposal as planned per current COSOP.

94. Engaging Localities in an important measure for ensuring adequate service provision for the communities on longer. In this respect, the relevant authorities should ensure that technical teams are positioned at Localities.



## Appendix 1: Summary of project status and ratings

### Project 1332 [1100001332] Butana Integrated Rural Development Project -

<b>Country</b>	<b>Sudan</b>	<b>Project ID</b>	<b>1332 [1100001332]</b>	<b>Loan/DSF/Grant/ASAP FI No.</b>	<b>1000002751</b>
<b>Project</b>	<b>Butana Integrated Rural Development Project</b>			<b>Top-up Loan/DSF/Grant/ASAP FI No.</b>	
Date of Update	30-Oct-2015				
Supervising Inst.	IFAD				
No. of Supervisions	6	No. of Implementation Support/Follow-up missions	8		
Last Supervision	12-Dec-2014	Last Implementation Support/Follow-up mission	18-Jun-2015		

#### Basic Facts

USD million    Disb. rate %

Approval	14-Dec-2006			<b>Total financing</b>	29.85	
Agreement	16-Feb-2007	Effectiveness lag	19.0	IFAD Total	24.80	
Entry into force	07-Jul-2008	PAR value	-----	IFAD loan	24.80	63
First disbursement	28-Nov-2008			DSF grant		
MTR	26-Sep-2012	Last amendment		IFAD grant		
Original completion	30-Sep-2016	Last audit	29-Jun-2015	ASAP grant	0.00	0
Current completion	30-Sep-2016			Domestic Total	5.06	
Current closing	31-Mar-2017			Beneficiaries	0.77	8
No. of extensions	0			Local Gov	1.06	15
				National Govern	3.23	60
				External Cofinancing Total		



## Overall Assessment and Risk Profile

B.1 Fiduciary Aspects			Last	Current	B.2 Project implementation progress			Last	Current
1. Quality of financial management			4	4	1. Quality of project management			4	4
2. Acceptable disbursement rate			3	3	2. Performance of M&E			4	4
3. Counterpart funds			3	3	3. Coherence between AWPB & implementation			4	4
4. Compliance with financing covenants			4	4	4. Gender focus			4	5
5. Compliance with procurement			4	4	5. Poverty focus			4	5
6. Quality and timeliness of audits			5	5	6. Effectiveness of targeting approach			4	4
					7. Innovation and learning			5	5
					8. Climate and environment focus			3	4
B.3 Outputs and outcomes			Last	Current	B.4 Sustainability			Last	Current
1. Policy and Institutional Building			3	4	1. Institution building (organizations, etc.)			3	4
2. Natural Resource Mng.			4	5	2. Empowerment			4	5
3. Livestock Dev. and Market Inf. Entities			4	4	3. Quality of beneficiary participation			5	5
4. Com. Dev., Business Options & Rural Fin.			5	5	4. Responsiveness of service providers			4	4
					5. Exit strategy (readiness and quality)			3	4
					6. Potential for scaling up and replication			4	5

### B.5 Justification of ratings

B.1, 6) 'Quality and timeliness of audits', up-grading with one to 5 as conducted in time and in line with ISA; B.2, 1) Gender Focus is up to 5; - women actively participated in the Open Dialogues; - women in leadership positions increased; - female youth play prominent role, while also 5) Poverty focus is up to 5; - based on 40% coverage of poverty surveys conducted and against the 2009 baseline survey, 35,6 % of the poor HHs had moved from poor to middle and well off levels, while 28 % of the middle HHs were transferred to the upper levels. Item 8) 'Climate and Environment Focus', and related B 3, item 2 (Component 2) respectively moved up to 4 and 5 as truly improved land management and gender-sensitive (women play a relative prominent role while earlier not involved in managing NRs) climate resilient agricultural practices and technologies are promoted and of some high adoption rate; field visits showed that communities are drought resilient –this year no rain, but most had mitigating measures to obtain feed and fodder for animals, among others using newly introduced Micro Finance options-. 'Potential for scaling-up' went up to 5 as it is already taking place through the local extension network (community extension agents), NGOs/others as well as through using audio visual means, while the better involvement of Locality Cadre also contributes. Albeit not having an 'Exit strategy' on paper, completion, consolidation and sustaining development at community levels are taken as important by DTs while documenting experiences and processes started. B3, item 1 (Component 1) moved up to 4 as finally the concept for developing Framework for governance of NRs is understood and used, while YPs and CBOs work up to the mark.

	Last	Current
C.1 Physical/financial assets	4	4
C.2 Food security	5	5
C.3 Quality of natural asset improvement and climate resilience	4	5
C.4 Overall implementation progress	4	4

The project, particularly under "community development, business options" (component 4) and 'natural resource management' (component 2) 'is on track towards achieving most of its outcome and targets. Business at HH – and community level has taken off while the pilots on Micro Finance generated plenty of positive results in a rather short period; i.e. momentum created to take off in a big way. Subsidies are no longer provided while scaling-up and scaling-out happens. The major challenge remains to concentrate on the development of the BDA and finalizing the process of arriving at a Framework for Governance of NRs so as to arrive at an enabling environment. Component 3 'Livestock Dev. and Market Inf. Entities' deserves more attention by ensuring that professional services can be delivered at PCU level which is not the case with current newly recruited livestock officer.

C.3 'Quality of natural asset improvement and climate resilience' moved up to 5; - no rain but the protected range and forest areas provide some fodder and feed stores were not all empty; - improved NRs beyond target set; - the livestock feeding strategies adopted contribute to mitigate drought; - food conservation at HH level contributes to food security.

C.5	Likelihood of achieving the development objectives (section B3 and B4)	4	4
-----	--	---	---

The increased SOCIAL CAPITAL of all targeted communities will prove essential in addressing their major concerns namely access to water, various types of encroachments on NRs, insecurity (thefts, conflicts regarding access to NRs, etc.) and non-availability of basic services such as primary schools and rural health centers. It however needs a CONDUCTIVE ENVIRONMENT to sustain and to further development whereby a functional BDA, pro-active Technical Cadres at Locality Level and Framework for Governance of NRs should be in place. Quote of His Excellence, Minister of Agri. & Liv., River Nile State reads: "The biggest achievement of BIRDP project is the process of social change that takes place in the Butana at present. IFAD provided us with the approach of how to engage with such closed societies".

**C.6 Risks** Short description of major risks for each section and their impact on achievement of development objectives and sustainability

Fiduciary aspects	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The serious delay in transfer of government contribution is a major risk, among others due to non-clarity of BDA degree and classification; - currently addressed by DG, MoFNP.</li> <li>- Too much centralization leading to ineffective implementation and lengthy fund flow process; i.e. quarterly plans and fund flow (PCU to SCUs),</li> <li>- Community procurement took off slowly but currently perceived as successful and deserves further attention.</li> </ul>
Project implementation progress	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The major reason for slow spending rate, which is due to the fact that major –hard ware- investments are pending, should be overcome by better planning and delegation of tasks; PCU to focus on higher level issues (- BDA, - Framework, - Studies, - KM, etc.) and SCUs/DTs, YPs and Network of community agents on field related work.</li> </ul>
Outputs and outcomes	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Importance of timely implementation of the Roadmap agreed upon regarding the development of the BDA as an evolutionary and strategic agency.</li> <li>- The planned MF activities shall further boast outputs and outcomes beyond the targets set.</li> </ul>
Sustainability	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Risk: delayed agreement on a harmonized framework for the management of natural resources and establishment of BDA. Pending delay of agreements with state and local governments and financial institutions for scaling-up; i.e. River Nile on track.</li> </ul>

Issue / Problem	Recommended Action	Timing	Status
ROADMAP □ BDA: Institutional Development.	Execute the entire ROAD map designed: - complete recruitment process of institutional advisor; - finalization of documents (Vision, Strategic Framework); - development five years business plan; - revisiting BoD membership; - develop by laws, organization structure and job descriptions for key positions; - re-look at BIRDP versus organizational structure of BDA.	Immediately	Start made
RAP contracts	Take the proper action to secure fund to cover the financing gap of RAP contracts	immediately	did start
Counterpart contribution	Immediate refund of the deficit in the counterpart contribution that was covered from the loan proceeds	Immediately	
Enabling environment for sustaining impacts	Since plenty of drivers for scaling-up are in place while an enabling environment for sustaining and furthering the developments is feasible when BIRDP is given more time, it is due time to prepare the Additional Financing proposal as planned per current COSOP.	Before the end of 2015	
Sub-optimal management	Decentralization of tasks and quarterly planning and fund flow of PCU to SCUs	Immediately	
Exit strategy paper missing	Develop coherent exit strategy	March 2016	
Co-operation with GEF	Top attention to be provided to the coordination between the BIRDP and ICSP (selection of areas, coordinating activities, studies, etc.)	Immediately	

**Additional observations**

- During the reporting period, the uptake of the pilot Micro Finance activities has been impressive and this showed that the right momentum is in place for investing in Micro Financing. It henceforth deserves the full attention to ensure that all plans prepared are implemented as planned.
- Timely follow-up mission to be arranged including providing support (exit strategy; component 3; RIMS; studies).



## Appendix 2: Updated logical framework (version post MTR): Progress against objectives, outcomes and outputs

Progress to date (Oct. 2015) **NB** No/patchy rainfall in 2015.

Narrative	Indicators –gender and HH disaggregated	Unit	MTR Target	Progress to date (Oct. 2015)	Remarks
	Number of households that have improved food security	HH	20,000	25,572	Terrace and Wadi/depression cultivation, Guar cultivation, functioning home nurseries and irrigated agriculture; livestock production (e.g. goats)
Goal: Improve in a sustainable manner the livelihoods and resilience to drought of the poor rural households	Decrease in child malnutrition, among boys and girls (RIMS)102				
	- Acute malnourished children - weight for height	% G, % B	25%G, 25%B	25%G, 25%B	
	- Chronic malnourished children - height for age	% G, % B	28%G, 29%B	28%G, 29%B	
	- Weight for height	% G, % B	12%G, 14%B	12%G, 14%B	
	Increase in household asset base, by type of household (RIMS)				
	- Poor HH	%	85%	42%	Poor to middle increased by 56%, poor to well off increased by 20% and middle to well off increased by 24%. Based on 40% coverage of the Survey. Survey still to be completed.
	- Middle-poor HH	%	13%	34%	
	- Well off HH	%	2%	24%	
	Number of persons receiving project services by gender (Target: 40,000 persons).	Pers.	40,000	68,869	Direct and indirect
	- Persons receiving project services	Male	20,000	41,869	" " "
	- Persons receiving project services	Female	20,000	27,000	" " "
<b>Development Specific Objectives:</b>					
1. Establishing a coherent and cost effective governance framework that ensures a regulated access to land and water resources of the Butana;	- Legislations, laws and by-laws enacted and enforced	NO	10	3	
	Number of communities with registered community range/forest/pasture/water resources committees				
	- Communities with registered community range/forest/pasture	Community	100	87	Total area of 62,970 feddan 29 hafirs + 42 Water Yards
	- Communities with registered water resources committees	Committee	102	71	
	- Decrease of dispute cases over natural resources solved at community organizations level.	Case	50	25	
2. Improving the access and bargaining position of women and men in the marketing;	Decrease in transportation time and cost to market and social services	NB livestock markets established do not influence bargaining position of wo/men, but increase fee collection for Localities. Only in the more isolated markets it attracts more traders.			
	- Increase in animal off take (livestock markets)	Head	5000 Head/season	8909	Inflow=11131, off take=8909 (In five livestock markets). NB difficult to obtain reliable data.
	- Increase in the No of traders (livestock markets)	Producer/ trader	250	123	
3. Developing the capacity of community-based organizations to engage in environmentally sound, socially and gender equitable development	- % of women and men who have access to the markets	%	40	31	NB Women can't enter the closed livestock market; against the traditional norms
	- Increasing CCI value	%	85	78%	CCI in 2005 was 62%
	- % of women participating in decision making structures	%	30	20%	
	- No of HHs benefitting from the CIF and ability to manage the revolving funds and business options	HH	5,000	4,387	100% women; Animal restocking 1853; Gas units 1588; Irrigation units 681; Grain

