

Pakistan

Gwadar-Lasbela Livelihoods Support Project II Supervision Report

Mission Dates: 1 November - 10 January 2025

Document Date: 03/02/2025

Project No. 2000002331

Report No. 7138-PK

Asia and the Pacific Division
Programme Management Department

Abbreviations and Acronyms

4Ps	public-private-producer partnerships
ASF	Agribusiness Support Fund
AWPB	annual work plan and budget
BPPRA	Balochistan Public Procurement Authority
BOQ	Bill of Quantities
CDD	community-driven development
CO	community organization
CPI	community physical infrastructure
DIU	District Implementation Unit
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations
GLLSP	Gwadar-Lasbela Livelihoods Support Project
LIP	Livelihood Improvement Plan
M&E	monitoring and evaluation
NRSP	National Rural Support Programme
PC-1	government project document
PMU	project management unit
PSC	poverty score card
RFP	Request for proposal
SDG	Sustainable Development Goal
SMP	social mobilization partner
UCDP	union council development plan
VDP	Village development plan
VO	village organization
WFP	World Food Programme
WRC	Women resource centres

A. Project Overview

Region:	Asia and the Pacific Division	Project at Risk Status:	Not at risk
Country:	Pakistan	Environmental and Social Category:	Moderate
Project Name:	Gwadar-Lasbela Livelihoods Support Project II	Climate Risk Classification:	High
Project ID:	2000002331	Executing Institution:	Planning and Dev Dept., Government of Balochistan
Project Type:	Fisheries	Implementing Institutions:	Planning and Dev Dept., Government of Balochistan
CPM:	Fernanda Thomaz da Rocha		
Project Director:	Rehmat Dashti		
Project Area:			

Approval Date:	08/05/2020	Last audit receipt:	27/12/2024
Signing Date:	15/04/2021	Date of Last SIS Mission:	10/01/2025
Entry into Force Date:	19/04/2021	Number of SIS Missions:	10
Available for Disbursement Date:	04/10/2021	Number of extensions:	0
First Disbursement Date:	04/10/2021	Effectiveness lag:	11 months
MTR Date:	not available yet		
Original Completion Date:	30/06/2027		
Current Completion Date:	30/06/2027		
Financial Closure:	not available yet		

Project total financing

IFAD Financing breakdown	Asia and the Pacific Division	\$3,000,000
	IFAD	\$60,155,000
Domestic Financing breakdown	National Government Cash	\$8,654,000
	Beneficiaries In-kind	\$992,000
Co-financing breakdown,	Saudi Fund for Development	\$3,000,000
Project total financing:		\$75,801,000

Current Mission

Mission Dates: 1 November - 10 January 2025

Days in the field: 12

Mission composition: Ghulam Nabi Marri, Country Programme Coordinator, Mission Leader;
Qaim Shah, Institutions Specialist and Team Leader;
Zahid Shakeel, Infrastructure and SECAP Specialist;
Enrico Andreini, Fisheries Specialist (remote);
Abdul Hamid Khan, M&E Specialist;
Naeem Abbas, Procurement Specialist;
Arsalan Vardag, Financial Management Specialist;
Fayyaz Ahmad, Value Chain/Public-Private Producer Partnership Specialist;
Angela Kimani, Nutrition Specialist (remote)

Field sites visited: Lasbela District: Village/communities in Union Councils of Ormara, Gwadar, Pasni, Surbandar, Peshukan
Gwadar District: Villages/communities in Union Councils of Chib Kalmati, Daamb Somiyani, Berra

B. Overall Assessment

Key SIS Indicator #1	∅	Rating	Key SIS Indicator #2	∅	Rating
Likelihood of Achieving the Development Objective		4.41	Assessment of the Overall Implementation Performance		4.08

Effectiveness and Developmental Focus		4	Project Management		4
Effectiveness		4	Quality of Project Management		5
Targeting and Outreach		5	Knowledge Management		4
Gender equality & women's participation		5	Value for Money		4
Agricultural Productivity		N/A	Coherence between AWPB and Implementation		4
Nutrition		4	Performance of M&E System		4
Adaptation to Climate Change		4	Social, Environment, and Climate Standards requirements		4

Sustainability and Scaling-up		4	Financial Management and Execution		4
Institutions and Policy Engagement		4	Acceptable Disbursement Rate		3
Partnership-building		5	Quality of Financial Management		4
Human and Social Capital and Empowerment		5	Quality and Timeliness of Audit		4
Quality of Project Target Group Engagement and Feedback		4	Counterparts Funds		4
Responsiveness of Service Providers		5	Compliance with Loan Covenants		5
Environment and Natural Resource Management			Procurement		4
Exit Strategy		4			
Potential for Scaling-up		4			

Relevance		5
------------------	--	----------

C. Mission Objectives and Key Conclusions

Background and Main Objective of the Mission

1. GLLSP II was approved by the IFAD Executive Board at a total cost of US\$ 76 million in April 2020 and entered into force on 19 April 2021. The total cost includes IFAD loan financing of US\$ 60.2 million, IFAD grant of US\$ 3 million, Saudi Development Fund grant of US\$ 3 million, government counterpart of US\$ 8.7 million and beneficiary contribution of US\$ 0.99 million. The project duration is six years (2021-2027).
2. The project's overall goal is to develop a sustainable model of decentralized and integrated rural development that is poverty, gender, youth, nutrition and climate change sensitive. The development objective is to increase the incomes and enhance the livelihoods of rural poor fisher folk and agriculture households in the project area in a sustainable manner. The project targets all the 40 rural union councils in Gwadar and Lasbela districts and shall directly benefit 228,000 persons corresponding to 100,500 households.
3. The objective of the project will be achieved through three complementary components: Component 1 - Community Development; Component 2 - Fisheries Value Chain Development; and Component 3 - Project Management and Policy Support. The principal outcomes expected from the project are: (i) improved capacity of ultra-poor and poor households and smallholder farmers and fishermen to increase incomes and improve livelihoods; (ii) improved socio-economic infrastructure; (iii) small fisher folk benefit from upgraded and inclusive value chain; and (iv) policy reform/dialogue, communication, and knowledge sharing.
4. This was a full Supervision Mission (SV) pre-Mid-Term Review (MTR) undertaken during 01-12 November 2024 and the main objectives of this mission were to (i) review physical and financial progress of the project against the targets set for MTR and assess recommendations made in the last Supervision Mission of December 2023 and Implementation Support Mission of June 2024; (ii) review progress made so far, against the AWPB and procurement plan; (iii) review the reallocation of category wise budget for meeting the fund requirements for construction of one priority jetty and fisheries landing sites; (iv) review project targeting, effectiveness, gender equality and social inclusion; (v) make recommendations to improve project performance and help the project resolve any bottlenecks and develop a roadmap for enhancing its performance.
5. The Mission carried out field work during 01-12 November 2024. The Mission held discussions with community and village organisations members; Fisher folk Cooperatives; visited several completed and ongoing interventions; and held detailed discussions with concerned government line departments, Project Management Unit (PMU), National Rural Support Programme (NRSP), UN World Food Programme (WFP), UN Food and Agriculture Organisation (FAO), and roads supervision consultants and implementation contractors.
6. The Mission would like to express sincere thanks to the Government of Balochistan, the PMU and implementing partners including FAO and WFP field and provincial team for their support and facilitation during the mission.
7. After a debriefing meeting with the Project Director and other line departments and officials, a wrap-up meeting chaired by the Additional Chief Secretary, Planning and Development Department, Government of Balochistan (GoB) was held on 11 November 2024. This Supervision Report presents the Mission's findings and recommendations, and the agreements reached with the GoB/Planning and Development Department and the Project.

Key Mission Agreements and Conclusions

8. The overall implementation performance of the project is progressing well except for the current AWPB (July 2024-June 2025) where progress has been hampered due to security situation in the province. The current beneficiary household (HH) outreach is 48% of the total 100,500 HH. The project focus on gender equality and women empowerment is leading to a commendable achievement of increasing number of women in management position in community institutions. Overall, women beneficiaries constitute 56% of current total outreach.
9. Most of the recommendations of IFAD Supervision Mission (December 2023) have been implemented and resolved. Key recommendations of the IFAD Implementation Support Mission of June 2024, including approval of revised PC-1, preparation of reallocation proposal, completion of validation of jetty feasibility and design, submission of FAO and WFP no-cost extension proposals and finalisation of community procurement manual have been completed.
10. Due to recent increase in the disbursement rate since last supervision mission, the disbursement rating has improved to moderately satisfactory. Combined disbursement rate of loan and grant, as of 31 October 2024, comes to around 41.5%. Disbursement rate of SDF grant is 78.9% (US\$ 2.37 million out of 3.0 million). Disbursement rate of IFAD loan is around 38.6% (SDR 16.87 million out of 43.78 million) including initial advance, disbursement rate of IFAD grant is 98.99% (SDR 2.16 million out of 2.18 million). The project has commitments of around SDR 6.21 million (13.5% of combined amount of loan and grant).
11. Revised PC-1 based on the agreements between the Government of Balochistan and IFAD has been approved. Major revisions included aligning of the original IFAD Project Design Report's (PDR) targets for community development component, roads and construction of one priority jetty against the original plan of three jetties due to financial shortfall.
12. Agreements:
13. **Tendering Process and Award of Contract of Construction of Jetty.** With the approval of the revised PC-1, and after completion of the review process by Checkers and Indenters for validating and vetting the feasibility and design reports of construction of Jetty, the tendering process and award of contract need to be completed latest by June 2025, particularly in view of project completion date of June 2027.

14. **Contract for the feasibility, design and supervision of Roads.** With the alignment of revised PC-1, the project will design and construct remaining 56 km of roads. Additionally, completion of ongoing roads is facing delays mainly because of unprecedented floods in early 2024 and deteriorated security situation in the project area. The contract for consulting services for feasibility, design, construction and supervision of roads would require extension for the 56 km roads as well as modification to conduct the construction and supervision of ongoing roads of original scope of work. The Project shall immediately obtain NO from IFAD for the contract extension and modification.
15. **Completion of Midline Survey.** The MTR of the project is due by June 2025 and the project needs to complete the survey report before the mission start. In this regard, the project is in process of hiring the firm. The agreed timeline includes the inception report by 25 January, completion of survey by 25 February and the draft report ready by mid-March 2025.
16. **Revision of Contract with NRSP.** Due to the alignment/restoration of the original PDR target for Community Development Component in the revised PC-1, the existing contract with NRSP would need to be revised to include the remaining scope. The Project informed that the last PSC has already approved the revision. However, as per the provisions of the existing contract, the Project also needs to obtain IFAD concurrence for modifications.

D. Overview and Project Progress

17. The overall implementation progress is rated as moderately satisfactory (4). The Project implementation performance has consistently been improving since November 2022 when the performance was rated as moderately unsatisfactory, culminating in its exiting Actual Problem Project (APP) status at the end of 2023. The Project achieved 83% financial progress during AWPB 2023-2024 (July-June). The implementation progress of AWPB 2024-2025 (July-June) suffered delays in the first four months due to political unrest and security situation. However, the Project expects to utilise around 26% of AWPB 2024-2025 by December 2024 and 52% by March 2025.
18. The PMU and implementing partners have implemented and resolved most of the previous supervision mission recommendations. Key recommendations of the IFAD Implementation Support Mission of June 2024, including approval of revised PC-1, preparation of reallocation proposal, completion of validation of jetty feasibility and design, submission of FAO and WFP no-cost extension proposals and finalisation of community procurement manual have been completed (see Annex-1 for details).
19. The current beneficiary household (HH) outreach is 48% of the total HH target of 100,500. Women beneficiaries constitute 56% of current total outreach. Geographical and household targeting follows the project criteria. The positive impacts of the project interventions on beneficiary incomes and women empowerment are becoming noticeable.
20. With the combined disbursement rate of 41.5% of loan and grant, as of 31 October 2024, the disbursement rating of the project has improved to moderately satisfactory.
21. PMU performance has continuously improved to provide effective leadership to all partners and district teams which is manifested in enhanced implementation progress and timely actions on recommendations of IFAD supervision and implementation support missions. The Planning and Development Department has been effectively supporting the project through the Project Steering Committee in timely manner with required approvals and prompt resolutions of issues.
22. **Component 1: Community Development**
23. The objective of the component is to enable the rural poor men, women and youth to improve their livelihoods. The component has three sub components: (I.I) Social Mobilization and Community Empowerment; (I.II) Economic Graduation of the ultra-poor, Women & Youth; (I.III) Social and Economic Infrastructure.
24. Due to the alignment/restoration of the original PDR target for Community Development Component in the revised PC-1, the existing contract with NRSP would need to be revised to include the remaining scope. The Project informed that the last PSC has already approved the revision. However, as per the provisions of the existing contract, the Project also needs to obtain IFAD concurrence for modifications.
25. **Social Mobilization and Community Empowerment sub component:**
26. **Community Organisations:** All the 40 Union Councils of the Project area have footprints of Community Institutions. The project, to date, has revitalised and established 358 village organisations (VO) against the target of 400^[1] (90%), consisting of 3,016 community organisations (CO). All the organised VO were assisted to develop their Village Development Plans which have been consolidated in Union Council Development Plans. Total membership of the organised VO/CO is 45,184 HH. Women constitute 56% of the total member HH against the PDR target of 50%. The Project's community capacity building activities include training of 4,215 (64% of the target) VO/CO Managers; 462 Village Resource Persons (105% of the target); and 50 public sector staff in preparation of Union Council Development Plans. Additionally, 248 community activist workshops with participation of 5,025 persons were conducted and 90 exposure visits were facilitated for learning and experience sharing.
27. **Union Council Development Plans (UCDP):** All the completed 40 GIS based UCDPs are being implemented as per work plan targets. The developed five years UCDP used GIS maps and display all the existing features including location of villages, hamlets/Goths, roads, schools, drinking water facilities, health facilities, community halls etc. and the identified project and non-project needs. The GIS-based UCDP reports in addition to planning and implementation of community identified need-based Project interventions, are expected to assist the government in informed decision making for appropriate and rationalized investments and interventions for villages/communities. The plans have drawn the attention of the Planning and Development

Department and other concerned departments and the government plan to institutionalise UCDP process for planning and financing under the annual public sector development plan.

28. The Planning and Development Department and the Project have planned to launch the Union Council Development Plans in January 2025 to officially engage all the concerned line departments for resource allocation from Public Sector Development Plan 2025-2026.
29. **Economic Graduation of the ultra-poor, Women & Youth sub component:** The sub component, following a Poverty Graduation approach, supports ultra-poor and extremely poor households in BISP-PSC category 0-32 to increase their livelihood opportunities and incomes through the provision of productive assets, including assets management training, skills and vocational training for employment and enterprise development and facilitation of linkage to other sources of finance like commercial banks and interest free loan scheme of federal government. The target beneficiaries are selected through the BISP Poverty Score Card^[2].
30. **Productive Assets for Ultra-Poor:** All the target 8,500 beneficiaries for asset distribution have been identified and distribution of 4,000 productive assets (47% of the total target) have been achieved. Asset management training was provided to all the 4,000 beneficiaries. Women constitute 81% of the beneficiaries for the distributed productive assets against the target of 70%.
31. The Project has developed a critical mass of productive assets beneficiaries who can now be organized into producer groups for economies of scale and access to more profitable market options and private sector engagement. There is a need to pursue the poverty graduation approach as a continuous and dynamic process that continues to help target households to keep progressing on economic well-being ladder and helping beneficiaries of assets transfer and vocational training to organise into production groups and facilitating their access to finance and direct linkages to markets.
32. **Youth Job Market Readiness:** Based on the completed job market survey, market demand-based training needs and trades for employment and self-employment/entrepreneurship have been identified and MOUs with the University of Gwadar and Balochistan Technical Education and Vocation Training Authority (B-TEVTA) for implementation of training have been signed. All the target youth (2,000 including 1,525 women and 475 men) have been identified and selected through a screening process. The first batch of 149 trainees has been completed while 54 are currently enrolled (10% of the target for both completed and enrolled). Implementation performance of the sub component needs to be significantly improved to complete the training of the remaining 1,800 youth well before the completion of the project. In this regard, the Project shall assess whether the University of Gwadar and Balochistan Technical Education and Vocation Training Authority (B-TEVTA) will be able to accommodate the required number of trainees.
33. During the Mission's interaction with communities, some young women who completed training in trades for employment requested assistance for job placement. As a first step, the project and NRSP shall explore possibilities of paid internship preferably through NRSP own resources and opportunities at project supported value chains and infrastructure and job placement support.
34. **Women Empowerment:** Women empowerment is being pursued through community mobilisation processes for ensuring participation and 50% membership for women in CO/VO (actual 56%), ascertaining women development priorities at community and village level and specific targeted interventions. The specific interventions include distribution of 70% productive assets (actual 81%) along with nutrition and health packages developed with the assistance from WFP to women; at least 30% technical training opportunities for women; and short vocational courses for young girls and women in traditional embroidery and crafts, fish processing, and fishing net weaving and repair, digital trainings etc. The project will establish 40 Women Resource Centres (WRC) with a livelihood's proposal, at least one per Union Council, in very poor villages that have no public building or suitable private dwelling for women's joint activities.
35. All the 40 WRC have been identified and construction work on 33 WRCs out of total target of 40 (55%) has been initiated. Of these, 10 WRCs have been completed and handed over to the communities.
36. The Mission was very pleased to meet a group of very dynamic and enterprising women of one of the recently completed WRC. The Project and NRSP shall assist women members of WRCs for preparing livelihood and enterprise development plan and shall provide learning and knowledge sharing opportunities to members of the newly completed WRC through exchange visits to already well functioning WRC.
37. The Mission appreciates the project achievement of increasing number of women in leadership role in COs and VOs. According to the project reports, 57% VOs have women in leadership positions including president of VOs.
38. **Collaboration with FAO and WFP on Nutrition and Climate Change Resilience:** The project signed contracts with FAO and WFP in July 2023 and April 2023 respectively. Initial fund disbursement has been made to both the agencies to initiate the activities proposed in the respective work plans.
39. **FAO:** An estimated 30,000 smallholder farmers and herders (15,000 each) will be trained under outcome 1 - Targeted rural agriculture households adopt Climate Resilient Agriculture and Livestock (CRAL) practices. So far FAO has completed training of trainers (TOT) for 30 government nominated livestock and agriculture officers and has trained 4,239 persons in CRAL in 318 sessions through 170 Farmers Field Schools.
40. Under the outcome 2, preparation of draft Fisheries Policy and Legal framework has been completed and validation meeting of Technical Working Group is planned in the end of November 2024 for finalization of the document which will be followed by submission to the Cabinet for approval. Feedback and comments of IFAD have been incorporated and the final draft is expected to be completed in November 2024. The Project plans to initiate the process of cabinet approval and enactment by the Provincial Assembly in January 2025.

41. **WFP:** For improved HH level nutrition with a focus on women and children, WFP has delivered on two output indicators: (i) improved nutrition status of direct beneficiaries of GLLSP II through nutrition sensitisation, improved KAP (Knowledge, Attitudes and Practices) and developed Social and Behaviour Change Communication strategy (SBCC); and (ii) developed a multisectoral nutrition sensitive livelihoods strategy for the GLLSP II project. The documents have been received by PMU for further implementation.
42. WFP has completed KAP baseline. The Nutrition Sensitive Livelihoods Enhancement (NSLE) Strategy has been developed and SBCC strategy and Nutrition Counselling Modules have been prepared. Capacity building of 164 Community Resource Persons (CRP) as ToT is completed and 300 community health workers and 100 health facility-based staff have been trained. So far, the CRPs have been able to undertake a total of 4 rounds of monthly nutrition education sessions at community level, reaching 34,500 households through 9,760 sessions. WFP has started training 2,800 COs through CRPs. The number of COs to be trained has reduced as the total number of actual COs that are active at community level were less than projected in the project document.
43. Following the recommendation of IFAD Implementation Support Mission of June 2024 and agreement of the Planning and Development Department, both FAO and WFP have submitted their proposals for no-cost extension. The Mission recommends immediate review and signing of the revised agreements so as to speed up the implementation of the remaining activities.
44. **Social and Economic Infrastructures sub component:**
45. **Community Physical Infrastructure (CPI):** Implementation of CPIs is progressing well. The project in consultation with COs/VOs has identified and initiated 360 CPIs, which are about 41% of PDR targets (879) including 79 CPI under the Saudi Fund for Development (SFD). Of these, 173 CPIs have been completed while remaining 187 are in progress. Of the total 360 identified schemes, a large majority 69% (247) are drinking water supply schemes, as envisaged in PDR. While Solar Home System (SHS) constitutes 23% (103) and flood protection schemes 3% (10) of total initiated CPIs.
46. **Farm to Market Roads (FMR):** Work on 10 FMRs with a total length of about 40 km is in progress. The project has gained good momentum following the delays caused by unprecedented heavy rains and flooding during March/April 2024. As of October 2024, two roads are complete while all the roads awarded the work during 2023, except 3 roads for which work was awarded only in September 2024, will be completed by December 2024. The remaining 3 roads are planned to be completed by June 2025.
47. **Contract for the feasibility, design and supervision of Roads.** The mission noted that with the alignment of revised PC-I, the project will need to design and construct remaining 56 km of roads. Additionally, completion of ongoing roads is facing delays mainly because of unprecedented floods in early 2024 and deteriorated security situation in the project area. The contract for consulting services for feasibility, design, construction and supervision of 56 km roads would require extension as well as modification to conduct the construction supervision of ongoing roads of original scope of work, which have faced delays. The Project shall immediately obtain NO from IFAD for the contract extension and modification to include the remaining scope (feasibility, design and construction supervision) for the 56 km roads.
48. **Component 2: Fisheries Value Chain Development**
49. The objective of the component is to increase the income of the fisher folks as well as enhance the competitiveness of the Balochistan fishery value chain. Fisheries Value Chain Development aims at improving small fishing communities incomes (50,000 fisher-folks) through fisheries value chain package consisting of (i) establishment of Public Private and Producers Partnership (4P) (11 till MTR) involving professionally run fishing households' cooperatives, private sector led factories, middlemen and banks and Department of Fisheries; (ii) infrastructure development around construction of 3 jetties and allied infrastructure at prioritized sites, and Fish Market Access roads to link landing sites and jetties with factories and trunk roads; and (iii) support for fisheries policy formulation and Fisheries Department's capacity building and institutional strengthening.
50. In view of the significant financing shortfall between the allocated amount and the estimated cost of the detailed design of the planned three jetties, the IFAD Implementation Support Mission of June 2024 in consultation with the Planning and Development Department and the Project agreed to finance construction of one jetty at Ormara, which has been identified as a priority by the GoB, through unallocated amount and reallocation among the loan categories.
51. **Establish Fisheries 4Ps sub component:**
52. Out of the total target of 15 fisher folk cooperatives, 11 cooperatives (73%) comprising of 7,679 members have been established and registered with the Cooperative Department. The 4P business plans have been prepared and duly approved by the Review and Selection Committee. Six cooperatives have received start-up funds for the working capital and capital investments from the Project. Implementation activities have been initiated and evaluation of bids for boat procurement and landing site infrastructure development is currently in process. Under the 4P arrangement, cooperatives signed agreements with private processing companies, facilitating collective marketing and selling fish catches.
53. The Mission reviewed the 4P business plans. Comments of the mission shall be addressed and share with IFAD by 31 Jan 2025 for final review. Additionally, as the project progresses with the implementation of the 4P business plan, it has become necessary to update the 4P implementation manual to align with site-specific contractual arrangements, incorporate revised templates for formal agreements and ensure compliance with the project's community procurement guidelines and mechanisms.
54. All cooperative documents (business model, business plan, private sector contracts, etc.) are currently in English, limiting members' understanding. The project shall translate key documents into Urdu and/or local languages to ensure easy understanding and accessibility for all cooperative members.

55. **Strengthening of Fisher folk Cooperatives:** At the recommendation of previous IFAD Missions, the project is in the process of engaging a service provider for technical and managerial capacity building including governance, procurement, business orientation etc. The project shall complete the hiring process of the service provider by February 2025.
56. The Mission observed significant short fall in depositing the mandatory membership fee by the members of the cooperatives. The membership fee collection process needs to be completed by end of February 2025 with respect to six Cooperatives where Project funds have been transferred. For remaining 5 cooperatives, project funds shall only be released when all the members have met the obligation of depositing their membership fees. Project shall make sure the membership fee is deposited in cooperative accounts by 31 March 2025.
57. The tenure of the current executive body of the fisher folk cooperatives has matured. The project shall ensure compliance of all regulatory requirements like Annual General Body Meeting and annual audit for the 11 cooperatives which shall be fulfilled by 31 December 2024. The mission noted that cooperatives funds are currently maintained in current accounts. The cooperative accounts shall be converted to interest bearing saving accounts by 31 December 2024, for interest earnings.
58. **Economic Infrastructure for Fishery Value Chain Development sub component:**
59. **Construction of jetties and allied infrastructure:** The Checkers and Indenters – civil engineer, oceanographer/hydrographer and environment specialist, hired by the project for validating and vetting the feasibility, detailed design and other related reports of jetties that were completed by the design and supervision consultants (TUMAS) – completed the review process on 30 October 2024. The Checkers and Indenters have been in close contact with TUMAS throughout the review process for timely adjusting the original design for any likely changes in design features/SECAP measures. The final reports from Checkers and Indenters are expected by 11 November 2024^[3]. The mission advised the project to share these reports with the design consultant (TUMAS) for their final review and certification of acceptance on priority; and commence the bidding process the soonest.
60. With the expected completion of the review process by Checkers and Indenters for validating and vetting the feasibility and design reports by 20 November 2024, and more importantly the project completion date of June 2027, the tendering process and award of contract need to be completed latest by June 2025.
61. **Fish Market Access Roads (FAR):** The Project initiated construction of 12 FARs (80 km long) of road, of which 3 roads (9 km) have been completed while construction of remaining 9 roads (71 km) is ongoing. The completion of some of the roads, awarded in 2023, suffered delays due to unprecedented rains and floods during March/April 2024 and due to social and political unrest in few cases. Of the remaining 9 roads, the project is however committed to complete five FARs by December 2024. The remaining two by February 2025 and other two are scheduled to be completed by September 2025. The mission advised the project to extend the contract periods accordingly already expired in June/Oct 2024.
62. **Monitoring and Quality Assurance:** The mission visited some roads (in both districts) and had detailed interaction with the beneficiary communities and with the staff of contractors/design and supervision consultants. The mission was pleased to note that communities were consulted on the alignment, siting the cross-drainage structures, and construction schedule. The contractors' representatives maintained close liaison with the VOs/COs representatives for addressing any likely/potential issues related to employing labour/equipment etc. On quality assurance, the "Design and Supervision Consultants" apprised the mission on regular site visits by their field engineers, contractors' supervising/engineering staff, and conducting spot checks by PMU Infrastructure Specialists. In addition, material/workmanship related quality tests (including soil, aggregate, concrete, steel, bitumen, pavement and environmental tests) were performed for each road as per standard procedures/requirements.
63. **Outcome/Impact:** Though no formal study/data was readily available, however anecdotal evidence^[4] suggests promising benefits ranging from significant reduction (10-30%) in production losses (agriculture/fisheries); reduced travel time/transportation cost (30-50%), improved connectivity with the markets/fish processing plants, and better access to education and health care facilities. The accrued benefits are helping the poor farmers/fisher folks towards increased income/saving due to lower input costs and relatively higher selling price for their agriculture/fisheries produce. The observed positive impacts have totally changed the scenario prior to road construction where the fish catch^[5] was mainly carried on donkey carts, vulnerable and exposed to direct sunlight and other contaminating elements for at least one to two hours before reaching the processing plants. Now the provision of proper black-top roads has encouraged motorized and efficient transportation, adding to quality, reducing wastage and allowing better returns for fisher folks. The forthcoming MTR EFA will further testify these accrued benefits to the community with quantified performance indicators like IRR, NPV and B/C ratio.
64. **SECAP:** Project is proactively following an inclusive approach by mainstreaming women, youth and marginalized fisheries communities and integrating SECAP requirements prior and during the implementation of activities. The mission noted that all infrastructure activities including CPs, roads and jetties^[6] are largely complying with the SECAP requirements. All roads have robust design features to cater climatic and environmental impacts. Both FAO and WFP have developed their respective capacity building curricula considering SECAP aspects. The forty UCDPs developed have exclusive sections on SECAP requirements. The 4P business plans for fisheries cooperatives also ensure quality of fish and clean environment during entire value chain.
65. **Capacity building and institutional strengthening:** After receipt of NO from IFAD the project signed agreement with Lasbela University of Agriculture, Water and Marine Sciences for capacity building of the fisheries department in specific areas including development of fisheries inspection manual and guidelines, stock management, sustainable management practices, development of post-harvest curricula and development of SOPs for research laboratory.
66. **Proposal for Fish Catch Data Collection:** In view of unreliability of manually collected fish catch data tools at the landing site level, the Department of Fisheries requested support for an online data collection/MIS including software and hardware equipment. The department has prepared a detailed proposal for online data collection tool at an estimated cost of US\$ 300,000.

The proposal is within the scope of the Project under the capacity building and institutional strengthening sub component of the Fisheries Value Chain Development Component and the Policy Support and Advocacy sub component of the Project Management and Policy Support Component. The Mission supports the proposal and recommends that the Project shall include the required financial provision in their formal request for reallocation of loan categories and obtain PSC approval.

67. **Hatcheries and Innovative Aquaculture:** The Fisheries Department has submitted the PC-1 for establishing shrimp hatchery and grow out tanks for seed production at Lasbela University existing Marine Research Laboratory at Damb. The PC-1 proposal is currently being reviewed by the PMU.

68. **Component 3: Project Management and Policy Support**

69. **Project Management:**

70. The Project Management Unit (PMU) and the two district Project Implementation Units (PIU) are fully operational. The positions of Gender Mainstreaming Officer, Environmentalist, Procurement Assistant, MIS Officer and Admin and Finance Assistant in PMU and District Coordinator, Fisheries Value Chain Officer, 2 Business Support Facilitator in Project Implementation Units are vacant. The Project shall complete recruitment of all the key staff by end February 2025.

71. The mission had some difficulties to gather the required information and data from single source in the PMU. The project needs to better organise with clear duties, responsibilities and record keeping for each the key staff of PMU. To streamline the functioning of the PMU and enhance efficiency, there is a need to prepare TORs for the key staff and assign dedicated focal persons for each of the key functions of PMU.

72. The MTR of the project is due by June 2025 and in this regard, the project is in process of hiring the firm for conducting Midline Survey. The agreed timeline includes the inception report by 25 January, completion of survey by 25 February and the draft report ready by mid-March 2025 before the inception of MTR mission.

73. **Policy Support and Advocacy:**

74. **Balochistan Sustainable Fisheries Policy and Regulatory Framework:** The Project is progressing well on the Balochistan Sustainable Fisheries Policy and Regulatory Framework (Rules and Bill) which is being developed by FAO through a consultative process involving a working group consisting of representatives of Federal and Provincial Government and fisher folks. Feedback on the draft documents from the Working Group/stakeholders, IFAD and FAO consultants have been incorporated and the final draft is expected to be completed in November 2024. The Project plans to initiate the process of cabinet approval and enactment by the Provincial Assembly in January 2025.

75. **Balochistan Nutrition Policy:** In view of the long-standing strategic partnerships between WFP and the Government of Balochistan on issues relating to food security and nutrition, the Project and WFP discussed and agreed to include the preparation of Provincial Nutrition Policy for Balochistan in the proposal for no cost extension of agreement with WFP. The no cost extension proposal is expected to be concluded in December 2024.

76. The Project shall expedite initiation of work on the remaining Youth Development Policy Action Plan and Climate Resilience and Mitigation for Agriculture Action Plan based on the National Policy for Climate Change mitigation and resilience.

