

Tajikistan

Livestock and Pasture Development Project II Supervision Report

Main report and appendices

Mission Dates: 7 to 20 October 2018
Document Date: 22/01/2019
Project No. 2000000977
Report No. 4970-TJ

Near East, North Africa and Europe Division
Programme Management Department

Abbreviations and Acronyms

ADB	Asian Development Bank
AKF	Aga Khan Foundation
ATAC	Agriculture Training and Advisory Centre
BCR	Benefit Cost Ratio
CACILM	Central Asian Countries' Initiative on Land Management
CAMP	Central Asia Mountain Partnership Programme
CBA	Cost Benefit Analysis
CD	Community Development
CF	Community Facilitator
CIG	Common Interest Group
CIS	Commonwealth of Independent States
CO	Community Organisation
DPO	District Project Officer
CU	Cattle Unit
EBRD	European Bank for Reconstruction and Development
EC	European Commission
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organisation of the United Nations
GOT	Government of Tajikistan
HH	household
IFAD	International Fund for Agricultural Development
IGA	Income Generating Activity
IRR	Internal Rate of Return
LPDP	Pasture and Livestock Development Project
MOA	Ministry of Agriculture
MSDSP	Mountain Societies Development Support Programme
MTR	Mid-term Review (by IFAD and GOT)
MWRLR	Ministry of Water Resources and Land Reclamation
TAAS	Tajik Academy of Agricultural Sciences
NARS	National Agricultural Research System
NGO	Non-governmental Organisation
NPV	Net Present Value
OMPP	Operational Manual for Procurement Procedures
PCR	Project Completion Report
FMM	Financial Management Manual
PIM	Project Implementation Manual
CLPMP	Community Livestock and Pasture Management Plan
PMT	Pasture Management Trust
PMU	Project Management Unit
PRSP	Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper
PSC	Project Steering Committee
PUU	Pasture Users Union
PUUB	PUU Board
SCLMG	State Committee for Land Management and Geodesy
SOE	Statement of Expenditures
SVIS	State Veterinary Inspection Services
SU	Sheep Unit
TA	Technical Assistance
TJS	Tajikistani Somoni , Currency unit of Tajikistan
TOR	Terms of Reference
TT	Technical Team
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
USD	United States Dollar

VO	Village Organisation
WA	Withdrawal Application
WB	World Bank
WIGG	Women Income Generating Groups
WFP	World Food Programme

A. Project Overview

Region:	Near East, North Africa and Europe	Project at Risk Status:	Not at risk
Country:	Tajikistan	Environmental and Social Category:	B
Project Name:	Livestock and Pasture Development Project II	Climate Risk Classification:	2
Project Id:	2000000977	Executing Institution:	Ministry of Agriculture
Project Type:	Livestock	Implementing Institutions:	not available yet
CPM:	Mikael Kauttu		
Project Director:	.		
Project Area:	Districts of Vose, Kulob, Dangara		

Approval Date	12/12/2015	Last audit receipt	22/06/2018
Signing Date	03/02/2016	Date of Last SIS Mission	20/10/2018
Entry into Force Date	03/02/2016	Number of SIS Missions	2
Available for Disbursement Date	23/11/2016	Number of extensions	0
First Disbursement Date	28/11/2016	Effectiveness lag	2 months
MTR Date	not available yet		
Original Completion Date	31/03/2021		
Current Completion Date	31/03/2021		
Financial Closure	not available yet		

Project total financing

IFAD Financing breakdown	ASAP Trust Fund	\$5,000,000
	IFAD	\$8,700,000
	Debt Sustainability Framework	\$8,700,000
Domestic Financing breakdown	Beneficiaries	\$1,348,000
	National Government	\$446,000
Co-financing breakdown,		
Project total financing		\$24,194,000

Current Mission

Mission Dates:	7 to 20 October 2018
Days in the field:	10 to 13 October 2018 (4 days)
Mission composition:	Mr Mikael Kauttu (Country Programme Manager, IFAD and Mission Leader), Mr Swandip Sinha (Rural Development Specialist, Team Leader); Mr Ben Norton (Pasture Management Specialist); Mr Zholdoshbek Dadybaev (Livestock Specialist); Mr Rahul Antao (Sociologist); Mr Malek Sahli (Senior Finance Officer, IFAD); Mr Anvar Mamkulov (Procurement Specialist). The mission was accompanied by Ms Zainab Kenjaeva, IFAD Country Presence in Tajikistan
Field sites visited:	Khatlon region

B. Overall Assessment

Key SIS Indicator #1	Ø	Rating	Key SIS Indicator #2	Ø	Rating
Likelihood of Achieving the Development Objective		5	Assessment of the Overall Implementation Performance		5

Effectiveness and Developmental Focus	5	Project Management	5
Effectiveness	5	Quality of Project Management	5
Targeting and Outreach	5	Knowledge Management	5
Gender equality & women's participation	5	Value for Money	4
Agricultural Productivity	5	Coherence between AWPB and Implementation	5
Nutrition		Performance of M&E System	5
Adaptation to Climate Change	4	Requirements of Social, Environmental and Climate Assessment Procedures (SECAP)	4

Sustainability and Scaling-up	5	Financial Management and Execution	5
Institutions and Policy Engagement	5	Acceptable Disbursement Rate	3
Partnership-building	5	Quality of Financial Management	6
Human and Social Capital and Empowerment	5	Quality and Timeliness of Audit	6
Quality of Beneficiary Participation	5	Counterparts Funds	6
Responsiveness of Service Providers	5	Compliance with Loan Covenants	5
Environment and Natural Resource Management	5	Procurement	5
Exit Strategy	5		
Potential for Scaling-up	5		

Relevance	5
------------------	----------

C. Mission Objectives and Key Conclusions

Background and Main Objective of the Mission

1. The Livestock and Pasture Development Project, second phase (LPDP II) is supported by the International Fund for Agricultural Development (IFAD) with a loan of US\$ 8.7 million and a grant of US\$ 8.7 million. ASAP has also contributed US\$ 5 million to the project for implementing climate adaptation activities (IFAD Loan No. 2000001439/DSF Grant No. 2000001438/ASAP Grant 2000001437). The project completion date is 30 September 2020. LPDP II's goal is to contribute to the reduction of poverty by enhancing livestock productivity and climate resilience in a sustainable manner. It is expected benefit 38,000 smallholder livestock households through the implementation of three components: (i) Institutional Development; (ii) Productivity Enhancement and Improved Animal Health; and (iii) Pasture Development and Diversification for Vulnerability Reduction. The Project Management Unit (PMU) of the Ministry of Agriculture located in Dushanbe, in coordination with a regional office in Kulab and two project implementation partners is responsible for project implementation in the five districts of Dangara, Farkhor, Hamadoni, Kulob and Vose.
2. An IFAD mission visited Tajikistan from 7 to 20 October 2018 to carry out the supervision of LPDP II. The last supervision mission in October 2017 confirmed that LPDP II was on track to achieve most of its targets. The objective of the current mission was to assess achievements against targets, interim project impact, efficiency and effectiveness of project management, compliance with loan covenants, sustainability arrangements, and in general pertinence and validity of project design. The mission also assessed the issues highlighted in the previous IFAD supervision mission and follow-up missions. The Mission visited all the five project districts and held on-site discussions with representatives from 24 PUUs, 9 Women Income Generating Groups (WIGGs), and several Common Interest Groups (CIGs). It also visited fodder crop demonstration sites and infrastructure investment sites. It held detailed discussions with the staff members at the PMU, regional staff, district project officers and the community facilitators involved in project implementation. The mission met and briefed the representatives of the Ministry of Finance, Ministry of Agriculture, Ministry of Economic Development and Trade, State Committee on Investments and State Property Management, State Committee on Environmental Protection, Tajik Agrarian University, State Veterinarian Inspection under Food Security Committee, Pasture Meliorative Trust under the Ministry of Agriculture and FAO about the key findings. All the PMU staff members attended the wrap-up meeting organised on 19 October 2018.

Key Mission Agreements and Conclusions

1. The project has demonstrated excellent physical and financial progress with the formation of all the 180 PUUs. It has already reached close to the 38,000 beneficiary outreach figures set in the PDR. A total of 215 (6,362 members) CIGs have been supported and 22 (211 members) WIGGs and have been formed and supported by microenterprise activities. The Ministry of Agriculture is scaling up the PUU model outside the scope of the project, and has with the help of the PMU established 22 PUUs.
 2. **Distribution of veterinary packages:** The Government of Republic of Tajikistan (GRT) has passed a resolution on 29 December 2017 transferring the function of the State Veterinary Inspection (SVI), which was supposed to partner with the project, to the newly established Food Security Committee (FSC) under the GRT. This move by the Government has developed obstacles in LPDP II's approach of supporting private veterinarians as all private veterinarians have become official employees of the FSC and their monthly salaries are paid from the FSC budget.
 3. The project has procured 60 veterinary packages for distribution to private veterinarians against 10% beneficiary contribution. The Financing Agreement does not allow distribution of such packages to initially targeted veterinarians, as they have now become state veterinarians. The mission recommends that the project should follow-up with the FSC the scope of distributing the equipment to private veterinarians who might serve the targeted PUUs. If such a solution is not possible, the project will need to explore and propose other purposes for distributing the equipment in line with the Financing Agreement. Also, it is recommended that the project can support the FSC with exchange visits and consultations for the developing and sharing of the strategy for the veterinary service.
- **Productivity of assets:** Starting late in 2017 the project has so far supplied agricultural machinery sets to 150 PUUs. The project has also provided some guidance to the PUUs regarding the annual revenue they should earn to recover the costs of the machinery within a specified time. Although the project is only in the second year of implementation around 10% of the member households in the visited PUUs have used these services and the PUUs have earned 15% of the potential revenue (around 25,000 TJS per PUU) from the machinery services. The utilisation of the machinery has been affected by a drought in many parts of the project area that reduced demand for these services as well as delivery of some of the machinery after peak season (end of December 2017). The average cost of delivery of these services in the PUUs visited by the mission is above 50% of the revenue and mostly comprises remuneration to the driver, accountant and sometimes the head of PUU. The project should monitor and initiate steps to ensure that the PUUs fully use the potential of the machinery. Additionally, asset utilisation plans and revisiting the costs of delivering the machinery services can contribute to strengthening the financial position of the PUUs.
1. **Collective business development for WIGGs:** WIGGs are informal groups. In the case of rosehip production and processing enterprise, the project has promoted collective farming by the group members. This will strengthen

group cohesion and provide experience towards collective processing and marketing arrangements planned for the future. The project can further support these groups with adapting the business plans to the specific circumstances and opportunities prevalent for each of the groups. This could include consultation to explore the more effective use of the assets (e.g. refrigerators, driers) and marketing.

D. Overview and Project Progress

- **Component 1: Institutional Development**

- Sub-component 1.1: Development of Community Organisations

1. The project has completed the establishment of 180 PUUs with 37,325 (13% women headed) member HHs in as many communities. Additionally, it has formed 22 WIGGs (214 women members) and 215 CIGs (6,362 members). Start-up equipment such as computers, printers, tables have been supplied to all the PUUs. A total of 72 larger PUUs have received mobile offices. The achievements of the LPDPI was highlighted to members of PUUs, CIGs and Jomoat local governments through local study tours. PUU board members have received pasture management training. Based on the proposed CLPMPs, the project has started investments across the 180 PUUs related to agricultural machinery services development, pasture infrastructure development, livestock breeding, fodder crop improvement and income diversification.
2. PUUs follow impressive record keeping system that is regularly updated and checked by the community facilitators during monitoring visits. They have also completed a wealth ranking exercise and adopted policies to provide more benefits to the poor HHs, for example by supplying machinery services free of charge. Women's representation in the board is satisfactory consisting of 449 (30%) out of 1,502 board members.
3. PUUs are still in the initial stages of development there is some variability in their quality with regards to regular meetings, and levels of financial success. These can be addressed through stronger monitoring and on-site capacity building by the community facilitators that should also check the performance of the assets and financial returns. The process of strengthening PUUs can also benefit from categorising PUUs into good, moderate, weak categories based on a set of physical and financial performance criteria and directing more capacity building inputs to the weaker PUUs. There is scope for consolidating the meticulously maintained income and expenses into readily available summary income statement and balance sheet and displaying these publicly in the PUU offices.

- **Sub-component 1.2: Advancement of Policy and Legal Framework and Strengthening National Institutions**

1. **Improvement of the pasture law:** The project has initiated steps towards amendments to the Pasture Law based on the experiences and success stories of the first phase. It established a working group comprising members from the Parliament, related Ministries and agencies. This was followed by two district level public discussion forums with the participation of representatives from relevant parliamentary committees, head of districts and PUU representatives. These steps resulted in around 70 amendments and the new Law, after incorporating these amendments has been sent to the government for consideration and is expected to be adopted by the end of 2018.
2. **District pasture commissions:** The project has started the establishment of a district pasture commissions in each project district comprising representatives of the local authorities, jamoats and PUUs. The commissions conduct meetings on quarterly basis to discuss and resolve pasture land regulation and related conflicts. As a result, 6 PUUs from Project districts received Certificate for pasture land use.
3. **Pasture Meliorative Trust (PMT):** The Pasture Meliorative Trust is a de facto Pasture Department within the Ministry of Agriculture charged with supporting PUUs throughout Tajikistan. LPDP II has rehabilitated the Trust's buildings and has provided office equipment and two vehicles. Four LPDP II specialists work closely with the Trust, including the PMU legal/policy team and GIS specialist. The PMT employs 78 staff in five regional offices with budget from the MoA. In summer 2018 it accepted five interns from the Tajik Agrarian University and PMT will likely employ them upon graduation. PMT activities include disinfection of livestock on their way to summer pastures, pasture monitoring, repairing roads and bridges and improving pasture by planting of species such as Saxaul in cultivated strips. The PMT staff conducted pasture monitoring and inventoried and mapped cattle track roads jointly with LPDP II staff. The PMT has also established 22 new PUUs in 3 Districts outside the Khatlon region following the LPDP model.
4. **Tajik Agrarian University:** The project has supported the development of Baccalaureate and Magister degrees in Sustainable Pasture Management in the Faculty of Agronomy. Classrooms and laboratories have been refurbished and supplied with modern equipment. Beginning September 2018, TAU accepted 18 students enrolling in their first year of a four-year degree. Ten of the 18 received LPDP scholarships to pay their tuition fees for the full 4 years. The students who perform well on state tests are awarded scholarships. A further 60 scholarships will be awarded next year across a group of four Faculties, including Agronomy. TAU is planning a workshop in March/April 2019 on climate change impacts on pasture and agricultural land with participation by international specialists.

