



Investing in rural people

## **Republic of the Sudan**

---

### **Western Sudan Resources Management Programme**

#### **Supervision report**

Main report, appendices and annexes

Mission Dates: 23 July – 9 August 2016  
Document Date: 3-Oct 2016  
Project No. 1100001277  
Report No: 4238-SD

Programme Management Department

## Contents

Abbreviations and acronyms	iii
A. Introduction	1
B. Overall assessment of programme implementation (Satisfactory,5)	3
C. Outputs and outcomes	4
D. Programme Implementation Progress ( <i>Satisfactory, 5</i> )	13
E. Fiduciary aspects	15
F. Sustainability	17
G. Other	19
H. Conclusion	20

## Appendices

Appendix 1:	Summary of project status and ratings	1
Appendix 2A:	Updated Logical Framework: Progress against objectives, outcomes and outputs, WSRMP, as per 30 June 2015	3
Appendix 2B -	Revised Logical Framework – revision not yet complete	7
Appendix 3:	Summary of key actions to be taken within agreed timeframes	11
Appendix 4:	Physical progress measured against AWP&B, including RIMS indicators	17
Appendix 5:	Financial: Actual financial performance by financier; by component and disbursements by category	25
Appendix 6:	Compliance with legal covenants: Status of implementation	29
Appendix 7:	Knowledge management: Learning and Innovation	31

## Annexes

Annex 1:	WSRMP Assets Register
Annex 2:	WSRMP Exit Strategy
Annex 3:	PCR Preparation - Action List
Annex 4:	Rural Finance
Annex 5:	Governance of Natural Resources
Annex 6:	Natural Resources
Annex 7:	Fiduciary Aspect
Annex 8:	Attendance sheets

## Abbreviations and acronyms

ABS	Agricultural Bank of Sudan
ABSUMI	Agricultural Bank of Sudan Microfinance Initiative
ASARECA	Association for Strengthening Agricultural Research in Eastern and Central Africa
AWPB	Annual Work-plan and Budget
BIRDP	Butana Integrated Rural Development Project
CAHWs	Community Animal Health Workers
CBS	Central Bank of Sudan / Central Bureau of Statistics
CCI	Community Capability Index
CCU	Central Coordination Unit
CDC	Community Development Centre/Committee; VDC: Village Development Committee
CEAP	Community Environmental Action Plan
CIF	Community Initiative Fund
CIP	Council of Implementing Partners
CPM	Country Programme Manager
CPO	Country Programme Officer
CRCs	Conflict Resolution Centres
CT	Credit Team / Community Trainer
DG	Director General
FC	Financial Controller
FMoAF	Federal Ministry of Agriculture and Forestry
FMoLFR	Federal Ministry of Livestock, Fishery and Range
FNC	Forest National Corporation
FP	Focal Point
GEF	Global Environmental Facility
GoS	Government of Sudan
HHs	Households
I&V	Inspection and Vaccination Centre
ICB	International Competitive Bidding
ICDC	Integrated Community Development Centre
ICO	IFAD Country Office
IFAD	International Fund for Agricultural Development
IMP	Integrated Pest Management
ISA	International Standards of Auditing
KM	Knowledge Management
LEN	Local Extension Network
LMIS	Livestock Marketing Information System
LMRP	Livestock Marketing and Resilience Programme
LPG	Liquid Petroleum Gas
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MDETs	Multidisciplinary Extension Teams
METs	Mobile Extension Teams
MFEP	Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning
MFIs	Micro Finance Institutions
MIS	Management Information System
MIWR	Ministry of Irrigation and Water Resources
MoAI	Ministry of Agriculture and Irrigation
MTR	Mid-term Review
NCB	National Competitive Bidding
NGOs	None Governmental Organizations
NK	North Kordofan
NR	Natural Resources
NRM	Natural Resource Management
O&M	Operation and Maintenance
OFID	OPEC Fund for International Development
PCU	Project Coordination Unit

PIAs	Programme Implementing Agencies (Green Departments, State level)
PIM	Project Implementation Manual
PPC	Programme Principle Coordinator
PSO	Programme Support Officer
PVC	Poly Vinyl Chloride
QCBS	Quality Cost-Based Selection
RF	Revolving Fund
RIMS	Results and Impact Management System
SA	Special Account
SCGs	Saving and Credit Groups
SCU	State Coordination Unit
SDG	Sudanese Pound
SDP	Seed Development Project
SK	South Kordofan
SMDC	Sudanese Microfinance Development Company
SMFU	State Microfinance Units
SPLM-N	Sudan People's Liberation Movement-North
SR	Stock Route
SRCM	Stock Route Co-management Mechanism
SROI	Social Return On Investment
SSB	Stabilized Sand Brick
SWA	State Water Authority
TORs	Terms of Reference
UNDSS	United Nations Department of Safety and Security
VAT	Value Added Tax
VDC	Village Development Committee/Community Development Committee (CDC)
VSCGs	Village Savings and Credit Groups
VSLA	Village Savings and Lending/Loans Association
WA	Withdrawal Application
WK	West Kordofan
WSRMP	Western Sudan Resources Management Programme
WUC	Water User Committee
TA	Technical Assistance

## A. Introduction<sup>1</sup>

1. The Western Sudan Resources Management Programme (WSRMP) loan agreement was signed on 14 February 2005, and was declared effective on 15 December 2005 for an initial period of 8 years. In September 2009 the mid-term review took place. The initial 8-year duration of the Programme was extended for one year in December 2013<sup>2</sup>. The overall **goal** of WSRMP is to improve the equity, efficiency and stability of the economy of Greater Kordofan Region<sup>3,4</sup> through rationalizing the regulation and use of natural resources (NRs), enabling access of rural poor to productive services and to fair terms of trade. The direct target beneficiary households are 38,000, and indirect beneficiaries are 80,000. The Programme consists of five components: (i) natural resource management (NRM); (ii) rural financial services and marketing; (iii) community development and extension; (iv) rural feeder roads; and (v) institutional support. In December 2014, the WSRMP financing agreement was extended with an additional two years. In connection with this, the GoS received a two-year extension and a US\$3.19 million additional grant<sup>5</sup> from IFAD to consolidate and ensure the sustainability of the WSRMP's outcomes. Henceforth, the focus of the Additional Financing (AF) period is on consolidation, sustainability, and up-scaling. The current completion and closing dates of the WSRMP are respectively 31 December 2016 and 30 June 2017.

2. For Additional Financing (AF) phase, '**CONSOLIDATION**' is about 'completing things', 'making it a whole', 'adding the missing items', 'strengthening', and 'firming up'; i.e. - **right Local Extension Network (LEN) agent at the right place**; - **NRM data collection and analysis**; - **Water User Committees**: ensuring that all members are being skilled in setting water tariffs, managing and operating water facility; - **Water Supply Facility**: 'up grading' namely the addition of a storage tank, fence, water taps, or pump; - **Use of improved seed/full package**; - **Equipment for Community Development Community Development Committee/Centre (CDCs), Integrated Community Development Committee/Centre (ICDCs)**; - linkages to **Livestock Marketing and Resilience Programme (LMRP)**, which concerns new IFAD programme, etc. '**SUSTAINABILITY**' stays for the ability to be sustained, supported, upheld, or confirmed. In terms of AF activities, it is about actions needed so that the practice can continue **on its' own namely without WSRMP support**, while not being harmful to the environment or depleting NRs. '**SCALING-UP**' is remarkably different from expanding namely the former would cost less and demand a different form of facilitating. Examples are: - **provision of appropriate Credit Products**: when women have easy access to a loan for establishing a Household tree nursery, the scaling – up will be boasted as could already be observed regarding small loans for sheep fattening; - **so called spontaneous adopters and adapters observed** and 'What can one learn from these adopters?' 'What were the triggers that they adopted?'; - development of Knowledge Products; - access to inputs and markets can accelerate scaling-up: thus, WSRMP aiming at linking-up to input providers and traders is one way especially when simple contracts could be established with CDCs/ICDCs.

3. The SM of the WSRMP took place in Sudan 23/07/2016 – 10/08/2016. The objective of the mission is to assess the WSRMP's achievements against targets under the loan and top up grant

---

<sup>1</sup> Mission composition: Mrs Lucy Maarse (Livestock & Natural Resource Specialist), Team Leader; Mr Omer Egemi, Natural Resource Policy/Community Development Specialist; Mr Swandip Sinha, Rural Finance Specialist; Mr El Fadol Ishag, ICO, Procurement and Financial Management Specialist; Mr Mohamed Elhag SirElkhatim, Coordinator of the CCU; Mr Omer Mekki, Natural Resource Management Specialist; Mr Ahmed Subahi, IFAD Country Programme Officer; Mrs Basmat Hassan Yousif Mustafa, Mrs Mona Hashim Idris Ali, Mr Abdelbagi Mohammed Babekir, Federal Ministry of Agriculture and Forestry, General Directorate of International Cooperation; Mr. Isam Ali Hussein, Federal Ministry of Animal Resources, General Directorate of Planning and Livestock Economics; Mr Ezzeldeen Ahmed Altyb, Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning, General Directorate of State Development; Mr Salah Ankoush Ahmed, General Directorate Foreign.

<sup>2</sup> The total programme costs were at the time of appraisal estimated to be USD 48.95 million: IFAD loan USD 25.46 million, OFID loan USD 8.6 million, Federal Government of Sudan USD 9.44 million, States' Government USD 3.38 million, Financing Institutions USD 0.53 million, and Beneficiaries USD 1.55 million.

<sup>3</sup> Greater Kordofan encompasses the North Kordofan (NK), West Kordofan (WK), and South Kordofan (SK) States.

<sup>4</sup> Since South Sudan's separation, conflict has broken out between the Government and the Sudan People's Liberation Movement-North (SPLM-N) in Southern Kordofan and Blue Nile states, which has resulted in large number of internally displaced persons (IDP). Thus, the WSRMP activities were since affected but operations in more secure areas continue. Henceforth, during the AF phase the focus is put on the Western and Eastern Stock Route as the Central one is seriously affected by the above mentioned insecurity. During field visits, for instance, the community Tibna revealed that as many as 1,000 Internal Displaced Households (2014/2015) arrived of which currently 50 HHs are remaining and these are now also participating in the Community Activities. In all communities visited, an influx of pastoralist groups and IDP beyond the normal pastoralist visitors was reported. It increased the pressure on grazing and cropping areas.

<sup>5</sup> As fund flow for 2015 were considerably delayed (first advance received in July 2015), while the no cost extension (in 2014) provided only limited funds for activities, full swing field activities started only by August 2015.

(Additional Financing (AF) period), interim impact, efficiency and effectiveness of programme management, compliance with loan covenants, sustainability arrangements, successful consolidation under the AF grant, exit strategy and in general pertinence and validity of Programme design. Moreover, should assess the issues highlighted in the previous IFAD supervision missions and follow-up missions. Last, in view of Programme Completion in December 2016, the mission shall provide advice to the Programme to support a successful completion process and exit, as well as sustainability of activities. On the basis of its findings, the mission provides recommendations on how to improve implementation and, as needed, adjust activities and/or implementation arrangements for the remaining programme period. The SM team made specific efforts to capture the output of the AF period, while also highlighting outcomes and impact of its' entire lifespan (Jan. 2006 – June 2016). As WSRMP teams, Project Implementation Agency (PIAs)<sup>6</sup>, Multi-Disciplinary Extension Teams (MDETs)<sup>7</sup> and Mobile Extension Teams (METs)<sup>8</sup> are mature and experienced, while remaining time for implementation is short (5 months left), the recommendations are limited and interrelated, and therefore put at the end. Where relevant suggestions are made of what could be done.

4. The SM team held consultations at the Federal level with the Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning (MoFEP), the Federal Ministry of Agriculture and Forestry (FMOAF), and the Federal Ministry of Animal Resources (FMOAR). In addition, security requirements (UNDSS) were fulfilled and travel permit arrangements obtained in time. At El Obeid level, various meetings with PCU, SCU (SK) and Focal Points<sup>9</sup> (NK, WK) were conducted whereby PIAs of NK, SK and WK, ABSUMI, National Consultants and MET members participated in relevant sessions. A consultation with the acting Minister of Agriculture/Minister of Physical Planning and Public Utilities (NK) took place on 28 July 2016, while an interaction with Ministry of Agriculture (NK) could still take place in the evening of 7 August 2016. An attractive field programme<sup>10</sup> was designed allowing the SM team to interact with the communities (plenary - and subsequent group sessions along themes such as 'NRs', 'Water', 'Rural Finance', 'LEN' and 'Livestock'), and observe a range of activities namely: home nurseries, revolving funds (LPG, animal feeding, veterinary drugs, etc.), ICDC and CDC infrastructures and its' management, water supply facilities (water points, hafirs, underground water tank and water yard), fishery activities, herder school, flour mill & water pump (investment by community and managed by them), agro-forestry activities, goat breeding, animal feeding (upscaling), village saving and credit groups (VSCGs) and their apex body, stock routes (SRs) and SR Manager Team of one SR section, while also visiting fields put under cultivation. The commissioner and his team of Abu Zabad locality pro-actively participated in the meeting held with the Um Arrada community; he expressed high appreciation of the achievements made while also making commitments for support.

5. A wrap-up meeting at State – and Federal level took place respectively on 6 and 9 August. The latter meeting took place under the chairmanship of the Director, Department of International and Regional Organizations, Siddig Elobaid, Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning (MFEP), Foreign Finance Department. This meeting was followed by another meeting with the Undersecretary for Planning Mr Abdalla Ali Ibrahim, with representatives of the Federal MoAF, MFEP and FMOAR participating in the meeting. The Mission wishes to thank the senior officials of Federal Government and NK, SK and WK State, the staff of PCUs/SCU/focal points and State (Green) departments, the various extension teams and local communities, for their hospitality, warm welcome and professional assistance.

---

6 PIA: Project Implementation Agency; these are the so-called Green Departments (Range, Forest, Land Reclamation and Soil Conservation, Animal Production, Animal Health, Extension) of the Ministry of Agriculture / Animal Resources at State level. The actual implementers are the Extension Teams at Locality level (MDETs), while PIAs have advisory and facilitating responsibilities.

7 MDETs: Multi-Disciplinary Extension Teams, which are based at Locality Level are sometimes also called Locality Extension Team (LET).

8 METs: Mobile Extension Teams; special multi-disciplinary teams who provide services along the SRs, conduct surveys and are key facilitators in the SR co-mng.

9 In order to reflect whether SDP is covered, the wording 'Focal Point' was introduced; it implies that a Focal Point (WK, NK) cares for both WSRMP and SDP, while the SCU (SK) only for WSRMP.

10 30/07, Abu Zabad Locality, Um Arrada Community, and El Himir community; 31/07, Elsumnut Locality, Eldibeabat Community; 01/08, Um Rawaba Locality, Eladdai community; 02/08, Elrahad Locality, Tibna community; 03/08, Sheikan Locality, Fariq Elbagar community. Albeit being monsoon period and thus planting season, a very large number of community members were present during the visits, and it is estimated that the SM team interacted at least with 120 people per community and in most cases women formed the majority. High number of youth and children did turn up in addition.

## B. Overall assessment of programme implementation (Satisfactory, 5)

6. The WSRMP management teams (PCU, SCU, focal points) have been pro-active in following-up all advices and recommendations provided during previous SM and follow-up missions, and managed to regain the momentum, which was lost when no activities were implemented during the first six months of 2015 and in 2014. This, albeit the fact that the same teams manage the IFAD-GoS Seed Development Project (SDP), which has a rather different orientation and approach. The 2015 AWPB was revised as per advice of previous SM, while currently small revisions for the 2016 AWPB are under preparation. At the onset, the SM received the 2015 annual progress report, 2016 semi-annual progress report, M&E report and work plan, while RIMS reports were up-to-date. All reports are concise and comprehensive. The teams are transparent when presenting and able to identify what are successes, the challenges and the areas of concern, which led to interactive and informative sessions. The preparations for the Programme Completion Review (PCR) have been initiated especially in terms of studies, surveys and reviews.

7. In terms of impact, they are impressive at community level as manifested by improved productivity (crops, livestock, fish, forest, range), access to drinking water implying saving time<sup>11</sup> and costs<sup>12</sup>, enough reserves to prevent hunger gap, improved houses and more household equipment (furniture, utensils, gas stove, etc.), female leadership common and ability of men and women to stand up, be counted and speak out for their rights developing. In terms of service providers (PIAs, MDETs and METs), the sustainability of their services is a concern post-WSRMP as locality and state authorities have financial limitations; budgets for Green Departments are normally limited to salaries while there are no funds for operation. Nonetheless, many efforts have been made to link the LEN agent to the relevant locality departments as well as other services providers (e.g. input – and credit providers in particular). With the new approach to co-management of SRs, renewed enthusiasm and clarity among communities but also authorities at admin, locality, state and inter-state level has been developed. This has already resulted in communities and MET making more efforts to maintain the SRs, surveying and registering grazing areas, reporting encroachment through cultivation activities, facilitating herder schools, involving CRCs, and communities making use of their rights (e.g. activation of the NRM and related laws) and so on. The design of WSRMP has been weak in terms of reaching out and involving mobile livestock keeping HHs (nomads and semi-nomads), and it has taken WSRMP a lot of efforts to reflect and adjust. The rural micro finance (RMF) kept generating good results – e.g. during AF 3,004 (60%) of the newly formed village saving and credit groups (VSCGs) are outside the targeted areas showing robust scaling-up; a very strong repayment culture has developed with almost 100% repayment records to all micro finance institutions (MFIs), but institutionalising the rural finance support (rural finance units at state and locality level) remains a challenge. Overall, achievement of the physical targets set for NR component for period Jan 2015 – June 2016 stands at 93%, rural finance at 79%, community development at 92%, and it is expected that all these three components will reach 100% before the end of the year. Unfortunately, there is no new development on the rural feeder roads<sup>13</sup> component as arrears to OFID have not been settled by MoFEP, but grown. Major efforts in Knowledge Management have been made regarding all components but have not yet finalised, while rainy season related activities are currently implemented.

---

11 From 5 hrs/day before to 1 hr/day after water supply intervention; i.e. 80% decrease.

12 Saving in costs is 50% from 6 SDG/day before to 3 SDG after water supply intervention.

13 The physical progress of the road stands at 38%.



## C. Outputs and outcomes

### Component 1: Natural Resource Management<sup>14</sup>. (*Satisfactory, 5*)

8. Most of the targeted outcomes proposed during the AF period are achieved and added much to overall programme achievements. This is based on the fact that NRM, which is the core of the programme, has led to evidence of good established crops and increases in crop productivity<sup>15</sup> under both rainwater harvesting and animal draw implements; increased community awareness about rangeland management and forestry protection; and sincere desire to keep the water supply infrastructures operational by realizing it as a pillar for providing capital resources that spilled over to support productive and social services for the communities.

#### 1.1 Rangeland and Pastures (*Satisfactory, 5*)

##### Rangelands and pastures (*Moderately Satisfactory, 4*)

9. Improvement and rehabilitation of rangeland and pastures involved a wide range of activities during the initial phase of the programme (2006-2014). However, except for the opening of fire lines and monitoring of hema performance no other activity was proposed during the AF period. Early support for the improvement of hema range resulted in the establishment of 52 reserve areas exceeding the planned target (22) by 136%. The wide adoption of communities to hema intervention was realized from both income generation as well as environmental rehabilitation perspective. In addition, 43% of targeted fire line constructions (1,500 km) have been achieved during the AF period.