77. [1] Project pointed out that there are 358 Revenue Villages and accordingly coverage stands at 100%. The log frame will be modified during MTR.

78. [2] The project is using updated National Socio-Economic Registry (NSER) data for targeting of HHs. As a major social safety net programme by the Government of Pakistan, the Benazir Income Support Programme (BISP) maintains a National Socioeconomic Registry (NSER) - a database of information about the socioeconomic status and welfare of poor households across the country. The registry was set up as a result of a Poverty Scorecard Survey (PSC) conducted in 2010 and updated in 2019. The data were then used to determine beneficiaries' identification and eligibility for BISP's 'Unconditional Cash Transfer (UCT) Payments'.

79. [3] Later the project confirmed that the reports from C&I have since been received to PMU.

80. [4] Discussion with various stakeholders.

81. [5] Agriculture produce also use to experience similar conditions.

82. [6] Feasibility and design studies.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Feasibility studies/design of jetties and allied infrastructure 4	PMU/IFAD No	04/2024
Award of contract for construction of selected/approved jetties	Objection	

<p>Start of construction of jetties by August 2024</p> <p>Project shall strictly follow the time for each step (validation of design, approval of PC-1, procurement of construction contractors), leading to the timely start of construction by August 2024</p>	PMU	08/2024
<p>Capacity building of Fisheries Value Chain Team</p> <p>Training of the VC team in business planning including financial budgeting, cooperative governance and leadership, networking and partnership building</p>	PMU	10/2024
<p>Revision of Contract with NRSP</p> <p>Revise contract with NRSP for remaining activities under Community Development Component and obtain NO from IFAD for the modification of NRSP contract to include remaining scope</p>	PMU	11/2024
<p>No-cost extension of Agreements with FAO and WFP</p> <p>Complete review of proposals and sign the revised agreements</p>	PMU/WFP/FAO	11/2024
<p>Completion of on-going Farm to Market Roads and Contract for Design of Remaining Roads - 2</p> <p>Obtain IFAD NO for extension of the existing contract for consulting services for feasibility, design, construction and supervision of the remaining 56km of roads and modifications to original scope of work as construction/supervision of ongoing roads have faced delays due to unprecedented floods and security situation</p>	PMU	11/2024
<p>Validation of Jetty Design, tendering and award of contract</p> <p>Share the final Checkers and Indenters reports for validation of jetty design and with the feasibility and design consultant (TUMAS) and obtain their final review and approval/certification</p>	PMU	11/2024
<p>Capacity building and institutional strengthening</p> <p>Focus on capacity building and institutional strengthening support and start of work on related activities.</p>	PMU/Fisheries Department	12/2024
<p>Improved Implementation of Youth Job Market Readiness</p> <p>Assign a focal person in the PMU for management of implementation of the activity - by end November 24 Implementation of sub component needs to be enhanced in terms of the number of trainings. In this regard, assess capacities of the University of Gwadar and Balochistan Technical Education and Vocation Training Authority (B-TEVTA) for timely completion of training of the required target - by end December 24 The Project and NRSP shall explore possibilities of paid internship for the young women who completed training for employment, preferably through NRSP own resources and opportunities at project supported value chains and infrastructure and job placement support - on a continuous basis</p>	PMU/NRSP	12/2024
<p>Compliance of regulatory requirements of Cooperatives</p> <p>The Project shall ensure the Annual General Body Meeting and election of executive bodies for the 11 Cooperatives</p>	PMU	12/2024
<p>Cooperatives bank accounts</p> <p>The cooperative accounts shall be converted to interest bearing saving accounts for interest earnings</p>	PMU	12/2024
<p>Recruitment of Staff and Enhanced Efficiency of PMU - 2</p> <p>Prepare detailed TORs for all the key staff of the PMU and assign focal persons for each of the key activities.</p>	PMU	12/2024

Capacity building of Fisherfolk cooperatives Complete the engagement of service provider for capacity building	PMU	02/2025
Fisheries Catch Data Collection Tool/MIS Allocate and transfer the requested amount of US\$ 300,000 under the capacity building and institutional strengthening of the Fisheries department.	PMU	02/2025
Recruitment of Staff and Enhanced Efficiency of PMU Complete recruitment process for all the vacant positions.	PMU	02/2025
Initiate action Youth Policy and Climate Resilience and Mitigation Action Plans Complete engagement of technical assistance for Youth Development Policy and Action Plan and Climate Resilience and Mitigation for Agriculture Action Plan based on the National Policy for Climate Change mitigation and resilience	PMU	03/2025
Completion of Mid-line Survey Completion of survey by 25 February and the draft report ready by mid-March 2025	PMU	03/2025
Completion of on-going Farm to Market Roads and Contract for Design of Remaining Roads Complete all the 6 ongoing roads by June 2025	PMU	06/2025
Validation of Jetty Design, tendering and award of contract - 2 Complete award of contract for construction of jetty (Ormara)	PMU	06/2025
Capacity Building of Members of WRCs Assist members of WRCs for preparing livelihood and enterprise development plan and provide learning and knowledge sharing opportunities to members of the newly completed WRC through exchange visits to already well functioning WRC - on a continuous basis	NRSP	

E. Project implementation

a. Development Effectiveness

Effectiveness and Developmental Focus

Effectiveness	Rating: 4	Previous rating: 4
----------------------	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

83. Rated as moderately satisfactory. Project implementation performance has consistently improved since November 2022 culminating in its exiting problem status at the end of 2023. Project interventions are responding effectively to the communities' social and economic development priorities and outcomes. Project is pursuing a participatory, pro-poor, pro-women and pro-youth approach in an effective manner. Household and community needs, capacities and priorities are identified and implemented through CDD approach. The assets transfers are providing livelihood enhancement opportunities to the ultra and extremely poor households. CPIs have been highly relevant to community needs, particularly for provision of safe water and solar energy in an area facing serious challenge on both counts. The PDR-set criteria of fishermen operating through small boats is applied for membership of fisherfolk cooperatives. The theory of change remains valid which the PMU is applying coherently and holistically.

Log-Frame Analysis & Main Issues of Effectiveness

84. Based on the recommendations of IFAD Missions, the discrepancies in the project PC-1 and IFAD PDR and log frame pertaining to changes in targets has been resolved.

85. The current beneficiary household (HH) outreach is 48% of the total 100,500 HH with 228,000 persons. The women beneficiaries

constitute 56% of current total outreach.

86. **Outcomes:** Project's progress against the log frame indicators thus far is commendable given the challenges posed by the project context/area. Internal data collection and assessment by the project suggests a commendable 57% of achievement against the target of 72,800 for households reporting improved physical access to market. The 11 established/supported rural producers' organizations are being engaged in formal partnerships/agreements or contracts with public or private entities, thus ensuring effectiveness of the project interventions. More than 70% of the physical target is expected to be achieved at the end of the fiscal year. The intermediate output indicators in the log frame demonstrate that progress is being made in implementation of all activities and sub components as indicated in above section D.
87. There is, however, lack of some clarity with the log frame indicators with respect to outreach and certain outputs and outcomes indicators, and certain data reported earlier against outreach indicators, in particular, need correction and adjustment. Besides, certain outcomes indicators require output indicators e.g., Nutrition needs a couple of output indicators with specific targets assigned for tracking nutrition specific progress.
88. Evaluation of EOIs (expression of interest) is in process for the Mid-line Evaluation/outcome based survey. In view of the planned Mid-Term Review of the Project occurring in 2025, the survey needs to be completed in early 2025.
89. A baseline KAP survey conducted by the WFP in 2023 highlight the need for development of a comprehensive SBCC strategy that should cover both nutrition sensitive and nutrition specific aspects.
90. GLLSP II has developed a critical mass of assets transfer beneficiaries. As a next step, there is need to focus on the consolidation of the gains by pursuing the Poverty Graduation approach as a continuous and dynamic process to assist the beneficiary HH to move to the next level through formation and strengthening of common interest groups for becoming production centres, aggregation, access to markets and private sector engagement which ultimately could lead to value chain development.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Poverty graduation approach as a continuous and dynamic process Continuously assist the productive assets transfer beneficiaries and vocational training to organise into production groups around specific products and facilitating their access to finance and direct linkages to markets - on a continuous basis	PMU	

Development Focus

Targeting and Outreach

Rating: 5

Previous rating: 5

Justification of rating

91. Rated as satisfactory. All the 40 Union Councils and 358 Revenue Villages have footprints of community institutions. The project continues to effectively apply BISP-PSC data as a primary tool for community mobilisation and initial identification of eligible HH; followed by wealth ranking and community profiling; physical verification; and CO/VO validation for the final selection of HH. Gender and Youth targeting ensures following specific quota across components. The current beneficiary household (HH) outreach is 48% of the total 100,500 HH. Women beneficiaries constitute 56% of current total outreach against PDR target of 50% and 81% recipients of productive assets are women against the target of 70%.

Main issues

92. The time-tested primary selection criteria of BISP-PSC is rigorously used for identification and selection of eligible HH. However, the data does not reflect the current status of all households and in a number of cases errors of omissions have also been observed. The National Socio-Economic Registry (NSER)/BISP-PSC was last updated in 2019 and currently there is no system in place for periodic updating of the data. There is a provision for inclusion of the left out eligible households in NSER registry data base but the screening and decision of inclusion is a long process which is outside the Project control.
93. The excluded households who are identified through wealth ranking/poverty profiling and community validation and are determined as eligible for relevant project interventions are only considered for membership of the CO/VO and benefit only from community level activities like CPI and capacity building/sensitization of COs. The Mission would like to reiterate earlier recommendation that subject to verification through the NRSP wealth ranking and validation by community forum (CO/VO), the eligible HH shall be considered for livelihood interventions like assets and skills development.
94. Project Implementation Units in project targeted districts (Lasbela and Gwadar) carry out regular monitoring to ensure compliance of the Project targeting approach and validation of the implementation of the project implementation

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
<p>Inclusion of eligible HH in income generating activities like assets transfer and skills development - on a continuous basis</p> <p>Eligible HH either not included in BISP-PSC data or whose poverty status may have changed since the time the survey was conducted shall be considered for livelihood related interventions subject to verification through wealth ranking and validation by community</p>	NRSP	

Gender equality & women's participation

Rating: 5

Previous rating: 5

Justification of rating

95. Rated as satisfactory. The project/NRSP is pursuing gender equality and women participation through dedicated Gender Strategy, following the three strategic objectives of IFAD's policy on Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment (GEWE), for their participation through CO/VO membership, targeted interventions and empowerment. The project has demonstrated its strong focus on women, who are the majority beneficiaries for some activities, or benefit from established quotas for others. Increasing number of women are undertaking management role in COs/VOs and fisherfolk cooperatives. Women are specifically consulted to identify their challenges, needs and opportunities and the project prioritizes women for asset transfer, collects sex disaggregated data and consults women members in VO/COs for selection of CPI scheme.

Main issues

96. The project social mobilisation process, strong gender focus and managerial/leadership capacity building is increasingly encouraging and promoting women leadership role in COs/VOs. Despite the cultural, economic, and social barriers, women leaders are emerging as powerful agents of change and empowerment. According to the Project reports, 204 VO's out of 358 (57%) are headed by women as its president.
97. The project has been successful to achieve and exceed women specific targets under Community Development and promoting opportunities for women under Fisheries Value Chain Development components. Women form the majority in the community organizations (56% against the target of 50%) and are actively involved in the selection of the project-funded CPI schemes. Around 81% of the productive asset distribution beneficiaries are women against the target of 70%. Productive assets include livestock, fishing nets, small boats and support for setting up tuck shops. These assets are distributed as per the needs identified by women for themselves and their respective households.
98. To date, the Project has initiated construction work on 33 Women Resource Centres (WRC) out of the total target of 40 (82%) and 10 have been completed and handed over to the communities. These centres serve as the meeting place, education/training centres for income generation like kitchen gardening, food preservation, traditional crafts, nutrition, enterprise development etc. The Mission was pleased to meet a highly motivated and dynamic group of women members of a newly completed WRC. There is a need for appropriate assistance to initiate activities of common interest and commercial nature. NRSP shall augment business mobilisation around each WRC and ensure development of business plan and road maps for WRCs. Additionally, exchange visits shall be organised between WRC members for learning and sharing of experiences.
99. The three objectives of IFAD's GEWE policy (economic empowerment, voice and decision making, equitable workloads) are well covered and addressed by project interventions. Women hold office-bearer positions at CO, VO and LSO level and have received training and capacity-building by the project for successful management of organisations. Women are particularly consulted for identification of suitable productive assets and CPI like of water collection points for the drinking water supply CPIs, implying their voice and decision making and control and access over fundamental assets being provided under the project interventions (individual and community level).
100. Mission observed outcomes of project interventions in terms of enhanced income generating opportunities through productive assets distributions and reduction of women's workload and time due to availability of drinking water facility/CPI close to their dwellings. Livestock as an asset account for about 77% of the total assets distributed and since women traditionally play an important role in activities dealing with livestock management and marketing in the smallholder household, the income derived from livestock related activities is mostly kept by the women. This activity is not only resulting in increased income but more importantly, contributes to women empowerment in terms of improved social status and decision-making influence.

Agricultural Productivity

Rating: N/A

Nutrition

Rating: 4

Previous rating: 3

Justification of rating

101. Rated as moderately satisfactory. The increase in the rating of the project from 3 to 4 is informed by the achievement of the recommendations from the previous mission. WFP has setup the foundational pillars for the nutrition activities of the Project, which is commendable. WFP has been able to undertake a KAP Baseline survey, developed the nutrition sensitive livelihood strategy, developed the social and behaviour change communication strategy and developed four nutrition training modules (on health, personal wellbeing, gardening and poultry).

Main issues

WFP has completed KAP baseline: Nutrition Sensitive Livelihoods Enhancement (NSLE) Strategy developed and SRCC strategy

102. WFP has completed a baseline, nutrition sensitive Livelihoods Enhancement (NLE) strategy developed and CBCC strategy and Nutrition Counselling Modules has been prepared. Capacity building of 164 Community Resource Persons (CRPs) as ToT is completed and 300 community health workers and 100 health facility-based staff have been trained. So far the CRPs have undertaken a total of 4 rounds of monthly nutrition education sessions at community level, reaching 34,500 households through 9,760 sessions. WFP has also started training 2,800 COs through the CRPs.
103. Following the recommendation of IFAD Implementation Support Mission of June 2024 and agreement of the Planning and Development Department, WFP has submitted a proposal for no-cost extension. The Mission recommends immediate review and signing of the revised agreements by 31 November 2024 so as to speed up the implementation of the remaining activities.
104. The proposal also includes assisting the Government of Balochistan in preparation of Provincial Nutrition Policy. WFP has planned an extra 10 rounds of monthly community-based nutrition sessions in the no-cost extension requested (up to October 2025). An endline KAP survey is also scheduled for October 2025.
105. The nutrition training package for CRPs that has been developed is health centric (nutrition specific messages), and this limits the linkages between agriculture and better nutrition outcomes which aims to improve consumption of healthy diets by enhancing nutrition sensitive agriculture and nutrition sensitive value chains messages. In order to strengthen these linkages, WFP will need to revise the major topics and key messages in the nutrition training package, so as to increase the focus on food-based approaches to nutrition. This may include topics on health and nutrition benefits of locally available foods, food preparation, recipes development, food handling and safety at household level, family feeding, food storage and preservation etc. Further to this, the nutrition training package for CRPs and the four nutrition training modules for communities need to be accompanied by practical engagement at community level (i.e. showing practically 'how to do' the key messages). The guidance as it stands now is more theoretical (therefore impacting knowledge); and less practical (which needs to impact attitudes and practices).
106. There are limited linkages between the different project activities managed by different organizations and entities. For example, the fisheries component and farmer field school's component of the project would highly benefit from nutrition integration into their fisher folks and farmer trainings respectively. Furthermore, the recommendations provided in the nutrition sensitive livelihood strategy need to be implemented by the other project sectors. Therefore, project management teams need to be sensitized on the strategy and provided with practical key value chain- specific nutrition messages that will be integrated on their trainings. This also means that coordination of the different project components needs to be improved.
107. WFP will be involved in the project until October 2025. Thereafter, the project through NRSP will continue with implementation of the nutrition activities. There are concerns over the sustainability of the activities, especially when it comes to the frequency and quality of nutrition training that will be carried out by CRPs to communities. Currently the project provides a small stipend to CRPs when they are undertaking community trainings, and this motivates them. However, with termination of this support in October 2025, there may be challenges. Broader discussions with the government are required, in terms of operationalizing a feasible transition strategy and enhancing sustainability of activities beyond the project life.
108. Fisheries Value Chain Development can also help in improving the healthy diet consumption both through income generation and availability of fish in households' diet. In this regard 11 professionally run fishing households' cooperatives are being established.
109. The project log frame has not been updated with the nutrition indicators (i.e. MDDW, KAP indicators). PMU needs to either share the log frame with the partners to be updating it directly; or frequently follow up and update the data.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Integrate nutrition sensitive agriculture messages in the training manual and community modules Strengthen integration of nutrition sensitive messages (i.e. food-based approaches to nutrition) into the current CRP nutrition training manual and nutrition counselling modules for community trainings	WFP/ PMU	12/2024
Nutrition data collection and logframe update Periodically update of the logframe with relevant nutrition data and follow IFAD COI surveys for nutrition outcome indicators (MDDW, KAP).	PMU and WFP	12/2024
Sensitize project partners and government departments on the nutrition sensitive livelihood strategy WFP to sensitize the project partners on the key actions in the strategy- especially related to the value chains targeted by the project	WFP/PMU	02/2025

Adaptation to Climate Change

Rating: 4

Previous rating: 4

Justification of rating

110. Rated as moderately satisfactory. Project is well integrating climate adaptation measures into ongoing activities. All 360 initiated CPIs have been assessed through ES&C screening checklists for climate and associated impacts, and the choice of infrastructure responds to the communities' adaptation needs. Similarly, to cater climatic impacts, all roads have robust design features such as provision of efficient drainage (culverts); flood protection works (retaining walls) and slope stabilization to avoid

soil erosion and land protection. The design and feasibility of jetty and allied infrastructure has been completed and has taken into account the climate change impact from cyclones and tsunamis, etc. Likewise adequate SECAP linkages were observed in other project activities. The requirements of SECAP have also been made part of 4P business plans for ensuring quality of fish and clean environment during the entire value chain.

Main issues

111. The prioritisation of Community Physical Infrastructure has taken into consideration the communities' climate change adaptation needs. The project has identified and initiated 360 CPIs (41% of target of 879). Of these, 173 CPIs have been completed while remaining 187 are in progress. Of the total 360 identified schemes, a large majority 69% (247) are drinking water supply schemes, Solar Home System (SHS) constitutes 23% (103) and flood protection schemes 3% (10).
112. One Jetty will be constructed in Ormara (Gwadar). The design and feasibility carried out by hired firm of jetty and allied infrastructure has taken into account the climate change impact from cyclones and tsunamis, etc. Project has hired civil engineer, oceanographer/hydrographer and environment specialist (called Checkers and Indenters) for validating and vetting the feasibility, detailed design and other related reports of jetties.
113. Under FAO partnership with GLLSP II, FAO through Farmer Field School (FFS) approach has completed training of trainers (TOT) for 30 government nominated livestock and agriculture officers and has trained 4,239 persons in CRAL in 318 sessions through 170 Farmers Filed Schools. The aim is to support rural agriculture households in adopting Climate Resilient Agriculture and Livestock (CRAL) practices.
114. Under the same partnership with FAP, the draft Fisheries Policy and Legal framework has been completed which provide clear guidance to fisher folks community adaptation to changing climate. The final framework will be submitted to the Cabinet for approval and subsequent enactment of law by the Provincial Assembly in first quarter of 2025.
115. The ongoing institutional strengthening of the Fisheries Department will likewise enhance adaption capacity in the coastal area. The proposal for online data collection/MIS will address the unreliability of manually collected fish catch data tools at the landing site level.
116. Despite integrating the climate adaptation measures in the documentation and implementing in the field, the reporting with evidence on these measures are weak. The mission struggled to gather the required information through discussions and interactions with various stakeholders (PMU/NRSP/FAO/WFP and design and supervision consultants) and through physically visiting the sites. The project needs to document SECAP related data and mainstream such reporting in all progress review documents. While addressing the impacts of climate change was not a specific objective of the project, all the interventions in first two components directly and indirectly contribute to building up the adaptation and resilience capacities of communities, the environment they live in and the natural resources they draw upon for sustenance and livelihood, both in fisheries and agriculture farming.

b. Sustainability and Scaling up

Institutions and Policy Engagement	Rating: 4	Previous rating: 4
------------------------------------	-----------	--------------------

Justification of rating

117. Rated as moderately satisfactory. The project design provides opportunities for institutional development and support to the government on key policy issues. Noteworthy the project has shown policy successes which include progress on institutionalisation of Community Driven Development (CDD) approach for rural development planning process in the government Public Sector Development Programme and resource allocations; near finalisation of the first ever Fisheries Policy and Legal framework of the province; initiatives to support strengthening of Fisheries Department; and provision of enabling environment for a holistic fisheries 4Ps model of value chain development. Establishment and capacity building of community level institutions is being pursued through social mobilisation under Community Development Component.

Main issues

118. **Institutionalisation of the CDD approach to Rural Development:** The objective of the activity is to facilitate the institutionalization of the CDD approach in the ongoing decentralization context in Balochistan. This is being pursued through the process of Union Council Development Plan (UCDP) approach to demonstrate an institutionalized system for the transfer of public sector development funding to community/village organizations through participatory planning involving communities, public and private service providers. The GIS based completed five-year UCDP have drawn the attention of the Planning and Development and other concerned departments, and the Planning and Development Department and the Project have planned to launch the Union Council Development Plans reports in January 2025 to officially engage all the concerned line departments for resource allocation from Public Sector Development Plan 2025-2026.
119. **4P Model for Fisheries Value Chain Development:** The project is providing support for establishment of market-driven 4Ps for fisheries value chains involving professionally run cooperatives with a market driven business model and business plan. The project has successfully achieved partnerships engaging fisher folk, the government and the private sector. Under the 4P arrangement, six cooperatives signed agreements with private processing companies, facilitating collective marketing and selling fish catches. The partnerships is expected to address the current sub-optimal performance of the sector, as well as the poor returns for the small fisher folk.
120. **Strengthening of public sector capacities:** The project signed agreement with Lasbela University of Agriculture, Water and Marine Sciences for capacity building of the Fisheries Department in development of fisheries inspection manual and guidelines,

stock management, sustainable management practices, post-harvest curricula and development of SOPs for research laboratory. Based on the proposal of the Fisheries Department, the project will support an online fish catch data collection/MIS including software and hardware equipment.

121. **Policy Support and Advocacy:** Formulation of a comprehensive sustainable Fisheries Management Policy and Legal Framework is in the final stages of completion, in partnership with FAO. The process for presentation of the policy for Cabinet approval and enactment by the Provincial Assembly is expected in January 2025. The Project and WFP have agreed to include the preparation of Provincial Nutrition Policy for Balochistan in the proposal for no cost extension of agreement with WFP.

Partnership-building	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 4
-----------------------------	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

122. Rated as satisfactory. Rating improved on account of effective coordination, qualitative improvements and achievement of partnerships with private sector, cooperatives, marketing institutions and other line departments. The project has fostered effective partnerships with key implementation partners like NRSP, Fisheries Department, WFP, FAO, private sector and community institutions. A key achievement is the facilitation of agreements of the fisherfolk cooperatives with reputable private companies at six landing sites, outlining collaborative arrangements for the sales and marketing of fish catch from new and upgraded boats at premium prices and ensuring cool chain facilitation to guarantee quality fish supply to the factory. Additionally, the project is currently brokering partnership between cooperatives and companies to optimize boat operations and revenue distribution

Main issues

123. Partnership and coordination have improved greatly between the project and the Department of Fisheries and the department is playing its due role in formation of fisher folk cooperatives and preparation of 4P business plans; creating an enabling environment for the successful 4P framework for the fisheries value chain development in terms of the legal status and functioning of fisheries cooperatives and jetties/landing sites; and sustainable fisheries management.
124. The initiatives to strengthen the capacities of the Fisheries Department would contribute to the development of fisheries sectors in terms of quantity and quality of fish catch particularly to respond to international quality norms for export; sustainable management of marine fisheries resources; and increase the income of the fisher folk.
125. NRSP implementation performance has been continuously improving which is demonstrated in achievement of target under the community development component and focus on women and youth development and empowerment.
126. After delayed start on implementation of the respective activities of FAO and WFP, their performance has appreciably improved during 2024 (see details on section D of this report).

Human and Social Capital and Empowerment	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 4
-------------------------------------------------	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

127. Rated as satisfactory. Human and social capital development and empowerment is an area of strength of the Project. A vast network of community human and social capital has been built through establishing COs/VOs (3,016 COs and 358 VO) and their capacities built through managerial and technical trainings. Community driven model involves participation of poor households and community institutions in all aspects of project planning; ensuring inclusive development, ownership and sustainability of the intervention. Women and youth have been specifically and successfully targeted for a range of capacity building and income generation activities. Women representation in decision-making positions at CO/VO has been increasing which is leading to their self-confidence and empowerment. Establishment and support of Fisher folk cooperatives are greatly helping in equitable empowerment of fisher folks while strengthening sustainability and enabling environment for the successful 4P framework for the fisheries value chain development. The project interventions are enabling the beneficiaries, particularly women, youth and fisher folks, to have increased control over economic relations.

Main issues

128. The Project's community capacity building activities include training of 4,215 (64% of the target) VO/CO Managers; 462 Village Resource Persons (105% of the target); and 50 public sector staff in preparation of Union Council Development Plans. Additionally, 248 community activist workshops with participation of 5,025 persons were conducted and 90 exposure visits were facilitated for learning and experience sharing.
129. Most of the COs/VOs are moving towards achieving institutional maturity with very active and dynamic leadership. A strong sense of ownership and control over local and project resources was observed by the Mission. Women development and empowerment is ensured through at least 50% representation in community institution (actual 56%) and strong gender focus and capacity building is promoting women leadership role in COs/VOs. Currently, 57% women are in leadership/managerial positions of 204 VO out of 358. The Women Resource Centers (10 completed so far out of 40) will be an important tool for women empowerment and human and social capital development.
130. All the 4,000 beneficiaries (47% of the total target) who received productive assets have received asset management training.
131. Under the Climate Resilient Agriculture and Livestock (CRAL) practices, FAO has completed training of trainers (TOT) for 30 government nominated livestock and agriculture officers and has trained 4,239 persons in CRAL in 318 sessions through 170

Farmers Filed Schools under outcome1 of GLLSP II-FAO partnership.

132. The draft Fisheries Policy and Legal framework has been completed and its enactment will empower the fisher folks and create a base for social capital. The Project plans to initiate the process of cabinet approval and enactment by the Provincial Assembly in first quarter 2025.
133. Human empowerment is also ensured through improved HH level nutrition with a focus on women and children, WFP has delivered on two output indicators: (i) improved nutrition status of direct beneficiaries of GLLSP II through nutrition sensitisation, improved KAP (Knowledge, Attitudes and Practices) and developed Social and Behaviour Change Communication strategy (SBCC); and (ii) developed a multisectoral nutrition sensitive livelihoods strategy for the GLLSP II project. The Capacity building of 164 Community Resource Persons (CRP) as ToT is completed and 300 community health workers and 100 health facility-based staff have been trained. So far, the CRPs have been able to undertake a total of 4 rounds of monthly nutrition education sessions at community level, reaching 34,500 households through 9,760 sessions. WFP has started training 2,800 COs through CRPs.
134. The contributing factors for human and social capital development and empowerment are the project approach of inclusiveness which ensures participation of the extremely and ultra poor HH (BISP-PSC category 0-32) through their inclusion in COs/VOs as members; establishment of fisher folks cooperatives; trainings through FFS and capacity building of community health workers through CRP; participatory household and community need assessment, identification of priorities and planning and implementation of identified interventions; managerial and technical capacity building; and other specific livelihood and training activities for women and youth.
135. The project is lagging behind on youth job market training. Implementation performance needs to be significantly improved to complete the training of the remaining 1,800 youth (out of the 2,000 target). In this regard, the Project shall assess whether the University of Gwadar and Balochistan Technical Education and Vocation Training Authority (B-TEVTA) will be able to accommodate the required number of trainees.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Customised capacity building training for women leaders NRSP shall design and implement customised trainings for women in leadership positions to enhance their confidence and development vision and to further nurture and develop their leadership potential	NRSP	03/2025

Quality of Project Target Group Engagement and Feedback

Rating: 4

Previous rating: 4

Justification of rating

136. Rated as moderately satisfactory. The mission observed and confirmed a direct and active involvement of households and community engagement and responsiveness of the project and implementation partners in all project interventions. The participatory approach followed by the project involves community institutions and its members in all aspects of project cycle i.e., identification, planning, implementation, and management. The extreme and vulnerable poor and women headed households identified and selected through the BISP-PSC data and validation process are assisted through livelihood investment plans and distribution of productive assets. The Mission noted institutional maturity, strong ownership, commitment and a sense of pride at beneficiary level. The project has a functional grievance redressal mechanism in place at both PMU and NRSP level, but the feedback loop is still to be closed.

Main issues

137. NRSP, which is a specialised social mobilisation institution, applies a well-defined and strong social mobilization process for household and community engagement and the use of BISP-PSC data, wealth ranking, physical verification and community validation for identification and selection of beneficiaries for formation of COs/VO. The project approach of inclusiveness ensures participation of the extremely and ultra poor HH, while women and youth have been specifically and successfully targeted for a range of capacity building and income generation activities.
138. Project activities are demand-driven and tailored to target groups' specific needs. The project adopts a comprehensive CDD, participatory approach that actively involves community organisations and its members in all aspects of project cycle i.e., identification, planning, implementation, and management. The approach followed by the project empowers the target group by putting responsibility for decision making and investments in their hands through the process of Village and Union Council level Development Planning. This is the basis for all project interventions, including CPIs, roads, assets provision, training, entrepreneurship and 4P business plans.
139. Significant progress has been achieved in engagement of fisher folk cooperative particularly the recent partnerships with private sector processing companies. However, there is a pressing need for continuous engaging with all members of the cooperative for ensuring a buy in and very clear understanding of the roles and responsibilities and terms of agreements by each party i.e., project/public sector, cooperative/producers and private sector.
140. The project has developed complaint redressal mechanisms at VO and CO level. At VO level an information notice (Urdu and English language) for complaints is displayed by NRSP in its district office which carries email, fax, mobile phone number (WhatsApp) and address of NRSP head office. At CO level, each member receives information (WhatsApp number) for registering complaints as part of the asset transfer form (Urdu language). The mission has observed that the complaints being

made by community members are being recorded manually in a complaint register by NRSP staff and subsequently addressed. However, this information is not being systematically analysed for performance management and improvement.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
<p>Strengthening of Complaint and Redressal mechanism</p> <p>PMU has complaint and redressal mechanism and same is in place in NRSP, however information is not being shared and analysed systematically. The project needs to strengthen the flow of information and redressal mechanism between NRSP and the project/PMU.</p>	PMU/ NRSP	03/2025
<p>Clarity of role and responsibilities of fisherfolk cooperatives stakeholders</p> <p>Continuous engaging with all members of the cooperatives for ensuring a buy in and very clear understanding of the roles and responsibilities and terms of agreements by each party i.e., project/public sector, cooperative/producers and private sector - on a continuous basis</p>	PMU	

Responsiveness of Service Providers

Rating: 5

Previous rating: 5

Justification of rating

141. Rated as satisfactory. The project has established strong, responsive and accountable partnerships with all service providers and collaboration and coordination has consistently improved and is functioning well. The project service provider including community institutions are effectively responding to the demand driven needs of project beneficiaries through participatory development approach as per the provisions of the Project design. After the initial delays and hiccups, performance of NRSP, FAO and WFP have improved significantly. Partnership and coordination between PMU and public sector institutions is working well and coordination and collaboration has improved with Fisheries Department for their role under the Fisheries Value Chain Development component.