- **Component 2: Productivity Enhancement and Improved Animal Health:**

- Sub component 2.1: Productivity enhancement

1. **Fodder promotion and production:** Natural pastures have been fertilized with 160 tons of carbamide and superphosphate to increase forage yield in key areas identified by PUUs. Measurements in pasture areas of 28 PUUs showed an average increase of 0.67 t/ha productivity due to fertiliser application. The treated area totals 1,462 ha in 63 PUUs and is not part of the fenced 1ha demonstrations. Seeds from six different kinds of high-yielding fodder crops amounting to 102.34 tons were distributed to 174 CIGs for fodder seed

- production. More than half (61.9 tons) consist of barley seeds, plus corn (19 tons), wheat (9.25 tons), lucerne (8.58 tons) and lesser amounts of Sainfoin and fodder beet. The seed production package included a total of 486 tons of urea and superphosphate fertiliser.
2. Ten Seed Breeding Farms producing fodder seed were selected to supply a revolving Seed Fund with high-quality fodder seeds. The project provided eight of the Seed Breeding Farms with high-quality seeds of wheat 18 tons, barley 21.6 tons, corn 1.5 tons, and alfalfa (400 kg) and fodder beet (60 kg) and carbamide and superphosphate fertiliser. Altogether, the Seed Breeding Farms planted nearly 400 ha and as of September had harvested 405 tons of wheat and 360 tons of barley seed. In their first year, the Seed Breeding Farms were required to return to the project one and a half times the amount of seed they initially received, as a contribution to the revolving Seed Fund. From the Seed Fund, the project supplies PUU members owning farmland with high-quality seed. So far 414 poor HH have received seed from the revolving Seed Fund. The revolving nature of the Fund occurs when, after harvest, those PUU recipients return the equivalent amount of seed to the Seed Fund, which then distributes seed to more smallholders within the PUU.
 3. Some CIG farmers reported yields from the better-quality seeds that were higher than what they normally get from local varieties. In 2018 a widespread and severe drought caused less than average yield in some cases and even total crop loss was reported by some PUUs visited. Where PUU members obtained reasonable yield in 2018, some of the seed was sold but some were given free of charge to poor PUU members, 15 recipients in one case. The PMU is monitoring seed production and distribution, with lists of PUU beneficiaries.
 4. **Conservation agriculture:** Minimum tillage equipment for crop cultivation is recommended and adopted in many parts of the world to conserve soil water and soil fertility. In Tajikistan, however, the silt soils set very hard and farmers traditionally use a mouldboard plough. The mission recommends that the PMU should monitor use of mouldboard ploughs. Where use deviates from best practice (e.g. slopes and other erosion-prone areas) the PMU should intervene with awareness raising and capacity building and other measures as necessary to ensure that use does not contribute to erosion.
 5. **Livestock breed improvement:** As of September 2018, 21 PUUs had been provided with 300 head of Hissar rams, together with a six-month supply of fodder. The target for 2018-2019 is 900 Hissar rams. Hissar rams are now kept in service for only two years before being sold and replaced, to avoid a ram mating with one of his female offspring. LPDP II should explore methods for exercising control over livestock mating for both avoidance of inbreeding and to intentionally improve the gene pool. This could mean running two flocks, one with Hissar rams and the best village ewes, and one with local-breed rams with the less-productive village ewes. In 2018, 37 purebred bulls, each with a six-month fodder supply, were distributed to 37 PUUs and mated with 1210 local cows from 37 PUUs to improve their performance regarding growth rate of calves and higher milk yield. The project supplied 1,800 units of pure breed bull semen (Brown Swiss and Black-and-White breeds) for artificial insemination. As of September 2018, 850 cows have been inseminated. This cattle breed-improvement effort is funded by the project but the distribution of bulls and the artificial insemination is managed by the Ministry of Agriculture. Results will be available next year.

● Sub component 2.2: Improved animal health

1. The project has compiled a list of 60 vets and procured 60 veterinary packages comprising veterinary drugs, office equipment, veterinary equipment. However, there is a delay in their distribution to the veterinarians and they are stored in Dushanbe. This gap has arisen because of the GRT's resolution dated 29 December 2017, to transfer the function of SVI to the newly-established Food Security Committee (FSC) under the GRT. Currently, after reorganization of SVI, all private veterinarians have become government employees which is no longer aligned with the LPDP II's approach of supporting private veterinarians. The mission recommends that the project should follow-up with the FSC the scope of distributing the equipment to private veterinaries who might serve the targeted PUUs. If such a solution is not possible, the project will need to explore and propose other purposes for distributing the equipment in line with the Financing Agreement. Also, the project can support the FSC with exchange visits and consultations for the developing and sharing of the strategy for the veterinary service. For the long term, the development of a private veterinary service – in consultation with OIE and relevant partners – is still the most efficient way to organise the sector.
2. A total of 15 sets of tools for artificial insemination of cows has been procured and distributed in the project area. IFAD's "no objection" has been obtained for the construction of a district veterinary laboratory requested by the government. An assessment of the State Veterinary Services has been conducted and Animal Health Plans have been elaborated as parts of the CLPMPs developed by PUUs.
3. **Component 3: Pasture Development and Diversification for Vulnerability Reduction:**

● Sub component 3.1: Community Resilience Pasture Management and Investments

1. **Pasture rotations:** All 180 PUUs for LPDP II have been established; they have prepared CLPMPs and have developed pasture rotation plans that are exhibited in schematic form on the walls of PUU offices. These plans show that problems identified by the last Supervision Mission in 2017 (too few grazing units in the rotation and rest periods too short) have been solved. However, the schematic illustrations of pasture plans show two consecutive years with a repeating pattern of the grazing sequence which can place heavy grazing pressure on these pasture plants at a regular calendar date and suppress their presence in the pasture. The National Pasture Specialist is aware of this difficulty and will amend pasture rotation plans to

- avoid repeat patterns from year to year.
2. Some PUUs mentioned real or expected benefits from the pasture rotations implemented in 2018. Chief among these are more forage available, bigger animals with higher calf and lamb growth rates, and higher milk yield. The project should systematically collect and review hard evidence of the impact of pasture rotation from the LPDP 1 experience to fine-tune pasture rotation practices in future. Pasture rotation should be documented to create a data-based model for other countries to follow.
 3. **Drinking water for livestock in pastures:** The project is overcoming water shortages in pastures by the construction of concrete troughs and water-supply pipelines. A concrete trough served by a 10-km pipeline has been constructed by the project in southern Dangara District. The project is speeding up the process of supplying water points in summer pastures.
 4. **Climate-change resilient interventions:** Procurement has started for establishing 86 demonstrations covering a total of 245 ha where various tree species will be planted. The young trees will be planted in waterboxes, which is a constructive intervention suitable for use in relatively small enclosures. In other suitable landscape configurations, the project can consider harvesting overland water flow towards swales and depressions where species resilient to climate change could be planted, such as Saxaul which is not consumed by livestock but provides shade and wind protection. Additionally, WIGGs could be engaged in the exploitation of sites where water has been harvested by planting and caring for trees and shrubs of economic value, such as fruit and nut-producing trees and Rosa canina for rose-hip production.
 5. **Demonstration plots:** The project has established 22 demonstration plots of 1 ha in the natural pasture. Altogether 20 PUUs have set up demonstration plots; two PUUs have 2 ha plots. The demonstration plots are fenced and show the potential forage production and vegetation changes that occur without livestock grazing. In late May/June the plots are estimated for plant biomass using a chart of average plant height against % cover developed by Professor Madaminov of the Botanical Institute. Demonstration plot data are stored in the M&E unit. They should also be shared with the host PUU, which is not done at present. On Mission field visits, PUU members expressed very positive impressions of the plant growth inside the plots, even in the dry drought-affected District of Farkhor. With just the simple action of fencing 1 ha, the response to controlling livestock access is clear, and the necessity for pasture rotation to capture that extra growth is clear to the PPUs.

● Sub component 3.2: Income Diversification

1. A total of 22 women's groups (214 members) have been formed and supported with microenterprise development investments. Half of the groups have selected rosehip cultivation and processing, while the rest are engaged in milk collection, marketing and honey production. The mission visited 8 such groups involved in rosehip and dairy milk production and observed that these were focused on women from poor, low-income HHs. The project has so far disbursed 22 enterprise grants comprising 67 dairy cows and 7 refrigerators supplied to 7 WIGGs, 210 beehives supplied to 3 WIGGs and rosehip planting, protection, and processing equipment supplied to 12 WIGGs. In the case of rosehip production and processing enterprise, the project has promoted collective farming by the group members. This will strengthen group cohesion and provide experience towards collective processing and marketing arrangements planned. The project can further support these groups with adapting the business plans to the specific circumstances and opportunities prevalent for each of the groups including the more effective use of the assets (e.g. refrigerators).

E. Project implementation

a. Development Effectiveness

Effectiveness and Developmental Focus		
Effectiveness	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 5

Justification of rating

The project has made good physical progress in two years with the establishment of 180 PUUs with 37,325 members, 215 CIGs and 22 WIGGs. More than 150 PUUs have received office infrastructure and agricultural machinery. Crop and livestock variety improvement has been undertaken through the distribution of around 100 tons of seeds and 300 heads of rams. Total disbursement of project budget has reached 41% (US\$ 6.5 million). Beneficiary groups have become more institutionalised, skilful and less vulnerable. There are early indications of improvement in pasture and farm productivity that have the potential to contribute to an increase in income of target households from livestock resources. The implementation progress at output level is on track to complete all project activities within the project period.

Log-Frame Analysis & Main Issues of Effectiveness

1. The project keeps a detailed output geo-referenced dashboard that outlines the infrastructure and machinery and equipment benefiting each village. On the outcome level, the project has developed a comprehensive M&E plan that sets out an outline for M&E as well as detailed instructions to stakeholders. Based on the last supervision mission in October 2017, the project has finalised protocols for periodical data collection of key survey data for management use to monitor key outcomes. Likewise, the PMU had begun to collect data via the suggested e-platform, and the project is conducting the first survey for collecting livestock weight. The system can include participatory M&E data collection on the enterprise activities implemented by the womens' groups.

Development Focus		
Targeting and Outreach	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 5

Justification of rating

The criteria elaborated in the PIM is used for beneficiary selection. The outreach to 180 PUUs reaching 37,805 households has already achieved 99.49% of the life of project target. The PMT has started replicating the PUUs in other districts which will increase the indirect outreach of the project.

Main issues

The project has followed the targeting strategy in the PIM and selected jamoats and villages according to the criteria approved in the PIM. Villages in each jamoat have been selected on the basis of population (between 50 and 500 households) and willingness. Availability of pasture land in the village was also taken into consideration. The project is facing some difficulty with regards to its engagement with private veterinarians. The Government has transferred the functions of the State Veterinarian Inspection (SVI) to the newly-established Food Security Committee (FSC) because of which all private veterinarians have become government employees salaried by the FSC. The project had already identified 60 private vets. But, because of the Government decision they have now become public vets and can no longer be supported by the project. Additionally, the project targeting of the poor can be further strengthened by starting steps for reaching those poor families which do not own any livestock.

Gender equality & women's participation	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 4
---	-----------	--------------------

Justification of rating

The project log frame includes the same gender-focused indicators as the LPDPI, and the project M&E tracks the progress. A gender strategy has been prepared and has taken effect in 2018. An assessment of the capacity of PMU staff to implement a gender-sensitive approach in all project interventions will be conducted next year. Gender studies were conducted in 22 villages to assess gender empowerment and impact. The gender specialist has set a target to complete the study in the rest of the villages by next year.

Main issues

1. **Gender strategy.** The gender focal person in the PMU handles the overall gender development aspects of the project. A gender strategy aligned with Tajikistan policies on gender equality, pasture management and youth policies was developed in May 2018. The four pillars of the strategy are: (i) support to decrease the vulnerability of rural women; (ii) ensure gender equality; (iii) ensure good opportunities for the development of women and youth opportunities and; (iv) involvement of women and youth in income generation activities. In particular, the provision

of rural women with high good quality livestock, agricultural products and packaging and processing assets is prioritized in the strategy. The development of the milk supply chain through the involvement of women in processing and marketing activities is also included in the strategy. A gender action plan should be integrated in the next AWPB to strengthen the implementation of the gender strategy.

2. **Women's Participation and WIGGs:** Around 30% of the board members of the newly established 180 PUUs are women (449 out of 1,502), and three PUUs are headed by a woman. Around 30% of total beneficiaries (1,199 women) benefitted from the training sessions on pasture management.
3. The project has developed 22 women's income generation groups (214 members) under the sub-component 3.2. All the members in these groups are drawn from poorer households. The project has supported these groups with microenterprise investments for diversifying their sources of income. Establishment of performance standards and participatory monitoring systems can aid the further development and performance of these groups.

Agricultural Productivity

Rating: 5

Previous rating: 4

Justification of rating

Results from natural pastures fertilised with carbamide and superphosphate have shown an increase of 0.67tons/ha in forage yield. A total of 174 CIGs have received around 100 tons of seeds of high yielding varieties of barley, corn, lucerne and sainfoin seeds. They reported better-quality seeds compared to the seeds obtained from local varieties. However, in 2018 a widespread and severe drought caused less than average yield in some cases and even total crop loss was reported by some PUUs visited. The PUUs have started implementing pasture rotation plans. Some PUUs mentioned real or expected benefits such as more forage available, bigger animals with higher calf and lamb growth rates, and higher milk yield.

