

Project Completion Report Validation

Agriculture, Farmers and Rural Areas Support Project in Gia Lai, Ninh Thuan and Tuyen Quang Provinces

Socialist Republic of Viet Nam

Date of validation by IOE: November 2018

I. Basic project data

			Approval (US\$ m)		Actual (US\$ m)**	
Region	Asia and the Pacific Division	Total project costs	65.35		65.15	
Country	Viet Nam	IFAD loan and percentage of total	48.04	73.5%	45.64	70.1%
Loan number	826-VN	Borrower	10.86	16.6%	12.42	19.1%
Type of project (subsector)	Rural Development	Cofinancier 1	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Financing type	IFAD Loan and grant	Cofinancier 2	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Lending terms *	HC	Cofinancier 3	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Date of approval	15 December 2010	Cofinancier 4	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Date of loan signature	25 February 2011	Beneficiaries	6.14	9.4%	6.79	10.4%
Date of effectiveness	25 February 2011	IFAD grant	0.31	0.5%	0.29	0.4%
Loan amendments	1 (2015)	Number of beneficiaries	132,600 HH (total) 73,800 HH (direct) 58,800 HH (indirect)		155,353 HH (total) 118,460 HH (direct) 36,893 HH (indirect)	
Loan closure extensions	1				31 March 2017 (completion) 30 September 2017 (closure)	
Country programme managers	Thomas Rath (current) Henning Pedersen (previous)	Loan closing date	31 March 2016			
Regional director(s)	Nigel Brett (current) Hoonae Kim (previous) Thomas Elhaut (previous)	Mid-term review			02-12 June 2014	
Project completion report reviewer	Renate Roels	IFAD loan/grant disbursement at project completion (%)			99% for both loan and grant***	
Project completion report quality control panel	Shijie Yang Fumiko Nakai	Date of the project completion report			26 September 2017	

Source: Project Completion Report and IFAD's financial database.

* There are four types of lending terms: (i) special loans on highly concessional terms, free of interest but bearing a service charge of three fourths of one per cent (0.75 per cent) per annum and having a maturity period of 40 years, including a grace period of 10 years; (ii) loans on hardened terms, bearing a service charge of three fourths of one per cent (0.75 per cent) per annum and having a maturity period of 20 years, including a grace period of 10 years; (iii) loans on intermediate terms, with a rate of interest per annum equivalent to 50 per cent of the variable reference interest rate and a maturity period of 20 years, including a grace period of 5 years; (iv) loans on ordinary terms, with a rate of interest per annum equivalent to one hundred per cent (100 per cent) of the variable reference interest rate, and a maturity period of 15-18 years, including a grace period of three years.

** The actual figure for the IFAD grant comes from the IFAD financing system (ORMS).

*** It does not correspond per cent for actual/appraisal in US\$ due to exchange rate between SDR and US\$.

II. Project outline

1. **Introduction.** The Agriculture, Farmers and Rural Areas Support Project (TNSP) aimed to develop the capacity of Tuyen Quang (TQ), Gia Lai (GL) and Ninh Thuan (NT) provinces to operationalize the Government of Viet Nam's policy for agriculture and rural development, also known as Tam Nong,¹ by focusing on investment activities tailored to the expressed needs of ethnic minorities and the rural poor. The project is therefore also named Tam Nong Support Project.
2. There was one overall project design report, but the subsequent reports were prepared separately for each province, i.e., the three provinces produced individual supervision reports, mid-term reviews (MTRs), project completion reports (PCRs), datasets and ratings. There is no overall PCR for the project but only an executive summary, which includes the province-specific ratings and overall ratings and three province-specific PCRs. Consequently, the three PCRs serve as a main basis for the validation.
3. The project was approved by the IFAD Executive Board on 15 December 2010 and became effective on 25 February 2011. Activities ended on 31 March 2017, for a total duration of six years. The loan was closed on 30 September 2017. A MTR was held in 2014, after 3.5 years of implementation.
4. **Project area.** The selection of the provinces was based on their location within three poor regions of the country² respectively having major populations of ethnic minorities³ with high rates of poverty, and with different levels of vulnerability to climate change, especially NT being the hottest, sunniest, and driest with the lowest rainfall in the country. The project provinces were expected to become 'leading rural development models' in their respective regions and serve an example to other poor communes and areas of deep poverty among ethnic minorities.
5. **Project goal, objectives and components.** The project was designed to improve the quality of life for rural people, with a particular focus on those living in the most disadvantaged areas (as described in the policy on Tam Nong). The objective of the project was to increase the participation in economic activities of 73,800 ethnic minority and rural poor households living in 117 poor communes in 16 districts of the three provinces of TQ (five districts⁴), GL (five districts) and NT (six districts).
6. The project had three components: (i) institutional strengthening for the implementation of pro-poor initiatives under Tam Nong; (ii) promotion of pro-poor value chains; and (iii) commune market-oriented socio-economic development planning and implementation. These three components covered a total of eleven sub-components.
7. **Target group.** The project's target group in the three provinces were poor households and ethnic minority households who are engaged in the agricultural sector as farmers, farm labourers, or in other roles. A particular focus was placed on reaching the poor, ethnic minority groups, and particularly women, in targeted value chains. Given the contextual differences within each of the three provinces, the design report includes descriptions of distinctive sub-groups of poor households and specific groups of ethnic minorities.
8. According to the project design report, about 73,800 households were supposed to benefit directly from the project, and 58,800 households indirectly according to the

¹ Tam Nong is also known as "Resolution 24 on Agriculture, Farmers and Rural Areas".

² TQ in the Northern Midlands and Mountain Areas (25.1% poverty rate); GL in Central Highlands (21% poverty rate) and; NT in North Central/Central Coastal Area (19.2% poverty rate). Source: VLSS, 2008 [PCR]

³ TQ has major populations of Tay, Dao and San Chay ethnic groups as well as several other groups with smaller local populations. GL has major populations from the Gia Rai and Ba Na ethnic groups and smaller, local population of other indigenous Central Highland ethnic groups as well as migrant ethnic groups from Northern Viet Nam (including Nung, Tay and Muong). NT has major populations of Cham and Raglai as well as several other groups with smaller local populations.

⁴ Finally, Tuyen Quang has 6 districts selected for TNSP as Na Hang was separated into Na Hang and Lam Binh districts.

design document.⁵ If divided by the ethnic/non-ethnic and the poor/near poor-not poor categories, 90 per cent of the beneficiaries are supposed to be ethnic and 46 per cent poor households. Common interest groups (CIGs) and collaborative groups were to be composed of poor and near-poor members to enhance opportunities and access to learning for poorer households.

9. **Financing.** The total project cost at design, including an allowance for physical contingencies and price contingencies, was estimated at US\$65.35 million. This included an IFAD contribution of US\$48.35 (loan of US\$48.04 million and a grant of US\$0.31), Government counterpart funds of US\$10.86 million and beneficiary contributions for the remaining US\$6.14 million of the project cost. These contributions did not change during the project.
10. The estimated costs for components 1 and 2; 'Institutional strengthening for implementation of pro-poor initiatives in Tam Nong' and 'Promotion of pro-poor value chains' were 17 per cent and 21 per cent of the baseline cost respectively. The third component, 'Commune Market Oriented Socio-Economic Development Planning and Implementation' represented the largest component, as illustrated in table 1 below. The actual figures do not differ much.

Table 1

Project component costs

<i>Component</i>	<i>US\$ '000 (design)</i>	<i>Percentage (design)</i>	<i>US\$ '000 (actual)</i>	<i>Percentage (actual)</i>
1. Institutional strengthening for the implementation of pro-poor initiatives under Tam Nong	9,811.5	17%	16,843	26%
2. Promotion of pro-poor value chains	12,536.7	21%	13,853	21%
3. Commune market-oriented socio-economic development planning and implementation	36,705.8	62%	34,457	53%
Sub-total	59,360.9	100%	-	-
Physical and price contingencies	5,995.7	10%	-	-
Total	65,356.6	110%	65,153	100%

Source: project design report (2010) and PCR (2017).

11. **Project implementation.** The Province Peoples' Committee (PPC), District Peoples' Committee and Commune Peoples' Committee had overall executing responsibility for the project management and coordination of all departments and agencies at their respective levels for implementation. At design, the project had decentralized the component coordination responsibility to a line department agency. The component lead agency for the first component was the Department of Planning and Investment in each province; for the second component it is the Department of Agriculture and Rural Development (DARD) in each province; and for the third it was the District Peoples' Committee in each district. As this limited the participation and involvement of district departments, management and implementation had been decentralized to district level since the MTR. The project was directly supervised by IFAD.
12. **Intervention logic.** The rationale of the project was to develop the capacity of the three provinces to operationalise the Tam Nong policy. Tam Nong set out a framework for the development of rural areas and aimed at addressing poverty and broad-based inclusive agricultural growth, closing the growth and poverty gap between poorer and better-off provinces, addressing low agricultural and labour productivity, low value and low quality production; providing strategic clarity in identifying and promoting

⁵ "Given that all villages in a commune will participate in the project and the capacity building at the commune level around using market-oriented participatory approaches for socio-economic development planning is designed to identify and address the priority constraints at the village level, it is expected that everyone in a village will benefit in some form or another from project activities" (design document).

market-driven options for tapping agricultural comparative and competitive advantage; and reversing the threats to sustainable natural resource management and associated forest degradation.⁶

13. To operationalize Tam Nong, there was need to improve the policy and institutional framework for decentralisation and improved governance; enhance private sector engagement in rural areas and agriculture; and ensure inclusion of the rural poor and ethnic minorities in local planning decision-making and development processes. In this context, TNSP **component 1 (institutional strengthening)** –referred to as the most important and first-to-be implemented– focused on strengthening the policy and institutional environment to be able to carry out effective and sustainable pro-poor market oriented activities with a focus on poor households and ethnic minorities, and to engage the private sector in the implementation of Tam Nong. **Component 2 (value chains)** focused on the promotion of demand-driven pro-poor value chain focused services for major mainstream products, linking poor, ethnic minority households to market opportunities. Lastly, **component 3 (community planning)** focused on the capacity-building of communes and villages, to be able to identify and prioritize their problems and opportunities associated with expanding their access to markets, in ways to ensure that poor households and ethnic minorities can participate and that annual market-oriented plans for demand driven, pro-poor rural development public investment are integrated in the Government's planning process.
14. **Delivery of outputs.** Output delivery of TNSP is documented in appendix 8 of each PCR, and attached in annex III of this PCR. Overall, the project has performed well reaching mostly 100 per cent of the expected targets, or more. Under component 1, for all three provinces, the output related to the organization of public-private partnership dialogue remained between 34 per cent (TQ) and 68 per cent (GL) of the expected target. In TQ the sub-component related to "*private sector development and partnership in agriculture and rural development*" has a majority of outputs (5 out of 9 indicators) underperforming. Under component 2, outputs were overall reached, except for the number of *Market Information Service Providers identified/ trained*, which remained at 84 per cent in NT and 50 per cent in TQ of the target. Furthermore, in TQ, the outputs related to *the competitive small grant fund* (for the promotion of agribusiness initiatives) reached between 64-70 per cent of the target. Under component 3, the outputs were overall reached.

III. Review of findings

A. Core criteria Relevance

15. The project objectives and activities were relevant to the strategic objectives of IFAD's Country Strategic Opportunities Programme 2008-2012. The project also made a direct contribution to supporting relevant national strategies and policies on rural and agricultural development and poverty reduction. At the time of project design and loan effectiveness, the Government issued two important strategies and policies, which were of direct relevance to the project: (i) the Tam Nong resolution; and (ii) the resolution on sustainable poverty reduction orientation for the 2011-2020 period.⁷ The project also aimed to develop the capacity of the three provinces to operationalize two national target programmes for agriculture and rural development⁸ and for poverty education.⁹ In addition, the project supported the new important pilot-restructuring programme¹⁰ with special focus on the development of agricultural value chains.
16. The project's key interventions such as the capacity-building for government agencies for market-oriented, participatory, socioeconomic development planning (known as MOP-

⁶ Design report, 2010.

⁷ Dated 19 May 2011 by Prime Minister.

⁸ The National Target Programme on New Rural Development for the 2010-2020 period.

⁹ The National Target Programme on Sustainable Poverty Reduction for 2012-2015 period.

¹⁰ Agricultural Restructuring towards Enhancing Added Value and Sustainable Development.

SEDP), value chain development and its various (funding) instruments, and decentralization and empowerment activities at community level were considered relevant to the needs of the target groups and benefiting communities.