Main issues

142. The Mission observed strong, responsive, and accountable partnerships with all service providers and collaboration is functioning well. The Public and private service providers have responded well to put the project on track after the start up delays which is reflected in the greatly improved performance of the project since November 2022. The Mission observed that the project and service providers/partners (NRSP, FAO, WFP) are effectively responding to the needs of project beneficiaries including the ultra and extremely poor HH, smallholder farmers and small fisher folks as per the provisions of the Project design. WFP and FAO have commenced their field activities. FAO has completed training of trainers (TOT) for 30 government nominated livestock and agriculture officers and has trained 4,239 persons in CRAL in 318 sessions through 170 Farmers Filed Schools under outcome1.

143. The draft Fisheries Policy and Legal framework has been completed and its enactment will empower the fisher folks and create a base for social capital. The Project plans to initiate the process of cabinet approval and enactment by the Provincial Assembly in first quarter 2025.

144. On improved HH level nutrition with a focus on women and children, WFP has delivered on two output indicators: (i) improved nutrition status of direct beneficiaries of GLLSP II through nutrition sensitisation, improved KAP (Knowledge, Attitudes and Practices) and developed Social and Behaviour Change Communication strategy (SBCC); and (ii) developed a multisectoral nutrition sensitive livelihoods strategy for the GLLSP II project. The Capacity building of 164 Community Resource Persons (CRP) as ToT is completed and 300 community health workers and 100 health facility-based staff have been trained. The CRPs have undertaken a total of 4 rounds of monthly nutrition education sessions at community level, reaching 34,500 households through 9,760 sessions. WFP has started training 2,800 COs through CRPs.

145. A key achievement is the facilitation of agreements of the fisher folk cooperatives with reputable private companies at six landing sites, outlining collaborative arrangements for the sales and marketing of fish catch from new and upgraded boats at premium prices and ensuring cool chain facilitation to guarantee quality fish supply to the factory. Additionally, the project is currently brokering partnership between cooperatives and companies to optimize boat operations and revenue distribution.

Environment and Natural Resource Management

Rating:

Main issues

146. The project is conducting water quality (WQ) testing for each drinking water supply scheme (DWSS) prior to execution and the test report becomes an integral part of subproject proposal for approval and subsequent implementation. The mission however noted that the water quality testing is not being performed at post completion stage. The project was advised to start conducting WQ testing for each water supply scheme and test report should become a part of subproject completion report.

147. Similarly, the project should continue focusing on better design of water supply schemes for proper disposal and efficient drainage of wastewater through appropriate measures (pipes, small drain). It would be good if it is used for kitchen gardening/plantation^[1].

148. The cooperatives as well as Fisheries Department will need considerable capacity building for maintaining fish quality and infrastructure in the required condition. The project has provisions for strengthening the capacity of the government departments while 4P plan also provide for trainings of the cooperatives' members on quality control, storage, grading and processing.
149. One Jetty will be constructed in Ormara (Gwadar). In this regard civil engineer, oceanographer/hydrographer and environment specialist (called Checkers and Indenters) hired for validating and vetting the feasibility, detailed design and other related reports of jetties, responded to sustainable environment and natural resources management.
150. [1] The mission noticed such environment friendly use in one of the CPI sites visited.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Water Quality Testing at Post Completion Stage - on a continuous basis Conduct water quality testing for each water supply scheme once completed and the test report should become a part of subproject completion report.	PMU/PIU/NRSP	
Improve CPI Water Supply Design for integrating better wastewater drainage arrangements - on a continuous basis Integrate proper disposal and efficient drainage of wastewater through appropriate measures (pipes, small drain) in all water supply scheme designs. Better to use this wastewater for kitchen gardening/plantation as environmental enhancement measures.	PMU/PIU/NRSP	

Exit Strategy **Rating: 4** **Previous rating: 4**

Justification of rating

151. Rates as moderately satisfactory. The work done in components 1 and 2 with community participation provides increasing comfort that at exit, community initiatives and institutions would sustain the momentum achieved during the project. Though the project has not yet prepared an exit strategy, the Project design and approach contain elements which provide a sound exit strategy framework. The nature and scale of private goods (productive assets to ultra and extremely poor households, youth women and men skills and vocational training, boats for small fisherfolk) is well matched with the abilities, circumstances and potential of each household that ensures their longer terms sustainability. The CPIs address prioritised community need and are undertaken after post-completion O&M arrangements are agreed and established with the community. Completed roads are handed over to the Communication and Work Department for O&M.

Main issues

152. The Project's community productive infrastructure sub component follows a community driven approach with high degree of community ownership. CPI prioritization, implementation and post completion O&M is guided by an active involvement of community members, and investments is made only after it has been ascertained that the infrastructure provided at the community level can be sustained by the community in terms of management and operation and maintenance. The Mission observed that the completed CPIs are being maintained and operated successfully.
153. The household level interventions of productive assets, vocational and technical training, women enterprises, nutrition interventions derive their exit and sustainability from an assessment of experience, ability and potential of households and the concurrent training and capacity building of the beneficiaries.
154. Partnership with NRSP, which has a permanent presence in the Project area, provides a natural exit strategy for all community-based activities as it is likely to continue interaction and support with the community institutions and facilitate linkages of CO/VO with government department and other sources of funding.
155. The exit strategy and sustainability for interventions under Fisheries Development component relies on the recently initiated establishment of cooperatives which will be backed by a legal framework (under the Fisheries Policy and Legal Framework) and the promotion of a sound market based 4P approach between sellers and buyers, on one hand, and the service providers on the other during project life. This is underpinned by the fishermen being organized into business cooperatives that through the 4P business plan will have contractual relationships with the private sector (buyers and service providers) and a collaborative relationship with the Fisheries Department for the sustainable and financially self-reliant operation of jetties and support infrastructure.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Project exit strategy Based on the exit strategy framework provided in the PDR, the Project shall prepare an exit strategy particularly keeping in view the post project institutional arrangements and sustainability.	PMU	03/2025

Potential for Scaling-up **Rating: 4** **Previous rating: 4**

Justification of rating

156. Rated as moderately satisfactory. The Project has successfully demonstrated several innovative approaches to community-based development/UCDP and fisheries value chain development that have a high potential for scaling up and replication. The model and process developed by the Project for UCDP preparation and GIS-based report fits well with the Government of Balochistan Community-Led Local Governance (CLLG) Policy promulgated in 2023, for institutionalizing the community-led development approach under Local Government system for improved service delivery and poverty alleviation in the province. The fisheries 4P business plan model through registered cooperatives and implementation arrangements involving private sector has the potential for replication and extension to the other coastal areas of the country. These initiatives provide a foundation for ongoing support to commercial, semi-commercial and subsistence-based livelihoods in project area.

Main issues

157. There is a growing recognition of the importance of the GIS based five-year UCDP developed by project, for realising the objective of institutionalisation of the community-led development approach for improved service delivery and poverty alleviation in the province under the Community-Led Local Governance (CLLG) policy. The Planning and Development Department and the Project has planned to launch the Union Council Development Plans reports in January 2025 to officially engage all the concerned line departments for resource allocation from Public Sector Development Plan 2025-2026.

<i>Agreed Action</i>	<i>Responsibility</i>	<i>Agreed Date</i>
<p>Showcasing the project’s innovative approaches and achievement</p> <p>The project through case studies under Knowledge Management, shall document the innovative approaches and key qualitative achievements for dissemination and knowledge sharing</p>	PMU	06/2025

c. Project Management

Quality of Project Management	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 5
--------------------------------------	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

158. Rated satisfactory. The turnaround of the project from “Actual Problem Project” status and the continuously improved implementation progress and quality of the interventions of the project is mainly attributed to the effective coordination and commitment of the Project Management team with a very strong support of the P&D Department of the Government of the Balochistan. The Project Steering Committee (PSC) has been meeting regularly for the provision of strategic guidance, oversight, provision of timely approvals and resolution of issues, progress review and approval of AWPB. The agreed actions/recommendations of previous IFAD Missions have largely been achieved. Effective coordination mechanisms have been put in place and functioning well between the PMU and implementation partners.

Main issues

159. The Project Management Unit (PMU) and the two district Project Implementation Units (PIU) are fully operational. The positions of Gender Mainstreaming Officer, Environmentalist, Procurement Assistant, MIS Officer and Admin and Finance Assistant in PMU and District Coordinator, Fisheries Value Chain Officer, 2 Business Support Facilitator in PIU are vacant. The Project is in process of hiring these staff by end February 2025.

Knowledge Management	Rating: 4	Previous rating: 4
-----------------------------	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

160. Rated as moderately satisfactory. Knowledge generation and management is imbedded in GLLSP-II M&E functions and there is no separate dedicated staff. KM activities are budgeted in AWPB. Project is striving to have its own dedicated website which is in the planning stage. The GLLSP-II KM team is closely guided by the Knowledge management/ Communication strategies and has maintained a good communication and awareness campaign through social media, radio, and periodical community events.

Main issues

161. A Knowledge management (KM) strategy and a plan have been developed to cater to the needs of collecting, developing and storing/ posting of knowledge products generated by the M&E/KM and Communication teams. The Communication team, under the KM strategy, and in close collaboration with the M&E team, continuously engaged in developing thematic knowledge products which includes quality videos portraying revealing impact of the programmatic interventions.

162. The Communication officer, at the PMU in close collaboration with M&E team, also looks after the KM activities, and has developed several themes-based knowledge products which have been posted on various platforms including but are not limited to Facebook, WhatsApp, and YouTube etc. These knowledge products advocate for organizational learning. As a next step and in the remaining life of the project, the Knowledge management unit, on fast track, should speed up the institutionalization of the KM activities/events at the PMU, districts/ sub-district and local levels by organizing learning events to be participated by the beneficiaries of the project’s interventions, fishermen, and other stakeholders for “learning from experiences” and sharing of ideas/ innovative practices. KM activities as per the workplan are implemented regularly, however, require to pick momentum.

163. The communication team has also developed various knowledge products including but not limited to Information leaflets, Brochures (Urdu an English), standees, capturing messages from events and field missions, and storing these products on electronic devices. Learning events at various levels are missing and the KM team should strive to organize learning and findings dissemination and knowledge sharing events at various forums involving all stakeholders/ partner organizations.

1. Intra-partners collaboration needs to be enhanced by organizing periodic collaborative learning and knowledge dissemination events to be participated by the 4Ps' stakeholders for understanding of the project's interventions, approaches, the Theory of Change and ultimate objectives.
2. Organizing learning events to be participated by the farmers and other stakeholders for learning from experiences and sharing of innovative ideas.
3. Communication and KM strategies, already in place, need to be revisited to align them to the most recent requirements of the project and re-evaluated to ensure their validity and timely implementation and get these products approved by IFAD.
4. A dedicated Knowledge Management system (KMS) portal must be integrated with the project MIS (currently planned to be re-structured) for instant accessing of the projects Knowledge products using dash boards.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
IFAD concurrence to KM Strategy The existing KM strategy and plan need to be cleared and approved by IFAD	PCU	02/2025
Learning Events Organise learning events to be participated by VO members and other stakeholders like public-private-producers sector. AWPB must have clear activity line for such events - on a continuous basis	PMU/M&E/KM	

Value for Money

Rating: 4

Previous rating: 4

Justification of rating

164. Rated as moderately satisfactory. Though the project activities visited by the mission are not sufficiently mature to assess financial viability in absence of ex-ante EFA due for the MTR in mid-year 2025, yet the project is generating substantial benefits to fisherfolks, farmers and rural entrepreneurs and poor households. Since the project is still in pre-MTR stage and no rigorous study is available to assess quantified value for money, the Mission assessed value for money in terms of cost efficiency of completed activities and accrued benefits based on discussions with communities and analysis of AWPB. Evidence suggests that project achieved cost efficiencies compared to appraisal estimates for implementing activities like CPI.

Main issues

165. The value for money is reviewed (i) on the basis of the unit cost of activities in the design, the unit cost used in the AWPB and for the actual expenditure; (ii) on performance of the AWPB planning and development; and (iii) revisiting the economic benefits due to some delay in project activities and project restructuring. Though the unit rates of the AWPB activities of all three components are in line with project design budget, the analysis of AWPB allocation and the actual expenditure for the current year (July 2024-June 2025) has expected to reach 26% in first six months. This shows the project funds are under-mobilized to the capacities of first and second component. However, the PMU has made a robust plan to achieve execution of the AWPB in next six months which is achievable in absence of any unforeseen adverse circumstances.

166. Regarding the cost efficiency, the average cost per CPI for completed schemes is US\$ 8,547¹¹ against the appraisal estimate of US\$ 8,970. The average per km cost of Farm to Market and Fish Market Access Roads is significantly lower than average cost of similar roads developed under Government regular programme, mainly due to involvement of communities and contribution of land by the local communities for project financed roads. The current beneficiary household (HH) outreach is 48% of the total 100,500 HH, with women beneficiaries constituting 56% of current total outreach against PDR target of 50% and 81% recipients of productive assets are women against the target of 70%.

167. Until November 2024, the combined disbursement rate of loan and grant comes to around 41.5%. the disbursement rate of SDF grant is 78.9% while disbursement rate of IFAD loan is around 38.6% and the disbursement rate of IFAD grant is 98.99%. This indicates that project will achieve its target at MTR and generate long term economic benefits in coming years with no envisaged increase in project management cost. Analysis of input to output and outcome as indicated in above section D are also good signs of progress since the project is achieving its target at both component 1 and 2.

168. ¹¹ 1 USD = 277 PKR

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Incorporate value for money aspect in the Midline Survey The proposed Midline Survey shall include required data collection need for assessment of value for money to inform preparation of EFA for MTR	PMU	03/2025

Coherence between AWPB and Implementation	Rating: 4	Previous rating: 4
--------------------------------------------------	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

169. Rated as moderately satisfactory. The Project achieved 83% financial progress during AWPB 2023-2024 (01 July 2023-30 June 2024). However, the implementation progress of AWPB 2024-2025 suffered some delays in the first four months due to political unrest and security situation. The Project expects to utilise around 26% of AWPB 2024-2025 by December 2024 and 52% by March 2025.

AWPB Inputs and Outputs Review and Implementation Progress

170. Though the shutdown protests in coastal area have ended for the moment, improvement in security situation remains a challenge with increased number of security incidents. The Project is likely to regain the momentum for implementation of AWPB 2024-2025 and complete the planned activities, though full execution is challenging and only possible in the absence of further shut down protests.

171. The Project has largely made up for the lost time due to the startup delays through significantly improved implementation progress. The current combined disbursement rate of loan and grant comes to around 41.5% compared to only 2% in November 2022 and 19.2% in December 2023.

172. Cumulatively, under the Community Development Component, the project has achieved establishment of 358 village organisations (VO) against the target of 400 (90%); completed all the GIS based UCDP (100% of the target); 4,000 productive assets distributed (47% of the target); work on 33 WRCs out of total target of 40 has been initiated (82%); of these, 10 WRCs have been completed and handed over to the communities; survey and design of 360 CPIs (41% of the total target) has been completed and of these 173 CPIs have been completed; and work on 10 Farm to Market Road with a total length of about 40 km have been initiated and construction of two roads are completed.

173. Under the Fisheries Value Chain Development component, 11 fisher folk cooperatives out of the total target of 15 (73%) have been established and registered with the Cooperative Department; review process by Checkers and Indenters for validating and vetting the feasibility and other related reports of jetties has been completed and tender and award of contract process is expected to be completed by June 2025; and work on 12 Fish Market Access Roads totalling 80 km is in progress and out these three roads have been completed.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
<p>Timely approval of AWPB and submission to IFAD - on a continuous basis</p> <p>The process for preparation of AWPB shall be initiated in April, approval of PSC shall be obtained and submitted for IFAD NO latest by 31 May of each year.</p>		
<p>Implementation of AWPB 2024-2025</p> <p>The project and implementation partners/service providers shall gear all resources towards implementation of AWPB 2024-2025 targets - on a continuous basis</p>	PMU/Implementation Partners	

Performance of M&E System	Rating: 4	Previous rating: 4
--------------------------------------	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

174. Rated as moderately satisfactory. The project has recently recruited three M&E personnel. The newly installed staff is going through trainings on IFAD’s mandatory M&E protocols. Deputy Project Coordinator is taking care of M&E activities at the PMU level. With the induction of new staff, the project performance with respect to M&E systems/ procedures will be enhanced. The project from the previous quarter started producing quarterly and semi-annual report as a result of the previous mission. The project midline survey got late due to certain external reasons but now is planned to complete early 2025. MIS is being used by the M&E for processing of data disaggregated at various levels, however, it needs adjustments to cater to the emerging needs of the M&E and Knowledge management.

M&E System Review

175. The Project has put in place an M&E system consisting of an elaborate M&E plan, KM strategy / plan, Monitoring framework, Logical framework, a communication strategy and a MIS as well as excel based database-management system. The M&E teams, at the PMU and in the regions, conduct periodic data collection exercises for progress reporting at the output level. Various data collection assessments tools are available for gauging progress, monitoring processes etc. The project periodic reports comprise of monthly, quarterly, semi-annual, and annual reports reflecting progress and performance of the project. So far, the M&E has conducted Case studies (12), Evaluation/ assessments (3) and Video documentaries (10) in collaboration with Communication unit. The PMU maintains elaborate data for the project’s components duly disaggregated by sex, poverty, youth, location etc. The quarterly report was found to be well prepared with scope for further improvement in terms of adding Lessons learned, best practices, and Recommendations for other units of the PMU in light of the collected data and information/ findings. The M&E team is being guided by the M&E plan; the KM plan / strategy has been prepared, but need to be submitted for IFAD NO.

176. The M&E activities at the local (district/ VO) level are least visible; however, with the recently hired M&E staff, the project will start showcasing field level performance on a more frequent basis and formal M&E needs to be institutionalized at these levels.
177. The core M&E team at the PMU is planning to conduct the project midline survey which got delayed by several months now. TOR have been advertised and EOIs have been received which are being evaluated for the selection of the 3rd party consulting firm. The team is expected to complete the midline based on the IFAD Core mandatory indicators by the end of March 2025.
178. The M&E unit, though operating with a lean team, has conducted few case studies and assessments. The M&E team was guided to expand the scope of conducting small scale thematic assessments across all components/ activities of the project thereby ensuring the project's visibility and leveraging cross partners collaboration and synergies. The lessons learned, case studies, and other assessment exercises are contributing well to developing a knowledge management hub; several videos/ pictures documented success stories with revealing impact.
179. The PMU has initiated an ambitious MIS for encompassing the entire project units and activities, with a live dashboard reflecting true data. Since the M&E, KM and Communication are going hand in hand, the improved MIS could serve as a repository of knowledge for live streaming data.
180. The M&E team must adhere to a rational quarterly field monitoring plans and back to office reports (Note for record) must be properly documented and findings discussed with the management and/ or individual units of PMU and to adopt M&E as a regular management practice.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
M&E MIS Develop/ revitalize exiting MIS that caters to the M&E and KM needs - updating the dashboard, generating reports and serve as a repository of knowledge as part of KM strategy	PMU	03/2025
Mini surveys Conduct Outcomes based / small scale internal thematic assessments across the project's interventions - on a regular basis	PMU/M&E	

Social, Environment, and Climate Standards requirements

Rating: 4

Previous rating: 4

Justification of rating

181. Rated as moderately satisfactory. Project is proactively following an inclusive approach by mainstreaming women, youth and marginalized fisheries communities by integrating SECAP requirements. All infrastructure activities including CPIs, roads and jetties are complying with the SECAP requirements. Each CPI includes the initial ES&C assessment through checklists and all roads have robust design features such as provision of efficient drainage (culverts), flood protection works (retaining walls) and slope stabilization. Likewise adequate SECAP linkages were observed in other project activities. FAO and WFP have developed their respective capacity building curricula considering the aspects such as community health and safety, climate smart agriculture practices; and health & hygiene considerations.

SECAP Review

182. GLLSP-II was approved under SECAP 2017. The project was assessed as **Category B** on **Environmental and Social** context; while **Climate Risk** was assessed as **High**.
183. A SECAP Review Note, ESMP table and matrix were prepared at design stage following a framework approach. As such, E&S screening and site specific ESMPs were required to be prepared by project once precise information (location, design features etc.) regarding sub-projects become available.
184. The project accordingly prepared an overarching ESCMP (for project), developed checklists templates (siting, ES & Climate impacts) for implementing CPI; formulated ESCMPs (for roads); and later revised E&S Checklists (consistent with the SECAP) as gaps noted and guided by previous IFAD supervision missions. Likewise an ESIA was prepared as a part of "feasibility and design studies" for the construction of jetties and allied infrastructure. Again as per IFAD SVM advice, ESIA was adjusted following the observations made during the process of validating the feasibility and design studies by independent Checker and Indenter (comprising 3 individual consultants including one Environmental Specialist).
185. The consistent progress on SECAP documentation and subsequently its implementation led to improved SECAP rating to moderately satisfactory during SVM of December-2023; which was previously rated as 2 (January 2023 SVM, and improved to 3 during partial SVM of October 2023).
186. **On the seven agreed** actions with previous SVMs, project also progressed well (**4 completed and 3-partially completed**), though with delays. Completed actions include: (i) recruitment of consultants/ checker and Indenter for internal review of feasibility and design of jetties and vetting of hydrographic and oceanographic survey; and review of environmental studies/SECAP; (ii) review of the preparation of SECAP part of jetties feasibility and design report; (iii) review of Jetties EIA for ensuring SECAP compliance; and (iv) adequate provision of proper wastewater disposal and drainage system for DWSS CPIs. Of the three remaining partially

completed actions, two are related to “training and capacity building^[1]”. While on the third action “hiring of additional positions of Gender Focal Person and Environmentalist”, the project has developed TORs and has commenced the hiring process. Incumbents are expected to be on-board by January-2025.

187. Despite being largely satisfactory the integration of SECAP requirements in project interventions/ documents, gaps were observed particularly on reporting SECAP compliance monitoring. This is largely attributed to weak sensitization on SECAP leading to lesser focus on its requirements.
188. The project needs to strengthen compliance monitoring in the field and regular reporting^[2] for timely course correction by fully capitalizing the good base already available in terms of adequate institutional set-up^[3]; and given the fact that key SECAP documents/instruments^[4] are already prepared.
189. The mission also observed lesser opportunities for capacity building/trainings of project staff on SECAP requirements. Currently SECAP compliance appears largely for fulfilling the procedural requirements and lesser focus on capturing the true gist (considering purpose, understanding context, implementing site specific measures; and generating evidence-based reports).
190. Another critical issue that requires immediate project attention is to set-up a robust mechanism for centrally collecting/storing all SECAP related documentation (ESIA, ESCMPs, and various reports related to implementation progress and compliance monitoring etc.). This would enable prompt retrieval and subsequent use of information/documents as and when needed by all concerned, including IFAD’s supervision missions.
191. ^[1] IFAD country office in collaboration with the regional office has planned a series of SECAP capacity building events employing local resource (consultant) for Pakistan Portfolio during end 2024/2025. Project staff would also get benefit of these opportunities.
192. ^[2] A few if not at all the sample “Back to office Reports” reviewed (7 No.) by the Mission has not reported observations/ comments on SECAP compliance monitoring and implementation progress.
193. ^[3] Focal persons at PMU, and related staff with Design and Supervision Consultants.
194. ^[4] Including: SECAP Review Note; Checklists templates (siting, ES & Climate impacts); overarching ESCMP; and ESCMPs (for roads); revised E&S Checklists (consistent with the SECAP); and ESIA for Jetties.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Completion of Actions agreed during previous missions Complete 3 partially completed actions (capacity building, trainings and hiring of additional staff).	PMU/PIUs	02/2025
Setting up Central Depository for SECAP Documentation Set-up a robust mechanism for centrally collecting/storing all SECAP related documentation and various reports related to implementation progress and compliance monitoring of SECAP for prompt retrieval and subsequent use of information/documents as and when needed by all concerned, including IFAD’s supervision missions	PMU	02/2025
SECAP Compliance Monitoring and Reporting Integrate the SECAP related observations in the Back to office reports generated by PMU/NRSP/FAO/WFP and design and supervision consultants as a regular phenomenon - on a continuous basis	PMU/PIUs/NRSP/Design and Supervision Consultants	

d. Financial Management & Execution

Acceptable Disbursement Rate	Rating: 3.0	Previous rating: 3
-------------------------------------	--------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

195. The project is entering in its fourth year of implementation and by 31 October 2024, IFAD loan disbursements is around 38.6% (SDR 16.87 million out of 43.78 million) including initial advance, disbursement rate of IFAD grant is 98.99% (SDR 2.16 million out of 2.18 million). Combined disbursement rate of loan and grant comes to around 41.5%. Disbursement rate of SDF grant is 78.9% (US\$ 2.37 million out of 3.0 million). Despite the recent increase in the disbursement rate since last supervision mission, the disbursement rating continues to be moderately unsatisfactory.

Main issues

1. The project had a quite slow start in the first year, however, in the subsequent years the project activities picked up. Since last supervision mission the IFAD loan disbursement increased from SDR 6.75 million to SDR 16.87 million, IFAD grant

disbursement has increased from SDR 2.06 million to SDR 2.16 million and SDF grant disbursement has increased from US\$ 1.5 million to US\$ 2.37 million. The project also has commitments of around SDR 6.21 million (13.5% of combined amount of loan and grant) out of which a substantial amount would be disbursed within the current financial year.

2. The AWPB financial utilisation in FY 2023-24 (July-June) was 82.9% (PKR 3.19 billion out of PKR 3.84 billion). In FY 2024-25 (July-June) the AWPB has been increased by 64.1% to PKR 6.31 billion, however, the actual utilisation until October is quite low at PKR 266 million or 4.2%. The mission has been informed that the main reason for low financial utilisation is the security situation in the project area. The Project expects to utilise around PKR 1.64 billion or 26% of AWPB until December 2024 and another PKR 3.3 billion or 52% of AWPB by March 2025.
3. The Government has approved the revised PC-1, as recommended in previous supervision mission to bring it in line with the PDR. The Government has also decided to finance one Jetty at Ormara instead of three Jetties as originally envisaged due to funding constraints. The estimated cost of one Jetty at Ormara has been rationalised to PKR 4,794 million (approx. US\$ 17.5 million). The Project needs to formally submit request IFAD for reallocation between financing categories. The procurement process of construction of Jetty is commencing soon while it is being planned that the contractor will be on board before the end of the financial year i.e. June 2025 and the construction period is expected to be three years. The estimated cost of Jetty is around 29% of the total IFAD loan, therefore, any delay in the procurement process of contractor or construction period of Jetty will have a substantial impact on the overall disbursement rate.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Reallocation between Financing Categories Request for reallocation between financing categories needs to be submitted formally to IFAD.	PMU/EAD	03/2025

Fiduciary aspects

Quality of Financial Management

Rating: 4

Previous rating: 4

Justification of rating

196. The quality of financial management has slightly improved with the recruitment of assistant finance manager, improved control over expenditure, up to date posting in the accounting software and finance team undergoing excel training. Payment terms with Fishermen Cooperatives need to be reviewed and modified and invoices of engineering consultants need to be verified before payment. Finance assistant vacancy needs to be filled. Internal audit plan and reports need to be shared with IFAD and scope needs to be expanded to project activities. Contract with NRSP needs to be revised and advance approval for international payment to FAO and WFP needs to be obtained.

Main issues

1. Finance & accounting function: Finance and accounting function has slightly improved with the recruitment of assistant finance manager and the finance team undergoing excel training. Finance & admin assistant at PMU has resigned, considering the increase in the volume of project activities, it is recommended that the replacement be dedicated to finance department.
2. Accounting and reporting: Project selected TOMPRO as accounting software in 2022 and posting of the accounting transactions have been updated. Accounting reports including IFR are being prepared based on data in excel. The project is submitting quarterly IFRs and draft FS to IFAD.
3. SOE verification: The mission's review of the expenditure and supporting documents revealed improvement in controls and documentation as recommended in previous supervision mission. The mission reviewed supporting documents of 28 transaction amounting to US\$ 2.1 million and had the following observations:
 1. Full amount of the Contract was paid in advance to the Fishermen Cooperatives. However, as per the contract payments were to be made either directly to the Vendors of the Cooperative or as a reimbursement to the Cooperative.
 2. Payments to Engineering Consultants (TAMAS and CAMEOS) were made without verification of service delivery by the Infrastructure Specialist of the Project. During the mission, all previous invoices were verified by the Infrastructure Specialist.
 3. Payment to CAMEOS (Engineering Consultants for Roads) was made twice by mistake amounting to PKR 2.66 million (US\$ 9,500)
4. Internal Audit: As per recommendation in the previous supervision mission, the Internal Auditor has prepared internal audit plan and conducted quarterly internal audits. Each internal audit report also summarises implementation status of previous recommendations. The scope of internal audit is limited to verification of accounting records and not extended to field visits conducting detailed verifications. Internal Audit reports have not been submitted to IFAD. Response of the Project on the Internal Audit reports also needs to be submitted to IFAD.
5. GoB with the assistance of the World Bank has established an independent specialised internal audit unit under the department of finance. It was previously recommended that the project's internal audit should be conducted by this independent specialised internal audit unit and its reports shared with IFAD. The project raised this matter with the P&D Department and with the Finance Department; however, response from the Finance Department has not yet been received. While this arrangement is finalised, the current internal auditor needs to continue conducting internal audits.
6. NRSP: Due to the alignment/restoration of the original target for Community Development Component in the revised PC-1, the existing contract with NRSP would need to be revised to include the remaining scope. The Project informed that the last PSC has already approved the revision. However, as per the provisions of the existing contract, the Project also needs to obtain IFAD concurrence for modifications.
7. FAO / WFP: Contracts with FAO & WFP are in USD and payment has to be made to their international bank accounts as per contract. Balance amount to be paid to FAO & WFP is US\$ 568 k when they will utilise the advance already given. Most of the

remaining IFAD Grant is already in the designated account. Only SDR 21.9 k (US\$ 29.2 k) is remaining with IFAD. The project needs to obtain approval in advance from the Finance Department and State Bank of Pakistan regarding transfer of funds from the designated account to the international bank accounts of FAO and WFP. IFAD FMD needs to be update on the matter.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Updating Accounting Software Posting of up-to-date financial transaction in the accounting software	Finance Manager	11/2023
Training of FM Team Training of finance management team on MS Excel and accounting	Finance Manager	11/2023
Re-evaluation of FM team Re-evaluation of qualification & experience of finance and admin assistants	Finance Manager	11/2023
Finance Team Recruitment of finance assistant to be dedicated to finance department.	Project Director / Director Finance	01/2025
Internal Auditor <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Internal Audit Plan and Quarterly Internal Audit Reports need to be shared with IFAD. • The scope of internal audit needs to be extended to field visits conducting detailed verifications. 	Project Director	01/2025
Insurance of Project Personnel: Project personal to be provided health and accidental insurance consistent with sound commercial practice or customary practice in respect of national civil service. Not enough allocation was in AWP&B 2022-23. Allocation has been made in 2023-24. Will be done after AWP&B 2023-24 approval.	PMU	03/2025
Control over expenditure and supporting documents: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Petty Cash Expenses: Documentation needs improvement in terms of maintenance of Cash Book, evidence of cash payment and evidence of goods/services received. • Asset Transfer: Documentation needs improvements regarding number of goats handed over to the beneficiary on the Asset Transfer Form. 	PMU	03/2025
Control over expenditure and supporting documents <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Payment Terms in the Contracts with Fishermen Cooperatives need to be reviewed and modified to reflect the intended/actual relationship / arrangement. • Invoices of Engineering Consultants (TAMAS and CAMEOS) should be verified before payment by the Infrastructure Specialist to ensure service delivery. • Additional payment to CAMEOS amounting to PKR 2.66 million should be deducted from future payments. 	Director Finance	03/2025
NRSP Obtain written consent from IFAD for the modification of NRSP contract to include remaining scope.	Project Director	03/2025
External Audit Observations Resolving external auditor observations	Finance Manager	06/2025

FAO & WFP Obtain approval in advance from the Finance Department & State Bank of Pakistan regarding transfer of funds from the designated account to the international bank accounts of FAO and WFP & update IFAD FMD on the matter.	Project Director / Director Finance	06/2025
Internal Audit Reports Submission of Internal Audit reports to IFAD Internal Auditor	Internal Auditor	
Internal Audit Reports Submission of Internal Audit reports to IFAD Internal Auditor	Internal Auditor	

Quality and Timeliness of Audit

Rating: 4

Previous rating: 4

Justification of rating

197. The audit report is fully informative and the audit has been conducted in accordance with the requirements of the IFAD Handbook on Audit and Financial Reporting. The audit opinion is unqualified in accordance with ISSA 7000.