Main issues

1. The main issue that has hampered productivity is a severe drought in many parts of the project area. The PUUs have just started adopting the pasture rotation plans. The full results from this intervention in terms of enhanced productivity be visible in another 2-3 years' time considering the gradual increase in production based on the PUU plans.
2. A total of 300 head of Hissar rams, together with a six-month supply of fodder were provided to 21 PUUs. The rams mate freely in the pastures and the herders have no control over mating. In order prevent a ram from mating from one of its female offspring the fine rams are kept in service for only two years before being sold or replaced. Hissar rams should be mated with the best of local ewes to maximise potential contribution from the better breed.
3. In 2018, 37 purebred bulls out of a planned 215 bulls, each with a six-month fodder supply, were distributed to 37 PUUs to mate with local cows and improve their performance in terms of growth rate of calves and higher milk yield. The project also plans to inseminate 1800 cows with stud bull semen (Brown Swiss and Black-and-White breeds).
4. There are obvious production benefits to livestock breed improvement: higher weight gain, larger animals at maturity, and higher milk yield from cows, the latter two translating into more household income. Individual cross-bred animals can provide levels of production equivalent to production from two or three local-breed livestock, thus increasing production efficiency and reducing the need to keep as many livestock in one household. Also, fewer animals reduce grazing pressure on pasture and reduce the production of Green House Gases (GHG). Furthermore, a large ruminant animal generates less methane (a very potent GHG) per kg of bodyweight compared to a smaller animal. Several issues converge in favour of breed improvement: higher yield per animal, higher income, the option of a smaller herd for the same productivity with reduced grazing pressure on the pasture, and less adverse effects on climate change.

Nutrition

Rating:

Previous rating: 5

Main issues

n/a

Adaptation to Climate Change

Rating: 4

Previous rating: 4

Justification of rating

The project is expected to generate positive impact thanks to improvement in pasture maintenance, grassland productivity, livestock productivity and overall policy and institutional arrangements responsible for NRM in Tajikistan particularly of pastures. The project promotes the "less, but more productive animals" approach - fewer animals reduce grazing pressure on pasture and reduce the production of GHG. A large ruminant animal generates less methane per kg of bodyweight compared to a smaller animal. Also, the introduction of climate-smart crops such as barley is seen as positive since they are more tolerant of dry conditions and have higher digestibility and nutrient content than wheat straw. Finally, the WIGGs are established to diversify income and counter climate vulnerabilities while reducing grazing pressure.

Main issues

As mentioned before, the main issues hampering productivity are changes in climatic conditions that have led to droughts and therefore had a negative impact on productivity. Based on the last supervision mission recommendations, training were held with district officers and CFs to enhance pasture livestock productivity in a climate-resilient approach by revising the LPDPII plans to account for better rotation plans.

b. Sustainability and Scaling up

Institutions and Policy Engagement	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 5
------------------------------------	-----------	--------------------

Justification of rating

The project has initiated steps towards amending the Pasture Law based on the experiences and success stories of the first phase. It has established a working group comprising members from the Parliament, related Ministries and agencies. This was followed by two district-level public discussion forums mainly with the participation of representatives from relevant parliamentary committees, head of districts and PUU representatives. These steps resulted in around 70 amendments and the new Law incorporating these amendments has been submitted to the government for consideration and is expected to be adopted by the end of 2018. The positive experiences of LPDPI have contributed to the amendments.

Main issues

District pasture commissions: For efficient and rational use of pastures, the project has initiated the establishment of a district pasture commissions in each project district comprising representatives of the local authorities, *jamoats* and PUUs. The commissions conduct quarterly meeting to discuss and resolve pasture land regulation and related conflicts. As a result, 6 PUUs from Project districts received Certificate for pasture land use.

Pasture Meliorative Trust (PMT): The Pasture Meliorative Trust is a *de facto* Pasture Department within the Ministry of Agriculture charged with supporting PUUs throughout Tajikistan. LPDP II invested in rehabilitation of the Trust's dilapidated buildings and also provided office equipment and two vehicles. Four LPDP II specialists work closely with the Trust, including the PMU legal/policy team and GIS specialist. PMU specialists provide training to PMT staff on administrative and technical subjects. The training could be expanded to include monitoring skills for assessing financial performance and business-development aspects of PUUs, addressing the need for accountability of investments and financial sustainability. The PMT receives a budget from the MoA and employs 78 staff in five regional offices. It also accepts interns from Tajik Agrarian University; in summer 2018 five interns – students between their 3rd and 4th years of study – were assigned to the PMT's Kulob office. PMT will likely employ these interns upon graduation. In subsequent years the interns will be assigned to other regions.

PMT activities include disinfection of livestock on their way to summer pastures, pasture monitoring, repairing roads and bridges and improving pasture by planting of species such as Saxaul in cultivated strips. In the project area and other districts of Khatlon region the PMT staff conducted pasture monitoring, and inventoried and mapped cattle track roads jointly with LPDP II staff. In Rasht District the PMT works with the GIZ in a mapping project.

Perhaps the most important PMT activity is the establishment of new PUUs in Districts outside the Khatlon region. So far 22 PUUs have become active in 3 Districts, with more planned. These new PUUs are formed under the authority of the law On Pasture and follow the LPDP model, with formal Local State Authority approval and financial independence. Households in the new PUUs are supported with purebred bulls and Artificial Insemination and establishment of WIGG groups. Pasture improvement is promoted by use of pasture rotations and spreading seed into pastures. The possibility should be explored for the PMT to replicate the PUUs in the unreached villages in LPDP districts (both phase I and II) wherever possible.

Partnership-building	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 4
----------------------	-----------	--------------------

Justification of rating

LPDPII has partnered effectively with Oryan and Al Amar, two community facilitator organizations for project implementation. It has also partnered with other UN agencies, namely UNIDO, ILO. UNIDO support has been used to for training women's groups on the processing of livestock processing and wool production. Also, partnerships with the state committee of land management and Geodesy has been used to conduct pasture geo-botanical analysis. The Tajik Agrarian University has been a key partner in bringing technical assistance for soil analysis in selected PUUs. The project has also made linkages with State Pasture Ameliorative Trust to do joint pasture monitoring and assessment.

Main issues

n/a

Human and Social Capital and Empowerment	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 5
---	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

The PUUs have been developed as self-governance groups that cater to the overall wellbeing of pasture users giving them access and control over assets such as – capital, community infrastructure and service, natural resources, land access, knowledge and technologies. The PUUs are now registered legal entities. The PUUs receive training, technical assistance and support to improve their managerial and organisational capacities as well as technical skills for employment opportunities. Subcomponent 3.2 specifically address women's economic empowerment through the WIGGs diversifying HH income.

Main issues

The project has facilitated 179 PUUs to secure rights to pasture usage through 139 pasture user agreements and 40 land certificates. As almost all the member households are users of the pastures, securing the pasture rights has addressed a common issue and has generated significant member support for the PUUs. The WIGG's have already started activities on the collective enterprises. However, they are in their early stages and the results are yet to emerge. Their activities and business orientation can be further strengthened through detailed plans for maximum utilisation of their business assets supported by the project as well as by strengthening the marketing linkages of these enterprises.

Quality of Beneficiary Participation	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 5
---	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

The core strategy of the project is grassroots institutional development and capacity building for enabling sustainable rural transformation. By focusing on the demand of PUU members, project interventions have taken a direct aim on the overall improvement of "common" livelihoods activities (i.e. pasture management), this has been found to attract the full involvement from all households. In particular, it is well understood at the community level that the assets delivered offer additional benefits to themselves and entire communities.

Main issues

The project applies a participatory approach from the selection process, training and bottom-up feedback that allows the beneficiaries to express their concerns, priorities and interests regarding project interventions. From PUU generated reports, it is clear that beneficiaries are not only participating actively in the PUU governance but have also begun taking advantage of the assets. This was validated by the asset request forms and the PUU meeting attendance sheets. Nevertheless, since the project is only in the second year of implementation and assets delivery has just been completed, in some cases there is scope for improving the utilisation of the assets driven by asset utilisation plans.

Responsiveness of Service Providers	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 4
--	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

Services provided under the project were generally of good quality and delivered on time and within the budget. Service providers included two community facilitator NGOs (Al Amar and Oryan) in charge of community mobilisation, veterinarians, and technicians/engineers. The reports are satisfactory - comprehensive, informative and timely. Reports of international consultants, who have provided technical assistance to the project, are of good quality and generally technically sound, with appropriate recommendations and support for project implementation.

Main issues

The two community facilitator NGOs have been re-recruited following the successful implementation of LPDPI. Therefore, they already gained extensive experience in working with the project and engaging with communities and are familiar with the approach and the systems employed. Moreover, the mission interviewed PUU beneficiaries to enquire on the responsiveness rate - almost all villages reported that the community facilitators visited at least once every two weeks. Communities also reported that when problems arise, the community facilitators are quick to react and develop linkages with the concerned PMU staff and consultants.

Environment and Natural Resource Management	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 5
--	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

The project has demonstrated pasture regeneration by fencing 1ha plots. The positive results from these demonstrations have convinced the communities to adopt pasture rotation plans. All the PUUs have started implementing pasture rotation plans according to project recommendations. In future, this will generate greater vegetation biomass with taller plants of

higher plant density. The vegetative cover with plants and litter resulting from rotational grazing will impede water flow over the soil surface and check erosion. The project is about to establish 86 demonstrations covering a total of 245 ha where various tree species will be planted using waterboxes to overcome moisture stress. These trees will provide shade and windbreaks to ease summer stress on livestock.

Main issues

Drinking water for livestock in pastures: Lack of drinking water for livestock in village pastures is the factor limiting livestock production for many PUUs. Without a source of water, especially in summer pastures, livestock must return to the village in the middle of the day to drink. This means that the herds travel between the village and the pasture 4 times per day. When summer pastures are located at 5-8 km from the village, the daily walk is 20-30 km, which imposes a high maintenance cost on the animals. The energy required for daily travel may negate any production benefits created by pasture rotation. Even though the drinking-water deficiency applies whether the pastures are grazed continuously or in rotation, continuous, uninterrupted grazing causes overgrazing and degradation without potential for higher forage and livestock productivity. Pasture rotation raises forage and livestock production potential, but energy expenditures associated with long distances walked each day can depress livestock weight gains and eliminate that potential.

The project is overcoming water shortages in pastures by construction of concrete troughs and water-supply pipelines. The project in southern Dangara District has constructed a concrete trough served by a 10-km pipeline; just one water-supply intervention so far. This is a slow and expensive approach to meet drinking-water demands in pastures. At this rate, only a small number of PUUs can solve their water-supply problems over the life of the project. An alternative approach, at least in the short term, is to cart water from the village to the pasture with a tractor-pulled water tank and let water flow from a tank into steel troughs.

Exit Strategy	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 4
----------------------	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

The PUUs will continue to operate and take responsibility for maintenance and management of the pasture resources. PUUs established with the project support are well functioning as a reliable mechanism to manage the pasture resources sustainably. The project is focused on secure pasture rights through land certification for the PUUs which will ensure continued pasture usage and protection for PUU members. The project has supported amendments to the 'Law on Pasture' which will institutionalise and scale up the PUU model under the LPDP.

Main issues

The project has facilitated 179 PUUs to secure rights to pasture usage through 139 pasture user agreements and 40 land certificates. As almost all the member households are users of the pastures, securing the pasture rights has addressed a common issue and has generated significant member support for the PUUs. The WIGGs are still at an early stage to reap the benefits from the IGAs as most assets (refrigerator, processing machinery) delivery has only occurred in the first half of this year. It is foreseen that income generation will begin only from the next seasonal year. The sustainability of these income generation activities will support the institutional development and sustainability of WIGGs and facilitate smooth project exit in the future.

Potential for Scaling-up	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 5
---------------------------------	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

The Ministry of Agriculture is scaling up the PUU model outside the scope of the project. On the Ministry of Agriculture's request, the PMT has helped establish new PUUs in Districts outside the Khatlon region. So far 22 PUUs have become active in 3 Districts, with more planned. These new PUUs are formed under the authority of the law On Pasture and follow the LPDP model, with formal Hukumat approval and financial independence. The households in the new PUUs are provided with purebred bulls and Artificial Insemination and establishment of WIGG groups. Use of pasture rotations promote pasture improvement and spreading seed into pastures. The possibility should be explored for the PMT to replicate the PUUs in the unreached villages in LPDP districts (both phase I and II) wherever possible.

Main issues

n/a

c. Project Management

Quality of Project Management	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 5
--------------------------------------	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

99. The project has filled all the staff positions in the PMU and in the regional office. Most of the technical staff have experience from LDPDI. Focused PMU leadership backed by strong financial management and procurement staff and the experienced technical team is responsible for the accomplishments of the project so far. There is strong coordination between the project staff and the service providers. The planning, budgeting and reporting process follows the established system of implementing IFAD projects in the country, including the preparation of Annual Work Plan and Budgets (AWPBs). The Project Steering Committee (PSC), headed by the Deputy Minister of Agriculture, meets on a regular basis.

Main issues

The project implementation structure comprises the Project Management Unit (PMU) of the Government based in Dushanbe which is supported by a regional office based in Kulob. District level operations are coordinated by three District Coordinators who are based in the districts and also have previous experience of LPDPI. Community facilitators from two service providers contracted by the project support the District Coordinators.

Knowledge Management	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 4
-----------------------------	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

The PMU implements knowledge management and communication activities. These include, PMU project website, interaction with mass media, TV, preparation of Information bulletins, maintenance of information board displayed at PMU premises, publication of stories of beneficiaries, development of brochures on the project implementation progress. The PMU project website was launched in early 2014 and is fully operational under the title www.rural.tj. A knowledge management strategy, titled Comprehensive Strategy of Trainings and Relations with Mass Media offers exchange visits, workshops and establishment between PUUs, WGG and CIGs. 18 technical publications relating to all project activities were developed and disseminated to almost all PUUs.

Main issues

A total of 16 TV programs regarding LPDP II were prepared and disseminated through four channels to reach out to the rural population in the project area. Twice a year a press conference is conducted with mass media about the activities. The website is one of the few websites dedicated to agriculture and rural development in Tajikistan and has a high rate of usage among the local organisations, professional and experts.

Value for Money	Rating: 4	Previous rating: 5
------------------------	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

The PMU has implemented the project activities on time and within budget. It has achieved almost 98% of the outreach targeted at the end of the project. The project has also completed the establishment of PUUs, CIGs and WiGGs which have started organising and delivering inputs and services to the beneficiaries. The early development of these community level institutions will increase the benefits to the target households during the life of the project. The PMT has started the replication of PUUs, CIGs and WIGGs in other districts which will increase the indirect outreach of the project. The project has recently delivered the agricultural machinery and other equipment (refrigerators, drying machine, etc.) to the PUUs and WIGGs and their full utilisation is yet to start.