10. The open access rangelands and pastures that support the bulk of livestock population in the region continue to be a critical issue. Encroachment of agriculture on rangelands including wet season grazing areas (makhras) and resting places for the nomads (Nozol), facilitated by the progressive and massive use of tractors under conditions of increasing number of animals and lack of law enforcement has been recognized and described, by all stakeholders, including senior authorities in Green Departments, as a serious problem and constitutes a major threat to peace and stability, particularly in NK State. The operationalization of 2015 Range and Pastures Law based on the development of land use planning maps is widely perceived as the most possible and sustainable solution. Recognizing the fact that such a solution could not be realized during the remaining life time of the programme neither would the programme be equipped to address such complex problems, the seriousness of the issue could be brought out for discussion in the proposed all-stakeholders programme completion workshop, and/or inter-state workshop on experience sharing on NRs with an accent on 'Good Governance'.

11. The mission was also pleased to find out that visited communities (Alhimeir and Eldibeabat and Tibna) have developed their own community environmental action plan (CEAP) encompassing rangeland grazing arrangement in hema, open access areas and farm land, planting gum Arabic trees and seeds broadcasting, and prohibiting tree cutting.

##### Stock Routes (*Satisfactory, 5*)

12. After an intensive preparation during the second half of 2015 (drafting a plan for co-managing of SRs, translating herder school handbook in Arabic, training staff, surveying, re-establishing METs, etc.), remarkable results have been achieved during 2016. Physical achievement was 445 km stock routes demarcated, exceeding the planned target (300 km) by 48%. The amount of water supply provided along the routes through construction/rehabilitation of water sources amounted to 53 M<sup>3</sup>000 and exceeding the target (30 M<sup>3</sup>000) by 77%. As maintained by the Mission the routes are well recognized and respected with almost all the demarcation posts remaining in place. However,

---

14 The NRM Component involves development of NR governance that is efficient, equitable and environmentally sustainable and increases biodiversity in the program by providing productive and social services along three SRs for nomads, agro-pastoralists (semi-nomads) and settled communities sharing the resources through implementing the following major activities including: (i) stock route demarcation, management and other related services; (ii) conflict resolution services; (iii) range and pasture interventions; (iv) water supply interventions; (v) land reclamation and conservation; (vi) forestry activities; (vii) livestock services; and (viii) Jebel El Dair reserve conservation, and Khor Abu Habil agriculture scheme diversion/Semeih main canal rehabilitation.

15 E.g. on average an increase varying from 50% to 90% depending on the quality of the rainy season; i.e. this result is based on data of 22,000 HHs, period 2010 – 2015.

encroachment on the route, by neighbouring farmers, in few restricted areas was reported<sup>16</sup>. An important outcome of route demarcation, as stressed by both farmers and pastoralists is the reduced number of disputes over the routes that were previously major zones of conflict. To ensure sustainability of the intervention the registration and legalization of the routes remains an important pending but planned task.

#### **Conflict resolution centres** (*Satisfactory, 5*)

13. Under the Programme, six conflict resolution centres have been established along SRs in 2010 (3 centres) and 2013 (3 centres). Three centres have been registered as civil society groups under the 2006 Humanitarian Act. Two Centres (Abu Haraz and Rahad) have been branched down by committees at the participating community level. With the exception of one centre (Habla) in SK which has been constraint by instability in the State the other five centres are operational, though with some variations. A national consultant was recruited to review and assess the functionality and provide sustainability measures. The draft report was presented and discussed in a consultative workshop where an implementation matrix was agreed upon. The centres have proven to be effective in conflict resolution as 90% of the total reported conflicts (200) in 2016 (Jan. – June) were peacefully settled. Most of these conflicts were related to crop damage (50%) and land issues (25%). The CRCs have gained wide recognition from authorities and communities and some of them managed to forge partnerships with national and international actors. Maintaining the balance between being service oriented and business-oriented structures is a challenging process as is the linkage between the centres and the established co-management mechanisms for SRs.

#### **Co-management of Stock Routes** (*Satisfactory, 5*)

14. This intervention aims at institutionalizing cooperation and collaboration between farmers and pastoralists for improved livelihoods, sustained management of NRs and promotion of social peace. During the first half of 2016 an appreciated progress had been made. Three pastoralists field schools (PFS) have been established in the three States with the one in NK described as the best functional one. The planned demarcation of SR was finalized and the targeted water provision program was fully implemented; number of agreements over co-management of water sources, sharing of grazing resources, identification of new rest points for mobile pastoralists along SRs, opening of blocked routes, and establishment of new wet grazing areas have been made and are still holding. A proposal for community investment fund (CIF) to fill gaps in funding interventions related to co-management has been prepared and under discussion in the PCU. The PFS established in Al Adday villages has been described by the beneficiaries as one of the most appreciated interventions of the Programme. Besides providing for social harmony and coherence, the school provided as a shared space for training and upgrading of productive skills, especially in relation to animal health and nutrition. The institutionalization of the SRs and co-management mechanisms and their capacities is on-going. Extension campaigns to popularize and promote understanding about co-management and its approaches, at community level as well as at the level of Green Departments and localities is addressed. In short, the approach of co-management of SRs is appealing and can work but time remains relatively short to accomplish all, while the indicators set (co-management SR plan) are planned to be monitored.

### **1.2 Land Reclamation and Soil Conservation** (*Satisfactory, 5*)

15. **Water harvesting.** This activity involves introduction of proven improved water harvesting and soil conservation techniques. In crop production, the activities for water harvesting have exceeded the appraisal targets. About 24,501 feddans in rain-fed area have been treated against a target of 13,500 feddan (181%), benefiting over 12,713 HHs (6,638 male and 6,075 female-headed) with 2 feddans each against a 10,000 HH appraisal target. The performance of this activity<sup>17</sup> is rated highly satisfactory and now just during the early cropping season (June – July 2016) of the AF period already 1,650 feddans against a 2,500 feddans target area (66%) are treated with water harvesting

---

<sup>16</sup> Routes are long and sign post far apart from each other; currently, a furrow is made from one post to the other so that the route is clearly demarcated from sign post to sign post.

<sup>17</sup> The central outcome of this intervention is the improved crop yield where about 500 - 900 kg per feddan increase in sorghum productivity was recorded throughout the three states compared to 180 – 270 kg/fed under traditional practices and/or conventional tillage cultivation. However, more important is stability of crop yield in poor rainfall seasons and of better resilience to rainfall fluctuation. The intervention has however, more outcomes including fe/male farmers are more aware about effect of water harvesting on alleviating dry spells effect and hence improved vertical yield, increased use of chisel plough and gradually replacing the undesirable conventional wide- level disc or disc plough.

techniques. It is likely that the whole target will be achieved by the end of the cultivation season.

**16.** In the majority of the treated areas, existing and new growers are scaling up activities at their own cost whereby benefitting from consolidation activities by the programme. The mission was pleased to learn that the last SM's recommendation to consolidate this activity by promoting and advising fe/male producers on the importance of implementing complete package elements has been acknowledged by the communities. They are now implementing water harvesting (land chiselling and contour bunds), improved seeds, and plant spacing and rotation in improving crop yield (Farig Elbagar, Eldibeabat)<sup>18</sup>. In addition, the newly launched National Programme for Integrated Agriculture Solutions (NPOIAS), which aims at improving agricultural productivity using production improvement technology packages like the WSRMP model, is operating in 18 States and initiated by the FMoAF and MoFEP, is now promoting these technologies; i.e. implanting agencies are MDETs at locality level and Green Departments at state Level. It is interesting to know that fe/male farmers have observed that the Curiat ploughed soil yields more than with tractor as well as the positive effects on environment benefits (water conservation, minimum soil disturbance and wind erosion and non-destructive to trees). The Mission praises this Good Practice (GP) as opposed to tractor and it would contribute to ensure sustainability of production and conservation of production resource base.

**17. Forestry.** The programme has a variety of forest activities including construction of nurseries at the Forest National Corporation (FNC), community and household levels. They are used for sand dune fixation, agro-forestry plantations, home and public purposes. During the AF period, the successful HH nurseries have been scaled up. Fourteen HH nurseries against a target of 12 (117%) were established and helped the communities to plant all planned and targeted 1,200 feddans in agro-forestry system. Availability of water has been conducive for promoting and encouraging seedling production around the water points as well as at the HH levels making them cost effective. The mission appraises the arrangement made by the communities of El Himir and Tibna for planting Hashab trees (Gum Arabic) in agro-forestry system and postponing crop harvest and residues collection to as late as February for protection purposes as most appropriate; all these crop by-products are then used for animal feeding at HH level. It is the opinion of WSRMP that the Gum Arabic Belt Revive Project<sup>19</sup> will support this activity where already production infrastructures were established by the programme<sup>20</sup>.

**18. Sand dunes fixation<sup>21</sup>:** No activity was proposed during the additional fund for sand dunes fixation. However, this activity was consolidated by advising, empowering and raising communities' awareness for protecting the shelterbelts to increase the vegetation cover percentage by replacing the missing and un-survived plants. The WSRMP model of sand dunes fixation is now being captured and expands by the climate change project<sup>22</sup> and thus no investment was made.

### **1.3 Water Supply (Satisfactory, 5)**

**19.** The programme has supported the communities along the SRs with significant investment in provision of potable drinking water supply through four main sources, namely stock water earth tank (dug-out reservoir/hafirs), water yards, stock water dams and water containment structures (natural ponds). During the AF, the physical achievement of water supply activities included (i) construction of

---

<sup>18</sup> Discussions with growers revealed that the use of minimum tillage such as chisel plough with runoff water flow control by installing contour bunds instead of the conventional wide level disc (WLD) plough, minimizes land cultivation with remarkable effect on improved water infiltration and conservation to 25 – 30 cm depth and vertical yield increase from small area. The WLD is an implement with very wide width of cut and very shallow depth of ploughing (5- 7 cm) enabling fast ploughing speed that covers large area in a very short time hence accelerating cultivation process, but yield is poor and hence compensation is made through cultivation of large area. Therefore, the programme model of water harvesting and conservation is encouraging small holding farmers to focus in small farm area with full package that would generate increased yield per unit area, at reduced the cost of production and conserving nutrients and while given a rest to large area (fallow) under natural regeneration of vegetation cover.

<sup>19</sup> A programme initiated by the State of North Kordofan and implemented by MoA.

<sup>20</sup> The mission is of the opinion that the outcome of this activity is quite significant, where earlier tree plantations have produced Gum Arabic and non-wood products of significant contribution to HH income; these Acacia Senegal shrubs (Hashab trees) also provide good browsing and pods for animal feeding.

<sup>21</sup> It is introduced for control of desertification and sand dunes creeping over the farm and range lands and residential areas through establishment of tree shelter-belt supported by tree seedlings (especially gum Arabic) raised on community nurseries near the water points. Physical achievement on this intervention is establishment of shelter-belts on three communities in NK State as the most vulnerable state, enabled protecting 366 feddans out of 300 fed project target (at 122 % achievement) and villages.

<sup>22</sup> UNDP supported programme of the Green Climate Fund.

one water yard out of 3 planned target; (ii) de-silting of 17 natural ponds out of 15 planned target (113%); (iii) improvement of 3 existing water sources (shallow wells); and (iv) construction / rehabilitation of 4 hafirs<sup>23</sup> out of 3 planned target (133%). The annual volume of water provided by these facilities amount to 231,000 m<sup>3</sup>, benefiting 3,400 HHs. With increase in water sources during this period, the availability of water increased by 43% from before this period (542,000 m<sup>3</sup>) and the number of beneficiaries increased by 53% from before this period (6,400 HHs) because of inclusion of nomadic people.

**20.** The problem with the implementation of water yards is due to (i) unavailability of water at the suggested sites (at NK); or (ii) because of the high cost of construction (SK and WK). The planned water yards were replaced by one new hafir and improvement of two already existing water sources. It is possible to construct at least two additional water yards if re-allocation is made to the current AWPB and the schedule two of the financial agreement.

**21.** The mission was pleased to note that the tripartite agreement between the community, locality and State Water Authority for O&M of the water yard is functioning properly and each partner is committed to its obligations at El Himir and other communities, indicating well organized and capacitated WMC. However, some communities (Gaghrou, Eldibeabat, Eladdai) spend more money/budget collected from sale of water on social services than on O&M and productive activities; teams are aware that this deserves attention. The results obtained of this activity has generated considerable outcomes (i) increased access to safe drinking water by 85% of duration consumption; (ii) reduced walking distance to fetch water by 75% (from 8 km to 2 km on average); (iii) reduced time for fetching water by 80% (from 5 hr to one hr); (iv) decreased cost of water to HH by 50%; (v) encourage change straw buildings to permanent and establishment of nurseries; (vi) increased time for farming and animal care; (vi) reduced pupils drop out; and (vii) increased return from sale of water and many communities are becoming self-dependant on meeting the cost of operation and management plus considerable savings. In addition, the savings from drinking water supply has been the driving vehicle for social and economic development at community level (building schools, mosques and latrines) and social stability; i.e. less/zero migration, but also attract IDPs; in addition to performing routine repair and maintenance<sup>24</sup>. It is also contributed to harmony between settlers and nomads/semi-nomads and improved livestock production. In terms of scaling-up<sup>25</sup>, the WSRMP model of upgrading the traditional hand-dug well and hand pump into enhanced water yard by installing submersible pump and diesel driven motor, overhead water tank and water abstraction outlets to human and animals was considered by community as more sustainable source of drinking water supply compared to hafirs.

#### **1.4 Livestock Activities (Satisfactory, 5)**

**22.** An important achievement made during the AF period concerns the careful planning and implementation of water ponds along the SRs, which contributes to dispersing the animals in need of water and thus preventing overgrazing at existing water supply facilities (mainly small hafirs). In terms of physical achievements (2006 – June 2016), 11 veterinary check points<sup>26</sup> were constructed along the SRs and some of them (about 6) will be linked to LMRP project in NK and WK; 2 inspection and vaccination centres (Elkhoway<sup>27</sup>, Elsunut) of which one had remained idle due to lack of water but

<sup>23</sup> The rehabilitation of existing hafirs is a consolidation activity whereby inlet and outlet structures and fences are added to improve its performance (i.e. improved quality of water, prevention of animal entrance and control of water abstraction) and upgraded into improved ones.

<sup>24</sup> During the field visit to Elhimir community the mission observed that the water management committee has replaced 3 engine motors and a generator worth of over 11000 SDG, indicating pro-active WMC.

<sup>25</sup> It was reported and stated by the participating communities that non-participating neighbouring communities will invest on establishing similar extra water points by paying the full cost of facility.

<sup>26</sup> The role played by these points is one of the core objectives of axis of the Animal Health. The check points in one season vaccinated 77,325 head livestock and treated 17,680 animals and issued 4,500 inspection certificates; moreover, a total number of 15,754 HHs had access to WSRMP initiated animal health services.

<sup>27</sup> As many as 1 million heads of sheep per year destined for Khartoum and export markets are passing through the IVC; as many as 5,000 head of sheep per day during the peak season. From the NR review studies conducted (report in draft stage), it is learnt that there is evidence that the WSRMP IVC intervention approach triggered and encouraged long lasting and viable private investment that would not have been made before; i.e. (i) the volume of business generated through investments based on adequate water provisions managed by surrounding communities as an enterprise; (ii) organising the resting and grazing areas through communication with traders and surrounding communities; (iii) community Hima's established in the vicinities provide excellent trade opportunities for selling fodder as well as allowing grazing against a fee; (iv) establishing fodder market provides incentive to the communities to invest in range, fodder production and caring for agricultural by-products. On the other hand, the revenue from the investments has had the effect of further stimulating reinvesting in other economic activities to generate more revenue i.e. establishing revolving funds, buying more assets, building stores, etc.

currently this problem is addressed by the FMoAR; and 38 crush pens<sup>28</sup>. Apart from consolidating some of the infrastructures established (mainly repairs, fencing); no other activities were planned for the AF period but light support to vaccination campaigns and pastoral field days.

**23.** Upscaling of sheep fattening and strategic feeding of goats is widespread in all communities as could be observed during the field visits where members of the communities explained how it is practiced and by whom<sup>29</sup>. In terms of animal health, all sites visited praised the access to preventive and curative care. Village poultry is a field, which is now also covered by the CAHWs especially by women; the uptake varies (50 communities) depending on the setting. The off-spring of the introduced Syrian goats perform well in terms of milk production when kept at home but not when taken out for grazing; women narrate that the local goats too perform well when strategic feeding is applied<sup>30</sup>. Overall, the role of CAHWs in provision of basic animal health care and animal production extension is recognized resulting in, among others, being employed by the Department, which is as such perceived as positive by the communities.

**24.** The fishery investments in Elrahad and Elsunut have generated one of the most appealing outcomes and impacts<sup>31</sup> of WSRMP. Currently, full support of the Fishery Department is in place at both sites and they are equipped with a motorized boat so as to ensure monitoring of the fish population. The field work for the environmental impact study planned for AF period has been conducted and the report is expected soon.

## Component 2: Rural Finance Services and Marketing (*Satisfactory, 5*)

### 2.1 Rural Finance Services (*Satisfactory, 5*)

**25.** During the AF period, the rural finance activities aimed to consolidate the achievements of the village savings and credit groups (VSCGs) develop VSCG associations and establishing state microfinance units. It also continues the partnership with ABSUMI to strengthen its institutional structure and linkages with the VSCGs.

**26. Savings and Credit groups.** AF in the 12 localities addressed a total of 4,917 groups with around 18,000 members in 313 communities. Of these 1,913 (40%) groups were in the programme villages and 3,004 (about 60%) in outside WSRMP villages indicating good diffusion of this intervention outside the project communities; i.e. scaling-up. The total number of VSCGs included 11% men's groups indicating good acceptance of the VSCGs approach by men. The overall performance status of the VSCGs is presented below.

Overall performance status of VSCGs, June 2016									
Details	Within project communities			Outside project communities			Total		
	Female	Male	Total	Female	Male	Total	Female	Male	Total
<b>Communities</b>			271			53			324
<b>VSCGS</b>	971	82	1,053	190	15	205	1,161	97	1,258
<b>Membership</b>	14,990	1,208	16,198	1,910	236	3,146	17,900	1,444	19,344
<b>Saving (SDG)</b>	1,807,062	2,66,249	2,073,311	353,462	52,078	405,540	2,160,524	318,327	2,478,851

<sup>28</sup> In the programme area the crush pens helped in vaccination of 1,173,473 animals in check points (mobile crush pens) and 1,567,100 head of animals in Makharif (fixed crush pens). Based on results of a recent study conducted by the Agricultural Research Station in El-Obied in North and West Kordofan, it is found (during vaccination and treatment campaigns) that vaccination rate increased by 25%-30% annually, while using the fixed crush pens helped in treatment of 152,412 head and using the mobile crush pens helped in treatment of 54,255.