Main issues

198. The audit opinion has not specified the accounting framework used but this is deduced from the notes. Since there was no emphasis on this issue, the IPSAS cash basis was confirmed as the relevant framework. Further comments below:

199.1. The audit opinion is unqualified.

2. It was possible to reconcile the FS to IFAD records and to the Q4 2023 IFR. The exception here is that PKR amounts are not provided in the IFRs and there is a cut off issue in the statement of withdrawal application. WA 6J for \$ 233k submitted in August 2022 was not captured and WA 13J for \$2.36 million submitted in August 2023 was included.

4. The fixed asset register was missing.

5. The management letters were fully informative including management responses and the considerations of the DAC. The auditors also provided an evaluation of the management and DAC responses and preliminary conclusions. There was also a follow up on prior period audit recommendations.

200. There were no significant internal control issues reported except with regards to hiring a professional accountancy firm to conduct internal audit of the project. This would be communicated to the project in the actions.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
<p>Clarify procurement issues or process refund to IFAD - BDT 239.824 million (USD 854 thousand)</p> <p>According to Rule 15 (1) of BPPRs, 2014, "Procurements over two hundred thousand rupees and up to one million rupees shall be advertised by timely notification on the Authority's website." Scrutiny of records of PD, GLLSP, Phase-II, Gwadar, for the financial year 2022-23, revealed that an expenditure of Rs. 239.824 million was incurred under the component of "Community Physical Infrastructure" i.e., for drinking water supply schemes, installation of solar home system and construction of protection wall for flood" without calling open tenders</p> <p>In the DAC meeting held on October 26, 2023, the management clarified that it wasn't a single scheme, but rather a compilation of multiple schemes. Further, community development was carried out by NRSP as the services were provided by NRSP being a social mobilization partner through cash forward program where the money was transferred to the community directly to carry out the civil works. Furthermore, BPPRA remained silent where procurement policies were implemented by donors. Audit highlighted that tenders should be called to obtain comparative rates and competitive quality.</p>	GLLSP Management	06/2025
<p>Maintain stock/store register for all purchased assets/inventory</p> <p>The DAC directed the management to maintain a stock register to ensure proper asset management and provide the same to Audit for verification.</p>	GLLSP Management	06/2025
<p>Provide details of income taxes and stamp deduction to Auditors</p> <p>In the DAC meeting held on October 26, 2023, the management informed that Stamp Duty had been recovered from the firms concerned on the recommendation of Audit. Audit highlighted the importance of deduction of taxes keeping in view the government revenues. The DAC directed the management to provide the detail of deducted Stamp Duty duly attested by the concerned Officer to Audit for verification.</p> <p>In the DAC meeting held on October 26, 2023, the management informed that the deductions were made as per rule notified by FBR. However, no record was produced to the forum to substantiate the claim. The DAC directed the management to provide the record of income tax deduction to Audit for verification. Further, the relevant notification be shared with Audit.</p>	GLLSP Management	06/2025
<p>Recruit professional accountancy firm for external audit</p> <p>Audit of the PD, GLLSP, Phase-II, Gwadar revealed that as per PC-1, PMU was required to engage the services of an auditing firm for conducting internal audit, after obtaining NOC from Foreign Donor, IFAD. The auditing firm was further required to submit quarterly reports on the activities of the Social Mobilizer Partner (SMP) which would be shared with IFAD as part of the project's QFRs. Scrutiny of records revealed that the PD failed to engage the services of the auditing firm as enunciated in the PC-I of the project.</p>	GLLSP Management	06/2025
<p>Provide project progress reports to auditors</p> <p>Audit of PD, GLLSP, Phase-II, Gwadar, for the financial year 2022-23, revealed that an expenditure of Rs. 239.824 million was incurred under the project component "Community Physical Infrastructure" on the construction of drinking water supply schemes, installation of solar home system and construction of protection wall for flood etc. But, neither completion certificates were prepared by the management nor were the handing I taking over of schemes by the notables of the villages/area provided to Audit.</p>	GLLSP Management	06/2025

Counterparts Funds

Rating: 4

Previous rating: 4

Justification of rating

201. Rated as moderately satisfactory as until 31 October 2024, increasing from US\$ 421 k (4.8%) on 30 Nov 2023 to US\$ 1.04 million (12%) at 31 October 2024. The Project has available Government funding of US\$ 235 k in the project bank account and no shortage of funds has been experienced for counterpart funding.

Main issues

1. The Government has committed to provide counterpart financing amounting to US\$ 8.6 million to meet the tax obligations and provide counterpart financing for community development and project management. However, as the progress of the overall project has been quite slow, the need for counterpart funding has also been low. Until 30 October 2024, counterpart funding of US\$ 1.04 million (12%) has been utilised while available funding in the project account is US\$ 235 k. Lower counterpart funding can be attributed to the tax exemption in GoB and devaluation of Pakistani Rupee against the US dollar.
2. Government is also providing In-Kind contribution in terms of providing office space and utilities for PMU. The project has developed guidelines for valuation, recording and reporting of In-Kid contribution by the Government and started valuing and recording In-Kind Contribution by the Government as recommended in previous supervision mission.
3. Beneficiaries are expected to contribute US\$ 0.99 million in terms of matching grant, in kind material, land and labour. The project has developed guidelines for valuation, recording and reporting of In-Kid contribution by the beneficiaries and started valuing both matching grant and In-Kind Contribution by the beneficiaries. Until 31 October 2024, the beneficiaries have contributed US\$ 83 k (8%) in both matching grant and In-Kind.

Compliance with Loan Covenants **Rating: 5** **Previous rating: 5**

Justification of rating

202. Rated as satisfactory. The project has complied with most Financing Agreement covenants while it has not yet complied with the timeline of submission of AWPB to IFAD within 60 days before the start of the financial year.

Main issues

203. The project has complied with almost all loan covenants, submitting interim financial statements on a quarterly basis, submitting draft financial statements within four months of the year end, obtaining insurance for project assets and health and accidental insurance for project personnel and submitting audit report, audited financial statements and management letter within six months of the end of the financial year.
204. In order to have timely approval and efficient implementation, AWPB are required to be submitted at least sixty days before the start of the financial year. However, the AWPB has been consistently submitted with substantial delay. AWPB for 2023-24 was submitted in September 2023 while AWPB for 2024-25 was submitted in August 2024.

<i>Agreed Action</i>	<i>Responsibility</i>	<i>Agreed Date</i>
Insurance of Project Assets and Project Personnel Project assets including vehicles and other assets to be insured as per best practice. Project personal to be provided health and accidental insurance consistent with sound commercial practice or customary practice in respect of national civil service.	PMU	02/2023
AWPB Submission AWPB to be submitted to IFAD at least 60 days before the start of the financial year.	PD and Finance Officer	04/2025

Procurement

Procurement **Rating: 4** **Previous rating: 3**

Justification of rating

Processes, procedures and systems applied exhibit some gaps and inconsistencies that have limited impact on project implementation and performance. Implementation support is required; however, prompt resolution of issues/constraints is likely.

Procurement Review

During Jan-Oct 2024 PMU awarded contracts of goods, works and consulting services amounting to US\$ 3.246 million. Procurement process for construction of Jetty package is awaiting submission of final reports by Checkers and Indenters. The contract management function is weak. PMU has followed IFAD procurement planning and bidding document templates. There are challenges of lack of full comprehension of IFAD procurement processes and procedures, lack of attention to details and weak internal controls. Procurement staff needs transaction-specific hand-holding.

Procurement Planning. The latest procurement plan is approved, OPEN and ICP-CMT are updated. The approved procurement plan for the year 2024-25 is US\$ 26.979 million including construction of Ormara Jetty contract of US\$ 17 million. During Jan-Oct 2024 PMU awarded contracts of goods, works and consulting services amounting to US\$ 3.246 million. The PMU's preparedness and readiness to initiate procurement process for contract award of construction of Jetty (Ormara) exhibit delays. PMU agreed to the proposal of holding a road-show to reach out to the potential international and national bidders.

Procurement Processes. PMU awarded 11 road contracts during Jan-Oct 2024. including 5 contracts under rebidding. PMU awarded contracts for video documentaries and Checkers and Indenters. The bid evaluation reports (BERs) for procurement of Boats and Allied Infrastructures (community procurements) and evaluation of proposals for selection of consultant for midline evaluation survey are work in progress. PMU is updating ICP-CMT on quarterly basis against the previous practice of updating by 15th of every month. FMRs of monthly monitoring field visits is a good practice, however, more information/substance is needed.

Contract Administration and Management: The contract management function is weak. The contract for feasibility, design and construction supervision of roads expired on June 30, 2024. The contract extension and modification for inclusion of additional scope as per revised PC-1 is pending. The consultant has been rendering services and being paid given the contract expired on June 30, 2024. The contract for review process by Checkers and Indenters expired on October 30, 2024. During the mission, the reports from Checkers and Indenters remained pending and were not shared onward despite commitment. The vetting of those reports will take additional time and without approval of these reports the technical part of the bidding document will remain incomplete. The modification of NRSP contract to include the additional scope is pending. PMU needs a dedicated staff for contract management and monitoring.

Record Retention and Monitoring: A filing system for each contract seems in place. However, some bids for contracts selected for post review were not available for review. There is a need to ensure a robust record management system. FMS ensured to share copies of invoices/payment vouchers to be placed on procurement files.

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Procurement Documents for Construction of Jetty Finalize and share a draft procurement document for construction of Jetty with IFAD for review and NO	Program Specialist/PD	11/2024
Contract for Roads Consultants Finalize contract extension and modification to include the additional scope (feasibility, design and construction supervision) of 56 KM roads	Program Specialist/PD	11/2024
Contract Extension with NRSP Finalize modification of NRSP contract to include the additional scope	Program Specialist/PD	11/2024
Community Procurement Contract award of Boats and Allied Infrastructures	Procurement Specialist/PD	12/2024

e. Key SIS Indicators

Likelihood of Achieving the Development Objective	Rating: 4.41	Previous rating: 4.18
Assessment of the Overall Implementation Performance	Rating: 4.08	Previous rating: 4.08

F. Relevance

Relevance	Rating: 5	Previous rating: 5
------------------	------------------	---------------------------

Justification of rating

205. Rated Satisfactory. Project interventions and approaches are relevant to the needs of the target group. The Project has been addressing the needs of poor households through a flexible menu of support at household and community level following participatory process. The nature and scale of activities are well suited to the needs, capacities and prevailing socio-economic environment of HH and communities and have proven their relevance in terms of impacts on incomes and empowerment of the target beneficiaries. The participatory approach and use of NSER data for beneficiary targeting has rendered transparency and trust among the beneficiaries.

Main issues

206. The project livelihood enhancement interventions have become more relevant for the rural poor in view of the current economic downturn and associating high inflation rates and deteriorating labour market which is resulting in decline in HH incomes and increase in depth and severity of poverty in Pakistan. The project infrastructure intervention of roads and jetties along with value chain development interventions will result in the realisation of the agriculture, livestock and fisheries sector potential of the province. Project has a strong poverty, women and youth focus. The development objective of the project with expanded livelihood opportunities to fisher folks and rural farmers is relevant and in line with the development strategies of IFAD and the provincial and federal government.

G. Project Modifications

Responsibility	Modification type	Description
Govt. PMU and IFAD	Reallocation	The Government has approved the revised PC-1, as recommended in previous SV report to bring it in line with the PDR. The Government has also agreed and decided to finance one Jetty at Ormara instead of three Jetties as originally envisaged due to funding constraints. The estimated cost of one Jetty at Ormara has been rationalised to PKR 4,794 million (approx. USD 17.5 million). The Project is formally requesting IFAD for reallocation between financing categories.

H. Lessons Learned

Farmers institutional strengthening is pivotal for agricultural value chain development

207. A key lesson learnt in establishing and development of fisherfolk cooperatives for 4P based value chain development is that institutional development and strengthening of farmers/fisherfolk is a longer term “process” of developing and empowering farmer/fisherfolk organizations, enabling them to function more effectively as a collective unit by improving their leadership, management skills, access to information and market linkages,

208. The 4P model also relies heavily on the careful selection of suitable private sector partner. Key considerations include their market reach, financial capacity, technical expertise, commitment to sustainability, existing relationships with farmers, ability to add value to the product, and alignment with the overall development goals of the project.

Participatory M&E System Contributes to Informed Decision Making, Stakeholder Ownership and Transparency

209. The mission observed that local knowledge and understanding of issues is given due consideration during the design and implementation of the community based intervention. The project M&E system includes feed back into decision making mechanism thereby enabling a project to adapt and improve. The ownership aspect is particularly evident from the successful operation and maintenance of community infrastructure facilitates thereby ensuring that the benefits are sustained once a project comes to an end.

210. GLLSP-II has been successful in taking onboard the implementing partners, (WFP, FAO, and NRSP), for assisting the PMU of GLLSP-II in creating a repository of data, knowledge and information. GLLSP-II provided opportunities and platform for these partners for contributing effectively to the state of the art robust M&E practices in GLLSP-II. The PMU has been leveraging benefits from these collaborative partnerships and fostering the bond further by closely convening periodic review meetings at the PMU as well as the district levels for sharing of data/ information and knowledge dissemination.. The wealth of data and information hub created across various thematic sectors by GLLSP-II and its partners will provide useful information to the government and will help inform any future projects around the same themes in Baluchistan.

Policy Engagement

211. A clear road map, thematic focus and budgeted plan for policy and institutional level engagement in the project design is leading to tangible outcomes. Notable achievements so far, include: (i) **Institutionalisation of Community Driven Development Approach.** The objective of the activity is to facilitate the institutionalization of the CDD approach in the ongoing decentralization context in Balochistan. This is being pursued through the process of Union Council Development Plan (UCDP) approach to demonstrate an institutionalized system for the transfer of public sector development funding to community/village organizations through participatory planning involving communities, public and private service providers.; and (ii) **Policy Support and Advocacy:** Formulation a comprehensive sustainable Fisheries Management Policy and Legal Framework is in the final stages of completion. The process for presentation of the policy for Cabinet approval and enactment by the Provincial Assembly is expected in January 2025. The Project and WFP have also agreed to include the preparation of Provincial Nutrition Policy for Balochistan in the proposal for no cost extension of agreement with WFP.

Provision of Working Space for Women Provides an Effective Entry Point for Gender Mainstreaming

212. The project, *inter alai*, is pursuing gender mainstreaming and women empowerment through the establishment of 45 Women Resource Centers (WRC) in very poor villages that have no public building or suitable private dwelling for women’s joint activities. The mission observed that the WRCs are providing an enabling environment and space for effective gender mainstreaming and economic and social empowerment, considering their cultural and economic constraints. The WRCs have created opportunities for women organisational development, to meet, network, exchange ideas and serve as skills development centres. However It is important to enhance the business mobilization around each WRC and ensure development of business plan and road maps for WRCs.

Poverty Graduation Approach

213. An integrated approach of skills development, productive asset-based income generation and access to start-up capital for the

extremely poor and the chronically poor, particularly women, is a promising instrument for sustainable poverty reduction and the empowerment of the poor, women and youth. However, there is a need to pursue the poverty graduation approach as a continuous and dynamic process that continues to help target households to keep progressing on economic well-being ladder and helping beneficiaries of assets transfer and vocational training to organise into production groups and facilitating their access to finance and direct linkages to markets.

Infrastructure and Value Chain Development

214. The enabling infrastructure and value chain development identified by the local community around the targeted area have supported the employment generation within the newly connected villages/communities as many new private sector business opportunities emerged (transports /loaders/small vendors etc.). Additionally, the transportation infrastructure development, have resulted in immediate improved access to social services like health and education and significant reduction in transportation costs of drinking water in a region where in view of scarcity and quality of water, a large number of communities rely on supply of water through water tankers.

I. Agreed Actions

Agreed Action	Responsibility	Agreed Date
Overview and Project Progress		
Feasibility studies/design of jetties and allied infrastructure 4 Award of contract for construction of selected/approved jetties	PMU/IFAD No Objection	04/2024
Start of construction of jetties by August 2024 Project shall strictly follow the time for each step (validation of design, approval of PC-1, procurement of construction contractors), leading to the timely start of construction by August 2024	PMU	08/2024
Capacity building of Fisheries Value Chain Team Training of the VC team in business planning including financial budgeting, cooperative governance and leadership, networking and partnership building	PMU	10/2024
Revision of Contract with NRSP Revise contract with NRSP for remaining activities under Community Development Component and obtain NO from IFAD for the modification of NRSP contract to include remaining scope	PMU	11/2024
No-cost extension of Agreements with FAO and WFP Complete review of proposals and sign the revised agreements	PMU/WFP/FAO	11/2024
Completion of on-going Farm to Market Roads and Contract for Design of Remaining Roads - 2 Obtain IFAD NO for extension of the existing contract for consulting services for feasibility, design, construction and supervision of the remaining 56km of roads and modifications to original scope of work as construction/supervision of ongoing roads have faced delays due to unprecedented floods and security situation	PMU	11/2024
Validation of Jetty Design, tendering and award of contract Share the final Checkers and Indenters reports for validation of jetty design and with the feasibility and design consultant (TUMAS) and obtain their final review and approval/certification	PMU	11/2024
Capacity building and institutional strengthening Focus on capacity building and institutional strengthening support and start of work on related activities.	PMU/Fisheries Department	12/2024

<p>Improved Implementation of Youth Job Market Readiness</p> <p>Assign a focal person in the PMU for management of implementation of the activity - by end November 24 Implementation of sub component needs to be enhanced in terms of the number of trainings. In this regard, assess capacities of the University of Gwadar and Balochistan Technical Education and Vocation Training Authority (B-TEVTA) for timely completion of training of the required target - by end December 24</p> <p>The Project and NRSP shall explore possibilities of paid internship for the young women who completed training for employment, preferably through NRSP own resources and opportunities at project supported value chains and infrastructure and job placement support - on a continuous basis</p>	PMU/NRSP	12/2024
<p>Compliance of regulatory requirements of Cooperatives</p> <p>The Project shall ensure the Annual General Body Meeting and election of executive bodies for the 11 Cooperatives</p>	PMU	12/2024
<p>Cooperatives bank accounts</p> <p>The cooperative accounts shall be converted to interest bearing saving accounts for interest earnings</p>	PMU	12/2024
<p>Recruitment of Staff and Enhanced Efficiency of PMU - 2</p> <p>Prepare detailed TORs for all the key staff of the PMU and assign focal persons for each of the key activities.</p>	PMU	12/2024
<p>Capacity building of Fisherfolk cooperatives</p> <p>Complete the engagement of service provider for capacity building</p>	PMU	02/2025
<p>Fisheries Catch Data Collection Tool/MIS</p> <p>Allocate and transfer the requested amount of US\$ 300,000 under the capacity building and institutional strengthening of the Fisheries department.</p>	PMU	02/2025
<p>Recruitment of Staff and Enhanced Efficiency of PMU</p> <p>Complete recruitment process for all the vacant positions.</p>	PMU	02/2025
<p>Initiate action Youth Policy and Climate Resilience and Mitigation Action Plans</p> <p>Complete engagement of technical assistance for Youth Development Policy and Action Plan and Climate Resilience and Mitigation for Agriculture Action Plan based on the National Policy for Climate Change mitigation and resilience</p>	PMU	03/2025
<p>Completion of Mid-line Survey</p> <p>Completion of survey by 25 February and the draft report ready by mid-March 2025</p>	PMU	03/2025
<p>Completion of on-going Farm to Market Roads and Contract for Design of Remaining Roads</p> <p>Complete all the 6 ongoing roads by June 2025</p>	PMU	06/2025
<p>Validation of Jetty Design, tendering and award of contract - 2</p> <p>Complete award of contract for construction of jetty (Ormara)</p>	PMU	06/2025

<p>Capacity Building of Members of WRCs</p> <p>Assist members of WRCs for preparing livelihood and enterprise development plan and provide learning and knowledge sharing opportunities to members of the newly completed WRC through exchange visits to already well functioning WRC - on a continuous basis</p>	NRSP	
Development Effectiveness		
<p>Integrate nutrition sensitive agriculture messages in the training manual and community modules</p> <p>Strengthen integration of nutrition sensitive messages (i.e. food-based approaches to nutrition) into the current CRP nutrition training manual and nutrition counselling modules for community trainings</p>	WFP/ PMU	12/2024
<p>Nutrition data collection and logframe update</p> <p>Periodically update of the logframe with relevant nutrition data and follow IFAD COI surveys for nutrition outcome indicators (MDDW, KAP).</p>	PMU and WFP	12/2024
<p>Sensitize project partners and government departments on the nutrition sensitive livelihood strategy</p> <p>WFP to sensitize the project partners on the key actions in the strategy- especially related to the value chains targeted by the project</p>	WFP/PMU	02/2025
<p>Poverty graduation approach as a continuous and dynamic process</p> <p>Continuously assist the productive assets transfer beneficiaries and vocational training to organise into production groups around specific products and facilitating their access to finance and direct linkages to markets - on a continuous basis</p>	PMU	
<p>Inclusion of eligible HH in income generating activities like assets transfer and skills development - on a continuous basis</p> <p>Eligible HH either not included in BISP-PSC data or whose poverty status may have changed since the time the survey was conducted shall be considered for livelihood related interventions subject to verification through wealth ranking and validation by community</p>	NRSP	
Sustainability and Scaling up		
<p>Customised capacity building training for women leaders</p> <p>NRSP shall design and implement customised trainings for women in leadership positions to enhance their confidence and development vision and to further nurture and develop their leadership potential</p>	NRSP	03/2025
<p>Strengthening of Complaint and Redressal mechanism</p> <p>PMU has complaint and redressal mechanism and same is in place in NRSP, however information is not being shared and analysed systematically. The project needs to strengthen the flow of information and redressal mechanism between NRSP and the project/PMU.</p>	PMU/ NRSP	03/2025
<p>Project exit strategy</p> <p>Based on the exit strategy framework provided in the PDR, the Project shall prepare an exit strategy particularly keeping in view the post project institutional arrangements and sustainability.</p>	PMU	03/2025

<p>Showcasing the project's innovative approaches and achievement</p> <p>The project through case studies under Knowledge Management, shall document the innovative approaches and key qualitative achievements for dissemination and knowledge sharing</p>	PMU	06/2025
<p>Clarity of role and responsibilities of fisherfolk cooperatives stakeholders</p> <p>Continuous engaging with all members of the cooperatives for ensuring a buy in and very clear understanding of the roles and responsibilities and terms of agreements by each party i.e., project/public sector, cooperative/producers and private sector - on a continuous basis</p>	PMU	
<p>Water Quality Testing at Post Completion Stage - on a continuous basis</p> <p>Conduct water quality testing for each water supply scheme once completed and the test report should become a part of subproject completion report.</p>	PMU/PIU/NRSP	
<p>Improve CPI Water Supply Design for integrating better wastewater drainage arrangements - on a continuous basis</p> <p>Integrate proper disposal and efficient drainage of wastewater through appropriate measures (pipes, small drain) in all water supply scheme designs. Better to use this wastewater for kitchen gardening/plantation as environmental enhancement measures.</p>	PMU/PIU/NRSP	
Project Management		
<p>IFAD concurrence to KM Strategy</p> <p>The existing KM strategy and plan need to be cleared and approved by IFAD</p>	PCU	02/2025
<p>Completion of Actions agreed during previous missions</p> <p>Complete 3 partially completed actions (capacity building, trainings and hiring of additional staff).</p>	PMU/PIUs	02/2025
<p>Setting up Central Depository for SECAP Documentation</p> <p>Set-up a robust mechanism for centrally collecting/storing all SECAP related documentation and various reports related to implementation progress and compliance monitoring of SECAP for prompt retrieval and subsequent use of information/documents as and when needed by all concerned, including IFAD's supervision missions</p>	PMU	02/2025
<p>Incorporate value for money aspect in the Midline Survey</p> <p>The proposed Midline Survey shall include required data collection need for assessment of value for money to inform preparation of EFA for MTR</p>	PMU	03/2025
<p>M&E MIS</p> <p>Develop/ revitalize exiting MIS that caters to the M&E and KM needs - updating the dashboard, generating reports and serve as a repository of knowledge as part of KM strategy</p>	PMU	03/2025
<p>Timely approval of AWPB and submission to IFAD - on a continuous basis</p> <p>The process for preparation of AWPB shall be initiated in April, approval of PSC shall be obtained and submitted for IFAD NO latest by 31 May of each year.</p>		

<p>Learning Events</p> <p>Organise learning events to be participated by VO members and other stakeholders like public-private-producers sector. AWPB must have clear activity line for such events - on a continuous basis</p>	PMU/M&E/KM	
<p>Implementation of AWPB 2024-2025</p> <p>The project and implementation partners/service providers shall gear all resources towards implementation of AWPB 2024-2025 targets - on a continuous basis</p>	PMU/Implementation Partners	
<p>Mini surveys</p> <p>Conduct Outcomes based / small scale internal thematic assessments across the project's interventions - on a regular basis</p>	PMU/M&E	
<p>SECAP Compliance Monitoring and Reporting</p> <p>Integrate the SECAP related observations in the Back to office reports generated by PMU/NRSP/FAO/WFP and design and supervision consultants as a regular phenomenon - on a continuous basis</p>	PMU/PIUs/NRSP/Design and Supervision Consultants	
Financial Management & Execution		
<p>Insurance of Project Assets and Project Personnel</p> <p>Project assets including vehicles and other assets to be insured as per best practice. Project personal to be provided health and accidental insurance consistent with sound commercial practice or customary practice in respect of national civil service.</p>	PMU	02/2023
<p>Updating Accounting Software</p> <p>Posting of up-to-date financial transaction in the accounting software</p>	Finance Manager	11/2023
<p>Training of FM Team</p> <p>Training of finance management team on MS Excel and accounting</p>	Finance Manager	11/2023
<p>Re-evaluation of FM team</p> <p>Re-evaluation of qualification & experience of finance and admin assistants</p>	Finance Manager	11/2023
<p>Procurement Documents for Construction of Jetty</p> <p>Finalize and share a draft procurement document for construction of Jetty with IFAD for review and NO</p>	Program Specialist/PD	11/2024
<p>Contract for Roads Consultants</p> <p>Finalize contract extension and modification to include the additional scope (feasibility, design and construction supervision) of 56 KM roads</p>	Program Specialist/PD	11/2024
<p>Contract Extension with NRSP</p> <p>Finalize modification of NRSP contract to include the additional scope</p>	Program Specialist/PD	11/2024
<p>Community Procurement</p> <p>Contract award of Boats and Allied Infrastructures</p>	Procurement Specialist/PD	12/2024

Finance Team Recruitment of finance assistant to be dedicated to finance department.	Project Director / Director Finance	01/2025
Internal Auditor <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Internal Audit Plan and Quarterly Internal Audit Reports need to be shared with IFAD. • The scope of internal audit needs to be extended to field visits conducting detailed verifications. 	Project Director	01/2025
Insurance of Project Personnel: Project personal to be provided health and accidental insurance consistent with sound commercial practice or customary practice in respect of national civil service. Not enough allocation was in AWP&B 2022-23. Allocation has been made in 2023-24. Will be done after AWP&B 2023-24 approval.	PMU	03/2025
Control over expenditure and supporting documents: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Petty Cash Expenses: Documentation needs improvement in terms of maintenance of Cash Book, evidence of cash payment and evidence of goods/services received. • Asset Transfer: Documentation needs improvements regarding number of goats handed over to the beneficiary on the Asset Transfer Form. 	PMU	03/2025
Reallocation between Financing Categories Request for reallocation between financing categories needs to be submitted formally to IFAD.	PMU/EAD	03/2025
Control over expenditure and supporting documents <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Payment Terms in the Contracts with Fishermen Cooperatives need to be reviewed and modified to reflect the intended/actual relationship / arrangement. • Invoices of Engineering Consultants (TAMAS and CAMEOS) should be verified before payment by the Infrastructure Specialist to ensure service delivery. • Additional payment to CAMEOS amounting to PKR 2.66 million should be deducted from future payments. 	Director Finance	03/2025
NRSP Obtain written consent from IFAD for the modification of NRSP contract to include remaining scope.	Project Director	03/2025
AWPB Submission AWPB to be submitted to IFAD at least 60 days before the start of the financial year.	PD and Finance Officer	04/2025
External Audit Observations Resolving external auditor observations	Finance Manager	06/2025
FAO & WFP Obtain approval in advance from the Finance Department & State Bank of Pakistan regarding transfer of funds from the designated account to the international bank accounts of FAO and WFP & update IFAD FMD on the matter.	Project Director / Director Finance	06/2025

<p>Clarify procurement issues or process refund to IFAD - BDT 239.824 million (USD 854 thousand)</p> <p>According to Rule 15 (1) of BPPRs, 2014, "Procurements over two hundred thousand rupees and up to one million rupees shall be advertised by timely notification on the Authority's website." Scrutiny of records of PD, GLLSP, Phase-II, Gwadar, for the financial year 2022-23, revealed that an expenditure of Rs. 239.824 million was incurred under the component of "Community Physical Infrastructure" i.e., for drinking water supply schemes, installation of solar home system and construction of protection wall for flood" without calling open tenders</p> <p>In the DAC meeting held on October 26, 2023, the management clarified that it wasn't a single scheme, but rather a compilation of multiple schemes. Further, community development was carried out by NRSP as the services were provided by NRSP being a social mobilization partner through cash forward program where the money was transferred to the community directly to carry out the civil works. Furthermore, BPPRA remained silent where procurement policies were implemented by donors. Audit highlighted that tenders should be called to obtain comparative rates and competitive quality.</p>	GLLSP Management	06/2025
<p>Maintain stock/store register for all purchased assets/inventory</p> <p>The DAC directed the management to maintain a stock register to ensure proper asset management and provide the same to Audit for verification.</p>	GLLSP Management	06/2025
<p>Provide details of income taxes and stamp deduction to Auditors</p> <p>In the DAC meeting held on October 26, 2023, the management informed that Stamp Duty had been recovered from the firms concerned on the recommendation of Audit. Audit highlighted the importance of deduction of taxes keeping in view the government revenues. The DAC directed the management to provide the detail of deducted Stamp Duty duly attested by the concerned Officer to Audit for verification.</p> <p>In the DAC meeting held on October 26, 2023, the management informed that the deductions were made as per rule notified by FBR. However, no record was produced to the forum to substantiate the claim. The DAC directed the management to provide the record of income tax deduction to Audit for verification. Further, the relevant notification be shared with Audit.</p>	GLLSP Management	06/2025
<p>Recruit professional accountancy firm for external audit</p> <p>Audit of the PD, GLLSP, Phase-II, Gwadar revealed that as per PC-1, PMU was required to engage the services of an auditing firm for conducting internal audit, after obtaining NOC from Foreign Donor, IFAD. The auditing firm was further required to submit quarterly reports on the activities of the Social Mobilizer Partner (SMP) which would be shared with IFAD as part of the project's QFRs. Scrutiny of records revealed that the PD failed to engage the services of the auditing firm as enunciated in the PC-I of the project.</p>	GLLSP Management	06/2025
<p>Provide project progress reports to auditors</p> <p>Audit of PD, GLLSP, Phase-II, Gwadar, for the financial year 2022-23, revealed that an expenditure of Rs. 239.824 million was incurred under the project component "Community Physical Infrastructure" on the construction of drinking water supply schemes, installation of solar home system and construction of protection wall for flood etc. But, neither completion certificates were prepared by the management nor were the handing I taking over of schemes by the notables of the villages/area provided to Audit.</p>	GLLSP Management	06/2025
<p>Internal Audit Reports</p> <p>Submission of Internal Audit reports to IFAD Internal Auditor</p>	Internal Auditor	