17. However, due to the overambitious project design and missing instruments for private sector support and agribusiness engagement, the project startup was slow with delays in all project activities up to 2015. To improve the adequacy of the design, various changes were applied, among which: (i) the development of detailed guidelines for the competitive business grant (CBG) scheme for farmer groups and the competitive small grant (CSG) scheme for agri-business investments; (ii) the allocation of the project budget for the establishment of the Women Development Fund (WDF) to enable poor households (HHs) and women's access to non-collateral lending; (iii) improved technical research and more practical capacity building activities; (iv) simplified procedures and manuals; (v) the shift of implementation responsibilities to the district level to enhance their involvement and integration of funds in the MOP-SEDP; and (vi) the extension of the project for one year and re-allocation of the budget to produce better results, as many activities only started (or were introduced) after MTR. The lack of mitigation and risk management measures at design was a missed opportunity, which was particularly felt in NT and GL. This is further discussed in the dedicated section on climate adaptation (par. 68-72).
18. The first logical framework included indicators that were unclear or impossible to be achieved¹¹ and reporting systems were not fully developed. While this also improved at MTR, some weaknesses remained (e.g. some missing targets and lack of indicators for agricultural productivity and food security).
19. Relevance of targeting. The design included a detailed and diversified targeting strategy with descriptions of distinctive sub-groups of poor households and specific groups of ethnic minorities. This strategy was further improved during implementation to better fit the context. For example, the MTRs recommended to adjust the training approaches and to make them more flexible¹² so they would better fit local practises and knowledge and herewith better reach the poorer ethnic minorities. Moreover, a differentiated approach for "market-ready" and "non-market ready" areas was introduced to better fit the different settings (e.g. highlands vs. lowlands).
20. The wider participation of the poor and near-poor HHs was initially challenged in a number of value chains such as apple, grape, garlic and black pig (NT) and orange (TQ) due to complicated techniques and/or high investment requirements. However with the aforementioned adjustments, and the selection of additional agriculture products, their participation in the project eventually improved (see par. 29 – effectiveness section).
21. **In summary**, the project's objectives and components were in line with national policies and strategies, local needs and IFAD's Country Strategic Opportunities Programme. While some weaknesses remained in the design, it significantly improved during implementation. Therefore, the PCRV assesses the overall relevance of the project as *satisfactory (5)*, which is in agreement with the Programme Management Department (PMD) rating.

Effectiveness

22. It is challenging to assess the effectiveness given that there are sometimes different interventions and indicators in the three provinces under the same (sub) components. A breakdown for the number of ethnic minorities, poor/near-poor and women is only available in the main text of the PCRs and not in the physical progress tables. The validation therefore tried to highlight overarching results and examples where

¹¹ E.g. the indicator on market readiness, social auditing and the National Targeted Program for New Rural Development (Ninh Tuan MTR, 2014 page 16-17).

¹² E.g. no minimum number for group formation.

possible. For the aforementioned reasons, the numbers should be interpreted with caution.

23. **Effectiveness of targeting.** According to the PCRs, the project reached 155,353 households (HHs),¹³ including 118,460 direct beneficiary HHs¹⁴ and 36,893 indirect beneficiary HHs.¹⁵ The project therefore had a good outreach exceeding the targets (see paragraph 8). Looking at the sub-targets, the project claims to have reached the target for the inclusion of ethnic minority groups with fifty-four per cent (84,619 HHs) of the total number of HHs. The PCRs stated that the targets for the inclusion of ethnic minority households in project activities were never set in the project guidelines. Further analysis, as shown in table 2, shows that the proportion of ethnic minorities and poor/near poor HHs (the latter had a target of 60 per cent) in project activities varied among the three provinces. On average, good numbers were reached. The target of women (min. 30 per cent) was reached across project interventions.

Table 2

Proportion of poor/near poor households and ethnic minorities in project activities¹⁶

Province	Range of poor/near poor HH	Range of ethnic minorities
Ninh Thuan	36% - 69%	22% - 55%
Tuyen Quang	19% - 69%	49% - 80%
Gai Lai	46% - 67%	33% - 89%

Source: individual PCRs.

24. The Validation noted that, despite the very detailed and diversified targeting strategy at design, other reports¹⁷ do not document which ethnic minority groups were reached and where the actual beneficiaries were located (e.g. lowland, or in the more difficult to reach upland). It does acknowledge that the remote and disadvantaged districts and communes were more difficult to target.
25. **Outcome of component 1 (Institutional strengthening): *Institutional environment is strengthened for the implementation of pro-poor initiatives in Tam Nong.*** This outcome was rated satisfactory by the PCRs of the three provinces. The implementation of this component was slow in the first two years due to lack of experience in innovative market-oriented approaches and multilateral-financed project management, especially for NT and GL. After MTR, the sub-component on Market-Oriented Economic Management Capacity-Building was cancelled in GL, and re-focused toward more *practical* business planning training for local staff and enterprises, trade promotion and market facilitation training for government staff (at all levels), *instead of theoretical* training on market orientation, etc.
26. In fact, public-private-partnerships and private sector development proved to be challenging. The PCR of TQ reveals that the organization of public-private-partnerships dialogues and trade fairs were not practical (as indicated in the previous paragraph) or relevant to the context and therefore, instead, the project rather organized commodity workshops at district level to link farmer groups with value chain enterprises (36 events in TQ, 17 in GL and five in NT). Notwithstanding this change, results varied among the provinces and overall targets have not been fully achieved for these sub-components.¹⁸
27. The MOP-SEDP approach was developed in all three provinces, and eventually institutionalized in GL and NT, as an important foundation to integrate different resources to implement priorities for pro-poor economic development of the poor, ethnic minorities and other stakeholders in the value chains. The project coordination

¹³ That consisted of 66,140 HHs from TQ, 42,400 HHs from NT, and 46,813 HHs from GL.

¹⁴ 60,916 in TQ, 36,000 in NT and 21,544 in GL.

¹⁵ 5,224 HHs in TQ, 6,400 HHs in NT and 25,269 HHs in GL.

¹⁶ The table could not break down the comparison per project activity as not all PCRs report as such.

¹⁷ E.g. MTRs and supervision reports.

¹⁸ Between 34-260 per cent in TQ, 20-100 per cent in GL and 42-110 per cent in NT of the targets related to public-private-partnerships were achieved.

and knowledge sharing sub-component experienced some hiccups and delays during the initial years (e.g. misunderstanding of responsibilities in NT), however after some adjustments after MTR the coordination and management improved and the number of study tours has exceeded the target with 33 percent in TQ and 15 per cent in NT. In GL there was no target for study tours.

28. **Outcome of component 2 (Value chains):** *Demand-driven, value chain focused services (public and private) available for connecting poor, ethnic minority households to market opportunities.* Accelerated progress was gained after the MTR, attributed to some improvements made by the project, as previously discussed in paragraph 17. The key achievements under this component include: (i) the selection of 21 prioritized value chains (8 in TQ,¹⁹ 8 in NT²⁰ and 5 in GL²¹), development of 21 value chain development action plans at the provincial level and some supplementary value chains at the district level; and (ii) extension service diversification with farmers field school, farmer-to-farmer and enterprise-to-farmer methodology.
29. However, the identification, prioritization and support to pro-poor value chains faced some issues. For example, the targets for market information services²² were only fully achieved in GL. In TQ, the buffalo value chain could not continue due to the limited grazing land, the pig value chain lacked interventions at various fronts (e.g. safety, processing, etc.²³), the orange value chain lacked interventions on market linkages and processing, while the tea, canna and peanut chains faced low quality and productivity. In NT, the value chain technical working group experienced difficulty in reviewing the value chain actions plans and the assessment of the various interventions. Lastly, as previously mentioned, some value chains had limitations for the participation of poor and near-poor HHs. Their participation ultimately improved, by adding an additional number of agriculture products for specific target groups, among which onion, maize and chicken.²⁴
30. The diversification of agricultural extension services was successful in all provinces and the quality of public extension services was overall improved. According to the main text of the PCRs, a total of 381 CIGs were supported by CSG co-financing, following a "revolving fund mechanism" in most cases (96 in TQ, 138 in NT and 147 in GL), with 4,302 beneficiary HHs (67 per cent poor and near-poor, 58 per cent ethnic minorities, and 39 per cent women). Thirty-nine value chain lead enterprises were co-financed by the CBG fund (20 in TQ, 10 in NT and 9 in GL), with 7,784 beneficiary HHs (78 per cent poor and near-poor, 72 per cent ethnic minorities, and 64 per cent women) and the WDF establishment provided rural financial services to 654 savings and credit groups (249 in TQ, 226 in NT, 179 in GL), with 35,634 beneficiary HHs (66 per cent poor and near-poor, 74 per cent ethnic minorities, and 77 per cent women). The PCRs mention that the target groups appreciated all these so-called agribusiness initiatives as they provided additional resources (to which they have ownership), business linkages, improved capacity (inter alia in business plan preparation), and access to more qualitative inputs and techniques.
31. **Outcome of component 3 (Community planning):** *Poor and ethnic minority households in project communes and villages benefit from profitable and sustainable market opportunities.* According to various project documents, all three provinces completed annual MOP-SEDP plans and integrated them into their own annual planning and budgeting process following the institutionalization decisions of the PPC. The formation of CIGs exceeded the targets (105 per cent in NT, 169 per cent in GL and even 351 per cent in TQ) with sufficient participation of poor/near-poor and ethnic

¹⁹ Pig, canna, orange, acacia, buffalo, peanuts, tea and fish in TQ.

²⁰ Cow, sheep, goat, black pig, banana, apple, grape and garlic in NT.

²¹ Coffee, sugar cane, maize, cassava and cow in GL.

²² E.g. preparation of market opportunity briefs, organization of market opportunity information workshops, identification and training of market information service providers.

²³ Food safety animal production procedures, pork processing, animal feed processing, pig development planning and management, and market development to avoid high dependence on fluctuating Chinese market.

²⁴ In NT.

minority HHs. All activities (e.g. public and productive infrastructure and trainings on inter alia literacy) supported by the Community Development Fund (CDF) met or exceeded the target of the poor and participation of ethnic minorities (being 61 per cent poor/near-poor and 71 per cent ethnic minorities in TQ; 52 per cent poor/near-poor and 56 per cent ethnic minorities in NT; 67 per cent poor/near-poor and 83 per cent ethnic minorities in GL). The PCR of TQ, however, emphasises that the level of benefit received by the poor was still limited compared to the demand, as the CDF amount was still small for one commune, while the mobilization of contributions from the poor and the community was difficult. It is not clear if this is also applicable to other provinces – as the level of detail discussed in the project documents of each province, varies.

32. **In summary**, the project had a good outreach exceeding the targets. It faced some delays and hiccups during implementation, but ultimately adjusted and strengthened its approach resulting in good achievements of the project’s objectives and outcomes. Despite some delays and initial hiccups, the project objectives and expected outcomes were achieved. The project adjusted and strengthened its approach. The PCR rates effectiveness as *satisfactory* (5), same as PMD.

Efficiency

33. **Process efficiency**. The project became effective five months after approval, which is quicker than the IFAD global average of 12.4 months. The project was however extended with one year, yet this allowed the project to improve process efficiency and catch up on the activities that were lagging behind.
34. **Disbursements**. Despite good final progress, the NT and GL experienced efficiency issues till 2014. This was inter alia caused by the late approval of the annual work programme and budget and inadequate allocation of counterpart funds resulting in consistently late transfers of funds to the project units. During the project life span, the disbursements were also affected by the new Official Development Assistance policies of the government. Although the funds were transferred from IFAD to the designated account in Viet Nam, disbursements were not approved beyond the Official Development Assistance plan, slowing down disbursement. It is not clear from the project documents if TQ experienced any efficiency issues, and if not, what lessons could be learned.
35. The MTR was a turning year, and with IFAD recommendations and follow-up support, the disbursements improved significantly and implementation delays were overcome. At project closure, the IFAD loan and grant were disbursed for 95 per cent at the US Dollar account and for 99 per cent at the SDR account. A detailed breakdown per province can be found in annex IV of the PCR. As it can be seen in the table, the disbursement of government contributions was 83 per cent in NT – according to the PCR this is due to understaffed project management during the initial years, resulting in lower contribution from counterpart financing.
36. **Cost per beneficiary**. The Validation calculated US\$546,68 per direct beneficiary household for the entire project (approx. US\$129.55 per person), US\$562,18 in TQ, US\$644,68 in GL and US\$461,81 in NT. These figures are similar to other comparable projects in the country.
37. **Internal rate of return (IRR)**. The IRR of the whole project in 20 years was estimated at 23 per cent, 24 per cent and 31 per cent for TQ, NT and GL respectively, exceeding the targeted IRR of 20 per cent at design. However, it should be noted that the target set at design was based on TQ province’s data only, and no adjustment for the crops and animals grown in the other two provinces was made. Therefore, the IRR target could be rather conservative for NT and GL, where the commodity markets are deemed relatively more developed than in TQ, according to the PCRs. The IRR varied by province and type of investment, specifically for the CBG,²⁵ the CSG,²⁶ the WD,^{F27}

²⁵ 128 per cent in TQ, 160 per cent in NT, and 168 per cent in GL.

and public infrastructure.²⁸ The two revolving funds in GL also produced a satisfactory IRR of 63 per cent.

38. **In summary**, even if the project faced serious impediments during the initial years, it managed to establish satisfactory disbursement rates, IRRs, and good costs per beneficiary. Therefore, the PCRV agrees with the *satisfactory* (5) rating of PMD.