<sup>29</sup> **Sheep Fattening:** the sheep fattening is a successful outcome gaining momentum. The evidences are: (i) village traders at community level started selling concentrate feed in bulk; veterinary drugs, mineral licks/salt in small sized packages; (ii) the women also using kitchen left-overs for developing local type of concentrate feed; (iii) variety of crop and milling by-products are used as well as commercial compound feed; (iv) sheep fattening is also the preferred productive activity for which women seek micro credit (78% of the ABSUMI loans are taken for animal production: sheep as well as cattle fattening). In Um Nalah community in West Bara locality revealed that a net profit of 400 SDG per head of sheep was achieved during a 40 days fattening period. Flushing of goats during late pregnancy and early lactation is also adopted but to a lesser extent in terms of number of goats as the milk is mainly kept for home consumption.

<sup>30</sup> From the draft study (reviewing the NRM component, Musa, June 2016), the following conclusion was made: the cross-bred might have potential in case where a household can afford management zero grazing / stall feeding system, which is rarely the case in North Kordofan.

<sup>31</sup> A total of 3,230 direct and 16,000 indirect beneficiaries are benefiting from the averaged 52-ton fish produced per season which gained an average price of 8.5 SDG per kg of fish (El Rahad lake) compared to marginal fish catch before the intervention.

27. Over the years the VSCGs have emerged as one of the most successful WSRMP interventions. The mission observed that the groups meet, save and invest regularly and independently and they have full support of the CDCs. Their internal capital is growing continuously as a result of regular savings and ploughing back of the profits from group investments and is one of the main factors for their success. Starting initially with SDG 5 per month many groups now save up to SDG 20 per month with seasonal variations. It is common to find total savings per group between SDG 6,000 to 10,000 and in some cases these have reached up to SDG 30,000. With the growth in the internal capital the nature of group investments has also evolved. Most groups started with individual internal credit amongst the group members and then progress to collective group investments in activities such as grain storage and livestock fattening. Thereafter, some groups progressed even further and made collective investments in collaboration with other groups in relatively large projects such as purchase of small transport vehicle (tuk tuk). Some groups have evolved even further and have partnered with the CDCs for investment in community development projects such as water tanks and school buildings.

28. A total of 183 out of the 1,913 groups formed within the project communities in the 12 localities were **credit linked to external MFIs** such as ABSUMI, Baraah, Islamic Relief and Sudanese Rural Development Company. The benefits of external credit in terms of increasing the income of the households are visible. A very strong repayment culture has developed with almost 100% repayment records to all MFIs. The concept of lending to women's groups has now been fully accepted by the financial institutions. However, the supply of external credit has been unpredictable as MFIs including ABSUMI have withdrawn from some villages after several loan cycles. The mission observed that when external credit linkage started some groups stopped internal savings. Unfortunately, when the MFIs withdrew from these villages after a few cycles due to external factors, these groups failed to restart their internal savings practice and collapsed.

29. **Development of VSCGs Association.** The formation of associations was launched during AF period to promote collective investments by mature groups and so far, 14 associations have been organized. However, the initiative started late and the associations are still in early stages of development. They are not yet registered, lack bank accounts and specialized enterprise training. WSRMP does not have the time to fully develop all the associations though evidence from the field suggests that all of them can function even after the programme along the same lines of the VSCGs.

30. **Establishment of State (Micro) Finance units.** During AF, WSRMP established three state finance units (SFUs), with one in each State. Necessary equipment and furniture was supplied and in consultation with the respective State Governments three staff members were placed in each unit. These staff members have been trained in basic microfinance principles and overall WSRMP approach. However, there is still a gap in understanding the key function of the units at the end of the Ministry of Agriculture/Animal Resources. Consequently, full support to these units by the government is still lacking. The units themselves have just started and are yet to fully grasp and implement their responsibilities.

31. **ABSUMI.** During AF, ABSUMI did not receive any direct assistance from WSRMP. However, the collaboration continued to ensure that WSRMP communities benefitted from the three ABSUMI units in Um Ruwaba, Lagawa and Sheikan. As at 30 June 2016 these three units reached 14,450 women members from 936 groups in 165 villages. Of the total groups receiving ABSUMI benefits, 862 were formed directly the ABSUMI credit officers and 74 were VSCGs formed by WSRMP. The total disbursement of the three units was approximately SDG 82 million and the total savings balance was approximately SDG 2.3 million. As of 30 June 2016 the Um Ruwaba and the Sheikan Units reported profits but the Lagawa unit continued to be loss making due to delinquency issues. The ABSUMI National Steering Committee was revived and the Regional Coordinator for the Kordofan region was appointed. The Um Ruwaba and Sheikan Units recorded 100% repayment rate. However, the Lagawa unit achieved 87.5% repayment rate mainly due to delinquency triggered by conflict in the Locality. Measures to bring the situation under control have so far not been fully successful. Another situation of concern witnessed in the Um Ruwaba locality is the large decline in the member base by around 7,000 members as it pulled out from 10 communities. This has occurred mainly due to 2 reasons. First in some villages ABSUMI had reached the last cycle (sixth cycle) and could not continue serving the clients further. In other villages the decision to withdraw was taken as the credit officers in the Unit were downsized from 20 to 10 by transferring some of them to other units.

## **2.2 Markets and Marketing** (*Moderately Satisfactory, 4*)

**32. Markets.** There have been no new developments regarding the markets constructed/rehabilitated since 2010<sup>32</sup>. During AF, WSRMP selected the Elmazroub livestock market in NK State for rehabilitation and tendering has been completed. A training session of the market staff is planned in order to raise their capacity in market management. The project has also distributed 64 out of the 120 market stalls budgeted in AF. Mixed utilization of these stalls was noted with some beneficiaries setting up the stalls in the communities itself near school yards or for selling grocery items.

**33. Marketing.** The main focus of the marketing activities was the rehabilitation of the large markets which unfortunately failed to produce the desired results. At the same time there have been some unintended success stories in market creation. One very good example in this regard is the fisheries intervention by the programme which among other activities trained members of the fisheries union and provided them with equipment. The local demand for fish far exceeded supply and led to considerable increase in fish production. On one hand it diversified the source of protein for the local buyers and on the other it generated handsome returns for around 200 fishermen. Yet, because of the rigidity of the marketing activities the project was unable to devote much attention to fish marketing aspects beyond local market sales. This general gap in marketing support was not felt earlier in the project but has now started emerging with the maturity of some of the programme activities. One main reason for this is the increased access to finance, resulting from the success of the rural finance activities, which is increasing the market engagement of the target group households. However, the project is currently not adequately equipped to provide the target group with necessary guidance on market linkage aspects for optimising their returns.

## **Component 3: Community Development and Extension** (*Satisfactory, 5*)

### **3.1 Community Development Committees (CDCs)** (*Satisfactory, 5*)

**34.** The number of communities targeted during the AF period was 131 communities distributed unevenly between the three States of NK (24%), SK (15%) and WK (61%). Out of the total targeted communities, 60% are settled farmers and the remaining 40% are nomads and semi nomads reflecting more focusing on nomads and semi nomads compared to 2006-2014 period. The main focus during the AF period was on (i) completion of community centres, especially ICDCs; (ii) provision of revised CIF to be linked to the Co-management initiative; and (iii) investment in the consolidation of capacity development at the level of community members and structures, including extension teams. 92% of the planned community development physical interventions have been achieved. This involved LENS advanced training (122% achievement); training of WUAs which was fully achieved; training of community and integrated development committees (133% achievement); training of fishery cooperatives members with 100% achievement; training of 25 women leaders (100% achievement); training of 100 community development groups with 107% achievement; gender sensitization with 100% achievement; establishment of CIF with 27% achieved and establishment of 30 revolving funds out of which 33% had been achieved<sup>33</sup>. The programme interventions in community development have contributed significantly to the empowerment of communities with the leaders of community development committees now playing an important role in overseeing the development process of community development while establishing links with the outside world.

### **3.2 Community Development Centres** (*Satisfactory, 5*)

**35.** A total of 37 CDCs have been established during the life time of the Programme. The centres provide the main hubs for community meetings, activities and collective decision making. They are also used by the extension teams (MDET, MET and LENS) as the entry window for extension activities with the communities. Because of that the centres have become an effective mechanism for equipping communities and individuals with the skills and capacities and developing of community-prioritized interventions. This is besides, symbolizing community cooperation over shared interests. The Mission also noted that the centres as institutions/structures have been capacitated with the

---

<sup>32</sup> The grain market in Al Rahad is fully functional. However, the grain markets in El Obeid and Abu Gubeiha are inactive as marketing activities were not transferred to these locations. Although, based on the request of the Sheikan locality authorities, the project has agreed to allow the use of the El Obeid market as a livestock instead of grain market there has not been much progress in this direction. Similarly, the Babanosa livestock market remains inactive as livestock marketing activities were not transferred to this location.

<sup>33</sup> However, number of activities under this sub component remains to be completed during the coming months including: the internal exchange visits; the study tour for community leaders; and CRCs committees training.

practical and technical skills and communities, though with some variations, are well organized and have built high degree of awareness about development management.

### **3.3 Integrated Community Development Centres (ICDCs) (Satisfactory, 5)**

36. ICDCs are multi-tasks centres along the SRs intended to provide valuable services to both settlers and nomads. Of the total 21 ICDCs established by the programme 7 have been completed and handed over to communities in 2016 reflecting 100% achievement. The two ICDCs visited by the Mission reflect the enormous determination of the communities to manage and maintain the centres. The youth in particular, as exemplified by the youth of Al Adday community are very enthusiastic about the centre and voiced the need for capacity development<sup>34</sup>, especially in areas of organizational management and the development of a business plan to sustain the functionality of the ICDC. As maintained by the Mission the ICDCs are relevant, providing to social cohesion by bringing diverse communities together and have the potential to expanding and sustaining the Programme benefits. The balance between being service structures and business oriented structures deserves to be maintained. However, the Mission noted that the quality of ICDCs buildings is not the same, as some centres, e.g. Um Simeima, show lower quality and, therefore deserves attention.

### **3.4 Multi-Disciplinary Extension teams (MDETs) (Moderately Satisfactory, 4)**

37. A total of 24 qualified and well-equipped Multi-Disciplinary Extension Teams (MDETs)<sup>35</sup> have been established in the programme localities. Composition of these teams has considered the gender dimension which assisted the team to equally approach and serve both women and men. Some specializations such as microfinance (officers) indicate how the teams are prepared to address different community needs. The mission field visits reflected the good ties between the communities and the teams. The mission has great concern about the sustainability of the teams as locality budgets should include the operational costs for these teams. Another concern is the persistence of the teams' composition under accelerated turn-over of staff.

### **3.5 Mobile Extension Teams (MET) (Satisfactory, 5)**

38. Three METs have been deployed in the three states of NK, SK and WK whereby the MET team of SK is topping. The teams cover the 2 rehabilitated SRs in which nomads and semi nomads (40% of programme beneficiaries) are the main targets. During the reporting period, 66 (68% males and 32% females) METs members have received trainings on co-management mechanism, PFS, Geographical Information System (GIS), data collection and report writing and book keeping. The METs are playing a crucial role in providing services to the nomadic communities in terms of capacity building programs, advocacy and other basic services besides linking these communities with supportive government institutions. Through an App Group, the members of the three METs communicate on a regular basis whereby also using photos taken to clarify, share and comment upon. In future, the role of the METs is anticipated to grow as linkages with the PFS, ICDCs, co-management structures and CRCs will be the promising entry points for the integration of the nomads in the development processes. The METs also contributed to the peaceful co-existence between the nomads and the settlers through sound participatory NRM mechanisms.

### **3.6 Local Extension Networks (LENs) (Satisfactory, 5)**

39. The Mission noted that community-based extension teams (para-vet, crop protection; midwife, NRM agents, community trainers and health workers) are effective and functional in providing valuable and highly prioritized community services. LEN skills and capacities are widely recognized by communities and MDETs. In all villages visited the services provided by the agents were highly commended and appreciated by the communities. In Al Dibabat village the community trainer has turned into a trainer of trainees in the neighbouring villages and hamlets. The cost recovery approach followed has significantly contributed to the continuity of the services provided. The agents are also largely linked and recognized by the authorities in the related technical departments. With very few exceptions, the stability of these service providers was also observed.

### **3.7 Pastoralists Field School (Moderately Satisfactory, 4)**

40. Three PFS have been established in the three States with the one in NK described as the best functional one. Although very novel, the intervention provided an important impetus for the

---

34 A learning route to well-functioning centres established under the programme was perceived and described by the youth as an important learning opportunity.

35 MDETs have formally been accepted in NK through legislation.



integration of the pastoralists with the world around them. The PFS established in Al Adday Villages in 2016 has been described by the beneficiaries as one of the most appreciated interventions of the Programme. Besides providing for social harmony and coherence the school provided as a shared space for training and upgrading of productive skills, especially in relation to animal health and nutrition. The participation of women in the schools was observed. As the intervention in the PFS is still in its infancy it deserves due attention and needs to be fully integrated in the Co management mechanisms of SRs and the related CRCs.

### **3.8 Community Initiative/Investment Funds (CIF) (Satisfactory, 5)**

41. The CIF when taken from development perspective has played a key role in empowering the communities financially to address their needs of the services they want. This fund enhanced the community cohesiveness as the methodology followed in the management of the funds has considered the accountability and transparency measures; i.e. communities' contribution is 25%. To date the programme has spent around 17% (SDG 20,000) of the allocated fund (SDG 120,000) in the AF period. However, the cumulative resources spent since the programme start-up exceed SDG 9,918,000 on 186 facilities such as water (70%), flour mills and oil mills. Some essential services have been secured through this fund such as education. The LENs also benefited from the generated profit.

### **3.9 Community Revolving Fund (CRF) (Satisfactory, 5)**

42. The CRF started with the establishment/construction of the CDCs/ICDCs with the purpose of improvement of the agricultural production through provision of inputs such as improved seed, chemicals, small animal drawn ploughs and restocking of small ruminants in addition to transformation of housing materials into bricks, LPG, veterinary drugs, etc. As at 30 June 2016 the programme has disbursed SDG 181,000 (55%) out of the SDG 333,000 allocated for financing community initiatives through additional financing. Of this around SDG 161,000 (89%) were used to support drug revolving funds in 36 communities and pest revolving funds in 10 communities. In addition, LPG revolving funds were also established in some villages. In the communities visited the mission observed that the CDCs charge a mark-up of around 10% from the beneficiaries of this activity. The repayment performance reported by the communities is satisfactory. However, the main concern remains the erosion of the capital with the growing inflation. This has been a consistent issue facing the sustainability of the revolving funds and the accelerated pace of price rise over the last few years has intensified its negative impact.

### **Component 4: Rural feeder Roads (Unsatisfactory, 2)**

43. The contracted work of Elsimyeh – Elsamasm road is composed of earth works and structures. Beit Elmaarifa Company was contracted to implement the proposed rural roads activities while Dar Consult was contracted as a consultant. Regarding the civil and earth works, the committed contractual work includes removal and disposal of all vegetation surfaces, debris, trees, scattered stones and rocks within the limit of the right way (length 183 km), easement area and borrows pits. As structures the committed contractual work includes construction of 13 new box culverts, 78 pipe culverts and 3 main bridges. Up to date the implementation of the work reaches 38% of the total plan. The work in cleaning the right way was completed for the whole length of the road. All the bridge piles for the three bridges were constructed but only placed in Domi bride. Also (10) pipe culvert were constructed. The scheduled plan of implementation of the road was highly affected by the suspension of the OFID loan which was declared ineffective at the end of October 2014. Notwithstanding the intensive lobbying efforts of WSRMP and related authorities, the delay of the GoS to pay the arrears continues up to date.

### **Component 5: Institutional Support (Satisfactory, 5)**

44. **Support to Extension Teams:** The MET, MDET continued to receive financial, logistical and technical support from WSRMP. The services of these teams are highly valued by communities. Government have expressed commitment to ensure their sustainability after Programme completion. Referring to Component 2 (capacity building METs, others) and 3 (establishment and equipping Rural Finance Units) for details on training conducted and infrastructures/means provided.

**45. Studies.** During the second quarter, 3 studies were initiated: (i) support functionality of conflict resolution centres for strengthening the capacity of centre to engage in peaceful settlement of NR disputes and other issues of operation and management; (ii) impact assessment of veterinary services being implemented to foresee its effect in supporting animal health and outreach coverage; and (iii) support Abu Habil Scheme to identify resistant and constraints impeding the adoption of the Programme intervention of improved water management practices. Of the first one, the draft report was shared with the SM, the second one is still under implementation while contract for the third one have just been issued. During the first half of 2016, **5 contracts** were developed including (i) support NRM data analysis and consolidation (draft completed and shared with the SM); (ii) development Knowledge Products (development video products in particular and two video shows were presented to the SM); (iii) updating WSRMP accounting system (national consultant); (iv) stock-route co-management consultant (national) is on-going and documentation of co-management process not yet started. **Surveys** - three out of two planned M&E surveys (annual assessment, RIMS, SROI) have been conducted. They are associated with annual assessment of the Programme performance, collecting data for RIMS and SROI. **Workshops** - two out of four planned thematic studies and workshops were delivered.

#### **D. Programme Implementation Progress** (*Satisfactory, 5*)

##### **D.1 Quality of Programme Management** (*Satisfactory, 5*)

**46.** The PCU is in charge of coordinating three IFAD projects/programmes (WSRMP, SDP and ABSUMI), while it was earlier indicated that this is far from ideal, currently it is up-to-the mark. It was, for instance, helpful that ABSUMI staff participated in the meeting specifically for rural micro finance. Where relevant, alignment with SDP happens at field level; CDCs, VSCGs, farmer field school approach, promoting utilisation of certified seed, etc. The focus of SDP on private service providers does also stimulate CDCs/groups/individuals to develop links with outside actors (arranging for inputs, link to credit providers, etc.). It is observed that all teams are back to being disciplined, engaged and committed; something which was much lacking during SM 2015.

##### **D.2 Performance Monitoring and Evaluation System** (*Satisfactory, 5*)

**47.** Physical achievements, RIMS data, M&E report and plan are up-to-date and of good quality. At this stage of the programme, the M&E is expected to give more attention to the extraction of lessons learned through proper analysis of the rich data and information collected and at the same time to play an effective role in the production of KM products whereby not hesitating to involve the so-called champions in the field (communities) and at locality level (MDET). The on-going review and impact studies are of utmost importance considering the PCR. Two draft studies were shared with the mission (review of NRM component; study on CRCs) and verbal feedback has already been provided by the relevant Mission experts while the same shall be reported in the working papers. A national consultant has been hired to provide comprehensive summaries in English as the review studies are written in Arabic as these are conducted by the PIAs and facilitated by national consultants.

##### **D.3 Coherence AWPB & Implementation** (*Satisfactory, 5*)

**48.** All members of the SM were impressed with the quality of the AWPB, related annual (2015) and semi-annual report; data provided match with the RIMS data, presentations of the different unit and so on. Arriving late July and receiving a complete semi-annual report (Jan-June, 2016) is an achievement as detailed data need to come from different SCU/focal points. Any question of the SM during meetings and field visits could be answered by various staff meaning that all are aware and on-board. The focus on consolidation, sustainability and scaling-up was clear to all, while commitment at all levels for achieving the demanding co-management of SRs.