Narrative	Indicators –gender and HH disaggregated	Unit	MTR Target	Progress to date (Oct. 2015)	Remarks
					storage 188; Fodder storage 41; Poultry 17; Donkey driven carts19
<b>Component 1. Policy and Institution Building</b>					
<b>Outcome:</b>					
	- Policies, Strategy, Laws, By-laws established and enforced.	No	5	3	Activating the law, which forbids the practice of any agricultural activities North the range line in Gedarf State+ activation of three local laws/norms regulating the use of NR
An enabling governance framework is developed for natural resources management in Butana	- No of interstate partnership/agreement established for NRM management	No.	3	1	
	- Effectiveness of NRM Conservation Plans	%	80%	65%	Average/overall effectiveness NRM Conservation Plans
	- Likelihood of Sustainability of Market facilities	%	80%	50%	O&M remains critical (localities not using fees collected for O&M); some facilities – water, toilets, etc. - still pending as resp. of Localities.
<b>Component 2. Natural Resources Management (Water, Range, Forest, Vegetable, Fodder and Agriculture Crops)</b>					
<b>Outcome</b>					
Improved Natural Resources management (range, forest, vegetables, crops)	1- Effectiveness and sustainability of water infrastructure (drinking water for people, animals)	Source	102	61	Total facilities established/constructed to date = 107 (57% fully effective and managed by the water committees )
	2- Savings in SDG for the poorer households' purchase of portable water.	SDG/HH/Da y	1.5	0.8	
	3- Saving in time spent for water collection for women (Per Household)	minutes/HH	60	45	
	4- Amount of money invested (by community) in repair and maintenance and development of domestic water facilities	SDG	1,075,000	153,658	Equal to about US\$ 26,958
	5- Increase in yields of subsistence, cash, food, dual purpose and fodder crops (irrigated, rain-fed)	Ha	60,000	49,333	NB No/patchy rainfall in 2015: lost season
	6- Effectiveness of NRM plans	Plan	140	140	
	7- Increased carrying capacity of the range	TAU/Ha/Yr	0.1	NA	
	8- Savings in SDG on smallholders' purchase of feed in the dry season	SDG	25,000	21,000	As no rains, high costs on purchasing feed this year.
	9- % of decrease in time and frequency of tracking animals outside the area (open Butana grazing, irrigated areas along Atbara river and Kassala area)	%	40%	25%	The establishment of the community and individual range helped communities in control of its NR and tracking animals outside the area.
	10- Number of women and men adopting technology recommended by the project (i.e. beyond demonstration/beyond outcome); area covered, amount invested, etc.	Person	15,500	20,374	Water harvesting, animal production, etc. Scaling-up happening.
<b>Component 3. Livestock and marketing development</b>					
<b>Outcome</b>					
Improved animal health and animal productivity	1- Rates of calving/lambing/kidding (large and small ruminants)	%	25	13.5	Using of Guar reduces the mortality and increased the proportion of births and twins in goat keeping. Hay making and
	2- % decrease in (cattle, shoats) animal mortality rate (young stock,	%	10	16.8	

Narrative	Indicators –gender and HH disaggregated	Unit	MTR Target	Progress to date (Oct. 2015)	Remarks
	adult)				fodder storage too.
	3- % decrease in mortality rate traditional poultry systems	%	40	30	Some communities have adopted breeding of traditional poultry which showed good results.
	4- Decrease in market transportation costs during the rainy season	SDG	100	65	Livestock survey for 2014 The establishment of rural roads has already contributed in reducing the cost; NB road however still under construction
Component 4. Community Development & Business Option					
Outcome	1- Effectiveness/Sustainability of CDC groups	%	75%	75%	CDCs good knowledge to management the NRs and development activities.
	2- Effectiveness/sustainability of service providers	%	75%	50%	Some improvements in CDCs effectiveness comparing with 2014 is realized, where about 50% of the CDCs rated between excellent ,very good and good, the middle CDCs 29% and the weak 21% , while in this year about 59% of the CDCs rated between excellent ,very good and good, the middle CDCs 25% and the weak 16%.
Community-based groups are empowered and business-oriented	3- Rate of implementation of the community development plans	%	75%	54%	
Component 1. Policy and Institution Building; Activities (Outputs)					
1.1. Legislation for NRM	- Gaps in existing laws and by-laws identified and addressed	laws and by-laws	5	2	Activating the law, which forbids the practice of any agricultural activities north the range line in Gedarif State+ activation of three local laws/norms regulating the use of NR
1.2. Policy & Strategy	- Number of Environmental Plans formulated	Plan	140	140	
1.3. Institutional Development building	- Area (Feddan) of land under improved management practices (range, forest; individual and communal areas)	Ha	11,598	355,832	Include= Traditional Terrace, Wadi/Depression Cultivation, community based forest, Individual and Community range reserves, Range-land protected by the belts of fire lines grids
- BDA	- No of local NRM regulations and by-laws established at community level.	regulations and by-laws	20	12	Activation of local orders, establishment of community-based orders for the management of natural resources
- CBOs	- Share of federal budgets allocated to BDA	US\$ (000)	3,233	2,714	
	- Additional funding mobilized by BDA	US\$ (000)	100	58	Loans for 404 household in Khartoum State in cooperation with the Agricultural Bank of Sudan Microfinance Initiative (ABSUMI)
- Markets	- No of cost-recovery based services provided to communities by BDA and earning generated	No	100	37	
- Others (e.g. Govt. partners)	- No of CBOs partnerships established	CBO	30	19	Some CBOs were able to establish partnerships with some organizations and

Narrative	Indicators –gender and HH disaggregated	Unit	MTR Target	Progress to date (Oct. 2015)	Remarks
					national institutions and bring fund for investment in their communities
	- Number of markets rehabilitated/constructed fully functional	Market	5	5	
	- No Market services established		5	5	
	- Number of performance based contracts with market operators	contract	5	3	Annually renewal of contracts in 3 Market, 2 Markets managed by localities
1.4 Knowledge Management					
	- Simple BDA KM strategy developed	strategy	1	1	
	- Number of locality staff and private operators trained	person	130	185	
Capacity building106 (Development Teams), Technical assistance, Studies, Pilots, Research, Young Professionals Programme, etc.)	- No of studies/research undertaken on NRM	studies/research	16	10	
	- No of young professionals successfully benefiting from young professional programme	person	100	74	
	- No of innovations, learning process, pilots/trials documented by the Project	innovations	20	10	
	- Extension materials and handbooks produced	materials/handbooks	15	13	
	- Visitors to BIRDP websites (frequency of downloading info)	Visitor	36,000	44,467	
	- No of items postings in MENA knowledge base and IFAD website	Article/Item	120	38	Different topics including success stories, reports, success practices...etc.,
<b>Component 2. Natural Resources Management (Water, Range, Forest, Vegetable, Fodder and Agriculture Crops): Activities (Outputs)</b>					
2.1 Water Infrastructures (Hafirs, water yards for people and animals)	- No of Drinking Water Systems constructed/rehabilitated (Water yards, Hafirs, Cisterns, Dams)	Source	102	107	Although the project has succeeded the target field. However water still is top priority for some communities, in some communities, no source of water available, or the amount of water is not enough
	- People trained in water infrastructures management	Person	603	225	
2.2 Water harvesting per Agro-ecological zone for forage, forest, fodder, vegetables and crops	- Land under improved management practices	Ha	145,800	101,156	Individual and community reserves + community forest+ scaling up of Guar cultivation.
	- Area under modified traditional terrace cultivated	Feddian	35,560	85,344	
	- Area under improved depression cultivation	Feddian	130,600	23,310	
	- Area under contour ploughing	Feddian	3,000	3,647	
	- Type of irrigation system installed and commanded area (incl. women gardens/farms)	System	300	291	
	- Community irrigated shelterbelts & woodlots	Feddian	300	147	
	- Area under sand dune fixation	Feddian	105	134	
	- Area under improved range and forest management including protection	Ha	145,800	101,156	Individual and community reserves + community forest+ scaling up of Guar cultivation
	- People trained in water harvesting and related plant and land	Person	7,112	1,011	Persons trained on subject matters

Narrative	Indicators –gender and HH disaggregated	Unit	MTR Target	Progress to date (Oct. 2015)	Remarks
	management (regarding above mentioned 1-7)				pertained to NRM
	- Increased contribution of locality/state/communities to fire line construction (i.e. 4000 km / annum)	Km	3,000	679	
	- Length of fire lines (km) and area protected (feddan)	Km	11,750	14,271	
	Area protected by fire lines constructed	Ha	399,500	225,715	This season no fire lined were constructed due to low rainfall and poor rage land , there is no significant growth of the grass at the level of the Butana area
2.3 Wadi crossings	- Other productive infrastructures constructed(Wadi Crossings)	Crossing	10	0	10 crossing under construction
<b>Component 3. Livestock and marketing development; Activities (Outputs)</b> <sup>67</sup>					
	- No. of business and livestock market information entities established, operational and financially sustainable	Entities	15	10	Mixed picture regarding market information
3.1 Business and livestock markets information entities (BLMIE)	- No of facilities/services available in market places (including for women)	Facility	15	9	Toilets, food and tea services, veterinary pharmacies and veterinary services centers
	- No of producers and traders benefitting from LIMS	Person	100	78	Producers and traders working on livestock export
3.2 Animal feeding innovations and initiatives	- No people trained in livestock production technology	Person	1,000	878	
3.3. Comprehensive extension and vaccination campaigns	- No. of women and men accessing (livestock) extension services	Person	17,000	15,143	
3.4 Animal husbandry and management (large and small stock including indigenous poultry)	See 3.2				Local poultry rearing taking off
3.5 Enhancement of Pastoralism	No of pastoralist HH reached	HH	4,800	4,094	
<b>Component 4. Community Development &amp; Business Option; Activities (Outputs)</b>					
4.1 CBOs Organization and Management	- Number of CD groups formed	Group	140	140	
	- Number of NRM groups formed	Group	500	685	
Training	- Number of groups with women in leadership position	Group	420	115	
	- Number of women and men members of the CD groups.	Men & Women	2,100	1,834	55% women
	- Number of community organizations registered	Organization	140	116	72% registered
	- Community trained in Score Cards and used it as an evaluation tool	Community	25	12	
	- No of meetings held by CDCs and decisions taken	Meetings	5,640	4,830	
	- Number of women and men belonging to groups	Men &	12,100	11,175	