Rural poverty impact

39. The PCRs, based on Department of Labour, War Invalids and Social Affairs data, reported that the reduction in the poverty rate targets were met in the respective project communes. In TQ by 67 per cent,²⁹ in GL by 38 per cent and in NT by 13 per cent,³⁰ despite a revised higher poverty line.³¹ While the overall design report and supervision reports up to 2015 include a poverty rate reduction target of 20 per cent, the NT PCR states a target of 10 per cent. The PCRV could not find a justification for this target reduction in NT.
40. For the impact domains discussed below, the PCRV relied mainly on data included in the PCRs of the individual provinces, as a full impact assessment in English has only been conducted for NT. The Validation further noted that although the Results and Impact Management System (RIMS) reports include a control group, they do not seem to present an analysis of the statistical significance of the observed changes and that different figures are presented in the PCR summary, the individual PCRs and the physical progress tables in the appendixes. Moreover, some contradicting trends (par. 44) and contradicting numbers in the PCR main text and annexes, some wrong calculations and unclear provincial targets (par. 39 incl. footnotes), influence of other national programmes (par. 15) as well as reliance on secondary provincial-level data (for agricultural productivity) influence the credibility of the data and the extent of attribution to the project. Data should therefore be interpreted with some caution.
41. **Household income.** In NT, 60 per cent of the HHs participating in the supported value chains experienced an increase in income by 25 per cent or more (which was the target). Garlic, onion, and sugarcane are the crops with the highest percentage (99-100 per cent) of the HHs gaining at least 25 per cent income increase, followed by rice, apple, and asparagus (60-89 per cent). The cow value chain only reached about 24 per cent as most of the cows are being held as assets. Finally, banana, cassava, sheep, and handicraft were the worst performing value chains, and did not provide an income increase by 25 per cent. The PCR states that this result is attributable to different factors such as prolonged and severe drought or late support from the project.
42. In GL, the overall income improvement averaging across all value chains was 26 per cent. The level of improvement varied among the value chains, reaching as high as 221 per cent in the chicken one and 187 per cent for the maize one, while missing the target in the cassava and sugar cane ones (only 7 per cent and 8 per cent increase respectively). The challenge was mainly the securing of capable buyers for cassava

²⁶ 225 per cent in TQ, 83 per cent in NT and 94 per cent in GL.

²⁷ 25 per cent in both NT and GL.

²⁸ 428 per cent in TQ, but only 17 per cent to 19 per cent in NT and GL.

²⁹ The PCR of TQ states a decrease of 41.6 per cent between 2011-2015, however this is incorrect. The poverty rate was reduced by 41.6 per cent points (from 61.7 per cent in 2011 to 20.1 per cent in 2015), which is equivalent to a 67 per cent decrease. Nonetheless, the target of 20 per cent decrease has been reached.

³⁰ The PCR of NT states a decrease of 14 per cent, however this is incorrect. The poverty rate was reduced by 4 per cent points (from 32 per cent in 2011 to 28 per cent in 2016), which is equivalent to a 13 per cent decrease.

³¹ According to the previous poverty standard (2011-2015), the poor HHs were the rural HHs with income of 400,000 VND/ person / month or less and the urban HHs with income of 500,000 VND/ person / month or less. Since January 2016, the Government has adopted the multi-dimensional poverty standard, whereby rural poor HHs are the ones that meet one of the following two criteria: (i) having an average income of 700,000 VND/person/month or less; or (ii) having an average income of more than 700,000 VND/person/month to 1,000,000 VND/person/month and lacking three or more measurement criteria on basic social service access (PCR).

and sugar, two large-volume low-price commodities, and the lack of more profitable alternative crops. The value chain performance of coffee, cow, goat and pig range between 25-40 per cent. The income of TQ's HHs increased by 31.2 per cent in the local hybrid pig value chain to 367.9 per cent in the tea value chain. In the fish, goat, canna, chicken, peanut, fattening pig and alcohol value chains, the value increase varied between 161.8 per cent and 351,8 per cent. The TQ PCR does not highlight any not well-performing value chains.

43. **Assets.** The household asset ownership improved in the three provinces in most types of assets such as mobile phones, trucks, ploughing and shredding machines. The improvement in HHs' asset ownership is largely owed to improved income from geographically targeted project interventions and to government investments in grid connection, irrigation, the country's booming economy etc., while radios, televisions, fridges are used for consumption, vehicles and motorbikes are mainly for production purposes, and bikes and cell phones are for mixed use.
44. Despite improvement in household assets, results from the Principle Component Analysis (PCA)³² are controversial. PCA ratios of the poorest and poor groups³³ increased respectively by 105 per cent and 16 per cent in NT, and by 9 per cent and 3 per cent in GL, not meeting the target of a 5 per cent decrease for NT and a 25 per cent decrease for GL. As the PCA indicator was calculated automatically via the RIMS software designed by IFAD, it was not possible for the project team or company hired to do the impact survey, to find out reasons for this contradicting trend.
45. **Human and social capital and empowerment.** Satisfactory impact was achieved for this criterion and this is mainly reflected by better technical and marketing capacities of the project beneficiaries. Data included in the PCRs point out that a large proportion of HHs in the project area benefitted from the project-supported extension services (e.g. technical training on crop and livestock), and that the HHs were able to combine the improved techniques and processes with other project activities, most importantly the CDF, CSG, CBG and WDF. Business plan development and marketing skills of farmers were applied mainly through interactions among CIGs (779 CIGs in GL; 448 CIGs in NT; 537 CIGs in TQ) and between farmers and contracted enterprises. By joining CIGs, ethnic minorities and poor HHs were able to benefit from the enterprises, but also from the better-off farmers in terms of technical and business experience, information and labour, and even financial support.
46. Due to high participation rates in the MOP-SEDP meetings (between 42-72 per cent at village level), the beneficiaries have a better voice in the planning and decision making processes and are more able to present their priorities and needs on basic infrastructure schemes and other investments for production and livelihoods improvement.
47. **Agricultural productivity.** As the project logical framework did not include a relevant indicator for agricultural productivity (see also par. 19), the PCRs included secondary statistical data from DARD for this impact domain. However, as the statistical data did not benefit from additional in-depth analysis, improvements in agricultural productivity can only partly be attributed to TNSP's contribution through investment in local infrastructure, productive infrastructure, agricultural extension, financial services, inputs support, and better connection with enterprises and other service providers in the project areas.
48. This being said, in TQ, statistics from the agriculture sector in the period 2011-2016 showed an important shift in the provincial agricultural structure towards market-oriented commodity production, with a significant increase in the production of project

³² PCA is an aggregate indicator used to reflect relative wealth of the project households. Its measurement is based on 11 sub indicators including: (i) floor materials for housing; (ii) number of living rooms; (iii) main water supply sources; (iv) toilets; (v) common consumables; (vi) transport vehicles; (vii) cooking fuels; (viii) food shortage time; (ix) household's crop production; (x) production tools; and (xi) household's animal production.

³³ This indicator was not set for the TNSP in TQ.

supported crops and animals. For example the increase in production of maize could be attributed to the expansion of production area (4,532 ha increase) and partly to the project, which supported more livestock and liquor production (that used maize as staple feed for animals and essential raw materials for liquor distillation).

49. Agricultural productivity for key crops and animals has overall improved in NT over the 2011-2016 period, even if in the context of prolonged and severe drought in the last three years, a number of crops and animals were affected. Maize and cassava are the two crops most affected by the drought. Despite this, the yields of various crops increased to different levels, especially for apple (increased 24.1 tons/ha), grape (with additional 7.1 tons/ha), sugarcane (with 4 ton/ha more) and even cassava and maize (with 2.4 and 0.4 tons/ha more respectively). In GL, the average yields of cash crops in the project areas have increased at a low (3 per cent for sugar cane and 7 per cent for maize) or moderate level (11 per cent for cassava and 15 per cent for coffee) while the growing area increased at a moderate, high and very high level (ranging between 13 and 189 per cent). The total production of key animals, particularly cow, goat and pig, increased by 9–11 per cent by the end of the project.
50. **Food security.** The number of HHs suffering from food shortage decreased substantially in GL and NT (with a 47 and 46 per cent reduction respectively) and moderately in TQ with a 25 per cent reduction over the 2011–2016 period. Moreover, the average duration of food shortage was cut down from 4.7 months to 2.6 months in GL, from 5.5 months to 5 months in NT and from 5.6 weeks in 2011 to 2.4 weeks in TQ – even if the results for the NT and TQ are similar to the non-project areas. According to the PCR these positive results are said to be partly attributable to the improved yields and income levels.
51. Child chronic malnutrition decreased by 12 per cent in TQ, 18 per cent in GL and 28 per cent in NT between 2011-2016, exceeding the target of 10 per cent. However, the rate of child acute malnutrition increased more than double (from 12 to 27 per cent) over the same period in GL. In NT the rate of children with acute malnutrition has a slight increase of 3 per cent while the situation in TQ did not change much, remaining at a 9 per cent rate acute malnutrition. Reasons in the PCRs are inter alia lack of knowledge, insufficient food for nursing mothers or little children for some time. More research is needed to understand the cause(s), especially since malnutrition was set to be the main indicator for the achievement of the project goal.
52. **Institutions and policies.** TNSP had good institutional and policy implications across the three provinces. Various decisions were issued by the PPC related to investment promotion and support policies, among which: (i) the issuance of provincial action plans to improve the Provincial Competitiveness Index; (ii) the development of poultry and cattle slaughters (in NT); and (iii) the implementation of administrative reform in business registration for enterprises (TQ). The MOP-SEDP was institutionalized in GL and NT for province-wide application in 2016. In TQ this was not achieved at completion. There is no mention of this being possible in the future. A number of other project practises were adopted by local government programmes (see scaling-up section).
53. The WDF has operated since 2016. Due to its limited funding capital and new operation, the impact was modest, but reached a high number of women (see gender section). Other community-based groups/institutions established by the project (CIGs, CGs, VDBs, CDBs) reflect good impact on this domain across the three provinces and in TQ six CIGs were successfully transformed into co-operatives. This performance equally counts for the enhanced capacities of all involved agencies, particularly with respect to the conduct of annual MOP-SEDP planning at village and commune levels. Improved capacity is also expected to continue to impact value chain development.
54. **In summary**, the project managed to generate a satisfactory impact by improving income levels and increasing beneficiary assets, even if the increase in PCA ratios contradicts with the latter. The project was also successful in empowering the project

beneficiaries, in strengthening institutions and the policy environment, and in improving agricultural productivity – even if benefits can only partially be attributed to the project. The project was moderately satisfactory in terms of improving food security. Overall the PCRV assigns a rating of *satisfactory* (5) to the rural poverty impact domain, in agreement with the PMD rating.

Sustainability of benefits

55. The provincial governments have shown a high level of commitment to sustain the project benefits, particularly through: (i) the institutionalization³⁴ and rolling out of the MOP-SEDP approach; (ii) replication of successful practices from the project;³⁵ (iii) policies and decisions to promote further private investment, especially in agribusiness; and (iv) approving the project exit strategy. Other key contributions were, among others: (i) the high social acceptance of the innovative instruments³⁶ by local communities, target groups, private enterprises, and local agencies; and (ii) accessibility to farmers of most of the improved technologies and techniques supported by the project. Non-project CIGs emerged and the majority of farmers is said to reinvest their money in the revolving funds, implying that economic sustainability was convincing to the beneficiaries.
56. Yet, the expected sustainability is mixed across the provinces and the project benefits. This is mainly due to the late implementation of many activities. While functional upgrading with some CIGs was noted in GL, others still have low management and operation and maintenance capacities, and a large share of CIGs is moderately or poorly performing in TQ and NT. Moreover, in NT, most CIGs-funded by a CDF do not have a real revolving fund to maintain operation of the group. While in TQ the management of the CBGs was handed over to the Provincial Young Business Association to promote greater sustainability, in NT the CBG mechanism was discontinued after the project affecting the sustainability of the CIGs and enterprise-CIGs linkages. At the same time the financing institutions, such as the commercial banks, were not involved in a more sustainable value chain financing model. The farmer-to farmer and farmer field school approach is said to continue after the project, yet the Farmer's Union lacks sufficient funding and capacity to support the CIGs in TQ and NT and is confused about their role in supporting CIGs in GL. Even if the WDF was a relative new operation, it has a strategic plan for 2016-2020 in all three provinces to become self-sufficient. In TQ, it still lacked guidelines on its administration, operational experience and knowledge and working facilities at completion.
57. The sustainability of the value chain development activities was fragile at project completion, due to: (i) insufficient and thus-far ineffective mitigation and risk management measures to support farmers to overcome consequences caused by climate change, diseases, and market price fluctuation; (ii) the not-sustained value chain technical working groups in TQ due to the lack of sufficient and clear policies regarding the role and responsibilities of the group members; and (iii) decreasing price trends for certain crop value chains,³⁷ and the challenge to get sufficient budget allocation from the central level and more enabling policies for additional strategic investment in value chain upgrading and the attraction of private investment in GL.
58. The improved institutional capacity of a great number of implementing agencies at provincial, district and commune levels³⁸ is expected to contribute to sustaining most of the project results and approaches. Yet, as the introduced project instruments are relatively new, it is expected to take some time before they are fully embedded in the respective work of (inter alia) the Farmer's Union and DARD.

³⁴ In GL and NT. See also section on institutions and policies.

³⁵ See section on scaling-up.

³⁶ Such as MOP-SEDP, CDF, CBG, CSG, and WDF.

³⁷ E.g., maize.

³⁸ E.g. DPI, DOIT/TPIEC, Women's Union.

59. **In summary**, due to the high commitment of the government and improved institutional capacity of a great number of implementing agencies, yet mixed and fragile results across the provinces and the project benefits, the PCV rates the sustainability of TNSP as *moderately satisfactory* (4) compared to PMD's satisfactory (5) rating.