#### **D.4 Gender focus in implementation** (*Satisfactory, 5*)

49. The programme shows strong gender orientation as women are represented in all programme structures at different levels (PCU, SCU/focal points, community development structures and extension teams). Fifty-two of the total targeting under the Community Initiative Fund in 2016 are women. Women also accounted for 28% of the extension teams trained in SK. In WK women constituted 77% of the community members trained. Out of the total number of WUA trained in the State 50% were women. Women empowerment, economically and socially, has also been widely recognized and emphasized, by both men and the women themselves.

#### **D.5 Poverty Focus in implementation** (*Satisfactory, 5*)

50. Recognizing that poverty reduction is essentially about enhancing capabilities and expanding alternatives, it is quite fair to judge that the programme has demonstrated strong poverty focus. The programme approach based on a combination of soft interventions (community organization, awareness raising, productive skills upgrading) and concrete hard interventions (land reclamation package, animal health and nutrition, village saving and credit groups, rural micro finance, and revolving funds) have demonstrated enormous effectiveness in addressing the nature of rural poverty among the targeted groups, both women and men.

#### **D.6 Innovation and Learning** (*Satisfactory, 5*)

51. An important innovation of the AF period concerns the renewed approach regarding co-management of SRs and albeit still under implementation, the first results are encouraging; i.e. see para 12 and 14. Few examples from the WSRMPs good practices (GPs) can be picked up as innovations that require proper documentation and processing as KM product: (i) the community trainers (e.g. Arafa) have strong transformative role among rural women; (ii) the VSCGs as women empowerment approach and consequently, the associations as collective investment for enhancement of social cohesiveness; (iii) the microfinance officer is an innovative discipline within the MDETs; (iv) water as a mean to govern NRM; and (v) CRCs/SR co-management/early warning as appropriate mechanisms for conflict management and maintaining peace along the livestock corridors.

#### **D.7 Knowledge Management** (*Satisfactory, 5*)

52. As WSRMP is approaching its closing stage, it is a pleasure to observe that priority is provided to the development of knowledge products (KP) as a key outcome of this top-up phase; i.e. plentiful achievements, methodologies applied and good practices and successes generated. As well, lessons learnt from failures/less successful interventions and the evolution of approaches. WSRMP has produced relatively a large set of KP but not always with a clear vision and targeted audience. Currently, there is a country KM strategy under development by the involvement of the ICO, CCU and the projects which would give guidance to WSRMP efforts in producing the right formatted KM products for dissemination among IFAD beneficiaries in the country and Worldwide. It is hoped that it will be available in time. The programme has prepared its M&E plan which identified knowledge management and sharing (generate, produce products and disseminate) as key objectives.

#### **D.8 Climate and Environmental Focus** (*Satisfactory, 5*)

53. Although resilience to climate change was not explicitly addressed in the programme design the programme interventions reflect strong focus on environment with enormous relevance to strengthen resilience to climate change. Achievements in land reclamation and conservation founded on promoting water harvesting technology (physical achievements stand at 66% during January-June 2016 and 181% during 2010-2016) and community/HH nurseries (physical achievements stand 50% during Jan –June 2016 and 206% during 2010-2016) together with the accelerated adoption and growing of high value trees, especially acacia Senegal (Gum Arabic tree) provided important climate and environment focusing<sup>36</sup>.

---

<sup>36</sup> According to data from Farig Elbagar 4,000 seedlings of gum Arabic trees have been planted over the past three years with an overall success of 75%. Some of these trees could be tapped by 2017. The replacement of wood by mud in house construction and the wide adoption of LPGs particularly in places like Farig Elbagar were described as an important input to environmental restoration and rehabilitation. In the village 78.6% of the households are using LPGs compared to 11.9% in 2010 when the Revolving Fund intervention was first introduced.

## E. Fiduciary aspects

### E.1 Financial management. (*Moderately satisfactory, 4*)

**54. Organization and Staffing.** The organizational structure of WSRMP and SDP, PCU and SCU/focal points, remained as it is. However staffing changes have taken place for financial management staff in March 2015 with the recruitment of an additional accountant position at PCU. With this change, the number of financial management staff increased to 6 comprising three positions at PCU, finance controller (FC) and two accountants (one for WSRMP and the other for SDP) and 3 more accountants one for each of three SCU/focal points in charge of State financial management. The staffing in terms of experience, qualifications and number is deemed sufficient for the management of WSRMP and no changes to the TORs are envisaged.

**55. Budgeting.** WSRMP AWPB preparation continues to follow a bottom up approach and goes through several stages of preparation, review and approval. Each of the three SCU/focal points prepares its own AWPB with participation of and according to the beneficiaries needs. SCU/focal points AWPB are subject to review and approval by the respective state steering committees. The consolidated AWPBs of SCU/focal points and PCU are approved by the central steering committee and subsequently by the MoFEP before submission to IFAD for review and concurrence. Normally, the AWPBs are ready for submission to IFAD in October of the previous year. For FY 2016, WSRMP's AWPB was submitted to IFAD in January 2016 for approval. The actual expenditures as at June 2016 represent 9% only of the budget for the period. If we exclude the budget allocated for the road, then the rate will be 42%. Obviously, the major reason for this low delivery rate relates to stopping works on road construction, caused by suspension of OFID Loan. The budget allocated for road construction works represents 63% of total budget for the year.

**56. Funds Flow and Disbursement Arrangements.** WSRMP maintains eight separate bank accounts for IFAD Loan and Grant, OFID Loan and GoS counterpart funds; two designated accounts (DA) in EUR opened at Omdurman National Bank in El Obied, three in SDG at Omdurman National Bank in El Obied, and three in SDG for the SCU/focal points. Funds flow from the IFAD DA and GoS account to the Loan, Grant and GoS pooled and from there to SCU/focal points for implementation Programme activities other than road construction. The road construction funds flow from OFID Loan DA to its corresponding operating account. Funds flow from IFAD Loan, Grant and GoS pooled operating bank account of PCU to each of the three SCU/focal points operating bank account based on quarterly forecast of AWPB and replenishment of actual SCU/focal points expenditures. The mission examined supporting documentation related to 60% of value of withdrawal applications submitted to IFAD under SOE since July 2015 amounting to EUR 519,530 - out of IFAD Loan and Grant - and found them to be in order. Documentation was readily available and easily retrievable. The review of the SOEs revealed that the completeness of supporting documentation is still an area of weakness characterised by (i) payments to consultants with no confirmation on the quality of their reports/deliverables; and (ii) payments of overtime to senior PCU staff against their extra hours spend on managing WSRMP beside their responsibility of managing SDP with no reference documents to such entitlements. The mission recommends that the Financial Controller (FC) revives previous mission's recommendation, to develop and communicate guideline/checklist of the required supporting documents for different type of expenditures and that clearance of payments by FC should be based on the checklist. Also since we are approaching the completion date, the mission recommends that the Programme is to prepare/communicate to CFS the recovery plan of the Grant authorised allocation immediately.

**57. Internal Controls.** Sufficient level of segregation of duties exists. The PIM exists, but does not cover all aspects of the FM arrangements. The mission noted that advances are recorded as expenditures when issued, monitored manually by the accountant and justification documents are attached to the payment voucher when submitted and justified amount are in most cases equal to the amount of advance taken. The mission recommends that advance should be recorded under debtors account (advance) and cleared to respective expenditures categories only when justification is submitted and approved. The accounting system should be upgraded to include an account code for advances. **Fixed assets register** is maintained by the administrative assistant. The mission has seen some improvements on assets management, such as tagging of assets and conducting physical count for the first time since 2011 (see Annex 1). However, further improvements are still needed. Procurement Officer does not include all required information such as the cost of item, etc. Further,

the assets are not tagged and physical count was last carried in 2011. The mission recommends that (i) the assets register be modified to include information such as date of acquisition, cost of asset, etc.; and (ii) produce the report of the physical count committee for record.

**58. Accounting.** Accounts are maintained on cash basis and the financial statements are prepared on the same basis too. An access based accounting system was specifically developed for IFAD projects in Sudan and is housed in the computers of the finance staff. The system however is not the best and has some loopholes such as allowing retroactive changes to posted transactions by the users and administrator access is granted to all finance staff. The situation is being mitigated by restricting access to compilation phase to the FC only. Also changes to transactions after compilation is made only by separate reversal and correction transactions. As a lesson learnt, The Mission recommends modifying and enhancing the SDP accounting system to prevent modification of posted historical transactions and restrict the administrator rights to the FC.

**59. Financial Reporting and Monitoring.** Financial Reports are available from the system and can be customized to a great degree. The beneficiaries' in-kind contributions are now charged expenditure based on the best estimate of their value and input through the accounting system, while ABSUMI contribution is incorporated manually outside the system based on the reports received from the bank HQ. Although mission testing found that the accounting system is now capable of producing financial statements (FS), the year 2015 FS were produced manually. The mission recommends that the semi-annual and annual FS should for FY 2016, be produced from the produced from the accounting system to test and confirm System capability.

**60. Internal Audit.** An internal audit function exists at the implementing Ministry – Ministry of Agriculture, however it does not conduct internal audits of any of the projects financed by IFAD. The Programme also does not have the availability of an internal audit function as it was not envisioned for the Programme.

**E-2 Disbursement. (Moderately Satisfactory, 4)**

**61.** For the period from last mission up to June 2016, 12 withdrawal applications have been submitted to IFAD, 6 for IFAD Loan and 6 for IFAD grant (including 2<sup>nd</sup> tranche of authorised allocation). These applications cover programme expenditure for the period from January 2015 to March 2016. Disbursement of IFAD Loan up June 2016 is 100% and disbursement of IFAD Grant (including authorised allocation) is 79%. Disbursements from OFID Loan are still suspended due to GOS arrears. The decision of OFID to suspend disbursement has impacted the progress of road civil works.

**E-3 Counterpart funds. (Moderately unsatisfactory, 3)**

**62.** On accumulated basis, the funds transferred are neither sufficient nor timely. During FY 2016, GOS contribution received by the Programme as at the mission date including balance carried forward from 2015 was SDG 271,516 while actual disbursement was SDG 978,198, showing a deficit of SDG 706,682. This deficit was financed from IFAD financing proceeds. *The mission therefore, recommended that MOFEP should take the necessary actions to avail sufficient funds to cover the above deficit and as well meet the GoS contributions for the remaining Programme life span.*

**E-4 Compliance with loan covenants. (Moderately Satisfactory, 4)**

**63.** The Programme is in compliance with Financing Agreement legal covenant with exception of (i) the semi-annual narrative and financial reports, which are not submitted to IFAD; (ii) the timely flow and sufficiency of counterpart fund; and (iii) the AWBP for 2016, which was submitted for approval by IFAD on 1 January 2016. A list of key covenants and the compliance therewith is compiled in Appendix 6.

**E-5 Procurement. (Moderately Satisfactory, 4)**

**64.** Most of the Programme procurement activities for the period under were made under shopping method for goods and individual consultant method for services. The Ex-post review conducted by the mission showed that 27 procurement contracts and purchase orders have been concluded during the period under review, covering goods, works and services. The mission observed that in conducting these activities (i) applicable procedures/processes have been adhered to; and (ii) appropriate filing system has been established to keep documentation of procurement activities.

The only exception was the recruitment of a national consultant for supporting stock route co-management. This activity was said to be carried out under individual consultant method, whereas it was under single source selection, and did receive prior approval from IFAD but not for the recent extension of the contract.

#### **E-6 Quality and Timeliness of Audit. (Satisfactory, 5)**

65. Financial statements for 2015 have been audited by National Audit Chamber of Sudan. The auditors conducted their audit in line with International Standards of Auditing (ISA). The audit report and management letter were received by the due date. Auditors expressed an unqualified opinion on the financial statements. However, the opinion on the designated account and the eligibility of SOE is still missing.

## **F. Sustainability**

### **F.1 Institution building (Satisfactory, 5)**

66. The community based institutions (see component 3, para 34-36) have already proven that they manage to continue on their own. Tailor-made support to B & C communities is planned so as to address some of their weaknesses. SCGs and ABSUMI (component 2, para) are growing while safeguarding their quality control, monitoring and supervision systems.

### **F.2 Empowerment (Satisfactory, 5)**

67. Community empowerment as a result of the programme interventions has been recognized and stressed by all communities visited during the mission. Women feel particularly empowered as their relationship to the world around them has been significantly transformed as they become more and more linked to that world and business oriented. The engagement of women in a wide range of small businesses and their active participation in the committees has contributed significantly to their economic and political empowerment. Self-confidence, self-realization and decreased dependency on others were widely stated. This is in addition to their economic contribution to a range of community activities. According to one informant in the visited villages *'we are significantly empowered and we are no longer passive receivers of external actors, but we are empowered to negotiate our interests'*.

### **F.3 Quality of beneficiary participation (Satisfactory, 5)**

68. The Mission noted that the targeted communities have been enormously empowered and they are effectively participating in all of the interventions undertaken. Their required contributions to the various interventions, whether in cash or in-kind, has always been met and honoured. Gender mainstreaming and their active participation in the meetings, including meetings with SM team is quite visible reflecting the enormous power gained. The determination of the communities reflects and their confidence to continue after the completion of the programme provides an important input for sustainability.

### **F.4 Responsiveness Service Providers (Satisfactory, 5)**

69. From the onset, WSRMP has been innovative in planning starting with the beneficiaries, then MDETs (implementers/facilitators), followed by PIAs (advisors) and then compiling the demands at SCU/focal points and PCU level into AWPBs; albeit a long chain with the initial assistance of the national advisor for extension, this approach has been followed throughout. Even for the AF period, demand assessment was conducted (in 2014) in all targeted villages and subsequently updated as new relevant demands were noticed. This happens notwithstanding that MDETs have a high turn-over of staff.

### **F.5 Exit Strategy (readiness and quality) (Satisfactory, 5)**

70. WSRMP has a rolling exit strategy, meaning that it is updated at regular intervals. As the orientation of the AF is about consolidating, sustainability and scaling-up, WSRMP is actually implementing the exit strategy. During the SM, WSRMP presented a summary of the exit strategy but this did not appeal to all members as no objectives and vision were shown; before the end of the SM the PCU team managed however to update and share the exit strategy paper which is included in the SM report (annex 2), while annex 3 provides an update of all the preparations for the PCR.

#### **F.6 Potential for scaling-up and replication (Satisfactory, 5)**

71. Scaling up successful interventions has been another focus of the AF period. Since the last two seasons and this current season many interventions are being scaled up with minimum programme support. During the reporting period, the community and farmers financed treatment of 1,650 feddans farming areas with water harvesting techniques, LENs (CAHW/Para-vet, IPM, midwives and trainer of community) provided services on cost. On this season, the VCSGs on WK State alone financed 500 smallholders for land rehabilitation practices and inputs for animal production, while the CDCs financed the procurement of 250 curiat ploughs in addition to ABSUMI regular financing of small business and those adopting gas stoves. Although this met the Programme targets, the potential for scaling up these activities is much more than what is currently achieved; 60% of new VCSGs (3,004 groups) are outside the targeted communities; LEN agents serve neighbouring communities; Gum Arabic seedlings produced in individual HH nurseries are sold to neighbours within and outside the community; yet, there is no systematic monitoring of uptake of practices and approaches promoted by WSRMP, but the above-mentioned Climate Change - and NPOIAS Programme show so called vertical scaling-up.

#### **F.7 Youth (Satisfactory 5)**

72. The programme deserves compliment in providing appreciated spaces for the engagement of the youth, while it has not been a specific focus in WSRMP. In most of the communities visited, there was a remarkable presence and engagement of the youth, both females and males, in the programme activities and the community structures established. Strong youth attachment to CRCs, ICDC and CDCs was observed. However, in places like Al Adday community, the youth explicitly voiced their request for capacity development, especially in areas of organizational management and the development of a business plan to sustain the functionality of the ICDC. A learning route to well-functioning centres established under the programme was perceived and described by the youth as an important learning opportunity.

#### **F.8 Impact (Satisfactory, 5)**

73. The programme has positively impacted the livelihoods of the targeted communities. These impacts, as stated by the communities visited during the mission include: population stability; diversification of sources of income; increased resilience to drought and climate change; improved quality of the natural environment; increased cooperation and collaboration between settled and pastoral groups; gradual process of positive social change including gender division of labour; and general empowerment of the communities.

74. According to the impact study commissioned by IFAD at end of 2014 to quantify the WSRMP's impact in economic terms, the results were mixed. On one hand, the project results in a significant and positive increase in large livestock assets. Furthermore, the outcomes related to household total, food, and non-food expenditures are slightly higher on average for the WSRMP villages group, but they are not statistically significant. In terms of agricultural outcomes, no significant impact on the yield levels for the two most commonly grown crops (maize and millet) exists. Similarly, no significant impact on the revenue from livestock among the treated households exists, and there was no significant impact of the project on poverty prevalence, as measured by the likelihood of being above the asset-based poverty line at the 40th and 60th percentile ranks. On the other hand, household durables show a decrease. Indicators of food security – dietary diversity score (the number of food categories consumed by the household) and the HFIAS based on past 7 day recall are negative, albeit not significantly. The weight-for-age z-scores of the children in treated households are significantly lower than those of the children in the control households (but not for all estimators). Further, results also indicate that children in the treated households have significantly higher prevalence of wasting, stunting, and severe stunting than children in the households from the control group. These impacts are qualified by the fact that WSRMP has mostly targeted the poorest villages with less inherent capacity for growth than their neighbours; and that its interventions have an emphasis on social empowerment and sustainability, and that it has also impacted villages of the control group. Overall, especially in relation to the institutional development of WSRMP villages, the programmes' impacts have been significant.

### **G. Other**

75. **Recommendations.** A joint set of recommendations is presented below.

Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
1. <b>Sustainability Service Providers:</b> In order to ensure the minimum extension and monitoring support of SFU, MET and MDET, it is strongly recommended that the relevant State and Locality Authorities include such services in their annual budget and plans.	MoA/MoAR at Locality and State level	Recurring
2. <b>Knowledge Products (KP) and Experience Sharing:</b> Provide first priority to finalize Studies, Surveys and Knowledge Products planned/initiated. Hire a quality consultant to develop short and concise synthesis document on WSRMP experiences in co-management and its prospects and constraints for sharing with other programmes.	WSRMP, PIAs, ICO, CCU	Immediate
3. <b>Relationship with LMRP:</b> It is recommended to organize discussion sessions between WSRMP and LMRP staff to share knowledge about those WSRMP interventions that are also relevant to LMRP; Organize exposure visit for LMRP staff to witness these interventions; Invite WSRMP inputs in the LMRP village selection process regarding NK and WK to maximize overlap between these programme communities wherever possible; Where appropriate ensure continuation of WSRMP interventions which are not yet fully sustainable (co-mng of SRs, SFUs, among others); Organize tailored meetings to share experiences of WSRMP in co-management of stock route with LMRP.	ICO, CCU, FMoAR, WSRMP	Immediate
4. <b>State Microfinance Units:</b> Guide the full establishment of the State MFUs by (i) assisting the development of a reporting system that supports a VSCGs geographical spread and performance database, (ii) helping in coordinating and linking state MFIs' to the VSCGs database, (iii) supporting dialogue between MFIs and other stakeholders to coordinate their actions, promote various programmes and prevent over-indebtedness.	RF manager, CCU	31 December 2016
5. <b>ABUSMI Steering Committee:</b> Follow-up to organize Regional and National steering committee meetings and request ABSUMI to (a) review its position on lending beyond the sixth cycle especially considering the high rate of inflation; (b) to increase the number of credit officers in Um Ruwaba so that services to the existing clients is maintained.	RF Manager, CCU in coordination with ABSUMI regional mng and Nat. Coordinator	31 October 2016
6. <b>VSCG Associations:</b> Develop 2-3 model associations till completion with bank account, formal registration and investment in a common project. Sensitize financial institutions to the opportunity of investing in community based projects through the associations.	RF manager, CCU	31 December 2016
7. <b>NR related legalization and institutionalization:</b> Undertake quick actions to legalize and institutionalize CRCs, stock routes co-management, and conflict resolution mechanism.	PIAs, METs, NR Consultant, PCU/SCU/Focal Points	Continuous
8. <b>ICDCs:</b> Avail capacity development to ICDCs focusing on organizational management and resource mobilization. Consider developing 2-3 ICDCs as fully active models expanding the programme interventions to the wider community and organized exposure visits to these for others to follow. Promote and link the ICDCs to other developmental programmes with community development mandates.	METs, MDETs, PIAs, PCU/SCU/Focal Points	Continuous
9. <b>NR Experience sharing:</b> Organize inter-state workshop to focus popular and official attention on headline issues around natural resource management such as encroachment on range lands, law enforcement issues, using the experience of the programme and the results of the NRM data analysis.	PIAs, PCU/SCU/Focal Points, ICO	Continuous
10. <b>Policy restriction:</b> Negotiate with the State MoA a policy restricting the use of tractors with WLD and other ploughs for land cultivation in fragile soils and natural range areas and focus on appropriate implements (chisel and animal drawn implement); and enforcement of relevant laws, as well as development of land use map to clearly indicate the restricted areas and institutionalization by registration under the Range and Pasture Department.		
11. <b>Scaling-up:</b> As part of the on-going preparations for the		



Agreed action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
programme completion review, it is recommended to study the horizontal – and vertical scaling-up of WSRMP's promoted practices and approaches.		
12. Meet GoS contribution for remaining programme life	PPC/MoFEP	Immediately / continuous
13. Prepare recovery plan of the Grant authorised allocation and share it with CFS	FC/PPC	Immediately
14. Revive last SM recommendation to develop and communicate a checklist on supporting documents required for different payment and follow up at PCU/SCU/Focal Points level enhancement of documentation completeness	FC/Accountants	31 August 2016 and continued
15. Adopt an advance account and upgrade the accounting system to facilitate that	FC	31 August 2016
16. Modify/update fixed assets register to include information such as date of acquisition, cost of assets, etc. and update the register each time a new item is acquired.	PPC/Admin/Procurement Officer	31 August 2016 and continued
17. Financial Management staff will periodically visit the field	FC/Accountant	On-going
18. Programme will follow regularly on the VAT and customs exemption made by MOFEP	FC/PPC	On-going

## H. Conclusion

76. The consolidation, sustainability and upscaling oriented activities planned for the additional financing period have taken momentum, are on track and in particular the new approach to co-management of SRs and re-gained interest in the Agro-Forestry with Gum Arabic and mixed cropping form strong pillars for peaceful co-existence and resilience to climate change.

77. A serious threat is the current wave of land appropriation and indiscriminate use of tractor cultivation on fragile soil and grazing areas. Albeit the high awareness of all actors involved in WSRMP, it requests for strong lobbying and consensus building for sustainable use of land.

78. The Mission has agreed on key issues and recommended actions agreed by all parties:

- (a) Arrive at a setting whereby the new IFAD Livestock Marketing and Resilience Programme opens up to learning from WSRMP, built upon its achievements and continues with those interventions which need further attention; namely co-management of SRs and State Rural Finance Units;
- (b) The suspension of works of the Elsimih – Elsamasi Road prevents WSRMP to achieve its planned development objectives. The Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning should (i) settle all arrears with OFID; (ii) seek extension of the loan agreement so as to be able to use the unused balance of the OFID loan; and (iii) cover the cost of the road contract in excess of the OFID loan. Considering that only six months are left, quick action is needed;
- (c) The many good practices developed by WSRMP, specifically in the field of natural resources and community development, together with knowledge products already produced, deserve to be professionally documented so that these can be promoted at large.

79. In the wrap up meeting with WSRMP project staff and its partners, the Directors General of Green departments from the three States expressed full commitment of their States to the co-management approach and to sustain the established extension teams by including their services in the States' annual budgets and plans. If honoured, this will be an important input for sustainability.

80. The under-secretary of the Federal Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning proposed during the wrap-up at Federal level to discuss these complex problems regarding governance of natural resources with the Federal Ministry of Agriculture Forestry, Governors and State MoA of the

three States. In addition, commitments were made to settle the outstanding arrears to OFID as soon as possible.

## Appendix 1: Summary of project status and ratings

Basic Facts								
Country	Sudan			Project ID	1277	Loan/DSF Grant No.	655	
Project	Butana Integrated Rural Development Project			Top-up Loan/DSF Grant				
Date of Update	5/8/2016							
Supervising Inst.	IFAD/IFAD							
No. of Supervisions	9	No. of Implementation Support/Follow-up missions	10					
Last Supervision	13/8/2015	Last Implementation Support/Follow-up mission	April 2016					
					USD million	Disb. rate %		
Approval	2-Dec-2004			Total financing	53.40	91.4		
Agreement	14-Feb-2005	Effectiveness lag	12.6	IFAD Total	28.65			
Entry into force	07-Jul-2008	PAR value		IFAD loan	25.46	99.7		
First disbursement	Dec.2008			DSF grant				
MTR	26-Sep-2012	Last amendment		IFAD grant	3.19	79.0		
Original completion		Last audit	22-Jun-2014	Domestic Total	16.15			
Current completion	31-Dec-2016			Government (*)	13.99	58.0		
Original closing	31-Dec-2015							
Current closing	30-Jun-2017			Beneficiaries	1.63	9.4		
				Domes. Fin Institutions	0.53	1,281.0		
No. of extensions	0			External Co-financing Total	8.6	25.3		
				OFID	8.6	25.3		

### Project Performance Ratings

B.1 Fiduciary Aspects		Last	Current	B.2 Project implementation progress		Last	Current
1. Quality of financial management		4	4	1. Quality of project management		4	5
2. Acceptable disbursement rate		4	4	2. Performance of M&E		5	5
3. Counterpart funds		4	3	3. Coherence between AWPB & implementation		3	5
4. Compliance with financing covenants		5	4	4. Gender focus		5	5
5. Compliance with procurement		3	4	5. Poverty focus		5	5
6. Quality and timeliness of audits		5	4	6. Effectiveness of targeting approach		5	5
				7. Innovation and learning		4	5
				8. Climate and environment focus		5	5
B.3 Outputs and outcomes		Last	Current	B.4 Sustainability		Last	Current
1. Natural Resource Management		4	5	1. Institution building (organizations, etc.)		5	5
2. Rural Financial Services and Marketing		5	4	2. Empowerment		5	5
3. Community Development and Extension		4	5	3. Quality of beneficiary participation		6	5
4. Rural Feeder Roads		2	2	4. Responsiveness of service providers		5	5
5. Institutional Support		4	5	5. Exit strategy (readiness and quality)		5	5
				6. Potential for scaling up and replication		5	5

### B.5 Justification of ratings

Regarding **B1, 3.) Counterpart funds**, the rating decreased with 1 point as the GoS contribution is currently showing a deficit of SDG 706,682 only; and as this affects the **4.) Compliance with financing covenants** which has henceforth been down rated with 1 point; but **5.) Compliance with procurement** increased with 1 point as considerable improvements were made (dedicated in up-dating, filling system, keeping contract registrar, etc.). With regard to all items under **B2. 'Project Implementation Progress'**, these are back to or remained standing at rate 5, as the teams have regained momentum, all data and reports shared and presentations presented were up-to-date and of robust quality; item **3.) Coherence between AWPB & Implementation** went up with 2 points (from 3-5) as planning and implementation are strictly monitored while adjustments made in time, and physical implementation is excellent; item **1.) Quality of Project Management** and **item 7.) Innovation and Learning** both gained 1 point. All teams (PCU/SCU/Focal Points) are disciplined, able to reflect, and work on all the challenges and constraints identified, while the current approach regarding co-mng. of SRs is innovative in the context of Greater Kordofan. **B3.'Output and outcomes'**, the upward rating (one point regarding **item 1.) Natural Resources Management, item 3.) Community Development and Extension, item 5.) Institutional Development**) is due to the fact that the AF approach of consolidation, sustainability and scaling-up is understood, followed and where relevant adjustments

are made. Overall, achievement of the physical targets set for NR component for period Jan 2015 – June 2016 stands at 93%, Rural Finance at 79%, Community Development at 92%, and it is expected that all these three components shall reach 100% before the end of the year, including Institutional Development where limited number of activities remain pending. Concerning **item 4.) Rural Feeder Roads**, no developments were observed (outstanding arrears of MFEP towards OFID keep increasing) and the rating (2) remains the same.

Overall Assessment and Risk Profile		Last	Current
C.1	Physical/financial assets	5	5
C.2	Food security	5	5
C.3	Quality of natural asset improvement and climate resilience	4	5
C.4	Overall <b>implementation progress</b> (Sections B1 and B2)	4	5

#### Rationale for implementation progress rating

In terms of impact, they are impressive at community level as manifested by improved productivity (crops, livestock, fish, forest, range), access to drinking water implying saving time and costs, enough reserves to prevent hunger gap, improved houses and more household equipment (furniture, utensils, gas stove, etc.), female leadership common and ability of men and women to stand up, be counted and speak out for their rights developing. A number of Good Practices (Soil and Water conservation, Agro-forestry based on Gum Arabic, VSCGs) keep spreading and horizontal and vertical up-scaling visible but deserves to be assessed as part of Project Completion.

C.5	Likelihood of achieving the development objectives (section B3 and B4)	5	5
-----	--	---	---

#### Rationale for development objectives rating

Since South Sudan's separation, conflict has broken out between the Government and the Sudan People's Liberation Movement-North (SPLM-N) in Southern Kordofan and Blue Nile states, which has resulted in large number of internally displaced persons (IDP) and their livestock. These insecure situations lead to diverted movement of animals. In addition, the encroachment of agriculture on rangelands facilitated by the progressive and massive use of tractors under conditions of increasing number of animals and lack of law enforcement has been recognized and described, by all stakeholders, including senior authorities in Green Departments, as a serious problem and constitutes a major threat to peace and stability, particularly in NK State. In this regard, the measures taken and Good Practices developed by WSRMP in the field of NRs are much appreciated but WSRMP operates in relative small geographical areas.

C.6	<b>Risks</b> (top-up phase: consolidation, sustainability and scaling up)		
<b>Fiduciary aspects</b>	The on-going non-settlement of arrears of GoS to OFID		
<b>Outputs and outcomes (pending risk)</b>	On construction of <b>rural feeder roads</b> , OFID has suspended the loan due to unpaid arrears, and works have been stopped at only 38% of implementation		
<b>Sustainability</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- At risk are the Extension Teams (METs, MDETs), the recently installed RFUs at State level and the new approach to co-management of SRs</li> <li>- Poor law enforcement regarding governance of NR</li> <li>- Insecurity which is increasing but new Peace Agreement (SK) to be signed on 11<sup>th</sup> of August.</li> </ul>		

#### Proposed Follow-up

Issue / Problem	Recommended Action	Timing	Status
<b>Road Construction</b>	- Follow-up the commitment made by under-secretary of the Federal Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning namely to settle all arrears to OFAD as soon as possible;	Immediately	
<b>Extension Teams (METs, MDETs)</b>	- Follow-up the commitment made by the Directors General of Green Departments from the three States namely including Extension Services (METs, MDETs) in the States' annual budgets and plans;	Immediately	
<b>Governance NRs</b>	- Follow-up the commitment made by under-secretary of the Federal Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning namely to discuss these complex problems regarding governance of Natural Resources with the Federal Ministry of Agriculture Forestry, Governors and State MoA of the three States;	Immediately	
<b>Co-management of SRs; sustainability RFUs</b>	- Facilitate the recommendation (4) related to LMRP in particular ensuring continuation of WSRMP interventions which are not yet fully sustainable (co-mng of SRs, SFUs, among others);	Immediately	

## Appendix 2A: Updated Logical Framework: Progress against objectives, outcomes and outputs, WSRMP, as per 30 June 2015

Narrative	Indicators	Status
<b>Goal:</b>		
To improve the equity, efficiency and stability of the economy of the Kordofan States through rationalising the use of natural resources, enabling access of poor households to productive services and fair terms of trade.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The revenues from agriculture sector in the Kordofan States are increased.</li> <li>• Number of households (disaggregated by gender) whose index assets increased.</li> <li>• Number of children suffering from malnutrition is decreased by at least 35%.</li> <li>• The number of the poorest households is reduced by at least 30%.</li> </ul>	Impact assessment was carried out with IFAD support during Dec 2014 – Jan 2015 to assess to what extent the programme has achieved its goal. The result of this assessment will be disseminated when the final report is finalized in Sept 2015.
<b>Objectives:</b>		
1. <i>Equitable, efficient and environmentally sustainable natural resources governance instrumentalities established and enabled.</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• NRM strategy passed into law</li> <li>• State roles, responsibilities and resources vis a vis NRM are clearly defined.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A NRM strategy for Kordofan Region was produced by WSRMP in the context of improving the natural resource governance system in the region. The NRM strategy was shared with stakeholders and the document was produced in a well printed booklet and distributed to all related partners in the region and at Federal level. Natural resources related legislations in the two states of North and South Kordofan were revised and harmonized. The two state governments showed strong commitment for the adoption of the strategy in their respective state level planning. The re-establishment of West Kordofan State is now necessitated that these legislations and by-laws that govern the use of the NRM be revisited and again to reach an agreed upon actions and regulation that assist the three states to harmonized these by-laws.</li> <li>• In West Kordofan state, advocacy efforts are needed to so as to accelerate the adoption and streamline of the NRM strategy into the newly formed state systems and legislations.</li> </ul>
2. <i>Strengthen capacity at state and inter-state level to manage natural resources in way that is sustainable, and socially and gender equitable</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Inter- state technical committee acting, planning and monitoring NRM activities.</li> <li>• Co-management of stock routes approved and implemented at the two the states.</li> <li>• Number of reported Intra and inter-state conflicts pertaining to resources use is reduced by at least 35%</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The inter-state technical committee since its formation in year 2009, is holding periodical meeting every three months (4 meetings annually) and giving high priority to NRM monitoring.</li> <li>• The co-management mechanism of the stock route was approved in the three states (WK, NK and SK) and it was planned that a consultative workshop will be held during Aug 2015 to setup a well-defined and agreed upon mechanism to co-managed the two stock route that are currently support by the WSRMP during the extension period using</li> </ul>

Narrative	Indicators	Status
		<p>the additional finance as a very important step to ensure the NR are management in a sustainable and socially and gender equitable. Yet more efforts are needed to ensure that the recently established sock route management mechanism is properly functioning.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>According to the periodical reports of the conflict resolution centres in the reported conflicts were decreased by 32%. The project is planning to conduct a thematic study at intra and inter-state levels to provide more information on the change in reported conflicts pertaining to resources use.</li> </ul>
<p><i>3. Biodiversity in the Programme Area was Increased</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Vegetative cover in the rangelands increased by at least 30%.</li> <li>Wild life count in the protected reserve increased by at least 30%.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Great efforts were made in reseeded of rangelands, especially in the rainy season grazing areas. However, the success seems to be limited, even though there were clear signs of improvement in plant diversity. The fact that such an activity relies much more on the community mobilization dimension and need to solicit the support of the two different land users (the incoming pastoralists and the resident communities) in the same time rather than on the soundness of the technical approaches followed. Due to the limited success achieved in these activities, WSRMP has shifted to support the establishment and adoption of Hema ranges which are well accepted by the communities and being widely used especially among the settled communities.</li> </ul>
<p><i>4- To enable the development of effective market chains for produce added value that is accessible to men and women.</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The quantity of food and cash crop and livestock products marketed increased by at least 30%.</li> <li>Improve the gross margin of crop and livestock by at least 30%.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>There is also a very limited success to keep the rehabilitated crop and livestock market functional. From the 4 already rehabilitated markets only one is functional up to date. In spite of that, and according to the annual assessment surveys carried by the project, records of in-flow food and cash crops showed slight fluctuating increase. Investigations attributed this fluctuated increase to the change rain water from one year to another.</li> <li>Also the findings of the annual assessment surveys showed an increase in the gross margin of the main crops (sorghum and groundnut) by 35% and this is mainly attributed to the adoption of the improved seeds and improved technologies disseminated by LETs and LENS.</li> </ul>
<p><i>5- Provide villages with better capacity to plan, execute, monitor and</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Community Capability Index (CCI) is improved by at least 35%.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>According to the recently conducted survey the CCI in NK is found to be improved by 48%.</li> </ul>

Narrative	Indicators	Status
<i>evaluate community sub-projects, through training and technical support</i>		
6- Enhance the productivity and incomes of individual farmers/pastoralists, villagers and groups from crop, livestock, range products and non-farm enterprises through targeted, technical, logistical and commercial extension support measures.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Share of off-farm income in total household income increased by at least by 25%</li> <li>• Farm income in total household income increased by at least 25%.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The measurement of these indicators will be reported as part of the impact assessment findings which will be finalized by Sept 2015.</li> </ul>
7- Rural access roads networks expanded and improved	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Decrease in merchandise transportation costs by at least 30%</li> <li>• Decrease repair and maintenance costs of vehicles by at least 30%</li> <li>• The total value of total charges collected increased by 20%</li> <li>• The total value of crop and livestock taxes collected increased 10%.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• These indicators cannot be measured now because the road construction is not completed yet.</li> </ul>
8. Cost effective institutions structure at the locality level capable of providing timely assistance to the communities during the development process.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Multidisciplinary decentralised extension agents fully deployed.</li> <li>• Women participation in multidisciplinary extension teams is at least 30%.</li> <li>• Participatory community-based extension networks are fully operational.</li> <li>• Recurrent cost of the locality administrations 100% covered from state budget starting from 2011</li> <li>• Ratio of agric. &amp; NRM development expenditure in actual locality expenditure, increased by at least 25%.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 24 MDETs were formed and deployed at the localities in the three states of Kordofan (NK, WK and SK). A new Mobile Extension team (MET) is planned to be formed in WK state. The members of these extension teams were adequately trained and equipped with logistical and office facilities.</li> <li>• These teams consist of 141 extension officers of whom 55 are females (39%).</li> <li>• About 1739 LEN members were selected by their respective communities and trained as para-vets (181), crop protection agents (140), Midwives (196), literacy trainers (212), VSCGs agent (176), Contact farmers and contact pastoralists (834). However not all of them are currently functioning as many have abandoned their jobs and migrated outside their communities. A recent assessment was carried to identify the gaps in LENS and it is important that utmost effort is made to select and train new ones to fill the identified gaps. It is also important that to seek means of incentives that will aid LEN members to earn a living from their work within their communities.</li> <li>• The recurrent cost is not yet covered fully by localities administrations but partially they pay the salaries and part of the allowances. Few localities are now providing the</li> </ul>

<b>Narrative</b>	<b>Indicators</b>	<b>Status</b>
		extension team with fuel and vehicle maintenance budget (Like El Nuhud in WN and Bara in NK).