Main issues

Starting late in 2017 the project has so far supplied agricultural machinery sets to 150 PUUs. The project has also provided some guidance to the PUUs regarding the annual revenue they should earn to recover the costs of the machinery within a specified time. Although the project is only in the second year of implementation around 10% of the member households in the visited PUUs have used these services and the PUUs have earned 15% of the potential revenue (around 25,000 TJS per PUU) from the machinery services. The utilisation of the machinery has been affected by a drought in many parts of the project area that reduced demand for these services as well as delivery of some of the machinery after peak season (end of December 2017). The average cost of delivery of these services in the PUUs visited by the mission is above 50% of the revenue and mostly comprises remuneration to the driver, accountant and sometimes the head of PUU. The project should monitor and initiate steps to ensure that the PUUs fully use the potential of the machinery. Additionally, asset utilisation plans and revisiting the costs of delivering the machinery services can contribute to strengthening the financial position of the PUUs.

Coherence between AWPB and Implementation	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 4
--	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

As of 30 September 2018, 72.1% financial progress has been achieved on the AWPB for 2018. The AWPB 2018 budgeted a total of USD 7,886,470 against which USD 5,686,144 has been disbursed as of 30 September 2018. The project is on track to completing its outlined activities for the year 2018. A change in government regulation has turned all veterinarians into government staff. As a result, there is uncertainty related to time completion of the activities related to

disbursement of veterinary kits to private veterinarians (who are not present any more).

AWPB Inputs and Outputs Review and Implementation Progress

A national veterinary consultant conducted an assessment of the State Veterinary Services and developed Animal Health Plans which were added to the CLPMPs developed by the PUUs. A total of 60 private veterinarians were identified. Veterinary packages were procured for them consisting of the following items:

- o 21 items of veterinary drugs;
- o 27 set of office equipment (furniture, refrigerator);
- o 60 motorcycles and
- o 60 set of veterinary supplies (includes 35 items like dressing gown, boots, scissors, knife, syringe, gloves, etc.).

The procurement of all the items in the veterinary packages (excluding 60 motorcycles) has been completed and stored in Dushanbe. The supplier will deliver the 60 motorcycles by the end of October 2018.

However, the Government of Republic of Tajikistan (GRT) has passed a resolution on 29 December 2017 transferring the function of the State Veterinary Inspection (SVI), which was supposed to partner with the project, to the newly established Food Security Committee (FSC) under the GRT. This move by the Government has developed obstacles in LPDP's approach of supporting private veterinarians as all private veterinarians have become official employees of the FSC and their monthly salaries are paid from the FSC budget. The mission recommends that the project should follow-up with the FSC the scope of distributing the equipment to private veterinarians who might serve the targeted PUUs. If such a solution is not possible, then the project will explore and propose other purposes for distributing the equipment in line with the Financing Agreement.

Performance of M&E System	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 4
--------------------------------------	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

Participatory and comprehensive monitoring and evaluation is in place to track progress and target achievements at district and PMU levels. The project maintains a detailed geo-referenced output dashboard that indicates the infrastructure, machinery and equipment benefiting each village. The mission observed that positive alterations were made to ensure outcome level monitoring. The project has developed a M&E plan with detailed instructions to stakeholders. Based on the last supervision mission in 2017, the project has finalised protocols for periodical data collection to monitor the key outcomes. Moreover, the PMU had started collecting electronic data via the suggested platform, and the first surveys for livestock weight have started.

M&E System Review

PMU specialists have trained the PMT staff on administrative and technical subjects. Future training could be expanded to include monitoring skills for assessing financial performance and business-development aspects of PUUs. Participatory M&E systems should be implemented to monitor the performance of the income generation activities amongst the Women Income Generating Groups (WIGGs).

Requirements of Social, Environmental and Climate Assessment Procedures (SECAP)	Rating: 4	Previous rating: 4
--	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

The project has been classified as Category B as it is less likely to cause any adverse environmental impact. In line with the experiences of LPDPI, the project is expected to generate positive impact through improvement in pasture rehabilitation/maintenance, grassland productivity, livestock productivity and the overall policy and institutional arrangements responsible for NRM in Tajikistan. Environment monitoring indicators are included in the M&E system and are monitored on a regular basis to ensure that there is no negative impact from the livestock development activities of the project. Acting on the recommendations of the last supervision mission the project has trained district officers and CFs to promote improved rotation plans that improve pasture livestock productivity as well as pasture conservation.

d. Financial Management & Execution

Disbursement by financier

Type	Name	Current Amount	Disbursed Amount	Actual Rate
Domestic Financing breakdown	Beneficiaries	\$1,348,000		
	National Government	\$446,000		

Acceptable Disbursement Rate

Rating: 3

Previous rating: 3

Justification of rating

The disbursement increased by 94% comparing to 2017, and reached a total of 40% of available resources.

Main issues

The disbursement rate of IFAD resources is rated as **Moderately Unsatisfactory**. As of 30 September 2018, the total disbursement of available resources reached 41% (Considering a WA of USD 318,159 under processing at IFAD) and a total amount of USD 6.5 million. During 2018, the project submitted regularly 16 WAs for replenishment or direct payment for a total amount of USD 5.4 million; reflecting an increase of 94% comparing to 2017 (total amount disbursed of USD 2.8 million). The Project team is managing effectively the cash forecast and the level of liquidity at their disposal. The effective disbursement as project level is lesser which confirms that the project has sufficient liquidities and that level of authorised allocation are sufficient.

If we would consider the adjustment to IFAD metrics of disbursement rate (year rounding up), the disbursement rate will be **Moderately Satisfactory**.

The mission examined the possibility to roll-out IFAD Client Portal (ICP), which is an on-line platform to submit WAs and to access to certain level of data. A demonstration was provided to the project team who started engaging actions to prepare the Letter of Advice. It was agreed to consider end of November as realistic deadline to roll-out ICP for on-going projects LPDP II and CASP.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Financial Management & Execution		
IFAD Client Portal roll-out The project team will start the preparation of the letter of advice and submit it to Ministry of Finance for approval. It's expected to roll-out IFAD Client Portal for the WA to be submitted in November 2018.	Project Director and Finance Manager	11/2018

Fiduciary Aspects

Quality of Financial Management

Rating: 6

Previous rating: 5

Justification of rating

The financial and accounting team is playing a key role of safeguard of the financial activities and best practices within the PMU.

Main issues

The financial management of the project is considered **Highly Satisfactory**. The team in charge has demonstrated a high level of understanding of duties; compliance with best practices and sufficient proficiency and knowledge of financial management procedures (including the monitoring of the counterparts contributions and beneficiaries). The mission noted that there is a sufficient level of segregation of duties with regard to the preparation and approval of financial transactions.

The Interim Financial Reporting Statements are regularly and timely submitted to IFAD. Several functionalities are automated and integrated in the financial and accounting 1-C software such as the budget, the register of contracts, the fixed asset register, the financial reports per component, sub-component and category and comparative period, the preparation of WAs, Smart Statement of Expenditures formats and the possibility to capture the Value Added Tax (VAT) and the beneficiary contributions for all activities. This high level of automation reduces the risk of non-controls and increase the quality of controls implemented by the team.

Fixed assets register. The FM-unit records all assets in the 1-C software. This information allows to create a fixed asset listing with serial number, location, custodian, historical cost and to follow up the assets. The overall fixed asset register can be generated automatically.

Register of contracts. The FM-unit records all the contracts the 1-C software. This information allows creating a register

of contracts according the IFAD templates.

Quality and Timeliness of Audit	Rating: 6	Previous rating: 5
--	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

Audited financial statements timely submitted with a good quality of preparation

Main issues

Audited Financial Statements were timely submitted to IFAD. Auditors' work and the preparation of financial statements were conducted respectively in accordance to International Standards of Auditing a, IFAD related requirements and International Accounting Standards. The Management Letter didn't disclose major weakness related to the quality of internal control systems.

Counterparts Funds	Rating: 6	Previous rating: 5
---------------------------	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

The Government's contribution exceeded by 166% budgeted contribution for overall project.

Main issues

The GoT provided VAT exemption on equipment purchase to beneficiaries and other activities related to the project. At this stage of the implementation, this contribution significantly exceeded the budgeted one (USD 0.45 million) by reaching an amount of USD 1.19 million. This due to the fact that, some activities related to CLPDP consisted on providing equipment and machineries to beneficiaries that benefit of VAT exemption. The VAT on the latter activities was not considered at design stage.

Also, the mission examined that beneficiaries' cash contribution is effectively implemented to eligible activities.

The mission noted that the project is not considering the customs duties exemption despite its effectiveness (5% of value of imported equipment).

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Financial Management & Execution		
Monitoring of the tax duties exemption and other contributions in kind The project team will prepare and monitor, for historical transactions and future ones, the customs duties exemption and other contribution in kind of the Government of Tajikistan. The monitoring will be included in the quarterly financial reports and will be annexed to the annual financial statements subject to external audit.	Finance Manager	11/2018

Compliance with Loan Covenants	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 5
---------------------------------------	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

The project has complied with the loan covenants. The details with regards to the status of implementation and compliance with Project Financing Agreement covenants are presented in Appendix 3.

Procurement

Procurement	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 5
--------------------	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

Project procurement follows the IFAD guidelines as reflected in Project Procurement Manual (PPM). There is an adequate procurement capacity. Most of the recommendations of the previous supervision mission have been adopted. The current procurement did not reveal any major violation. However, some minor issues were noted as presented below.

Procurement Review

Recommendations of the previous IFAD mission (October 2017) have been largely performed.

The PMU prepares annual procurement plans an integral part of AWPBs and submits them to IFAD for approval. From October 2017 to October 2018, the PMU had concluded 37 contracts for a total amount of US\$ 4,725,713.00, including 25 contracts for procurement of goods amounting to US\$ 4,520,238.00, 1 contract for procurement of civil works amounting to US\$ 95,543.00 and 11 contracts for providing consultancy services amounting to US\$ 109,932.00.

The project has adequate procurement capacity. The procurement unit is in the PMU and the staff comprises consultants who have long experiences in WB/IFAD procedures. It is recommended to continue improving the procurement knowledge of the procurement unit through training courses including training in ITC-ILO (Turin, Italy).

The Procurement Plan (PP) conforms to the requirements of IFAD. It reflects the process of procurement activities and has procurement monitoring tools. Procurement is carried out according to the details in the PPM which has been prepared with IFAD support. IFAD has approved recommendations regarding changes to the PPM. The possibility of making amendments to the Letter to the Borrower (procurement thresholds, inclusion of additional methods (LIB, SSS, DC), prior review requirements) has been agreed in line with the PPM.

The filing and registration system is organized satisfactorily. The main documents are available and classified accordingly on the shelves. The database of eligible companies is available. There is scope for improving the record keeping system and active use of database.

The mission reviewed the tender process for 25 contracts concluded since the last supervision. The findings for all reviewed procurements are of the same nature. No major violations were observed. In particular, it was noted: i) applied practice in shortlisting suppliers is prepared based on the expressions of interest; ii) application of the IFAD's prior review procedures, instead of post review as specified in PP; iii) procurement of homogeneous goods in one package, without distribution to the lots; iv) delay in provision of ITQ for bidders from the announcement publication date; v) no additional agreements in changing the contract terms. The measures necessary to address these issues have been discussed with the procurement staff.

F. Agreed Actions

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Financial Management & Execution		
Monitoring of the tax duties exemption and other contributions in kind The project team will prepare and monitor, for historical transactions and future ones, the customs duties exemption and other contribution in kind of the Government of Tajikistan. The monitoring will be included in the quarterly financial reports and will be annexed to the annual financial statements subject to external audit.	Finance Manager	11/2018
IFAD Client Portal roll-out The project team will start the preparation of the letter of advice and submit it to Ministry of Finance for approval. It's expected to roll-out IFAD Client Portal for the WA to be submitted in November 2018.	Project Director and Finance Manager	11/2018

Livestock and Pasture Development Project II

Logical Framework

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of verification			Assumptions
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2017)	Cumulative Result (2017)	Cumulative Result % (2017)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility	
Outreach	1.b Estimated corresponding total number of households members										
	Household members										
	1.a Corresponding number of households reached										
	Non-women-headed households			38 000	38 541	38 541	101.4				
	Women-headed households										
	1 Persons receiving services promoted or supported by the project										
	Males			122 094	158 299	158 299	129.7				
	Total number of persons receiving services			239 400	313 338	313 338	130.9				
	Females			117 306	155 039	155 039	132.2				
	Poor smallholder household members supported in coping with the effects of climate change										
	Males			95 000							
	Females			95 000							
	Total household members			190 000							

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of verification			Assumptions
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2017)	Cumulative Result (2017)	Cumulative Result % (2017)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility	
Goal Contribute to the reduction of poverty in Khatlonr region (50% of people in Khatlon are estimated as being below the poverty line)	reduction in the prevalence of chronic malnutrition (stunting)										A sound use of climate change vulnerability assessment informs and drives adaptation work; risk mitigation management plans are implemented by targeted communities; elite capture of a disproportionate amount of the gains from increased production and local level conversion of animal, milk and meat surpluses sold on the market and the processors (R). A political stability and conducive macro economic framework; Commitment and cooperation among all concerned institutional partners; influence of overall economic development concealing project achievements (R);
	Height for age (boys)	40		3							
	Weight for age (boys)	40		3							
	Weight for age (girls)	40		3							
	Height for age (girls)	40		3							
	variation/increase in household assets income for 18 000 household in the project area										
	increase in household assets income			15							

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of verification			Assumptions
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2017)	Cumulative Result (2017)	Cumulative Result % (2017)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility	
Objective Increase the nutritional status, incomes and resilience of poor households by enhancing livestock productivity in a sustainable manner	Average HH income increase from livestock for 80% of population										A sound use of climate change vulnerability assessment informs and drives adaptation work; Risk mitigation management plans are implemented by targeted communities; Elite capture of a disproportionate amount of the gains from increased production and local level conversion of animal, milk and meat surpluses sold on the market and the processors (R). A sound use of climate change vulnerability assesement informs and drives adpatation work; Risk mitigation management plans are implemented by targeted communities; Elite capture of a disproportionate amount of the gains from increased production and local level conversion of animal, milk and meat surpluses sold on the market and the processors (R).
	Income increase in TJS	2 932		3 372							
	Number of targeted HH reporting increased income from livestock										
	Targeted households			3 250							