67 Monitoring is poor. Needs attention.



Narrative	Indicators –gender and HH disaggregated	Unit	MTR Target	Progress to date (Oct. 2015)	Remarks
4.2 Social Skill Training	- No of Community Village Plans formulated	Women			
	- No. of gender empowerment training delivered	Plan	140	140	
	- No of social infrastructures constructed/rehabilitated (health centers, schools, storage, etc.)	Session	560	481	
	- No of pers. receiving social skill trainings	Infrastructure	120	42	
	- No. of communities and participants involved in the repair, maintenance and development of Hafirs/dams/water yards	Person	20,000	16,446	
4.3 Business promotion projects Community Development projects	- No of local and national NGOs involved in up-scaling activities	Community	120	53	
	- Number of women and men trained in income generating activities.	NGO	15	10	
	- Rate of disbursement of CIF	Person	1,008	296	
4.4 Training of Trainers Community based extension workers (Development Community-based extension cadre: CBAWs, Water Committee's, range – and other local extension agents)	- No. of TOT training	%	100	53	
	- No new CAHWs trained		10	6	
	- No of CAHWs received activity and advanced training (business, CARDA manual, etc.)	No	280	220	
	- Average increase in revenue generated by women and men	No	140	69	
	- No of Integrated Pest Management Agents	No	25	12	
	- No of community initiatives implemented	No	280	225	
	- No of community agents of mature communities actively involved in up-scaling activities	No	280	198	
	- No of people trained in post-production, processing and marketing	Agent	280	225	
	- No households receiving animal health services (RIMS) facilitated by the project	No	14,200	16,440	
		No	3600	3,053	

## Appendix 3: Summary of key actions to be taken within agreed timeframes

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date	Actions Taken
B. Overall assessment of the Butana Integrated Rural Development Project implementation			
1 Complete the urgent upstream work required for improving NRM governance framework (consultation at community, locality, state, and national level; conduct urgent background studies, etc.)	BDA; Policy Advisor	Immediately	In close collaboration with the management of the BIRDP, the Policy Advisor (PA) started the prescribed task by drawing a comprehensive operational plan for 2015 as how to achieve a coherent, cost effective and sustainable governance framework for natural resources. A plan was developed at different levels; the salient feature of the plan was to conduct a bottom-up natural resource management workshops. The main objective is to engage the stakeholders at each level with focus on five themes related to Natural Resource Management (NRM): water, forestry, rangelands, livestock, and small scale rain-fed farming. So far workshop series at the following levels: 1- Communities (Implemented) 2- Localities (Implemented) 3- States (under preparation) and 4- Inter-State (yet to be implemented)
2 Start developing a vision on how to improve the NRM governance structure	BoD; BDA director, policy advisor	December 2015	During 2015 BIRDP with close facilitation by the PA succeed to introduce and undertake key activities and policies to start developing a vision on how to improve the NRM governance structure. The introduced activities and policies aim at establishing a coherent and cost effective governance framework in order to improve livelihoods, reduce poverty, and promote development while maintaining and enhancing the sustainability and resilience of the natural resource base as well as ensuring a regulated access to land and natural resources in Butana.
3 Strengthen the BDA team by an institutional development advisor to help achieve institutional strengthening, develop a business plan and attract funds.	BDA director	January 2015	As per Oct., 2015, BDA recruit an institutional advisor on consultancy basis who will immediately start strengthen the BDA team to achieve institutional strengthening, develop a business plan and attract funds
4 BDA should look for incremental sources of funds to support NRM governance work and starting follow-up projects to scale-up and sustain achievements under BIRDP.	BDA; IDA	Continuous	Some cooperation under process such as the programme with GEF, the project will keep looking for incremental sources of funds to support NRM governance work and follow-up projects to scale-up and sustain achievements.
5 Firm-up exit strategy to ensure sustainability and scaling-up of BIRDP activities.	BDA; IDA	immediately	Some exit strategies were initiated such as: 1- Strengthen the CDCs and CBOs at bottom level, 2- Enhance the local community workers (CHWs, IPM, etc.) and connect them with technical departments at localities, 3- Enhance and support the technical departments at locality level to supervise and co-follow up the work at communities with SCUs team, 4- Upgrade the CIF programme ad Savings and Credit Groups which initiated by the project (developing and introduce and support small scale enterprises).
C. Outputs and outcomes, Component 1: Policy and Institution Building			
6 Finalize review federal, state and local legislation as well as customary rules relevant to NR management and formulate proposals for removing contradictions and ensuring harmony (Funding from BIRDP).	PA	March 2015	Review of the federal, state and local legislation and the customary rules relevant to NR management are one of the ongoing activities concerning the improving of NRM governance which including: 1- Document in a systematic manner all communal customary practices, values and indigenous knowledge and regulations governing natural resource utilization and management;

	Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date	Actions Taken
				2- Review all states' regulations, and laws at different levels (locality, state, federal levels); 3- Propose new ones to fill any existing gaps identified during the workshops at different levels; and finally to 4- Synthesize all these set of customary and civil regulations and laws that govern the utilization and management of natural resources by different stakeholders at different levels, with focus on the poor households.
7	Complete the consultation process and consolidate with the results of earlier conferences	BDA; PA; Federal Government; State Government	June 2015	Not yet
8	Conduct priority studies about natural resources in Butana	BDA; PA; consultants	2015	Some studies about natural resources interventions were conducted using community Score Card (CSC) method such as: 1. Evaluate Range Reserves interventions /activities; 2. Outcomes result of Drinking Water facilities; 3. Results & Impacts of Establishment of Women Communal Farm; 4. Impacts of Introduction of guar as fodder crop to improve animal productivity. 5. Results & Impacts of Introduction of Terraces as Water Harvesting Structure to Improve Agriculture
9	Finalize hiring an institutional development/resource mobilization consultant (IDA) as a priority	BDA; BOD; IDA	January 2015	Will discussed with institutional advisor consultant when start developing the business plan and attract funds
10	Form a task force of key stakeholders to support BOD in urgent actions	BOD; BDA; PA	December 2014	The recommendation was discussed during one of the BODs meeting, the BODs agreed, some of localities commissioners attended the meeting, BDA started the formation, but not yet completed.
11	Draft BDA vision, mission, strategy and priorities based on the Mission's meeting with some BDA BOD members and key representatives (no funding required)	PA; BDA/ BOD; working group	January -February 2015	Not yet
12	Organize National launch of reformed BDA, signing of MOUs between BDA and all states involved	MoFNE/CCU/BDA	Immediately/continuous	Not yet
	Component 2: Natural Resources Management (Water, Range, Forest, Vegetable, Fodder and Agriculture Crops)			
13	Design further CDC training in NRM and further elaborate M&E in the NRM activities	BDA; M&E officer	Feb/March 2015	Some training programs were conducted concerning NRM elaborating M&E NRM, evaluation studies on NRM were conducted with participation of CDC using community Score Card (CSC) method.
14	Develop with support of outside specialists holistic watershed/catchment area development plans	BIRDP	Feb/March	Not yet
15	Scale-up overall production and harvesting of forage within individual farm reserves		March/May	So far the project succeeded to scale-up the overall production and harvesting of forage by introducing different approaches and interventions such as:

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date	Actions Taken
			1- Establishment of individual and communal range reserves (most of households used water harvesting techniques in establishing and developing their reserves with no or minimum project support; 2- Communities were motivated to build their own local fodder stores (150 stores at household level in Nahr ELNil State and about 84 stores in 5 communities in Gedarif); 3- Introducing of Guar in Butana by BIRDPA as fodder crop (so far farmers are being relied on their resource in introducing guar (minimum assistance of BIRDPA))
16 Prepare a tree planting plan and limit production of the seedlings to the needed amounts as per the plan	BIRDPA	March/April 2015	The recommendation was recognised as part of the AWPB 2015 and conducted as on the job training at community level.
17 Invite and involve private sector and/or private financing in the terrace construction programme	BDA	March/April 2015	Not yet
18 Upgrading the knowledge and skills of staff in project and implementing partners at SCUs levels, on pastoralism and pastoralist development Component 3: Livestock and Marketing Development	BIRDPA	March/April 2015	The knowledge and skills of staff in project and at SCUs levels was enhanced towards pastoralism and pastoralist development. Pastoralist development programme was partially conducted in River Nile and Gedarif States (AWPB 2015 Involvement of pastoralist in development of rangelands and forest).
19 Review the agreements with localities on the construction/rehabilitation of livestock markets and finalize these agreements	BDA/SCU livestock officers	Jan/Feb 2015	Agreements with localities on the construction/rehabilitation of livestock markets were not yet reviewed; i.e. two markets managed by localities three by contractors.
20 Make an inventory of fodder, feed and grazing availability during the year in the various zones and formulate measures to alleviate constraints	BDA/SCU livestock keepers	Ongoing	Somehow the project using the ecological zonation study as basic for the process of making the inventory of fodder but not yet completed.
21 Develop economic models for input supply, lamb fattening and village poultry keeping to gain access to microfinance	BDA/SCU livestock officers	March 2015	Some models were developed 1-Animal feeding innovation and initiatives which depends on local feed materials available and accessible to communities 2- Using of Guar as fodder to increase animal production.
22 Develop a Butana general animal health strategy, based on public private partnership, and agree on this with the various state veterinary departments Component (4): Community Development and Business	BDA/consultant	April 2015	Butana general animal health strategy somehow is a federal issue that can be discussed during the upcoming activities of conducting NRM workshops (5 workshops at State level and Inter-State workshop for all five States and relevant federal ministries)
23 Fine-tune the formation of groups and promote regular meetings between CDC and community, legalize CDCs	SCU, BIRDPA community	January / June 2015	1. The interest groups revised to assess the increase or decrease in the group membership, and moreover to assist the organization of the new groups in the communities where there are community members interested in new activities; 2. Regular meetings were conducted for the development committees (864 meeting in 2015); i.e.