B. Other performance criteria

Innovation

60. So-called "new-to-the-context" innovative approaches were implemented in the project, including: (i) socio-economic management, decentralization and bottom-up planning through the MOP-SEDP; (ii) agricultural extension through farmer-to-farmer and enterprise-led training method; (iii) value chain development that is based on market/value chain analysis, containing various (funding) instruments to facilitate investment of the private sector and the common-interest groups (CIGs), and connecting poor, ethnic minority households to market opportunities; and (iv) engaging the poor and EM households into value chain-based CIGs with support from a community development fund in public infrastructure, human capacity development and productive infrastructure. According to the design report, these innovations were already used or tested in other areas, but new to the TNSP project area. In all provinces, the introduced innovations were successfully implemented, rated satisfactory by the PCRs and even being scaled up as described in the next section. **In summary**, given these positive features, the PCRV rates the innovation criterion *satisfactory* (5), same as PMD.

Scaling up

61. The farmer-to-farmer and enterprise-led training method has not yet been institutionalized in the provinces, however both public and private actors and some government-funded programmes, such as the National Target Programme on New Rural Development and the 135 Programme,³⁹ have replicated the practice. In GL, the value chain development approach and its instruments were positively rated by local authorities at all levels and fellow projects for scaling-up. The PCR reports that in certain value chains, the CIGs have expanded by themselves with new members or formed new groups beyond the project. This approach also became an important part of the World Bank-funded Highlands Poverty Reduction Project. In NT, the value chain development approach has become an important part of the provincial programme on "Agricultural Restructuring towards Enhancing Added Value and Sustainable Development", even if the PPC faced difficulty in finding financial resources for its implementation. Nonetheless, the identification of potential markets and enterprises for NT products has already been integrated into the Trade Promotion and Industry Extension Center's ongoing trade promotion activities. **In summary**, based on the information presented above, the PCRV assigns a rating of *satisfactory* (5) to the scaling up criterion, in line with PMD.

Gender equality and women's empowerment

62. **Participation.** The project aimed to achieve gender balance in all project interventions and gender-disaggregated indicators were included in the M&E system.⁴⁰ The target of having at least 30 per cent participation of women in all project activities in GL and NT and 50 per cent in TQ is fully achieved in all provinces. The highest participation was in the WDF, with 97 per cent women participating in the women saving and credit groups in GL and NT and 98 per cent in TQ. Similarly, women's participation in the CIGs was also at a sufficient level at 44 per cent in GL and NT and

³⁹ The Socio-economic Development Programme for Ethnic Minority Areas (SEDEMA), more commonly referred to as Programme 135 (P135) is a national poverty reduction programme that began in 1998 for a 7-year period and in 2006 was extended to 2010. Its target area is communes and villages in remote ethnic minority and mountainous areas facing extreme difficulties, with harsh natural conditions and few opportunities to participate in national and mainstream economic growth.

⁴⁰ Even though gender disaggregated data is difficult to find in the project documents.

even 52 per cent in TQ. In other interventions such as agricultural extension, CBG, CSG and rural infrastructure, women participation accounted for 30-82.9 per cent, the latter being for CBG participation in TQ.

63. **Empowerment.** While the gender-related RIMS data for TQ and GL could not be consulted (as they are in Vietnamese), an independent consulting firm produced a detailed English end-line survey for NT. This report highlights that, while the ratios are generally still in favour of men, over time, women gained more decision-making power in production activities, selling of products and other family issues, and are contributing more to the HH income as compared to baseline results.
64. In the PCR of GL, gender is considered moderately satisfactory, compared to satisfactory ratings in TQ and NT. GL data shows that there was not any significant improvement in the role of women in decision-making. The low position of women in family decision-making was partly attributable to their weakening role in income earning for the family, which were reported in the mid-term and end line surveys.⁴¹ Similarly, the rate of women participating in extension trainings and both village- and commune-level MOP-SEPD meetings⁴² was a few times lower that of men. Limited social engagement of women in community activities (and CIGs) was partly related to the traditional attitude of local people on the role of women, their lack of time due to housework burden, and perhaps limited language skills and education opportunities of rural women and girls, especially those from ethnic minority groups. It is not clear from the documents if this difference in results compared to NT and TQ is context related and/or project related. Both PCRs of NT and GL highlight that gender equality and women's empowerment remain areas for improvement that requires continuous efforts.
65. **Gender data.** The Validation noted that apart from participation numbers, the subject of gender equality and women's empowerment is poorly covered in the supervision reports, the MTRs and the PCRs of TQ and NT. The PCRV also noted that the documents do not report if the women are disadvantaged women from the poor and near-poor HHs and ethnic minority groups. Moreover, while the TNSP gender strategy aimed to ensure that the project would not expand women's workload, an assessment of such is missing at MTR and PCR.
66. **In summary,** based on the achievements in terms of targeting and the increased female participation, but the need for further improvement in addressing empowerment issues in the field and capturing such information/data in reports; the PCRV assigns a rating of *moderately satisfactory* (4) to this criterion. This is one rating below the PMD rating (5).

Environment and natural resources management

67. The project had a positive contribution to local environment and better natural resource management. The introduction of VietGAP⁴³, integrated pest management as well as the replication of the "one must and 5 reduction practice in NT"⁴⁴ helped to reduce pesticide and chemical fertilizer usage in agricultural production. Environmental awareness raising for farmers that triggered behaviour changes in environmental protection and sanitation, for example, water saving, use of biogas tanks (and herewith a reduction of wood cutting), manure collection for fertilization as well as a slaughterhouse⁴⁵ and cattle cages, helped reduce pollution and diseases and enhanced food safety. Additionally, in NT, a couple of garbage collection groups were

⁴¹ The rate of the wife being the key bread winner reduced from 18 per cent at the baseline to 15 per cent at the mid-term and 16 per cent at the end-line survey, while that of the husband increased from 21 per cent to 53 per cent and 54 per cent respectively. Sons were the key breadwinners in more cases than daughters.

⁴² Only 5 per cent of the women participated in the commune-level MOP-SEDP meetings and 9 per cent in the village-level MOP-SEDP meetings while that of men was respectively 21 per cent and 30 per cent at the end-line survey in 2016.

⁴³ Vietnamese Good Agricultural Practices.

⁴⁴ This is a new practice promoted by MARD in rice cultivation, requiring farmers to use certified seeds, and reduce quantity of seeds, urea, chemical fertilizers, irrigation water and post-harvest loss.

⁴⁵ In Krong Pa district, GL.

put into operation, generating income for poor labour in the communes and keeping the environment safe and clean. In GL, the value chain development for *boi loi*, a multi-purpose forestry and non-timber forest products tree, encouraged forest plantation. No negative effects were reported, only that attention should be paid to possible environmental issues arising from further value chain development, for example through canna root processing and pig waste. **In summary**, based on the information presented above, the PCRV assigns a rating of *satisfactory* (5) to this criterion, in line with the PMD score.

Adaptation to climate change

68. The severe 2014-2016 drought in NT has seriously affected the project progress and results, the livelihood of its population, and agricultural development in general. This resulted inter alia in the risk of crop failure, the halt of various project investment plans in crop cultivation and animal raising, serious lack of livestock feed throughout the province, desertification of some land areas, and the carrying of water (during this period 8,916⁴⁶ smallholders) from far distance to their farms. In response, DARD, with some help from TNSP, initiated a number of interventions.⁴⁷ DARD and the project also undertook a number of measures⁴⁸ in TQ, which suffered heavy rains causing landslides and flash floods to certain areas, and damaging cold in winter killing cattle and other animals. GL experienced challenges related to drought and lowering underground water level, which directly affected the key market commodities such as coffee, sugar cane and also rice production. Also here DARD initiated interventions as done in NT.
69. The various interventions were relatively late and the interventions were evaluated by the PCR as thus far insufficient (and in NT in-effective). The TNSP design made reference to climate change vulnerability in the project area and its alignment to the IFAD Climate Change Strategy, yet no mitigation and risk management measures or indicators were included. Reference to climate change starts to appear in the MTRs, yet mostly in relation to environment and natural resource management. The various weather events and mitigation measures are -other than in the PCR- under discussed.
70. **In summary**, there was a lack of attention to climate change measures in the design and project documents. Awareness was raised during implementation, but the interventions were late and not sufficiently able to compensate for the deficit at design. Therefore, the PCRV assigns a rating of *moderately unsatisfactory* (3) to this criterion. This is two ratings below the PMD rating.

Overall project achievement

71. The TNSP was a relatively large and ambitious project that targeted three provinces in Viet Nam. The project managed, despite the impediments it faced during the initial years, to reach good results. The number of beneficiaries reached exceeded the target figure, the project activities were overall effective, and a good level of impact was reached. Other successes were the inclusion and scaling up of various innovative approaches and positive contributions to local environment and better natural resource management.
72. The sustainability of benefits was fragile at project completion, and gender equality and women's empowerment remain areas for improvement that requires continuous efforts. The late introduction of mitigation and risk-management measures resulted in a moderately unsatisfactory performance of the adaptation to climate change criterion. Yet, continues support and capacity-building activities enabled the project to reach satisfactory achievement of project objectives and impact. **In summary**, the PCRV rates the overall project achievement *satisfactory* (5), in line with PMD.

⁴⁶ The 2015 Supervision Report states 22,130 farmers.

⁴⁷ E.g. drip water irrigation investment through CSG/CGB, shift to more drought resilient crops and animals, extended vaccination support and conservation of fodder.

⁴⁸ E.g. animal food fermentation techniques to preserve food.

C. Performance of partners

73. **IFAD.** The project start-up was slow due to a number of design weaknesses. As described under relevance, IFAD worked together with the implementing agencies to make the initial design more operational. These adjustments were relevant and effective, but took place too late to prevent a slow pace during the first years. Good recommendations from annual supervision missions, follow-up support, and capacity development activities provided by IFAD to the project implementation unit and implementing agencies enabled the project to take actions in response to the identified issues. These actions, plus extending the project by one year, and organizing “learning routes” and experience exchanges with other IFAD-funded provinces in Viet Nam enabled the project to reach satisfactory achievement of project objectives and impact. Based on IFAD’s recommendations in the MTR, the project logical framework was revised and RIMS surveys were implemented to measure the second- and third-level indicators, which were subsequently updated in annual reports. As explained under relevance, a few gaps remained though.
74. Better results could have potentially been achieved if these improvements were introduced sooner, in order to give enterprises and CIGs more time to form production and business linkages, and to give implementing agencies at the various levels more time to fully embed the innovative approaches in the respective work; resulting in a better foundation for sustainability. **In summary**, based on the design revisions, the strong commitment and good supervision, the performance of IFAD as a partner is rated *satisfactory* (5), same as PMD.
75. **Government.** Given the complexity of the TNSP project, during the first 2-3 years, implementation was slow due to lack of knowledge and experience in market based approaches, methodologies and project management procedures, delayed fund transfer, difficult transportation conditions and low community awareness. Since the MTR, with the assistance of additional technical experts, the implementation capacity of project districts and communes was significantly improved. Since 2015, loan withdrawal was affected by new regulations on Official Development Assistance management. Government agencies supported PPC to resolve this issue. At the local level, the PPCs made a timely direction to implement IFAD’s recommendations, especially with regards to advancing the provincial budget for project activities while awaiting Official Development Assistance allocation from the central government. PPC also supported decentralization of investment ownership to districts and communes, enabled integration of different resources, improved the business enabling environment, and issued decisions to institutionalize the project’s innovative practices (e.g. MOP-SEDP). Through good technical support provided by the district agencies, the communes were able to perform better as “investment owners” - which is an important basis to maintain and replicate the project achievements.
76. **M&E.** The results-based M&E faced difficulties up to 2015, but thanks to the pressures of project implementation during the last reporting period, competent project staff, IFAD Country Office support and involvement of intensive technical assistance, the project managed to create a substantial database. The project documents highlight that these data could have been applied better in the project planning, reporting documents and management meetings. **In summary**, based on good commitment, support and improved capacity, the overall government performance is rated as *satisfactory* (5) the same as PMD.

IV. Assessment of PCR quality

77. **Scope.** The three PCRs are all well-written reports with a quality format. The narrative is based on the latest indicators and both positive and negative results are reported. There is however a lost opportunity for knowledge management in not looking at the project as a whole unit in one detailed completion report, but instead having documented separate, but also overlapping information in three individual PCRs. Also for the purpose of evaluation, and the comparison of performance, it would have been

more useful to have had the project results of the three provinces gathered under each criterion.

78. The PCRs, by and large, follow the IFAD guidelines and cover all evaluation criteria, albeit with a variation of detail and depth among the PCRs. Occasionally, the same information is repeated in the PCRs, while other information (like certain design issues), that is relevant to all three project areas, is only mentioned in one or two PCRs, not all three. For certain sections in the TQ PCR, there is less explanation on the “why”. While all three PCRs are rich in information on the efficiency of the project investments, little information is presented on management efficiency. The subject of gender equality and women's empowerment is poorly covered. As mentioned in the report, it is also not clear which ethnic groups were reached and where these groups were located (e.g. lowland, or in the more difficult to reach upland). Based on these results, the scope of the PCRs is rated *moderately satisfactory* (4).
79. **Quality.** Provincial and district workshops took place in each province to validate the project findings. Overall, the analysis presented and lessons drawn in the PCRs are largely good. At the same time, some of the data presented are not used consistently or contradict each other (e.g. between the overall executive summary PCR report and the individual PCRs and the physical progress tables in the appendices). The Validation also noted that the PCRs do not report if the women are disadvantaged women from the poor and near-poor HHs and ethnic minority groups. Therefore, this aspect of the PCRs gets a rating of *moderately satisfactory* (4).
80. **Lessons.** The PCRs present many useful and informative lessons on the project and recommendations for the improvement of similar projects in the future. Therefore, the PCR rates this criterion as *satisfactory* (5).
81. **Candour.** Even though the PCR finds that some sections in the PCRs over-emphasize the achievement of results on the ground, project issues are treated transparently and candidly, and both positive and negative lessons are illustrated. Overall, the PCR assigns a *satisfactory* (5) rating.