Internal Audit Reports Submission of Internal Audit reports to IFAD Internal Auditor	Internal Auditor	
------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	------------------	--

Pakistan

Gwadar-Lasbela Livelihoods Support Project II

Supervision Report

: Logical Framework

Mission Dates: 1 November - 10 January 2025

Document Date: 03/02/2025

Project No. 2000002331

Report No. 7138-PK

Asia and the Pacific Division
Programme Management Department

Gwadar-Lasbela Livelihoods Support Project II

Logical Framework

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of Verification			Assumptions
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2025)	Cumulative Result (2025)	Cumulative Result % (2025)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility	
Outreach	1 Persons receiving services promoted or supported by the project							Baseline survey, surveys	annual, Mid-Term, completion	PMU, SMP, IFAD	A baseline survey is conducted to establish the baseline Project approach and timelines are adhered to An efficient M&E system is developed and implemented
	Males (number)		52 000	109 000		112 410	103.128				
	Females (number)		78 000	119 000		146 576	123.173				
	Young (number)		65 000	105 000		0	0				
	Total number of persons receiving services (number)		130 000	228 000		258 986	113.59				
	1.a Corresponding number of households reached							Baseline survey, surveys	annual, Mid-Term, completion	PMU, SMP, IFAD	
	Women-headed households (number)					4 346					
	Non-women-headed households (number)					28 015					
	Households (number)		40 000	100 500		48 384	48.1				
	1.b Estimated corresponding total number of households members							Baseline survey, surveys	annual, Mid-Term, completion	PMU, NRSP, IFAD	
Household members (number)		191 400	695 000		366 553	52.7					
Project Goal A sustainable model of decentralized and integrated rural development that is poverty, gender, youth, nutrition and climate change sensitive	No. of organized villages with access to annual government development funding for their development plans							completion survey	end of project	PMU	All ultra-poor and poor households are members of COs Security situations remains stable
	organized villages (%)		50	90							

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of Verification			Assumptions
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2025)	Cumulative Result (2025)	Cumulative Result % (2025)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility	
Development Objective Increase in a sustainable manner the incomes and enhance the livelihoods of rural poor fisherfolk and agriculture households in the project area	No. of small holder farmer and fishermen hhs reporting improved incomes and food security							M&E surveys, NRSP records, progress reports	annual, ad hoc assessment	PMU, NRSP, IFAD	Updated BISP data on poverty available for targeting. Targeting guidelines available, NRSP staff trained and transparent targeting process implemented Political and economic stability and security
	households (number)		30 000	75 000							
	1.2.8 Women reporting minimum dietary diversity (MDDW)										
	Women (%) (%)		30	60							
	Women (number) (number)										
	Households (%) (%)										
	Households (number) (number)										
Household members (number)											
Outcome 1. Improved capacity of ultra-poor and poor hhs and small holder farmers and fishermen to increase incomes and improve livelihoods	1.2.2 Households reporting adoption of new/improved inputs, technologies or practices							outcome survey	annual	PMU	communities are willing to participate in project activities
	Households (%)		50	70							
Output 1.1 Holistic UC Development Plans prepared	UC Development Plans developed							progress reports	quarterly and annual	PMU, NRSP	Capable Social Mobilization services providers available and engaged upfront
	development plans (number)		45	45							
Output 1.2 Training and productive assets provided to ultra-poor households (0-11)	Rural Households provided with productive assets							NRSP reports, invoices from providers, PMU reports	quarterly and annual	PMU, NRSP	Careful assessment of each household's potential and endowments
	rural hh (number)		8 500	8 500							
	1.1.4 Persons trained in production practices and/or technologies										
	Total persons trained in crop (number)		20 000	30 000		3 519	11.7				

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of Verification			Assumptions
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2025)	Cumulative Result (2025)	Cumulative Result % (2025)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility	
Output 1.3 Skills and enterprise training and start-up packages provided to poor households (12-34) for climate smart agriculture	1.1.3 Rural producers accessing production inputs and/or technological packages							NRSP reports, invoices from providers, PMU reports	quarterly and annual	PMU, NRSP	Careful assessment of each household's potential and endowments
	Males (number)		5 000	20 000		0	0				
	Females (number)		3 000	10 000		0	0				
	Young (number)					0					
	Total rural producers (number)		8 000	30 000		5 675	18.917				
Output 1.4 Women empowerment facilitated through awareness /training on nutrition, climate change, food security and entrepreneurship development	1.1.8 Households provided with targeted support to improve their nutrition							NRSP reports, invoices from providers, PMU reports	quarterly and annual	PMU, NRSP	Project strategy for gender, youth, climate and nutrition prepared No social and cultural barriers that prevent poor women from participating in COs
	Total persons participating (number)		8 500	8 500		33 000	388.235				
	Females (number)		8 500	8 500		33 000	388.235				
	Households (number)					33 000					
	2.1.2 Persons trained in income-generating activities or business management							NRSP reports, invoices from providers, PMU reports	quarterly and annual	PMU, NRSP	
	Females (number)		5 000	10 000		2 500	25				
	Persons trained in IGAs or BM (total) (number)		5 000	10 000		2 500	25				
Outcome 2. Improved socio-economic infrastructure	2.2.6 Households reporting improved physical access to markets, processing and storage facilities							Assessments, PMU, NRSP reports	quarterly, annual	PMU, NRSP	Baseline established
	Households reporting improved physical access to markets (%)		42 300	72 800							
Output 2.1 Community prioritized infrastructure	Drinking water/irrigation/sanitation and innovative schemes constructed							contract registers, UC Development Plans	quarterly, annual	NRSP, PMU	Transparent selection/prioritization criteria established
	total schemes (number)		400	879							
	irrigation schemes (number)										
	sanitation schemes (number)										

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							Means of Verification			Assumptions
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2025)	Cumulative Result (2025)	Cumulative Result % (2025)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility	
	drinking water schemes (number)										
Output 2.2 Priority roads from farm or landing sites to markets identified and constructed	2.1.5 Roads constructed, rehabilitated or upgraded							contract registers, UC Development Plans	quarterly, annual	NRSP, PMU	Transparent selection/prioritization criteria established
	Length of roads (km)		80	185		78.37	42.362				
Outcome 3. Small fisherfolk benefit from upgraded and inclusive value chain leading to reduced waste and improved incomes	1.2.4 Households reporting an increase in production							Ad hoc, mid-term and PCR assessments	annual, completion	PMU, NRSP	No significant reduction in fish catch from disease or fish stocks in the project districts; Implementation as per planned schedule; Communities actively participate in entire cycle
	Households (%)		30	70							
	2.2.3 Rural producers' organizations engaged in formal partnerships/agreements or contracts with public or private entities							Ad hoc, mid-term and PCR assessments	annual, completion	PMU, NRSP	
	Percentage of POs (%)		11	40							
	Number of POs (number)										
Output 3.1 Jetties and allied infrastructure constructed/rehabilitated/upgraded	number of infrastructure sites upgraded							contract registers, assessments	quarterly and annual	PMU/Fisheries Department	Fisheries Department is responsive with efficient staff
	fish landing platforms (number)		8	30							
	sites jetties and allied infrastructure (number)		3	3							
Output 3.2 Fisherfolk Organized in Cooperatives, 4-P based value chains developed and youth facilitated to develop fisheries income streams	1.1.4 Persons trained in production practices and/or technologies							M&E reports, NIRSP reports	quarterly, annually	PMU, NRSP	No socio-cultural barriers for the participation of poorest and marginalized households
	Men trained in fishery (number)		20 000	50 000		10 561	21.122				
	Women trained in fishery (number)					899					
	Young people trained in fishery (number)					0					
	Total persons trained in fishery (number)		20 000	50 000		11 460	22.92				
Output 3.3 Access to finance and market	1.1.5 Persons in rural areas accessing financial services							M&E reports, NIRSP	yearly	PMU	beneficiaries willing to use financial

Results Hierarchy	Indicators							reports	Means of Verification	Assumptions	
	Name	Baseline	Mid-Term	End Target	Annual Result (2025)	Cumulative Result (2025)	Cumulative Result % (2025)	Source	Frequency	Responsibility	
	Men in rural areas accessing financial services - credit (number)					101					
	Women in rural areas accessing financial services - credit (number)					6 271					
	Young people in rural areas accessing financial services - credit (number)					0					
	Total persons accessing financial services - credit (number)		1 000	20 000		6 372	31.86				
Outcome 4. Policy reform/dialogue, communication and knowledge sharing	Policy 3 Existing/new laws, regulations, policies or strategies proposed to policy makers for approval, ratification or amendment							PMU reports	yearly	PMU	dedicated KM team is in place
	Number (number)			5							
	Knowledge and communication products							PMU reports, mass media	yearly	PMU	
	products (number)		6	15							

Pakistan

Gwadar-Lasbela Livelihoods Support Project II

Supervision Report

Appendix 1: Financial: actual financial performance; by financier by component and disbursements by category

Mission Dates: 1 November - 10 January 2025

Document Date: 03/02/2025

Project No. 2000002331

Report No. 7138-PK

Asia and the Pacific Division
Programme Management Department

Appendix 2: Actual financial performance by financiers; by component and disbursements by categories

Table 2A: Financial performance by financier (USD '000) as at 31 Oct 2024

Financier	Appraisal	Disbursements	Per cent disbursed
IFAD loan	60,155	13,045	22%
IFAD Grant	3,000	2,333	78%
SFD Grant	3,000	1,722	57%
Government	8,654	1,041	12%
Beneficiaries	992	83	8%
Total	75,801	18,224	24%

Table 2B: Financial performance by financiers by components (USD '000) as at 31 Oct 2024

Components	IFAD Loan			IFAD Grant			SFD Grant			Government			Beneficiary			Total	
	Appraisal	Actual	%	Appraisal	Actual	%	Appraisal	Actual	%	Appraisal	Actual	%	Appraisal	Actual	%	Appraisal	Actual
Community Development	24,429	6,596	27%	2,490	1,991	80%	760	707	93%	1,340	337	25%	778	83	11%	29,797	9,715
Fisheries Value Chain	32,497	4,689	14%	440	283	64%	2,240	1,014	45%	6,626	554	8%	214	-	0%	42,018	6,540
Project Mgt.& Policy Support	3,228	1,760	55%	70	59	84%	-	-	0%	689	150	22%	-	-	0%	3,987	1,969
TOTAL	60,155	13,045	22%	3,000	2,333	78%	3,000	1,722	57%	8,654	1,041	12%	992	83	8%	75,801	18,224

Table 2C (a): IFAD Loan disbursements (SDR, as at 31 Oct 2024)

Category	Category Description	Original Allocation	Disbursement	WA pending	Balance	Percent disbursed
I	Civil Works	16,477,000	4,793,892	241,339	11,441,769	29.1%
II	Equipment, Goods & Vehicle	222,000	268,732	-	(46,732)	121.1%
III	TA, Trainings & Studies	2,587,000	204,036	18,333	2,364,631	7.9%
IV	Grant & Subsidies	16,996,000	2,809,891	-	14,186,109	16.5%
V	Operating Costs	3,037,000	1,176,218	27,394	1,833,388	38.7%
	Unallocated	4,368,000	-	-	4,368,000	0.0%
	Initial Advance	-	7,622,687	-	(7,622,687)	0.0%
	Total	43,687,000	16,875,456	287,066	26,524,478	38.6%

Table 2C (b): IFAD Grant disbursements (SDR, as at 31 Oct 2024)

Category	Category Description	Original Allocation	Disbursement	WA pending	Balance	Percent disbursed
III	TA, Trainings & Studies	1,820,000	1,750,530	-	69,470	96.2%
IV	Grant & Subsidies	142,000	-	-	142,000	0.0%
	Unallocated	217,000	-	-	217,000	0.0%
	Initial Advance	-	406,536	-	(406,536)	0.0%
	Total	2,179,000	2,157,065	-	21,935	99.0%

Table 2C (c): SFD Grant disbursements (USD, as at 31 Oct 2024)

Category	Category Description	Original Allocation	Disbursement	WA pending	Balance	Percent disbursed
I	Civil Works (Roads Construction Work)	2,240,000	792,313	221,977	1,225,711	35.4%
I	Civil Works (CPI Schemes Works)	760,000	707,305	-	52,695	93.1%
	Initial Advance	-	868,761	-	(868,761)	0.0%
	Total	3,000,000	2,368,379	221,977	409,645	78.9%

Pakistan

Gwadar-Lasbela Livelihoods Support Project II

Supervision Report

Appendix 2: Physical progress measured against AWP&B

Mission Dates: 1 November - 10 January 2025

Document Date: 03/02/2025

Project No. 2000002331

Report No. 7138-PK

Asia and the Pacific Division
Programme Management Department

Appendix 2: Physical progress measured against AWP&B

Table 1- AWPB 01 July 2024-31 Oct 2024

			Period: 01 July 2024-31 Oct 2024			Cumulative Actual	Appraisal Target	%	
Indicator	Unit	AWP&B	Actual	%					
Component 1: Community Development									
A. Capacity Building for Participatory Development									
1.1.1	Union Council Development Planning	Development Plans	Plan	0	0	0	40	40	100
1.1.2	Training of CO/VO Managers	persons trained	Person	2400	161	7	4215	6600	64
1.1.3	Training of Village Resource Persons	persons trained	Person	0	0	0	462	440	165
1.1.4	Training of Public Sector Staff for UCDP	persons trained	Person	0	0	0	50	49	98
1.1.5	Activist Workshops	persons trained	Workshop	84	18	21	248	450	55
1.1.6	CAT Sessions by VRP's	Session	Session	800	51	6	51	4416	1
1.1.7	Exposure Visits	persons trained	Person	50	50	100	90	90	100
B. Poverty Graduation and Empowerment									
1. Asset Transfer									
1.2.1	a. Provision of Asset	Rural HH	Grantee	4500	0	0	4000	8500	47
1.2.2	b. Training of Asset Recipients	persons trained	Grantee	4500	0	0	4000	4000	47
2. Women Empowerment									
1.2.3	a. Women Resource Centres	Centres	Women	14	7	50	33	40	83
b. Capacity Building for Income Enhancement									
1.2.4	Capacity Building Toolbook	number	Plants	3000	450	15	825	3,000	28
1.2.5	Capacity Building - Provision of Toolkits	number	Households	40	0	0	0	40	0
1.2.6	Afforestation Campaigns with Women	events	Enterprise	21,000	6070	29	6070	30,000	20
1.2.1	Feasibility Study for Women Enterprise Facility/Processing Unit	number	Women	0	0	0	1	1	100
1.2.9	Establishment of Women Enterprise Facility/Processing Unit	number	Women	1	-	-	-	1	-
3. Youth Employment									
1.2.10	a. Accredited Training	number	Youth	1100	50	5	204	2,000	10
1.2.11	4. Start Up Package for Youth Employment	number	Youth	400	0	-	-	1,000	-
C. Farm to Market Roads									
1. Rural Roads									
1.3.1	a. Road Design Consultancy	KM	KM	50	0	0	40	40	100%

				Period: 01 July 2024-31 Oct 2024			Cumulative	Appraisal	
	Indicator	Unit	AWP&B	Actual	%	Actual	Target	%	
1.3.2	b. Upgrading of Rural Roads	KM	50	0	0	28	90	31%	
1.3.3	c. Plantation on Roadsides	number	8,500	-	0	-	8,500	0%	
2. Community Productive Infrastructure									
1.3.4	a. Productive Infrastructure	number	286	14	5	281	800	35	
1.3.4.1	a1. Productive Infrastructure (SDF)	number	0	0	0	79	79	100	
1.3.5	b. Plantation linked to CPIs	number	1500	-	0	-	4000	0	
D. Collaborative Interventions									
1. Food Security & Climate Resilience - Farming System									
1.4.1	a. Climate Resilient Farming Practices	number	Person	15,000	3575	24%	3575	15,000	24%
1.4.2	b. Climate Resilient Livestock Husbandry Practices	number	Person	15,000	2100	14%	2100	15,000	14%
2. Food Security/Nutrition Initiatives - Household Level									
1.4.3	Awareness Session on Nutrition	HH	Lumpsum	31947	34500	108	34500	31947	108
Component 2: Fisheries Value Chain Development									
A. Construction of Jetties and Allied Infrastructure									
2.1.1	1. Feasibility and Design - Jetties and Allied Infrastructure	Feasibility Study	Sites	3	3	100%	3	3	100%
2.1.2	2. Consultant for Supervision (Checker and Indentor)	Supervision Report	No.	3	3	100%	3	3	100%
2.1.3	3. Civil Works - Jetties Infrastructure (Onshore)	Jetties	No.	1	-	0%	-	1	0%
2.1.4	4. TA for Jetties Management - PPP Model		p/month	-	-	0%	-	216	0%
B. Fish Market Access Roads									
2.2.1	1. Road Design Consultancy	KM	KM	80	80	100%	80	80	100%
2.2.2	2. Upgrading of Rural Roads	KM	KM	0	0	0	27	46.8	58
2.2.2.1	2a. Upgrading of Rural Roads (SDF)	KM	KM	0	0	0	15	25	60
2.2.3	3. Plantation on Roadsides	number	Plants	3,065	-	0%	-	3,065	0%
C. Capacity Building of Value Chain Actors									
1. Value Chain Package (3 Sites)									
2.3.1	a. 4Ps model for market access	Partnerships	Lumpsum	9	5	56	11	15	73
2.3.2	2. Training of Landing Sites Managers/Trainers	Staff Training	p/days	75	-	0	-	-	0
3. Strengthening Fisheries Cooperatives									
2.3.3	TA Support for Strategic & Business Planning for Cooperatives		p/month	0	0	0	8	8	100%
2.3.4	Management Support to Cooperatives		Cooperative	58	-	-	-	360	-

			Period: 01 July 2024-31 Oct 2024			Cumulative	Appraisal		
			AWP&B	Actual	%	Actual	Target	%	
D. Capacity Building of Fisheries Department			Indicator	Unit					
2.4.1	1. TA Policy Reform Support			Lumpsum		0	2	2	100%
2.4.2	2. TA for Fisheries Policy and Regulatory Framework	Framework	2	Lumpsum	2	0	2	2	100%
2.4.3	3. TA for Inspection Manual	Inspection Manual	6	Months	-	0%		6	0%
2.4.4	4. TA for Stock Assessment and Management Plans	Assessment and Management Plans	3	Months	-	0%		3	0%
2.4.5	5. Equipment for Fisheries Inspectors	Equipment's	30	Kit	-	0%		30	0%
2.4.6	6. Fisheries Control Centre			Lumpsum		0%			0%
2.4.7	7. Training of Fisheries Officials	person trained		Lumpsum		0%			0%
2.4.8	8. Training in Sustainable Management	person trained	5	No.	-	0%		5	0%
9. Support to Training Centre Sur Bandar									
2.4.9	TA for Design of post-harvest curricula	Post-Harvest Curricula	6	Months	-	0%		6	0%
2.4.10	TA for SoPs for Laboratory	SoPs for Laboratory	1	Months	-	0%		1	
10. Innovative Aquaculture									
2.4.11	a. Hatcheries for Stocking	Hatcheries	1	Lumpsum	-	0%		1	0%
11. Strengthening Fisheries Department									
2.4.13	Vehicles	Vehicles	2	No.	1	50%	1	2	50%
2.4.14	Office Equipment	Office Equipment		Lumpsum					
Component 3: Project Management & Policy Support									
Knowledge Management and Communication									
3.1.18	Staff Trainings	Staff Trained	100	Person Days	40	40%	79	100	79%
3.1.19	District workshops	Workshops	8	No.	3	25	16	144	11
3.1.20	knowledge Sharing Events	Events	1	Events	0	0%	1	3	33%
Evaluation/ Studies									
3.1.21	Case Studies	Case Studies	6	Lumpsum	4	67	8	12	67
3.1.22	Video Documentaries	Documentaries	2	No.	1	50	3	10	30
3.1.23	Evaluation and Assessment	Study Report	1	No.	0	0%	1	3	33%
3.1.24	Project Completion Report	PCR	-	No.	-			1	0%
Software									
3.1.25	a. MIS / Website Designing & Hosting	MIS System	-	Lumpsum	-	-	1	1	100%
3.1.26	b. Accounting Software	FMIS	-	Lumpsum	-	-	1	1	100%
Institutionalization Support									
3.1.27	a. TA for CDD Institutionalization		3	p/month	0	0%	0	3	0%
3.1.28	b. Consultative Workshops		3	Lumpsum	0	0%	0	3	0%

Indicator	Unit	Period: 01 July 2024-31 Oct 2024			Cumulative Actual	Appraisal Target	%
		AWP&B	Actual	%			
Exposure to Best Practices							
3.1.29 Exposure to Best Practices in CDD		-	-	-	1	1	100%
3.1.30 Exposure to Best Practices in Poverty Graduation		-	-	-	0	1	0%

Appendix 2: Physical progress measured against AWP&B

Table 2 – AWPB 01 July 2023-30 June 2024

			Period: 01 July 2023-30 June 2024			Cumulative Actual	Appraisal Target	%	
Indicator	Unit	AWP&B	Actual	%					
Component 1: Community Development									
A. Capacity Building for Participatory Development									
1.1.1	Union Council Development Planning	Development Plans	Plan	40	40	100	40	40	100
1.1.2	Training of CO/VO Managers	persons trained	Person	2400	2446	102	3205	6600	49
1.1.3	Training of Village Resource Persons	persons trained	Person	240	262	109	462	440	165
1.1.4	Adult Literacy and Numeracy Training	persons trained	Person	230	0	0	0	800	0
1.1.5	Training of Public Sector Staff for UCDP	persons trained	Person	0	0	0	50	49	98
1.1.6	Activist Workshops	persons trained	Workshop	200	194	97	230	450	50
1.1.7	Exposure Visits	persons trained	Person	50	50	100	90	90	100
B. Poverty Graduation and Empowerment									
1. Asset Transfer									
1.2.1	a. Provision of Asset	Rural HH	Grantee	1618	1618	100	4000	4000	100
1.2.2	b. Training of Asset Recipients	persons trained	Grantee	2305	2305	100	4000	4000	100
2. Women Empowerment									
1.2.3	a. Women Resource Centres	Centres	Women	21	18	86	26	40	65
b. Capacity Building for Income Enhancement									
1.2.4	Capacity Building Toolbook	number	Plants	630	375	60	375	3,000	13
1.2.5	Capacity Building - Provision of Toolkits	number	Households	630				3,000	
1.2.6	Afforestation Campaigns with Women	events	Enterprise	13,000	0	0	0	30,000	0
1.2.7	Kitchen Gardening - Nutrition Support	number	Enterprise	3,000	0	0	0	7,000	0
1.2.8	Feasibility Study for Women Enterprise Facility/Processing Unit	number	Women	1	1	100	1	1	100
1.2.9	Establishment of Women Enterprise Facility/Processing Unit	number	Women	1	-	-	-	1	-
3. Youth Employment									
1.2.10	a. Accredited Training	number	Youth	750	154	21	154	2,000	7.7
1.2.11	4. Start Up Package for Youth Employment	number	Youth	375	0		-	1,000	-
C. Farm to Market Roads									
1. Rural Roads									
1.3.1	a. Road Design Consultancy	KM	KM	40	40	100%	40	40	100%

				Period: 01 July 2023-30 June 2024			Cumulative	Appraisal	
		Indicator	Unit	AWP&B	Actual	%	Actual	Target	%
1.3.2	b. Upgrading of Rural Roads	KM	KM	29.13	10.35	36%	10.35	40.06	26%
1.3.3	c. Plantation on Roadsides	number	Plants	8,500	-	0	-	8,500	0%
2. Community Productive Infrastructure									
1.3.4	a. Productive Infrastructure	number	Schemes	150	88	80	269	400	67
1.3.4.1	a1. Productive Infrastructure (SDF)	number	Schemes	26	26	100	79	79	100
1.3.5	b. Plantation linked to CPIs	number	Schemes	1500	-	0	-	4000	0
D. Collaborative Interventions									
1. Food Security & Climate Resilience - Farming System									
1.4.1	a. Climate Resilient Farming Practices	number	Person	15,000	3575	24%	3575	15,000	24%
1.4.2	b. Climate Resilient Livestock Husbandry Practices	number	Person	15,000	2100	14%	2100	15,000	14%
2. Food Security/Nutrition Initiatives - Household Level									
1.4.3	a. Food Security/Nutrition Initiatives - Household Level	HH	Lumpsum	1	-	0%	-	6	0%
1.4.4	b. Nutrition Support to Asset Recipient	HH	Grantee	1,400	-	0%	-	8,500	0%
Component 2: Fisheries Value Chain Development									
A. Construction of Jetties and Allied Infrastructure									
2.1.1	1. Feasibility and Design - Jetties and Allied Infrastructure	Feasibility Study	Sites	3	3	100%	3	3	100%
2.1.2	2. Consultant for Supervision (Checker and Indentor)	Supervision Report	No.	3	3	100%	3	3	100%
2.1.3	3. Civil Works - Jetties Infrastructure (Onshore)	Jetties	No.	-	-	0%	-	3	0%
2.1.4	4. TA for Jetties Management - PPP Model		p/month	-	-	0%	-	216	0%
B. Fish Market Access Roads									
2.2.1	1. Road Design Consultancy	KM	KM	80	80	100%	80	80	100%
2.2.2	2. Upgrading of Rural Roads	KM	KM	55.5	14.4	26%	14.4	55.5	26%
2.2.2.1	2a. Upgrading of Rural Roads (SDF)	KM	KM	25	10.2	41%	10.2	25	41%
2.2.3	3. Plantation on Roadsides	number	Plants	3,065	-	0%	-	3,065	0%
C. Capacity Building of Value Chain Actors									
1. Value Chain Package (3 Sites)									
2.3.1	a. 4Ps model for market access	Partnerships	Lumpsum	3	11	366	11	32	34
2.3.2	2. Training of Landing Sites Managers/Trainers	Staff Training	p/days	-	-	0	-	-	0
3. Strengthening Fisheries Cooperatives									
2.3.3	TA Support for Strategic & Business Planning for Cooperatives		p/month	4	4	100%	8	8	100%

			Period: 01 July 2023-30 June 2024			Cumulative	Appraisal		
	Indicator	Unit	AWP&B	Actual	%	Actual	Target	%	
2.3.4	Management Support to Cooperatives	Cooperative	-	-			360		
D. Capacity Building of Fisheries Department									
2.4.1	1. TA Policy Reform Support	Lumpsum	2	2	100%	2	2	100%	
2.4.2	2. TA for Fisheries Policy and Regulatory Framework	Framework	2	2	100%	2	2	100%	
2.4.3	3. TA for Inspection Manual	Inspection Manual	6	-	0%		6	0%	
2.4.4	4. TA for Stock Assessment and Management Plans	Assessment and Management Plans	3	-	0%		3	0%	
2.4.5	5. Equipment for Fisheries Inspectors	Equipment's	30	-	0%		30	0%	
2.4.6	6. Fisheries Control Centre	Lumpsum			0%			0%	
2.4.7	7. Training of Fisheries Officials	person trained			0%			0%	
2.4.8	8. Training in Sustainable Management	person trained	5	-	0%		5	0%	
9. Support to Training Centre Sur Bandar									
2.4.9	TA for Design of post-harvest curricula	Post-Harvest Curricula	6	-	0%		6	0%	
2.4.10	TA for SoPs for Laboratory	SoPs for Laboratory	1	-	0%		1		
10. Innovative Aquaculture									
2.4.11	a. Hatcheries for Stocking	Hatcheries	8	-	0%		8	0%	
2.4.12	b. Commercial Net Culture	Commercial Net Culture	64	-	0%		64	0%	
11. Strengthening Fisheries Department									
2.4.13	Vehicles	Vehicles			50%	1	2	50%	
2.4.14	Office Equipment	Office Equipment							
Component 3: Project Management & Policy Support									
Knowledge Management and Communication									
3.1.18	Staff Trainings	Staff Trained	Person Days	100	39	39%	39	100	39%
3.1.19	District workshops	Workshops	No.	8	5	63%	13	144	9%
3.1.20	knowledge Sharing Events	Events	Events	1	0	0%	1	3	33%
Evaluation/ Studies									
3.1.21	Case Studies	Case Studies	Lumpsum	4	4	100%	4	12	33%
3.1.22	Video Documentaries	Documentaries	No.	3	2	100%	2	10	20%
3.1.23	Evaluation and Assessment	Study Report	No.	1	0	0%	1	3	33%
3.1.24	Project Completion Report	PCR	No.	-			1	0%	
Software									
3.1.25	a. MIS / Website Designing & Hosting	MIS System	Lumpsum	-	-	-	1	1	100%
3.1.26	b. Accounting Software	FMIS	Lumpsum	-	-	-	1	1	100%
Institutionalization Support									

Indicator	Unit	Period: 01 July 2023-30 June 2024			Cumulative Actual	Appraisal Target	%
		AWP&B	Actual	%			
3.1.27 a. TA for CDD Institutionalization	p/month	1	0	0%	0	3	0%
3.1.28 b. Consultative Workshops	Lumpsum	1	0	0%	0	3	0%
Exposure to Best Practices							
3.1.29 Exposure to Best Practices in CDD		-	-	-	1	1	100%
3.1.30 Exposure to Best Practices in Poverty Graduation		-	-	-	0	1	0%

Pakistan

Gwadar-Lasbela Livelihoods Support Project II

Supervision Report

Appendix 3: Compliance with legal covenants: status of implementation

Mission Dates: 1 November - 10 January 2025
Document Date: 03/02/2025
Project No. 2000002331
Report No. 7138-PK