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date	Actions Taken
			number of meeting is one of the effectiveness criteria that ensure the team work and transparency in implementing the different development intervention through shared responsibilities and participatory decisions making. Moreover, meetings strengthen the capacity of CDCs members regarding communication skills and meetings management;
			3. Legalization of the community organizations is an important factor that support the community empowerment through enabling the CBOs to act as legal entities and facilitate their communication with governmental/non- governmental organizations to provide more development resources and services, as well as ensuring the sustainability of the implemented development interventions; i.e. up to Oct. 2015 about 116 CDCs out of 140 were legalized (registration of 7 CDCs underway/waiting for certificates).
24 Develop other economic activity models with good returns or saving (e.g. village poultry, gas bottles, etc.) Identify traditional skills with economic potential to be included in the training and models	CDCs and SCUs	ongoing	Considering the lessons learned from CIF implementation that focused mainly on animal restocking during the period pre-the MTR mission, CIF was opened, and activities to some extent were diversified. Improvement was materialised in the implementation of the CIF; i.e. up to August 2015 a total of 198 different CIF were implemented including: Animal restocking 79, Gas units 48, Irrigation units 66, Grain storage 4, Fodder storage 1, Poultry 9 and Donkey driven carts 4
25 CDCs to be made more independent through training, charging for services and sourcing other donors and aid programmes	CDCs and SCUs	ongoing	Training and enhancing the CDCs is an ongoing programme recognized by the project. So far some improvements were noticed in CDCs effectiveness, some CDCs have ability charging for services and sourcing other donors aid and programmes such as: - provision of fund from charity or organizations, - conducting of periodic meetings with general assembly specially for the evaluation of the CDCs works and members and to select new members instead of inactive ones.
D. Project implementation progress			
26 Recruit Institutional Development Advisor (IDA) to support institutional restructuring of BDA	BDA	January / February 2015	An institutional advisor was recruited on consultancy basis to support the BDA
27 Provide sufficient budget and support staff to the policy advisor and the Institutional Development Consultant.	BDA	January / February 2015	Sufficient budget was allocated for both policy advisor and the Institutional Development Consultant. All project staff at BDA and SCUs working together and supporting the policy advisor, the same support will avail for Institutional Development Consultant, moreover the project will consider any support staff for both if needed.
28 Strengthen relationship between BDA / SCUs and the localities structure	BDA	Immediately	Since the structure of the BDA as institution was not yet completed but the relationship between BDA/SCUs is progressing, also the relation and cooperation with the available technical departments at locality level was considered more tuning are needed.
Monitoring & Evaluation (M&E).			
29 Conduct some analytical studies on collected data, including cost – benefit analysis.	BDA / M&E officer	Immediately	Some analytical studies on collected data were conducted including cost–benefit analysis (cost-benefit analysis of improved terraces cultivation, cost-benefit analysis of animal feeding innovation and initiatives by using local feed materials, Using of cost–benefit analysis of using Guar as fodder to increase animal production)
30 Conduct refreshment training to DTs on outcome and output indicators	BDA / M&E officer	January 2015	On the job refreshment training was conducted to DTs on outcome and output indicator followed by practical work on preparing the AWPB for 2015 (calculating the activities cost base on the output and

	Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date	Actions Taken
31	Collect beneficiary age date to allow quantification of beneficiaries by age <b>Coherence between AWPB and implementation.</b>	BDA / M&E officer	Immediately	outcome of each component). The project starts to use this approach as base for every activity or intervention.
32	Conduct leadership and empowerment training for women		Immediately	To enhance the empowerment and gender equality, gender training and gender sensitization was incorporated in all training and extension programs delivered. In addition, special opportunities that were secured for women in different training programs or any events organized by the project. As a result, the project realized a tangible improvement in women participation in the different activities, interest groups and leadership positions the quality of women participation improved and this can be noticed through effective participation of women regarding roles responsibilities and participation in decision making process; i.e. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Increase number of women as leaders of the interest groups that composed from both men and women with clear responsibilities;</li> <li>• Submission of special women activities within the community annual plan;</li> <li>▪ Women representation in the external events such as natural resource forums and effective participation by presenting and discussing issues related to natural resource in their communities;</li> <li>• Effective women participation as members of the procurement committees attending, participating and applying all procurement guidelines as needed.</li> </ul>
33	Scaling up of illiteracy cases, targeting women and combining with aspirate programs such as consciousness and recognition	BDA / Community Development Officer; SCUs	Immediately	Done: ToT, among others.
34	Reduce activities out of the locality as this would limit women participation	BDA; SCUs	Immediately	Most activities conducted within village or village clusters to increase women participation.
35	Develop a holistic strategy for enhancement of Butana women involvement in development processes.	BDA / Community Development Officers	January 2015	The project starts developing strategy to enhancement women involvement in development processes. Although quality in women participation can be noticed, still the empowerment and gender equality both at individual and household level need to be assessed and promoted, therefore the project prepared an action plan that developed from the knowledge built during the Learning Route in gender and microfinance that held in Uganda in August 2014. The main focus of the project strategy in addition to its special objectives is to build the capacity of the development teams and communities in gender action and learning system (GALS) to create vision culture and ensuring gender balance through maintaining gender roles and benefits at household level, the arrangements for this capacity building procedure was completed, 10 participants from BDA and development teams will be trained as TOT in November 2015
36	Develop a strategy for enhancing youth participation in the project activities	BDA / Community Development Officer	February 2015	About 25% of the people receiving project intervention are youth, therefore one of the project strategies is to allocate special programme for the youth in addition to the regular and annually programmes such as: the programme of supporting youth groups peer reconstruction of natural

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date	Actions Taken
			resources, the green education programme and tree planting in public utilities.
37 Effectiveness of targeting approach Follow careful targeting approach to maintain effective engagement of women and youth	BDA / Community Development and M&E Officers; SCUs	Immediately	So far the project following carefully an effective targeting approaches maintaining engagement of women as well as youth. 1- About 25% of the people receiving project intervention are youth. 2- 40% of the community procurement committees (CPCs) members' women. 3- 58% of gender and mainstreaming training are women. 4- Women representation in CDCs 30%, 32%, 32.7%, 34.7%, 35% and 35.3% in years 2009, 2010, 2011, 2012, 2013, 2014 and 2015 respectively.
38 Provide more focus on targeting different stakeholders, including nomads.	BDA / Community Development Officer; M&E	Immediately	The project starts focusing on targeting the different stakeholders, including nomads, especial programme was development in 2015 AWBP (involvement of pastoralist in development of rangelands and forest), more focusing will take place in future.
<b>Innovation and learning</b>			
39 Additional efforts should be delivered for knowledge generation from the abundant success stories on the project interventions	BDA	Immediately	Knowledge Management Strategy (KMS) was developed by the project based on the ideas and approaches that lead and help in fulfilling in a sustainable manner the livelihoods and resilience to drought of the poor rural households as well as achieving the development objectives of the project. Steps of implement the strategy: 1. Develop the capabilities of the different development teams in related aspects of knowledge production through intensive training programmes. 2. Gradually establishing a sustainable culture of learning collaborated with primarily focusing on field processes and beneficiaries' practices. The BIRDPA already encouraged communities to establish community network as methodology of practice that use action learning to solve NRM problems as well as spread and exchange innovation. 3. Linking community practices, initiatives and ideas with the project plans/activities and exchanging knowledge among communities in coordination and cooperation with development team. 4. BIRDPA continuously will develop the process of dissemination and sharing the good practices and knowledge through the available means of knowledge sharing at local, regional and globe. The primary keys for knowledge management depend on the following basic steps: 1. Identify a limited number of knowledge themes, derived from the BIRDPA interventions and the good community practices and knowledge. 2. Build the knowledge management skills gradually on the current assets and operations and partnerships. 3. Identify specific instruments needed to improve learning and knowledge-sharing at the community level as well as project level. 4. Identify the cultural and behavioural changes needed for implementation and the incentives and training that must be put in place to bring these changes. 5. Ensure cost-effectiveness by harnessing resources and efforts and integrating them into a



Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed date	Actions Taken
40 Expand knowledge sharing channels to target beneficiaries who are not internet users.			coherent and time bound results framework The project starts to implement the knowledge strategy through a clear distribution of roles and responsibilities within stakeholders in order to provide efficiency and accountability. Promoting a supportive culture of knowledge sharing and learning using most available knowledge management measures (at community levels ,community-networks, regional networks, and village, locality and state partnerships such as exchange visits, learning route, workshops, knowledge share fair meetings, radio, TVs and internet portals).
41 Climate and Environment Focus Accelerate the project efforts to develop overall NRM that would address climate change and environmental degradation in the Butana region	BDA	Immediate	The projects' strategy has always been focusing on develop overall NRM in order to address climate change and environmental degradation in the Butana region. In this context, 6 studies are under process in collaboration between BIRDP and ECAW (Enhancing Climate Change Adaptation in Agriculture and Water Resources in the Greater Horn of Africa).
42 E. Fiduciary aspects == Personnel Management Follow up - vigorously - at the federal, state and community level to secure counterpart funding contribution to facilitate implementation of project activities	BDA/CCU/SCUs	Immediate y/ continuous	Some progress was made at community level especially in the implementation of CIF. At federal level the counterpart funding contribution is lagging behind.
43 MoFNE to transfer remaining counterpart balance to the project account to avoid negative impacts on project activities.	MoFNE	immediate	Partially secured
44 Discuss IFAD requirements for audit with NAO and include such requirements in the ToR.	/BDA/FC/IFAD	Feb 2015	Some changes were made in the ToR for audit with NAO to meet IFAD requirements.
45 Provide information on government contribution timely deducted at source, including customs duty and VAT exemptions.	MoFNE/CCU/BDA	Immediate y/ continuous	An inventory for government contribution including customs duty and VAT exemptions was requested by the project from MOFNP
46 Update the inventory, tag the list of items in custody of individual staff and codify all assets	BDA/ACUs/ Admin officer	April 2015	The inventory tags were updated including list of items in custody of individual staff and codify all assets.
47 Conduct annual performance evaluation exercise of project staff Procurement	BDA MGT/staff	Annually	Performance evaluation exercise of project staff was done at BDA and SCUs.
48 Apply international advertisement to all ICB's	CCU	Immediate y	Done accordingly
49 Maintain a complete procurement centralized files, where all procurement	BDA	Immediate y	So far a complete procurement file was prepared for each procurement process at BDA and SCUs including solicitation documents, evaluation, awarding, contracts and payments.