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of verification			Assumptions
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2017)	Cumulative Result (2017)	Cumulative Result % (2017)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility	
Outcome Outcome 1: Targeted public sector and community organisations (disaggregated by type, i.e. PUUs, Vos, MoA, Pasture Department, TAU, Jamoats) are more effective and efficient at pro-poor pasture management	% of PPUs declaring satisfactory levels of governance										Favourable government policies and cross-sectoral cooperation between state, region and district authorities; Interest and motivation among community members, Lack of capacity in government agencies and communities to effectively participate in project activities and transmit information and know how.
	PPUs			75							
	number of targeted institutions reporting an increase in technical capacity							"Project M&E records, progress reports, specific public records, policy documents, laws, strategies "			
	Number of institutions			1							
	Number of public institutions assisted/receiving training										
	Public Institutions			1							
Output Output 1.1 PUU are enabled to develop and implement climate risk-mitigation community pasture plans incorporating needs and priorities of poor and women 180 of land use rights agreements obtained by PUUs that reduce disputes regarding access to pastures by 50%;	3.1.1 Groups supported to sustainably manage natural resources and climate-related risks								Quarterly		
	Groups supported			180	180	180	100				
	Females				449	449					
	Males				1 053	1 053					
	Women in leadership position				3	3					
	Total size of groups			1 260	1 502	1 502	119.2				
	% of the PPUs Board with at least 30% women representation										
	PPUs Boards			22.5	29.89	29.89	132.8				
	2.1.3 Rural producers' organizations supported										

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of verification			Assumptions
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2017)	Cumulative Result (2017)	Cumulative Result % (2017)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility	
	Total size of POs			3 000	2 250	2 250	75				
	Males			2 100	1 620	1 620	77.1				
	Women in leadership position				0	0					
	Females			900	630	630	70				
	Rural POs supported			150	174	174	116				
	2.1.4 Supported rural producers that are members of a rural producers' organization										
	Women in leadership position				0	0					
	Females										
	Males										
	Number of land use rights agreements obtained by PUUs										
	Land titles - Certificates			80	35	35	43.8				
	Land titles - Agreements			180	135	135	75				
Output Output 1.2 PUUs acquired planning and technical skills to implement sustainable pasture management and livestock production;	Number of people benefitting of training or study tours, (women 30%).										
	Women			30	24	24	80				
	Number of people			5 400	2 768	2 768	51.3				
	Number of trainings										
	Number of trainings held			326	115	115	35.3				

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of verification			Assumptions
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2017)	Cumulative Result (2017)	Cumulative Result % (2017)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility	
Output Output 1.3 Increase in pasture fees collected by the end of the project	% variation in pasture fees amount										
	Variation (increase)			20							
Output Output 1.4 Public institutions involved in pasture management are strengthened (PUUs, VOs, MoA, Pasture Department, TAU, Jamoats)	Number of public institutions assisted/receiving training										
	Public Institutions			1							
Output Output 1.5 Improved Pasture Law and related legislation proposed/passed;	Improved Pasture Law and related legislation passed										
	Pasture Law approved			1	0	0	0				
Output Output 1.6 Sustainable Pasture Management curriculum is taught in Tajik Agrarian University.	Number of curriculum taught in Tajik Agrarian University										
	Sustainable Pasture mgt curriculum taught			1		1	100				
Outcome Outcome 2: Healthier livestock with lower levels of mortality and increased supplementary feed available to community livestock	Number of livestock households reporting reduction in animal mortality							"Baseline, mid-term, completion surveys, project M&E records, progress reports "			
	Livestock Households										
	15% increase in average milk yields							"Baseline, mid-term, completion surveys, project M&E records, progress reports "			
	Milk Ltrs	3.2									
	10% increase in average weight of cattle, sheep goats										
	Cattle	0.091		0.1							
	10% increase in average weight of cattel, sheep, goats sold in local markets										

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of verification			Assumptions
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2017)	Cumulative Result (2017)	Cumulative Result % (2017)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility	
	Sheep	0.047		0.051							
	10% increase in average weight of cattle, sheep, goats sold in local markets										
	Goats	0.045		0.049							
Output Output 2.1 Capacity for sustainable and efficient livestock production built.	number of beneficiary HH trained in improved livestock husbandry practices							CF/TA Reports Progress Reports Veterinarians logbooks Annual Reports Case studies			Communities willing to participate in the project activities; Govt support is favourable
	Households			5 000	0	0	0				
	1.1.3 Rural producers accessing production inputs and/or technological packages										
	Females			900	0	0	0	CF/TA Reports Progress Reports Veterinarians logbooks Annual Reports Case studies CF/TA Reports Progress Reports Veterinarians logbooks Annual Reports Case studies			
	Males			2 100	0	0	0				
	Total rural producers			3 000							
	1.2.2 Households reporting adoption of new/improved inputs, technologies or practices							CF/TA Reports Progress Reports Veterinarians logbooks Annual Reports Case studies			
	Households			3 000	0	0	0				

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of verification			Assumptions
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2017)	Cumulative Result (2017)	Cumulative Result % (2017)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility	
	Number of business plans prepared and which received financing										
	Business Plans			20	12	12	60				
Output Output 2.2 Private vets provide animal health and production services on a sustainable basis	Number of veterinarians trained and equipped							CF/TA Reports Progress Reports Veterinarians logbooks Annual Reports Case studies			Communities willing to participate in the project activities; Govt support is favourable.
	Females			0	0	0	NaN				
	Males			60	0	0	0				
Outcome Outcome 3: Household resilience increase through sustainable use of pastures and income diversification	% income increase of beneficiaries households from alternative income activities (ASAP)							"Baseline, mid-term, completion surveys, Project M&E records, progress reports "			
	Income increase			20	0	0	0				
	ha of accessible pasture managed in a more climate resilient manner							"Baseline, mid-term, completion surveys, Project M&E records, progress reports "			
	Hectares of land			95 000	0	0	0				
Output Output 3.1: Resilient and sustainable investments prioritized in CLPMPs completed and functioning.	number of PPUs implementing CLMP plans							"Baseline, mid-term, completion surveys, Project M&E records, progress reports "			Communities willing to participate in the project activities; Govt support is favourable
	Number of plans implemented			180	179	179	99.4				
	Number of subprojects approved/financed of PPUs (by priorities, first, second and set)										

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of verification			Assumptions
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2017)	Cumulative Result (2017)	Cumulative Result % (2017)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility	
	Number of sub-projects			180	157	157	87.2				
	Number of approved CLPMP in the Project areas (includingLPDPI's PUUs) effectively integrating climate risk mitigation and adaptation measures (ASAP)										
	# of approved CLPMP			180	179	179	99.4				
	Number of HH with access to infrastructure that is climate resilient & envron sound										
	Households			18 000	0	0	0				
	Land under climate-resilient practices										
	Land area			132 000	0	0	0				
Output Output 3.2 Alternative income generating activities supported to enhance risk coping mechanisms	2.1.3 Rural producers' organizations supported										Communities willing to participate in the project activities; Govt support is favourable
	Total size of POs			220	266	266	120.9				
	Males			0	0	0	NaN				
	Women in leadership position			22	24	24	109.1				
	Females										
	Rural POs supported			22	24	24	109.1				
	Number of grants disbursed to new enterprises established										
	Number of grants			22	12	12	54.5				

Tajikistan

Livestock and Pasture Development Project II

Supervision Report

Appendix 1: Financial: actual financial performance; by financier by component and disbursements by category

Mission Dates: 7 to 20 October 2018

Document Date: 22/01/2019

Project No. 2000000977

Report No. 4970-TJ

Near East, North Africa and Europe Division
Programme Management Department

Appendix 1: Financial: Actual financial performance by financier; by component and disbursements by category

Table 1A: Financial performance by financier as of 30th September 2018

Financier	Appraisal (USD '000)	Disbursement (USD '000)	Balance	Per cent disbursement
IFAD Loan	8 700	3 073	5 627	35%
IFAD Grant	8 700	2 024	6 676	23%
ASAP Grant	5 035	2 570	2 465	51%
Government	447	1 190	-743	266%
Beneficiaries	1 348	592	756	44%
Total	24 230	9 449	14 781	39%

Tale 1B: Financial performance by financier by component (USD '000) as of 30th September 2018

Components	IFAD Loan			IFAD Grant			ASAP Grant			Government			Beneficiaries			Total		
	Appraisal	Actual	%	Appraisal	Actual	%	Appraisal	Actual	%	Appraisal	Actual	%	Appraisal	Actual	%	Appraisal	Actual	%
1. Institutional Development	0			1 313	828	63%	153	120	78%	126	36	29%	269		0%	1 861	984	53%
2. Productivity Enhancement	0			1 871	553	30%	0			190	4	2%	184	55	30%	2 245	612	27%
3. Pasture Development	8 700	3 073	35%	4 002	349	9%	4 882	2 450	50%	23	1 143	4970%	895	537	60%	18 502	7 552	41%
4. Project Management	0			1 514	294	19%	0			108	7	6%	0			1 622	301	19%
Total	8 700	3 073	35%	8 700	2 024	23%	5 035	2 570	51%	447	1 190	266%	1 348	592	44%	24 230	9 449	39%

Table 1C-1: IFAD grant disbursements – as of 30th September 2018 (SDR)

Category	Initial Allocation (1)	Disbursement (2)	Balance (1) - (2)	% disbursement (2)/(1)
Authorized Allocation		370		
Consultancies	1000	382	618	38%
Equipment and Materials	1425	740	685	52%
Grants and Subsidies	2 510	92	2 418	4%
Operating costs	600	59	541	10%
Training	100	17	83	17%
Grants and Subsidies 2	315	0	315	0%
Unallocated	250	0	250	0%
Total	6 200	1 660	4 910	27%

Table 1C-2: IFAD loan disbursements – as of 30th September 2018 (SDR)

Category	Initial Allocation (1)	Disbursement (2)	Balance (1) - (2)	% disbursement (2)/(1)
Authorized Allocation		434		
Grants and Subsidies	6 200	2 052	4 148	33%
Total	6 200	2 486	4 148	40%

Table 1C-3: ASAP grant disbursements – as of 30th September 2018 (SDR)

Category	Initial Allocation (1)	Disbursement (2)	Balance (1) - (2)	% disbursement (2)/(1)
Authorized Allocation		434		
Consultancies	150	76	74	51%
Grants and subsidies	3 100	1 378	1 722	44%
Grants and subsidies 2	350	272	78	78%
Total	3 600	2 160	1 874	60%

Tajikistan

Livestock and Pasture Development Project II

Supervision Report

Appendix 2: Physical progress measured against AWP&B

Mission Dates: 7 to 20 October 2018

Document Date: 22/01/2019

Project No. 2000000977

Report No. 4970-TJ

Near East, North Africa and Europe Division
Programme Management Department

Appendix 2: Physical progress measured against AWP&B

SE PMU "Livestock and Pasture Development"																		
"Livestock and Pasture Development Project -II"																		
SCHEDULE OF PROJECT ACTIVITIES BY COMPONENTS for the period of January - December 2018																		
No	Component 1: Institutional Development	Total Allocated amount, by all Finance sources (USD '000)	Est. Cost (USD '000) for financial year 2018*	Activities	2018												Completion rate	Progress
					Jan	Feb	Mar	Apr	May	June	July	Aug	Sep	Oct	Nov	Dec		
1a	Sub-component 1.1: Development of Community Organizations	1.032,97	215,30															
1a.1	District workshop	2,06	-	To launch the project districts (Dangara, Vase, Farkhor, Hamadoni, and Kulob) with participation of the Local government authority. During the workshop, the PMU will presents information about the objectives of the Project, its approach and main activities and present information on: (i) Project procedures and modalities; (ii) types of investments eligible for funding; (iii) allocation of funds; and (iv) a form for Memorandum of Understanding (MoU), Community Partnership Agreement (CPA), banking arrangements and financial controls.												Provided in Dec 2016	Done	

1a.2	Local study tour for members of PUU,CIGs,VDC	10,93	5,00	The local study tours is expected to organize in the area where have already been established PUU by LPDP- I and other projects and donors. The exact district(s) and PUU for trip would be specified.														Completed	1 WIGG on rosehip cultivation. Budget from CF thye conducted between districts and Jamoats
1a.3	International study tour	15,92	10,00	International study tour for members of PUU, head of CIG, PUU and project Jamoat representatives, PMU and MOA specialists/representatives.														Removed	Removed
1a.4	Community Development - International TA																		
1a.5	NTA - Contracting Community Facilitators	510,00	145,30	Recruiting an NGO to assist Project field community mobilization and implement field Project activities.														Completed	Two NGOs were recruited - Al Amar and Aryan
1a.6	Start-up Equipment	225,55	55,00	Provision of minor office equipment for established PUUs														Completed	Disbursement to all PUUs
1a.7	Pasture Land Certificates (by PUUs and facilitated by PMU)	268,51	-	Preparation of a format for data collection. Collection of data on pasture type and users. Collection of all the documents and submission to the local governments. Negotiating and obtaining land certificates.														Ongoing	Ongoing - refer to
	Jamoat and Village selection			Data collection of targeted Jamoats and villages of all project districts														Completed in Jul -Aug 2016	

1a.8	Memorandum of Understanding			Preparation and signing of Memoranda of Understanding (MOU)															MoA signed with Project established PUUs in 2017	
1a.9	First village meeting			Conducting first general village meetings															Completed by CF	
1b	Sub-component 1.2: Advancement of Policy and Legal Framework and Strengthening National Institutions	827,37	368,97																	
1b.1	Institutional Assessment and Programme Development	4,20	-	Recruiting an International Consultant to undertake a participatory institutional assessment of key stakeholders, to identify the institutional and capacity gaps which need to be addressed to strengthen their capacity as well as to develop a Programme of work for the future Pasture Department																
1b.2	Public Awareness	6,27	3,00	Publishing on awareness and dissemination publications on pasture management legal and institutional issues															Completed	17 publications were printed in 2018 .
1b.3	International study tours/conferences	32,32	9,32	Conduct International study tours for representatives from PMU and other related agencies															Reallocated to next AWPB	
1b.4	Office renovation	20,00	-	Renovation of the future Pasture Department's office																
1b.5	Vehicles	71,00	49,00	Procurement of vehicles for the future Pasture Department															Completed	Vehicles have been purchased