V. Lessons learned

82. The PCRs identify a number of lessons. The most prominent ones are summarized below.
83. Sustainable and pro-poor value chains work when strong lead firms with high capacity in production, processing and trading are identified for potential province-wide value chains; they should be selected based on high market potential, poverty reduction potential, and relevance to local conditions (climate, lands) in the project areas and of the target groups; and CIGs should be formed by the lead firms in selected value chains and with a revolving fund; the identification of pro-poor value chains at design is key to a successful targeting strategy and to ensure that the poor are not excluded from project's benefits.
84. Agricultural extension services should adopt a market-oriented and results-based management approach to hold accountability of both service providers and users, with a focus on expanding enterprise-to-farmer and farmer-to-farmer extension.
85. Project design should include risk mitigation and management measures in order to support farmers in coping with the climate change-triggered consequences. Moreover, differentiated livelihood strategies and plans should be considered in the most difficult districts where CBG-supported enterprises and some value chains are less applicable to the poor ethnic minorities. Also attention to nutrition of vulnerable groups should be considered for suitable interventions.

Definition and rating of the evaluation criteria used by IOE

Criteria	Definition	Mandatory	To be rated
Rural poverty impact	Impact is defined as the changes that have occurred or are expected to occur in the lives of the rural poor (whether positive or negative, direct or indirect, intended or unintended) as a result of development interventions.	X	Yes
	<i>Four impact domains</i>		
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Household income and net assets: Household income provides a means of assessing the flow of economic benefits accruing to an individual or group, whereas assets relate to a stock of accumulated items of economic value. The analysis must include an assessment of trends in equality over time. 		No
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Human and social capital and empowerment: Human and social capital and empowerment include an assessment of the changes that have occurred in the empowerment of individuals, the quality of grass-roots organizations and institutions, the poor's individual and collective capacity, and in particular, the extent to which specific groups such as youth are included or excluded from the development process. 		No
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Food security and agricultural productivity: Changes in food security relate to availability, stability, affordability and access to food and stability of access, whereas changes in agricultural productivity are measured in terms of yields; nutrition relates to the nutritional value of food and child malnutrition. 		No
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Institutions and policies: The criterion relating to institutions and policies is designed to assess changes in the quality and performance of institutions, policies and the regulatory framework that influence the lives of the poor. 		No
Project performance	Project performance is an average of the ratings for relevance, effectiveness, efficiency and sustainability of benefits.	X	Yes
Relevance	The extent to which the objectives of a development intervention are consistent with beneficiaries' requirements, country needs, institutional priorities and partner and donor policies. It also entails an assessment of project design and coherence in achieving its objectives. An assessment should also be made of whether objectives and design address inequality, for example, by assessing the relevance of targeting strategies adopted.	X	Yes
Effectiveness	The extent to which the development intervention's objectives were achieved, or are expected to be achieved, taking into account their relative importance.	X	Yes
Efficiency	A measure of how economically resources/inputs (funds, expertise, time, etc.) are converted into results.	X	Yes
Sustainability of benefits	The likely continuation of net benefits from a development intervention beyond the phase of external funding support. It also includes an assessment of the likelihood that actual and anticipated results will be resilient to risks beyond the project's life.	X	Yes
Other performance criteria			
Gender equality and women's empowerment	The extent to which IFAD interventions have contributed to better gender equality and women's empowerment, for example, in terms of women's access to and ownership of assets, resources and services; participation in decision making; work load balance and impact on women's incomes, nutrition and livelihoods.	X	Yes
Innovation	The extent to which IFAD development interventions have introduced innovative approaches to rural poverty reduction.	X	Yes
Scaling up	The extent to which IFAD development interventions have been (or are likely to be) scaled up by government authorities, donor organizations, the private sector and others agencies.	X	Yes
Environment and natural resources management	The extent to which IFAD development interventions contribute to resilient livelihoods and ecosystems. The focus is on the use and management of the natural environment, including natural resources defined as raw materials used for socio-economic and cultural purposes, and ecosystems and biodiversity - with the goods and services they provide.	X	Yes
Adaptation to climate change	The contribution of the project to reducing the negative impacts of climate change through dedicated adaptation or risk reduction measures.	X	Yes

<i>Criteria</i>	<i>Definition</i> *	<i>Mandatory</i>	<i>To be rated</i>
Overall project achievement	This provides an overarching assessment of the intervention, drawing upon the analysis and ratings for rural poverty impact, relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, sustainability of benefits, gender equality and women's empowerment, innovation, scaling up, as well as environment and natural resources management, and adaptation to climate change.	X	Yes
Performance of partners			
• IFAD	This criterion assesses the contribution of partners to project design, execution, monitoring and reporting, supervision and implementation support, and evaluation. The performance of each partner will be assessed on an individual basis with a view to the partner's expected role and responsibility in the project life cycle.	X	Yes
• Government		X	Yes

* These definitions build on the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development/Development Assistance Committee (OECD/DAC) Glossary of Key Terms in Evaluation and Results-Based Management; the Methodological Framework for Project Evaluation agreed with the Evaluation Committee in September 2003; the first edition of the Evaluation Manual discussed with the Evaluation Committee in December 2008; and further discussions with the Evaluation Committee in November 2010 on IOE's evaluation criteria and key questions.

Rating comparison^a

<i>Criteria</i>	<i>Programme Management Department (PMD) rating</i>	<i>IOE Project Completion Report Validation (PCRVR) rating</i>	<i>Net rating disconnect (PCRVR-PMD)</i>
Rural poverty impact	5	5	0
Project performance			
Relevance	5	5	0
Effectiveness	5	5	0
Efficiency	5	5	0
Sustainability of benefits	5	4	-1
Project performance^b	5	4.5	-0.3
Other performance criteria			
Gender equality and women's empowerment	5	4	-1
Innovation	5	5	0
Scaling up	5	5	0
Environment and natural resources management	5	5	0
Adaptation to climate change	5	3	-2
Overall project achievement^c	5	5	0
Performance of partners^d			
IFAD	5	5	0
Government	5	5	0
Average net disconnect			-0.33

^a Rating scale: 1 = highly unsatisfactory; 2 = unsatisfactory; 3 = moderately unsatisfactory; 4 = moderately satisfactory; 5 = satisfactory; 6 = highly satisfactory; n.p. = not provided; n.a. = not applicable.

^b Arithmetic average of ratings for relevance, effectiveness, efficiency and sustainability of benefits.

^c This is not an average of ratings of individual evaluation criteria but an overarching assessment of the project, drawing upon the rating for relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, sustainability of benefits, rural poverty impact, gender, innovation, scaling up, environment and natural resources management, and adaptation to climate change.

^d The rating for partners' performance is not a component of the overall project achievement rating.

Ratings of the project completion report quality

	<i>PMD rating</i>	<i>IOE PCRVR rating</i>	<i>Net disconnect</i>
Candour	n.p.	5	n.a.
Lessons	n.p.	5	n.a.
Quality (methods, data, participatory process)	n.p.	4	n.a.
Scope	n.p.	4	n.a.

Rating scale: 1 = highly unsatisfactory; 2 = unsatisfactory; 3 = moderately unsatisfactory; 4 = moderately satisfactory; 5 = satisfactory; 6 = highly satisfactory; n.p. = not provided; n.a. = not applicable.

Physical progress tables of Tuyen Quang, Gia Lai and Ninh Thuan

Tuyen Quang

Project components	Indicators	Unit	Cumulative Actual	Appraisal target	%
Goal: Increase the quality of material and spiritual life for rural people, especially those who live in most disadvantaged areas.	10% reduction in child (< 5 years) malnutrition (weight for height) by end of Project:	%	9	0	0
	10% reduction in child (< 5 years) malnutrition (height for age) by end of Project:	%	35	37	120
	10% reduction in child (< 5 years) malnutrition (weight for age) by end of Project:	%	16	9	30
Development objective: Sustained and profitable economic participation of 57,238 households living in 64 poor communes in 5 districts of the Tuyen Quang province.	25% increase in the household assets index (value of relevant productive assets) of poor and ethnic minority households in the project communes	%	Rate of hhs that have Refrigerator: 59%; Motorbike: 89%; Agr. Machinery: 23%; Telephone: 93%. The value index of main assets of hhs increased by 20.4% in compared with 2011 index.	25	82
	Percentage of poor HHHs in project communes decrease by 30%.	%	20	32	139
	Annual agricultural production improvement rate is of at least 4% since Y3 of the project	VND billion	7000	5.726.5	129
Component 1: Institutional Strengthening for Implementation of Pro-Poor Initiatives in Tam Nong					
OUTCOME 1: Policy and institutional environment strengthened to carry out effective and sustainable pro-poor market oriented innovations with a focus on ethnic minorities, and to engage the private sector in the implementation of Tam Nong	PCI: 72.47 point at the end of the Project	points	55	72	75
	25% increase in the number of agribusiness related private sector investment in project areas	VND billion	327,36	278,45	188
	MOP-SEDP approach mainstreamed into DPI's annual planning and budgeting process and integrating government resources at district and commune levels by end of Project.		MOP-SEDP approach implemented in 64 project communes, and 77 un-project communes.	MOP-SEDP approach implemented	100

Sub-Component 1.1. Market-Oriented Economic Management Capacity Building					
Output 1.1.1: Provincial and district level authorities capacities built for implementing the National Targeted Program for New Rural Development (NTP-NRD)	Training completed for 30 provincial and district level DPI, DARD, DOTI staff implementing the national targeted programs.	#	30	30	100
	Training of trainers on market access and trade promotion for 30 provincial and district staff.	#	85	30	280
	Training on market access and trade promotion for 150 commune level staff.	#	380	150	253
	90% percent of staff can explain key concepts from the training.	%	90	90	100
Output 1.1.2: Training syllabus developed and implemented for training of trainers in the project target districts and communes	TOT Training syllabus developed.		TOT Training syllabus developed.	TOT Training syllabus developed.	100
	195 Trainers trained on market-oriented public administration, local economic planning and management, procurement procedures or financial management	#	200	195	105
	Training completed for 700 CDB members on market-oriented public administration, local economic planning and management, procurement procedures and financial management	#	878	700	125
Output 1.1.3: Capacities Built on Market Oriented Business Planning Service Delivery	Market-Oriented Business Planning curriculum developed		Curriculum developed	Curriculum developed	100
	Core group of 135 trainers trained on market oriented business planning.	#	91	135	67
	Training completed for 1,500 commune/village level participants on market-oriented business planning	#	1525	1500	102
Sub-Component 1.2 Institutionalization of market-oriented, results-based, participatory socio-economic development planning and implementation process (MOP-SEDP)					
Output 1.2.1 : MOP-SEDP Methodology and Guidelines developed	MOP-SEDP Thematic Working Group established and functional.	#	7	7	100
	MOP-SEDP Guidelines formulated and disseminated		Guidelines formulated and disseminated	Guidelines formulated and disseminated	100
	Procedures and Norms for mainstreaming the MOP-SEDP into the Provinces' annual planning and budgeting process defined and implemented.		Procedures and Norms implemented	Procedures and Norms implemented	100
	PPC decisions with regards to the mainstreaming of the MOP-SEDP		Decision no. 118/QĐ-UBND dated 17/4/2015	PPC decision issued	100

Output 1.2.2: NTP NRD activities integrated into MOP-SEDP methodology	Objectives and content of the NTP NRD are incorporated in the MOP-SEDP guidelines (continue to implement MOP-SEDP for 2014)		Guidelines developed	Guidelines developed	
	Target districts' resources for the NTP-NRD being allocated to implement MOP-SEDP priorities.		Resources allocated	Resources allocated	100
Output 1.2.3: MOP-SEDP guidelines institutionalized within the local economic development process	Training completed for 150 district staff and 700 CDB members on the MOP-SEDP methodology	#	1840	1620	115
	MOP-SEDP Methodology tested in 15 communes in year one and results of pilot test documented	#	141	64	220
	Province level and district-level stakeholder consultations conducted to review lessons from pilot activities and refine MOP-SEDP methodology.	#	7	6	116
Sub-Component 1.3. Private sector development and partnership in agriculture and rural development					
Output 1.3.1: Thematic Working Group on Business Environment Reform (TWG-BER) established.	TWG-BER established and functional. (the group being functional in 2013)		TWG-BER established and functional	TWG-BER established and functional	100
	Actions plans developed, updated annually, and implemented for development of more efficient business regulations and regulatory processes and improvement of the Province Competitiveness Index (PCI).	#	2	5	40
	Policies and/or regulations modified or established to improve the business environment.	#	2	3	66,7
Output 1.3.2: Current status of private sector engagement in agriculture sector reviewed in the provinces	- Comprehensive review of the private sector in agriculture production, processing and trading completed and updated annually in the province.	#	3	5	60
	- A PCI improvement action plan in agricultural field developed and approved by the PPC for implementation.	#	1	1	100
Output 1.3.3: Public-private policy dialogue organized	Six forums organized annually in the province and each district to facilitate public-private policy dialogue around input supply, contract farming, agro-processing and/or marketing.	#	11	30	34
Output 1.3.4: Bi-annual public-private partnership promotion fairs organized	Two partnership promotion fairs organized and implemented annually in each district	#	28	50	56
	10 cooperative alliance models or associations that link teams/groups together for district and provincial level commodity production areas being formed (supplying input or together selling output and delivering other technical services).	#	26	10	260
	26 contracts signed.	#	26	26	100