	<b>Agreed action</b>	<b>Responsibility</b>	<b>Agreed date</b>	<b>Actions Taken</b>
	related documents are maintained: including solicitation documents, evaluation, awarding, contracts and payments			
50	Comply with IFAD prior-review requirements	BDA	Immediately	Done accordingly
51	Strict adherence to IFAD guidelines with regard to shopping, direct recruiting and selection of consultants	BDA	Immediately	Done accordingly
52	Recruit or assign an admin/ procurement assistant to be responsible for keeping procurement files and manage the flow of documents and information to/from the procurement unit in the CCU and SCUs	BDA	Immediately	Done accordingly
53	Provide additional training, specific to procurement planning, contract Management and applying different method of procurement to the concerned staff.	IFAD/GOS	Immediately	The project recruited a procurement specialist to provide technical support for project as well as to enhancing the staff capabilities in procurement
54	Carry out second round of capacity building programme for CPCs	BDA/SCUs	Immediately	Done accordingly
55	Fully utilize IFAD procurement plan template and avoid combining larger contracts in the same line item	BDA	Immediately	The project procurement plan 2015 was developed according to the IFAD template avoiding combining larger contracts in the same line item; the plan was reviewed and approved by IFAD.
56	Provide Procurement Implementation Support	IFAD	Immediately	Procurement implementation support provides by the procurement specialist

## Appendix 4: Physical progress measured against AWP&B, including RIMS indicators

	Output	Unit	Project target	Y 2015			Achieved to date (2009 – Oct.2015)		Remarks
				Planned	Achieved	%	Achieved	%	
Component 1. Policy and Institution Building									
1	Gaps in existing laws and by-laws identified and addressed	laws/by-laws	5	2	1	50	4	80	Activating the law, which forbids the practice of any agricultural activities north the range line in Gedarif State+ activation of three local laws/norms regulating the use of NR
2	Environmental Plans formulated	Plan	140	0			140	100	
3	Area (Ha) of land under improved management practices (range, forest; & communal areas)	Ha	333,060	6,500	6,024	93	473,781	142	Inc. Terrace improvement, Wadi/Depression, Forest/Woodlots, Tree shelter belts, Sand dune fixation, Guar cultivation, etc. (Community awareness on the importance of protecting the NRs □ helped to expand the activities and interventions towards the improvement of the management practices of NRs)
4	Local NRM regulations and by-laws established at community level.	Regul./ by-laws	20	5	5	100	14	70	
5	Share of federal budgets allocated to BDA	US\$ (000)	3,233	731	117	16	2,714	84	
6	Additional funding mobilized by BDA	US\$ (000)	200	100		0	58	29	
7	Cost-recovery based services provided to communities by BDA and earning generated	Services	100	5	3	60	37	37	
8	CBOs partnerships established	Partnership	30	10	8	80	19	63	Some CBOs were able to establish partnerships with NGOs & Nat. Institutions and bring fund for investment in their communities (Kassala, Gedarif, River Nile)
9	Markets rehabilitated/constructed fully functional	Markets	5	1		0	5	100	
10	Market services established	Services	5	1		0	5	100	Constructed but not all functioning up-to-the mark.
11	Performance based contracts with market operators	Contracts	5	3	3	100	3	60	
12	Simple BDA KM strategy developed	Strategy	1	0			1	100	In place. See Appendix 7, AM Oct-Nov 2015
13	Locality staff and private operators trained	Person	130	50	60	120	185	142	Training ratio more than planned due to the high turnover among the DTs at SCUs, in addition to giving training opportunities for staff from Localities
14	Studies/research undertaken on NRM	Studies/Research	16	5	4	80	10	63	
									Scientific theses dedicated to the project activities and innervations in collaboration of Enhancing Climate Change Adaptation in Agriculture and Water Resources in the Greater Horn of Africa (ECAW), in addition to the studies of some

1	Young professionals successfully	Person	100	70	47	67	74	74	activities and interventions project
5	benefiting from young professional programme								See Appendix 7, AM Oct-Nov 2015
1	Innovations, learning process,	Innovations	20	5	3	60	10	50	See Appendix 7, AM Oct-Nov 2015
6	pilots/trials documented by the Project								
1	Extension materials and handbooks produced	Material/ Handbooks	15	5	5	10	13	87	See Appendix 7, AM Oct-Nov 2015
7						0			
1	Visitors to BIRDP websites (frequency of downloading info)	Visitor	36,000	40,000	44,467	111	94,909	26	See Appendix 7, AM Oct-Nov 2015
8								4	
1	Items postings in MENA knowledge base and IFAD website	Article/Item	120	15	5	33	38	32	See Appendix 7, AM Oct-Nov 2015
9									
	Component 2. Natural Resources Management								
2	Effectiveness and sustainability of water infrastructure (drinking water for people, animals)	Source	102	35	25	71	107	10	
0								5	
2	Savings in SDG (AVG) for the poorer households' purchase of portable water.	SDG/HH/Day	5	4	3.8	94	7	13	
1								5	
2	Saving in time spent for water collection for women (Per Household)	Minutes/HH	60	90	95	10	180	30	The presence of water source in the village, in some cases, water supply networks in the home reduced the time it takes to fetch water, and take advantage of the time available in other activities especially for women
2						6		0	
2	Amount of money invested (by community) in repair and maintenance and development of domestic water facilities	SDG	1,075,000	200,000	176,200	88	329,858	31	
3									
2	Increase in productivity sorghum	Kg/Feddan	700	450	440	98	898	12	The use of water harvesting techniques and improved seeds increased productivity, in some areas productivity reached more than 900 kg / Feddan (season of 2014)
4								8	
2	Increase in productivity vegetable	Kg/Feddan	2,000	810	765	94	1,865	93	
5									
2	Increase in productivity fodder	Kg/Feddan	3,000	125	121	97	1,726	58	
6									
2	Increase in water utilization per household/day	liter/day	140	120	102	85	172	12	
7								3	
2	Effectiveness of NRM plans	Plan	100	100	80	80	81	81	
8									
2	Area under improved depression cultivation	Feddan	130,600				123,310	94	
9									
3	Area under contour ploughing	Feddan	3,000				3,647	12	
0								2	

3 1	Type of irrigation system installed and commanded area (incl. women gardens/farms)	System	300	10	11	110	291	97	
3 2	Community irrigated shelterbelts & woodlots	Feddan	300	34	30	88	147	49	
3 3	Area under sand dune fixation	Ha	105	25		0	134	12 8	
3 4	Area under improved range and forest management including protection	Ha	145,800	2,000	2,486	12 4	101,156	69	Individual and community reserves + community forest + scaling up of Guar cultivation
3 5	People trained in water harvesting and related plant and land management	Person	7,112	950	1,011	10 6	1,011	14	
3 6	Contribution of locality/state/communities to fire line construction (i.e. 4000 km/annum)	Km	3,000	3,000		0	679	23	This season no fire lined were constructed due to low rainfall and poor range production; there is no significant growth of the grass at the level of the Butana area
3 7	Fire lines constructed	Km	11,750	6,000		0	14,271	12 1	
3 8	Area protected by fire lines constructed	Ha	399,500	-	-	-	225,715	56	
3 9	Productive infrastructures constructed(Wadi Crossings)	Crossing	10	10		0			10 crossing under construction
Component 3. Animal Resources									
4 0	People trained in livestock production technology	Person	1,000	220	199	90	878	88	
4 1	Women and men accessing (livestock) extension services	Person	17,000	3,000	3,023	10 1	15,143	89	52% women
4 2	Business and livestock market information entities established, operational and financially sustainable	Entities	15	5	4	80	10	67	Telephone and communication services, providing meals and tea, veterinary medicines and treatment services
4 3	Producers and traders benefiting from LIMS	Person	100	40	35	88	78	78	Mixed picture.
4 4	Facilities/services available in market places (including for women)	facilities/services	15	6	2	33	9	60	Toilets, food and tea services, veterinary pharmacies and veterinary services centres
4 5	No of pastoralist HH reached	HH	4,800				4,094	85	
Component 4. Community Development & Business Options									
4 6	CD groups formed/Reviewed	Group	140	140	140	10 0	140	10 0	
4 7	NRM groups formed/Reviewed	Group	700	280	277	99	685	98	

4	Groups with women in leadership position	Group	200	80	85	10	115	58	
8						6			
4	Women members of the CD groups.	Person(women)	840	70	50	71	647	77	
9									
5	Men members of the CD groups.	Person(men)	1,260	170	177	10	1,187	94	
0						4			
5	Community organizations registered	Organization	140	35	19	54	116	83	In 2015 , 7 organizations underway (waiting certificates)
1									
5	Community trained in Score Cards and used it as an evaluation tool	Community	25	9	8	89	12	48	
2									
5	Meetings held by CDCs and decisions taken	Meeting	5,640	1,104	864	78	4,830	86	
3									
5	Women and men belonging to groups	No.	12,100	6,200	3,352	54	11,175	92	In 2015 56% women
4									
5	Community Village Plans formulated/reviewed	Village Plan	140	140	140	10	140	10	Review community village plans formulated
5						0		0	
5	TOT training	Training	10			-	6	60	
6									
5	Gender empowerment training sessions delivered	Session	560	50	58	116	481	86	
7									
5	Women and men trained in income generating activities.	No.	1,008	280	296	10	296	29	On the job training
8						6			
5	People trained in post-production, processing and marketing	No.	14,200	500		0	16,440	116	Nutrition food processing
9									
6	Social infrastructures constructed/rehabilitated (health centres, schools, storage, community centres...etc.)	infrastructure	120	20	19	95	42	35	Community centres; good progress in 2015
0									
6	Households receiving animal health services (RIMS) facilitated by the project	HH	3,600	2,900	3,023	10	3,053	85	Direct benefited from animal health worker services
1						4			
6	Pers. receiving social skill trainings	No.	20,000	1,352		0	16,446	82	Adult Education, First Aids (14% men)
2									
6	Rate of disbursement of CIF	%	100	50	53	10	53	53	
3						6			
6	Community involved in the repair, maintenance and development of Hafirs/dams/water yards	Community	120	10	8	80	53	44	
4									
6	Persons involved in the repair, maintenance and development of Hafirs/dams/water yards	Community	164			-	225	13	The programme of on the job training increased the number of trainees (training at water source in villages)
5								7	
6	Community agents of mature	Persons	492	20	15	75	126	26	

6	communities actively involved in up-scaling activities							
6	Local and national NGOs involved in up-scaling activities	NGO	15	5	4	80	10	67
7	New CAHWs trained	No.	280	33	23	70	220	79
8	CAHWs received activity and advanced training (business, CARDA manual, etc.)	No.	140	30	26	87	69	49
7	Average increase in revenue generated by women and men CAHWs	%	140	15		0	-	0
0	Integrated Pest Management Agents	Agent	280				225	80
7	Community initiatives implemented	Initiative	280	46	50	10	198	71
2	Community networks formed	Network	8	4	3	75	4	50
7	Households benefiting from CIF	HH	3500	1,644		0	2,743	78
4	Community radio listening group formed	Group	30	10	7	70	13	43
5								

---

## Appendix 4 B: Physical progress measured against AWP&B, RIMS (level1, 2, 3) indicators

Results	Unit	Period 31-Oct. 2015			Cumulative			Actual of previous years	Remarks
		AWP&B	Actual	% of AWPB	Appraisal	Actual	% of appraisal		
BIRDP – RIMS – First Level Results-									
Total Outreach									
Communities receiving project services	Number	140	140	100%	140	140	100%	140	Increase the number people receiving project service due to the increasing of people from the neighbouring villages as well as the scaling-up of the activities and interventions
Households receiving project services	Number	1,000	1,201	120%	33,000	34,381	104%	33,180	
People receiving project services	Male	4,200	3,232	77%	20,000	48,201	241%	44,969	
People receiving project services	Female	8,400	8,642	103%	20,000	39,029	195%	30,387	
Institutional support									
Staff of service providers trained	Male	-	-	-	55	67	122%	67	Number of forums has been implemented at the local and central level to review, strengthen and assist on the enforcement legislation and regulations
Staff of service providers trained	Female	-	-	-	33	57	173%	57	
Staff of service providers trained	Number	-	-	-	88	124	141%	124	
Effectiveness: improved performance of service providers	Rating	4	4	100%	6	4	67%	4	
Effectiveness: promotion of pro poor policies & institutions	Rating	4	4	100%	6	4	67%	4	
Pro-poor legislation and regulations enforced at the local or central level	Rating	4	4	100%	6	4	67%	3	
Drinking water/sanitation									
Drinking water systems constructed/rehabilitated	Number	35	25	71%	75	118	157%	93	
Likelihood of sustainability of social infrastructure-drinking water systems	Rating	4	4	100%	6	4	67%	4	
Rangeland/pastures									
Environmental management plans formulated	Number	0	0	-	140	140	100%	140	This indicators replaces "Natural resources mgt groups formed/strengthened" Include= Traditional Terrace, Wadi/Depression Cultivation, community based forest, Individual and Community range reserves, Range-land protected by the belts of fire lines - grids <sup>68</sup> Including :(( Irrigation by using: Matra - pump - Drip Irrigation...etc.)+ (Applying of modern irrigation systems in collaboration with (ICARDA)), The implementation exceeded the planned due to the following factors: see <sup>69</sup>
Groups involved in NRM formed/strengthened-rangelands	Number	0	0	-	140	744	531%	744	
Land under improved management practices	Ha	5,800	6024	104%	333,060	423,977	127%	417,953	
Land under irrigation schemes constructed/rehabilitated	Ha	1600	1845	115%	302	2,255	746%	410	