Asia and the Pacific Division
Programme Management Department

Appendix 3: Compliance with legal covenants: status of implementation

Description	Target/Action Due Date	Compliance status	Remarks
Financing Agreement			
<p>Section B Para 6 & LTB Para 16 - Designated Accounts for IFAD Loan, IFAD Grant and SFD Grant As per practice in the Islamic Republic of Pakistan, IFAD will transfer the proceeds of the Financing to a State Bank of Pakistan foreign aid account in USD. The State Bank of Pakistan will channel in PAK Rupees the equivalent amounts of the Loan, Grant and SFD Grant in the respective PAK Rupees Project Designated Accounts.</p>	Condition precedent for first WA	Complied	IFAD Loan: 3 Sept 2021 IFAD Grant: 3 Sept 2021 SFD Grant: 3 April 2023
<p>Section B Para 7 & LTB Para 19 – Project Accounts There shall be two Project Accounts in PAK Rupees (one for the Loan and SFD Grant and one for the Grant) for the project operations at the National Bank of Pakistan.</p>	Condition precedent for first WA	Complied	IFAD Loan: 3 Sept 2021 IFAD Grant: 3 Sept 2021 SFD Grant: 3 April 2023
<p>Section B Para 8 & LTB Para 22 - Counterpart Funding The Borrower/Recipient shall cause the provincial Government of Baluchistan (GoB) to provide counterpart financing for the Project in the amount of eight million six hundred fifty four thousand United States dollars (USD 8,654,000) to meet the tax obligations and provide counterpart financing for community development and project management. The Borrower/Recipient shall cause GoB to deposit counterpart financing in a separate account.</p>	Throughout the programme	Complied & Ongoing	Until 31 October 2024 USD 1.04 million has been spent.
<p>Section E Para 1. - Conditions Precedent to Withdrawal The following are designated as additional general conditions precedent to withdrawal: a) The first AWP&B and procurement plan shall have been approved; b) The Designated Accounts shall have been duly opened; c) Appointment of a full time Project Director and Finance Manager has received IFAD's No Objection and core staff shall have been duly appointed; and d) The Project Implementation Manual, including the Finance and Administration Manual, shall have been duly approved.</p>	Condition precedent for first WA	a) Complied b) Complied c) Complied d) Complied	a) 2 June 2021 b) 3 Sept 2021 c) 20 April 2021 d) 2 June 2021
<p>Schedule 1, II, Para 2 - Lead Project Agency (LPA) The Lead Project Agency shall be the Planning and Development Department of the provincial Government of Baluchistan (GoB).</p>	After effectiveness	Complied	
<p>Schedule 1, II, Para 7 – Project Steering Committee (PSC). The PSC will have the minimum following composition and will be formally notified prior to start of the Project: Additional Chief Secretary (ACS) Development (Chairman); Secretary Planning and Development Department (Member); Secretary Finance Department (Member); Secretary Fisheries Department (Member); Secretary C&W Department (Member); Secretary Agriculture and Livestock Department (Member); The Project Director (GLLSP- II) will act as secretary of the PSC.</p>	After effectiveness	Complied	PSC Notified on 29 April 2021

Description	Target/Action Due Date	Compliance status	Remarks
The policy level guidance, coordination and oversight will be provided by a Project Steering Committee. The PSC will grant approval of AWPBs, PPs and conduct regular progress reviews of the Project.			
<p>Schedule 1, II, Para 8 - Project Management Unit (PMU) A PMU shall be established and operate as an autonomous institution headed by a Project Director.</p> <p>The PMU will report to the steering committee at least twice a year.</p> <p>The PMU will be responsible for all GLLSP II operational and financial aspects including project, finance, procurement and human resource management as well as Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E).</p> <p>The PMU will be based in Quetta with two sub offices, one in Gwadar and one in Lasbela.</p> <p>The Fund's no objection shall be received before the appointment or dismissal of the Project Director, Finance Manager, M&E and other key Project personnel.</p>	After effectiveness	Complied	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> PMU established headed by Project Director. The PMU reports to PSC. PMU is responsible for Finance, Procurement, HRM and M&E. Two PIUs established in Lasbela & Gwadar. IFAD NOC obtained before appointments. No one dismissed yet.
<p>Schedule 1, II, Para 10 - Programme Implementation Manual (PIM). The Lead Project Agency shall submit a Project Implementation Manual (PIM) acceptable to the Fund within the first 3 months after effectiveness.</p>	Within 3 Months after Effectiveness	Complied	
<p>Schedule 3, Para 1 – Accounting Software Within 6 months of entry into force of the Financing Agreement, the Project will procure and install a customize accounting software as it is the practice in IFAD on-going supported projects, to satisfy International Accounting Standards and IFAD's requirements.</p>	Within 6 months of entry into Force of the Financing Agreement	Delayed	TOMPRO Accounting software procured & installed. Posting of transactions not yet updated.
General Conditions			
<p>Section 7.01 (b) (ii) - AWPB Before each Project Year, the LPA shall submit the draft AWPB to the oversight body designated by the Borrower for its review. When so reviewed, the LPA the LPA shall submit the draft AWPB to IFAD for comments no later than 60 days before the beginning of the Project Year. If IFAD does not comment on the draft AWPB within 30 days of receipt, the AWPB shall be deemed to be acceptable to IFAD.</p>	2021-22: 30 April 2021 2022-23: 30 April 2022 2023-24: 30 April 2023	Delayed	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 2021-22: 15 June 2021 2022-23: 13 Oct 2022 2023-24: 5 Sep 2023 2024-25: 27 Aug 2024
<p>Section 7.10 – Insurance – Goods and Building The Borrower / LPA shall insure all goods and buildings used in the Project against such risks and in such amounts as shall be consistent with sound commercial practice.</p>	Ongoing	Complied	Assets Insured
<p>Section 7.13 – Key Project Personnel The Borrower/Recipient or the Lead Project Agency shall appoint the Project Director and all other key Project personnel in the manner specified in the Agreement or otherwise approved by the Fund. All key Project personnel shall have qualifications and experience specified in the Agreement or otherwise approved by the Fund. The Borrower/Recipient shall exercise best efforts to ensure continuity in key Project</p>	Upon Effectiveness Ongoing	Complied Complied	

Description	Target/Action Due Date	Compliance status	Remarks
<p>personnel throughout the Project Implementation Period.</p> <p>The Borrower/Recipient or the Lead Project Agency shall insure key Project personnel against health and accident risks to the extent consistent with sound commercial practice or its customary practice in respect of its national civil service, whichever is appropriate.</p>	Ongoing	Complied	Personnel Insured
<p>Section 8.01 - Implementation Records The Borrower/Recipient shall ensure that Project Parties maintain records and documents adequate to reflect their operations in implementing the Project until the Project Completion Date and shall retain such records and documents for at least ten (10) years thereafter.</p>	Ongoing	Complied and ongoing	
<p>Section 9.01 - Financial Records The Project Parties shall maintain separate accounts and records in accordance with consistently maintained appropriate accounting practices adequate to reflect the operations, resources and expenditures related to the Project until the Financing Closing Date and shall retain such accounts and records for at least ten (10) years thereafter.</p>	Ongoing	Complied and ongoing	
<p>FA Section 9.02 & LTB Para 32 - Financial Statements The Borrower/Recipient shall deliver to the Fund detailed financial statements of the operations, resources and expenditures related to the Project for each Fiscal Year prepared in accordance with standards and procedures acceptable to the Fund and deliver such financial statements to the Fund with four (4) months of the end of each Fiscal Year.</p>	31 October 2023	Complied	
<p>Section 9.03 - Audit of Accounts The Borrower / Recipient shall (a) each Fiscal Year, have the accounts relating to the Project audited in accordance with the auditing standards acceptable to the Fund and the IFAD Guidelines on Project Audits by Independent auditors acceptable to the Fund; (b) within six (6) months of the end of each Fiscal Year, furnish to the Fund a certified copy of the audit report.</p> <p>The Borrower / Recipient shall submit to the Fund the reply to the management letter of the auditors within one month of receipt thereof.</p>	31 Dec 2022 31 Dec 2023 31 Dec 2024 31 Jan 2023 31 Jan 2024	Complied Complied Not yet Due Complied Complied	
<p>Section 11.01 (c) - Taxation The use of any proceeds of the Financing to pay for Taxes is subject to the Fund's policy of requiring economy and efficiency in the use of its financial.</p>	Ongoing	Complied and ongoing	
Letter to the Borrower			
<p>Para 9 – Withdrawal Application & Interim Financial Reports An electronic application for withdrawal, accompanied by Interim Financial Reports (IFRs) and by relevant forms and supporting documents, should be submitted via the IFAD Client Portal. Electronic submissions must be performed in accordance with the Terms and Conditions for Access to IFAD Client Portal, as outlined in Annex 2 to the</p>	Quarterly	Complied	All IFRs (Oct 2021 to Sept 2024) submitted within submission deadlines

Description	Target/Action Due Date	Compliance status	Remarks
Revision letter.			
<p>Para 10 – Contents of Withdrawal Application</p> <p>Each Withdrawal Application submitted to IFAD will contain what follows:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> i. the duly filled forms constituting the project's IFRs, as outlined in Annex 3 to this letter; ii. the bank statements of the Designated Accounts for the reporting period, showing the accounts' opening and closing balance and a summary of the accounts' movements; iii. the contracts register, as generated by the project's from the IFAD Client Portal – Contract Monitoring Tool (CMT) Module. iv. the expenditures transaction list extracted from the accounting software 	Quarterly	Complied	Complete IFR packages submitted
<p>Para 11 & 12 – Interim Financial Reports</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Interim Financial Reports Package shall be used as a basis for submission of withdrawal application to IFAD. The format and the contents are detailed in Annex 3 to this letter. • Interim Financial Reports Package shall be submitted to IFAD at quarterly intervals within 45 days after the period end. 	Quarterly	Complied	
<p>Para 13 – Contents of Interim Financial Reports Package</p> <p>The Interim Financial Reports Package shall include:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> i. The duly filled forms constituting the Project's IFRs, as outlined in Annex 3 to this letter: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Project Cash Forecast b. Summary of Sources and Uses of Funds c. Designated Account Activity Statement d. Variance Analysis; by quarter, by financial year and cumulative; ii. The bank statements of the Designated Accounts for the reporting period, showing the accounts' opening and closing balances and a summary of the accounts' movements; iii. The contracts register, as generated by the Contract Monitoring Tool (CMT) Module in the IFAD Client Portal; and iv. The expenditures transactions list, extracted from the accounting software. 	Quarterly	Complied	
<p>Para 16 & 17 - Revolving Fund</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Designated Accounts will be administered following Revolving Fund arrangements. Under the revolving Fund modality the first advance withdrawal cannot exceed the period of six months' forecast amount of IFAD financed expenditures approved in the AWPB. • Further advanced to the Designated Account will be made for the next reporting period based on the AWPB or expenditure forecast provided that at least 70% of the immediately preceding advance and 100% of all period advances have been fully justified. 	Ongoing	Complied and ongoing	

Description	Target/Action Due Date	Compliance status	Remarks
<p>Para 12 & 23 - Beneficiary Contribution</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Beneficiaries contribution will be for an amount of nine hundred and ninety two thousand United States dollars (USD 992,000) for matching grants, in kind materials, land and labour. Beneficiaries contribution shall be accounted for in accordance with procedures detailed in the Financial Management Manual 	Ongoing	Ongoing	
<p>Para 34 - Appointment of first Independent Auditors</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Borrower / Recipient must appoint independent auditors acceptable to IFAD within 120 days after entry into force of the Agreement. IFAD accepts the appointment of the Auditor General of Pakistan as the Programme External auditors to audit the financial statements relating to the Project on annual basis, in accordance with the agreed Terms of Reference, which should be cleared by IFAD. 	120 days after effectiveness		Auditor General Balochistan accepted as External Auditor.
<p>Para 35 - Audit Log</p> <p>Annex 8 to the LDH includes a template for the Log of Audit Observations, which should be maintained and updated regularly. A copy of this Log is to be included as part of supervision and mid-term review reports.</p>	Continuous	Complied	

Pakistan

Gwadar-Lasbela Livelihoods Support Project II Supervision Report

Appendix 4: Technical background analysis

Mission Dates: 1 November - 10 January 2025
Document Date: 03/02/2025
Project No. 2000002331
Report No. 7138-PK

Asia and the Pacific Division
Programme Management Department

Appendix 4:

- a) Technical background analysis – and**
- b) Status of Recommendations of Supervision Mission December 2023 and Implementation Support Mission June 2024**

Terms of Reference for Institutional Strengthening of Fisherfolk Cooperative Societies GLLSP-II

1. Project Background

The GLLSP II is a second phase of the Gwadar Lasbela Livelihoods Support Project which completed in September 2019. The new project was approved by IFAD Executive Board in April 2020, for an IFAD Loan of USD 60 million and a grant of USD 3 million. In 2021, the Saudi Development Fund approved a grant to the project for an amount of USD 3 million. The implementation of GLLSP II will complete in June 2027. The project has three components: 1) Community development, 2) Fisheries Infrastructure and Capacity Building, and 3) Project management. The project's goal is to sustainably increase the income and improve the livelihoods of poor rural fishers and agricultural households in the project area, and it covers 400 villages in 45 union councils of the Gwadar and Lasbela districts.

2. Rationale of the Assignment

The fisherfolk community in the project target areas are confronted with variety of challenges including, limited access to high-end markets, high cost of production, lack of financial resources and high post harvest losses due to unavailability of required infrastructure. These challenges are further aggravated by absence of collective voice and aggregation of produce to negotiate and bargain with high-end markets. Resultantly the income, profitability and quality of life of the fisherfolk community is significantly compromised.

To address these challenges and improve the livelihood of the fisherfolk community, the project has formed multiple fisherfolk cooperatives. Each cooperative is representative body of the fisherfolk community aimed to safeguard their interests and increase their income. The project has adopted 4P (Public, private, producer partnership) approach that requires that fisherfolk cooperative shall act as partners, negotiate their terms with private companies, undertake collective sale and marketing and manage the cooperative as an independent entity. However, these cooperatives are currently at the nascent stage and unable to articulate their vision and mission, lack clarity of roles and responsibilities and do not have the capacity to effectively manage their operations as an independent entity.

In view of the above, the project requires the services of an experienced service provider to assess the current capacities of the cooperatives, develop customized manuals and provide practical training and handholding support to these cooperatives in order to achieve the objective of well-functioning independent organization.

3. Objective

The primary objective of hiring a service provider is to strengthen the institutional capacity of fisherfolk cooperatives under GLLSP-II project. The specific objectives are outlined below,

- To enhance the organizational capacity of the Fisherfolk cooperative by fostering strong and sustainable leadership, improving governance and strengthening decision-making systems and processes.
- To ensure that the cooperatives act as an independent entity and carry out their day-to-day operations efficiently and effectively through well established SOPs and functional systems.
- To enable the cooperatives in better business management with particular emphasis on revenue generation, funds management and financial independence to ensure their long-term sustainability.

Scope of Work

The service provider will be required to undertake the following tasks at minimum,

3.1. Institutional Assessment of Cooperatives

- Carryout institutional gap assessment of the cooperatives to ascertain their current state of operations, institutional capacities and key areas of improvement in-line with the scope and objectives of this assignment. The key areas to be assessed may include, (i) Organizational management and governance, (ii) Office management, (iii) Human resource management, (iv) procurement and (v) finances.
- Based on the previous engagement of the project with the fisherfolk cooperatives, the above-mentioned areas have been identified where capacity building and training is required. However, the service provider undertaking the assessment may identify additional areas for improvement/capacity building or furnishing the already identified areas.

3.2. Development of Manuals

Based on findings of the organizational capacity assessment, develop comprehensive and user-friendly training manuals in the following functions of the cooperatives.

a. Manual on Governance and Leadership

The objective of this manual is to enhance the technical capacity and understanding of the cooperative management in key aspects of governance and leadership. It may include standard by-laws, organizational hierarchy with clear roles and responsibilities, membership eligibility and registration process, benefits to members, election process and protocols, decision making, conflict resolution, accountability and controls.

b. Manual On Office Management

The office management manual is meant to improve the day-to-day operations of the cooperative by providing clear guidelines, procedures and best practices. In addition, it may include general record keeping, filing, external and internal meetings, meetings record keeping, event management, internal and external communication.

c. Manual on Human Resource Management

The manual on human resource management is aimed to develop a customized HR system for effective staff management in-line with the cooperative by-laws and best practices. The critical areas include, hiring process for core staff of the cooperative, types of employees to be hired by the cooperative (full time, wage based, consultant, volunteers), terms of reference, personal files management, benefits, leaves, office timing, training and capacity building, work ethics, code of conduct, performance evaluation and resignation or termination.

d. Manual on Inventory and Assets Management

The purpose of this training manual is to equip the cooperative management with necessary knowledge and skills to effectively track and control assets of the cooperative. At minimum, the manual should include, definition of inventory and asset, purpose and importance, categorization (building, machinery, equipment, boats etc.), stock taking and assets register, coding, effective use, tracking, monitoring and supervision, repair and maintenance, risks management (insurance), valuation and disposition (sale)

e. Manual on Financial Management

The purpose of this manual is to develop capacities of the cooperative management in bookkeeping and financial control mechanism. The manual should include, financial terms and definitions, types of financial management and bookkeeping, basic accounting and bookkeeping process and protocols, budgeting, petty cash management, cash flow management, shareholders and shares management, financial statements, bank account management, bank reconciliation, dividend policy, internal control and audit mechanism, formation of audit committee and their responsibilities.

- The service provider must provide standard template/forms/tools for easy understanding and adoption by the cooperatives.
- Provide one Administrative procedural manual that will cover all the aforementioned areas both in English and Urdu languages.

3.3. Capacity Building Training

- Develop capacity building plan for each cooperative keeping in view their availability and seasonality.
- Provide training to cooperative management on the above manuals with particular emphasis on practical demonstration and participative learning.
- Provide post training hand holding to the cooperatives in internalizing the practices and procedures for institutional capacity building of the cooperative.

4. Deliverables

- Inception report
- Institutional capacity gap assessment report
- Training manuals

- Training plan
- Training reports
- Final assignment completion report

5. Qualification and Experience

- The service provider must be a legal entity registered with relevant authorities in Pakistan/Balochistan. A copy of the valid registration must be provided with the EOI/proposal.
- Must have preferably ten (10) years of working with cooperatives/associations/community-based enterprises, institutional development and value chain development. Copies of contracts/agreements of previous work must be provided.
- The service provider must have undertaken at minimum three (03) assignments completed within last 8 years on organizational development, development & implementation of manuals/SOPs, capacity building trainings and business plan development and implementation support.
- Experience of working with fisherfolk and fisherfolk cooperatives will be preferred.

6. Selection Method

- A firm will be selected under Quality and Cost Based (QCBS) selection method (Depending on the cost estimates/budget, the selection may be LCS).

**a) Status of Recommendations of Supervision Mission
December 2023 and Implementation Support Mission June
2024**

Title of Agreed action	Date of mission	Responsibility	Deadline	Status
KEY RECOMMENDATION				
<p>i. Financial gap between estimated cost of jetties and allocation</p> <p>The Project and IFAD will explore options for filling the financial gap for Jetties or at least the priority jetty construction and decide by the end of January 2024 so that the process of PC-1 approval and hiring of contractors continues unabated.</p>	12/2003	IFAD/PMU	31/01/2024	Done
<p>ii. differences between PC-1 and PDR</p> <p>It is clarified that the original targets of the PDR and category wise financial allocations of the PDR/Financing Agreement would prevail until the issue of are resolved through mutual agreement between IFAD and GoP/GoB at the time of Mid Term Review.</p>		PMU	Immediate and continuous	Done
<p>iii. Capacity Building of Value Chain Development Team</p> <p>The Project Value Chain Development Team needs capacity building for clear understanding of contextualizing the 4P business plans for individual landing sites; focus on building the organizational and technical capacity of the fisherfolk cooperatives; and ensure clear understanding of the terms including the role, responsibility and obligations of involved parties, of 4Ps business plan, by each member of the cooperative.</p>		PMU	31/01/2024	On-going
<p>iv. Poverty Graduation Approach</p> <p>GLLSP II has laid a strong foundation by kickstarting income-generating opportunities through asset transfers and created a critical mass of assets beneficiaries. There is a need to formulate a strategy and action plan to lead this critical mass of assets transfer beneficiaries towards aggregation of produce, markets linkages and value-chains development.</p>		PMU/NRSP	31/01/2024	On-going

COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT COMPONENT				
<p>v. Development of UCDPs</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Complete the remaining 20 UCDPs reports. Get the completed UCDPs approved by PSC and once approved, share with concerned line Department for consideration of inclusion in Annual Development Programme/PSDP 	12/23	PMU	31/03/2024 30/04/2024	Done
<p>vi. Coordination with FAO and WFP</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Put in place formal coordination/quarterly meeting mechanism for improved communication, progress review and resolution of issues. Both FAO and WFP to share updated workplans with the timelines 		PMU/WFP/FAO FAO/WFP	Immediate and Continuous 31/12/2023	Done
<p>vii. Differences in the selection criteria for CRAL (FAO) and the BISP-PSC based selection criteria of the Project</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> FAO, PMU and NRSP to resolve the issue and agree on a criteria. CRAL training shall be integrated with the beneficiaries selected for other Project activities. 		FAO/PMU/NRSP	31/01/2024	On-going
<p>viii. Inclusion of Fisherfolk in CRAL training</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> FAO to submit a proposal within the scope of the agreement 		FAO	15/01/2023	No received
<p>ix. Inclusion of Fisheries Cooperative in consultations for Policy and legislative framework</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> TWG notified for Fisheries Policy and Lehal Framework shall include fisherfolk cooperative as the fisherfolk representatives. 		FAO/PMU	Immediate and continuous	Done

FISHERIES VALU CHAIN DEVELOPMENT COMPONENT				
<p>x. Financing gap between the estimated cost of jetties and PDR/Financing Agreement allocation</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Project and IFAD will explore options for filling the financial gap for Jetties or at least the priority jetty construction 	12/23	IFAD/PMU	31/01/2023	Done
<p>xi. Start of construction of jetties by August 2024</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Project shall strictly follow the time for each step (validation of design, approval of PC-1, procurement of construction contractors), leading to the timely start of construction by August 2024) 		PMU	08/2024	On-going
<p>xii. Notification of Evaluation Committee for 4P Business Plans</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The project shall follow up with P&D department for approval of the Evaluation Committee for 4P Business Plans Initiate implementation of 4P business plan following the process prescribed in the 4P Implementation Manual 		PMU/P&D Department PMU	31 January 2024 30 March 2024	Done

xiii. Capacity building of cooperatives		PMU	15/01/2024	On-going
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Focus on organizational capacity building of fisherfolk cooperatives and prepare an implementation plan. 				
xiv. Capacity building of Project Value Chain team in context specific business planning and cooperative management		PMU	31/03/2024	Partially done
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Hire services of individual consultant/firm for capacity building 				
xv. Capacity building and institutional strengthening		PMU/Fisheries Department	31/01/2024	On-going
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Completion of the process of TA support for capacity building support to Fisheries Department 				
xvi. Policy Support		FAO	04/2024	Done
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> As agreed between the GoB and FAO complete the draft Fisheries Policy and Legislative framework. 				
PROJECT MANAGEMENT AND POLICY SUPPORT				
i. Differences in PDR and PC-1	12/23	PMU	Immediate and continuous	Done
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The PDR targets and Financing Agreement/PDR category wise allocations shall apply 				
ii. Recruit all the business promoter positions.		PMU	31/01/2024	Partially done
Complete recruitment of remaining 6 business promoters				
iii. Additional staff positions for PMU		PMU	15/02/2024	In process
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Recruitment of the proposed additional positions of Gender Focal Person, Environmentalist and MIS Officer 				
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 				

Effectiveness and Development Focus

Title of Agreed action	Date of mission	Responsibility	Deadline	Status
i. Inclusion of eligible HH in livelihood activities like assets transfer and skills development - on a continuous basis.	12/23	PMU/NRSP	Immediate and continuous	Continuous
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Eligible HH either not included in BISP-PSC data or whose poverty status may have changed since the time the survey was conducted shall be considered subject to verification through wealth ranking and validation by community 				
ii. Women membership in Cooperatives		PMU	Immediate and continuous	Continuous
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Project will equally mobilise and inform women on cooperative and will entertain the interest of women to become cooperative members. 				

ii. Business Plan/Roadmap for WRCs NRSP will develop an economic roadmap for each WRC including identification of market linkages and potential. The process of this roadmap shall be started parallel to the construction of WRC.		NRSP	Immediate and continuous	Done
v. Promote women as leaders in the VOs. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> As a key to effective women representation, encourage women at leadership roles in the village organisation. 		PMU	31/03/2023	Continuous
v. Baseline KAP Survey Report & KAP Module Submit KAP Survey report of PMY and finalise improvements in KAP Modules.		WFP	31/03/2024	Done
vi. KAP Community Sensitization Activities (Trainings and Focus Group Discussions) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Develop Work Plans with detailed breakdown of Sensitization activities and timelines. 		WFP/PMU/NRPU	31/03/2024	On-going
vii. Capacity building of Fisheries Department and Cooperatives in climate resilient fisheries		PMU	30/06/2024	Continuous

Sustainability and Scaling-up

i. Target for youth job market readiness <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Based on youth census results, the Project and IFAD shall consider enhancing the original target of training 2000 youth at MTR stage. 	12/23	PMU/IFAD	MTR	Done
Social mobilisation and formation of cooperatives <p>i. All cooperative members must be informed and sensitised on the purpose of cooperative, being member, their roles and responsibilities through multiple validation sessions.</p>		PMU	Continuous	Continuous
ii. Training of PMU staff, Fisheries Department and Cooperative members on environmental safety and protection.		PMU/NRSP	30/06/2024	Continuous
iii. Provision of proper wastewater disposal and drainage system for DWSS CPIs		PMU/NRSP	continuous	Continuous
iv. Briefing on UCDP preparation process <ul style="list-style-type: none"> After approval of the completed 20 UCDPs, arrange a briefing for P&D, Local Government and Rural Development and concerned Department on the process and model of UCDP 		PMU/NRSP	30/04/2024	Done

Project Management

Title of Agreed action	Date of mission	Responsibility	Deadline	
<p>i. Recruit all the business promoter positions.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Complete recruitment of remaining 6 business promoters 	12/23	PMU	31/01/2024	Partially done
<p>ii. Additional staff positions for PMU</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Recruitment of the proposed additional positions of Gender Focal Person, Environmentalist and MIS Officer 		PMU	15/02/2024	In-process
<p>iii. Update KM Plan</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Include time bound and stakeholder specific KM products 		PMU	30/04/2023	Done
<p>iv. Develop KM products together with FAO/WFP</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Leverage FAO/WFP expertise to release KM products – 3 products released to media by June 2024 		PMU/FAO/WFP	30/06/2024	Continuous
<p>v. Impact Assessment Studies</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Conduct an impact assessment studies, which could feed into MTR. 		PMU	30/06/2024	Initiated
<p>vi. Timely approval of AWPB and submission to IFAD</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The process for preparation of AWPB shall be initiated in April, approval of PSC shall be obtained and submitted for IFAD NO latest by 31 May of each year 		PMY	Continuous	Partially Done
<p>vii. Undertake analysis of feedback provided and improvement made by implementing partner.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> An analysis shall be carried out of the trend of improvements resulting from different monitoring reports/qualitative feedback provided by PMU/PIUs to implementing partners. 		PMU	31/03/2024	Continuous
<p>viii. Update youth disaggregated data in logframe</p> <p>Adopt the MIS and regularly update data on youth as direct beneficiaries of project interventions.</p>				Done
<p>ix. Review of Jetties EIA for ensuring SECAP compliance</p>		PMU		On-going
<p>x. Capacity building of Project Engineers and NRSP Engineers on SECAP</p>		PMU/NRSP		Done

Financial Management and Execution

Title of Agreed action	Date of mission	Responsibility	Deadline	
i. Finance Team: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Recruitment of Assistant Finance Manager and Finance & Admin Assistants to be re-evaluated considering qualifications and experience. 	12/2023	PMU	31/01/2024	Done
ii. Accounting and Reporting: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Posting of accounting transactions should be updated in the accounting software and reporting function of the software should be used for generating regular reports and IFRs. 		PMU	31/01/2024	Ongoing
iii. Control over expenditure and supporting documents: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Petty Cash Expenses: Documentation needs improvement in terms of maintenance of Cash Book, evidence of cash payment and evidence of goods/services received. Asset Transfer: Documentation needs improvements regarding number of goats handed over to the beneficiary on the Asset Transfer Form. 		PMU	31/03/2024	Done
iv. Internal Auditor: internal audit should be conducted by this independent specialised internal audit unit setup in the department of finance. Internal Audit Reports need to be shared with IFAD on regularly basis.		PMU	30/06/2024	Continuous
v. Departmental Accounts Committee (DAC) meeting <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Conduct Departmental Accounts Committee (DAC) meeting to discuss and resolve outstanding audit observations. 		Programme Coordinator Director Finance	30/06/2024	Done
vi. Response to Management Letter <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Submit response to observations in the management letter to IFAD 		Director Finance	31/01/2024	Done
vii. Counterpart Contribution <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Record on-kind contribution by the Government in the accounting software and include in project financial reporting. 		PMU	31/01/2024	Done
viii. Beneficiary Contribution <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Record both matching grant and in-kind contribution by the beneficiaries 		PMU	31/01/2024	Done

in the accounting software and include in project financial reporting.				
ix. AWPB Submission <ul style="list-style-type: none"> AWPB to be submitted to IFAD at least 60 days before the start of the financial year. 		PMU	31/05/2024	Not done due to revision of PC-1 and Reallocation Proposal development
x. Procurement Plan and CMT updating Procurement Specialist to get himself familiarized with use of OPEN and CMT. PMU to put in place a mechanism to ensure timely updating of procurement plan.		Procurement Specialist/PD	31/01/2024	Continuous
xi. PIM Revision Review and remove the inconsistencies in the PIM.		Procurement Specialist/PD	30/04/2024	Continuous
xii. Procurement Governance Improvement <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Ensure a checklist for each procurement transaction is duly filled-in and placed on file. Share a checklist of procurement (DOs and DONTs) with all PIUs. 		Procurement Specialist/PD	31/03/2024	Partially Done
xiii. Procurement Capacity Building <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Conduct a series of short procurement training program for PIUs and procurement committee members. 		Procurement Specialist/PD	30/06/2024	Planned in July 2024

Implementation Support Mission June 2024

Actions	Date of Mission	Responsibility	Deadline	Status
Follow the original Project Design Report (PDR) targets for assets transfer and Community Physical Infrastructure				
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Project revised PC-1 shall restore the original PDR targets and allocations made based on the attached category wise reallocation table. 		PMU	20-Jun-24	Done
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Revise the Project PC-1 based on the category wise reallocation and its approval. 		PMU		
FAO and WFP				
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> WFP: Revise approach keeping in view the specific district wise agriculture sector challenges and opportunities for nutrition benefits and submit it along with request for no-cost extension to the project and IFAD. 		WFP	15-Jul-24	Done
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> FAO: Revise the FFS methodology and duration to make it hands on learning and knowledge sharing approach and submit along the request for no-cost extension. 		FAO	15-Jul-24	Done
B. Fisheries Value Chain Development				
Request for Category wise reallocation to IFAD				
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Submit request for category wise reallocation to IFAD through EAD. 		PMU/PDWP	30-Jun-24	Done
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Revise the Project PC-1 based on the category wise reallocation and its approval. 		PMU/CDWP/EC-NEC	30-Sep-24	Done
Validation of Jetties Design and Costing				
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Complete the Validation of Jetties design after IFAD No Objection for engagement of Checker and Intender. 		PMU	31-Jul-24	Done
Capacity building of Fisherfolk cooperatives				
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Focus on organizational capacity building of fisherfolk cooperatives and prepare an implementation plan. 		PMU	Continuous	On going
Capacity building and institutional strengthening				
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Focus on capacity building and institutional strengthening support and start of work on related activities. 		PMU/Fisheries Department	31-Dec-24	On going
Revised Fish Landing Sites				
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Develop 15 landing sites with a cluster approach instead of the original 32. 		PMU	Immediate and Continuous	Done

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Develop detailed profiles of both minor and major landing sites, encompassing data on fisherfolk numbers, boats, middlemen, and other relevant information for developing sound justification for clustering. 		PMU	30-Sep-24	Done
Recruitment of Staff				
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Complete recruitment process for all the vacant position 		PMU	31-Aug-24	Done
Procurement				
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Finalize the draft community procurement manual. 		Procurement Specialist (PS) / Technical Coordinator (TC)	15-Jul-24	Done
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Finalize the market and options analysis of Boats. 		PS/TC/PD	14-Jun-24	Done
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Finalize the responses to comments on BERs 			05-Jul-24	Done
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Share the RFP for Jetties with IFAD for prior review 				Done

Pakistan

Gwadar-Lasbela Livelihoods Support Project II

Supervision Report

Appendix 5: Mission preparation and planning, TORs, schedules, people met

Mission Dates: 1 November - 10 January 2025

Document Date: 03/02/2025

Project No. 2000002331

Report No. 7138-PK

Asia and the Pacific Division
Programme Management Department

Appendix 5: Mission preparation and planning, TORs, schedules, people met.