Sub-Component 1.4 Strengthening Coordination and Knowledge Sharing					
Output 1.4.1: Project Steering Committee established	Project steering committee established and 20 quarterly meetings held by PSC.	#	18	20(meetings)	90
Output 1.4.2: Coordination among implementing agencies established	Burn rates for budgets of core lead agencies and component implementing agencies within 10% of target burn rates by year 4.	%	7	10	128
	80% of designated members of multi-sectoral working or coordination groups attending at least 90% of scheduled meetings.	%	91	90	113
Output 1.4.3: Project Coordination Unit (PCU) established	PCU established.		PCU established.	PCU established.	100
	100% of annual audits are without critical findings.		100% of annual audits are without critical findings	100% of annual audits are without critical findings	100
	Progress against annual output targets are within 90% of targets.	%	2013: 75%	90	83
		%	2014: 96.8%	90	108
		%	2015: 85%	90	94
%		2016: 92%	90	101	
Output 1.4.4: Monitoring and Evaluation System established	Three evaluation events completed (at baseline, mid-term and completion)	#	3	3	100
	Two annual household surveys completed	#	2	2	100
	20 quarterly monitoring reports compiled	#	22	20	110
Output 1.4.5: Knowledge shared within and outside the project	Study tours for key staff and farmers.	#	32	24	133
	90% of participants on study tours recall key content from study tours six months after the tour.	%	95	90	106

Component 2: Promotion of Pro-Poor Value Chains					
OUTCOME 2: Demand driven, value chain focused services (public and private) available for connecting poor, ethnic minority households to market opportunities	20% increase in value of targeted value chain commodities marketed annually per district;	VND million	1717200	Pig: 1,456,930	207
		VND million	555790	Buffalo: 216,974	1037
		VND million	7320	Arrow root: 5,910	243
		VND million	736220	Orange: 117,691	3253
		VND million	251120	Peanut: 206,958	228
		VND million	1.117.000	Acacia: 970,090	191
	50% percent of targeted households have at least a 25% increase in income from targeted value chain sources.	VND million	238.6	Pig: 61	398
		VND million	14.4	Buffalo: 10	80,5
		VND million	210.8	Arrow root: 60	341
		VND million	90.37	Orange: 88	28,5
		VND million	258.97	Peanut: 207.50	56
		VND million	368.2	Tea: 134	243
		VND million	9.95	Acacia: 3.4	266
	Sub-Component 2.1. Identification and Prioritization of Value Chains				
Output 2.1.1: Pro-poor Value Chain analyses and selection completed	Identification of at least six major pro-poor value chains in each year of the project.	#	6	6	100
	PPC decisions with regards to the mainstreaming of Value Chain Analysis	#	6	6	100
Output 2.1.2: Value Chain Action plans developed	6 value chain action plans per year developed and implemented	#	12	12	100
	Value chain action plans prepared for two new value chains (tea and fisheries) at least 40% poor and near poor HHs involved in.	#	2	2	100
Output 2.1.3: Market Opportunities Information Services delivered	6 Market Opportunities Briefs per year developed	#	18	30	60
	4 Market Information Service Providers Identified and trained in the province	#	2	4	50
	Events held in 06 districts and 64 communes to deliver Market Opportunities Briefs to CDBs and CIGs/CGs	#	70	70	100

Sub-Component 2.2 Value chain technical research and extension services					
Output 2.2.1: Agricultural technical services provision diversified	Staff of Mass Organizations and Cooperative Alliance (2 per provincial, 2 per district and 1 per commune) trained to support organization and operation of common interest groups.	#	116	90	129
	Private sector agricultural input suppliers trained on safety topics and appropriate technical topics associated with selected value chains.	#	70	45	155
	Young commune staff (1 per commune) trained in improved agriculture production techniques enabling them to engage in selected value chains.	#	64	64	100
	Key farmers (1 per commune) trained on improved production systems and trade/marketing for prioritized value chains.	#	64	64	100
Output 2.2.2: Quality and availability of DARD extension services upgraded	DARD extension workers (4 per province and 4 per district) trained in FFS methodology, basic knowledge on health and safety in the use of agro-chemicals, and improved production techniques associated with selected value chains.	#	70	28	250
	FFS pilots (1 per district) completed and analyzed.	#	6	5	120
	300 person-days of study tours organized on topics relevant to selected value chain action plans	#	106	100	106
	Veterinary service providers (4 per province and 4 per district) trained in topics relevant to selected value chain action plans	#	40	28	142
	Extension staff (4 per province and 4 per district) trained in improved extension methods using modern technologies.	#	80	28	285
	Demonstration models developed by District-level Extension Units, District Veterinary, Agriculture & Fisheries Extension, Plant Protection, & Forestry Protection Units	#	22	20	110
Sub-Component 2.3. Promotion of Pro-Poor Agribusiness Initiatives					
Output 2.3.1: Pro-poor Agribusiness Promotion Fund	CBG and CSG Manuals finalized, of which Agribusiness Policies and Procedures were clearly stated. For CIGs/CGs and agribusinesses	#	Manuals finalized	Manuals finalized	100
	At least 50% poor and near poor get direct benefits from those grants.	%	65	50	130
	CSG manual revised toward more simplification and directly support to remote CGs/CIGs and where there are lots of poor HHs.		Manual revised	Manual revised	100
Output 2.3.2: Agribusiness Fund promoted to potential target beneficiaries	07 promotional events organized to introduce about CSG and CBG at province and district levels.	#	8	7	114
	Promotional materials developed and disseminated.	#	4	2	200

Output 2.3.3 : Pro-poor Agribusiness Fund invested	150 CGs/CIGs and household businesses benefited from CSG with at least 1,500 direct beneficiaries. 10% contribution from CGs/CIGs.	#	96 CGs/CIGs	150 CGs/CIGs	64
		#	1,061 hhs	1,500 hhs(65% poor and near poor hhs)	70
	15 private companies and cooperatives accessed resources of CBG with 51% available fund from business owners and linked to CIGs	#	20	15	133
Sub-Component 2.4. Improving access to rural financial services					
Output 2.4.1: Strategies for enhancing credit access and encouraging local savings among the rural poor developed	Inventory of rural financial market (both formal and informal) completed.		Inventory completed	Inventory completed	0
	The microfinance fund developed and operated by the Provincial Women's Union to lend women under groups/teams for economic and production development.		Fund established	Fund established	100
Output 2.4.2: Financial services for pro-poor value chains strengthened	TOT Training completed for credit officers from VBARD	#	30	45	
	Pilot lending activity with VBARD completed and analyzed		Proposal reviewed and approved to 4 groups (with 39 member), with lending fund of VND 195 million.	Lending implemented	100
	TOT Training on SCG facilitation provided to VBSP credit officers	#	80	64	125
	WU staff at the commune level trained on VBARD lending policies, VBSP programs and savings mobilization through SCG	#	144	138	138
Component 3: Commune Market-oriented Socio-economic Development Planning and Implementation					
OUTCOME 3: Poor and ethnic minority households in project communes and villages benefiting from profitable and sustainable market opportunities	Percent of HH below the DOLISA Poverty Line in project communes	%	20	32	138
	Impact Group Beneficiaries: Direct: 40,000hh	hhs	46594	40000	116
	100% of the project communes meet at least 50% of the NTP-NRD criteria	%	23.4% number of communes	100% number of communes	23
	60% of the project communes in districts of Son Duong, Yen Son, Ham Yen, Chiem Hoa and 30% from districts of Na Hang and Lam Binh fall into the market ready category (better access to services, market information, market orientation of the commune officials, poor households participating in profitable market opportunities and local decision making), 20% potential products sold in markets annually)	%	Sơn Dương: 50%	Sơn Dương: 60%	83
		%	Yên Sơn: 50%	Yên Sơn: 60%	83
		%	Hàm Yên: 40%	Hàm Yên: 60%	67
		%	Na Hang: 30%	Na Hang: 30%	100
		%	Chiêm Hóa: 21%	Chiêm Hóa: 30%	70
		%	Lâm Bình: 14%	Lâm Bình: 30%	47

	85% of communes have the MOP-SEDP approach mainstreamed into their annual planning and budgeting process by EOP.	%	100	85	118
	100% of activities financed from CDF resources meet or exceed targeting criteria for participation of the poor and ethnic minorities (50% poor hhs, 70% ethnic minority hhs).	%	44.7% poor and near poor hhs	50% poor and near poor hhs	89
		%	71% ethnic minority hhs	70% ethnic minority hhs	101
Sub-Component 3.1: Planning Capacities for MOP SEDP					
Output 3.1.1: Commune Development Boards oriented on key principles and trained on MOP SEDP	64 CDBs (including Village Heads) receive basic orientation on concepts and the MOP-SEDP approach	#	64	64	100
	77 non-project communes (770 people) trained basically on concept and MOP-SEDP approach.	#	770	770	100
	Cross-visits organized between communes	#	64	64	100
	90% of CDB members can adequately explain the key concepts from the orientations by the end of year 2.	%	75	90	83
Output 3.1.2: Commune Value Chain Strategies Developed	64 CDBs develop Value Chain Strategies for each of the selected value chains that are deemed relevant to the commune.	#	64	64	100
	85% of value chain strategies surpass performance standards for practicality and relevance	%	100	85	118
Output 3.1.3: Village Development Plans Formulated	All Project villages formulate Village Development Plans annually beginning in year 2.	#	64	64	100
	77 non-project communes developed village development plans.	#	77	77	100
	85% of village development plans surpass performance standards for participation, practicality and relevance for 141 communes	%	100	85	118
	Sufficient proposals developed by Village Development Boards to utilize allocated CDF funds	#	815	815	100
Output 3.1.4: Commune Development Plans Formulated	141 communes develop communal Socio-Economic Development Plans	#	141	141	100
	85% of plans surpass performance standards for participation, practicality and relevance for 141 communes	%	100	85	118
Output 3.1.5: Participatory Monitoring and Evaluation & Social Audit Implemented	All Project communes and villages establish participatory monitoring and evaluation systems for self-assessing performance.	#	64	64	100
	90% of communes can cite significant changes made in their activities as a result of PME information.	%	90	90	100

Sub-Component 3.2: Engaging the Poor in Value Chains					
Output 3.2.1: Common Interest Groups and Collaborative Groups Identified and Oriented	Inventory of existing CIGs/CGs completed in 64 communes.		Inventory of existing CIGs/CGs completed	Inventory of existing CIGs/CGs completed	100
	Relevant CIGs/CGs identified in each commune and included in value chain development plans.	#	526	150	351
	Organizational capacity assessments conducted on targeted CIGs/CGs.	#	526	150	351
	Training on value chains, leadership skills, entrepreneurship and business planning completed with targeted CIGs/CGs	#	526	150	351
Output 3.2.2: Common Interest Group/Collaborative Group Proposals Developed	Sufficient proposals meeting criteria developed to utilize CDF matching grant funds allocated to the commune for Public infrastructure works	#	885	885	100
	Sufficient proposals meeting criteria developed to utilize CDF matching grant funds allocated to the commune for Productive infrastructure works	#	8452	8452	100
Sub-Component 3.3: Community Development Fund					
Output 3.3.1: CDF-funded Activities Implemented	VND 296,063.7 million (US\$ 15,917,402) in IFAD resources used in CDF activities	VND million	272230	296064	91,9
	VND 17,342.8 million (US\$ 932,410) in Government of Vietnam contributions used in CDF activities.	VND million	17715	17343	102
	VND 30,444.3 million (US\$ 1,636,788) in private sector and community cash or in-kind contributions used in CDF activities.	VND million	20786	30444	68
	100% of activities financed from CDF resources meet or exceed targeting criteria for participation of the poor (50%)	%	59	50	117
	100% of activities financed from CDF resources meet or exceed targeting criteria for participation of the ethnic minorities (70%)	%	71	70	100
	NTP-NRD INDICATOR No 12	#	128/129 communes achieved	number of achieved communes increased in compared with baseline	100
	NTP-NRD INDICATOR No 14	#	129/129 communes achieved		100
	NTP-NRD INDICATOR No 2	#	35/129 communes achieved		100
	NTP-NRD INDICATOR No 3	#	99/129 communes achieved		100
	NTP-NRD INDICATOR No 4	#	83/129 communes achieved		100
	NTP-NRD INDICATOR No 5	#	54/129 communes achieved		100