1b.6	Office equipment	32,00	-	Procurement of office equipment, furniture and minor equipment for the future Pasture Department															
1b.7	Pasture Management Consultant	18,63	-	Recruiting a National Pasture Monitoring Consultant (NPMC) to assist the PMU staff, future Pasture Department, MoA, CF, Districts Governments, Jamoat Councils, and PUU Councils in Pasture monitoring and assessment issues, to design monitoring format and datasheets															
1b.8	Interns	23,61	7,00	Selection of postgraduates to gain practical knowledge and assist the future Pasture Department													Completed	3 interns were recruited	
1b.9	Pasture assessment and monitoring	19,17	8,00	Recruiting independent consultants to provide comprehensive assessment and monitoring of pastures in project area. This includes: soil tests, plant assessments, productivity and quality of production													Completed	1 short term consultant recruited on M&E of pasture + 1 SP for geobotanical analysis	
1b.9.1	Pasture Monitoring Consultant for Pasture Trust (Department)	37,80	10,80	Recruiting a National Pasture Monitoring Consultant to provide monitoring and evaluation of pasture Union Users, Pasture Association, pasture land use, and other tasks according the ToRs													Completed	1 consultant recruited	

1b.9.2	Mapping and GIS consultant for Pasture Trest (Department)	24,00	11,00	Recruiting a national Consultant for Pasture Department of MoA, to provide inventarization of pasture land, collect geoinformation data, prepare map of pasture on type, yield, using for PUU, project and non project districts at Republic level														Completed	1 cosultant recruited
1b.9.3	PUU Institutional Development Consultant	24,00	11,00	PMU recrute National Institutional Development Consultant to provide assesment on strengthened of PUUs, Pasture Department, mobilization of establishment of PUU in Non project distrctits, and other tasks according ToR														Completed	1 cosultant recruited
1b.10	National Legal TA	50,19	10,80	Recruiting a National Legal Consultant to review policy and legal issues, assist on entitlement and management of pasture users institutions and local communities . e.g. for PUU, CLPDP Jamoat/Hukumat Administration, PMU, CF, CIGs, etc. according the ToRs														Completed	1 cosultant recruited
1b.11	Agronomist Consultant	25,40	10,80	Recruiting a National Agronomist Consultant to provide agricultural advise to pasture user, CIG, farmers, households on cropping, cultivation, trieatment, processing of agriculture and fodder crop.														Completed	1 cosultant recruited

[illegible]

1b.21	Scholarships	56,00	-	Scholarship programme to create opportunities for TAU's qualified students														Completed	39 scholarships but payment will be made from january
1b.22	Practical studies	40,00	10,00	Practical studies for TAU's students														Completed	5 practical studies for 5 students
1b.23	Internships	30,00	10,00	Internships programme for new graduates to work in close cooperation with recognized/established Vet/Pasture institutions and laboratories, PUU, Vet Clinics, etc.														Completed	10 Internships
	SUB-TOTAL Component 1	1.860,34	584,27																
2	Component 2 - Productivity Enhancement and Improved Animal Health	-																	
2a	Sub - Component 2.1. - Livestock Productivity Enhancement	1.688,60	630,30																
2a.1	Participatory demonstrations	807,52	320,00	Procure fodder crop seeds and fertilizers to establish participatory demonstrations plots for increasing animal productivity														Completed	Refer to Logframe for detailed breakdown

2a.2	Seed production/cleaning units	241,50	157,50	Provide support packages for entrepreneurs in production of fodder seed and seed cleaning units														Completed	packages were provided to 10 seed farms with high quality seeds and 10 clearing units
2a.3	Sheep participatory trials	501,38	125,00	Provide improved rams for sheep breeding to CIG, provide trainings, inputs, and technical support services														Completed	300 units were provided
2a.4	AI trials	100,00	17,00	Provide improved semen for cattle breeding to CIG, provide trainings, inputs, and technical services														Completed	30 trials were conducted and 1800 purebred bulls semen were provided
2a.5	Gender, youth development and social efficiency	38,20	10,80	Recruiting National consultant on Gender, youth development and social efficiency														Completed	1 national consultant recruited
2b	Sub - Component 2.2 - Improved Animal Health	555,81	532,29																
2b.1	Strengthening State Veterinary Inspection (SVI) - Institutional Assessment and Programme Development	20,30	8,00	Recruiting an National Consultant to undertake a participatory institutional assessment of the animal health system, to identify the institutional and capacity gaps which need to be addressed to strengthen its capacity as well as to develop Subcomponent's implementation programme														Completed	1 national consultant was recruited

2b.2	SVI - International study tours/ conferences	21,22	10,00	Conduct International training tours/ participation in international conferences on animal health by SVI representatives														Not Completed	This sub-component is facing challenges related to the veterinary services and has been highlighted in the supervision report. The project is restrategising its approach and It is highly likely that works will move into the next year
2b.3	SVI - Laboratory construction	160,45	160,45	Construction of regional veterinary laboratory in Dangara district														Unable	
2b.4	SVI - Laboratory equipment	164,45	164,45	Provide modern equipment for veterinary laboratories														Unable	
2b.5	Veterinary packages	170,00	170,00	Procure and provide veterinary packages for the participating qualified private vets (demand-driven)														Completed	60 packages were purchased, however delivery has not yet happened due to the challenges faced in this sub-component

2b.6	Training	19,39	19,39	Hiring qualified trainers to provide training on veterinary for Jamoat/district/oblast veterinarians, PUUs' vets and other relevant stakeholders															Unable	Due to challenges faced in the component
	SUB-TOTAL Component 2	2.244,41	1.162,59																	
3	Component 3 - Pasture Development and Diversification for Vulnerability Reduction																			
	Sub-component 3.1: Community Resilience Pasture Management and Investments	17.953,33	5.086,40																	
3a.1	Lead Consultant/Economist	Nat 99,85	18,00	Recruiting a National Economist Consultant (NEC) to undertake a project coordinator role															Completed	1 national consultant recruited
3a.2	Community Consultant/LC Assistant	Dev 59,90	12,00	Recruiting a National Community Development Consultant to assist in Development and Establishment of Community organization like PUU, CIG, Women groups and assist the Project Coordinator															Completed	1 national consultant recruited
3a.3	Pasture Management Consultant	Nat 59,90	10,80	Recruiting a National Pasture Management Consultant (PMC) to assist with preparation and implementation of Community Livestock and Pasture Management Plans (CLPMP), provide technical advice related to implementation of project demonstrations, trials and training and strengthening of veterinary services															Completed	1 national consultant recruited

3a.4	Livestock Nat Consultant	59,90	12,00	Recruiting a National Livestock Consultant (LC) to assist with preparation and implementation of Community Livestock and Pasture Management Plans technical advice related to implementation of project demonstrations, trials and training and strengthening of veterinary services.													Completed	1 national consultant recruited
3a.5	GIS/mapping Consultant	59,90	12,00	Recruiting a National Geographic Information Systems (GIS)/Mapping Consultant to assist with preparation and implementation of PDPs, technical advice.													Completed	1 national consultant recruited
3a.6	Climate Adaptation Consultant	52,45	10,80	Recruiting a National Climate Adaptation Consultant (CAC) to assist in identification of climate change and adaptation in livestock and pasture management and development													Completed	1 national consultant recruited
3a.7	Environmental Consultant	44,45	10,80	Recruiting a National Environmental Consultant (NEC) to assist in identification of environmental issue and aspects in livestock and pasture management and development													Completed	1 national consultant recruited
3a.8	GPS equipment and other usable for PUUs	93,98	-	Procure and provide GPS equipment and other usables for monitoring pasture rotation as well as some minor office equipment for PUUs													Completed in 2017	

3a.9	Pasture Management Plans Investments	17.423,00	5.000,00	PUUs with assistance from CF prepare CLPMPs and related investment sub-projects to improve livestock productivity, access to summer pasture, to increase fodder crop productivity, rural and pasture infrastructures rehabilitation, provide machinery and equipment including CA machineries, for landscape restoration (reforestation, watershed management etc). Minimum of 5% of the community grant will be allocated to protective and natural resource rehabilitation measures of degraded land, which could include fencing, demarcation, weed/shrub eradication, supplementary seeding of community pastures; for demonstration purpose and to learn about CA and about the natural re-vegetation potential; Introducing more environmentally sound natural resource management practices.														Ongoing (Started in 2017)	286 projects approved. Out of which 171 are ongoing and 115 are implemented	
	Sub-component 3.2 Income Diversification	- 550,00	452,00																	
3b.1	Business Development Consultant	50,00	12,00	Recruiting national consultant to facilitate and assist business development															Completed	1 consultant recruited

[illegible]

4a.10	Short-term TA	27,00	10,00	On demand														Completed	
4a.11	Translation services	38,00	5,00	On demand														Completed	Service Provider has been recruited
4a.12	Audit	81,00	16,00	Hiring a qualified Auditing company to provide Independent financial audit of the project														Ongoing	To be recruited before year-end
4a.13	National Internal Auditor		6,00	Recruiting a National Internal Auditor														Ongoing	Recruitment process ongoing
4a.14	Contracting PMU staff	208,40	50,00	Contract 2 District Project officers, 3 Drivers and Support staff (Cleaner/Messenger, Security)														Completed	
4a.15	Allowances and Social Fund	114,00	19,00															Completed	
4a.16	Office Running Costs	537,00	36,00	Provision of stationary, office and vehicles operation and maintenance, and insurance														Completed	
4a.17	Project planning and budgeting			Preparation and submission of draft AWPBs for second half of 2016 and 2017															
4a.18	Project planning and budgeting			Preparation and submission of project detailed AWPBs for 2019														To be completed	End of September
4a.19	Procurement plan			Preparation and submission draft Procurement Plan for a first 18 months and 2018														To be completed	End of septemeber
4a.20	Reporting			Preparation and submission of periodic reports														Ongoing (regular)	
4b	Sub-component 4(b): Monitoring and Evaluation	110,26	31,49																
4b.1	Stakeholder Review and Planning Workshops	2,00	0,50	Provide annual workshop on project implementation, activities, successes or issues														To be conducted in December	

[illegible]

SE PMU "Livestock and Pasture Development"

"Livestock and Pasture Development Project -II"

SCHEDULE OF PROJECT ACTIVITIES BY COMPONENTS for the period of January - December 2018

No	Component 1: Institutional Development	Total Allocated amount, by all Finance sources (USD '000)	Est. Cost (USD '000) for financial year 2018*	Activities	2018												Completion rate	Progress
					Jan	Feb	Mar	Apr	May	June	July	Aug	Sep	Oct	Nov	Dec		
1a	Sub-component 1.1: Development of Community Organizations	1.032,97	215,30															
1a.1	District workshop	2,06	-	To launch the project districts (<u>Dangara, Vase, Farkhor, Hamadoni, and Kulob</u>) with participation of the Local government authority. During the workshop, the PMU will presents information about the objectives of the Project, its approach and main activities and present information on: (i) Project procedures and modalities; (ii) types of investments eligible for funding; (iii) allocation of funds; and (iv) a form for Memorandum of Understanding (MoU), Community Partnership Agreement (CPA), banking arrangements and financial controls.													Provided in Dec 2016	Done

1a.2	Local study tour for members of PUU,CIGs,VDC	10,93	5,00	The local study tours is expected to organize in the area where have already been established PUU by LPDP- I and other projects and donors. The exact district(s) and PUU for trip would be specified.														Completed	1 WIGG on rosehip cultivation. Budget from CF thye conducted between districts and Jamoats
1a.3	International study tour	15,92	10,00	International study tour for members of PUU, head of CIG, PUU and project Jamoat representatives, PMU and MOA specialists/representatives.														Removed	Removed
1a.4	Community Development - International TA																		
1a.5	NTA - Contracting Community Facilitators	510,00	145,30	Recruiting an NGO to assist Project field community mobilization and implement field Project activities.														Completed	Two NGOs were recruited - Al Amar and Aryan
1a.6	Start-up Equipment	225,55	55,00	Provision of minor office equipment for established PUUs														Completed	Disbursement to all PUUs
1a.7	Pasture Land Certificates (by PUUs and facilitated by PMU)	268,51	-	Preparation of a format for data collection. Collection of data on pasture type and users. Collection of all the documents and submission to the local governments. Negotiating and obtaining land certificates.														Ongoing	Ongoing - refer to
	Jamoat and Village selection			Data collection of targeted Jamoats and villages of all project districts														Completed in Jul -Aug 2016	

1a.8	Memorandum of Understanding			Preparation and signing of Memoranda of Understanding (MOU)														MoA signed with Project established PUUs in 2017	
1a.9	First village meeting			Conducting first general village meetings														Completed by CF	
1b	Sub-component 1.2: Advancement of Policy and Legal Framework and Strengthening National Institutions	827,37	368,97																
1b.1	Institutional Assessment and Programme Development	4,20	-	Recruiting an International Consultant to undertake a participatory institutional assessment of key stakeholders, to identify the institutional and capacity gaps which need to be addressed to strengthen their capacity as well as to develop a Programme of work for the future Pasture Department															
1b.2	Public Awareness	6,27	3,00	Publishing on awareness and dissemination publications on pasture management legal and institutional issues														Completed	17 publications were printed in 2018 .
1b.3	International study tours/conferences	32,32	9,32	Conduct International study tours for representatives from PMU and other related agencies														Reallocated to next AWPB	
1b.4	Office renovation	20,00	-	Renovation of the future Pasture Department's office															
1b.5	Vehicles	71,00	49,00	Procurement of vehicles for the future Pasture Department														Completed	Vehicles have been purchased

1b.6	Office equipment	32,00	-	Procurement of office equipment, furniture and minor equipment for the future Pasture Department															
1b.7	Pasture Management Consultant	18,63	-	Recruiting a National Pasture Monitoring Consultant (NPMC) to assist the PMU staff, future Pasture Department, MoA, CF, Districts Governments, Jamoat Councils, and PUU Councils in Pasture monitoring and assessment issues, to design monitoring format and datasheets															
1b.8	Interns	23,61	7,00	Selection of postgraduates to gain practical knowledge and assist the future Pasture Department													Completed	3 interns were recruited	
1b.9	Pasture assessment and monitoring	19,17	8,00	Recruiting independent consultants to provide comprehensive assessment and monitoring of pastures in project area. This includes: soil tests, plant assessments, productivity and quality of production													Completed	1 short term consultant recruited on M&E of pasture + 1 SP for geobotanical analysis	
1b.9.1	Pasture Monitoring Consultant for Pasture Trust (Department)	37,80	10,80	Recruiting a National Pasture Monitoring Consultant to provide monitoring and evaluation of pasture Union Users, Pasture Association, pasture land use, and other tasks according the ToRs													Completed	1 cosultant recruited	

