

## Viet Nam: Ha Giang Development Project for Ethnic Minorities

Item	Assessment Remarks	Rating
<b>Country &amp; Project Name</b>	<b>Viet Nam: Ha Giang Development Project for Ethnic Minorities</b>	
Loan No.:	460-VN	
Project Id.:	1025	
Board Date	December 1997	
Effectiveness date	April 1998	
Closing date	June 2004	
Total Project Cost USD(M)	18.4M	
IFAD loan USD (M)	12.52M	
Cofinanciers if any	UNDP- UN Development Programme 2.33M (TA), SIDA- Swedish International Development Agency 0.79M (Ag. Ext. TA)	
Implementing Agency		
Principal Components	1. Rural roads. 2. Domestic water supply. 3. Irrigation. 4. Ag. Extension. 5. Animal Health. 6. Forest Protection. 7. Education. 8. Health. 9. Income diversification. 10. Community Development Fund (added later).	
<b>Project Performance</b>		
Design	Comprehensive and broadly conventional rural development project. Project coverage of province varied by component. PCR makes no mention of a log-frame.	4
Implementation	Slow at first owing to new procedures and large scale with many actors at different levels. But systematic approach by provincial authorities soon corrected this weakness. Project very closely monitored and almost all aspects of all components implemented largely without problems and with extensive community participation and in most cases ahead of schedule. Around mid-term savings recycled into CDF (community development funds) to assist communes and overcome earlier allocative rigidities in design using local self-help implementation. UNDP funded technical assistance (TA) very effective. Generally good communication between donor agencies and TS inputs which helped with local capacity growth and steadily increased pace of implementation.	6
Relevance	The geographical, socio-economic and environmental criteria used to design and target the project led to objectives that were entirely relevant to the existing conditions in Ha Giang Province.	6
Effectiveness	All targets met or exceeded. Effectiveness of all components enhanced through participation. Investments per commune very modest but participation and people based selection of investments in roads, water supply, irrigation, animal health, crops, education and livelihood support were all effective. In sum these have "helped people overcome most pressing socio-economic constraints."	6
Efficiency	Probably a positive ratio of costs to benefits, but no evidence deployed to demonstrate this quantitatively.	5
<b>Partner Performance</b>		
Partner Perf. & Quality	IFAD and UNDP performance satisfactory. SIDA performance uncertain- since it cut its TA. Interagency coordination generally satisfactory. Provincial coordination handicapped by frequent transfers of commune chairmen. Overall performance of Government was satisfactory.	IFAD=5, UNDP=5, SIDA=4, GOV=5
<b>Rural poverty impact</b>		
Physical Assets	Roads had strategic impact enabling further human and economic development especially in hill areas. No material evidence of impact on private assets.	5
Food Security	Irrigation has led to double cropping by about 7,000 h/h (mostly not poor), animal diseases have declined	4
Environment	Community forestry has increased forest cover modestly, brought substantial areas under better protection and helped to raise environmental awareness and reduce degradation.	5
Human Assets	Better drinking water supplies and health & education facilities as well as enhanced training have helped health and education standards to improve and school enrolments to rise and drop outs decline.	5
Soc. Cap. & Emp.	Highly decentralized and participatory implementation built local development capacity and strengthened empowerment.	6
Ag. Productivity	Ag extension including mass media is claimed to have raised yields and productivity, but	4

Item	Assessment Remarks	Rating
<b>Country &amp; Project Name</b>	<b>Viet Nam: Ha Giang Development Project for Ethnic Minorities</b>	
	no evidence of yield or production changes is cited.	
Inst. & Serv.	Provincial and district authorities developed improved understanding and appreciation of participatory methods.	5
Financial Assets	Income diversification was mainly a savings and credit scheme with usefully positive effects especially on women. About 30% of beneficiaries were poor households.	4
Markets	No discernible impact mentioned in PCR.	1
Rural Poverty	Rural poverty has declined in the province from 34% in 1997 to 15% in 2003. Although the project has clearly contributed to this the extent of that contribution is not known.	5
<b>Overarching factors</b>		
Targeting	The project focussed on raising the standard of living for ethnic minorities in northern districts and improving food security of the poorest elsewhere, together with systematic targeting of women. Simple targeting tools (resource mapping, transects, and participatory wealth ranking) were deployed to select areas of operation within generalised pre-targeting at design.	5
Gender	Widespread project effort to increase gender awareness and to include women in all activities. Results are said to be positive but almost entirely unquantified) NB girls school enrolment increased in target communes.	5
Sustainability	Formal aspects of institutional change may not long survive as these were in many ways ad hoc, but the deeper understanding of gender, participation, poverty reduction, donor coordination etc. is likely to prove of lasting value. Project infrastructure is of adequate quality and is likely to be maintained by communities providing the relevant technical resources continue to be provided by GOV. Gains for women especially through credit groups appear sustainable.	5
Innov, Rep & Scaling	Project offers no special contribution in regard to innovation and/or replication.	2
<b>Overall Performance</b>	An effective and efficient contribution to rural development with wide-ranging but entirely unquantified effects on the rural population. Probably a lower than planned impact on the poorest.	5
Contribution to IFAD Strategic Objectives	Positive contribution to all strategic objectives with greatest and sustainable contribution to SO 2.	5
Contribution to MDG's	Positive but unquantified contributions to MDG's 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6 & 7.	5
<b>PCR Quality</b>		
Scope	Unconventional structure leading to omissions and repetition. PCR lacks a simple overview of project. Components, scope, estimated cost, actual expenditure, main outcomes and impact. No glossary or list of acronyms.	2
Quality	Detailed accounting of inputs, but little tangible evidence of outputs or outcomes beyond plausible assertion. Analysis largely absent. No re-estimated ERR.	2
Lessons	Strong lessons about prerequisites for and methods of successful participation as well as on effective targeting. All have widespread relevance.	5