## Appendix 2B - Revised Logical Framework – revision not yet complete<sup>37</sup>

Narrative Summary	Key Performance Indicators <sup>38</sup>	Means of Verification	Assumptions
<b>Goal:</b>			
To improve the equity, efficiency and stability of the economy of the Kordofan States through rationalising the use of natural resources, enabling access of poor households to productive services and fair terms of trade.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The revenues from agriculture sector in the Kordofan States are increased.</li> <li>Number of households (disaggregated by gender) whose index assets increased.</li> <li>Number of children suffering from malnutrition is decreased by at least 35%</li> <li>The number of the poorest households is reduced by at least 30%</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>State and locality budgets</li> <li>Socio-economic surveys, at completion, and 3 years after completion of programme</li> <li>Weight/age (UNICEF Reports)</li> </ul>	Political and macroeconomic stability
<b>Objectives:</b>			
1. Equitable, efficient and environmentally sustainable natural resources governance instrumentalities established and enabled.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>NRM strategy passed into law</li> <li>State roles, responsibilities and resources vis a vis NRM are clearly defined.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>MIS (community database, village database, household survey, thematic studies, GIS and mini-surveys)</li> <li>Baseline survey</li> <li>Appraisal report</li> <li>Secondary data/sources</li> <li>Socio-economic surveys</li> </ul>	Commitment of Federal Government to devolution of natural resources management with adequate responsibilities,
2. <i>Strengthen capacity at state and inter-state level to manage natural resources in way that is sustainable, and socially and gender equitable</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Inter- state technical committee acting, planning and monitoring NRM activities.</li> <li>Co-management of stock routes approved and implemented at the three the states.</li> <li>Number of reported Intra and inter-state conflicts pertaining to resources use is reduced by at least 35%</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Mini-surveys.</li> <li>Thematic surveys/studies.</li> <li>CRCs Reports.</li> <li>Secondary data/sources.</li> </ul>	Contingency planning and environmental early warning systems streamlined into policy-making.  Roles and mandates of States institutions are revised.
3. <i>Biodiversity in the Programme Area was Increased</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Vegetative cover in the rangelands increased by at least 30%.</li> <li>Wild life count in the protected reserve increased by at least 30%.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Thematic surveys/studies</li> <li>Appraisal report</li> <li>Secondary data/sources</li> <li>GIS Database.</li> <li>Environmental assessment survey</li> </ul>	Stability of the average annual rain fall in the programme area.
4- <i>To enable the development of effective market chains for produce added value that is accessible to men and women.</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The quantity of food and cash crop and livestock products marketed increased by at least 30%.</li> <li>Improve the gross margin of crop and livestock by at least 30%.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Baseline</li> <li>MOA reports</li> <li>Household assessment</li> <li>Localities records</li> <li>Thematic Studies</li> <li>Farmers' records</li> <li>Agriculture Research Institute</li> <li>MOF</li> </ul>	
5- <i>Provide villages with better capacity to plan, execute, monitor and evaluate community sub-projects, through training and technical</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Community Capability Index (CCI) is improved by at least 35%.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>CCI assessment</li> <li>Baseline</li> </ul>	

37 Not all comments and request for clarification could be addressed during the mission as certain issues need to be discussed with the different teams. Agreed that follow-up mission shall look into it, while this would also allow anticipating on the AM and Supervision Reports including annexes.

38 S=Scaling up; C=Consolidation; SU=Sustainability.

Narrative Summary	Key Performance Indicators	Means of Verification	Assumptions
<i>support</i>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Secondary data/sources</li> </ul>	
<p>6- Enhance the productivity and incomes of individual farmers/pastoralists, villagers and groups from crop, livestock, range products and non-farm enterprises through targeted, technical, logistical and commercial extension support measures.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Share of off-farm income in total household income increased by at least by 25%</li> <li>• Farm income in total household income increased by at least 25%.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• MIS database</li> <li>• MOA reports</li> <li>• Thematic Studies</li> <li>• Rapid assessment surveys</li> <li>• Households survey</li> <li>• Farmers' records</li> <li>• Agriculture Research Institute</li> </ul>	<p>Commitment among states governments, pastoralists and settled farming communities to the vision of agricultural development based on crop production and extensive animal production.</p>
<p>7. Cost effective institutions structure at the locality level capable of providing timely assistance to the communities during the development process.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Multidisciplinary decentralised extension agents fully deployed.</li> <li>• Women participation in multidisciplinary extension teams is at least 30%.</li> <li>• Participatory community -based extension networks are fully operational.</li> <li>• Ratio of agric. &amp; NRM development expenditure in actual locality expenditure, increased by at least 25%.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Baseline</li> <li>• MOA reports</li> <li>• Household assessment</li> <li>• Localities records</li> <li>• State budget</li> <li>• Thematic study for effectiveness of the established extension system</li> </ul>	
<b>Outputs for Additional Financing</b>			
<b>Natural Resources Management (NRM)</b>			
<p>1.) NRM Infrastructure established, equitable, efficient and environmentally sustainable natural resources governance instrumentalities established and enabled</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 500 km of livestock routes (300 km as new demarcation to reach the water points and 200 as re-demarcation of removed poles) surveyed and demarcated in the western and eastern stock routes. 'C'</li> <li>• 2,500 fed of agricultural land reclaimed for crop production 'SU'</li> <li>• 1,000 fed of rangeland reclaimed using water harvesting techniques 'SU'</li> <li>• 3 water yards constructed. 'C'</li> <li>• 2 water yards rehabilitated. 'C'</li> <li>• 15 water ponds improved 'S'</li> <li>• 3 hafirs rehabilitated. 'C'</li> <li>• 14 mobile crush pens constructed. 'C'</li> <li>• 2 sites of sand dune fixation implemented 'S'</li> <li>• 14 community/household nurseries established. 'C'</li> <li>• 2 systems of sand dune supplementary irrigation in place by end of year 2015 'C'</li> <li>• 2,100 fed of Agro-forestry area planted. 'SU'</li> <li>• 3,000 km of fire-lines (fire breaks) opened. 'SU'</li> <li>• 4 conflict resolution centres established</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• M&amp;E system.</li> <li>• MOA records (concerned Dep.)</li> <li>• MOF records</li> <li>• Record of service providers.</li> <li>• Progress reports</li> <li>• TA reports</li> </ul>	
<p>2.) Institutional Capacity Building enhanced and strengthened at state and interstate level to manage natural resources in way that is sustainable, and socially and gender equitable</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 10 staff members from the PIAs and MDETs 50% are females trained in livestock.</li> <li>• 12 staff members from the PIAs and MDETs 50% of them females trained in soil and water conservation.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• MIS/Progress reports.</li> <li>• MOA records (concerned Dep.)</li> <li>• MOF records.</li> <li>• GIS database.</li> </ul>	

Narrative Summary	Key Performance Indicators	Means of Verification	Assumptions
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 7 staff members of the PIAs and MDETs and 50% of them are females trained in fire management.</li> <li>• Analytical (longitudinal) Studies (X) on experience made in Animal Production (sheep fattening, cross breeding, poultry, strategic feeding for goats, etc.)</li> <li>• Analytical (longitudinal) Studies (X) on experience made in NR (water supply, fire lines, etc.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Beneficiary database.</li> <li>• TA reports</li> <li>• Draft inputs for Knowledge Products</li> </ul>	
<b>Marketing and Financial Services:</b>			
<b>a. Rural financial services:</b>			
<b>1-Scaling up ABSUMI activities and increase microfinance coverage at rural community's level</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• ABSUMI national unit established and developed. 'C', 'S'</li> <li>• Linkage of VSCGs with ABSUMI increased by at least 50%</li> <li>• Average loan size increased. 'C', 'SU'</li> <li>• Number of borrowers increased (by person, gender, settled/nomadic, poverty statues). 'C', 'SU'</li> <li>• Portfolio at risk maintained to 0% 'S'</li> <li>• ABSUMI staff trained (by gender). 'C', 'S'</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• ABSUMI database</li> <li>• ABSUMI MIS</li> <li>• ABSUMI progress reports</li> </ul>	
<b>2- Village savings and credit groups established</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 300 village saving &amp; credit groups established and developed. 'SU'</li> <li>• 3 microfinance units within State extension department established. 'C', 'S'</li> <li>• 30 VSCGs Associations established and developed. 'SU'</li> <li>• 60 community saving and credit agent trained (including males and females). 'C'</li> <li>• 15 good practices and success stories are documented. 'C', 'SU'</li> <li>• Knowledge products are disseminated and shared. 'S'</li> <li>• 7 members of ABSUMI national unit and locality units trained. 'C'</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• MIS/Progress reports.</li> <li>• MOA records (concerned Dep.)</li> <li>• Record of service providers.</li> <li>• Beneficiary database.</li> </ul>	
<b>b- Marketing</b>			
<b>Marketing infrastructure established</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The 4 already established livestock and crop markets are operational and functional. 'C', 'S'</li> <li>• Construction of one livestock market at Elmazroub. 'C'</li> <li>• Management staff at livestock and crop markets trained. 'C', 'S'</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• MIS/Progress reports.</li> <li>• Markets database.</li> </ul>	
<b>Community Development and Extension Component</b>			
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 6 Integrated Development centres established. 'C'</li> <li>• 300 LEN agents upgraded and linked with related institutions. 'S'</li> <li>• 70 members of water users associations trained. 'S'</li> <li>• 49 CD committees trained. 'S'</li> <li>• 85 members of conflict resolution centres trained. 'S'</li> <li>• 150 of rural youth trained in small business. 'C'</li> <li>• 225 women leaders in 45 women groups trained. 'S'</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• MIS/Progress reports.</li> <li>• MOA records (concerned Dep.).</li> <li>• TA reports</li> </ul>	

Narrative Summary	Key Performance Indicators	Means of Verification	Assumptions
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 15 literacy classes established. 'SU'</li> <li>• 15 small project implemented under the committee initiative funds. 'SU'</li> <li>• 30 revolving funds established and developed. 'C'</li> <li>• 15 MDETs, 4 METs Locality Extension teams and 3 Mobile extension teams strengthened. 'S'</li> <li>• 54 Extension officers/trainers trained 'S'</li> </ul>		

Where does the following come: - advisable to integrate these?

- Development Knowledge products & Capacities developed in this regard,
- All investments (meetings, negotiations and lobbying) regarding regulations and enforcement NRM, STs, etc.
- Registration issues of ICDCs, CRCs, HIMAs, SRs, etc.
- Leaving communities behind with an up-to-date CEAP
- Hand holding (exit) communities

### Appendix 3: Summary of key actions to be taken within agreed timeframes

	Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed date	Status of implementation as per June 2016
1	Update the AWPB so that all activities planned for Top-up Phase clearly contribute to consolidation and sustainability, whereby not taking any risk regarding planned infrastructure, while 'putting NRM strategy into law', and 'getting inter-State Stock Route Management functioning' deserve first priority.	State Ministry of Agriculture/Animal Resources in the three states, PCU	Planned Aug.'15 Workshop provides the start;	<b>Done.</b> Now (August, 2016, post SM) A second round of revision is taking place to reallocate the budget to fill some gaps in the water supply activities and to make sure all funds will be disbursed before the completion date.
2	Ensuring that funds flow shall be efficient so as to ensure successful consolidation within the time limits set	FMoFEP, CCU, PCU, IFAD	On-going	<b>On-going.</b> Funds flow is very smooth and sufficient from IFAD but not sufficient from the Gov side. The approved amount of counterpart funds for this year is very small (500,000 SDG) if compared with what we proposed and submitted to MoFEP (4 million SDG) during the budget discussion session in Nov 2015. Since January and till now the project receives 40,000 SDG monthly which represents 26% of the actual expenditure. The CCU started to claim for the approved amount and up to date the project received 43% of that. During debriefing (SM, 2016) At Federal level, the MOFEP under-secretary made the commitment to settle the pending payment soonest.
3	Regarding the workshop planned for August, 2015, (arriving at inter-state management of the SR), it is advisable to invite the resource person currently assisting other IFAD projects <sup>39</sup> on NRM policy issues.	PCU, IFAD CO	Immediately	<b>Done.</b> The workshop was held in 17 Sept 2015 and attended by the stakeholders concerned. The two policy officers of SUSTAIN and BIRDP were invited but only Dr. Musa of SUSTAIN has come.
4	Financing constraints regarding the O&M costs of the CRCs and arriving at registered ownership deserves priority attention during top-up phase. It is advisable to hire a consultant who is experienced in handling these problems.	PCU, Native, Locality and State Admin, CIPs	Immediately	<b>Done.</b> The draft report was submitted and a consultative workshop was held to discuss the finding. The final draft Arabic version of the report was received during the SM mission time and shared with the mission members for feedback and comments. SM (Omer Egemi) provided feedback. A comprehensive summary in English was also submitted to SM
5	Intensive negotiations with the State MoA are needed to enforce the 'Range Organization and Development of Fodder Resources Law' so as to ensure that strict use of tractor's ploughing in recommended areas for cultivation is enforced and not over the whole State namely preventing their use for land cultivation in degraded farm land and natural range areas.	PCU, SCUs/Focal Point, CIPs, MDETs	Immediately	<b>Done; on-going.</b> The Range and pasture department at federal level has organized a tailored workshop which was held in Sept 2015 and discussed with the stakeholder the arrangements and efforts needed for enforcing the law. Also, receiving on-going attention as part of co-mng of SRs activities.
6	It is recommended to hire a professional consultant to assess the experience in the development of Elsimih Agricultural Scheme by evaluating the institutional and	PCU, SCU-NK	Mid 2016	<b>Ongoing.</b> ToRs were prepared, reviewed during current follow-up mission and advice for adjustments made. A consultant was nominated to carry out the assessment.

39 SUSTAIN, BIRDP

	Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed date	Status of implementation as per June 2016
	management constraints and resisting forces that led to the failure of the pilot despite the successful research results.			The deadline was set to accomplish the assignment. The preparation and finalization of the ToRs took more time than expected because the Water consultant was busy. Also we spent relatively long time to fine tune the ToRs which was prepared by the consultant to be implemented by a team of consultants while our idea is to recruitment one consultant to look at the managerial and institutional aspects and not the technical aspect related to irrigation system. But now we catch up and the Consultant is about to finish his tasks.
7	Withholding 1.5% of income generated through fees at I&V source for O&M	FMoLFR, PCU	Before end of 2015	<b>On-going; no longer valid.</b> Negotiations with the FMoLS and FMoFNP have commenced. No promising outcome to be expected as FMoLRF wants to keep the management of all I&V centres uniform and no acceptance to be expected. By now, this recommendation seems to be not implementable taking into account the electronic fees collecting system recently adopted by GoS. In addition to that, the head of the department of quarantines at the federal level is resisting the idea which is contradicted with the presidential decree that forbid keeping any money of the revenue aside (they call it Tagneeb).
8	Systematically analysing of all experiences made in animal production and – animal health – positives as well as less positive -, documenting and disseminating these.	Relevant PIAs, MDEts, and METs and LEN agent. SCUs/PCU/Focal Point	Before mid-2016.	<b>On-going.</b> This activity was started by the beginning of July and will be concluded by end of November before the completion mission. This activity is intended to complement the impact evaluation and it is part of the completion process. The findings of this process will be monitored and reviewed periodically to ensue good indicators are set and a good quality of information and findings are obtained.
9	Ensuring smooth transition of achievements made, sharing of lessons learnt and of on-going activities and problems (NRs, SRs, Vet Services, Animal Production) to LMRP	WSRMP, SCU, State Focal Points, Relevant PIAs, MDEts, MET	Before end of 2015	WSRMP through the PIAs started to document all the activities and lesson learnt to be handed over to the LMRP. The LRMP State units are not yet in place and not yet ready to start the handing over process. A consolidation process is taking place to produce a package of those activities that will be shared with the LMRP.
10	Development and implementation of environment plan regarding I&V centre at El Khowai whereby <sup>40</sup> aiming at management by communities, pronounced involvement of sheep traders and small fodder sellers.	MDET El Khowai locality, Relevant State PIA, SCU WK and WSRMP	Before mid-2016	<b>On-going.</b> The ToRs was prepared; a consultant was nominated to develop the plan. The work has not started yet and there is a delay on that. Right now we managed to find a competent NRM consultant

40 See for details AM, Sept. 2013.

	Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed date	Status of implementation as per June 2016
				who will start by end of Aug.
11	Provide TA for a comprehensive study analysis of lake water quality and constituents, and health and environmental hazards in relation to fish habitats and requirements in all three States.	WSRMP, SCU, FMoLFR	Jan 2016	<b>On-going.</b> This activity was carried out by the fishery department at the federal ministry of livestock for Elsunut and the findings were disseminated. Regarding Elrahad lake, the survey was done and findings and report were expected to be submitted by mid Aug 2016.
1 2	Follow-up and expedite the establishment of the State Microfinance Units.	WSRMP	Sept'15	<b>Done.</b> Office spaces were provided in the three States, office equipment and furniture were purchased and the staff was nominated.
1 3	Enable decision on ABSUMI Lagawa unit operations based on joint visit.	WSRMP & ABSUMI	Sept'15	<b>Done.</b> Lending activities were re-launched in the most safety areas in Lagawa and the recovery process is on-going.
1 4	Ensure revival of ABSUMI steering committees and Regional Coordinator deployment.			<b>Done.</b> The first meeting of the central committee was held on 16 May 2016.
1 5	Commence disbursement of pilot loan products for small and social enterprises.	WSRMP & ABSUMI	Oct'15	<b>In progress.</b>
1 6	Register, open bank account and provide enterprise training to the associations.	WSRMP	Dec'15	<b>In progress.</b>
1 7	Conduct a critical review of non-functional and functional Markets established/rehabilitated.	WSRMP	Immediately	<b>On-going.</b> A national consultant was contracted to carry out an assessment of the market and final report is expected to be submitted by the end of July 2016. But up to now we did not receive the draft report so it is not expected the mission may say it.
1 8	Develop a tailored capacity building plan oriented to address main ICDCs, CDCs' and LENs weaknesses and strengthening their capabilities.	MDETs, METs, PIAs, SCUs/Focal Points, PCU	Immediately	<b>Done.</b>
1 9	WSRMP, MDET and communities are to support integrating the LEN agents in a referral system (linking the community agents to the technical department at locality level).	MDETs, METs, PIAs, SCUs/Focal Points, PCU	End 2015	<b>Done.</b>
2 0	Developing and implementing a tailored capacity building plan (Participatory Extension Approach, CEAP, Knowledge Management) in order to enable both MDETs and MET to play more effective roles deserves top priority.	PCU, SCUs/Focal Points	Immediately	<b>Done.</b>
2 1	WSRMP should pursue dialogue and negotiation with the Government (State, Locality) to ensure that a Special Extension Fund is established and fund sources agreed upon so as to maintain services for the communities after post WSRMP.	PCU, SCUs/Focal Points, MDETs, METs, PIAs	End 2015	<b>On-going; no longer valid.</b> The issue was discussed during the implementation workshop in the three States as part of WSRMP exit strategy. Up to date there is not a clear mechanism of how to put the SEF in place. Moreover, after the application of the electronic fees collection system in the



	Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed date	Status of implementation as per June 2016
				Sudan, the chance for establishing the SEF is to be minimal if it is not impossible.
2 2	Federal Government of Sudan settles the arrears with OFID	MoFEP	Immediately	<b>Not yet settled</b> , although 70% of the arrears were paid but still the payment of the rest of amount (9 m USD) is required by OFID in order to decide on the extension of the loan. As project management we met the two Wali of South and North Kordofan and they promised to provide lobbying and support, but nothing happened yet.
2 3	Federal and State Government will provide enough local funds to cover financial gaps and additional costs	MoFEP, State Authorities	Immediately	<b>On-going</b> . A very little money is provided (up to date the Gov paid 200,000 SDG out of one million).
24	Conduct quality analysis of experiences made across component 1, 2 and 3 whereby using longitudinal data and ensuring appropriate technical support	PCU, PIAs	Mid-2016	<b>On-going</b> .
25	Jointly with CCU, other IFAD Sudan projects and IFAD Country Office arrive at a Knowledge Management Strategy (start simple and let it evolve as capacities increase)	IFAD CO, CCU, PCU, SCU/FPs, other IFAD program/projects	End 2015	<b>Done</b> . One-day workshop was conducted on 16 March 2016 in which the KM strategy was discussed and approved.
26	Review and Up-date the WSRMPs 2012 Exit Strategy	PCU, PIAs, SCU/FPs, MDETs, METs,	End 2015	<b>Done</b> . The exit strategy will be reviewed again during the SM to facilitate project completion process.
27	Capacitate and equip staff across the three levels (State, Locality, Community) in producing Knowledge Products and organize a challenging competition to make it attractive for all	PCU, PIAs, Focal Points, MDETs, METs, LENSs, CDCs/ICDCs	Mid 2016	<b>On-going</b> . WSRMP started by sending 8 M&E and Media officer to Egypt for a short training course in the field of knowledge management. Local training courses were planned for the PIAs, MDETs, MET and communities.
2 8	It is recommended that: <b>(i)</b> timely submission of realistic and achievable AWPB based on historical trends for IFAD approval for future years, and <b>(ii)</b> A revision of the AWPB after this supervision mission.	WSRMP/FC	Immediately	<b>Done</b> .
2 9	Given that the AWPB will be revised after this supervision mission, and another AWPB is due before completion of the Programme in December 2016, the mission recommends to <b>(i)</b> increase the Authorized Allocation of the additional financing of the grant to an amount correspondent to the AWPB, and <b>(ii)</b> start recovery of the remaining authorised allocation - Loan of 237,775 EUR and the initial authorised allocation of the additional financing of the grant six months before completion date.	WSRMP/FC	Immediately	<b>Done</b> .