1b.9.2	Mapping and GIS consultant for Pasture Trest (Department)	24,00	11,00	Recruiting a national Consultant for Pasture Department of MoA, to provide inventarization of pasture land, collect geoinformation data, prepare map of pasture on type, yield, using for PUU, project and non project districts at Republic level														Completed	1 consultant recruited
1b.9.3	PUU Institutional Development Consultant	24,00	11,00	PMU recrute National Institutional Development Consultant to provide assesment on strengthened of PUUs, Pasture Department, mobilization of establishment of PUU in Non project distrctits, and other tasks according ToR														Completed	1 consultant recruited
1b.10	National Legal TA	50,19	10,80	Recruiting a National Legal Consultant to review policy and legal issues, assist on entitlement and management of pasture users institutions and local communities . e.g. for PUU, CLPDP Jamoat/Hukumat Administration, PMU, CF, CIGs, etc. according the ToRs														Completed	1 consultant recruited
1b.11	Agronomist Consultant	25,40	10,80	Recruiting a National Agronomist Consultant to provide agricultural advise to pasture user, CIG, farmners, households on cropping, cultivation, trieatment, processing of agriculture and fodder crop.														Completed	1 consultant recruited

[illegible]

1b.21	Scholarships	56,00	-	Scholarship programme to create opportunities for TAU's qualified students														Completed	39 scholarships but payment will be made from january
1b.22	Practical studies	40,00	10,00	Practical studies for TAU's students														Completed	5 practical studies for 5 students
1b.23	Internships	30,00	10,00	Internships programme for new graduates to work in close cooperation with recognized/established Vet/Pasture institutions and laboratories, PUU, Vet Clinics, etc.														Completed	10 Internships
	SUB-TOTAL Component 1	1.860,34	584,27																
2	Component 2 - Productivity Enhancement and Improved Animal Health	-																	
2a	Sub - Component 2.1. - Livestock Productivity Enhancement	1.688,60	630,30																
2a.1	Participatory demonstrations	807,52	320,00	Procure fodder crop seeds and fertilizers to establish participatory demonstrations plots for increasing animal productivity														Completed	Refer to Logframe for detailed breakdown

2a.2	Seed production/cleaning units	241,50	157,50	Provide support packages for entrepreneurs in production of fodder seed and seed cleaning units														Completed	packages were provided to 10 seed farms with high quality seeds and 10 clearing units
2a.3	Sheep participatory trials	501,38	125,00	Provide improved rams for sheep breeding to CIG, provide trainings, inputs, and technical support services														Completed	300 units were provided
2a.4	AI trials	100,00	17,00	Provide improved semen for cattle breeding to CIG, provide trainings, inputs, and technical services														Completed	30 trials were conducted and 1800 purebred bulls semen were provided
2a.5	Gender, youth development and social efficiency	38,20	10,80	Recruiting National consultant on Gender, youth development and social efficiency														Completed	1 national consultant recruited
2b	Sub - Component 2.2 - Improved Animal Health	555,81	532,29																
2b.1	Strengthening State Veterinary Inspection (SVI) - Institutional Assessment and Programme Development	20,30	8,00	Recruiting an National Consultant to undertake a participatory institutional assessment of the animal health system, to identify the institutional and capacity gaps which need to be addressed to strengthen its capacity as well as to develop Subcomponent's implementation programme														Completed	1 national consultant was recruited

2b.2	SVI - International study tours/ conferences	21,22	10,00	Conduct International training tours/ participation in international conferences on animal health by SVI representatives														Not Completed	This sub-component is facing challenges related to the veterinary services and has been highlighted in the supervision report. The project is restrategising its approach and It is highly likely that works will move into the next year
2b.3	SVI - Laboratory construction	160,45	160,45	Construction of regional veterinary laboratory in Dangara district														Unable	
2b.4	SVI - Laboratory equipment	164,45	164,45	Provide modern equipment for veterinary laboratories														Unable	
2b.5	Veterinary packages	170,00	170,00	Procure and provide veterinary packages for the participating qualified private vets (demand-driven)														Completed	60 packages were purchased, however delivery has not yet happened due to the challenges faced in this sub-component

2b.6	Training	19,39	19,39	Hiring qualified trainers to provide training on veterinary for Jamoat/district/oblast veterinarians, PUUs' vets and other relevant stakeholders															Unable	Due to challenges faced in the component
	SUB-TOTAL Component 2	2.244,41	1.162,59																	
3	Component 3 - Pasture Development and Diversification for Vulnerability Reduction																			
	Sub-component 3.1: Community Resilience Pasture Management and Investments	17.953,33	5.086,40																	
3a.1	Lead Consultant/Economist	Nat 99,85	18,00	Recruiting a National Economist Consultant (NEC) to undertake a project coordinator role															Completed	1 national consultant recruited
3a.2	Community Consultant/LC Assistant	Dev 59,90	12,00	Recruiting a National Community Development Consultant to assist in Development and Establishment of Community organization like PUU, CIG, Women groups and assist the Project Coordinator															Completed	1 national consultant recruited
3a.3	Pasture Management Consultant	Nat 59,90	10,80	Recruiting a National Pasture Management Consultant (PMC) to assist with preparation and implementation of Community Livestock and Pasture Management Plans (CLPMP), provide technical advice related to implementation of project demonstrations, trials and training and strengthening of veterinary services															Completed	1 national consultant recruited

3a.4	Livestock Nat Consultant	59,90	12,00	Recruiting a National Livestock Consultant (LC) to assist with preparation and implementation of Community Livestock and Pasture Management Plans technical advice related to implementation of project demonstrations, trials and training and strengthening of veterinary services.													Completed	1 national consultant recruited
3a.5	GIS/mapping Consultant	59,90	12,00	Recruiting a National Geographic Information Systems (GIS)/Mapping Consultant to assist with preparation and implementation of PDPs, technical advice.													Completed	1 national consultant recruited
3a.6	Climate Adaptation Consultant	52,45	10,80	Recruiting a National Climate Adaptation Consultant (CAC) to assist in identification of climate change and adaptation in livestock and pasture management and development													Completed	1 national consultant recruited
3a.7	Environmental Consultant	44,45	10,80	Recruiting a National Environmental Consultant (NEC) to assist in identification of environmental issue and aspects in livestock and pasture management and development													Completed	1 national consultant recruited
3a.8	GPS equipment and other usable for PUUs	93,98	-	Procure and provide GPS equipment and other usables for monitoring pasture rotation as well as some minor office equipment for PUUs													Completed in 2017	

3a.9	Pasture Management Plans Investments	17.423,00	5.000,00	PUUs with assistance from CF prepare CLPMPs and related investment sub-projects to improve livestock productivity, access to summer pasture, to increase fodder crop productivity, rural and pasture infrastructures rehabilitation, provide machinery and equipment including CA machineries, for landscape restoration (reforestation, watershed management etc). Minimum of 5% of the community grant will be allocated to protective and natural resource rehabilitation measures of degraded land, which could include fencing, demarcation, weed/shrub eradication, supplementary seeding of community pastures; for demonstration purpose and to learn about CA and about the natural re-vegetation potential; Introducing more environmentally sound natural resource management practices.														Ongoing (Started in 2017)	286 projects approved. Out of which 171 are ongoing and 115 are implemented
	Sub-component 3.2 Income Diversification	- 550,00	452,00																
3b.1	Business Development Consultant	50,00	12,00	Recruiting national consultant to facilitate and assist business development														Completed	1 consultant recruited

[illegible]

4a.10	Short-term TA	27,00	10,00	On demand														Completed	
4a.11	Translation services	38,00	5,00	On demand														Completed	Service Provider has been recruited
4a.12	Audit	81,00	16,00	Hiring a qualified Auditing company to provide Independent financial audit of the project														Ongoing	To be recruited before year-end
4a.13	National Internal Auditor		6,00	Recruiting a National Internal Auditor														Ongoing	Recruitment process ongoing
4a.14	Contracting PMU staff	208,40	50,00	Contract 2 District Project officers, 3 Drivers and Support staff (Cleaner/Messenger, Security)														Completed	
4a.15	Allowances and Social Fund	114,00	19,00															Completed	
4a.16	Office Running Costs	537,00	36,00	Provision of stationary, office and vehicles operation and maintenance, and insurance														Completed	
4a.17	Project planning and budgeting			Preparation and submission of draft AWPBs for second half of 2016 and 2017															
4a.18	Project planning and budgeting			Preparation and submission of project detailed AWPBs for 2019														To be completed	End of September
4a.19	Procurement plan			Preparation and submission draft Procurement Plan for a first 18 months and 2018														To be completed	End of septemeber
4a.20	Reporting			Preparation and submission of periodic reports														Ongoing (regular)	
4b	Sub-component 4(b): Monitoring and Evaluation	110,26	31,49																
4b.1	Stakeholder Review and Planning Workshops	2,00	0,50	Provide annual workshop on project implementation, activities, successes or issues														To be conducted in December	

[illegible]

Tajikistan

Livestock and Pasture Development Project II

Supervision Report

Appendix 3: Compliance with legal covenants: status of implementation

Mission Dates: 7 to 20 October 2018
Document Date: 22/01/2019
Project No. 2000000977
Report No. 4970-TJ

Near East, North Africa and Europe Division
Programme Management Department

Appendix 3: Compliance with legal covenants: Status of implementation

Section	Covenant	Target/Action Due Date	Compliance Status/Date	Remarks
Section B.6	Opening of the Designated Account	Opening prior to Effectiveness	Complied with	Designated Account at Eskhata Bank
Section B.7	Opening of 3 Project Accounts	One for each financing source	Complied with	Three project bank accounts and one for beneficiaries contribution at Eskhata Bank
Section E.2.a Section 7.11	The PMU has been set up and the Project Director and all other key project personnel appointed	Continuous	Complied with	
Section E.2.b	Acceptable software shall have been configured for the use by the project.	Continuous	Complied with	Done by the software company on March 2017
Section E.2.c	Project Implementation Manual (PIM) shall have been duly approved	Continuous	Complied with	Revised PIM approved by IFAD on September 2017
Section E.3	External and internal ToR shall have been submitted to IFAD for approval		Partially complied with	There is no internal auditor for the project.
Section 4.08 Section 7.06	Eligible Expenditures	IFAD financing proceeds to be used exclusively to finance Eligible Expenditures	Complied with	
Section 7.01	Annual Work Plans and Budgets and Procurement Plans to be submitted to Fund	No later than 60 days before beginning of each Fiscal Year	Complied with	The PMU shall prepare and submit a revised AWPB for the fiscal year 2017, for IFAD No Objection, according to the revised procurement plan approved by IFAD.
Section B.7.02	Availability of Grant Proceeds and Counterpart Funds	Continuous	Complied with	
Section 7.05	Procurement of goods, civil works and services in accordance with Schedule 4	Continuous	Complied with	
Section 7.08	PMU shall insure all goods and buildings used in the project and goods imported for the project	Continuous	Partially complied with	Vehicles are insured.

Section 8.02	Monitoring, establishment of information management system	Continuous	Complied with	
Section 8.03	Progress Reports to be submitted to IFAD on a six-monthly basis	No later than six weeks after the end of each six-month period	Complied with	
Section 8.03	A Mid-Term Review to be carried out jointly by Borrower and IFAD	No later than midpoint of the project	Not yet due	
Section 9.02	Submission of Financial Statements	Within 4 months after the end of each fiscal year	Complied with	.
Section 9.03	Audit Reports on project accounts of each year to be submitted to Fund	Within 6 months after the end of each fiscal year	Complied with	IFAD gave its NO, on 10 May 2017, that the audit of FY 16 could be waived for this year and combined with FY17

Tajikistan

Livestock and Pasture Development Project II Supervision Report

Appendix 4: Technical background analysis

Mission Dates: 7 to 20 October 2018
Document Date: 22/01/2019
Project No. 2000000977
Report No. 4970-TJ

Near East, North Africa and Europe Division
Programme Management Department

Appendix 4: Technical Background Analysis

Supplementary comments to Subcomponents 2.1 and 3.1

Component 2: Productivity Enhancement and Improved Animal Health

Sub component 2.1: Productivity enhancement

1. **Comments on the benefits of livestock breed improvement**

2. There are obvious production benefits to livestock breed improvement: higher weight gain, larger animals at maturity, and higher milk yield from cows, the latter two translating into more household income. Individual cross-bred animals can provide levels of production equivalent to production from two or three local-breed livestock, thus increasing production efficiency and reducing the need to keep as many livestock in one household.

In addition, fewer animals reduce grazing pressure on pasture and reduce the production of Green House Gases (GHG). Furthermore, a large ruminant animal generates less methane (a very potent GHG) per kg of bodyweight compared to a smaller animal. Several issues converge in favour of breed improvement: higher yield per animal, higher income, the option of a smaller herd for the same productivity with reduced grazing pressure on the pasture, and less adverse effects on climate change.

3. **Drinking Water Supplement: The need of drinking water for livestock in pastures**

4. Many PUUs consider that lack of drinking water for livestock in village pastures is a factor limiting livestock production. Without a source of water in pastures, especially in summer pastures, livestock must return to the village in the middle of the day to drink. When summer pastures are located at 5-8 km from the village, the mid-day walk is 10-16 km, which imposes a high maintenance cost on the animals. The energy required for mid-day travel may negate production benefits created by pasture rotation. This supplement examines the consumption of water by livestock when they are grazing, and weight-gain cost of walking to and from the village in the middle of the day.

Mid-day water consumption on summer pastures

5. Livestock managed in Khatlon Districts consume water in the village before heading to pasture, and again when they return from grazing in the late afternoon/ early evening. On hot summer days they generally obtain a drink in the middle of the day as well. If water is unavailable in the pasture where they are grazing, the herder will take them back to the village.

6. The actual water intake depends on many factors: air temperature, kind of animal and especially the nature of the coat as an insulator against heat, availability of shade, air humidity, and the water content of the pasture forage. Cattle have more obligatory water loss than sheep through their urine, faeces, respiratory tract and skin (12% of body weight per day for cattle versus 4% of body weight for sheep) according to a South African text. If grass has 30-50% water content under cool spring conditions, sheep may not need to drink at all. Breed of livestock is important: Zebu cattle can get by with half the water intake of Hereford cattle.