Gia Lai

Component/			Cumulative	Appraisal	
<i>Sub-component or Output</i>	Indicator	Unit	Actual	Target	%
Component 1					
<i>Sub-Component 1.2 Institutionalization of market-oriented, results-based, participatory socio-economic development planning and implementation process</i>					
Output 1.2.1	MOP-SEDP Thematic Working Group established and functional.	group	32	32	100%
MOP-SEDP Methodology and Guidelines developed	MOP-SEDP TWGs supported the MOP-SEDP pilot to satisfaction	%	100%	100%	100%
	MOP-SEDP Guidelines formulated and disseminated	commune	64	26	246%
	PPC decision on MOP-SEDP institutionalization	paper	1	1	100%
	DPI decision on MOP-SEDP preparation guidelines	paper	1	1	100%
Output 1.2.2	Number of project communes integrating NTP-NRD criteria into annual MOP-SEDP preparation	commune	64	26	246%
NTP NRD activities integrated into MOP-SEDP methodology.					
NTP NRD activities integrated into MOP-SEDP methodology.	70% of target districts' resources for the NTP-NRD being allocated to implement MOP-SEDP priorities.				
Output 1.2.3	Training completed for 150 district staff and 700 CDB members on the MOP-SEDP methodology	person	1578	850	186%
MOP-SEDP guidelines institutionalized within the local economic development process	5 project districts capable to train lower levels on MOP-SEDP	district	5	5	100%
	Project communes capable to prepare MOP-SEDP	commune	222	222	100%
	MOP-SEDP process consulted with stakeholders	event	2	1	200%
	MOP-SEDP pilot reviewed in project and non-project areas	activity	1	1	100%
	MOP-SEDP manual revised, updated and assessed as relevant to local capacities	manual	1	1	100%
<i>Sub-Component 1.3. Private sector development and partnership in agriculture and rural development</i>					
Output 1.3.1	Thematic Working Group on Business Environment Reform (TWG-BER) established.	group	1	1	100%

	Output 1.3.2	One review completed	activity	1	1	100%
	Current status of private sector engagement in agriculture and rural development (ARD)	PPC decision on support policy for production, marketing and investment promotion in ARD	paper	2	1	200%
	Output 1.3.3	Number of annual district commodity workshops	event	17	25	68%
	Public-private policy dialogue organized					
		Number of enterprise participants	enterprise	86	NT	
		Number of linkages/ MOUs between CIGs and enterprises	paper	111	NT	
	Output 1.3.4	Organising public-private partnership promotion fairs to promote PPP	workshop	2	10	20%
	Bi-annual public-private partnership promotion fairs organized	Decisions, actions to resolve private investment issues	paper	0	NT	
	<i>Sub-Component 1.4 Strengthening Coordination and Knowledge Sharing</i>					
	Output 1.4.1	Periodic meetings of Project steering committee organised	event	12	20	60%
	Project Steering Committee established					
	Output 1.4.2	80% of TWG/ coordinating group members attending at least 90% of periodic meetings.	%	100%	80%	125%
	Coordination mechanism among implementing agencies established					
	Output 1.4.3	100% of annual audits are without critical findings.	%	100%	100%	100%
	Project Coordination Unit (PCU) established					
	Output 1.4.4	Three evaluations completed (baseline, mid-term and end-of-project)	activity	3	3	100%
	Monitoring and Evaluation System established					
		20 quarterly monitoring reports compiled	paper	24	20	120%
		Logframe and M&E plan updated	turn	3	5	60%
		Exit strategy completed	paper	100%	100%	100%
	Output 1.4.5	Project manuals developed and updated	manual	9	9	100%
	Knowledge shared within and outside the project	Study tours for key staff in project management organized	trip	8	NT	
		Training on project management, bidding, M&E and learning organized	workshop	48	NT	
		Project website maintained for information sharing	website	1	1	100%

Component 2						
	<i>Sub-Component 2.1. Identification and Prioritization of Value Chains</i>					
Output 2.1.1	At least six key pro-poor value chains studied and updated		chain	5	6	83%
<i>Pro-poor Value Chain analyses and selection completed</i>	Number of value chains identified and analyzed by communes to integrate in MOP-SEDP		chain	6	NT	
	Number of lead enterprises identified in value chains		enterprise	8	5	160%
Output 2.1.2						
Value chain action plans (VCAPs) developed	6 VCAPs updated for the key value chains		paper	5	6	83%
	Number of staff trained in VCD method and instruments		person	180	180	100%
	Plan to integrate VC in agricultural sector's plan		paper	0	1	0%
	PPC approval of VCAPs		paper	0	1	0%
Output 2.1.3						
Market opportunity information service provided	6 market opportunity briefs updated per year		paper	26	6	433%
	4 Market Information Service Providers Identified and trained in the province.					
	Market opportunity information workshops based on VCAPs organized every year		event	5	500%	100%
	Information on market opportunities integrated in communal MOP-SEDP		commune	26	26	100%
	<i>Sub-Component 2.2 Value chain technical research and extension services</i>					
Output 2.2.1						
Agricultural technical services provision diversified	List of key farmers developed in communes		commune	26	26	100%
	All key farmers trained in FFS		%	100%	100%	100%
	All FFS-trained key farmers support CIG in production and business		%	100%	100%	100%
	Number of services provided by government and enterprises to households		paper	1	1	100%
	Number of ASGs established and operational		group	26	26	100%
	Rate of ASG members trained in CIG support contents		%	100%	90%	111%
	Rate of ASGs capable to support CIGs		%	100%	100%	100%
	Rate of CIGs supported by ASGs to improve group operation		%	59%	50%	118%

Output 2.2.2	Number of FFS models completed in project districts and number of household participants	model	0	5	0%
Quality and availability of DARD extension services improved					
	Number of local households replicating the models	household	0	NT	
	Number of study tours and number of participants	trip	5	5	100%
	Number of proposals after study tour	paper	1	NT	
	Number of service providers (public and private) trained in agricultural techniques	organization	0	NT	
	Number of dialogues in planting, caring, plant protection, disease prevention and treatment for crops and animals	activity	4	5	80%
	Number of service contract concluded	paper	465	NT	
	Number of CIGs supported (material inputs, training...) in VCD	group	779	320	243%
	Rate of CIGs linked with enterprises for inputs/ outputs (disaggregated by value chain)	%	60%	50%	119%
	Rate of CIGs maintaining the revolving fund	%	100%	100%	100%
	Number of pilot models in project districts	model	8	5	160%
	Number of household beneficiaries in the pilot models	person	452	NT	
	Number of local households replicating the models by themselves	household	0	NT	
<i>Sub-Component 2.3. Promotion of Pro-Poor Agribusiness Initiatives</i>					
Output 2.3.1	CBG manual issued	manual	1	1	100%
Pro-poor Agri-business Promotion Fund established					
	Information on CBG fund disseminated to target audiences	activity	2	2	100%
	Rate of CBG applications from enterprises trained in CBG proposal development	%	40%	50%	80%
	CSG manual issued	manual	1	1	100%
	Information on CSG fund disseminated to all CIGs	%	100%	100%	100%
	Rate of CSG applications from groups trained in CSG proposal development	%	80%	50%	160%
Output 2.3.2	All CBG budget (VND7.5 bn.) disbursed by the end of the project	%	100%	100%	100%
Agri-Business Funds promoted to potential target beneficiaries					
	Number of CBG sub-projects completed	sub-project	9	8	113%

		Number of jobs created in CBG sub-projects (rate of poor and near-poor)	job	161	NT	
		Number of household beneficiaries in CBG sub-projects	household	1881	1200	157%
Output 2.3.3		All CSG budget (VND 12.8 bn.) disbursed by the end of the project	%	122%	100%	122%
Pro-poor Agribusiness Fund invested		Number of households trained/ built capacities in CSG activities	household	3116	2000	156%
		Number of households receiving CSG grants	household	1769	1500	118%
		Rate of CSG-supported CIGs linked with enterprises	%	100%	80%	125%
		Rate of CSG-supported CIGs maintaining the revolving fund	group	100%	80%	125%
<i>Sub-Component 2.4. Improving access to rural financial services</i>						
Output 2.4.2						
	Strategies for enhancing credit access and encouraging local savings among the poor developed	Social Fund established, operational, with operating capital	fund	1	1	100%
		150 WSCGs established, with 2,400 members, ensuring required rate of the poor and near-poor	group	179	150	119%
		Rate of WSCG members trained on savings	%	100%	NT	
		Rate of WSCG members trained on business	%	0%	NT	
		Number of WU staff trained to facilitate fund disbursement	person	544	350	155%
		Rate of WSCG members depositing savings	%	100%	NT	
		Amount of savings deposited from the beginning of the project (VND bn.)	bn. VND	12.679	NT	
		Rate of WSCG members receiving loans	%	100%	NT	
		Number of loans to WSCG members; Total amount of disbursement and outstanding loan at the time of report	loan	3328	NT	
		Rate of loans used on the right purpose	%	100%	NT	
		Rate of WSCG members increasing income from the loan	%	100%	NT	
		Rate of proper interest and principal repayment	%	100%	NT	
		Financial self-sufficiency of Social Fund (net financial earnings against OPEX)	%	186%	100%	100%
Component 3						
<i>Sub-Component 3.1: Planning Capacities for MOP SEDP</i>						
Output 3.1.4						
	Communal MOP-SEDP prepared, implemented and monitored	Rate of TWG MOP-SEDP members from project communes trained in MOP-SEDP process	%	100%	90%	111%
		All project districts organized orientation workshops	%	100%	100%	100%

	All project and non-project communes prepare annual MOP-SEDP	commune	222	222	100%
	Rate of household participants in MOP-SEDP meetings in project communes	person	25,269	NT	
	Number of MOP-SEDP plan of project communes integrating value chains	commune	26	26	100%
	Number of project communes' MOP-SEDP plans mainstreaming resources from NTPs and projects	commune	26	26	100%
	All MOP-SEDP plans submitted to district sections of finance and planning for review	%	100%	100%	100%
<i>Sub-Component 3.2: Engaging the Poor in Value Chains</i>					
Output 3.2.1	Number of district CIG development strategies developed and updated	paper	5	5	100%
CIG development strategy completed					
	Number of established CIGs (rate of poor and near-poor, women and EM households)	group	779	460	169%
	Rate of CIGs trained and supported in management skills (group management, financial management, business plan development, market linkage)	%	100%	100%	100%
	Rate of CIGs improved and having adequate operation capacities	%	100%	50%	200%
	Rate of CIGs having group savings fund; amount of savings deposited	%	100%	100%	100%
	Number of CIGs received CSG grant	group	147	140	105%
	Number of CIGs receiving CDF revolving fund	group	328	208	158%
	Number of CIGs receiving inputs revolving fund	group	419	155	270%
<i>Sub-Component 3.3: Community Development Fund</i>					
Output 3.3.1	Number of CDF-invested public infrastructure schemes	scheme	180	NT	
Public infrastructure					
	Number of household beneficiaries in public infrastructure schemes	household	27,024	NT	
	Results from use and maintenance of CDF-invested schemes	scheme	1	1	100%
Output 3.3.2	Number of CDF-invested productive infrastructure schemes	scheme	45	NT	
Productive infrastructure					
	Number of household beneficiaries in productive infrastructure schemes	group	5770	NT	
Output 3.3.3	Number of jobs for trained laborers (disaggregated by gender and poverty)	person	0	NT	
Training					
	Number of long-term vocational training courses and number of participants	workshop	33	NT	

		Number of short-term vocational training courses and number of participants	person	567	NT	
	Output 3.3.4	All budget (VND 20.1 bn.) for CDF revolving fund disbursed in compliance with the manual	%	103%	100%	103%
	CDF revolving fund					
		Number of benefiting CIGs	group	328	208	158%
		Rate of CIGs maintaining the CDF revolving fund	%	100%	100%	100%

Ninh Thuan

Component/ Sub-component or Output	Indicator	Unit	Cumulative Actual	Appraisal Target	%
Component 1					
Sub-component 1.1: Strengthening the institutionalization capacity to implement Tam Nong Resolution					
Output 1.1.1 Strengthening capacity for provincial and district officers to carry out NTP-NRD	110 provincial, district and communal staff trained and provided with capacity building in the first 2 years on NTP-NRD implementation, including at least 30% women	#	109	110	99%
Output 1.1.2 Develop programs and document for training of trainers on commune market-oriented participatory socio-economic development planning (MOP-SEDP) for staffs at provincial and districts level	Development of a ToT training plan and training materials	manual	1	1	100%
	45 provincial and district staff (at least 30% women) are provided with TOT in MOP-SEDP	#	83	45	184%
Output 1.1.3 Develop programs and document for training of trainers at all levels on market-oriented economic management	Development of a training document for market-oriented economic management.	manual	1	1	100%
	45 provincial and district staff provided with TOT in market-oriented economic management.	person	75	45	167%
Output 1.1.4 Strengthening capacity on market access and trade promotion for district and commune officers.	250 person-rounds of staff provided with advanced training in market access and trade promotion	person-round	251	250	100%
Sub-component 1.2: Institutionalizing the market-oriented, result-based, participatory socio-economic development planning process and implementation (MOP-SEDP)					
Output 1.2.1 Regulation and policies to support production and market development and promote investment in agriculture and rural development (pay much attention to agents having low income) made	Produce 5 policy papers on market and production development support, investment promotion in agriculture and rural development	document	5	5	100%