	<b>Agreed Action</b>	<b>Responsibility</b>	<b>Agreed date</b>	<b>Status of implementation as per June 2016</b>
3 0	It is recommended that i.) FC should develop and communicate guideline/checklist of the required supporting documents for different type of expenditures; ii) Recurrent cost such as staff salaries and allowance have been billed to the Technical Assistance category in accordance with the Cost Tables. These expenditures of recurrent nature to be charged to correct category of Recurrent Costs and project to send to IFAD reallocation request.	WSRMP/FC	Immediately	<b>Done</b>
3 1	The accounting system to be upgraded to include an account code for advances and expenditures to be recognized only when justifications are submitted and approved.	WSRMP/FC	Immediately	<b>Not yet.</b> The system has been amended to accept coding the advance, but the financial department did not yet use coding for advance payment. We set strong measures to ensure the advances clearance will be done in a proper time.
3 2	The programme should form a committee to perform physical count and tagging or fixed asset by end of 2015.	WSRMP/FC	Immediately	<b>Done.</b>
3 3	It is recommended to modify and enhance the system to prevent modification of posted historical transactions and restrict the administrator rights to the FC.	WSRMP/FC	Immediately	<b>Not yet.</b> It is the WSRMP fault in not requesting early from the consultant to do the modification. Now we request him to start immediately to accomplish the work in one week from now.
3 4	It is recommended that beneficiaries' in kind contribution to be recorded based on their actual contribution only based on best valuation.	WSRMP/FC	Immediately	<b>On-going</b>
3 5	It is recommended that GOS settles the issue of arrears with OFID and to secure an extension to the expired Financing Agreement to allow project achieve its planned development objectives.	WSRMP	Immediately	<b>Not settled yet.</b> As mentioned before, MoFEP has deposited the request to Bank of Sudan (CBS) to pay but we were informed that the bank is not putting this as a top ranked priority. This is why we are seeking the lobbying of the two Wali of Kordofan States to push up.
3 6	It is recommended that submission of WA with no delay covering the period up to end of July 2015 is cared for, and to adhere to the rule of submitting WA every 90 days or when 30% of the authorised advance is exhausted whatever occurs first.	WSRMP	Immediately	<b>Done.</b>
3 7	It is recommended that FC to follow up with MFEP and reflect the accurate contributions of GoS.	WSRMP	Immediately	<b>Done.</b> Reporting formats were developed by support from Mr. Elfadul of the Sudan ICO and are regularly filled and shared with IFAD.
3 8	Urgent need to expedite the procurement process to compensate for earlier delays, and to follow up closely	WSRMP (Mng., Procurement	Immediately	<b>Done.</b>

	<b>Agreed Action</b>	<b>Responsibility</b>	<b>Agreed date</b>	<b>Status of implementation as per June 2016</b>
	the timely implementation of these activities	Officer), CCU		
39	For the updated version of the procurement plan, the lumped items of the larger contracts (e.g. hafirs) should be spelled out in separate items.	WSRMP (Mng., Procurement Officer)	Immediately	<b>Done.</b>
40	Updates in the contract register to include the paid and remaining balance against each contract.	WSRMP (Mng., Procurement Officer)	Immediately	<b>Done.</b>
41	A dedicated filing system needs to be developed to include all procurement related documents such as annual procurement plans, copies of bidding documents, IFAD no-objections, etc.	WSRMP (Mng., Procurement Officer)	Immediately	<b>Done.</b>

## Appendix 4: Physical progress measured against AWP&B, including RIMS indicators (Period Jan – Jun 2016 and Cumulative)

Output	Unit	Programme Cumulative			AWPB Year 2016		
		Programme Target	Cumulative achievement (2006 - Jun 2016)	Achievement %	Plan	Achievement up to June 2016	Achievement %
<b>Component 1: Natural Resources Management</b>							
Participating Communities	No.	380	368	97			
Registered CDCs	No.	368	341	93			
<b>1.1 Infrastructure</b>							
Stock route demarcation	Km	4,300	4,897	113	300	445	148
Check points	No.	15	11	73			
Quarantine station construction/rehabilitation	No.	2	2	100			
Land reclamation and conservation	Fed	13,500	24,501	181	2,500	1650	66
Sand dune fixation	Fed	300	366	122			
Jebel Ed Dair Protection Point	No.	1	1	100			
Khor Abu Habil diversion/Semeih main canal	Works	1	1	100			
Water containment and spreading structures	No.	18	14	78			
Water yards	No.	13	9	69	4	1	25
Stock water earth tank (hafir) construction/renovation	M3 '000	400	477	112	30	53	177
Stock Water Dams (/construction/renovation)	Unit	1	1	100			
Forestry nurseries construction/rehabilitation	No.	6	15	250			
Community/household Nurseries	No.	45	93	206	12	6	50
Community forests	no.	40	19	48			
Production of forestry seedlings	No. '000	750	1,245	166			
Agro-forestry planting	Fed	10,000	13,160	132	1250	0	0
Fire lines	Km /year	0	0		1600		
Forestry seed collection	Ton	40	42	105			
change straw building style	Group	20	10	50			
Hay baling	Bale	50000	55785	112			
Rangeland seed collection/broadcasting	Ton	250	214	86			
<b>1.2 Institutional Capacity Building</b>							
Support Back yard poultry	Unit	40	43	108			
Vet treatment and vaccination campaign	locality	80	88	110			
Support hema range protection	Unit	22	52	236			
Support functionality of conflict resolution centers	no	6	1	17	5		
Support functionality of veterinary facilities	no	23	20	87			
External NRM trainings	person	35	38	109	15	0	0
Internal NRM training courses	courses	60	107	178	12	4	33
<b>1.3 Studies</b>							
NRM Strategy	Contract	2	2	100			
Jebel Eldair reserve plan	Plan	1	1	100			
Water bodies and fish survey	Study	4	4	100			
Lake Kailak Study	Study	1	0	0			

Output	Unit	Programme Cumulative			AWPB Year 2016		
		Programme Target	Cumulative achievement (2006 - Jun 2016)	Achievement %	Plan	Achievement up to June 2016	Achievement %
breed characterization	study	1	1	100			
<b>RIMS Output Indicators</b>							
People trained in natural resources management	Male	10,000	13,053	131	500	0	0
People trained in natural resources management	Female	10,000	12,181	122	500	0	0
Groups managing infrastructure formed/strengthened	Number	46	70	152	10	0	0
People in groups managing infrastructure formed/strengthened	Male	460	589	128	100	0	0
People in groups managing infrastructure formed/strengthened	Female	150	198	192	50	0	0
Land under irrigation schemes constructed/rehabilitated	Ha	1,680	3,359	200			
Livestock water points constructed/rehabilitated (Water yards)	Number	13	10	77	2	0	0
Rainwater harvesting system constructed/rehabilitated (hafirs)	Number	18	25	139			
Natural resources management groups formed/strengthened	Number	72	231	321	0	0	0
People in natural resources management groups formed/strengthened	Male	864	2,020	234	0	0	0
People in natural resources management groups formed/strengthened	Female	864	1,197	139	0	0	0
Land under improved management practices	Ha	5,000	10,595	212			
<b>RIMS Outcome Indicators</b>							
<b>Likelihood: of sustainability of groups managing infrastructure formed/strengthened</b>							
# of groups operational and functional increased (bylaws, revolving funds)	Number	368	305	83%	131		
<b>Rating</b>		<b>6</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>83%</b>	<b>6</b>		
<b>Effectiveness: of productive infrastructure - Rainwater harvesting system</b>							
Supply of drinking water for human and livestock increased	M3 '000	510	420	85%	60		
Time spend for fetching water decreased	hr.	1	1	100%			
Distance for fetching water decreased	km	1	1.5	90%			
<b>Rating</b>		<b>6</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>83%</b>	<b>6</b>		
<b>Likelihood: of sustainability of productive infrastructure - Rainwater harvesting system</b>							
Number of functional water points increased (hafirs)	Number	25	25	100%			
Number of households with secured access to water resources for themselves and their livestock increased	Number	3,600	3,355	93%			
Cost of water per household per day decreased	SDG	3	3	100%			
<b>Rating</b>		<b>6</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>83%</b>	<b>6</b>		
<b>Component 2: Marketing &amp; Rural Financial Services</b>							
<b>2.1 Marketing Services</b>							

Output	Unit	Programme Cumulative			AWPB Year 2016		
		Programme Target	Cumulative achievement (2006 - Jun 2016)	Achievement %	Plan	Achievement up to June 2016	Achievement %
<b>2.1.1 Infrastructure</b>							
Local markets construction	No.	6	4	67	1	0	0
Women's market stalls	No.	120	64	53			
<b>2.1.2 Capacity Building</b>							
Training on small enterprise and feasibility study	Course	2	2	100			
Training of community in promotion of good business ideas	Course	1	1	100			
Market access for sustainable development training (external)	Person	4	4	100			
<b>RIMS Outcomes Indicators</b>							
Number of operational and functioning markets increased	Number	4	1	25%	3	0	0
Number of functional market boards increased	Number	54	0	0	0	0	0
<b>Rating</b>		<b>6</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>67%</b>	<b>5</b>		
<b>2.2 Rural Finance Services</b>							
<b>2.2.1 Institutional capacity building</b>							
Saving and credit group training	Course	6	5	83			
Upgrading training for existing VSCGs	Group	235	270	115			
Development of revolving funds by-laws	Group	100	50	50			
Training of SCGs on small enterprise and feasibility study	Course	3	3	100			
Formation of VSCGs	No.	625	1,194	253	200	199	99
No. of VSCGs members	Person	7,500	18,965	204	4000	3662	92
Total VSCGs savings	SDG '000	390	1,257	322	300	221	76
<b>2.2.2 Fund Support</b>							
Credit line (community revolving funds)	USD '000	330	181	55	150	0	0
<b>RIMS Output Indicators</b>							
Saving and credit groups with women in leadership position	Number	200	1391	696	200	0	0
Financial institutions participating in the project	Number	2	2	100	0	0	0
Staff of financial institutions trained	Male	50	47	94	10	7	70
Staff of financial institutions trained	Female	10	11	110	5	4	90
Value of gross loan portfolio	USD Million	0.50	4.3	860	1,200	400	42
<b>RIMS Outcome Indicators</b>							
<b>Likelihood: of sustainability of saving and credit groups formed/strengthened</b>							
Number of functional village saving and credit groups (VSCGs) increased	Number	1,194	1,257	105%	200	0	0
<b>Rating</b>		<b>6</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>83%</b>	<b>6</b>		
<b>Effectiveness: improved access of the poor to financial services</b>							
% of poor households benefited from financial services increased	%	75	60	80%	70		
<b>Rating</b>		<b>6</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>83%</b>	<b>6</b>		

Output	Unit	Programme Cumulative			AWPB Year 2016		
		Programme Target	Cumulative achievement (2006 - Jun 2016)	Achievement %	Plan	Achievement up to June 2016	Achievement %
<b>Sustainability: improved performance of financial institutions</b>							
Portfolio at risk kept in minimal level	%	0	0	100%	0		
Percentage of active borrowers increased	%	80	70	88%	75		
<b>Rating</b>		<b>6</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>83%</b>	<b>6</b>		
<b>Component 3: Community Development and Extension</b>							
<b>3.1 Infrastructure</b>							
Crush pens	No.	460	36	8			
Community development centers	No.	140	87	62			
Integrated Community Development Centers (ICDCs)	No.	30	22	73	4	4	100
<b>3.2 Institutional Capacity Building</b>							
Community awareness	Campaign	380	368	97			
Group management training	Group	280	179	64			
Book keeping/financial management training	Group	280	179	64			
Water management training	Group	100	102	102			
Training of literacy trainers	No.	240	194	81			
Beneficiary literacy training	Group	240	181	75			
CEAP Training	Group	318	301	95			
Para-vets	Person	220	191	87			
Crop protection agents	Person	280	140	50			
Milk product processing	Person	180	165	92			
Cooperating farmers/pastoralists – basic	No.	605	644	106			
Beekeeping and non-woody forest products	Person	40	58	145			
Food processing, hygiene and package	Group	70	132	189			
Midwifery training	Person	200	196	98			
Training of fishermen on manufacturing of fishing equipment	Persons	40	38	95	30	0	0
Distribution of LPG units	No	1,000	1,594	159			
Improvement of goat breads	No	26	26	100			
Improvement of local cattle breads	No	72	42	58			
Forage making and storage training	Group	22	24	109			
Stakeholders training in conflict resolution	person	200	163	82	100	0	0
Water harvesting training (community)	Group	200	251	126			
Study tour for community leaders	person	12	13	108	6	0	0
Handicraft training	Group	10	10	100			
Water user association training	Group	40	58	145	50	13	26
Leather making	workshop	1	1	100			
Gender mainstreaming workshop	workshop	2	2	100			
Fire line training	Group	60	48	80			
Animal husbandry training	course	2	1	50			
Saving and credit group TOT training	person	225	206	92	150	0	0

Output	Unit	Programme Cumulative			AWPB Year 2016		
		Programme Target	Cumulative achievement (2006 - Jun 2016)	Achievement %	Plan	Achievement up to June 2016	Achievement %
Intermediate technology training (Blacksmith)	course	2	2	100			
Stabilized Sand Block Training	Group	20	19	95			
Internal exchange visit	visit	8	2	25	6	0	0
LENs upgrading and linking with related departments	Person	260	231	89	120	100	84
ICDCs activation and consolidation	Groups	13	9	69	5	3	80
ICDCs training (refresher)	Group	13	9	69			
<b>3.3 Funds Support</b>							
Community initiative fund	No.	280	202	72	9	0	0
<b>RIMS Output indicators</b>							
People trained in crop production and technologies	Male	5,000	6,638	133	200	0	0
People trained in crop production and technologies	Female	5,000	6,075	122	100		
People trained in livestock production and technologies	Male	1,250	1,088	87	100	0	0
People trained in livestock production and technologies	Female	1,250	834	67	100	0	0
People trained in fish production and technologies	Male	50	131	262	40	0	0
People trained in fish production and technologies	Female	30	33	110	10	0	0
Households receiving animal health services	Number	38,000	73,790	184	0	0	0
People accessing advisory services facilitated by project	Male	10,000	12,517	125	500	0	0
People accessing advisory services facilitated by project	Female	9,000	11,472	127	300	0	0
People trained in income generating activities	Male	1,140	1,603	141	100	0	0
People trained in income generating activities	Female	2,240	1,521	68	400	0	0
People trained in community management topics	Male	2,240	5,344	239	100	0	0
People trained in community management topics	Female	1,960	4,392	224	200	0	0
Community workers and volunteers trained	Male	340	876	258	10		
Community workers and volunteers trained	Female	500	761	152	10		
Community groups formed/strengthened	Number	380	368	97			
People in community groups formed/strengthened	Male	17,860	17,296	97			
People in community groups formed/strengthened	Female	14,440	13,984	97			
Community groups with women in leadership position	Number	380	272	72			
Village/Community plans formulated	Number	2,280	1,985	87	131		
<b>RIMS Outcome Indicators</b>							
<b>Effectiveness: improved agricultural, livestock and fishery production</b>							
<b>Crop Production</b>							
Number of farmers reporting yield increase in crop production (sorghum)	Number	22,537	17,360	77%	4,000		
sorghum productivity increased by 35%	%	35%	33%	94%			
Number of farmers adopting recommended technologies increased	Number	21,000	13,130	63%	8,000		
<b>Effectiveness: community development</b>							
Number community action plans included in local government plans	Number	368	368	100%			

Output	Unit	Programme Cumulative			AWPB Year 2016		
		Programme Target	Cumulative achievement (2006 - Jun 2016)	Achievement %	Plan	Achievement up to June 2016	Achievement %
number of functional small community-based projects (initiatives) increased	Number	186	147	79%			
<b>Rating</b>		<b>6</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>83%</b>	<b>6</b>		
<b>Likelihood: of sustainability of community groups formed/strengthened</b>							
Number of operational/functional community groups increased	Number	368	325	88%			
<b>Rating</b>		<b>6</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>83%</b>	<b>6</b>		
<b>Effectiveness: creation of employment opportunities</b>							
Total jobs generated by small and medium enterprises (of which 50% of them are women)	Number	600	718	120%			
<b>Rating</b>		<b>6</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>100%</b>			
<b>Component 4: Rural Feeder Roads</b>							
Road construction (track cleaning and grubbing)	km	183	183	100			
Bridge construction	No.	3	0	0	3	0	0
Pipe Culvert construction	No.	78	10	12	68	0	0
Box Culvert construction	No.	13	0	0	13	0	0
<b>RIMS Outcome indicators</b>							
Number of producers benefiting from reduced travel distance to/from market place	%		N/A				
% of road maintenance cost included in the localities annual budget	%		N/A				
<b>Rating</b>		<b>6</b>			<b>6</b>		
<b>Component 5: Institutional Support</b>							
<b>5.1 Support to Local Government</b>							
<b>5.1.1 Infrastructure</b>							
Office renovation	No.	65	67	103			
<b>5.1.2 Institutional Capacity Building</b>							
Management training	person	120	109	91			
Demonstration plots	No.	525	462	88			
Field days	No.	56	44	79			
Field exchange Visits	Visit	8	7	88			
<b>5.2 Support to State Government &amp; Instrumentalities</b>							
<b>5.2.1 Infrastructure</b>							
Office renovation – PIA Headquarters	no.	5	10	200			
Veterinary clinic construction/rehabilitation /Mobile	no.	6	7	117			
<b>5.2.2 Institutional Capacity Building</b>							
Adaptive research and technology transfer	contract	3	3	100			
Crop assessment survey	Survey	16	14	88	3	0	0
Range measurement survey	Survey	16	14	88	3	0	0
Breed characterization	Survey	2	2	100			