7. Data on livestock water consumption is usually expressed in total intake per day. American texts state that for sheep weighing 45-50 kg a conservative figure is 4 L per day. For a cow the comparable amount is 30-40 L per day. The American livestock tend to be larger than their Central Asian counterparts, so comparable figures in Tajikistan may be more like 3 L per day for sheep and goats and 20-25 L per day for cattle. From those daily totals the mid-day requirements need to be estimated. Given the early morning water intake, the mid-day water consumption must be up to only around 2 L for small ruminants and 12 L for cows. However, American and Australian textbooks suggest that both small and large ruminants need to drink only once per day. The pasture management specialist on the mission has observed herds of cattle in the Sahel drinking once every two days. Perhaps the Tajik herders are ensuring a greater mid-day water supply than the animals require.

Cost in reduced weight gain due to walking to and from water

8. Many PUUs do not have drinking water available for livestock on summer pastures. The LPDP is constructing concrete troughs in those pastures with water supplied by pipeline from a spring, generally several km away. So far, after two years of project activity, four troughs have been finished in the same general area of Dangara District. They are all connected to a spring by a 10-km pipe. In the course of discussions with PUU Board members, water supply is often identified as a critical issue. The question arises: What difference does water supply in summer pastures make to livestock productivity?

9. The most relevant study on this question was conducted in Wyoming (USA) in a region with a continental climate and a summer grazing regime. The work was published by Hart and associates in 1993. [Journal of Range Management 46:81-87] The area is used only for spring/summer grazing and the research was carried out for 5 years with 128 grazing days per year, mid-May to mid-September. The authors compared animal behaviour and animal performance in terms of distance travelled and weight gain in two paddocks of different sizes: one a small paddock of 24 ha and another a large elongated paddock of 207 ha. The farthest distance to water was 1.6 km in the small paddock and 5 km to water in the large paddock. The stocking rate was similar in both treatments, averaging 29.7 Animal Units in the large paddock and 30.3 Animal Units in the small paddock. [One Animal Unit in the U.S. is 454 kg.]

10. The cows spent 56% of time in the field grazing and 44% of their time in non-grazing activities such as resting and walking to and from water. During non-grazing activities in the large paddock the cows travelled, on average, 1.8 km/day more than in the small paddock; when travel-while-grazing is included, the cows in the large paddock travelled 2.9 km/day more than cows in the small paddock.

11. Cows were weighed every 4 weeks. Weight gain of cows in the large paddock averaged 0.17 kg/day less than for cows in the small paddock. This result matches estimates obtained by calculating an energy requirement of around 50 kilocalories/ km of travel/ 100kg of body weight, converted to body mass and then comparing the two treatments. Average weight of individual cows in this study was about 500 kg.

12. Cows in Khatlon Districts average around 250 kg body weight or half the weight of cows in the Wyoming study. By extrapolation we can assume that the effect of extra walking on weight gain was also roughly half, or 0.085 kg/day. Focusing only on the non-grazing walking of an extra 1.8 km/day in the large paddock, this difference in weight gain translates into 0.047 kg/km/day walked by a 250 kg cow.

13. Livestock in summer pastures in Khatlon region of Tajikistan may be grazing 4-5 km from the village on average. In the middle of the day they are herded back to the village for a drink of water if no water is available in the pasture. The round trip amounts to 8-10 km walking in the hot sun. Using the data from the Wyoming study, an average of 9 km extra mid-day walking imposes a weight gain cost of 0.42 kg/day. Over a summer grazing season of roughly 120 days, the production penalty for walking to-and-from the village in the middle of the day is 50 kg less weight gain per cow.

Component 3: Pasture Development and Diversification for Vulnerability Reduction

Sub component 3.1: Community Resilience Pasture Management and Investments

Pasture Rotation Supplement: The effect of pasture rotation on soil water infiltration

14. An inconspicuous effect of pasture rotation is increasing soil water storage and reducing erosion. Rotations involve long periods without grazing, during which the pasture vegetation increases in quantity and diversity, with leaf litter accumulating on the soil surface. Higher vegetative and litter cover impede the flow of rainwater over the ground, facilitating water infiltration into the soil and decreasing erosion. More water infiltration enhances water uptake by plants whose roots penetrate a deeper soil horizon during growth in the long rest periods of a rotation. Thus the bigger stand of forage observed under pasture rotation is partly due to a more favourable soil water regime or, in other words, more effective rainfall.

Additional comments on climate change resilience

15. Pasture rotation is the primary mechanism for combatting the adverse effects of climate change, and it has broad application over entire landscapes. Pasture rotations generate greater vegetation biomass with taller plants of higher plant density. The greatest climate-change threat to Tajik pastures is the occurrence of severe storms causing accelerated soil erosion. Vegetative cover with plants and litter resulting from rotational grazing can impede water flow over the soil surface. In addition, plant growth during the long rest periods in a rotation allows deeper root penetration into the soil, creating a framework that helps to hold the soil particles together. The silt soils prevalent in Khatlon region have very poor physical structure and are particularly susceptible to erosion and landslides.

Tajikistan

Livestock and Pasture Development Project II

Supervision Report

Appendix 5: Mission preparation and planning, TORs, schedules, people met

Mission Dates: 7 to 20 October 2018
Document Date: 22/01/2019
Project No. 2000000977
Report No. 4970-TJ

Near East, North Africa and Europe Division
Programme Management Department

Appendix 5: Mission Preparation and Planning, TORs, Schedules, People met.

A. Terms of reference

1. MISSION COMPOSITION:

(Team members full name and specialization)

Mr Swandip Sinha, Team Leader

Mr Brien Norton, Pasture Management Specialist

Mr Joldoshibek Dadybaev, Livestock Specialist

Financial Management Specialist

Mr Anvar Mamkulov, Procurement Specialist

Mr Rahul Antao, Sociologist

2. BACKGROUND:

3. You will proceed to Tajikistan (see Section V. Tentative Itinerary) to carry out the supervision mission for the LPDP. The mission shall take into consideration the minutes of any IFAD internal review processes, the previous IFAD supervision and follow-up mission recommendations, the experience gained from previous interventions supported by IFAD and other donors in Tajikistan, and any studies/surveys carried out by the Government and other external financiers. The objective of your assignment will be to produce a supervision report and related documentation in accordance with IFAD Guidelines.

Livestock and Market Development Programme 2

4. The LPDP2 was signed on 3 February 2016. The programme area is the Khatlon region, regions of Dangara, Farkhor, Hamodoni, Kulob and Vose. The goal of the project is to contribute to the reduction of poverty. The development objective is to increase the nutritional status and incomes of the target population by enhancing livestock productivity and climate resilience in a sustainable manner.

5. There are three components: (i) Institutional Development; (ii) Productivity Enhancement and Improved Animal Health; and (iii) Pasture Development and Diversification for Vulnerability Reduction. It also includes a range of climate change adaptation interventions funded by a grant from the Adaptation for Smallholder Agriculture Programme (ASAP). The day-to-day implementation of the project is carried out by the Project Management Unit (PMU) of the Ministry of Agriculture,

6. Objective and Outputs of the Mission

7. For the LPDP2, the objective of the mission is to assess achievements against targets, interim Programme impact, efficiency and effectiveness of Programme management, compliance with loan covenants, sustainability arrangements, and in general pertinence and validity of Programme design. The mission shall also assess the issues highlighted in the previous IFAD supervision missions and follow-up missions. On the basis of the mission findings, the mission shall provide recommendations on how to improve implementation and, as needed, adjust activities and/or implementation arrangements for the remaining Programme period.

8. The mission's findings shall be written in a draft Aide Mémoire, to be discussed at a wrap-up with Government Representatives in Dushanbe. Based on the wrap-up, the mission shall produce a final full Supervision Report.

9. Specific TORs for mission members team

Mr. Swandip Sinha, Team Leader will be responsible for the following tasks:

- Coordinate the overall mission, ensure synergies of the works of the mission team members and provide guidance to them in light of the mission overall objective.

- Review overall implementation progress with respect to the overall Programme objectives as well as those set in the AWPB.
- Assess the Project's activities under components 1, including progress towards the overall Programme objectives, against the latest AWPBs, as well as implementation of recommendations from the MTR mission
- Discuss implementation modalities, constraints and lessons learnt with relevant stakeholders.
- Assess the status of implementation of the previous IFAD mission recommendations.
- Lead the write-up of the aide-mémoire and the supervision report according to IFAD ORMS template and outline).

Mr. Ben Norton, Pasture Management Specialist will be responsible for the following tasks:

- Assess the Project's activities under components 2.1 and 3.1, including progress towards the overall Programme objectives, against the latest AWPBs, as well as implementation of recommendations from the MTR mission.
- Support the TL in assessing the Project's activities under component 1.
- Provide recommendations on how to improve implementation under components 1 and 3 and, as needed, adjust activities and/or implementation arrangements for the remaining Programme period to achieve sustainable outcomes.
- Contribute to the write up of the mission aide-memoire and supervision report.
- Undertake any other relevant task as agreed with Team Leader.

Mr. Joldoshbek Dadybaev, Livestock Specialist will be responsible for the following tasks:

- Assess the Project's activities under component 2.2, including progress towards the overall Programme objectives, against the latest AWPBs, as well as implementation of recommendations from the MTR mission.
- Support the TL in assessing the Project's activities under component 1.
- Provide recommendations on how to improve implementation under component 2 and, as needed, adjust activities and/or implementation arrangements for the remaining Programme period to achieve sustainable outcomes.
- Contribute to the write up of the mission aide-memoire and supervision report.
- Undertake any other relevant task as agreed with Team Leader.

Mr Rahul Antao, Sociologist, will

- Assess the Project's targeting, poverty focus, insti including progress towards the overall Programme objectives, against the latest AWPBs, as well as implementation of recommendations from the MTR mission.
- Assess the Project's activities under component 3.2, including progress towards the overall Programme objectives, against the latest AWPBs, as well as implementation of recommendations from the MTR mission.
- Conduct the relevant assessments to contribute with support from the other team members (as applicable) to the following sections of the supervision report and dimensions of the Aide Mémoire: Log-Frame Analysis & Main Issues of Effectiveness; Targeting and Outreach; Gender equality / women's participation; Nutrition; Human and Social Capital and Empowerment; Quality of beneficiary participation; Knowledge Management; coherence btw AWPB and implementation; and performance of M&E System.

- Provide recommendations on how to improve implementation pertaining to targeting, gender equality / women's participation, Knowledge Management and performance of the M&E System, adjust activities and/or implementation arrangements for the remaining Programme period to achieve sustainable outcomes.
- Undertake any other relevant task as agreed with Team Leader.

Finance Management Specialist, will undertake the review of financial management. More precisely, he shall undertake the following tasks:

- Review the operational/administrative arrangements to enhance the operational efficiency.
- Review the financial and administrative procedures, accounting and financial management system and documents retained under SOEs.
- Confirm the functionality of the accounting system and the financial reporting system.
- Examine the reconciliation statements of the special accounts and project accounts and verify the adequate management of the financial resources. Assess whether the advances are appropriate for the projected expenditure needs.
- Assess the performance of cash-flow management, including effective annual and multi-yearly budgetary planning.
- Review a sample of Withdrawal Applications and Statements of Expenditure to verify the adequacy, completeness and validity of claims.
- Review the status of the Counterpart Funds.
- Review the Programme's accounting books and records and ensure proper and adequate documentation to support the Programme's transactions.
- Review 2015 financial statements and audit reports.
- Make recommendations to Programme to improve all fiduciary related procedures and tasks.
- Assess the compliance with applicable guidelines and financial covenants.
- Follow up on the recommendations made by the last missions.
- Review the processes and practices of assets management (existence, maintenance, asset registers, etc.).
- Risk assessment activities – key tasks

(a) Consult via desk top review:

- Results of the latest External Audit Report (including specifically the Management letter) to ascertain whether any issues raised by the auditor identify potential fiduciary risks.
- Consult main findings, requests for clarification and action plan proposed by CFS with the latest audit review exercise.

(b) Re-assess the Programme Financial Management Arrangements:

- Review actions taken to address recommendations raised by external auditors on previous years' management letters, recommendations raised by CFS during the audit review exercise.
- Using the IFAD FMAQ as the basis to collect the relevant information re-assess the strengths and weaknesses of financial management systems, internal controls and financial reporting systems relating to financial management and financial administration of Programme funds in order to ensure that they satisfy IFAD's fiduciary requirements.

- Test check sample internal controls, by system “walk through” to ensure that approved procedures are consistently being followed.
- Identify current risks arising from material deficiencies and propose practical recommendations for improving financial management functions and/or staffing for financial operations needed to mitigate risk.
- Prepare the current Summary Risk Analysis.
- Contribute to the final Aide-Mémoire and Supervision Report, draft the required fiduciary annexes and provide appropriate inputs to Programme Status Reports. Prepare a Financial Management Assessment Questionnaire as well as update the PSR rating for the quality of financial management.

10. Ms Anvar Mamkulov, Procurement Specialist, will undertake review of procurement. More specifically, she will:

- Review the overall performance on procurement actions and systems of the Project and implementing partners.
- Follow up on the recommendations of the previous missions for the Project.
- Review and assess the procedures and processes applied for the procurement of goods, services and civil works, their adherence to IFAD guidelines and covenants, and performance in terms of efficiency and transparency.
- Identify the current risks arising from the material deficiencies and propose the practical recommendations for improving financial management and procurement functions needed to mitigate risk.
- Conduct procurement post-review.
- Contribute to the write-up of the Aide Mémoire and Supervision Report.

11. Tentative Itinerary

October		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16	17	18	19	20	21	22	23	24	25	26	27	28	29	30	31
Mission	Name	Mo	Tu	We	Th	Fr	Sa	Su	Mo	Tu	We	Th	Fr	Sa	Su	Mo	Tu	We	Th	Fr	Sa	Su	Mo	Tu	We	Th	Fr	Sa	Su	Mo	Tu	We
LPDP 2 SV	Swandip Sinha							t	c	c	c	f1	f1	f1	f1	c	c	c	c	c	t											
	Zainab Kenjaeva											f1	f1	f1	f1																	
	Anvar Mamkulov							t	c	c	c	c	c	t																		
	Joldoshibek Dadybaev							t	c	c	c	f1	f1	f1	f1	c	c	t														
	Ben Norton							t	c	c	c	f1	f1	f1	f1	c	c	c	c	c	t											
	Rahul Antao							t	c	c	c	f1	f1	f1	f1	c	c	c	c	c	t											
	Financial Management							t	c	c	c	c	c	c	c	c	c	t														

T=travel
C= capital
F1 = field