68 NB (the calculation of actual area for 2014 up to October 2015)

People in natural resources management groups formed/strengthened	Male	2,200	2,444	111%	29,250	46,626	159%	44,182	The composition of the NRM interest groups was reviewed in 140 communities
People in natural resources management groups formed/strengthened	Female	2,500	2,931	117%	15,750	29,245	186%	26,314	
People in natural resources management groups formed/strengthened	Number	4,700	5,375	114%	45,000	75,871	169%	70,496	
People trained in natural resources management	Male	200	187	94%	31,500	38,784	123%	38,597	Including: Water Harvesting, Compost (organic manure), Vegetable Production, Water and Soil Conservation, Integrated Pest Management (IPM), the number succeeds the target due to the following: see <sup>70</sup> Lack of rain for the season 2015 did not encourage interference in this activity
People trained in natural resources management	Female	800	788	99%	13,500	22,539	167%	21,751	
People in natural resources management groups formed/strengthened	Number	1,000	975	98%	45,000	61,323	136%	60,348	
People trained in crop production and technologies	Male	160	147	92%	3,150	8,441	268%	8,294	
People trained in crop production and technologies	Female	650	716	110%	1,350	2,740	203%	2,024	
People trained in crop production and technologies	Number	810	863	107%	4,500	11,181	248%	10,318	
Rainwater harvesting system constructed/rehabilitated	Number	0	0	#DIV/0!	75	30	40%	30	The increase in group number due to the continuous scaling up and adoption of different intervention such as Guar cultivation in the individual range reserves
Common property resources under improved management practice-rangelands	ha	1,500	1,586	106%	50,000	35,523	71%	33,937	
Effectiveness of NRM & conservation programmes	rating	4	4	100%	6	4	67%	4	
Likelihood of sustainability of NRM & conservation groups-rangelands	rating	4	4	100%	6	4	67%	4	
Number of groups operational/functional-rangelands	Number	250	275	110%	500	1,108	222%	833	
<b>Animal production</b>									
Government officials and staff trained	Male	7	0	0%	7	56	800%	56	Dissemination of supplementary feeding programme + increase births via animal
Government officials and staff trained	Female	3	0	0%	3	14	467%	14	
Government officials and staff trained	Number	0	0	0%	10	70	700%	70	
Households receiving animal health services	Number	2,900	3,023	104%	4,000	7,238	181%	4,215	
People accessing advisory services facilitated by project	Male	180	191	106%	1,260	1,642	130%	1,451	

69 1- The contribution of community in cost recovery; 2- High adoption; 3- Organization of women in clusters or groups for further service provision; 4- Creating revolving fund basis; 5- Instituting crop sharing to address the needs of landless.

70 1- High interest & enthusiasm amongst women; 2- Acquaintance and gaining of knowledge & skills on vegetable production techniques; 3- Organization of women in clusters or groups by regulations to secure fair division of roles and share of benefits; 4- Use of the proceeds /revenue of women farms in other viable investments; 5- Drafting & endorsing of regulations & rules to manage these farms; 6. Use & consumption of the produced vegetables to improve the nutritional level & status.



People accessing advisory services facilitated by project	Female	170	176	104%	540	1,024	190%	848	feeding & improving animal health. (Improve and upgrade the nutritional value of agricultural by-products by adding nutritive ingredients such as molasses, as well as the good results obtained from using Guar as supplement feed for animals. People were trained in livestock production and technologies adopted technologies provided by the project, particularly involving the use of local materials available at the village level in addition to the introduction of guar fodder (women are the most adopted these techniques)
People accessing advisory services facilitated by project	Number	350	376	107%	1,800	2,675	149%	2,299	
People trained in livestock production and technologies	Male	88	86	98%	196	1,064	543%	978	
People trained in livestock production and technologies	Female	132	113	86%	84	1,146	1364%	1,033	
People trained in livestock production and technologies	Number	220	199	90%	280	2,210	789%	2,011	
Effectiveness of productive infrastructure-livestock water points	rating	5	5	100%	6	5	83%	5	
Effectiveness: improved agricultural, livestock and fishery production	rating	4	4	100%	6	4	67%	4	
Farmers reporting increased herd sizes (men)	Number	110	102	93%	900	613	68%	511	
Farmers reporting increased herd sizes (women)	Number	120	118	98%	500	519	104%	401	
Farmers reporting increased herd sizes (men/women)	Number	230	220	96%	1,350	1,232	91%	1012	
<b>Market infrastructure</b>									
Marketing facilities constructed/rehabilitated	Number	0	0	0	5	5	100%	5	Toilets, food and tea services, veterinary pharmacies and veterinary services centres
Market facilities constructed/rehabilitated-other	Number	6	2	33%	5	7	140%	5	
Marketing groups formed/strengthened	Number	-	-	-	280	22	8%	22	
People in marketing groups formed/strengthened	Male	-	-	-	2,800	365	13%	365	
People in marketing groups formed/strengthened	Female	-	-	-	2,800	446	16%	446	The process of groups formation of marketing do not find acceptance with the communities, most producers prefer individual marketing, so there was no progress or development in this process
People in marketing groups formed/strengthened	Number	-	-	-	5,600	811	14%	811	
People trained in post-production, processing and marketing	Male	-	-	-	700	782	112%	782	
People trained in post-production, processing and marketing	Female	-	-	-	700	621	89%	621	
People trained in post-production, processing and marketing	Number	-	-	-	1,400	1,403	100%	1,403	
Effectiveness: producers benefiting from improved market access	rating	4	4	100%	6	4	67%	4	
Likelihood of sustainability of market, storage, processing facilities-market	rating	4	4	100%	6	4	67%	4	
Market, storage or processing facilities	Number	5	4	80%	6	4	67%	5	

operating after 3 years- market

**Community Development**

Community groups formed/strengthened	Number	280	277	99%	700	1,162	166%	885	
People in community groups formed/strengthened	Male	70	50	71%	7,350	6,400	87%	6,350	
People in community groups formed/strengthened	Female	170	177	104%	3,150	3,890	123%	3,713	
People in community groups formed/strengthened	Number	240	227	95%	10,500	10,290	98%	10,063	
People trained in income generating activities	Male	120	118	98%	702	1,226	175%	1,108	Nutrition and food processing for storage and marketing & other income-generating activities
People trained in income generating activities	Female	160	178	111%	1,638	2,250	137%	2,072	
People trained in income generating activities	Number	280	296	106%	2,340	3,476	149%	3,180	
Village/Community plans formulated	Number	-	-	-	140	141	101%	141	
Effectiveness of community development	rating	5	5	100%	6	5	83%	5	
Likelihood of sustainability of community groups formed/strengthened	rating	5	5	100%	6	5	83%	5	
									The project focusing on the approach of formation of groups that are business oriented, most groups organized themselves into sub groups, some groups started savings and production income generating activities
Number of groups operational/functional	Number	10	8	80%	700	893	128%	885	

## BIRDP RIMS – Second Level Results

Component	Category	Results	Rating	Remarks
1. Institutional Support	Institutional Support	Effectiveness: promotion of pro-poor policies and institutions	4	<p>Project strategy and approached focusing on community organization and strengthening through formation, reformation, arrangement, capacity building and legalization of community based organizations including the community development committees and the interest groups at community level. One of the most important results of poverty targeting, based on 40% of targeted villages, is: 35.6% of the poor households moved from poor to middle and well off levels while the 28% of the middle households changed to the upper levels. The following interventions contributed relatively most on improving the situations of poor and middle-households:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Water harvesting/terrace cultivation which resulted in a tangible increase in Dura/Sorghum production.</li> <li>• Adoption of Guar cultivation and production resulted in increased number of animals.</li> <li>• Animal restocking through CIF helps in increased number of animals of poor household.</li> <li>• Vegetable cultivation,</li> <li>• Availability of water facilities ,</li> <li>• Availability of fodder through communal and individual range reserves,</li> <li>• Existence of community animal health workers( animal health services),</li> <li>• Existence of effective CDCs focusing on poor, selected suitable activities for suitable households in addition to good monitoring, follow up and regulations, etc.</li> </ul> <p>In addition some households their situation improved due to the involvement of one of the family members in tradition gold mining. Most of those benefited from gold mining are already well off households.</p>
2. Agriculture, rangelands and water services	Rangeland/pastures (Natural Resources Management)	Likelihood of sustainability of natural resources management groups formed/strengthened	4	<p>1- Some communities have common issues and rights over natural resources.</p> <p>2- Willingness and cooperation for conservation of NR and to have social services</p> <p>3- Establishment of registered community based organizations</p> <p>4- Communities are competing and struggling to be better than before and ahead of others</p> <p>5- Natural resource stock and reserve has encouraged and promoted the common work</p>
		Effectiveness of natural resources management and conservation programmes	5	<p>1- Farmers built sound results and beneficial impacts by their own practices for natural resources management</p> <p>2- High rate of scaling up of individual range reserves was reported amongst HHs</p> <p>3- Some farmers are being relied on their resource in introducing different crops and fodders such as guar in their range reserves</p>
3. Livestock development and marketing services	Animal production	Effectiveness of productive infrastructure - Livestock water points	4	<p>1-Application of water fees/rates by use of duplicates/coupons &amp; acceptance of it by the majority of each community members.</p> <p>2- Existence and recognition of water functional subcommittee &amp; to work under the umbrella of the legal mother committee (the Community Development Committee).</p> <p>3- The enthusiasm and readiness of communities to contribute in kind &amp; in cash.</p> <p>4- Use of excess/surplus water in production (home gardens/women jubraka or in supplementary irrigation in the main farm/terrace)</p>
		Effectiveness: improved	4	<p>1-The contribution of community in cost recovery (from 25 % share to full cost)</p> <p>2- High adoption.</p>