Output	Unit	Programme Cumulative			AWPB Year 2016		
		Programme Target	Cumulative achievement (2006 - Jun 2016)	Achievement %	Plan	Achievement up to June 2016	Achievement %
Animal disease mapping	Survey	2	2	100			
Veterinary services impact assessment	Survey	2	2	100			
Pastoral Camps	no	12	13	108			
Pastoral Day	no	16	15	94			
<b>RIMS Output Indicators</b>							
Staff of service providers trained	Male	800	820	182			
Staff of service providers trained	Female	700	676	150			
<b>RIMS Outcome Indicators</b>							
<b>Effectiveness: improved performance of service providers</b>							
Number of household covered by service delivered	Number	38,000	27,000	71%			
Staff Efficiency increased	%	85	85	100%	30	0	0
% of Community household satisfied of service delivered	%	90	80	89%	30	0	0
<b>Rating</b>		<b>6</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>83%</b>	<b>6</b>		

## Appendix 5: Financial: Actual financial performance by financier; by component and disbursements by category

**Table 5A: Financial performance by financier as at 30/06/2016**

Financier	Appraisal (USD '000)	Revised Appraisal (USD '000)	Actual (USD '000)	Per cent Actual
IFAD loan	25 500	25 500	31 019	122%
IFAD grant - Additional Financing	-	3 194	1 217	38%
Co-financier - OFID	8 600	8 600	1 317	15%
Agricultural Bank of Sudan	500	500	6 406	1281%
Government*	12 800	13 991	8 129	58%
Beneficiaries	1 600	1 630	718	44%
<b>Total</b>	<b>49 000</b>	<b>53 415</b>	<b>48 806</b>	<b>91%</b>

**Table 5B: Financial performance by financier by component (USD '000) as at 30/06/2016**

Component	IFAD loan			IFAD Grant			OFD			ABS			Government			Beneficiaries			Total		
	Revised Appraisal	Actual	%	Revised Appraisal	Actual	%	Revised Appraisal	Actual	%	Revised Appraisal	Actual	%	Revised Appraisal	Actual	%	Revised Appraisal	Actual	%	Revised Appraisal	Actual	%
Natural Resource Management	8 200	7 874	96%	862	272	32%	0		0%	-		0%	1 808	706	39%			0%	10 870	8 852	81.4%
Rural Financial Services and Marketing	3 300	2 209	67%	302	77	25%	0		0%	500	6406	1281%	1 197	6	1%		4	0%	5 300	8 702	164.2%
Community Development	6 700	5 351	80%	665	118	18%	0		0%	-		0%	842	11	1%	1630	714	44%	9 836	6 193	63.0%
Rural Feeder Roads	-	1 470	0%	-		0%	8600	1 317	15%	-		0%	5 600	595	11%			0%	14 200	3 382	23.8%
Institutional Support	7 300	14 115	193%	1 364	751	55%	0		0%	-		0%	4 544	6 811	150%	0		0%	13 209	21 677	164.1%
<b>Total</b>	<b>25 500</b>	<b>31 019</b>	<b>122%</b>	<b>3 194</b>	<b>1 217</b>	<b>38%</b>	<b>8600</b>	<b>1 317</b>	<b>15%</b>	<b>500</b>	<b>6406</b>	<b>1281%</b>	<b>13 991</b>	<b>8 129</b>	<b>58%</b>	<b>1 630</b>	<b>718</b>	<b>44%</b>	<b>53 414</b>	<b>48 806</b>	<b>91.4%</b>

**Table 5C-a: IFAD loan disbursements (SDR, as at 30/06/2016)**

Category	Category description	Original Allocation	Revised Allocation	Disbursement	W/A pending	Total	Balance	Per cent disbursed
I	Civil Works	3 700 000	4 000 000	3 870 761	110 162	3 980 923	19 077	99.5%
II	Vehicles & Equipment	2 520 000	2 520 000	2 411 057		2 411 057	108 943	95.7%
III. a	Training	1 430 000	1 580 000	1 582 440		1 582 440	(2 440)	100.2%
III. b	Technical Assistance	830 000	2 500 000	2 863 361		2 863 361	(363 361)	114.5%
III. c	Studies	350 000	350 000	326 829		326 829	23 171	93.4%
IV	Credit Lines	1 210 000	200 000	132 255		132 255	67 745	66.1%
V	Grants	2 330 000	1 100 000	1 159 445		1 159 445	(59 445)	105.4%
VI. a	Salaries	850 000	1 600 000	1 797 900		1 797 900	(197 900)	112.4%
VI. b	Allowances	420 000	1 500 000	1 435 834		1 435 834	64 166	95.7%
VI. c	Operations & Maintenance	400 000	1 300 000	1 287 809		1 287 809	12 192	99.1%
	Un-allocated	3 010 000	400 000	-		-	400 000	0.0%
	Authorised Allocation	-	-	16 849		16 849	(16 849)	0.0%
	<b>Total</b>	<b>17 050 000</b>	<b>17 050 000</b>	<b>16 884 539</b>	<b>110 162</b>	<b>16 994 701</b>	<b>55 299</b>	<b>99.7%</b>

**Table 5C-b: IFAD Grant disbursements (SDR, as at 30/06/2016)**

Category	Category description	Original Allocation	Revised Allocation	Actual Disbursement	W/A pending	Total Disbursement	Balance	Per cent disbursed
I	Civil Works	490 000.0	490 000.0	6 321.9	149 751.4	156 073.2	333 926.8	31.9%
II	Vehicles & Equipment (**)	65 000.0	65 000.0	21 249.8	31 660.0	52 909.7	12 090.3	81.4%
III. a	Training	310 000.0	310 000.0	122 021.4	33 658.2	155 679.5	154 320.5	50.2%
III. b	Technical Assistance	660 000.0	483 000.0	109 088.3	90 586.6	199 674.9	283 325.1	41.3%
III. c	Studies	-	-	-	-	-	-	0.0%
IV	Credit Lines	-	-	-	-	-	-	0.0%
V	Grants	100 000.0	100 000.0	9 250.2	18 106.1	27 356.3	72 643.7	27.4%
VI. a	Salaries (**)	7 000.0	184 000.0	88 112.7	65 193.0	153 305.7	30 694.3	83.3%
VI. b	Allowances	73 000.0	73 000.0	9 033.8	9 316.3	18 350.1	54 649.9	25.1%
VI. c	Operations & Maintenance	160 000.0	160 000.0	37 839.7	38 821.8	76 661.6	83 338.4	47.9%
	Un-allocated (**)	205 000.0	205 000.0	-	-	-	205 000.0	0.0%
	Authorised Allocation	-	-	784 987.8	-	784 987.8	(784 987.8)	0.0%
	<b>Total</b>	<b>2 070 000.0</b>	<b>2 070 000.0</b>	<b>1 187 905.6</b>	<b>437 093.4</b>	<b>1 624 998.9</b>	<b>445 001.1</b>	<b>78.5%</b>

**Table 5C-c: OFID Loan disbursements (USD, as at 30/06/2016)**

Category	Category description	Original Allocation	Revised Allocation	Disbursement	W/A pending	Balance	Per cent disbursed
I	Civil Works - Rural Feeder Roads	8 600 000	8 600 000	1 317 000		7 283 000	15.3%
	Authorised Allocation	-	-	860 000		(860 000)	0.0%
	<b>Total</b>	<b>8 600 000</b>	<b>8 600 000</b>	<b>2 177 000</b>	<b>-</b>	<b>6 423 000</b>	<b>25.3%</b>

## Appendix 6: Compliance with legal covenants: Status of implementation

Section	Covenant	Target/Action Due Date	Compliance Status/Date	Remarks
<b>Section 2.03</b>	Brower shall open/maintain project Special Account	Before project effectiveness	Complied	Special Account is opened and maintained
<b>Section 3.02</b>	Preparation of Annual Work Plan & Budget	Prior to Disbursement and annually thereafter	Complied	Complied with, FY 2016 AWPB Submitted in January 2016
<b>Section 3.03</b>	Brower shall open/maintain Project Account		Complied with	Complied with, project accounts opened and maintained
<b>Section 3.04</b>	Availability of Additional Resources		Complied with	Government fund not flowing regularly, but not matching budgeted amounts
<b>Section 4.01</b>	Monitoring -PCU shall establish information management system	90 days after effectiveness date	Complied with	M & E System is in place and functional
<b>Section 4.02</b>	PCU shall submit progress reports semi annually	3 months after each 6 months	Complied with	Submitted regularly
<b>Section 4.03</b>	Mid-term Review	4 <sup>th</sup> Year of the project	Complied with	Done, MTR was carried out
<b>Section 4.04</b>	Completion Report	6 months after project completion date	N/A	Programme completion date is 31 December 2016
<b>Section 5.01</b>	Financial Statements	Every six months	Partial Compliance	Only annual Financial Statements are submitted by the Programme management
<b>Section 5.02</b>	Audit Reports	Annually	Complied with	Audit for FY 2015 submitted timely
<b>Schedule 1,</b>	Project Description		Partial compliance	Component
<b>Schedule 2,</b>	Allocation and Withdrawal of Loan/Grant Proceeds		Complied with	Loan disbursement is 99% of Loan proceeds and 79% of Grant proceeds
<b>Schedule 3,</b>	Project Implementation	90 days after effectiveness	Complied with	
<b>Schedule 3A,</b>	Additional Covenants	Project Year 3	Partial Compliance	Generally, all additional covenants are complied with. However, financing the RFR is facing difficulties at present time.
<b>Schedule 4</b>	Procurement	Continuous	Complied with	Procurement thresholds and review requirements are generally adhered to. Improvements in planning processes are under way as well as concerned personnel capacity improvement.

## Appendix 7: Knowledge management: Learning and Innovation

**LEARNING:** review of Lessons Learnt, SM, WSRMP, 2016

**INNOVATIONS:** vertical intensification.

**Learning:** A range of lessons learnt (LL) still generated through the subsequent missions (2009, 2010, 2011, 2012, 2013, 2014, 2015 and 2016) as the project approaching its closure stage i.e. maturation stage of its interventions. However, the project has already passed most of the time of the top-up extension, the mission is convinced a lot of successes have been enhanced through capitalisation on the complementarity of the three driving forces of the consolidation, scaling-up and sustainability of impacted experiences. Although, the project is expected to invest heavily on the production of the right formatted KM products to capitalize and globalize its transformative change to the rural communities in the project area. A highlight of these lessons and innovations is given in the below table:

No.	Lesson	Review as per SM observations, 2016
1	The Natural Resource Management is a socioeconomic cohesive element in the project area.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- NR laws and by-laws when approved they should be associated with adequate monitoring and enforcement mechanisms.</li> <li>- Sound NRM governance is a safeguard for the sustainability of NR utilization gains.</li> <li>- Pro-active communities and people managed Conflict Resolution Centres (CRCs) are currently able to sustain practices and peaceful co-existence among communities along the SRs. This structure when supported by appropriate services, reasonable economic opportunities will be created for the beneficiaries as time and efforts will be directed on investments.</li> <li>- Current tractor invasion (massive cultivation of fragile rangelands as these tractors becoming a good source of income to the localities) is a big threat to human stability and Do No Harm approach is needed as preventive measure.</li> <li>- Ultimately land use maps and rangeland registrar are needed.</li> </ul>
2.	Scaling-up of WSRMP-NRM Activities in Greater Kordofan is a must to ensure NRM security and sustainability.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- No lasting impact can be expected as the current pockets are tinny.</li> <li>- Most valid; i.e. communities were adamant in indicating that they would NOT allow cultivation in open rangeland and Hima's.</li> <li>- Apart from lasting implicit, the issue of expressing as ONE VOICE is also important.</li> </ul>
3.	Sustainability of services provided by the PIAs, MDETs, METs is dependent on the integration of their operational cost in the state government budget in the post-WSRMP era.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Green departments have to maintain work facilities provided for the service providers.</li> <li>- Funds in addition to the salaries should be secured to keep the different extension teams operational.</li> <li>- Staffing turnover should always be acknowledged considering the persistence of the multidisciplinary set-up/composition of the teams.</li> </ul>
4.	Community Environmental Action Plan (CEAP) is a bottom-up planning tool and functions as a kind of NR promotion tool.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- CEAP encompasses the planning for range land grazing arrangement, monitoring of hema performance, open access areas and farm land, planting gum Arabic trees and seeds broadcasting, prohibiting tree cutting, construction of fire lines, etc.</li> <li>- Early support for the improvement of hema range resulted in the establishment of 52 reserve areas exceeding the planned target (22) by 136%. The wide adoption of communities to hema intervention was realized from both income generation as well as environmental rehabilitation perspective.</li> </ul>
5.	Stock route (SR) demarcation is package of hardware and software processes whereby the latter is easily underestimated.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Law enforcement structures, monitoring and follow up mechanisms should be provided along the SRs, whereby promoting a decentralised set-up.</li> <li>- Service Provisions (Water, Animal Health and - Production, Female Reproductive Health –midwife-, Conflict Resolution modalities, etc.) along the SR play a core role in ensuring appropriate use and basic income to maintain the facilities and can be preventive measures against conflicts eruption.</li> <li>- Engagement of (settled and mobile) communities in the management arrangements along the SRs besides community mobilisation are good ways to sustain the infrastructures and</li> </ul>

No.	Lesson	Review as per SM observations, 2016
		<p>peaceful co-existence along the SRs.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Mobile extension teams and adopting Herder Schools (Pastoralist Farmer Field School) are desirable interventions when succeeding in management of SRs and reaching out to mobile communities (nomads, semi-nomads).</li> </ul>
6.	Community Initiative Fund (CIF) is a community empowerment tool.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- CIF has played a key role in empowering the communities financially to address their needs of the services they want.</li> <li>- This fund enhanced the community cohesiveness as the methodology followed in the management of the funds has considered the accountability and transparency measures.</li> </ul>
7.	Beneficiaries' profits from NRM can be maximized through appropriate training and technical skills promoting program.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Activities such as fishing (A total of 3,230 direct and 16,000 indirect beneficiaries are benefiting from the averaged 52-ton fish produced per season which gained an average price of 8.5 SDG per kg of fish (El Rahad lake) compared to marginal fish catch before the intervention). Gum Tapping, food processing, selling balled fodder and range seeds, sheep fattening, etc.</li> <li>- Remains valid even when little support services (MDETs, METs, etc.): fishing, fodder conservation, range seed collection for own and market, animal fattening and home nurseries.</li> <li>- Access to micro-credit is an important conducive condition.</li> </ul>
8.	Microfinance Services are driving force for women empowerment.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- In particular, women have been economically empowered to overcome most of the suppressive interactions against women.</li> <li>- Men's groups' formation has been inspired by women's groups.</li> <li>- A very strong repayment culture has developed with almost 100% repayment records to all MFIs.</li> </ul>
9.	The concept of lending to women's groups has now been fully accepted by the financial institutions.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Over the years the VSCGs have emerged as one of the most successful WSRMP interventions. The mission observed that the groups meet, save and invest regularly and independently and they have full support of the CDCs. Their internal capital is growing continuously as a result of regular savings and ploughing back of the profits from group investments and is one of the main factors for their success.</li> </ul>
10.	Gender mainstreaming approach adopted by WSRMP has narrowed developmental gaps between females and males in the rural communities.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Empowered the communities and women economic empowerment is an effective transformation tool for women. It led to improving the household dynamics whereby husbands turn appreciative of their wives.</li> <li>- Women feel particularly empowered as their relationship to the world around them has been significantly transformed. They become more and more linked to the world and business oriented.</li> <li>- Engagement of women in a wide range of small businesses and their active participation in the committees has contributed significantly to their economic and political empowerment.</li> <li>- Self-confidence, self-realization and decreased dependency on others were widely stated in terms of achievements at community levels.</li> </ul>
11.	Cost recovery ensures sustainability and continuity of Local Extension Networks (LENs) services at community level.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- LENs play pivotal role in providing extension services and inputs against a price;</li> <li>- When monitoring and support is provided by MDET (part of referral system), these LEN agents can be sustained on longer term and contribute to scaling-up;</li> <li>- Remains valid, but deserve more appreciation and attention from green departments so as to ensure that the LEN link is used appropriately; i.e. it can reduce the cost of Government related Service Provision (extension).</li> <li>- LEN evolved step by step; WSRMP questioned the sustainability of services a lot and this was perceived as a potential solution.</li> <li>- Awkward things do however happen namely employing a well-functioning CAHW as Govt. employee; i.e. clearly the vision of LEN is in such handling not understood.</li> </ul>
12.	Participatory method involving all stakeholders increases the chances for sustainable services;	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- 'Linking communities to private service and input providers' is now a clear activity in AWPB. Involving 'traders' is for instance challenging and not easily taking place.</li> <li>- Community development plans (in particular CEAP) in the absence of WSRMP will consolidate the ownership among communities.</li> </ul>
13.	Reaching out to nomad and	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- When aiming at reaching out to mobile and semi-mobile</li> </ul>

No.	Lesson	Review as per SM observations, 2016
	semi-nomadic communities next to settled communities	communities (nomads, semi-nomads) next to settled communities, it is important to target them from the onset whereby making use of Mobile Multi-Disciplinary Extension Teams including rural micro finance officer, and adopting the Herder School (pastoralist farmer field school) approach.

## INNOVATION

- The Pastoralists Field School (PFS) established in Al Adday Villages has been described by the beneficiaries as one of the most appreciated interventions of the Programme for the integration of the nomads in the development processes. Besides promotion of social harmony and coherence the school provides a shared space for training, upgrading of productive skills, especially in relation to animal health and nutrition in addition to educational services.
- Careful planning and implementation of water ponds along the SRs, contributes to dispersing the animals in need of water and thus prevents overgrazing at existing water supply facilities (mainly small hafirs).
- Renewed approach regarding co-management is replicable in other states in Sudan to resolving wide spread conflicts along livestock corridors. CRCs/SR co-management/early warning as appropriate mechanisms for conflict management and maintaining peace along the livestock corridors.
- Good practices (GPs) can be picked up as innovations that require proper documentation and processing as KM product.
- Community trainers (e.g. Arafa) have strong transformative role among rural women.
- The VSCGs as women empowerment approach and consequently, the associations as collective investment for enhancement of social cohesiveness.
- Microfinance officer is an innovative discipline within the MDETs.
- Water as a mean to govern NRM.