Terms of Reference

COUNTRY OF ASSIGNMENT/LOCATION: Quetta/Gwadar/Lasbela, Balochistan province, Pakistan

MISSION NAME: Supervision Mission - Gwadar-Lasbela Livelihoods Support Project II (GLLSP II)

MISSION START AND END DATES: 1 to 12 November 2024 (in field)

REPORT TO: Fernanda Thomaz da Rocha, Country Director Pakistan, APR

MISSION COMPOSITION:

1. Fernanda Thomaz da Rocha, Pakistan Country Director, Mission Leader (remote)
2. Ghulam Nabi Marri, Country Programme Coordinator, Co-Mission Leader
3. Qaim Shah, Institutions Specialist and Team Leader
4. Zahid Shakeel, Infrastructure and SECAP Specialist
5. Enrico Andreini, Fisheries Specialist (remote)
6. Abdul Hamid Khan, Mainstreaming and M&E
7. Naeem Abbas, Procurement Specialist
8. Arsalan Vardag, Financial Management Specialist
9. Fayyaz Ahmad, Value Chain/Public-Private Producer Partnership Specialist
10. Angela Kimani, nutrition (remote)

Mr Richard Abila, PTL, Ms Anupa Rimal Lamichhane, and Petra Jarvinen, PDT members, will support the mission remotely.

BACKGROUND:

The GLLSP II is a second phase of the Gwadar Lasbela Livelihoods Support Project which completed in September 2019. The new project was approved by IFAD Executive Board in April 2020, for an IFAD Loan of USD 60 million and a grant of USD 3 million. In 2021, the Saudi Development Fund approved a grant to the project for an amount of USD 3 million. The implementation of GLLSP II will complete in June 2027. The project has three components: 1) Community development, 2) Fisheries Infrastructure and Capacity Building, and 3) Project management. The project's goal is to sustainably increase the income and improve the livelihoods of poor rural fishers and agricultural households in the project area, and it covers 400 villages in 45 union councils of the Gwadar and Lasbela districts.

Since November 2022 Supervision Mission, implementation performance of the project improved significantly, and the pace of implementation has gained a good momentum. The first Supervision Mission of Nov 2022 assessed the implementation performance of the project as moderately unsatisfactorily, mainly on account of start-up delay of about 18 months since entry into force and the qualitative issues in the approaches for implementation of Community Development (component 1) and Fisheries Value Chain Development (component 2). As a result, the project was placed in "Actual Problem Project" category. Then a series of Implementation support mission were carried out to assist the project in developing a comprehensive road map for improved qualitative and quantitative performance, and a Project Improvement Plan (PIP) that assigns specific responsibilities with timelines for resolution of issues was finalized in consultation with the project and service provider (NRSP). Based on the recommendation of Implementation Support Mission/PIP, IFAD provided technical assistance for a comprehensive review of the approaches and processes of Union Council Development Planning (UCDP) and 4P (public, private and producers partnership).

A full Supervision Mission in December 2023 was undertaken in the project area to assess the overall progress of the project. The mission observed Marked qualitative and implementation progress improvements in the key areas of: (i) beneficiary targeting approach; (ii) implementation of asset transfers and Community Physical Infrastructures (CPIs); (iii) completion of job market survey and start of trainings for youth; (iv) completion of feasibility and design of jetties; (v) completion of feasibility and design of 25 climate smart roads and award of

contract for construction of 11 roads (82 km); (vi) completion of the log frame baseline survey; and (vii) recruitment of key staff of PMU and PIUs.

MISSION OBJECTIVES AND OUTPUTS:

The current mission will undertake a full-supervision of the project to review the overall progress of the project, reallocation of category wise budget for meeting the fund requirements for construction of one priority jetty, fisheries landing sites and assess the status of implementation of recommendations of IFAD Supervision and Implementation Support Missions.

The mission will assess the reallocation of category wise budget for meeting the fund requirements for construction of one priority jetty, fisheries landing sites assess, community development schemes procurement, the status of implementation of recommendations of missions, those pertaining to both physical progress and qualitative aspects, and assess performance of the project based on the ORMS requirements. The Mission will specifically assess:

- Progress of the project under all the three components and identification of gaps and challenges hampering progress.
- Pending design review report particularly on Ormara Jetty IFAD is going to invest and which is to be submitted by individual consultant. Process of Procurement of boats under community participation approach.
- Procurement of Allied infrastructure (civil works).
- Review progress on community physical infrastructure, its relevance to the need for poor households, prioritization approach and sustainability outlook.
- Assess compliance to SECAP frameworks and measures undertaken to improve due diligence.
- Assess, to the extent possible, the lesson learned from Phase 1 of GLLSP investments especially the community physical infrastructure, roads and vocational training – assess the extent to which these lessons are being integrated in the implementation of current phase.
- Assess the efficacy of the mainstreaming/ M&E and KM strategies and identify gaps that warrant attention.
- Assess the level of implementation of the partnerships with FAO and WFP and the extent to which these collaborations are contributing to the project's overall objectives as well as specific objectives of these partnerships.
- Assess financial management, procurement and project management as well as coherence between AWPB, Procurement Plan and progress achieved.

INDIVIDUAL RESPONSIBILITIES:

Fernanda Thomaz da Rocha: Mission Leader, Country Director (remote)

- Leading discussions with key stakeholders and providing overall guidance to the mission members
- Assess the proposal by the project on reallocation of category wise budget, identify variations in financing structure and agree on variation to IFAD financing
- Chairs and leads the discussions during the wrap-up meeting in Quetta with Lead Agency P&DD and in Islamabad with EAD;
- Review the aid memoire and mission report;
- Review overall implementation progress of project components and assess the status of implementation of Missions recommendations; and,
- Identify actual and potential/emerging operational problems, propose solutions and provide guidance on priorities to be pursued for accelerating progress to achieve the expected results.
- Any other task that is referred by the mission team for guidance and concurrence.

Ghulam Nabi Marri: Co-Mission Leader, Country Programme Coordinator, Economist/Value for Money

- Assess the level of implementation of different technical documents including status of design review report of jetties, level of community participation approach and status of allied infrastructure.
- Lead discussions with the PMU and concerned implementing agencies and private sector partners;
- Make assessment of the overall project performance and quality of implementation in line with the defined result objectives, legal and financial agreements, in particular the performance of the activities related to Fisheries Value Chain Development;
- Assess the project's overall performance in targeting, social inclusion, community empowerment and beneficiary participation.

- Review the status of gender mainstreaming, gender equality, women's empowerment and participation in the project activities
- Assess partnership with FAO/WFP under the project and policy reforms agenda relevant to RBA collaboration;
- Any other task requested by the CD and that is referred by the mission team for guidance and concurrence

Outputs:

- Finalise Aide Memoire and Supervision Report, in line with IFAD's required formats.

Qaim Shah: Institutions Specialist and Team Leader

Under the guidance of the CD/Mission Leader, he will be responsible for:

- Review implementation progress related to subcomponent 1 and 2 and identify actual and potential/emerging operational problems, propose solutions for corrective measures or improvements to be made and provide guidance on priorities to be pursued for finalization of planned jetties construction time line, level of community participation approach and status of allied infrastructure.
- Coordinating the mission's activities, assignment of responsibilities among mission team members, lead discussions and liaising with PMU and concerned implementing agencies and private sector partners;
- Assign the detailed tasks contributing to the various parts of the Mission's Aide Memoire and SV Report among the mission members;
- Make assessment of the overall project performance and quality of implementation in line with the defined result objectives, legal and financial agreements;
- In particular, review the performance of the activities related to poverty graduation, capacity building and institutional strengthening under Components 1 and 2, including the achievement of outputs, outcomes and initial impacts, constraints, risks and lessons learned, and propose concrete solutions, clear strategy and operational procedures for enhancing performance in order to achieve the results expects by the completion date;
- Carry out comprehensive review of the AWPB to assess whether any revision and NOC would be required to ensure completion of all project activities for the current fiscal year;
- Review the qualitative and quantitative performance of social mobilisation and preparation of UCDP under Community Development component;
- Specifically, review the adoption of the targeting and poverty graduation approach, and the community need assessment processes in terms of its robustness and the extent to which it is aligned with the approaches of Project Design Report;
- Review the status of staffing and quality of Project Management and the status of progress on Policy Support (Component 3);
- Review the implementation modalities for the community led procurement and to take stock of the commitment levels under both components for the community level interventions;
- Update of IPRM, where and if needed;
- Coordinate and provide the necessary support to the team, fill-in specific sections in the supervision template as per assigned responsibilities, consolidate and review the aide memoire, supervision report and management letter, prior to their finalization;
- Undertake any other tasks as may be assigned by the mission leader.

Outputs:

- Contribute to the relevant sections, consolidate and review the draft Aide Memoire and Supervision Report, in line with IFAD's required formats.

Zahid Shakeel: Infrastructure and SECAP Specialist

- Assess and review finalization of planned jetties construction technical design study, level of community participation approach and status of allied infrastructure.
- Review the performance of the infrastructure activities under both Components 1 and 2, including the achievement of outputs, outcomes and impacts, constraints, risks and lessons learned, and propose concrete solutions, clear strategy and operational procedures for enhancing performance in order to achieve the results expects by the completion date;
- Review the performance of all infrastructure generated by the project (including community physical infrastructure-CPI) in collaboration with the other mission members, and make recommendations to ensure the sustainability of these investments (O&M), the farm to market roads and jetties/landing sites;
- Review rainfall, flood and temperature patterns that have impacted the livelihoods or the interventions of the project; and how project has addressed these challenges during implementation;
- Make assessment of the overall project performance and quality of implementation in line with the defined result objectives, legal and financial agreements in respect to the safeguards/SECAP;
- Review the identification framework and prioritization of CPI, FMRs and investment in fisheries related infrastructure;

- Assess the progress of project activities related to climate change adaptation and Environment and Natural Resources Management (ENRM)
- Assess effectiveness in terms of process or institutional capacities and coordination in mainstreaming climate change adaptation and ENRM at the project level.
- Estimate the effectiveness of the adaptive actions implemented and provide recommendations to maximise those benefits and ensure their sustainability.
- Review the status of implementation of IFAD Missions recommendations relating to infrastructure, climate, and environment activities;
- Review the status of development and implementation of SECAP frameworks and compliance;
- Review UCDP development planning;
- Contribute to the relevant sections of the mission Aide Memoire, Supervision Report and Appendices / Annexes;
- Undertake any other tasks as may be assigned by the mission leader.

Outputs:

- Contributions provided to the mission Aide Memoire.
- Contributions provided to relevant sections of the Supervision Report.
- Relevant Appendix and Annex provided according to report template.

Enrico Andreini: Fisheries Specialist (Remote)

The Fisheries Specialist will support the Mission in addressing fisheries technical issues, assess implementation progress/ preparedness, identify gaps and challenges and provide time-bound recommendations and guidance to improve project performance. Under the supervision of Mr Richard Abila, PTL, he will perform the following specific tasks:

- Review and assess the project fishery technical activities against the likelihood of achieving set objectives and the status of implementation of the agreed recommendations from the last Missions about fishery technical issues;
- Assess the suitability and adequacy of the fishing assets proposed under the project for fishing cooperatives and identify any gaps in the approach to achieve the project's fish production targets;
- Assess the measures under the project to reduce post-harvest losses and to increase the quality of the fish catch delivered to fish factories, local markets and to meet export market grade; identify any related gaps to be addressed;
- Working closely with the M&E specialist on the Mission, assess the tools and templates to ensure accuracy and reporting of fisheries data; identify any gaps to be addressed;
- Assess the progress/ preparedness and adequacy of the measures in place to ensure sustainable management of marine fisheries resources;
- Assess the progress/preparedness for income generation activities for women fisherfolk through Women Resource Centers including fish and fish products processing, fish grading and packaging, fishnet-making etc.; identify any constraints to be addressed;
- Assess the proposed arrangements for organizing fishermen; capacity development needs for cooperatives/ fishermen; identify any gaps that should be addressed to ensure sustainable fishing, market access and post-harvest reduction;
- In liaison with the infrastructure expert on the mission, assess the progress/ preparedness with the key fisheries infrastructure facilities and equipment under the project, including landing jetties, cooperative landing sites platforms, ice plants, fish quality laboratories etc; assess their adequacy, maintenance plans and identify any related constraints;
- Assess progress/ preparedness for implementing capacity building and institutional strengthening of the Department of Fisheries for sustainable Fisheries Management and to formulate a new Fisheries Cooperative Law in the Province;
- Assess progress/preparedness of the aquaculture activities under the project, including establishment of hatcheries along the coastline, private sector engagement and capacity building of the Department of Fisheries to develop, monitor and regulate aquaculture activities;
- Contribute to the relevant sections of the mission Aide Memoire, Supervision Report and Appendices / Annexes;
- Undertake any other tasks as may be assigned by the mission leader.

Outputs:

- Contributions provided to the mission Aide Memoire.
- Contributions provided to relevant sections of the Supervision Report.
- Relevant Appendix and Annex provided according to report template.

Abdul Hamid Khan: Mainstreaming and M&E Specialist

- Carry out a preliminary assessment on the quality of activities planned for nutrition interventions, and interventions targeting women and particularly youth;
- Review the status of implementation of IFAD Missions recommendations particularly formulation of the Gender Strategy and Action Plan by the project, and update the project's Logframe ensuring consistency with PDR and baseline;
- Assess the quality of information provided to the beneficiaries for self-targeting;
- Assess the quality of pro-poor targeting on the basis of the BISP poverty score card;
- Review the status of gender mainstreaming, gender equality, women's empowerment and participation in the project activities;
- Assess the project's activities with respect to the three dimensions covered by IFAD gender policy: (1) economic empowerment to enable both rural women and men to participate in and benefit from profitable economic activities; (2) both women and men have equal voice and influence in rural institutions and organizations, including decision making processes at household, community or local level; (3) More equitable balance in workloads and in the sharing of economic and social benefits between women and men;
- Check inclusiveness of project activities;
- Assess the ration f/m in the project management unit and among the service providers;
- Assess the programme's M&E system (including responsibilities, arrangements, compliance across project actors), especially its effectiveness in capturing bottom-up information/ data for reporting and as a management tool and identify gaps and suggest remedial measures;
- Assess the project's progress in managing knowledge including the knowledge management strategy/action plan of the project and assess capacity of the project and its implementing partners in this respect;
- Ensure the nutrition indicators are collected during baseline survey and provide technical assistance on MDDW collection/analysis if required;
- Evaluate and suggest improvements for the inclusion of priority target groups such as the ultra and extremely poor individuals who are recipients of assets in nutrition interventions;
- Assess and provide recommendations on ways to expand the target of awareness-raising activities on nutrition to include men and boys, in addition to women and girls;
- Contribute to the relevant sections of the mission Aide Memoire, Supervision Report and Appendices / Annexes;
- Undertake any other tasks as may be assigned by the mission leader.

Outputs:

- Contributions provided to the mission Aide Memoire.
- Contributions provided to relevant sections of the Supervision Report.
- Relevant Appendix and Annex provided according to report template.

Naeem Abbas: Procurement Specialist

Under the supervision of the Senior Procurement Officer, Mr Shankar Achuthan Kutty, in line with Module IV of the IFAD Procurement Manual, the consultant should carry out the following tasks:

- Assess and review finalization of planned jetty construction technical design study, level of community participation approach and status of allied infrastructure.
- Assess and review documents for competitive bidding documents for planned jetty and allied infrastructure.
- Conduct a desk review of the project's contract portfolio in the Contract Monitoring tool before the start of the mission to identify delays, big ticket and/or problematic contracts;
- Review the current Procurement Plan in order to assess whether it has been fully updated and upgraded in the correct IFAD template or appropriate IFAD procurement system, ascertain its completeness, its concurrence with the AWPB, Financing Agreement, Project Procurement Arrangements (PPA) and Project Procurement Strategy (especially concerning packaging and value for money) and its consistency with the country systems and/or IFAD Procurement Guidelines and Handbook;
- Conduct a review of any significant changes in the borrower/recipient's procurement system and practices, and ensure project procurement procedures and systems are updated accordingly;
- Review/update the Procurement Risk Assessment, using the IFAD Procurement Risk Matrix (Chapter I of the IFAD Procurement Manual) and update the procurement section of the IPRM based on the updated PRM;
- Provide support, advice and recommendations on the following: • Amendments to the proposed methods of procurement, thresholds, ceilings, contract types, contractual arrangements and preferences listed in

the PPA; The related IFAD review procedures and provide suggestions to improve the overall quality of the procurement processes;

- Based on the desk review of contract data, review a minimum sample of 10% of all post-review contracts (including contracts and agreements with implementing agencies and a sample of downstream contracts) and high risk prior review contracts during the mission for compliance with: • The applicable procurement framework: i.e.: national procurement laws and regulations consistent with the IFAD Project Procurement Guidelines and Procurement Handbook; • The approved AWPB and Procurement Plan, in terms of quality and quantities; • IFAD or national Procurement Bidding and Contract Templates (as applicable); and • IFAD's SECAP and other IFAD policies concerning anti-corruption, anti-money laundering and prevention of SH and SEA; • Compliance with good procurement practices in contracts/agreements with implementing agencies (clear deliverables, payment schedule, IFAD's right to audit, etc.);
- Review the procurement, contracting and implementation processes (prequalification/shortlisting, receipt of bids/proposals, bid/proposal evaluation and contract award) and timeliness and appropriateness of procurement actions;
- Review the management capacity and appropriateness of addressing SECAP risks through procurement (with specific focus on big ticket contracts and SECAP-related management at bidding stage and contract implementation stage), as outlined in the PIM;
- Assess contract administration and management procedures and review the completeness and updated nature of contract data in the Contract Monitoring Tool;
- Assess the procurement capacity of all entities to be reviewed in terms of manpower, levels of training of procurement staff, work environments, absence of conflict of interest with other PMU functions and the parent IA's departments and independence of procurement staff to carry out their statutory assignments;
- Conduct specific analysis of value for money (VFM) at all levels and the reasonableness of prices for: • Goods, equipment, etc. using available price indicators; • Civil Works, compared to locally accepted standards and prices; and • Services, compare quality-output to international standards and prices;
- Determine whether adequate systems are in place for procurement planning, implementation and monitoring, and whether procurement documentation and records (including securities) are maintained as per required standards and can be relied upon;
- Verify to the extent possible, whether goods, works and consulting services contracted were supplied/completed according to the required specifications and technical standards;
- Review issues identified in the previous procurement review and aide memoire and procurement related issues identified in project audit reports;
- Identify deficiencies and make recommendations for improvements and control mechanisms in the procurement procedures and processes;
- Bring to the attention of the SPO any instance of non-compliance deemed connected with malpractice or fraudulent and corrupt activities on the part of the borrower's or bidders' staff, including potential cases of mis-procurement or ineligible expenditures;
- Assess further procurement staff training needs and ensure relevant training is planned and provided to project management and procurement staff in a timely manner;
- Assess the procurement performance of the project with respect to seven designated parameters: Big Ticket Contracts and Contract Portfolio - Management Capacity of the PMU, SECAP risk management, procurement strategy & planning process, processes and procedures from Prequalification/Shortlisting to receipt of bids/proposals, process and procedures for bid evaluation and contract award, contract management and administration and CMT data accuracy and record retention;
- Assess the suitability and the correct compliance with the terms of any contract/agreement with implementing agencies. Downstream contracts signed by implementing agencies should be part of the post review sample in order to check if the implementing agency complies with its contractual requirements. When downstream contracts are reviewed, the existence and adequacy of distribution lists should be verified (these can be requested to be brought to the PMU);
- List needed improvements in relation to performance and define the actions, timeline and responsibilities (agreed with either the Borrower/Recipient or IFAD) for implementation of the recommendations resulting from this review;
- Submit an assignment report (as per the IFAD standard format of the Procurement Review/Implementation Support Appendix, Annex 1, 3 and 6 of Chapter V of the IFAD Procurement Manual), and any other relevant ancillary documents;
- Carry out any other activity, as required by IFAD.

Outputs: He will be expected to contribute (for those aspects that are directly related to his TORs) to the following Mission outputs:

- The Aide Memoire – section on overall project assessment as it relates to procurement and section on procurement;
- Prepare a Technical Guidance Note on findings of the review of procurement operations and provide guidance on implementation of procurement in remaining period of project;
- Contribution to sections – Procurement Review, Appendix 6,7 including an updated PRM.

Arsalan Vardag: Financial Management Specialist

Under the direct supervision of Kayode Fagbemi, you will carry out the Supervision Mission through a remote assessment (preparation for the mission) and the physical visit to the project.

At the assignment start and before traveling to the sites, you will review and analyse the project's documents and IFAD records received in preparation for the SM (see Annex 2). At this stage, you will contact the Project Management Unit and seek clarification on issues that may emerge during the desk review. You will review the findings and recommendations from the previous SM and note the issues that have been recurrent in the last three SMs. You will document the findings in the "notes on the desk review" and ensure an effective follow-up during the Mission.

During the physical visit to the project, you will focus on reviewing areas of weaknesses identified during the desk review exercise, the validation of IFRs, visit to selected project implementation units, and delivery of capacity-building activities to the project teams (to be edited according to the mission type). During the implementation/supervision missions stated above you will perform the following tasks:

Re-assess the quality of FM arrangements and update residual risk assessment.

- Perform Financial Management Performance Assessment, guided by the FMAQ template (annex 6)¹, to assess the strengths and weaknesses of the project's financial management systems. This will include the review of documents and reports indicated in the FMAQ questionnaire.
- Review and assess the adequacy of LPA's fraud and anti-corruption policy, including procedures for fraud reporting, whistle-blower protection handling, and safeguarding assets from fraud, waste, and abuse. Assess the need for anti-corruption awareness training for the finance staff.
- Based on the results of the FMAQ, re-assess the project residual risk under the six FMAQ pillars (risk AS IS at the time of the SM) before factoring the mitigation measures you have agreed with the project team. The proposed mitigation measures must be specific, clear, realistic, attainable and time-bound.
- Assess the overall country FM context and confirm whether there are any changes that may affect/improve the Inherent Risk².
- Review FM recommendations/findings from the latest supervision mission (if applicable) and confirm that the project is timely implementing the agreed action plan. *Critically review the unimplemented mitigating measures and consider whether they were suitable and they can still be implemented, or you may need to propose alternative mitigating measures if the issues are still prevailing.*
- **FM covenants.** Confirm that the project complies with all the FM covenants to the Financing Agreement (FA) and conditions set out in the FMFCL. In case of joint or parallel financing, review and confirm the adherence to fiduciary requirements of co- financiers.
- **Flow of funds.** Review the flow of fund arrangements as spelt in the FMFCL and assess the adequacy of the current system based on inter-alia, funds are made timely available to the implementing entities, traceability of IFAD financing, timely submission of funds requisitions, management of advances³, timely preparation of expenditures reports and monthly bank reconciliations. Refer to FMAQ section 3.
- **Counterpart funding.** Review the status of counterpart funding from government, beneficiaries, and other co-financiers (as relevant). Confirm that government co-financing is traceable, and a separate project account/ledger is maintained where this is provided in cash. Confirm whether the project has developed and consistently uses practical guidelines to define, measure, monitor and report all forms of in-kind contributions (IKC).
- **Accounting.** Review the project's accounting processes, identify accounting standards used and reporting differences with IFRS/IPSAS. Assess timeliness for recording transactions, budget posting and reconciliations. Comment as required on the suitability of chart of accounts and expenditure classification. Refer to FMAQ section 5.
- **Information system.** Using the "accounting software" checklist (annex 5), review and assess the functionality of the project's accounting software/ government system where the project is embedded within the government system. Review the FMDB 'Systems' tab on Accounting Software and note any discrepancies or updates in final report to the Finance Officer.
- **Internal controls.** Perform a virtual walkthrough of the project's internal controls and financial administration of funds and confirm the adequacy of payment processes, segregation of duties, and

¹ A self-evaluation by Project staff of agreed actions may be conducted as a first review. Where evidence provided is not deemed sufficient, the actions status should not be updated in FMDB.

² Refer to Enhanced Risk Framework; gather information from external sources, other projects and partners.

³ Review register of advances (e.g. to field offices, implementing partners, service providers, staff), perform ageing analysis in respect of the rules set out in the PIM, and highlight long-outstanding advances.

management of assets. Provide recommendations on any internal control weakness noted and concretely support the project with any needed revision of the PIM. Refer to FMAQ section 4.

- Review the internal-audit (IA) arrangements and status/follow up on past recommendations; review IA reports if available, describe findings and identify areas which need to be strengthened in the PIM⁴.
- **Oversight of Implementing Partners (IPs).** Review the MoUs/contracts signed with the project's main implementing partners (IPs) and the adequacy of fiduciary provisions (audit requirements, disbursement of funds, accounting and financial reporting); confirm that PMU carries out regular oversight activities. Perform the checks indicated in FMAQ section 4.
- **Project Implementation Manual.** Assess project's compliance with the PIM, including procedures related to travel, staff allowances, vehicles/fuel and IT.
- Perform visits to project's decentralized offices and perform standard FM checks (from FMAQ), as agreed with the Team Leader and FO.
- **Follow-up on ineligible expenditures.** Review and discuss with the project financial controller the status of the declared ineligible expenditures emerging from audit reports and/or communicated by IFAD, or any pending legal cases, which may imply ineligible expenditures.
- Consider changes in project design or implementation arrangements that have been implemented or are being considered by Project Delivery Team. Assess the impact of these on financial management arrangements and if any changes in the FM arrangements are required.
- **Expenditures review.** Review Withdrawal Applications (WAs) and IFRs submitted to IFAD after the previous supervision mission and perform the expenditures review exercise as per the "Annex 3". The size of the sample to be tested should be at least **20%** of transaction values. Identify potential ineligible expenditures and update the FMDB "Mission" tab section.

Review of Interim Financial Reports (IFRs): project's financial performance and funds forecast.

- Review the overall financial performance by expenditure category and component against appraisal targets and the approved AWPB.
- Provide technical guidance to the project on the preparation of the IFRs by performing the following tasks:
 - a. Complete Pillar 2 checklist and file this in FMDB.
 - b. Estimate the need for category reallocations.
 - c. Ensure that the financial data reported in the sources and uses of funds report are accurate and it is well reflected in the IFRs; reconcile with IFAD data (Status of Funds and Historical Transaction Report);
 - d. Reconcile the IFR data with the Trial Balance of the accounting system.
 - e. Review and guide the project in filling correctly all the statements contained in the report.
 - f. If needed, propose changes to the template to facilitate the project and to adapt the template to specific needs of the project.
 - g. Ensure the project is aware of the submission timelines (45 days after the quarter end) and review whether this were met in the last submission, understand the challenges, and seek to help the project where practical to address this.
 - h. Prepare a brief report on your findings, on the work done. Include your recommendations for IFAD and for the project and evaluate the quality of the report.
 - i. After the above steps, complete Pillar 2 checklist and file this in FMDB.

Outputs:

- Contributions provided to the mission Aide Memoire.
- Contributions provided to relevant sections of the Supervision Report.
- Relevant Appendix and Annex provided according to report template.

Fayyaz Ahmad: Value Chain/Public-Private Producer Partnership Specialist

- Review the performance of the activities related to fisheries value chain development including the process and quality of fisherfolk cooperatives and their business plans;
- Assess the level of attainment of community cooperatives strengthening, identify the bottlenecks and provide recommendations.
- Review the status of implementation of IFAD Missions recommendations particularly formulation of a clear strategy and operational procedures for development of 4Ps;
- Review the implementation modalities for the fisheries value chain notably the identification of private sector engagement, access to finance, innovative aquaculture and filling the gaps in the value chain;
- Review 4P proposals developed by PMU and provide support to finalise the proposal;
- Contribute to the relevant sections of the mission Aide Memoire, Supervision Report and Appendices / Annexes;

⁴ When the internal audit reports are not made available to the Mission (e.g. internal audit covers the entire Ministry department), the consultant can request an extract of findings and recommendations raised in respect of the project.

- Undertake any other tasks as may be assigned by the mission leader.

Outputs:

- Contributions provided to the mission Aide Memoire.
- Contributions provided to relevant sections of the Supervision Report.
- Relevant Appendix and Annex provided according to report template.

Angela Kimani: Nutrition expert (remote)

The project is nutrition sensitive, but the PMU needs clear guidance on how to identify, implement and monitor nutrition-related activities.

The consultant will:

- review implementation of the nutrition strategy
- Assess nutrition-sensitive interventions in the project implementation/AWPB, and assess partnership arrangements in line with recommend implementation arrangements in the PIM;
- Assess the nutrition-related activities are budgeted and financial resources are allocated in separated budget lines for their implementation (and reflected into the AWPB);
- Assess and review the start-up phase of the Technical Assistance partnership between WFP and GLLSP-II for nutrition-related activities and if necessary propose recommendations for improved progress;
- Assess, nutrition indicators are collected during baseline survey and provide technical assistance on MDDW collection/analysis if required;
- Evaluate and suggest improvements for the inclusion of priority target groups such as the ultra and extremely poor individuals who are recipients of assets in nutrition interventions;
- Assess and provide recommendations on ways to expand the target of awareness-raising activities on nutrition to include men and boys, in addition to women and girls;
- Contribute to the relevant sections of the mission Aide Memoire; and,
- Undertake any other tasks as may be assigned by the mission leader.

Outputs:

- Contributions provided to the mission Aide Memoire.
- Contributions provided to relevant sections of the Supervision Report.
- Relevant Appendix and Annex provided according to report template.

DOCUMENTATION

The following documentation will be made available to mission members prior to the assignment:

The mission will be provided with the supervision template which will be used to prepare the Aide Memoire and Supervision Report/ update the ORMS (Operational Results Management System), as well as with all basic documents of the project.

In carrying out the supervision, the mission members are requested to refer to the Performance Scores Descriptions which guide on additional aspects to consider during the mission.

MISSION ITINERARY:

Date	Activity
01 Nov 2024	Travel to Karachi and kick off meeting with PMU
02-04 Nov 2024	Travel to Gwadar and field activities/site visits/ fisheries cooperative meetings/ and back to Karachi
05-06 Nov 2024	Travel to Lasbela and field activities/ project sites visits/ fisheries cooperative meetings
07 Nov 2024	Travel to Quetta
08 Nov 2024	Meeting with Partners (FAO, WFP and Consultant) in Quetta
09-10 Nov 2024	Meeting with PMU Staff, review and planning of next activities, Meetings with Line departments.
12 Nov 2024	Wrap-up with P&D, Balochistan debrief and travel back/field mission conclusion

Note: Project will make all arrangements before the arrival of the Mission, to identify private sector participants and fisheries community for the 4P development in both districts.