Component	Category	Results	Rating	Remarks
4. Community development	Marketing	agricultural, livestock and fishery production Effectiveness: producers benefiting from improved access to markets	4	3- Organization of farmers in clusters or groups to facilitate service provision Some markets are not managed directly by the locality (managed by contractors), no maintenance for the facilities, no services (such as water, animal health), in some cases animals are sold out of the market due to the absence of active management of locality
		Likelihood of sustainability of marketing facilities, processing facilities	3	Most of the markets managed by contractors, there is no follow-up or permanent maintenance of the facilities in the market, which reduces the continuity and sustainability as required
		Effectiveness: community development Likelihood of sustainability of community groups	5	The various project interventions contributed on raising community awareness towards better services and enhanced women leadership and quality of their participation as CDCs members (building self-confidence) , linking of some groups with finance institutions Some improvements in institutions at community level (CBOs & CDCs), concerning the effectiveness, the annual assessment show that about 59% of the CDCs rated between excellent ,very good and good, the middle CDCs 25% , Which indicate positive result in terms of likelihood of sustainability of community groups
	Community Development	community groups formed/strengthened	5	

### BIRDP RIMS – 3<sup>RD</sup> Level Results

Indicator	Unit	Benchmark	Mid-term
Households with improvement in household assets ownership index	Number	20,000	25,572
Underweight children - weight for age	% total	25.1	21.1
Chronic malnourished children - height for age	% boys	28.8	22.3
Chronic malnourished children - height for age	% girls	29.3	26.1
Acute malnourished children - weight for height	% boys	13.6	11.2
Acute malnourished children - weight for height	% girls	11.6	9.2
Households experiencing one hungry season	Number	325.0	0
Households experiencing two hungry seasons	Number	88.0	0
Month duration of first hungry season	Number	4.0	0

## Appendix 5: Financial: Actual financial performance by financier; by component and disbursements by category

**Table 5A: Financial performance by financier 30/09/2015**

Financier	Appraisal (USD '000)	Revised Appraisal (USD '000)	Actual (USD '000)	Committed (USD '000)	Total (USD '000)	Per cent Actual
IFAD Grant	24 799	24 799	15 321	712	16 033	65%
Federal Government	3 233	7 333	3 190	274	3 464	47%
State Governments	1 056	2 856	193		193	7%
Beneficiaries	766	1 666	271		247	15%
<b>Total</b>	<b>29 855</b>	<b>36 655</b>	<b>18 975</b>	<b>986</b>	<b>19 938</b>	<b>54%</b>

**Table 5B: Financial performance by financier by component (USD '000) as at 30/09/2015**

Component	IFAD loan			Government			State			Beneficiaries			Total		
	Revised Appraisal	Actual	%	Revised Appraisal	Actual	%	Revised Appraisal	Actual	%	Revised Appraisal	Actual	%	Revised Appraisal	Actual	%
Policy and Strategies	6 217 779	6 251 872	101%	3 133 834	2 373 682	76%	2 226 377	31 388	1%	-	33 256	#DIV/0!	11 577 990	8 690 198	75%
Natural Resources Development	11 744 405	6 288 744	54%	2 939 132	298 392	10%	-	28 210	#DIV/0!	300 000	62 719	21%	14 983 537	6 678 065	45%
Livestock & Marketing Development	3 557 473	1 157 534	33%	1 148 389	78 455	7%	629 529	87 980	14%	-	17 311	#DIV/0!	5 335 391	1 341 279	25%
Community Development & Business Options	3 279 576	1 622 745	49%	112 022	439 918	393%	-	45 600	#DIV/0!	1 366 462	133 840	10%	4 758 060	2 242 104	47%
<b>Total</b>	<b>24 799 233</b>	<b>15 320 895</b>	<b>61.78%</b>	<b>7 333 377</b>	<b>3 190 447</b>	<b>43.51%</b>	<b>2 855 906</b>	<b>193 178</b>	<b>6.76%</b>	<b>1 666 462</b>	<b>247 126</b>	<b>14.83%</b>	<b>36 654 978</b>	<b>18 951 646</b>	<b>52%</b>

**Table 5B: Financial performance including commitments by financier by component (USD) as at 30/09/2015**

Component	IFAD loan				Government				State				Beneficiaries				Total			
	Appr.	Signed and Committed	Act. As at Sept 30, 2015	%	Appr.	Signed and Committed	Act. As at Sept 30, 2015	%	Appr.	Signed and Committed	Act. As at Sept 30, 2015	%	Appr.	Signed and Committed	Act. As at Sept 30, 2015	%	Appr.	Signed and Committed	Act. As at Sept 30, 2015	%
Policy and Strategies	6 217 779		6 251 872	101%	3 133 834		2 373 682	76%	2 226 377	-	31 388	1%	-	-	33 256	#DIV/0!	11 577 990	-	8 690 198	75%
Natural Resources Development	11 744 405	712 243	6 288 744	60%	2 939 132	273 894	298 392	19%	-	-	28 210	#DIV/0!	300 000	-	62 719	21%	14 983 537	986 137	6 678 065	51%
Livestock & Marketing Development	3 557 473		1 157 534.24	33%	1 148 389		78 455	7%	629 529	-	87 980	14%	-	-	17 311	#DIV/0!	5 335 391	-	1 341 279	25%
Community Development & Business Options	3 279 576		1 622 744.93	49%	1 112 022		439 918	393%	-	-	45 600	#DIV/0!	1 366 462	-	133 840	10%	4 758 060	-	2 242 104	47%
<b>Total</b>	<b>24 799 233</b>	<b>712 243</b>	<b>15 320 895</b>	<b>65%</b>	<b>7 333 377</b>	<b>273 894</b>	<b>3 190 447</b>	<b>47%</b>	<b>2 855 906</b>	<b>-</b>	<b>193 178</b>	<b>7%</b>	<b>1 666 462</b>	<b>-</b>	<b>247 126</b>	<b>15%</b>	<b>36 654 978</b>	<b>986 137</b>	<b>18 951 646</b>	<b>54%</b>

**Table 5C: IFAD loan disbursements (SDR, as at 20/10/2015)**

Category	Category description	Original	Revised	Disbursement	W/A pending	Balance (excluding pending WA)	(%age) disbursement excluding pending WA
		Allocation	Allocation				
1	Civil Works	5 650 000	5 440 000	3 433 004	362 494	2 006 996	63.1%
2	Vehicles & equipment						
2.a	Vehicles	650 000	820 000	674 246		145 754	82.2%
2.b	Machinery and Other	700 000	1 000 000	923 430	6 687	76 570	92.3%
3	Technical assist., training & studies					-	
3.a	Technical assistance and training	3 030 000	4 290 000	2 249 291	103 494	2 040 709	52.4%
3.b	Inputs and materials	170 000	1 360 000	32 511		1 327 489	2.4%
4	Grant	1 180 000	1 320 000	272 437	40 367	1 047 563	20.6%
5a	Salaries & Allowances	1 700 000	1 420 000	1 153 002	21 683	266 998	81.2%
5b	Operation & Maintenance	400 000	1 150 000	744 018	22 327	405 982	64.7%
	Authorised Allocation			1 111 928		(1 111 928)	0.0%
	Unallocated	3 320 000				-	
	<b>Total</b>	<b>16 800 000</b>	<b>16 800 000</b>	<b>10 593 868</b>	<b>557 051</b>	<b>6 206 132</b>	<b>63.1%</b>

## Appendix 6: Compliance with legal covenants: Status of implementation

Section	Covenant	Target/Action Due Date	Compliance Status/Date	Remarks
<b>Section 3.03-a</b>	Lead Project Agency (LPA) shall open and maintain a Project Account.	Before project inception	Complied with	Project Account opened before loan effectiveness
<b>Section 3.05-b</b>	The Borrower shall deposit counterpart funds in an Initial amount of Euro 240,000 and shall replenish BDA project account quarterly in advance to fund AWPB.	Before project inception/continued	Partially complied with	GoS transferred the initial amount to the project account at project inception. However, but replenishment is not happening on quarterly basis.
<b>Section 3.06</b>	The LPA and each other project party shall procure all items financed by the loan in accordance with shedule-4	Immediately/continued	Partially complied with	Procurement practices are in line with the FA, with exception of few cases where the BDA deviated from the prescribed procurement method due to the field circumstances and difficulty to apply the mentioned method.
<b>Schedule-3A, 4</b>	The Borrower shall ensure that all vehicles procured under the project are insured and used for project implementation	Immediately/continued	Complied with	All projects vehicles are fully insured.
<b>Section 5.02-b</b>	The Borrower shall have the financial statements (FS) relating to the project audited each fiscal year and shall submit certified audit reports to the Fund no later than 6 months after year end	Annually	Complied with	Audit reports submitted to IFAD annually, 2014 audit report was submitted by the deadline.
<b>Section 4.02</b>	The Borrower through the LPA shall submit to the Fund semi-annual and consolidated annual progress reports	Annually	Partially complied with	Progress reports are submitted to IFAD but with some delays.
<b>Section 3.02-b</b>	Draft AWPB to be submitted to the Fund for its comments and approval not later than 60 days before the beginning of the relevant project year		Not complied with	The final version of AWPB for FY 2015 was submitted in June due to the need to revise the AWPB several times, particularly the new template for procurement plan provided by IFAD.
<b>Section 4.03</b>	A mid-term review to be carried jointly by the borrower and the Fund during the fourth project year	4 <sup>th</sup> anniversary of the project	Complied with	A mid-term review was done jointly by IFAD and GoS in September 2012
<b>Schedule-3. B. 1.1</b>	Project Implementation Manual to be prepared not later than 90 days after the effective date	90 days after project effectiveness	Not complied with	The Lead Project Agency prepared a draft PIM but is yet to be finalized and sent to IFAD for concurrence



## Appendix 7: Knowledge management: Learning and Innovation

### I. Young Professionals Programme – Case study

#### **Hanan Babibker is bridging the gap between men and women at community level**

Mobilizing communities in remote rural areas often requires patience and persistence, but in the end it's rewarding in many ways. That is the experience of Hanan Babibker, who joined the BIRD Young Professionals programme in January 2015. During the past months she has been working with communities in Gezira state, teaching them about community mobilization, vegetable home gardens and other activities of the Butana Integrated Rural Development Project.

With a university degree in Agricultural Engineering, some work experience from the Faculty of Agricultural Engineering at the University of Sudan in Khartoum, Hanan was still struggling with finding work. When she heard about the YP-programme from former colleagues at the Faculty of Agricultural Engineering she immediately decided to apply, and got accepted.

When I prepared myself for the challenges of working in the field I was a bit worried about whether the communities would accept me, but they accepted me immediately, Hanan says.

One of the key ideas with the BIRD YP-programme is for Young Professionals to spend more time in the communities, as a way of building trust and intensifying the efforts of mobilizing targeted communities. This means that Hanan, and her other YP-colleagues spend between ten and twenty-one days living together with the communities, understanding how they function and what their weaknesses and strengths are. This close cooperation builds trust between the BIRD's development teams and the communities, and makes it easier to spot weaknesses in the implementation of project activities.

In one community I realised that the local extension agents were not conducting regular meetings with the community members, so I decided to do an effort and mobilize them and make sure that meetings were held, Hanan says.