Output 1.2.2 Establishing and maintaining the operation of provincial and district MOP-SEDP Thematic Working Groups.	Establish and maintain the operation of MOP-SEDP working groups at provincial, district and communal levels	group	72	72	100%
Output 1.2.3: MOP-SEDP implementation manual adapted to local conditions (after different level workshops), approved by PPC, printed for large-scale dissemination	180 provincial and district staff and 1,200 communal staff trained in MOP-SEDP methodology during the project (at least 30% women)	person	187	180	100%
	01 MOP-SEDP Implementation Manual is adjusted appropriately and issued	manual	1	1	100%
Sub-component 1.3: Private sector development and partnership in agriculture and rural development					
Output 1.3.1 Support in establishment and training for associations, alliances and extension clubs.	10 cooperatives, associations, extension clubs linking groups from common production areas at district and provincial levels, ensuring the participation of at least 30% women	association	10	10	100%
Output 1.3.2 Organize public-private partnership policy dialogue at provincial and district levels on business environment and policies to the private sector	Number of workshops was conducted to evaluate the private-sector's investment in agricultural production, processing and marketing, and to update the annual data by conducting 1 workshop at province and 1 in each district every year to dialogue on public-private partnerships in the field of input supply, farming contract, processing and consuming of agricultural products	event	5	12	42%
Output 1.3.3 Trade promotion and market development activities held twice per year at provincial and districts levels of the project	Trade promotion and market development activities are organized (marketing of product, brand development, product market research, product introduction conference, training and implementing of trade promotion for farmers...)	activities	22	20	110%
Output 1.3.4 Organize human resource trainings to develop the medium and small enterprises in agriculture and rural development	51 person-rounds are trained to maintain and develop SMEs during the project (at least 30% women)	person	51	51	100%
Output 1.3.5 Training on management skill for heads of farms and making vocational education for labors working in farms and private enterprises	Training on management skill for farms and private enterprises during the project		78	80	98%
	250 laborers from farms and SME are trained in vocational skills during the project (at least 30% women)	person	253	250	101%
Sub-component 1.4: Project coordination and knowledge sharing					
Output 1.4.1: The Project Coordination Unit (PCU) formed and effectively operated	The Project Coordination Unit (PCU) formed	PCU established	1	1	100%
	No significant errors found in all annual audits	times	100	100	100%
	Number of staff trained on project management (such as M&E, financial management and procurement)	person	1164	1000	116%

Output 1.4.2 The Project Steering Committee (PSC) formed and effectively operated	The Project Steering Committee (PSC) formed and organized quarterly	meeting	12	12	100%
	40 meetings, workshops, conferences of IFAD, central and local line ministries and departments attended by PSC representatives for efficient ODA management	meeting	42	40	105%
Output 1.4.3 An effective collaboration mechanism established among project implementing agencies	80% of members of TWGs or coordinating groups attended regular meetings	meeting	87	80	109%
Output 1.4.4 M&E system established	Three supervisions completed (first term, mid-term, final term)		3	3	100%
	05 annual surveys performed		5	5	100%
Output 1.4.5 Knowledge shared inside and outside of the project	Domestic and international study tours organized for staff and farmers	trip	23	20	115%
Component 2					
<i>Sub-component 2.1: Definition and prioritization of pro-poor value chains</i>					
Output 2.1.1: Pro-poor value chains are analyzed and selected	120 provincial, district and related agencies' staff trained in value chain analysis and selection in the first 3 years, ensuring a fair rate of women		393	120	328%
	At least six pro-poor value chains and potential value chains annually defined		8	6	133%
Output 2.1.2: Value chain improvement action plans prepared	Thematic group workshops in VC analysis and selection and action plan development and approval organized	workshop	4	4	100%
	Number of value chain development action plans prepared, approved and yearly carried out	plan	8	6	133%
	Group of working on value chain is formed and maintain operating (at least 30% women participate)	group	1	1	100%
Output 2.1.3 Supplying information service on market opportunities	Design 4 market opportunity briefs every year, starting from the second year	brief	24	20	120%
	Distribute market opportunity briefs for CDBs and CIGs/CGs.	brief	96000	50000	192%
	160 market staffs at all levels trained to help them catch up all market information during project implementation time, ensuring the participation of at least 30% women	person	134	160	84%
<i>Sub-component 2.2: Extension services and technical research to develop value chains. This sub-component is considered to be very satisfactory</i>					
Output 2.2.1: Extension services diversified	Farmers are trained in the field (01 class / commune / year, 20 people / class, implemented in 3 years, ensuring that at least 30% of women are trained)	household	6345	920	690%
	Key farmers trained on production method and marketing, trade for priority value chains, 3 farmers/commune, implemented in 3 years each, ensuring that at least 30% of women are trained	person	4307	2556	169%

Output 2.2.2 Quality and availability of extension service provision by DARD improved	Number of trained communal extension staff		520	270	193%
	49 extension staff trained in extension information dissemination and use of information tools, starting from the second year		49	49	100%
	Number of study tours organized in topics related to development of the selected value chains	trip	2	2	100%
	50 staff of district and provincial veterinary service trained in diagnose		43	50	86%
	354 communal and 144 village veterinary staff from 27 communes trained in diagnosis, disease control and veterinary treatment		394	354	111%
	2600 livestock farming HHs trained in veterinary hygiene and food safety during the project (at least 30% women)		2610	2600	100%
	Grape, garlic, apple and fruit, food crop production models following GAP completed	model	7	7	100%
	Animal feed processing and storage models completed	model	10	10	100%
	High fertility livestock models for cow, goat and sheep completed	model	6	6	100%
	- Number of farmers are trained	person	1875	1000	188%
	Documents on disease-free area development printed and disseminated to farmers	copies	1930	2000	97%
	Documents printed and disseminated to farmers	copies	59120	20000	296%
	Sub-component 2.3: Promoting pro-poor agri-business initiatives (PPP)				
Output 2.3.1: Competitive Small Business Fund for the Poor (WSCG) established	CGB launching roadshows organized in province and districts, CBG introduction documents issued and disseminated	workshop	3	2	150%
	01 Manual for the operation of the CBG is prepared	manual	1	1	100%
Output 2.3.2: Investments by the Competitive Business Grant (CBG)	There are 1200 turns of HHs trained by enterprises to strengthen capacity in production business related to the CBG's proposals		1503	1200	125%
	VND 8,5 billion of the CBG financed to enterprises	billion VND	15	9	176%
	Number of enterprises linked with HHs in supply of inputs and outputs.	enterprise	10	8	125%
	At least 480 HHs (of which 60% poor and near-poor) from linked CIGs 01 WSCG implementation manual developed	household	992	480	207%
Output 2.3: Competitive Small Grant Fund (CSG) established	Number of HHs trained in business plan development	HH	3325	3000	111%
	01 Manual for the operation of the CSG is prepared	manual	1	1	100%
Output 2.4: Investments by the Competitive Small Grant Fund (CSG)	There are at least 1.250 HHs accessed with the CSG	HH	1462	1250	117%
	Volume of fund invested in production activities of CIGs	billion VND	18	14	131%

Sub-component 2.4: Rural financial service access strengthening. This sub-component is considered to be satisfactory			group	123	-
Output 2.4.1: There are at least 120 SCGs formed and operated in project communes	Number of SCGs formed in 27 communes (with no more than 25 members per group, give priority to poor HHs and householders as women) and these groups provided books twice per year for 5 years		123	120	103%
	2000 HHs trained on business planning skills and loaning application	household	2041	2000	102%
	Provincial, district and communal WU staff trained in WSCG establishment and management of, starting from the second year		256	250	102%
Output 2.4.2: Disbursement of the WDFW	Number of HHs benefited	HH	2014	2000	101%
	Rate of poor and nearly-poor members benefited	%	41.5	40	104
	Disbursement of the WDFW	Billion VND	18	14	132%
Output 2.4.3: Women Development Fund (WDF) established	Capacities improved to provide micro-finance services in the long term to at least 2,000 women, including 40% poor and near-poor	person	2041	2000	102%
	Women Development Fund (WDF) established	fund	1	1	100%
Component 3: Develop and implement a commune-level SEDP towards market orientation					
Sub-component 3.1: Planning Capacities for MOP-SEDP					
Output 3.1.1: CDBs are being oriented on basic principles and trained on MOP-SEDP	Number of staffs communes (including village heads) are trained on MOP-SEDP and basically oriented on various concepts and MOP-SEDP methods		1772	1215	146%
	Output 3.1.2: Designing commune value chain development strategies	VCD plans implemented by DASU for the most relevant value chains in communes	plan	6	6
Output 3.1.3: The MOP-SEDP developed in communes	360 communal staff trained in PRA method in value chain analysis		439	360	122%
	Annual village development plan development starts in second year		65	65	100%
Sub-component 3.2: Engaging the poor in value chains. This sub-component is considered to be extremely satisfactory					
Output 3.2.1: Identify and direct interest groups and collaborative groups	There are at least 400 CIGs and CGs formed and operated in connection with value chains, of which there are at least 40% of poor and near-poor HHs participated in		418	400	105%
Output 3.2.2: CIGs which have their own production business plan are operated and accessed to the project's resources to develop, of which there are at least 30% of "market ready" groups	CIG members trained in business plan development, starting from the second year, at least 30% women		2331	2000	117%
	Rate of CIGs group accessed market	%	44.7	30	149%
Sub-component 3.3: Community Development Fund (CDF)					
Output 3.3.1: There are 190 rural public infrastructure works invested by the CDF and operated	Number of completed and in-usage works (124 roads, 11 bridges, and 59 irrigation works)	work	194	190	102%
	Total of beneficiaries	HH	64985		

Annex III

	Output 3.3.2: There are 23.000 HHs (with at least 40% of poor and near-poor HHs and 35% of women) trained on necessary knowledge and skills to strengthen capacity in developing production and business from the CDF's resource for income improvement	Funding for training for improving people capacity	billion VND	10.30	11.25	92%
		Number of households trained		24123	23000	105%
	Output 3.3.3: There are at least 2000 HHs (with 40% of poor and near-poor HHs and 35% of women) from CIGs and CGs supported by CDF with necessary inputs and productive infrastructure to develop production and business in prioritized value chains	CDF's investments are for production infrastructure and counterpart contribution be managed in favour of poor women and prioritize CIGs and CGs with most of members as women	Billion VND	66.75	71.52	93%
		Total of HHs benefited from supported inputs and productive infrastructure		31966	2000	1598%

Actual project cost by financier and province*

Financiers	Appraisal (USD '000) by province			Disbursement (USD '000) by province			% of Disbursement by province			TNSP Total		
	Tuyen Quang	Ninh Thuan	Gia Lai	Tuyen Quang	Ninh Thuan	Gia Lai	Tuyen Quang	Ninh Thuan	Gia Lai	Appraisal (USD '000)	Disbursement (USD '000)	% Disbursed
IFAD loan	23,355	12,213	10,500	23,355	12,212	10,368	100%	100%	99%	46,068	45,935	100%
Government	3,912	3,281	2,645	6,501	2,731	2,639	166%	83%	100%	9,838	11,871	121%
Beneficiaries	2,856	1,524	613	4,390	1,682	881	154%	110%	144%	4,993	6,953	139%
Total	30,123	17,018	13,758	34,246	16,625	13,889	114%	98%	101%	60,899	64,760	106%

Source: Project Completion Report, 2017

* Due to exchange rate differences, the appraisal amounts in USD are different from those mentioned in the design report in USD, and therefore different from those mentioned on the PCR's cover page. The SDR amounts remained the same.

Abbreviations and acronyms

CBG	Competitive business grant
CDF	Community development fund
CIG	Common-interest group
CSG	Competitive small grant
DARD	Department of Agriculture and Rural Development
GL	Gia Lai
HH	Household
IFAD	International Fund for Agricultural Development
IRR	Internal rate of return
MOP-SEDP	Market oriented participatory socio-economic development plan
MTR	Mid-term Review
M&E	Monitoring and evaluation
NT	Ninh Thuan
PCA	Principle Component Analysis
PCR	Programme completion report
PCR/V	Programme completion report validation
PMD	Programme management department of IFAD
PPC	Province Peoples' Committee
RIMS	Results and Impact Management System
TNSP	The Agriculture, Farmers and Rural Areas Support Project / Tam Nong Support Project
TQ	Tuyen Quang
WDF	Women development fund

Bibliography

Development and Policies Research Centre. 2017. RIMS + Endline Survey, Agriculture, Farmers and Rural Areas Support Project, Ninh Thuan Province

IFAD. 2010. Design Completion Report, TNSP, Main Report and Appendices

_____. 2010. *President's report, Proposed loan and grant to the Socialist Republic of Viet Nam for the Agriculture, Farmers and Rural Areas Support Project in Gia Lai, Ninh Thuan and Tuyen Quang Provinces*

_____. 2012. *Supervision report – Gia Lai, Ninh Thuan and Tuyen Quang Provinces*

_____. 2014. *Mid-term review report – Tuyen Quang Province*

_____. 2014. *Mid-term review report – Ninh Thuan Province*

_____. 2014. *Mid-term review report – Gia Lai Province*

_____. 2015. *Supervision report – Tuyen Quang Province*

_____. 2015. *Supervision report – Ninh Thuan Province*

_____. 2015. *Supervision report – Gia Lai Province*

_____. 2017. *Project Completion Report, TNSP, Main Report and Appendices*

_____. 2017. *Project Completion Report – Tuyen Quang Province*

_____. 2017. *Project Completion Report – Ninh Thuan Province*

_____. 2017. *Project Completion Report – Gia Lai Province*

_____. 2017. *Project Status Report, TNSP*