List of Meetings, Field Visits and Persons Met
GLLSP II Supervision Mission 01-12 Nov 2024)

Date	Activity/Meeting	Visiting areas	Time	Participants
Nov 1, 2024	Kick-off Meeting with PMU, Partners	Karachi	2:00 pm	Rehmat Dashti (Project Director GLLSP), Asif Lehri (Program Specialist), Umar Mehmood (Finance Specialist) Nabeel Baloch (RGM-NRSP), Zahoor Ahmed (Project Coordinator FAO), Mazhar Baloch (WFP), Jahangir (District Manager NRSP), Ghulam Mohammad (Infrastructure Specialist GLLSP), Haibatun Umar (KM and Communication Specialist GLLSP)
Nov 1, 2024	Progress Review meeting with WFP	Karachi	5:00 pm	Mazhar Baloch (Project Coordinator WFP)
Nov 03, 2024	Meeting with Ormara Cooperative Members and visit of Jetty Site	Ormara	12:30 pm	20 Cooperative members, Rehmat Dashti (Project Director GLLSP), Asif Lehri (Program Specialist), Abdul Rahim (Fisheries Value Chain Specialist) Masood (District Coordinator GLLSP-II) Salam (Infrastructure Specialist GLLSP)
Nov 03, 2024	Visit of Ispiak landing site road and Sirki Landing Site Road	Ormara and Pasni	2:30 pm - 4:30 pm	Rehmat Dashti (Project Director GLLSP), Asif Lehri (Program Specialist), Abdul Rahim (Fisheries Value Chain Specialist) Masood (District Coordinator GLLSP-II) Salam (Infrastructure Specialist GLLSP)
Nov 4, 2024	Meeting with fishermen cooperative society Surbandar	UC Surbandar	11:00 am	16 Cooperative Members Asif Lehri (Program Specialist GLLSP-II), Abdul Rahim Fisheries Value Chain Specialist GLLSP-II) Munir Ahmed Fisheries Value Chain Office GLLSP-II and Abdul Rauf (BSP)
Nov 4, 2024	VO Chahbahari ward & Asset beneficiaries meeting and visit of CPI Extension pipe line and Visit of FAO Training	Peshukan	10:00 am	23 Community Members, Rehmat Dashti (Project Director GLLSP), Gul Afroz (Project Manager SMP), Pir Jan District Manager NRSP, Nabeel Baloch (RPO SMP), Masood PIU Coordinator Gwadar, Salam Infrastructure Specialist, Fazeel Team leader FAO Gwadar and Zahoor Ahmed Project Coordinator FAO
Nov 4, 2024	Visit of CPI Water Filtration Plant of CO Johrkahan	Chib Kalmati	11:00 am	15 Community Members, Rehmat Dashti (Project Director GLLSP), Gul Afroz (Project Manager SMP), Pir Jan District Manager NRSP, Nabeel Baloch (RPO SMP), Masood PIU Coordinator Gwadar and Salam Infrastructure Specialist)

Nov 6, 2024	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Visit to DWSS Naar Goth and • Visit to Wakeel Chib for VO Meeting • Visit to Ramzan Jamot Goth (WFP Activity) • Wayaro (FAO Activity) 	Tehsil Bela, District Lasbela	10:30 am to 3:30 pm	37 Community members, Rehmat Dashti (Project Director GLLSP), Ghulam Mohammad District Coordinator GLLSP-II, Irfan Ahmed (M&E Officer GLLSP-II) Jahangir District Manager NRSP, Nabeel Baloch (RPO SMP), Ramzan Jamot (Project Assistant WFP Lasbela and Fazal Team leader FAO Lasbela, Zahoor Ahmed Project Coordinator Lasbela
Nov 6, 2024	Visit of Cooperative Society Damb Somiyani	Daamb Somiyani, District Lasbela	11:00 am	13 Cooperative Members, Asif Lehri (Program Specialist GLLSP-II), Yasir Roonjah (BSF), Abdul Hameed (BSF)
Nov 6, 2024	Visit of Cooperative Society Berra	Berra Tehsil Somiyani Lasbela	1:00 pm	11 Cooperative Members, Asif Lehri (Program Specialist GLLSP-II), Yasir Roonjah (BSF), Abdul Hameed (BSF)
Nov 8, 2024	Progress Review meeting with FAO	Quetta	11:30 am	Rehmat Dashti (Project Director GLLSP), Asif Lehri (Program Specialist), Abdul Rahim (Fisheries Value Chain Specialist) Waleed Mehdi (FAO Area Manager Balochistan) Zahoor Ahmed (Project Coordinator FAO)
Nov 8, 2024	Discussion with WFP on Nutrition	Quetta	2:00 pm	Asif Lehri (Program Specialist), Noman Razzaq (M&E Specialist) Dr. Faaria Ahsan (Head of Program Balochistan WFP) Mazhar Baloch (Project Coordinator WFP)
Nov 8, 2024	Meeting with Fisheries Department	Quetta	3:00 pm	Rehmat Dashti (Project Director GLLSP-II), Dr. Javed Shahwani (Secretary, Fisheries and Coastal Development Department Government of Balochistan), Dr. Alludin (Director Technical Fisheries Department), Asmatullah (Deputy Secretary Fisheries Department)
Nov 10, 2024	Pre-Wrap-up Meeting with PMU and Partners	Quetta	11:00 am	Rehmat Dashti (Project Director GLLSP), Asif Lehri (Program Specialist), Umar Mehmood (Finance Specialist) Noman Razzaq (M&E Specialist), Ghulam Mohammad (Infrastructure Specialist PIU Lasbela), Abdul Rahim (Fisheries Value Chain Specialist), Haibatan Umar (KM and Communication Specialist), Nabeel Baloch (RGM NRSP)
Nov 11, 2024	Wrap-up with PMU and Government of Balochistan	Quetta	9:00 am	Abdul Basit Additional Chief Secretary (Dev) Balochistan, Imran Khan Baloch (Chief Foreign Aid) Balochistan. Rehmat Dashti (Project Director GLLSP), Asif Lehri (Program Specialist), Umar Mehmood (Finance Specialist), Hafiz

Pakistan

Gwadar-Lasbela Livelihoods Support Project II

Supervision Report

Appendix 7: Integrated Project Risk Matrix (IPRM)

Mission Dates: 1 November - 10 January 2025

Document Date: 03/02/2025

Project No. 2000002331

Report No. 7138-PK

Asia and the Pacific Division
Programme Management Department

Overall Summary

Risk Category / Subcategory	Inherent risk	Residual risk
Country Context	Moderate	Moderate
<i>Political Commitment</i>	<i>Moderate</i>	<i>Moderate</i>
<i>Governance</i>	<i>Moderate</i>	<i>Moderate</i>
<i>Macroeconomic</i>	<i>Moderate</i>	<i>Moderate</i>
<i>Fragility and Security</i>	<i>Substantial</i>	<i>Moderate</i>
Sector Strategies and Policies	Moderate	Moderate
<i>Policy alignment</i>	<i>Moderate</i>	<i>Low</i>
<i>Policy Development and Implementation</i>	<i>Moderate</i>	<i>Moderate</i>
Environment and Climate Context	Substantial	Moderate
<i>Project vulnerability to environmental conditions</i>	<i>Moderate</i>	<i>Moderate</i>
<i>Project vulnerability to climate change impacts</i>	<i>Substantial</i>	<i>Moderate</i>
Project Scope	Substantial	Moderate
<i>Project Relevance</i>	<i>Moderate</i>	<i>Moderate</i>
<i>Technical Soundness</i>	<i>Substantial</i>	<i>Moderate</i>
Institutional Capacity for Implementation and Sustainability	Moderate	Moderate
<i>Implementation Arrangements</i>	<i>Moderate</i>	<i>Moderate</i>
<i>Monitoring and Evaluation Arrangements</i>	<i>Moderate</i>	<i>Low</i>
Project Financial Management	High	Substantial
<i>Project Organization and Staffing</i>	<i>Substantial</i>	<i>Moderate</i>
<i>Project Budgeting</i>	<i>Substantial</i>	<i>Moderate</i>
<i>Project Funds Flow/Disbursement Arrangements</i>	<i>Substantial</i>	<i>Moderate</i>
<i>Project Internal Controls</i>	<i>High</i>	<i>Substantial</i>
<i>Project Accounting and Financial Reporting</i>	<i>Substantial</i>	<i>Moderate</i>
<i>Project External Audit</i>	<i>Substantial</i>	<i>Moderate</i>
Project Procurement	Substantial	Substantial
<i>B.1 Assessment of Project Complexity</i>	<i>Substantial</i>	<i>Substantial</i>
<i>B.2 Assessment of Implementing Agency Capacity</i>	<i>Low</i>	<i>Low</i>
<i>Project Procurement Overall</i>	<i>Substantial</i>	<i>Substantial</i>
<i>A.1 Legal, Regulatory and Policy Framework</i>	<i>Substantial</i>	<i>Substantial</i>
<i>A.2 Institutional Framework and Management Capacity</i>	<i>Moderate</i>	<i>Moderate</i>
<i>A.4 Accountability, Integrity and Transparency of the Public Procurement System</i>	<i>Substantial</i>	<i>Substantial</i>
<i>A.3 Public Procurement Operations and Market Practices.</i>	<i>Moderate</i>	<i>Moderate</i>
Environment, Social and Climate Impact	Moderate	Moderate
<i>Biodiversity Conservation</i>	<i>Moderate</i>	<i>Moderate</i>
<i>Resource Efficiency and Pollution Prevention</i>	<i>Moderate</i>	<i>Moderate</i>
<i>Cultural Heritage</i>		<i>No risk envisaged - not applicable</i>
<i>Indigenous People</i>		<i>No risk envisaged - not applicable</i>
<i>Labour and Working Conditions</i>	<i>Moderate</i>	<i>Moderate</i>

Risk Category / Subcategory	Inherent risk	Residual risk
<i>Community health, safety and security</i>	<i>Moderate</i>	<i>Low</i>
<i>Physical and Economic Resettlement</i>		<i>No risk envisaged - not applicable</i>
<i>Greenhouse Gas Emissions</i>	<i>Low</i>	<i>Low</i>
<i>Vulnerability of target populations and ecosystems to climate variability and hazards</i>		<i>No risk envisaged - not applicable</i>
Stakeholders	Moderate	Moderate
<i>Stakeholder Engagement/Coordination</i>	<i>Moderate</i>	<i>Low</i>
<i>Stakeholder Grievances</i>	<i>Moderate</i>	<i>Moderate</i>
Overall	Substantial	Moderate

Country Context	Moderate	Moderate
Political Commitment	Moderate	Moderate
<p>Risk:</p> <p>Political commitment may be affected by: (i) macro-economic challenges; (ii) a strong opposition and political movement by the ousted Prime Minister; (iii) slow down in decision making due to change in administration; and (iv) geo-political environment owing to the strategic importance of the coastal areas (notably Gwadar Port) has posed numerous challenges to the Federal and Balochistan Governments</p>	Moderate	Moderate
<p>Mitigations:</p> <p>(i) Project design is entirely aligned to the Government's priorities, policies and strategies; and, (ii) project provides TA for policy reforms in fisheries sector and institutionalisation of the community driven approach. Project is highly relevant to the needs of the community.</p>		
Governance	Moderate	Moderate
<p>Risk:</p> <p>The main risk pertains to shortage of counterpart funding and likely misuse of funds, namely, (i) the gap between revenues and expenditures usually lead to expenditure cuts and allocations for development projects; insufficient authority given to internal financial control and audit units within line departments and project; (ii) inadequate capacity, could affect effectiveness in financial management, control of expenditures, and accountability, posing the risk of misuse of funds; and (iii) delay owing to the need for NOC from Naval Forces for construction of Jettiers and allied infrastructure.</p>	Moderate	Moderate
<p>Mitigations:</p> <p>Project have made provisions for; (i) financial management and audit, including assistance for capacity building of PMU; (ii) project will use of accounting software; and (iii) regular audit (both internal and external) being mandatory. The project will have a timely engagement with authorities for obtaining No Objection alongside the feasibility studies.</p>		
Macroeconomic	Moderate	Moderate
<p>Risk:</p> <p>The country continue to have large current account deficit, adverse balance of payments, revenue collection shortfalls, continued devaluation of national currency and rising inflation. In addition growth rate is predicted to decline or stagnate.</p>	Moderate	Moderate

<p>Mitigations:</p> <p>During the implementation IFAD and executing agency to; (i) ensure continued relevance of project to needs of beneficiaries and government's priorities; (ii) project management to undertake timely projections to determined counterpart funds by PMU, and, (iii) regular monitoring of disbursements.</p>		
<p>Fragility and Security</p>	<p>Substantial</p>	<p>Moderate</p>
<p>Risk:</p> <p>Major risks which could potentially affect pace of project implementation include; (i) province-wide instable law and order situation; (ii) frequent tens situation at borders (with Iran and Afghanistan) which indirectly impact local economy; (iii) restricted movement of international expert in the project area owing to UNDSS requirements; and, (iv) local tribal system potentially disrupting project activities.</p>	<p>Substantial</p>	<p>Moderate</p>
<p>Mitigations:</p> <p>The current government is committed and applying multi-pronged strategy to improve law and order and the geopolitical environment has improved along the border with Afghanistan and Iran; and, security agencies have beefed up operation in the project areas.</p> <p>At the project level the pertinent risks will be mitigated through; (i) continued community- consultations throughout project implementation; (ii) poverty graduation, community mobilization and fisheries development - promoting local job opportunities and income generation activities; and, (iii) use of qualified national specialists for TA and supervision/support missions.</p>		
<p>Sector Strategies and Policies</p>	<p>Moderate</p>	<p>Moderate</p>
<p>Policy alignment</p>	<p>Moderate</p>	<p>Low</p>
<p>Risk:</p> <p>Main risk pertains to policy framework with strong government role, that diverts resources from private sector and community development.</p>	<p>Moderate</p>	<p>Low</p>
<p>Mitigations:</p> <p>The project has provision for policy alignment and through FAO collaboration will seek alignment with National Policy Framework for fisheries.</p>		
<p>Policy Development and Implementation</p>	<p>Moderate</p>	<p>Moderate</p>
<p>Risk:</p> <p>Limited capacities in place with regards to policy reforms and policy implementation lead to delayed benefits to communities.</p>	<p>Moderate</p>	<p>Moderate</p>
<p>Mitigations:</p> <p>Project will provide technical assistance for policy reforms as well as support institutional strengthening for policy reforms implementation for fisheries sector and community-led rural development.</p>		
<p>Environment and Climate Context</p>	<p>Substantial</p>	<p>Moderate</p>
<p>Project vulnerability to environmental conditions</p>	<p>Moderate</p>	<p>Moderate</p>
<p>Risk:</p> <p>Baluchistan's coastal areas faces erosion, sea water intrusion and are prone to dust storms.</p>	<p>Moderate</p>	<p>Moderate</p>

<p>Mitigations:</p> <p>Project's direct support will improve environment by; (i) adaptation of all infrastructure designs to make them environmentally friendly; and, (ii) ensure flood and drainage control functions in roads and CPIs.</p>		
<p>Project vulnerability to climate change impacts</p>	Substantial	Moderate
<p>Risk:</p> <p>Communities in the target districts are vulnerable to recurrent occurrence of variety of natural and climate-induced adversities – features such as soil erosion, recurring flash floods and droughts; earthquakes, rising temperature, heavy torrents and frequent dust-storms.</p>	Substantial	Moderate
<p>Mitigations:</p> <p>The project direct support include undertaking; (i) climate change risk assessment together with hydrological modelling during all infrastructure design; (ii) adaptation of structures and materials; (iii) adequate measure to ensure O&M; (iv) extensive training and demonstrations for small holder farmers in climate smart agriculture, as well as for fishermen and line departments; and, (v) mandatory plantation around all infrastructure projects..</p>		
<p>Project Scope</p>	Substantial	Moderate
<p>Project Relevance</p>	Moderate	Moderate
<p>Risk:</p> <p>Due to high prevalence of poverty in the two districts and diverse needs of communities, the project may not fulfil all the needs adequately.</p>	Moderate	Moderate
<p>Mitigations:</p> <p>The project will promote union council development planning and 4Ps to leverage resources for greater impact.</p>		
<p>Technical Soundness</p>	Substantial	Moderate
<p>Risk:</p> <p>Absence of legal framework for farmers' organisations to support 4Ps in fisheries and lack of capacity may hamper the full and timely realisation of benefits.</p>	Substantial	Moderate
<p>Mitigations:</p> <p>The project design is informed by lessons learned such as: holistically address priorities, remain simple in terms of number, type and range of activities as well as implementation arrangements. Community participation and knowledge of challenges and opportunities gained during Phase 1 will be utilized.</p>		
<p>Institutional Capacity for Implementation and Sustainability</p>	Moderate	Moderate
<p>Implementation Arrangements</p>	Moderate	Moderate
<p>Risk:</p> <p>Relevant institutions to the Project face several institutional capacity issues. In addition, there is limited design and implementation capacity for jetties and support infrastructure which may hamper timely achievement of targets.</p>	Moderate	Moderate

<p>Mitigations:</p> <p>The risk is addressed through the establishment of a capacitated PMU, the provision of back-up technical assistance, the partnership with FAO and WFP, the capacity building of staff and the engagement of capable SMP. A comprehensive technical assistance package has been designed to build department capacity and assist in programme implementation through a professional team based in PMU with all key procurement done at the PMU level.</p>		
<p>Monitoring and Evaluation Arrangements</p>	Moderate	Low
<p>Risk:</p> <p>The project may experience limited access to field data and restricted field work during missions as well as delayed implementation due to security risks.</p>	Moderate	Low
<p>Mitigations:</p> <p>Use of improved processes and technology-based solution for M&E, such as geo-tagging systems, etc.</p>		
<p>Project Financial Management</p>	High	Substantial
<p>Project Organization and Staffing</p>	Substantial	Moderate
<p>Risk:</p> <p>Nil</p>	Substantial	Moderate
<p>Mitigations:</p> <p>Nil</p>		
<p>Project Budgeting</p>	Substantial	Moderate
<p>Risk:</p> <p>AWPB preparation and approval is usually delayed.</p>	Substantial	Moderate
<p>Mitigations:</p> <p>AWPB to be submitted to IFAD at least 60 days before the start of the financial year.</p>		
<p>Project Funds Flow/Disbursement Arrangements</p>	Substantial	Moderate
<p>Risk:</p> <p>Nil</p>	Substantial	Moderate
<p>Mitigations:</p> <p>Nil</p>		
<p>Project Internal Controls</p>	High	Substantial

<p>Risk:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Full amount of the Contract was paid in advance to the Fishermen Cooperatives. However, as per the contract payments were to be made either directly to the Vendors of the Cooperative or as a reimbursement to the Cooperative. • Payments to Engineering Consultants (TAMAS and CAMEOS) were made without verification of service delivery by the Infrastructure Specialist of the Project. During the mission, all previous invoices were verified by the Infrastructure Specialist. • Payment to CAMEOS (Engineering Consultants for Roads) was made twice by mistake amounting to PKR 2.66 million. • Internal Audit reports have not been submitted to IFAD. Response of the Project on the Internal Audit reports also needs to be submitted to IFAD. • GoB with the assistance of the World Bank has established an independent specialised internal audit unit under the department of finance for conducting internal audits of various departments and projects. The mission recommends that the project's internal audit should to be conducted by this independent specialised internal audit unit and its reports shared with IFAD. This will ensure conduct of an independence and professional internal audit. While this arrangement is finalised, the current internal auditor needs to continue conducting internal audits and share internal audit reports with IFAD. The project raised this matter with the P&D Department and with the Finance Department, however, response from the Finance Department has not yet been received. 	High	Substantial
<p>Mitigations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Payment Terms in the Contracts with Fishermen Cooperatives need to be reviewed and modified to reflect the intended/actual relationship / arrangement. • Invoices of Engineering Consultants (TAMAS and CAMEOS) should be verified before payment by the Infrastructure Specialist to ensure service delivery. • Additional payment to CAMEOS amounting to PKR 2.66 million should be deducted from future payments. • Internal Audit Reports need to be shared with IFAD on regularly basis. • Internal audit should to be conducted by independent specialised internal audit unit setup in the Department of Finance. 		
<p>Project Accounting and Financial Reporting</p>	Substantial	Moderate
<p>Risk:</p> <p>Nil</p>	Substantial	Moderate
<p>Mitigations:</p> <p>Nil</p>		
<p>Project External Audit</p>	Substantial	Moderate
<p>Risk:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The first Audit Report of the project for financial year 2021-22 included five audit findings which do not involve an ineligible expenditure. There is not financial impact on IFAD Funding. • The second Audit Report of the project for financial year 2022-23 included seven audit findings which do not involve an ineligible expenditure. There is not financial impact on IFAD Funding. 	Substantial	Moderate
<p>Mitigations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Conduct Departmental Accounts Committee (DAC) meeting to discuss and resolve outstanding audit observations. • Submit response to observations in the management letter to IFAD 		
<p>Project Procurement</p>	Substantial	Substantial
<p>B.1 Assessment of Project Complexity</p>	Substantial	Substantial

<p>Risk:</p> <p>Project area is geographically spread over the Balochistan province. Project involves community participation in procurement activities. The capacity of the community regarding community procurement might be limited due to lack of skills, qualification and previous experience. There is a capacity constraint of implementing high value contracts of construction of Jetties and purchasing of boats.</p>	Substantial	Substantial
<p>Mitigations:</p> <p>PMU will ensure coordination with implementing partners and cooperating agencies through PIUs for smooth implementation. PMU will engage supervision engineer to oversee the construction of Jetties.</p>		
<p>B.2 Assesment of Implementing Agency Capacity</p>	Low	Low
<p>Risk:</p> <p>(Section 2.1.1 is to be filled only if the IA is an autonomous national agency or a private entity which is allowed to have a separate legal framework for procurement other than the national procurement law/regulations which was assessed under Part A)</p> <p>The Implementing agency is P&DD which is a core government department. The project is being implemented through PMU at Quetta and PIUs at two districts level. A PSC, headed by Additional Chief Secretary P&DD, will oversee and supervise the implementation progress of the project. P&DD, PMU, PIUs, Agriculture, livestock and fisheries departments etc. are not autonomous national /provincial agencies. They are not allowed to have a separate procurement legal framework.</p>	Low	Low
<p>Mitigations:</p> <p>The IA follows Balochistan Public Procurement Rules, 2014 so long as they are consistent with the IFAD Procurement Handbook and Guidelines. The IA shall use the IFAD SPDs for procurement of Goods, Works and Services.</p>		
<p>Project Procurement Overall</p>	Substantial	Substantial
<p>Risk:</p> <p>The PMU is housed in two separate buildings. The confidentiality is frequently compromised as some procurement activities of Works are taking place at Lasbela and Gwadar districts under the control and supervision of PIU heads. The PMU has been using IFAD SPDs for procurement of Goods, Works and Services. 5 out of 11 packages went for rebidding due to non-responsive bids/proposals. Contract extension of construction supervision firm is pending despite the fact that the contract had expired on June 30, 2024. As such, there has never been any complaint against the procurement practices of PMU. PMU needs a more robust record keeping mechanism. Some bids were found missing. The PS is now familiar with OPEN and CMT use. The risks emanating from lack of required professional capacity and downstream experience of transactional procurement, office space, confidentiality compromises are quite substantial in nature.</p>	Substantial	Substantial
<p>Mitigations:</p> <p>PMU will report to and seek guidance from project steering committee/P&DD for securing additional support. The additional support in the procurement unit will ensure timely procurement of goods, works and services activity and proper record keeping along with effective contract management.</p> <p>The new PS will get familiar with use of OPEN and CMT and will ensure that IFAD SPDs are used in true letter and spirit and the procurement opportunity is disseminated among the bidders effectively. He will ensure that the procurement activity under the project is undertaken ensuring economy, efficiency, transparency, fairness, quality and value for money in the process.</p>		
<p>A.1 Legal, Regulatory and Policy Framework</p>	Substantial	Substantial

<p>Risk:</p> <p>To some extent, the public procurement legal framework encapsulates the agreed principles and ensure compliance with applicable obligations. Implementing regulations notified so far support the legal framework. The country procurement system is just 2 decades old. There are some international best practices incorporated in the procurement legal framework. There are no supporting User Guides for the procurement practitioners. There is no downstream procurement procedural manual /guideline for the PAs to effectively ensure efficiency, economy and transparency during the procurement process. There is no procurement monitoring mechanism and Guide on contract management. Recent amendments relating to engagement of state-owned entities under direct contracting does not seem in line with promoting competition and transparency.</p>	Substantial	Substantial
<p>Mitigations:</p> <p>PPRA should focus on meeting the development of missing standard procurement documents to complete the procurement regulatory framework at the federal level. Subsequently, PPRA should activate the National Institute of Procurement (NIP), take lead in designing of an annual calendar of a series of capacity building training programs. .</p>		
<p>A.2 Institutional Framework and Management Capacity</p>	Moderate	Moderate
<p>Risk:</p> <p>The institutional framework and management capacity may be treated as average. The procurement planning is aligned with annual budgeting exercise. However, there is no mechanism for detailed planning and updating of procurement plans during the year. PPRA is managed by its Board albeit some potential conflict of interest in terms of financial and administrative autonomy. The country procurement system is just 20 years old and it has to go a long way to achieve the desired institutional maturity and proper functioning. The public procurement system has a capacity to develop and improve. The progress is very slow but it is in the right direction. The ingredients required for introducing and operating e-public procurement system are being brought together.</p>	Moderate	Moderate
<p>Mitigations:</p> <p>The main challenge is ensuring the development of desired capacity in the areas of procurement regulations, planning, transactions, monitoring, audit and contract management. The government must recognize procurement as a profession and do the needful as soon as possible. It should focus on promoting public procurement as a promising career stream with the introduction of necessary certification/accreditation.</p>		
<p>A.4 Accountability, Integrity and Transparency of the Public Procurement System</p>	Substantial	Substantial
<p>Risk:</p> <p>The country procurement system is fairly new in performance of its operations. The country has ethics and anti-corruption measures in place. The components required for ensuring accountability, integrity and transparency of the public procurement system are somewhat present. The country has effective control and audit systems.</p> <p>There is always room for improvement and with the passage of time, the Authority will attain required level of operational maturity. Procurement is a cross-cutting function, one aspect is the audit activity. The country has a sound legal framework and institutional arrangements for external audit—though the practice of performance audit and procurement audit (as a sector) is not established. It is not clear whether the offices of Chief Internal Auditors will enhance the procurement efficiency or otherwise.</p>	Substantial	Substantial

<p>Mitigations:</p> <p>PPRA to prepare a bucket list based on following. Plan an awareness campaign to sensitize the stakeholders on the functions and powers of the authority; coordinate with AGP office to start the practice of sector audit; liaise with NAB and FIA and discourage investigation of cases by them; prepare a case for establishment of office of the procurement ombudsman as highest procurement appellate authority.</p>		
<p>A.3 Public Procurement Operations and Market Practices.</p>	Moderate	Moderate
<p>Risk:</p> <p>Capacity constraints lead to poor procurement planning and weak contract management. PPRA to take lead and coordinate with PEC and other professional bodies of Constructors and Consultants; design an annual calendar of training programs for the PAs on frequent issues relating to effective contract management. There is a communication gap between the public sector and private sector. There are representative professional bodies of suppliers, constructors and consultants in the country. Market knowledge for the PAs of critical sectors (energy, transport, irrigation etc.) may be updated through interaction with these bodies on a working relationship basis.</p>	Moderate	Moderate
<p>Mitigations:</p> <p>There is a communication gap between the public sector and private sector which should be bridged through mutually agreed actions. These actions may include capacity building of both sides of the equation. The training activity should be coordinated by PPRA with PEC and these bodies.</p>		
<p>Environment, Social and Climate Impact</p>	Moderate	Moderate
<p>Biodiversity Conservation</p>	Moderate	Moderate
<p>Risk:</p> <p>There is a risk that project activities (especially construction of Jetties) may; (i) disturb migratory birds and Green Turtles in the coastline of Jewani; (ii) affect fish stocks due to change in increased fishing effort, resulting in changes in fish yield; (iii) generate opportunities for the current available fishermen as well as new/additional fishermen, which may cause overfishing.</p>	Moderate	Moderate
<p>Mitigations:</p> <p>While regulation regarding mandatory break during annual fishing breeding seasons and conservation of biodiversity, the project will take measures such as; (i) during construction of jetties in terms of adequate scheduling and planning carried out to avoid adverse impacts on fisheries, eco-system (particularly green turtles) and migratory birds; (ii) overfishing addressed by investing in the government's policy, strategy and management capacity for sustainable management of fisheries resources; (iii) establishing fish hatcheries to enable restocking; (iii) fisher folk cooperatives to manage landing sites; and (iv) reducing the high post-harvest losses, improving the quality of the catch for better prices resulting in higher incomes thus less need for excessive fishing.</p>		
<p>Resource Efficiency and Pollution Prevention</p>	Moderate	Moderate
<p>Risk:</p> <p>The project implementation may involve slight adverse impacts on waste disposal and ecosystem.</p>	Moderate	Moderate
<p>Mitigations:</p> <p>Adequate waste disposal will be ensured by the contractor under close supervision of the consultants and line department. Appropriate sewerage and drainage system will be developed by the contractor during construction. Use of well-maintained vehicles and equipment will be ensured by the contractor, consultants and clients.</p>		

Cultural Heritage		No risk envisaged - not applicable
Project activity is neutral in this respect.		
Indigenous People		No risk envisaged - not applicable
The project will have positive economic impact on indigenous fisherfolks of the coastal areas (Gwadar and Lasbela)		
Labour and Working Conditions	Moderate	Moderate
Risk: The project will require seasonal workers, particularly during construction of Jetties and allied structures. Seasonal workers may be more easily subject to unclear employment status and less favourable treatment compared to permanent employees. In addition, seasonal workers are often migrant workers who are particularly at risk from health issues (i.e. contracting and spreading communicable diseases, overcrowding in accommodation facilities, inadequate personal protective equipment, etc.)	Moderate	Moderate
Mitigations: Project will ensure; (i) hiring conducted in a transparent and accountable manner; (ii) work place environment are monitored and ensure to be in compliance with pertinent labor legislation and ratified international conventions; (iii) workers, contractors and service providers well informed of the duration of the work and the finite nature of their contracts under the project; and, (iv) whenever local people/organizations can carry out project activities they will be given preference over external people/organization.		
Community health, safety and security	Moderate	Low
Risk: The project may affect public health of surrounding communities and workers through air, water and soil pollution, noise or direct contact with hazardous material. The operation of supply facilities of fuel and other chemicals may release hazardous or flammable material due to accidental damages to storage containers and delivery structures.	Moderate	Low
Mitigations: Project work orders/contract will include general condition that refer to; (i) a condition that worker's camps be located at an adequate distance from local residential areas; and, (ii) workers, including drivers, should be trained on work safety, machinery operation and public health before the commencement of work and will be provided with personal protection equipment, such as helmets, gloves, dust masks, boots and earmuffs		
Physical and Economic Resettlement		No risk envisaged - not applicable
No involuntary resettlement will occur as a result of project activities.		
Greenhouse Gas Emissions	Low	Low
Risk: Increased number of livestock and agricultural activities may increase as a result of project support which pose a low inherent risk.	Low	Low

<p>Mitigations:</p> <p>The project through support of FAO will develop resilience of beneficiaries and will provide support in adopting climate smart technologies and practices.</p>		
<p><i>Vulnerability of target populations and ecosystems to climate variability and hazards</i></p>		<i>No risk envisaged - not applicable</i>
<p>Project activity will instead reduce vulnerabilities to climate variability and hazards.</p>		
<p>Stakeholders</p>	Moderate	Moderate
<p><i>Stakeholder Engagement/Coordination</i></p>	<i>Moderate</i>	<i>Low</i>
<p>Risk:</p> <p>Several different stakeholders engaged in project may increase complexity to the project implementation approach and create distrust between Project and other key stakeholders.</p>	Moderate	Low
<p>Mitigations:</p> <p>Stakeholder risks have been addressed through: intensive dialogue and consultation with provincial government; required Department staff's consensus on the approach, targeting and interventions; transparent criteria-based selection of project interventions and beneficiaries; and the equitable division of resources between the two districts. A bottom-up community driven needs assessment and delivery, with beneficiaries in control, promises local ownership and mitigates the possibilities of conflict.</p>		
<p><i>Stakeholder Grievances</i></p>	<i>Moderate</i>	<i>Moderate</i>
<p>Risk:</p> <p>Although it is the same implementing agency as for Phase 1 (GLLS), the implementing agency may not be fully conversant with updated IFAD's rules, procedures, and requirements.</p>	Moderate	Moderate
<p>Mitigations:</p> <p>The implementing agency and the PMU will be oriented with updated guidelines, rules, and procedures. The stakeholders' grievances registration and redress mechanism will be established and kept functional.</p>		