As an induction training the Young Professionals receive trainings on participatory learning methods, farmer school management, water harvesting, integrated pest management, and based on their educational background a work plan and specific responsibilities are worked out. With almost ten months of working in the YP-programme Hanan has already gained a lot of experience. She is involved in mobilizing a number of communities, has been training women in vegetable farming and how to organize and manage the farms. She has also been involved in livestock, communal rangeland and forest activities.

One of the things I learned was that the community El Rizgab El Goba in Gezira state had their own terminology for certain things. They use a local name for water melon, so I started using their own terminology so that we could understand and better communicate with each other.

In the beginning Hanan had difficulties in mobilizing community members. Men and women did not have a habit of meeting together and she had to find innovative ways of inviting people to meetings.

I decided to sit with a groups of women outside the local mosque and in the evenings when the men passed by, I invited them to sit down and talk about various topics. With time they started trusting me and more and more men joined, Hanan says.

The BIRD Young Professionals have made a huge contribution to the mobilization of communities. With their help community meetings are organized and held on a regular basis, communities are trained in social skills, extension services and management of community based organizations. The Young Professionals also contribute to the collection of data for monitoring and evaluation of project



interventions and help BIRDP Project staff with the formation of Saving and Credit Groups. The programme is one of mutual benefits, Hanan has gained a lot of new experience in the past ten months.

I'm happy to have learned about how communities can organize themselves around natural resources. Water committees are a good example, where communities set up water fees and transfer the gains into investments in school buildings, she explains.

In the future Hanan hopes to get the opportunity to continue her work in the rural development sector in the Butana region, but she has also been inspired to start her own business in poultry or vegetable production. Many of her YP-colleagues have received employment offers thanks to their experience with BIRDP.

The YP-programme has been of great advantage to us Young Professionals, who trying to build our carriers, Hanan says.

Up to date a total of 137 Young Professionals have been contracted with the BIRDP.

State	Y 2013			Y 2014			Y 2015			Total		
	Male	Female	Total	Male	Female	Total	Male	Female	Total	Male	Female	Total
River Nile	1	3	4	2	20	22	0	17	17	3	40	43
Khartoum	2	3	5	2	10	12	2	9	11	6	22	28
Gazeera	2	2	2	6	9	15	4	7	11	12	18	28
Gadarif	2	4	6	2	10	12	2	0	2	6	14	20
Kassala	2	3	5	2	5	7	1	5	6	5	13	18
Total	9	15	22	14	54	68	9	38	47	32	107	137

## II. BIRD Knowledge Management Strategy

The BIRDP has developed a KM Strategy to guide its work of KM activities.

The project Knowledge Management Strategy (KMS) based on the ideas and approaches that lead and help in fulfilling in a sustainable manner the livelihoods and resilience to drought of the poor rural households as well as achieving the development objectives of the project, which include:

- i. Establishing a coherent and cost effective governance framework that ensures a regulated access to land and water resources of the Butana;
- ii. Improving the access and bargaining position of women and men in the marketing of livestock;
- iii. Developing the capacity of community based organizations to engage in environmentally sound, socially and gender equitable development initiatives and management of natural resources.

The project learning and knowledge strategy flow from the open culture of the Butana region and the local community practices in various fields, including natural resource management which supported by the project to fulfill and adapt the community knowledge with overall goal of the project.

### Steps of implement the strategy

1. Develop the capabilities of the different development teams in related aspects of knowledge production through intensive training programmes.
2. Gradually establishing a sustainable culture of learning collaborated with primarily focusing on field processes and beneficiaries practices. The BIRDP already encouraged communities to establish

community network as methodology of practice that use action learning to solve NRM problems as well as spread and exchange innovation.

3. Linking community practices, initiatives and ideas with the project plans/activities and exchanging knowledge among communities in coordination and cooperation with development team.
4. BIRDP continuously will develop the process of dissemination and sharing the good practices and knowledge through the available means of knowledge sharing at local, regional and globe.

The primary keys for knowledge management depend on a number of basic steps which include:

5. Identify a limited number of knowledge themes, derived from the BIRDP interventions and the good community practices and knowledge.
6. Built the knowledge management skills gradually on the current assets and operations and partnerships.
7. Identify specific instruments needed to improve learning and knowledge-sharing at the community level as well as project level.
8. Identify the cultural and behavioral changes needed for implementation and the incentives and training that must be put in place to bring these changes.
9. Ensure cost-effectiveness by harnessing resources and efforts and integrating them into a coherent and time bound results framework. The BIRDP Knowledge Management Strategy has three main strategic sub-components as follows:

Sub-components	Implementation Statues
Strengthening knowledge-sharing and learning processes; equipping BIRDP with a more supportive knowledge-sharing and learning infrastructure; fostering partnerships for broader knowledge-sharing and learning.	The project contracted two training workshops in knowledge production different skills for 40 development team members the training included the following: 1- The project Internet service system has been upgraded, by raising the service speed in the project headed to 1 GB and in Gadarif and Khartoum coordination units to 256 MB for each 2- Special training course was organized in knowledge-sharing Included the following: - Communication skills - Formulation and preparation of the success stories of local knowledge - Data collection and analysis - Photography and video skills (basic shots and camera movements) - Hands-on training (on the production and dissemination of knowledge materials).
Promoting a supportive culture of knowledge sharing and learning using most available knowledge management measures (at the levels of community-networks, regional networks, and strategic partnerships such as exchange visits, learning route, workshops, meetings, radio, TV and the internet portals).	During 2014 the project implemented the following: 1- Establish a project page on the Internet in July 2014 ( <a href="http://www.butanaonline.org">www.butanaonline.org</a> ). 2- Recording and broadcasting of radio session about BDA and its development projects, the session broadcasted twice by the Algazera State radio and the Sudanese national radio. 3-Recording and broadcasting of television session about the project, broadcasted by Sudan National Television. 4- The project continued uploading and dissemination different topics, pictures on its site on Kenana Online Portal, the number of visitors to the site for the period from January to November 2014 reached 23,436. 5- Since the establishment of the project site on the internet, the project uploaded about 70 different topics including success stories, reports, success practices, etc., visitor of the site reached 30,000 visitors since the establishment of the site in September 2014.
Implement the strategy through a clear distribution of roles and responsibilities within BIRDP stakeholders in order to provide for efficiency and accountability.	1- The DTs at state level have been trained on the basics of production and dissemination of knowledge. 2- Two of the project cadres were trained on how to manage and develop the project website.

### III. Inventory of BIRD Knowledge management 2013-2015

#### Knowledge by year

#	Knowledge method	Unit	Year 2013	Year 2014	Year 2015	Total
1	Establishment of the project sub-page on Kenana Online Portal June 2013	Sub-page	1	0	0	1
2	Establishment of the project page on the Internet in July 2014 (www.butanaonline.org).	Page	0	1	0	1
3	Community exchange visits	Visit	3	6	6	15
4	Development team/SCUs exchange visits	Visit	2	3	3	8
5	Village day (sharing/ dissemination the results &Impacts of Introduction of guar as fodder crop to improve animal productivity)	Day	0	2	3	5
6	Radio sessions	Session	5	13	45	63
7	TV sessions	Session	2	8	12	22
8	Learning route - Livestock (Kenya )	Learning route	0	1	0	1
9	Learning route in NRM (Kenya )	Learning route	0	0	1	1
10	Learning route on framers organizations (Morocco )	Learning route	0	1	0	1
11	Learning route on water harvesting (Egypt)	Learning route	0	1	0	1
12	Learning route on water harvesting (Egypt)	Learning route	0	1		1
13	Learning route (Turkish)	Learning route	0	0	1	1
14	Learning route on gender and microfinance (Uganda )	Learning route	0	0	1	1
15	Learning route on women development in Melissa (in cooperation with Gadarif State)	Learning route	0	0	1	1
16	International workshops on IMP (Germans)	Workshop	0	0	1	1
17	Study Tour in NRM (Ethiopia)	Study Tour	0	1	0	1
18	Documentary films	Film	0	3	8	11
19	Participation the National Knowledge Share Fair	Share Fair	0	0	1	1
20	Designing and production of extension materials	Material	2	3	4	9
21	Radio extension sessions	Session	5	10	16	31
22	Conducting NRM forum/workshops at community level	Forum/Workshop	0	8	9	17
23	Conducting NRM forum/workshops at locality level	Forum/Workshop	0	0	9	9
24	Radio listening group	Group	0	0	6	6
25	Participate in the annual flower exhibition	Exhibition	1	2	2	5
26	Participate in the annual Agriculture fair	Fair	0	0	1	1
27	Production of short films dedicated to address specific issues	Film	1	3	6	10
28	Deployment of some topics on project activities in publications / international journals	Topics	0	3	0	3
29	Production of knowledge plates(Standing plates)	Plate	0	4	12	16
30	Specialized seminars and lectures	Seminar/Lecture	0	2	3	5
31	Writing and publishing /uploading success stories	success stories	0	8	5	13
32	Production of brochures	Topics	3	5	5	13

## **Knowledge by state**

Unit	River Nil	Khartoum	Jazeera	Gadarif	Kassala	BDA	Total	Remarks
Sub-page	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	October. 2012 ( <a href="http://www.kenanaonline.com">http://www.kenanaonline.com</a> )
Page	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	July 2014 ( <a href="http://www.butanaonline.org">www.butanaonline.org</a> )
Visit	4	3	3	3	2	0	15	
Visit	2	2	2	1	1	0	8	
Session	1	1	1	2	0	0	5	
Session	28	2	6	2	23	2	63	State and National Radio
Session	2	2	1	5	11	1	22	State, National and individual TVs
Learning route	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	5Persons from ( 3 BIRD staff + 2 SCUs staff)
Learning route	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	12 Persons from SCUs staff
Learning route	1	0	0	0	0	0	1	3 persons from BIRD staff
Learning route			1				1	
Learning route	1						1	
Learning route	1						1	
Learning route						1	1	3 persons from BIRD staff
Learning route				1			1	(community development extension Gadarif SCU)
Workshop	0	0	1				1	In cooperation with Ministry of Agrc. Khartoum State
Study Tour	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	13 persons ( 3 from BDA + 10 SCUs staff)
Film	5	1	1	1	1	2	11	
Share Fair						1	1	
Material	3	2	2	1	1	0	9	Includes, leaflets, brochures and extension books...etc
Session	9	3	8	4	7		31	
Forum/Workshop	3	2	4	4	4	0	17	
Forum/Workshop	2	1	2	1	3	0	9	
Group	0	0	0	6	0	0	6	
Exhibition	0	2	3	0	0	0	5	
Fair	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	
Film	2	3	1	2	2	0	10	Draw attention to some of the issues and problems related to the activities and interventions of the project (such as natural resource management)
Topics	1	1	0	0	0	1	3	Published in Farming-matters (Netherlands journal)
Plate	1	6	1	1	1	6	16	
Seminar/Lecture			1	1	1	2	5	
success stories	3	2	4	2	2	0	13	Publishing uploading on the project web-site + portal in Kenanaonline
Topics	2	2	2	2	2	3	13	English and Arabic in different topics